

JOHN PAIRMAN BROWN

ISRAEL AND HELLAS

DE GRUYTER

John Pairman Brown
Israel and Hellas



Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die
alttestamentliche Wissenschaft

Herausgegeben von
Otto Kaiser

Band 231

Walter de Gruyter · Berlin · New York

1995

John Pairman Brown

Israel and Hellas

Walter de Gruyter · Berlin · New York

1995

© Printed on acid-free paper which falls within the guidelines of the ANSI
to ensure permanence and durability

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Brown, John Pairman.
Israel and Hellas / John Pairman Brown.
p. cm. – (Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche
Wissenschaft ; Bd. 231)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 3-11-014233-3
1. Bible. O.T.–Extra-canonical parallels. 2. Bible. O.T.–Compar-
ative studies. 3. Greek literature–Relation to the Old Testament.
4. Jews–Civilization–To 70 A.D. 5. Greece–Civilization. I. Title.
II. Series.
BS410.Z5
[BS1171.2]
221.6 s–dc20
[880.9'4221] 95-34023
CIP

Die Deutsche Bibliothek – Cataloging-in-Publication Data

[Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft / Beihefte]
Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft. – Berlin ;
New York : de Gruyter.
Früher Schriftenreihe
Reihe Beihefte zu: Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
NE: HST
Bd. 231. Brown, John Pairman: Israel and Hellas. – 1995
Brown, John Pairman:
Israel and Hellas / John Pairman Brown. – Berlin ; New York : de Gruy-
ter, 1995
(Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft ; Bd.
231)
ISBN 3-11-014233-3

ISSN 0934-2575

© Copyright 1995 by Walter de Gruyter & Co., D-10785 Berlin.

All rights reserved, including those of translation into foreign languages. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

Printed in Germany
Printing: Arthur Collignon GmbH, Berlin
Binding: Lüderitz & Bauer-GmbH, Berlin

for
SAUL LEVIN

AUTHOR'S PREFACE

Thanks to the commitment of Otto Kaiser and the superlative typography of Walter de Gruyter & Co., readers have in their hands the very first book to compare at length classical Hebrew and Greek texts—and sometimes Latin as well. (The English font was typeset off my disk, but the foreign fonts keyed in manually with great accuracy, off my far-from-perfect hand, by Oliver Roman.) Naturally, those with some minimal proficiency in the two languages and their scripts will be at an advantage. But everything is translated into English; and the Hebrew frequently as well into the Greek of the Septuagint, or the Latin of the Vulgate, or Luther's German as modernized. (I regret that the German version I cite is less *lutheranisch* than some others; native users of German will know how to compensate.) So anybody interested in the twin foundation literatures of Western civilization should be able to use the book with profit. Nobody is more aware than myself that, dealing with so wide a variety of texts, studied for centuries by so many scholars, I have discussed some wrongly or inadequately, and overlooked others of equal or greater interest. Unlike Humpty Dumpty, I cannot explain all the poems that ever were invented. My fondest hope is that a reader or two, overlooking my deficiencies, will conclude that the literatures of Israel and Hellas, for some of the reasons I suggest and on the basis of some of my examples, are in fact comparable. I would have liked to support the discussions much more fully by the results of archaeology; but *non omnia possumus omnes*.

Seven of the nine chapters here have previously appeared in print, in one form or another. But Chapter 1, a systematic introduction to these studies, is new; as are Chapter 8 on the treaty and the Excursuses. And everything has been rethought and revised; I saw no reason to perpetuate my initial limitations. So I hope that reviewers who habitually just list the contents of "collected essays" will give these a second look. The original articles, published between 1968 and 1981, record the investigation by which I came to realize the comparability of Israel and Hellas—the first free societies, cultivating rain-watered fields around a fortified citadel, recording their words about the human situation in a widely-accessible alphabetic script. After several efforts, I have not found a better mode of presentation than the original one. Each chapter represents one segment of a coherent train of thought, and all refer to each other. They do not need to be read in sequence; rather, each individual

comparison asks to be judged on its own merits. Still, I will be bold and claim that this book, for the first time, documents as a unified event the double emergence, around Jerusalem and Athens respectively, of full humanity as we know it.

The primary clue to the comparability of Hebrew and Greek texts—and of the societies they reveal—is the surprising fact of their *shared vocabulary*, mostly of nouns. The majority of the chapters here rest on that basis. From 1981 to 1994 I published a further series of nine articles in the same realm—five of them, by the kindness of Prof. Kaiser, in the *Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft*—, listed here on p. 9. In them, the common vocabulary, while nowhere absent, is less prominent, and is supplemented by more general grounds of comparison; Etruria and primitive Rome appear; the merger of Israelite and Hellenic culture in the early Christian church is emphasized. They substantially complete the enterprise of the present volume, and I hope that some day they can likewise be gathered together. But the essays of the present work, as being older, stood in more need of revision; and I am clear also that they should be read first.

The indexes are an integral part of the work, and make various comparisons not underlined elsewhere. Index 1, of words whose phonetic equivalents in other languages are discussed, contains, among other things, a complete listing of the common nouns (so far as I have determined them) shared by Greek and Hebrew before Alexander; in conjunction with the text, it is a tiny etymological dictionary. Index 2, of passages cited (long even though selective), will be useful to anybody studying a particular text who wishes to determine whether I have put it in a new context. Index 3, of objects described, is a key to the plates I would like to see in an imaginary illustrated edition. Index 4, of modern authors cited, takes the place of a full bibliography (whose function I have never been able to determine), with the advantage that it indicates where they are quoted. Index 5 includes whatever does not fall in one of the preceding categories.

I spell Greek and Hebrew names in what I judge to be the most familiar English form. For mere simplicity I name the God of Israel "Yahweh." I call the composer of the two Greek epics "Homer," and the author of the *Prometheus Vincitus* "Aeschylus," without committing myself to historical judgements. I print Greek and Latin inscriptions in large and small capitals when I wish to emphasize their epigraphic character—particularly for Greek dialects where the Byzantine apparatus is inapplicable. For consistency in the series "BZAW" I abbreviate Biblical books in its form. When I occasionally transcribe Hebrew, I recognize seven full vowels *a e i o u* along with three short ones *ă ě ǝ*; and treat *y* or *w* after a vowel as a consonantal offglide. So as not to overload the typography, I mostly refrain from marking

Latin long vowels; I leave off vowels in the Mishna for lack of a critical edition of the Kaufmann codex; I omit vowels also from Targum and Peshitto, along with Hebrew accents other than the pausal, and the overhead lines on fricatives marked in the best MSS of the Hebrew Bible. My occasional citations from other ancient languages do not rest on any deep understanding of their scripts or grammar; and my transcriptions, drawn from different sources, are not fully consistent.

I have done all I could to make the actual text of citations from foreign languages correct, according to the editions under my hand. In the course of compiling Index 2 I have corrected a number of the references. But it has proved impossible to verify in their entirety the thousands of references to authors ancient and modern, some of which go back thirty years or more in my papers, printed and MS. I beg the reader's indulgence for the residual errors, and will welcome any list of them.

Even when I do not specifically refer to works in the select bibliography, readers can be assured that I have often consulted them, and that they will derive much profit by doing so themselves. In particular I could have cited much more frequently than I did the new Cambridge Iliad and the Oxford Odyssey; M. L. West's commentaries on Hesiod; Menahem Stern's learned collection of authors on Judaism; Émilia Masson's judicious study of Semitic loan-words in Greek, with its history of scholarship; and the admirable new *Dictionnaire de la civilisation phénicienne et punique* edited by Édouard Lipiński.

I first understood the overlap between the Hebraic and Hellenic worlds during my seven years at the American University of Beirut, a stone's throw from the old Roman law school, and under the remnant forests and snows of Jebel Sannin—not quite as Tacitus knew it, *tantos inter ardores opacum fidumque niuibus*. This book would have been impossible without twin treasures, a quarter mile apart: the Classics Seminar of the University of California at Berkeley; and the Library of the Graduate Theological Union, which kindly designated me a visiting scholar. I am especially in debt to the knowledgeable and industrious staff of the Interlibrary Loan Service at the latter place.

Fifty years ago at the Harvard Society of Fellows I met Saul Levin, now Distinguished Professor of the State University of New York at Binghamton, to whom this work is dedicated. A full accounting of what I owe him would make him seem a joint author, which in a true sense he is. Without his constant encouragement, I would probably have given up this enterprise long ago. Taking time out from his own comparison of the Semitic and Indo-European languages at an older period, he reviewed the manuscript of each article redone here once or several times before its original publication.

(His big *Semitic and Indo-European Comparative Grammar*, expected from the press shortly after the present work, will treat at an earlier period many of the etymologies studied here.) He carefully checked these chapters in their present form before they went to the press, and read the first proofs in their entirety. He detected much lurking political correctness in my MS, of which I have deleted some but not all. Again and again he has found counter-examples to puncture premature generalizations. He knows the grammar and texts of all three languages —Hebrew, Greek, and Latin—better than I do; he has saved me from many errors (for those remaining I claim exclusive authorship), and made many perceptive additions. As Pindar says about Theron of Acragas (*Olympian* 2.98), "Who could say what joys he has brought to others?—for the sand escapes counting," ἐπεὶ ψάμμος ἀριθμὸν περιπέφυγεν.

January 20, 1995

PREFACE

Scholars of the Old Testament usually concern themselves not only with the Bible and the manifold problems it poses, but also and ideally with the ways in which it relates to the Near Eastern religions and cultures. This is not at all surprising, nor should it be criticized, because ancient Israel was surrounded by other peoples, and throughout her history Israel's territory was a battlefield for Egypt and Mesopotamia. It was not until the end of the seventh century that the impact of Greek politics and culture on the Levantine coast and its hinterland gradually increased, reaching its maximum when, in the Hellenistic period, Palestine became part of the Hellenistic world. For this reason the theme 'Judaism and Hellenism' is commonly discussed by scholars specialized in Late Biblical or Post Biblical studies. The fact that connections existed between Greece and Syria at least since Mycenaean and Late Helladic times is generally acknowledged only by archaeologists who are interested in either of the two periods. Acute outsiders who venture to write on Hellenosemitica, like Michael Astour about a quarter of a century ago, are the exception.

This situation is no coincidence but rather a consequence of the enormous difficulties and perils of misjudgement anyone encounters who is working in this extensive field. The scholar should be well acquainted with both Classical and Biblical literature; he should know the general history of the languages Greek and Hebrew, and have at least a basic idea of Indo-European and Semitic linguistics. Some experience in the archaeology of Greece and the Near East is also desirable. Last but not least, he must not be intimidated by those who are just cultivating their own special field and allege that comparative studies such as these may only be carried out by specialized scholars working as a team. Someone engaged in both Greek and Hebrew studies is like a sailor navigating across a sea only partly explored and unreliably charted. He has to be extremely prudent and cautious in order not to suffer shipwreck on reefs, cliffs, or shoals. Yet at the same time he must summon up courage to weigh his anchor and to attempt the voyage even if the hull of his vessel might become scratched or spring a serious leak.

Having passionately devoted most of his life to this daunting task, John Pairman Brown was not discouraged from undertaking the adventurous

voyage. The editor of BZAW would like to thank this highly esteemed colleague for the honour of presenting his results to the learned public in this series. Some articles, which were published earlier, have been revised for this collection, others appear here for the first time. It is hoped that through their stimulating effect these essays may provide Biblical scholars with new insights and perspectives.

Otto Kaiser
At present University of Tartu,
Estonia

19 April, 1995

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Author's Preface.....	VII
Preface by Otto Kaiser.....	XI
Abbreviations and Bibliography.....	XVII
Chapter 1: Hebrew and Greek Texts.....	1
1.1 Hebraism and Hellenism	1
1.2 Common features of Hebrew and Greek texts.....	10
1.3 Realms of contact between Hebrew and Greek texts	14
1.4 Conditions for the new literatures	22
1.5 Movement of peoples	29
1.6 The alphabet	38
1.7 Theism and humanism.....	54
Chapter 2: Literary Contexts of the Common Hebrew-Greek Vocabulary	62
2.1 The concubine.....	65
2.2 Cassia: with notes on other spices	70
2.3 The clothes-moth	73
2.4 The pledge	74
2.5 The ritual sickle: Iapetus and Japheth.....	78
2.6 The brick.....	83
2.7 The griffin and cherub	85
2.8 Jasper	87
Excursus A: The nine spices of Canticles.....	91
Excursus B: The god of Kasios and his adversary.....	98
Chapter 3: Cosmological Myth and the Tuna of Gibraltar	106
3.1 The domed sky.....	106
3.2 The pillars of the sky	113
3.3 The Phoenicians in Gades.....	118

3.4 The pillars as scene of dragon-combat	124
3.5 The tuna and the <i>tanniyn</i>	128
Chapter 4: The Mediterranean Vocabulary of the Vine.....	134
4.1 The name of the vine	136
4.2 The name of "wine"	137
4.3 The drinking-hall	141
4.4 "To mix"	142
4.5 The winejar	143
4.6 The wine-cask.....	145
4.7 The (golden) "vessel"	146
4.8 Nard and other ointments	148
4.9 The bull.....	152
4.10 The tambourine.....	152
4.11 The (unripe) grape-cluster	155
4.12 The vine-stem	156
Chapter 5: Peace Symbolism in Ancient Military Vocabulary.....	159
5.1 The defensive panoply.....	163
5.2 The lance.....	170
5.3 The tent.....	177
Excursus C: Phinehas and Phineus	181
Chapter 6: The Sacrificial Cult and its Critique.....	183
6.1 Sacrifice as banquet.....	183
6.2 Critique of the cult and modern theories	188
6.3 The bull and its name.....	190
6.4 The bull's horn	195
6.5 "To slaughter"	199
6.6 The altar.....	201
6.7 The tunic.....	204
6.8 <i>Libanos</i> , "frankincense".....	210
6.9 Further features of the sacrifice.....	213
6.10 Human sacrifice.....	216
Excursus D: "Lord of the flies".....	219

Chapter 7: The Shifting Roles of Women.....	222
7.1 Women's freedom of action in the archaic period	223
7.2 Housewife and harlot in the autonomous city-state.....	232
7.3 Women under the universalizing of restrictions.....	246
Chapter 8: Treaty and Loyalty-Oath	253
8.1 Nomenclature and formal aspects of the treaty	256
8.2 Provisions of the loyalty-oath.....	262
8.3 The elements as divine witnesses	267
8.4 The curses of the oath-taker on himself.....	272
Chronological Catalogue of Treaties.....	284
Supplementary Bibliography to Chapter 8	287
Chapter 9: Proverb-Book and Gold-Economy.....	290
9.1 The proverb-book	291
9.2 The spread of a gold-economy	299
Excursus E: Motifs, Comparisons, Proverbs	309
E.1 Ethical and religious motifs	310
E.2 Comparisons.....	312
E.3 International Proverbs	316
Bibliography to Chapter 9 and Excursus E	327
Appendix.....	328
Index 1: Words discussed	344
Index 2: Passages cited	357
Index 3: Objects described.....	387
Index 4: Modern scholars.....	389
Index 5: General.....	393

ABBREVIATIONS AND BIBLIOGRAPHY

Chapter 8 and Excursus E have separate lists of bibliographical abbreviations at the end. Modern studies marked with an asterisk (*) are those I have found most useful; the notes do not always abbreviate references to them.

ABD: D. N. Freedman (ed.), *The Anchor Bible Dictionary*; 6 vols.; 1992.

AJP: *American Journal of Philology*.

Amarna: J. A. Knudtzon, *Die El-Amarna Tafeln*; 2 vols.; repr. 1964.
Translation and updates in W. L. Moran, *The Amarna Letters*, 1992.

ANEP²: James B. Pritchard (ed.), *The Ancient Near East in Pictures Relating to the Old Testament*; 2nd ed.; 1969.

ANET³: James B. Pritchard (ed.), *Ancient Near Eastern Texts Relating to the Old Testament*; 3rd ed.; 1969.

Bab. Talm.: *Babylonian Talmud*.

BAH: *Bibliothèque Archéologique et Historique*.

BASOR: *Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research*.

BCH: *Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique*.

BibZ: *Biblische Zeitschrift*.

* Bonnet, Melqart: Corinne Bonnet, Melqart: Cultes et mythes de l'Héraclès tyrien en Méditerranée; *Studia Phoenicia* VIII; *Bib. de la fac. de philos. et lettres de Namur* 69; 1988.

Borger: R. Borger, *Die Inschriften Asarhaddons Königs von Assyrien*; *Archiv für Orientforschung Beiheft* 9; 1956/1967.

Briquel-Chatonnet: F. Briquel-Chatonnet, *Les relations entre les cités de la côte phénicienne et les royaumes d'Israël et de Juda*; *Orientalia Lovaniensia* 46; *Studia Phoenicia* 12; 1992.

Brown, Lebanon and Phoenicia: J. P. Brown, *The Lebanon and Phoenicia: Ancient Texts illustrating their physical geography and native industries*; Vol. I [all pub.] *The physical setting and the forest*; 1969.

Brown-Levin, *Ethnic Paradigm*: J. P. Brown & S. Levin, "The Ethnic Paradigm as a pattern for nominal forms in Greek and Hebrew," *General Linguistics* 26 (1986) 71-105.

- * Burkert, *Homo Necans*: Walter Burkert, *Homo Necans: The Anthropology of Ancient Greek Sacrificial Ritual and Myth*; tr. P. Bing, and revised by the author, 1983; tr. of German ed., 1972.
- * Burkert, *Or. Rev.*: Walter Burkert, *The Orientalizing Revolution: Near Eastern Influence on Greek Culture in the Early Archaic Age*; 1992: English tr. (with extensive revisions by the author) of *Die orientalisierende Epoche in der griechischen Religion und Literatur* (Sitzungsb. der Heid. Akad. der Wiss., Phil.-hist. Klasse, 1984).
- BZAW: *Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft*.
- CAD: *The Assyrian Dictionary of the University of Chicago*.
- * Cambridge *Iliad*: G. S. Kirk (general ed.), *The Iliad: A Commentary*; 6 vols.; 1985-1993.
- * Casabona: Jean Casabona, *Recherches sur le vocabulaire des sacrifices en grec des origines à la fin de l'époque classique*; *Pub. des Annales de la fac. des lettres Aix-en-Provence, n.s., no. 56*; 1966.
- CIL: *Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum*.
- CIS: *Corpus Inscriptionum Semiticarum*.
- Cooke: G. A. Cooke, *A Text-Book of North-Semitic Inscriptions*, 1903.
- Corp. Christ.: *Corpus Christianorum*.
- Cowley: A. Cowley, *Aramaic Papyri of the Fifth Century B.C.*, 1923 [partly replaced by B. Porten & A. Yardeni, *Textbook of Aramaic documents from ancient Egypt*; in progress, 1986—; not referred to here].
- CPG: E. Leutsch & F. G. Schneidewin, *Corpus Papyrographorum Graecorum*; 2 vols.; 1839-1851.
- CSEL: *Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum*.
- CSHB: *Corpus Scriptorum Historiae Byzantinae*.
- Daremberg-Saglio: C. L. Daremberg & E. Saglio, *Dictionnaire des antiquités grecques et romaines...*, 5 vols. in 9, 1877-1919.
- * DCP: Édouard Lipiński (ed.), *Dictionnaire de la civilisation phénicienne et punique*, 1992.
- DISO: C.-F. Jean & J. Hoftijzer, *Dictionnaire des inscriptions sémitiques de l'Ouest*, 1965.
- DMG²: M. Ventris & John Chadwick, *Documents in Mycenaean Greek*; 2nd ed.; 1973.
- * Edwards, *Kadmos*: Ruth B. Edwards, *Kadmos the Phoenician: A Study in Greek Legends and the Mycenaean Age*, 1979.
- Ehrenberg-Jones: V. Ehrenberg & A.H.M. Jones, *Documents illustrating the reigns of Augustus and Tiberius*, 2 ed., 1955.
- EPROER: *Etudes préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l'Empire romain*.
- Erman-Grapow: A. Erman & H. Grapow, *Wörterbuch der ägyptischen Sprache*, 6 + 5 vols., 1926-1953.

- Ernout-Meillet: A. Ernout & A. Meillet, *Dictionnaire étymologique de la langue latine*; 4th ed.; 1959.
- * Faure: P. Faure, *Parfums et Aromates de l'Antiquité*, 1987.
- FGH: F. Jacoby, *Die Fragmente der Griechischen Historiker*, 1957—.
- Frisk: H. Frisk, *Griechisches etymologisches Wörterbuch*; 3 vols.; 1960-1972.
- FRLANT: *Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments*.
- FVS⁸: H. Diels & W. Kranz, *Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker*; 8th ed.; 3 vols.; 1956.
- GCS: *Die Griechischen Christlichen Schriftsteller*.
- GGM: C. Müller, *Geographi Graeci Minores*; 2 vols.; 1855-1861.
- * Gordon, *Before the Bible*: Cyrus H. Gordon, *Before the Bible: The Common Background of Greek and Hebrew Civilisations* (London), 1962; the New York ed. of 1965 is entitled *The Common Background of Greek and Hebrew Civilizations*.
- * Gordon, *Homer & Bible*: —, *Homer and Bible: The Origin and Character of East Mediterranean Literature*, 1967; repr. from *HUCA* 26 (1955) 43-108.
- Helck-Otto: H.-W. Helck & E. Otto, *Lexikon der Ägyptologie*.
- HUCA: *Hebrew Union College Annual*.
- IDB: *Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible*, 4 vols., 1962; with *Supplementary Volume*, 1976.
- IEG: M. L. West, *Iambi et Elegi Graeci*; 2 vols.; 1971.
- IESL: Saul Levin, *The Indo-European and Semitic Languages: An exploration of structural similarities related to accent, chiefly in Greek, Sanskrit and Hebrew*; 1971.
- IG: *Inscriptiones Graecae*.
- IGLS: *Inscriptions grecques et latines de la Syrie*.
- IGRR: *Inscriptiones Graecae ad res romanas pertinentes*.
- ILS: H. Dessau, *Inscriptiones Latinae Selectae*; 3rd ed.; 5 vols.; 1962.
- Inscr. Cret.: M. Guarducci, *Inscriptiones Creticae*.
- JAOS: *Journal of the American Oriental Society*.
- JBL: *Journal of Biblical Literature*.
- Jer. Talm.: *Jerusalem Talmud*.
- JHS: *Journal of Hellenic Studies*.
- JNES: *Journal of Near Eastern Studies*.
- JRS: *Journal of Roman Studies*.
- JSNT: *Journal for the Study of the New Testament*.
- JSOT: *Journal for the Study of the Old Testament*.
- JSS: *Journal of Semitic Studies*.
- JTS: *Journal of Theological Studies*.

- * Just: Roger Just, *Women in Athenian Law and Life*; 1989.
- KAI: H. Donner & W. Röllig, *Kanaanäische und aramäische Inschriften*; 3 vols.; 1962-4.
- KASD: J. Friedrich, *Kleinasiatische Sprachdenkmäler*; *Kleine Texte* 163; 1932.
- KB³: L. Koehler & W. Baumgartner, *Hebräisches und aramäisches Lexicon zum alten Testament*; 3rd ed. in progress; 1967—.
- Kent: R. G. Kent, *Old Persian: Grammar, Texts, Lexicon*; 2nd ed.; 1953.
- KJV: King James Version of the English Bible.
- Kock: T. Kock, *Comicorum Atticorum Fragmenta*; 3 vols.; 1880-1888 [partly replaced by R. Kassel & C. Austin, *Poetae Comici Graeci*; in progress; 1983—; not referred to here].
- KTU: M. Dietrich et alii, *Die keilalphabetischen Texte aus Ugarit*; Teil 1; *Alter Orient und Altes Testament* Bd 24; 1976.
- LACUS: Linguistic Association of Canada and the United States.
- LCL: Loeb Classical Library.
- * Lewy: Heinrich Lewy, *Die semitischen Fremdwörter im Griechischen*, 1895.
- * Lieberman, Greek: Saul Lieberman, *Greek in Jewish Palestine*, 5702 / 1942.
- * Lieberman, Hellenism: —, *Hellenism in Jewish Palestine...*, 5711 / 1950.
- LSAG²: Lilian H. Jeffery, *The Local Scripts of Archaic Greece*, rev. ed. by A. W. Johnston, 1990.
- LSAM: Franciszek Sokolowski, *Lois sacrées de l'Asie Mineure; École française d'Athènes, Travaux et Mémoires...* fasc. 9, 1955.
- LSCG: —, *Lois sacrées des cités grecques; ibid.* fasc. 18, 1969; *LSCGSup, Supplément* [to the older work by Prott-Ziehen]; *ibid.* fasc. 11, 1962.
- LSJ: Liddell-Scott-Jones, *A Greek-English Lexicon*; 9th ed., 1940; with Supplement by E. A. Barber, 1968.
- Luther: *Die Bibel...nach der Übersetzung Martin Luthers*; *Württembergische Bibelanstalt*, 1972.
- * Masson, *Recherches*: Emilia Masson, *Recherches sur les plus anciens emprunts sémitiques en grec*; *Études et Commentaires* 67; 1967.
- Meiggs-Lewis: R. Meiggs & D. Lewis, *A Selection of Greek Historical Inscriptions to the end of the Fifth Century B. C.*, rev. ed. of 1975.
- Merkelbach-West: R. Merkelbach & M. L. West, *Fragmenta Hesiodica*, 1967.
- * Miller, *Spice Trade*: J. Innes Miller, *The Spice Trade of the Roman Empire, 29 B.C. to A.D. 641*; 1969.
- Monier-Williams: M. Monier-Williams, *A Sanskrit-English Dictionary*, 1899.
- MVAG: *Mitteilungen der Vorderasiatischen Gesellschaft*.

- Nauck: A. Nauck, *Tragicorum Graecorum Fragmenta*; 2nd ed.; 1889 [partly replaced by TrGF].
- NEAE: *New Encyclopaedia of Archaeological Excavations in the Holy Land*; 4 vols.; 1993.
- NovT: *Novum Testamentum*.
- * OBO 129: B. Janowski et alii (eds.), *Religionsgeschichtliche Beziehungen zwischen Kleinasien, Nordsyrien und dem Alten Testament* [Symposion Hamburg 1990]; *Orbis Biblicus et Orientalis* 129; 1993.
- OCT: *Oxford Classical Texts*.
- ODEP³: F. P. Wilson, *Oxford Dictionary of English Proverbs*, 3rd ed.; 1970.
- OED: *Oxford English Dictionary*.
- OGIS: W. Dittenberger, *Orientalis Graeci Inscriptiones Selectae*; 2 vols.; 1903-5.
- OLD: P. G. W. Glare (ed.), *Oxford Latin Dictionary*, 1982.
- * Otto: A. Otto, *Die Sprichwörter und sprichwörtlichen Redensarten der Römer*, 1890.
- * *Oxford Odyssey*: A. Heubeck et alii, *A Commentary on Homer's Odyssey*; 3 vols.; Oxford, 1988-1992.
- Palingenesia 36: C. W. Müller et alii (eds.), *Zum Umgang mit fremden Sprachen in der griechisch-römischen Antike* [Kolloquium Saarbrücken 1989]; *Palingenesia* 36; 1992
- PG: J.-P. Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*.
- PL: J.-P. Migne, *Patrologia Latina*.
- PLF: E. Lobel & D. L. Page, *Poetarum Lesbiorum Fragmenta*; 2nd ed.; 1963.
- PMG: D. L. Page, *Poetae Melici Graeci*, 1962.
- P.Oxy.*: *Oxyrhynchus Papyri*.
- * Powell: Barry B. Powell, *Homer and the Origin of the Greek Alphabet*, 1991.
- PRU iv: Jean Nougayrol, *Le palais royal d'Ugarit IV: Textes accadiens des archives sud* (*Archives internationales*); *Mission de Ras Shamra IX*, 1956.
- PW: Pauly-Wissowa, *Real-Encyclopädie der klassischen Altertumswissenschaft*.
- REA: *Revue des Etudes Anciennes*.
- RES: *Répertoire d'Epigraphie Sémitique*.
- RHR: *Revue de l'Histoire des Religions*.
- RLA: *Reallexikon der Assyriologie*.
- * Rosén: H. B. Rosén, *l'Hébreu et ses rapports avec le monde classique: Essai d'évaluation culturelle*; *Etudes chamito-sémitiques Sup.* 7; 1979.
- RSV: *Revised Standard Version of the English Bible*.
- SANT: *Studien zum Alten und Neuen Testament*.

SBL: Society of Biblical Literature.

Script. Hist. Aug.: Scriptores Historiae Augustae.

SEG: Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum.

SIG³: W. Dittenberger, *Sylloge Inscriptionum Graecarum*; 3rd ed.; 4 vols.; 1915-1921.

* Stern: M. Stern, *Greek and Latin Authors on Jews and Judaism*, 3 vols., 1974-1984.

SVA: *Die Staatsverträge des Altertums*: Vol. ii, H. Bengtson & R. Werner, *Die Verträge der griechisch-römischen Welt von 700 bis 338 v. Chr.*, 1962; Vol. iii, Hatto H. Schmidt, *Die Verträge der griechisch-römischen Welt von 338 bis 200 v. Chr.*, 1969.

TAPA: Transactions of the American Philological Association.

TDOT: Theological Dictionary of the Old Testament.

TLE: M. Pallottino, *Testimonia Linguae Etruscae*, 1954.

TLL: *Thesaurus Linguae Latinae*.

TrGF: *Tragicorum Graecorum Fragmenta*; in progress, 1971—.

TWAT: *Theologisches Wörterbuch zum Alten Testament*.

UT: C. H. Gordon, *Ugaritic Textbook*; *Analecta Orientalia* 38; 3 vols; 1965 [Texts replaced by KTU, but cross-references provided here].

Vermeule: Emily Vermeule, *Aspects of Death in Early Greek Art and Poetry*, 1979.

Vet. Test.: *Vetus Testamentum*.

* Weinfeld, *Cov. Term.*: Moshe Weinfeld, "Covenant Terminology in the Ancient Near East and its Influence on the West," *JAOS* 93 (1973) 190-199.

* Weinfeld, *Loyalty Oath*: —, "The Loyalty Oath in the Ancient Near East," *Ugarit-Forschungen* 8 (1976) 379-414.

* West, *Theogony*: M. L. West, *Hesiod: Theogony*, 1966.

* West, *Works and Days*: M. L. West, *Hesiod: Works and Days*, 1978.

WVDOG: *Wissenschaftliche Veröffentlichungen der Deutschen Oriental-Gesellschaft*.

ZAW: *Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft*.

ZNW: *Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft*.

Chapter 1: Hebrew and Greek Texts

1.1 Hebraism and Hellenism

A typical city of western Europe or the United States has a university where Greek literature is widely read in translation; and, among a smaller group, in the original. Around it are churches where the Hebrew Bible (along with the Greek New Testament) is publicly read in translation; and a synagogue or seminary where it is studied in the original. The picture has not changed much since the Reformation. As people get older, they look back to their childhood to discover who they really are. And so societies that first became aware of themselves through the books of Israel and Hellas (along with Rome the foster daughter of Hellas) keep referring back to the records of their birth. For Israel, the literary record, along with the living memory of church and synagogue, is all the record there is; it left no buildings or monuments of art conveying its message in their own right, and the mediocre monuments of its sister Phoenicia add only a little to our understanding. The art and architecture of Hellas are indeed an integral part of its record; one reason they are prized so highly is that the literary record is there to help us interpret them.

You might think that scholars and other people would be curious that their society had its origins not in one place but in two. What is the relation between Hebraism and Hellenism? Were there any connections between Israel and Hellas?—two societies coming to birth during the same centuries, a week's voyage apart with favorable winds.¹ But the question is not often raised. In part, because the two traditions make mutually exclusive claims for themselves through those twin institutions, university and church. Though standing door by door, even in lands of an established church they are today in effect hermetically sealed off from each other.

1 A voyage from Byzantium to Gaza, 855 nautical miles, took ten days, at an overall speed of 3.6 knots: Marcus Diaconus, *Vita Porphyrii* 27 (ed. H. Grégoire and M.-A. Kugener, 1930), analyzed by Lionel Casson, *Ships and Seamanship in the Ancient World* (1971) 288, together with comparable records.

We hear that the university supports the cause of Man (and of Woman too if we ask), while the church supports the cause of God. Humanism and theism! It is felt inappropriate for either to trespass on the other's territory. Once it was daring for the University to study "the Bible as living literature"; today it affects to believe that its students already know the Bible, and surveys other sacred books out of a mandate for cultural diversity. Walter Burkert, dean among students of Greek religion, puts into an envied but suspect category those who take approach that subject as religion:

[Otto's] *Die Götter Griechenlands* (1929) is a challenging attempt to take the Homeric gods seriously as gods, in defiance of 2,500 years of criticism.... This path, which ends in a sublime private religion, is not one which can be taken by everyone, but the work still radiates a powerful force of attraction.²

Scattered observers who see that Hebraism and Hellenism are both important mostly *contrast* them. Matthew Arnold, in Chapter 4 of *Culture and Anarchy* (1869) affirms that the "final aim of both Hellenism and Hebraism, as of all great spiritual disciplines, is no doubt the same: man's perfection or salvation":

Still, they pursue this aim by very different courses. The uppermost idea with Hellenism is to see things as they really are; the uppermost idea with Hebraism is conduct and obedience. ...The governing idea of Hellenism is *spontaneity of consciousness*; that of Hebraism, *strictness of conscience*.

Thorleif Boman, orienting himself on the Greek side almost wholly on Plato, contrasts Hebrew and Greek thought rather differently:

Rest, harmony, composure, and self-control—this is the Greek way; movement, life, deep emotion, and power—this is the Hebrew way. ...As space was the given thought-form for the Greeks, so for the Hebrews it was time. ...For the Hebrew, the decisive reality of the world of experience was the *word*; for the Greek it was the *thing*.³

—and so on: *hearing* is most important for Hebrews, *seeing* for Greeks.

2 Walter Burkert, *Greek Religion*, tr. John Raffan (1985) 4; Otto's work has been translated as Walter F. Otto, *The Homeric Gods: The spiritual significance of Greek religion*, tr. Moses Hadas (1954).

3 Thorleif Boman, *Hebrew Thought compared with Greek*, tr. from the 2nd German edition by Jules L. Moreau (1960) 205-207. The 5th German edition, *Das hebräische Denken im Vergleich mit dem griechischen* (1968) has (p. 180): "Ruhe, Harmonie, Gelassenheit und Selbstbeherrschung ist griechische Art; Bewegung, Leben, Leidenschaft und Kraft ist hebräische Art. ...Wie der Raum die gegebene Denkform für die Griechen ist, so die Zeit für die Hebräer. ...Die entscheidende Realität der Erfahrungswelt war für die Hebräer das Wort, für die Griechen das Ding."

Others rank the two literatures in opposite order. With regard to the Hebrew texts, Havelock⁴ insists:

...that these originals and their surrounding sentiments are syntactically repetitive, that typical situations recur, that the relationships between the characters are relatively simple and their acts take on an almost ritual quality. ...It is precisely these limitations imposed upon the possible coverage of human experience that give to the old Testament its power of appeal, as we say, to "simple people." ...To enter the world of what we call "Greek literature," from Homer on, is to encounter a larger dimension of human experience, so much more diverse, personal, critical, subtle, humorous, passionate, ironic, and reflective.

Auerbach almost reverses this judgement.⁵ On Abraham's attempted sacrifice of Isaac, "his soul is torn between desperate rebellion and hopeful expectation; his silent obedience is multilayered, has background":

Such a problematical psychological situation as this is impossible for any of the Homeric heroes, whose destiny is clearly defined and who wake every morning as if it were the first day of their lives; their emotions, though strong, are simple and find expression instantly. How fraught with background, in comparison, are characters like Saul and David! How entangled and stratified are such human relations as those between David and Absalom, between David and Joab!

These four authors agree that the Hebrew and Greek worlds are to be contrasted with each other—though not in what respect. But only those things can be contrasted which are in fact comparable. Jerome and Grotius, who knew Hebrew besides the classical languages, compare them as representing a common geographical and cultural world. In Jerome's commentaries on the Prophets, although much is fanciful, quotations from Latin poets are all to the point. Thus on Jer 11,5 "a land flowing with milk and honey" (p.140 below), Vg *terram fluentem lacte et melle*, he cites⁶ Vergil *Ecl.* 3.89 "let honey flow for him, the harsh bramble bear amomum":

mella fluant illi, ferat et rubus asper amomum

and also *Georg.* 1.132 "and [Jupiter] withdrew the wine flowing everywhere in the rivers,"

et passim riuus currentia uina repressit.

-
- 4 Eric A. Havelock, *Origins of Western Literacy* [lectures at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, 1974] (1976) 34-35.
 - 5 Erich Auerbach, *Mimesis: The Representation of Reality in Western Literature*, tr. W. R. Trask (1968) 12. German ed. (1946) 17: "...in so problematisch innere Lagen können die homerischen Gestalten, deren Schicksal eindeutig festgelegt ist, und die jeden Tag erwachen, als wäre es ihr erster, gar nicht geraten; ihre Affekte sind zwar heftig, aber einfach, und brechen sofort hervor. Wie hintergründig sind dagegen Charaktere wie Saul oder David, wie verwickelt und geschichtet solche menschliche Verhältnisse wie die zwischen David und Absalom, zwischen David und Joab!"
 - 6 Hieronymus in *Hieremiam* 11,5; Corp. Christ. 74.112.2-4.

Even better, he could have quoted Ovid *Met.* 1.111-112 on the Golden Age,
 flumina iam lactis, iam flumina nectaris ibant
 flauaque de uiridi stillabant ilice mella

"rivers of milk and nectar flowed, and yellow honey dripped from the green ilex." In fact he echoes the passage in his commentary on Isa 30,26⁷ *lactis riuos fluere et de arborum foliis stillare mella purissima*; but I think Jerome did not have Ovid in his head as exactly as he did Vergil.

Likewise on Isa 57,16 "For a spirit proceeds from me, and I have made breathing things," Vg *quia spiritus a facie mea egredietur et flatus ego faciam*, Jerome quotes Vergil's cosmological verses, *Aeneid* 6.724-6:

Principio caelum ac terras camposque liquentes,
 lucentemque globum lunae, Titaniaque astra
 spiritus intus alit...

"In the beginning a spirit inwardly nourishes sky, earth, the watery plains, the shining globe of the moon, and the Titan stars." Milton, who also knew Hebrew, takes its Spirit and the Greek muse as interchangeable (*P.L.* 1.6-8):

Sing Heav'nly Muse, that on the secret top
 Of *Oreb*, or of *Sinai*, didst inspire
 That Shepherd [Moses]...

Grotius in *de Iure Belli et Pacis* (1625) with a sure instinct regularly puts Hebrew and Greco-Roman practice in parallel.⁸ Thus in two places⁹ he cites in his own Latin the law of Ex 22,1-2 that one who kills a thief at night is innocent, but guilty if the sun has risen. Beside this he puts the law of Solon¹⁰ echoed in Plato *Leg.* 9.874B "If one seizes and kills a thief entering a house at night for theft of goods, he shall remain pure": Νύκτωρ φῶρα εἰς οἰκίαν εἰσιόντα ἐπὶ κλοπῇ χρημάτων ἐὰν ἐλὼν κτείνῃ, καθαρὸς ἔστω. And he assumes (at 1.3.2.2, cf. 1.2.5.10) that a law in the XII Tables is from Athens, *haud dubie ex ueteri iure Attico profectum*, "If one makes a theft at night, if another kills him, let him be considered slain by right": SI NOX FVRTVM FAXSIT, SI IM OCCISIT, IURE CAESVS ESTO.¹¹

7 Hieronymus in *Esaiam* 30,6; Corp. Christ. 73.396.48; and similarly on Isa 11,6 at Corp. Christ. 73.151.31.

8 William Whewell's preface to his edition of 1854 (vol. I p. iv) feels that Grotius' "citations go to the extent of disturbing the didactic clearness and convenient brevity which we wish to find in a philosophical work"; from our present viewpoint they are its chief glory.

9 Grotius 1.3.2.2 (p. i.96 ed. Whewell) and 2.1.12.1 (p. i.217).

10 Demosthenes 24.113.

11 Cited by Macrobius *Sat.* 1.4.19, whose text reads *factum sit*, corrected to *faxsit* (OLD s.v. *furtum*). Same law in Texas! The New York Times (March 8, 1994) reported that a Texan had shot and killed with a telescopic rifle at 3:30 AM a "repo man" who was repossessing his truck for delinquent payments; police declined to arrest him, citing a

Again Grotius¹² cites Gen 9,6 "Whoever sheds the blood of man, by man shall his blood be shed"; and compares with it the "law of Rhadamanthys"¹³

εἰ κακά τις σπεύρει, κακά κέρδεα κ' ἀμήσειεν·
εἰ κε πάθοι τά τ' ἔρξε, δίκη κ' ἰθεῖα γένοιτο.

"If one should sow ill, he would reap ill profit; if one should suffer what he did, that would be a right judgement." Likewise Seneca the elder *Iustissima patiendi uice, quod quisque alieno excogitauit supplicio, saepe expiat suo*¹⁴ "It is by a most just exchange of suffering, that whatever one has devised for another's punishment, he often expiates by his own."¹⁵

That Greek literature is not systematically compared with Hebrew does not come from any lack of comparative spirit. Commentaries on the Hebrew Bible emphasize its connections with the ancient Near East. Two passages show a literary connection: Prov. 22,17—24,22 echoes the demotic Egyptian *Instruction of Amen-Em-Opet* or its source (p. 291 below); the curses of Deut 28,27-33 correspond to the curses which Esarhaddon required his vassals to impose on themselves (p. 280 below). Schmitt¹⁶ has gathered inherited Greek poetic formulas agreeing identically with their Sanskrit cousins. And Greek literature is regularly compared in turn with each of the ancient Near Eastern literatures except the one that it most resembles—Hebrew.

Thus archaic Greek literature and art are compared mostly with *Akkadian* in the work of Walter Burkert,¹⁷ who also chronicles study of the Oriental background to the Homeric poems.¹⁸ West has summarized Homeric parallels to texts mainly Akkadian.¹⁹ Walcot²⁰ has laid out the roots of Hesiod's *Theogony* in the *Hittite* world (and the Babylonian as well). The indebtedness of Hellas to *Egyptian* civilization has been well studied. Lloyd has written a

frontier-era law conceived as a deterrent to horse-theft "that gives Texans considerable leeway—at night only, not in daylight—to kill thieves and intruders."

12 Grotius 1.2.5.2 (p. i.40 Whewell).

13 Hesiod frag. 286 Merkelbach-West.

14 Elder Seneca, *Cont.* 10 praef. 6: I print the true text, Grotius quotes inaccurately from memory.

15 See my discussion, "From Hesiod to Jesus: Laws of Human Nature in the Ancient World," *NovT* 35 (1993) 313-343, p. 338.

16 Rüdiger Schmitt, *Dichtung und Dichtersprache in indogermanischer Zeit* (1967).

17 Walter Burkert, *The Orientalizing Revolution: Near Eastern Influence on Greek Culture in the Early Archaic Age* (1992): English version (revised by the author) of *Die orientalisierende Epoche in der griechischen Religion und Literatur* (1984).

18 Walter Burkert, "Homerstudien und Orient," pp. 155-181 of J. Latacz (ed.), *Zweihundert Jahre Homer-Forschung, Colloquium Rauricum* 2 (1991).

19 M. L. West, "The Rise of the Greek Epic," *JHS* 108 (1988) 151-172, esp. p. 170; citation below, p. 15.

20 P. Walcot, *Hesiod and the Near East* (1966). See further West on *Theogony*, 18-31, on the "Succession Myth" in Hittite, Akkadian and Philo Byblius.

full commentary from an Egyptological viewpoint on Herodotus' second book²¹ and Griffiths on Plutarch's *Isis and Osiris*;²² West²³ has also noted proverbial themes entering the later classical world, above all from Egypt; Fournet²⁴ has analyzed the Greek words derived from Egyptian. The enterprise of Martin Bernal, in progress,²⁵ announces a larger speculative attempt to derive much of Greek religion and vocabulary from Egyptian (and secondarily Phoenician) models.

In comparison of the classical world to *Canaanite* civilization, the most enticing areas have been the Ugaritic texts and the Amarna letters. The work of Astour²⁶ rests on identifications of peoples, in particular Danaoi and Danites (p. 227 below), which have not won universal acceptance. The books of Gordon,²⁷ tantalizing in their references to the Bible, rest in the end more on Ugaritic.²⁸ Study of the Phoenician world – in large part through Greco-Roman data – is solid rather than venturesome; it is now summarized in a great work of synthesis edited by Lipiński.²⁹

Or have Greek and Hebrew not been compared because they are not in fact comparable? A paragraph of Momigliano³⁰ might suggest that conclusion:

... what did Greeks and Jews make of these various opportunities [just summarized] for meeting and knowing each other? As for the Greeks, the answer is simple. They did not register the existence of the Jews. The little nation which was later to present the most radical challenge to the wisdom of the Greeks is mentioned nowhere in the extant pre-Hellenistic texts. ... As for the Jews of the Biblical period, they of course knew of Yavan, which designated all the Greeks rather than specifically the Ionians. Where Yavan is more precisely defined, as in the genealogy of Noah, Yavan is

-
- 21 Alan B. Lloyd, *Herodotus Book III*; EPROER 43; 3 vols. (1975-1993). See further M. Austin, *Greece and Egypt in the Archaic Age*, Cambridge Philological Society Proceedings, Supplement 2 (1970).
 - 22 J. Gwyn Griffiths, *Plutarch's De Iside et Osiride* (1970).
 - 23 M. L. West, "Near Eastern Material in Hellenistic and Roman Literature," *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 73 (1968) 113-134.
 - 24 Jean-Luc Fournet, "Les emprunts du grec à l'égyptien," *Bulletin de la Société de Linguistique de Paris* 84 (1989) 55-80.
 - 25 Martin Bernal, *Black Athena: The Afroasiatic Roots of Classical Civilization* (1987—).
 - 26 Michael C. Astour, *Hellenosemitica: An Ethnic and Cultural Study in West Semitic Impact on Mycenaean Greece* (1965).
 - 27 Cyrus H. Gordon, *Homer and Bible: The Origin and Character of East Mediterranean Literature*, repr. (1967) from HUCA 26 (1955) 43-108; —, *Before the Bible: The Common Background of Greek and Hebrew Civilisations* (1962).
 - 28 Sarah P. Morris, *Daidalos and the Origins of Greek Art* (1992), has four chapters with extensive bibliography on the relations of Greece with Ugarit and the Phoenicians.
 - 29 Édouard Lipiński (ed.), *Dictionnaire de la civilisation phénicienne et punique*, Brepols (1992).
 - 30 Arnaldo Momigliano, *Alien Wisdom: The Limits of Hellenization* (1975) 77-78.

father of Elisah, Tarsis, Kittim and Dodanim; that is, probably, of Alashiya and Kition in Cyprus, of Rhodes³¹ and of Tarsus—rather than Tartessus. There is no indication that Athens, Sparta, Thebes or even Miletus and Ephesus were consciously connected with the name Yavan.

The presumption here (which also underlies the separation of "Phoenician studies" and "Old Testament studies") is that Israel and the Jews are a people distinct from the coastal cities: Aradus, Byblos, Sidon, Tyre. What are the grounds of this distinction? Not language: for the language of the coastal cities, recorded in their inscriptions, is along with Hebrew and Moabite simply one of the dialects of Canaanite. The "Gezer calendar" of the 10th century BC (KAI 182) has been classified both as Hebrew and as Phoenician.³² Isa 19,18 envisages five cities in Egypt speaking the "lip of Canaan," קַנְעָן שְׂפַת כְּנָעַן Vg *lingua Chanaan*.³³ At II Reg 18,26 it is called "Judean," יְהוּדִית, and the Rabshakeh can speak it; those who knew no other tongue could not understand the Aramaic of Damascus, אַרְמִיית (LXX Συροστί). But Hebrews and Sidonians never had trouble communicating. Jezebel can write acceptable Hebrew (I Reg 21,8) and in her last words makes herself well understood to Jehu (II Reg 9,31). And in the end both peoples stopped speaking their native Canaanite.³⁴

Is the distinction that Hebrews and Phoenicians had different deities? They did indeed; but so did the Phoenician cities. Melqarth is the Baal of Tyre, KAI 47 מַלְקָרְת בַּעַל צַר; Eshmun has his temple just north of Sidon (KAI 15); Byblos has her lady (KAI 5 etc.) בַּעַלְת גְּבַל. Phoenicians might worship several deities, but so did Israelite kings and commoners, not to mention Jews of Elephantine. The Phoenician cities were maritime, but so briefly was Solomon's realm (I Reg 9,26); and Phoenician sea-trade was complemented by Israelite land-trade. Their architectures hardly differed, since the Jerusalem temple was built by Hiram of Tyre (I Reg 7,13).³⁵ We learn from the Hebrew side that they were in regular political relations.

-
- 31 Unlikely, see the Appendix; it is only I Chron 1,7 that interprets as "Rhodians" Gen 10,4 לְרֹדָנִים, which if an attested Greek place could only be Dodona, Δωδώνη *Iliad* 2.750. Also, Lipiński in DCP 440 is certain that Hebrew Tarshish can represent only Tartessus, not Tarsus.
- 32 Discussion by Lipiński in DCP 255.
- 33 Jerome (*in Esaiam* 19,18; Corp. Christ. 73.284.45) incorrectly thinks this is neither Hebrew nor Egyptian, *sed lingua Chananitide, quae inter Aegyptiam et Hebraeae media est, et Hebraeae magna ex parte confinis*.
- 34 The best study of Hebrew-Phoenician relations is now that of Briquel-Chatonnet, who wonders (p. 291) whether Israel reciprocally influenced Phoenician religion and cult, or "whether the cult of Yahweh, at certain moments, was observed at Tyre."
- 35 But Briquel-Chatonnet (p. 362) thinks that the Phoenician artisans brought only building techniques, but not types of buildings or ornaments unknown in Palestine.

There is no record of their having gone to war against each other. Hebrew and Phoenician inscriptions on stone and ostraca are much alike; we know what Hebrew history, laws and poetry are like, and it would be a bold person to deny that Phoenicians had such, of whatever literary merit. The principal difference then is that in the end Hebrews managed to remain a people preserving their faith and their books, and Phoenicians did not.

So, as Thebes was an inland city with a literary culture over against maritime Corinth, Jerusalem and Israel were *the inland literary phase of the culture of which the Phoenician cities were the maritime*. The traders of "Yawan," however illiterate, must have conveyed hints of new cultural enterprises at Athens and Thebes. And so Phoenician traders surely conveyed hints of new beginnings at Jerusalem. The culture of the Phoenicians proper included much not in their own records. To fill the gap, the Hebrew Bible is by far the best witness. Since from Homer onwards Greeks were in regular contact with Phoenicians, a vast new area of demonstrable Helleno-Canaanite relations is revealed. We only need to open up Hebrew and Greek books side by side.

The strongest beginnings have been made in specific cultural areas (listed in 1.3.3 below), though mostly without explicit comparison of texts: spices, the sacrificial cult, proverbs, the treaty, divinities (Melqarth, the god of Kasios). E. Masson discusses "Semitic loanwords in Greek" but again in isolation from the texts; Rosén stops short of a full treatment in any area. There is a promising theoretical beginning in a Hamburg symposium of 1990.³⁶

Die Ergebnisse des Symposions wecken die Frage, ob es auf kulturellem und religiösem Gebiet im Altertum neben den Gemeinsamkeiten des Fruchtbaren Halbmonds ["Fertile Crescent"] nicht auch, in mancher Hinsicht gegenläufig dazu, eine Art *levantinischen Halbkreises* um das östliche und nördliche Mittelmeer gegeben hat, *von Palästina bis nach Hellas reichend*, der seine eigenen mythologischen Ideen und kultischen Praktiken ausgebildet hat.

In the present work, following the sequence of my original articles, I treat contacts between Hebrew and Greek literature by subject areas. In this introduction I give a more systematic outline. Chapters 2-9 should be supplemented from a further set of articles treating other themes, which could also be collected as in this volume. For reference I list them with letters and short titles:

36 "OBO 129" p. viii; italics mine.

- (A) "Men of the Land."³⁷
- (B) "The High God and the Elements."³⁸
- (C) "Divine Kingship."³⁹
- (D) "Archery."⁴⁰
- (E) "Shamanism."⁴¹
- (F) "Ark and Janus."⁴²
- (G) "Templum and Saeculum."⁴³
- (H) "Prometheus."⁴⁴
- (I) "From Hesiod to Jesus."⁴⁵

Here I first (section 1.2 below) briefly summarize common features of Hebrew and Greek texts which distinguish them from the documents of the Ancient Near East. I then (1.3) analyze topical areas of contact, historic and prehistoric, between those texts, referring to my chapters here and the further articles (A)-(I). To account for the historic contacts I discuss (1.4) sets of conditions (necessary though not sufficient) for a society to produce texts warranting preservation: in a word, a society organized around more or less *independent city-states*. To account for the prehistoric contacts I treat (1.5) the evidence for movement of peoples in both directions between Canaan and the Aegean. In (1.6) I discuss the alphabet as the common *form* of the texts; in (1.7) theism and humanism as their *content*. Matters not covered elsewhere in this work or the supplementary articles are treated in a little more detail.

-
- 37 "Men of the Land and the God of Justice in Greece and Israel," ZAW 95 (1983) 376-402.
 - 38 "Yahweh, Zeus, Jupiter: The High God and the Elements"; ZAW 106 (1994) 175-197.
 - 39 "From Divine Kingship to Dispersal of Power in the Mediterranean City-State," ZAW 105 (1993) 62-86.
 - 40 "Archery in the Ancient World: 'Its Name is Life, its Work is Death'," BibZ 37 (1993/4) 26-42.
 - 41 "The Mediterranean Seer and Shamanism," ZAW 93 (1981) 374-400; of all these articles, the one requiring most revision.
 - 42 "The Ark of the Covenant and the Temple of Janus: The magico-military numen of the state in Jerusalem and Rome," BibZ 30 (1986/7) 20-35.
 - 43 "The *Templum* and the *Saeculum*: Sacred Space and Time in Israel and Etruria," ZAW 98 (1986) 415-433.
 - 44 "Prometheus, the Servant of Yahweh, Jesus: Legitimation and Repression in the Heritage of Persian Imperialism," pp. 109-125 of *The Bible and the Politics of Exegesis* [Norman Gottwald Festschrift], ed. David Jobling et alii, 1991.
 - 45 "From Hesiod to Jesus: Laws of Human Nature in the Ancient World," NovT 35 (1993) 313-343.

1.2 Common features of Hebrew and Greek texts

The literatures of Israel and Hellas have striking features in common as over against the ancient Near East, which should have led us to compare them first. But the new hieroglyphic and cuneiform texts, for all their defects, demanded top billing: *omne ignotum pro magnifico*. Hebrew and Greek texts have typical differences also. The Hebrew canon eventually settled on was much smaller than the Greek. Hebrew verse, not syllabic or metrical, was less memorable than Greek. Hellas created the forms of epic, philosophy and science; Israel preserved its laws; but both have history, wisdom, lyric, hymns, cosmology and drama (Hebrew in *Job*). Greek scholars mostly preserved just one history for each period; the Hebrew canon shapes one continuous history from the beginning. Hebrew tells us only a little about "all the gods" whom its God rules as a "great king" (Ps 95,3). But none of these differences negate deeper agreements over against the Near East.

1.2.1 Continuity of preservation

The Hebrew and Greek books we possess have never been lost: since they were written, they have always (like Latin books) been in friendly hands somewhere. Unlike the normally fragmentary remains of the Near East, they are mostly complete. At times the tradition has run thin. Aeschylus, Lucretius, Tacitus, Catullus come down by a slender thread; Sappho only in fragments; Polybius and Livy only in their first books. For a thousand years after Jerome, the Hebrew Bible was confined to the synagogue; the western Church knew it only in Latin. Knowledge of Aristotle came at third hand, through Syriac and Arabic, though the Greek was preserved at Constantinople. Shakespeare (unlike his learned contemporaries Marlowe and Jonson) knew Greek drama only through its coarse image in Seneca. But in each generation the traditions had devoted reciters and interpreters somewhere. Just by itself, that continuity marks off Hebrew and Greek literature from all the others. We know how the tradition pronounced and interpreted the texts; from the beginning our society somehow has been in dialogue with them.

Their original makers anticipated that continuity. Isa 40,8 "The grass withers, the flower fades, but the word of our God will abide for ever":

יְבֹשׁ הָעֵצִיר נְבֵל צִיץ וְדָבַר אֱלֹהֵינוּ יָקִים לְעוֹלָם

Achilles will go on fighting (*Iliad* 9.413), for if he does "my return is lost, but I will have imperishable fame" with a famous Indo-European phrase,

Sanskrit *śrávo...áksitam*⁴⁶ = κλέ(F)ος ἄφθιτον:

ᾠλετο μὲν μοι νόστος, ἀτὰρ κλέος ἄφθιτον ἔσται.

Horace (*Carm.* 4.9.25-28) knows that "many strong men lived before Agamemnon," *uixere fortes ante Agamemnona*, but unwept and unknown, "because they lack a sacred bard," *caerent quia uate sacro*. Thucydides, sure that his long work would be copied in perpetuity, calls it a "possession for ever," κτῆμα...ἕς αἰεί (1.22.4). Jesus says of a woman (Mark 14,9) that "wherever the Gospel is preached in the whole world, what she has done will be spoken of as a memorial of her (εἰς μνημόσυνον αὐτῆς)." Horace again boasts, in contrast to any Egyptian, "I have raised a monument more lasting than bronze, and higher than the royal crumbling⁴⁷ of the pyramids" (*Carm.* 3.30.1-2)

Exegi monumentum aere perennius
regalique situ pyramidum altius.

So Shakespeare again and again, even though there are indications⁴⁸ that he tried to suppress the 1609 publication of his Sonnets (*Son.* 55):

Not marble, nor the gilded monument[s],
Of Princes shall out-lieue this powrefull rime.

1.2.2 Phonetic script (1.6 below)

Hebrew and Greek texts are set down in exquisitely accurate symbols, which surpass modern phonetics in some respects (like the Hebrew sentence accents). Each script with its letter-names comes from the Phoenician alphabet. The basic Hebrew text marks only consonants. The basic Greek adds vowels, but was not that much easier to read from, since its first texts were written alternating right to left and left to right, with no word- or line-divisions; West⁴⁹ so restores the first verses of Hesiod's *Works and Days*. But the texts were not exactly meant to be read from: they served rather as an *aide-mémoire* and control in the recitation of compositions already memorized. Only when

46 Rüdiger Schmitt, *Dichtung und Dichtersprache in indogermanischer Zeit* (1967). Hector (*Iliad* 7.89-91) challenges an Achaean to fight and anticipates winning, so that in days to come one will recite the funeral epitaph of his victim, and "my fame will never perish."

47 Against the OLD but with several editors I take *situ* in a double sense, both "site" and "crumbling."

48 Robert Giroux, *The Book Known as Q: A Consideration of Shakespeare's Sonnets* (1982).

49 West, *Works and Days*, p. 60. Pausanias 5.17.6 and others call a text written in alternating directions βουστροφηδόν, "as an ox plows."

the tradition of oral recitation was fading elsewhere did Hebrew scholars (the "Masoretes" of Tiberias) invent signs for vowels, diacritics on consonants, word and sentence accent; so Byzantine Greek scholars noted word-endings, and applied accents and breathings consistently. The texts were composed with a careful ear to euphony, reaching its high point in Vergil, who in his ideal line puts a different vowel into each of the six stressed syllables (*Ecl.* 1.3):

nōs patri|ae fī |nī s et| dū lcia| lī nquimus| árua.

1.2.3 Texts of a whole people (1.4 below)

Public texts of the ancient Near East record the acts of kings, priests, gods—of whom they speak only favorably, as being written by interested parties. To master cuneiform and hieroglyphic required, then as today, a lifetime of study; nobody outside court, temple and counting-house was offered that study. But alphabetic script was available to any man or woman who wished to learn it. That only a small percentage of Greeks achieved literacy⁵⁰ does not alter its new availability. Reflection and composition went on outside court and temple: among bards of the nobility, shepherds touched with the spirit of justice, impartial military historians, makers of dramas, men and women of song, composers of dialogues, lecturers. When such deal with rulers and priests, as often as not they speak in reproof. The societies came to see such texts less as the record of their accomplishment than as that accomplishment itself.

1.2.4 Theism and humanism (1.7 below)

The men and women portrayed in those texts come from all ranks of society, behaving and speaking as we know such ones do. The texts encourage us to praise their selflessness, sympathize with their suffering, reject their crimes. And since language is the deposit of society, to enlarge it enlarges society; not merely is such a record of acts and emotions a new historical emergent, but the acts and emotions themselves. In the texts we recognize freedom, truthfulness, reflection. New social conditions made possible new levels of nobility and of arrogance; and texts rising above both by picturing them.

All that novelty happened against a background of God or the gods. The pathos of transience was only grasped—could only have been grasped—

50 William V. Harris, *Ancient Literacy* (1989).

against the serenity of permanence. The protest against injustice spoke always in the name of a God of justice. Israel has a humanism which can stand beside the Hellenic; and neither would have been possible except in an original setting of theism. Hellas has a theism comparable to that of Israel, though along different lines. And conversely, the excellence of the characters given the gods was only possible after hints of it had already been perceived in men and women.

1.2.5 Exemplary character and originality

Although (as we shall find) Hebrew and Greek books are linked by hidden influences of trade, war, prehistoric arts; although they saw themselves over against the same background of civilizations—Akkadian, Egyptian, Phoenician—; nevertheless, neither is aware of any dependence on earlier *literatures*. Understanding of the human and divine worlds in Israel and Hellas, as set down in their texts—our only evidence for that understanding—, blossomed from native soil. Such oral formulas as Greek epic has in common with Sanskrit, or Hebrew poetry with Ugaritic, were not seen as an inheritance but simply part of the language of verse. Here is their biggest divergence from Latin literature, which from the beginning consisted in the adaptation, close or free, of Greek models. Likewise the earliest monuments of Germanic literature betray their knowledge both of the Bible and Latin tradition. Thus *Beowulf* knows God as *Ælmihtige* (92); Cain and Abel by name (107-8); Greco-Latin loanwords (2088)

dēofles cræftum ond dracan fellum

"The *devil's* craft, the *dragon's* hide." Compare Rev 12,9 (cf. 20,2) where among the titles of Satan are listed "the great dragon...called the devil," ὁ δράκων ὁ μέγας ... ὁ καλούμενος διάβολος, Vg *draco ille magnus ... qui uocatur diabolus*.

The complete originality of Hebrew and Greek texts is a feature no other literature has claimed or now can. A scientist might expect that the earliest literatures would be as primitive as Greek science; though admirable in their way, admitting indefinite improvement. Not so. It turns out that understanding of affairs human and divine is not in any obvious sense a cumulative body of knowledge. The consciousness of being innovators in a comparatively free society with a phonetic script at one's disposal created works seen from that time to this as exemplary models of insight, expression and form, and due perhaps to remain so forever.

Some literary forms, like sculpture and music, seem unrepeatable. In modern languages a pure stream of lyric poetry flows on uninterrupted. A

bare handful of works may be considered to have surpassed their originals: the New Testament in spiritual insight; Shakespeare in fit representation of character; the nineteenth-century novel in portrayal of a contemporary social world. No accident that these works are deeply rooted in the tradition. The novels of Russia, the nearest to an independent society, sit most loosely to the past.

The unique excellences of Hebrew and Greek literature are most akin to novelties in biological evolution, where new structures emerging in a relatively brief period remain determinative for the whole future development. So Israel and Hellas represent the two poles of an unrepeatable emergence, which has colored and will continue to color the whole future development, and which we ignore to our loss. The doctrines of divine revelation and classical form express that special character for the two societies respectively. My novelty here consists in laying out the hidden connections between the twin centers of the new development. The argument of this book, if taken seriously, should enlarge our notions of both theism and humanism; it should also bring us to see revelation and classicism as the two forms of a broader notion. In another place (Article A, "Men of the Land...") I provisionally define that notion as *inspiration*; the poet's words are breathed into his mouth by a feminine memory-figure, the Muse or Spirit.

1.3 Realms of contact between Hebrew and Greek texts

Are the parallel features in the texts independent accidents, or the result of historical connections? Here I list what I regard as unmistakable indications (for those who have ears to hear) drawn from the texts that the two societies were in touch at one or more removes. We want such indications to be as clear and persuasive as possible; and I propose two minor categories and a major one. A few texts (1.3.1) are in effect *translations* of each other (but without common vocabulary). Others (1.3.2) show abundantly that Israel and Hellas lived in *the same geopolitical world* of states and rulers, with the shared vocabulary of their *proper names*. Above all (1.3.3) the texts witness that the two societies were engaged in *parallel enterprises* with a *shared vocabulary of common nouns* (and a few verbs too). The chapters here, with the supplementary articles, take up those enterprises one by one and illustrate the vocabulary.

The archaeological record, a whole other field of study, should be a fourth category of evidence. When it illustrates objects appearing in the texts, I try

to note it: thus with the griffin throne, the pillar holding up the sky, the bull sacrificed and the bull-god, the gold or silver bowl, the arrow. Finally, I mostly omit parallelism in narrative themes for two reasons: (1') it is often between Greek epic and cuneiform texts which I do not control, but in which I suspect little shared vocabulary with the Greek; (2') it is less objective and demonstrable than the others. A quotation from M. L. West,⁵¹ documented in his context, will summarize:

...it is hard to believe that the extensive thematic parallels [of Greek epic] with oriental texts all reflect Mycenaean borrowings that were faithfully preserved through five centuries or so of Greek tradition: the destruction of mankind to relieve the earth from the burden of overpopulation; a debate scene in which an angry hero makes to raise his weapon but is physically restrained by two goddesses; a hero who appeals to his divine mother to intercede with a higher god on his behalf (and she, in doing so, laments her son's danger-courting nature); the goddess of love crying and complaining to her parents, Sky and Mrs Sky, of maltreatment by a mortal, and receiving an unsympathetic response from her father; a goddess dressing up in fine clothes and jewellery made by the gods' smith, in preparation for an amorous encounter; this smith (who uses bellows and tongs, and works with precious metals, and builds houses for the gods) making special weapons for a hero at the request of the hero's parent; the divine messenger who takes his staff in his hand and puts his shoes on his feet; the hero who at the death of his beloved companion tears his hair and clothes and rages in the night 'like a lion deprived of its cubs', and is visited by the companion's spirit coming up from the nether world, and embraces it, and learns the meaning of death. There is a freshness and vividness about all this as it appears in the *Iliad* which suggests that it is comparatively modern material...

Many of these parallels are from Burkert's *Or. Rev.*; in the Appendix I briefly note "Sky and Mrs Sky" (p. 329) and "like a lion deprived of its cubs" (p. 340).

1.3.1 Translations

The Hebrew and Greek proverb-books of Solomon and Theognis (Chapter 9.1) contain a few items which seem nothing less than translations— but without common vocabulary. Likewise some of the provisions and curses attached to the loyalty-oath form of the treaty (Chapter 8.1).

51 M. L. West, "The Rise of the Greek Epic," *JHS* 108 (1988) 151-172, p. 170.

1.3.2 A common geopolitical world

Greek and Hebrew literature are securely set against a common background of realms: Egypt, Mesopotamia, Persia, Syria, Phoenicia, Anatolia (1.5.1), with very many proper names of places, peoples and kings. Darius' Behistun inscription was known to the Jews of Elephantine in an Aramaic translation, and its contents to Herodotus at one or more removes. Here in particular I note Greek and Hebrew knowledge of the two main Akkadian epics.

1.3.2.1 *Gilgamesh*

His name is mostly expressed in Akkadian ideograms as GIŠ.GIN.MAŠ,⁵² but once as^d Gi-il-ga-mèš.⁵³ Greeks knew him as Γίλγαμος king of Babylon, saved as a baby by an eagle from death (Aelian *de nat. anim.* 12.21).⁵⁴ (Herodotus and the Jews were well acquainted with Babylon [Babel] and agree in the name of the "brick" [πλίνθος = Targumic כְּהַבִּיזָה, Chapter 2.6].) In the Qumran fragments of the Enochian *Book of Giants*⁵⁵ he appears as טיגמלג and טיגמל[ג]; he is accompanied by שׁבבב who may be Humbaba of the Akkadian epic, and with a shift of gender as Anatolian Κυβήβη (Appendix). Aelian also stumbled on the afterlife of the lost plant of youth (Tablet XI, echoed in Eden?). In his burlesque version (*de nat. anim.* 6.51) Zeus rewards the informers on Prometheus with the "drug that wards off old age," φάρμακον γήρωσ ἀμυντήριον.⁵⁶ They put it on an ass, which comes thirsty to a spring; its serpent guardian gets him to exchange the plant for a drink. The ass drinks, the serpent sloughs off its γήρας (Greek for both "old age" and "snakeskin") and gets the ass's thirst which goes into his poison.⁵⁷

52 R. Labat, *Manuel d'Épigraphie akkadienne*, 4th ed. (1963) 137.

53 Falkenstein in RLA iii.358.

54 His Sumerian counterpart Ziusudra (ANET³ 44) was known to Greeks as Ξίσουθρος (Berossus, FGH 680 frag. 3.13) and Σίσουθρος (Abydenus, FGH 685 frag. 3), so that the name must have been alive somewhere in Akkadian, though apparently unattested there.

55 J. T. Milik, *The Books of Enoch: Aramaic Fragments of Qumrân Cave 4* (1976) 313.

56 The "medicine of immortality" has a long afterlife: Ibycus frag. 32, Page PMG 158; Isis used it to raise Osiris from the dead (Diodorus 1.25.6); Ignatius of Antioch (*ad Eph.* 20.2) of the Eucharist; Seneca *de prov.* 3.12 has Socrates drink the poison as if it were *medicamentum immortalitatis*.

57 See also Nicander *Ther.* 343-354 and the Scholiast, who attributes the story to Sophocles' lost *Kophoi Satyroi*, frag. 362 TrGF iv.326.

1.3.2.2 *Enuma Elis*

Although the cosmology of Genesis is surely related to the Akkadian creation epic, Greeks knew it in much more detail. Eudemus of Rhodes, an Aristotelian of the fourth century BC, from some source had knowledge of its first verses. Damascius the neo-Platonist ascribes various Oriental cosmologies to him, including that of the "Babylonians":⁵⁸

τῶν δὲ βαρβάρων εἰκόμασι Βαβυλώνιοι μὲν τὴν μίαν τῶν ὄλων ἀρχὴν σιγῇ παριέναι, δύο δὲ ποιεῖν Ταυθὲ καὶ Ἀπασῶν, τὸν μὲν Ἀπασῶν ἀνδρα τῆς Ταυθὲ ποιοῦντες, ταύτην δὲ μητέρα θεῶν ὀνομάζοντες, ἐξ ὧν μονογενῆ παῖδα γεννηθῆναι τὸν Μωϋμίν, αὐτόν, οἶμαι, τὸν νοητὸν κόσμον ἐκ τῶν δυεῖν ἀρχῶν παραγόμενον, ἐκ δὲ τῶν αὐτῶν ἄλλην γενεάν προελθεῖν, Δαχὴν καὶ Δαχόν, εἶτα αὐτὴν τρίτην ἐκ τῶν αὐτῶν, Κισσαρὴ καὶ Ἀσσωρόν, ἐξ ὧν γενέσθαι τρεῖς, Ἄνον καὶ Ἴλλινον καὶ Ἀόν· τοῦ δὲ Ἀοῦ καὶ Δαύκης υἱὸν γενέσθαι τὸν Βῆλον, ὃν δημιουργὸν εἶναί φασιν.

Among the barbarians, the Babylonians seem to pass over in silence the single principle of all things, but to set up two, Tauthe and Apason; making Apason the husband of Tauthe, calling her the mother of the gods. From them a single son was born, Moymin, whom I believe to be the intelligible cosmos generated from the two principles; from the same two another generation came into being, Dache (fem.?) and Dachos (?); then a third generation from the same, Kissares and Assoros. From these last three were born, Anos and Illinos and Aos; Aos and Dauke [= Dache?] had a son Belos, whom they call the Demiurge.

Here from the first lines of *Enuma Elis*⁵⁹ are Apsu the fresh water and Tiamat (in the form Tiawat) the sea. Damascius' text has an error in uncials, for *Λαχὴν and *Λαχόν would be Lahmu and Lahamu of the epic. Moymin is the mysterious *muummum* of the Akkadian. Then come Anshar and Kishar, and Anu the firstborn of Anshar. Burkert⁶⁰ concludes that, as we learn best the beginning of a foreign text, somewhere Babylonians were actually teaching Greeks the beginning of their epic.

58 Damascius *de prim. princ.* 124 ed. Ruelle i.319, reprinted by F. Wehrli, *Die Schule des Aristoteles* [viii], Eudemos von Rhodos (1955), Eudemos frag. 150, p. 70.

59 I follow the translation in ANET³ 61; I do not control the Akkadian text, which anyway seems still to be fragmentary here at the beginning. The "generic term *lahmu*" denotes "apotropaic figures at the gates" (CAD 9.42).

60 Burkert, *Orientalizing Revolution* 95.

1.3.3 Enterprises with common vocabulary

1.3.3.1 Nature of the common vocabulary (Chapter 2)

Greek and Hebrew have a body of shared words, mostly common nouns, naming key elements in the two cultures.⁶¹ Some moved from East to West and represent "Semitic loanwords in Greek," studied by Masson.⁶² Some moved in the opposite direction, "Greek loanwords in Canaanite"; others are "Mediterranean"; others go back to the source of Indo-European and Semitic, or beyond. Further I claim three parallel formations of verb with noun object, corresponding to three central activities of both peoples: during the business day they "tested gold" (9.2); on holidays they "slaughtered a bull" (6.5) and afterwards "mixed wine" (4.4).

Greek and Hebrew also inherited common noun-endings which facilitated the takeover of loanwords and ethnics.⁶³ Thus consonantal stems in the singular: ἄρραβών from עֲרַבּוֹן "pledge"; γρύψ from קְרוֹב "griffin, cherub"; ἴων from Ἴάων "Ionian, Greek." Feminine singulars with open vowel: κασία from קַצִּיָּעָה "cassia" (itself reworking of an Oriental word); λῆσχη from לְשֶׁכֶּה "winehall"; ethnics, as Σιδονίηθεν "Sidonian" (*Iliad* 6.291) beside *צִדְנִיָּה (צִדְנִית) pl. I Reg 11,1). Plurals in a diphthong -y: δέλοτοι from דְּלֹתַי "tablets" (a Hebrew dual); ταῦροι with Aram. תּוֹרֵי "bulls"; λόγχοι with רִמְחֵי "lances"; Ἑρεμβοί (*Odyssey* 4.84) showing the final accent of collective אֲרַמֵּי (Deut 26,5) "Aramaeans." Most are treated here elsewhere.

In both languages loanwords are partially transformed by being given folk-etymologies. Thus Herodotus' forms of Persian names suggest the story in which they appear.⁶⁴ Hebrew בְּרִיקָה "'emerald,' green stone" assimilates Sanskrit *marakata* to בְּרִיק "lightning." In three languages the names of the date-palm are assimilated to the hand: Isidore⁶⁵ *palma manus est dispansis digitis sicut et arbor dispansis ramis* "Palm is a hand with fingers spread and a tree with branches spread." Thus Lev 23,40 כַּפַּת תְּמָרִים "hands' of

61 Very often, as we shall see, the LXX translate the Hebrew by the related Greek; either because it was the natural name of the thing, or from similarity of sound, or both. For lists see E. Tov, "Loan-words, Homophony and Transliterations in the Septuagint," *Biblica* 60 (1979) 216-236, at pp. 220-222; my "The Septuagint as a Source of the Greek Loan-Words in the Targums," *Biblica* 70 (1989) 194-216, at pp. 205-206.

62 Émilie Masson, *Recherches sur les plus anciens emprunts sémitiques en grec*, *Études et Commentaires* 67 (1967), an essential work. W. Burkert has discussed the loanwords further in *The Orientalizing Revolution* 33-40.

63 Levin and I have discussed them in our "Ethnic Paradigm...".

64 O. Kimball Armayor, "Herodotus' Persian Vocabulary," *Ancient World* 1 (1978) 147-156.

65 Isidorus *de diff.* 2.62, cited TLL x.141.59.

palm-trees"; Greeks etymologized Mishnaic דָּקָל "date" (*Peah* IV.1, cf. Gen 10,27 לְבָנֵי טְרָחְיָה tribal name) as δάκτυλος "finger."⁶⁶ Tamar (I Reg 9,18 K תָּמָר) "City of Palms" was interpreted as Tadmor (I Reg 9,18 Q תְּדֹמֹר); Greek Πάλμυρα (Appian *Civ.* 5.9) was perhaps associated with παλάμη "palm of the hand," and *Palmyra* (Pliny 5.88) surely with *palma* in both senses.

1.3.3.2 Contacts between city-states

We begin an outline of the common enterprises at the clearest point—the city-state in the full light of history—and work backwards and forwards.

1.3.3.2.1 Contacts via trade

Sea-trade. Wine was carried by sea in an amphora, *cadus* (Chapter 4.5), and a Phoenician freighter was a "tub," γαῦλος (4.7), corresponding to another meaning of Heb. לָהַךְ "bowl." The tuna (θύννος) may reflect תַּנִּינִי "sea-dragon" (3.5). Early anchors were stone;⁶⁷ Homer calls them εὐνάς (*Iliad* 1.436) with folk-etymology to the same word for "beds": then with εὐναί nom. pl. compare Hebrew "stones," אֲבָנִי.⁶⁸

Land-trade. See Article A "Men of the Land," esp. section IV: its principal terms are the sack (שַׁקֵּי = σάκκος = Lat. *saccus*) carried by the ass (אֲוִוִּן, Targumic אֲוִוִּן, Latin *asinus*). The traders were likely transmitters of proverbs (Chap. 9). A possible crop exported was the humble "bean": Hebrew פּוּל, Latin *puls*; and πολτός can be "bean porridge".

Banking and a gold-economy. See Chapter 9.2, especially the words for "gold" (χρυσός = צָהָב) and "to test" (ἰσμεν = בָּחַן = βασανίζω); also the words for "pledge" (ἀρραβών = צָרְבוֹן, 2.4).

The movements of women. Women, often as concubines (παλλακίς = פְּלִלְגָה = *paelex*, 2.1), move easily between societies (Chap. 7), carrying their cults (e.g. that of Adonis) and trousseaux with them.

66 Aristotle *Meteor.* 342a10.

67 Honor Frost, "Ancres," DCP 29-30. Lionel Casson, *Ships and Seamanship in the Ancient World* (1973) fig. 187: trapezoidal stone anchors with holes for the cable from a wreck of ab. 350 BC.

68 O. Szemerényi, "Etyma Graeca V (30-32): Vocabula Maritima Tria," pp. 425-450 of A. Etter (ed.), *o-o-pe-ro-si* [Festschrift Ernst Risch] (1986).

Exoticism. The heart of the common vocabulary is luxury imported goods sold by traders and carried by women: names of jewels (2.8), linens (6.7), cosmetics (7.2.3)—above all spices and perfumes (2.2, 4.8, 6.8 and Excur-sus A), for which see the excellent books of Miller and Faure.

1.3.3.2.2 Contacts by war

Materiel. Weapon-names are exchanged in battle: thus (Chapter 5) the helmet (κύμβαχος = כַּוָּכָח); lances (λόγγαι = יָהֲמָרָה = *lanceae*); cf. the tent (σκηνή = הַיָּבֵה); and in Article D "Archery" arrows (ἄξῃ = οὔστοί = *sagittae*).

Provisions of the treaty. By definition these are shared between peoples. See Chapter 8 throughout, with the ground-breaking studies by Moshe Weinfeld there cited.

Magical themes. Article F sees the Ark of the Covenant and the Temple of Janus as boxes releasing the state's military *numen* on the enemy.

1.3.3.3 Archaic materials revealed by the first literary texts

The texts of the historical city-states record institutions and vocabulary resting on prehistoric contacts between societies.

Viticulture. Some of the extensive vocabulary of the vine much antedates the formation of the city-state, and either represents Mediterranean usage or old importations from elsewhere; see Chapter 4.

The sacrificial cult. The oldest stratum of vocabulary—the words for "bull" and "horn," and the verb "to slaughter"—may go back to the formative period of the Indo-European and Semitic languages. The cult that they describe may be younger (Chapter 6): several authors, with Yerkes as their predecessor, derive the Israelite sacrificial cult from the West.

The High God and the elements. Zeus and Jupiter, bearing the Indo-European name of the "bright sky," in the Mediterranean become like Yahweh gods of the "dark sky"; the names of the elements they drop down—lightning, snow, rain and water, along with the "earth" (Arabic أَرْضُ *arḍa*, Heb. אֶרֶץ, ἔραϛε > * ἔρασ-δε, German *Erde*) they fall on—seem to have very old connections: see Article B "The High God and the Elements."

Cosmological myth and the primeval dragon. Israel and Hellas know a battle of the High God with the sea-dragon, located at Mount Kasios of Syria, connected with the original making of the world: see Chapter 2.8 (on his "sickle," ἄρπη = תְּרִב), Chapter 3.4, and Excursus B. They agree further in seeing the sky as a metallic dome propped up by pillars (Chap. 3).

The Mediterranean seer and shamanism. Practices coming in from Scythia modify older features of a Mediterranean seer. In particular he is associated with the "torch" (λαμπάς = לְפִיֵד); see Article E.

The original divine kingship. The partial democracy of the city-states is set against memories of a time, historical or mythical, where the king shared attributes of the high God; see Article C.

Sacred space and time. Israel and Etruria share archaic ideas about the sacred precinct (תְּמִנַת = τέμενος = *templum*) and the "generation" of a city; see Article G.

1.3.3.4 Under loss of civic independence to new empires

In a last series of studies we trace social roles under the city-state to the situation under new empires, in particular the Roman.

Dispersal of political power. The undermining of the powers vested in divine kingship, already advanced under the city-state, is completed under empire; see Article C "Divine Kingship" part 2.

The roles of women. The roles of princess and concubine, and primitive village equality of women, are reduced or disappear under the restrictions of the city-state; but when genuine political power is taken away from the city, the relative power of women again rises; see Chapter 7.

Imperial incentives and sanctions. The Persian Empire was seen as the origin of symbolic incentives such as the king's forest-reserve or *paradise*, and the real sanction of crucifixion. Prometheus, the Servant of Yahweh and Jesus are types of the empire's adversary; see Article H "Prometheus."

The "laws" of human nature, prescriptive and descriptive. Love of friends and love of enemies from Hesiod to Jesus: Article I. Here I discuss the correlatives "love" (ἀγάπη, אֲהָבָה) and "grief" (ἀνίη, אֲנִיָה).

1.4 Conditions for the new literatures

Four sets of conditions came together in the historic period to generate societies capable of producing alphabetic texts, and of preserving them when original independence was lost: geographical, technological, social, and scribal. The conditions were necessary but not sufficient; for other societies meeting them did not produce texts ensuring their own preservation. The geographic base of both Israel and Hellas was a city with its fringe of farms and upland shepherds: the *city-state*.

The structures of the two societies run parallel. "Israel" names both the father of twelve tribes and a state; as state it is mostly masculine, but feminine at I Sam 17,21 **וַיִּשְׂרֹאֵל** "and Israel drew up" (cf. II Sam 24,9) when seen as an army (**מִצְרָכָה**). Hellen ("Ελλην) after whom feminine Hellas (Ἑλλάς) was named was the eldest son of Deucalion, survivor of the Flood (Apollodorus 1.7.2-3); he begat Doros, Xouthos and Aiolos; Xouthos begat Ion. Hence three peoples: Dorians, Aeolians and Ionians. The Ionians had twelve cities in Achaea and took that number over to Ionia (Herodotus 1.145). It was Ionia (p. 82 below) that gave the Near East its name for all Greeks. It is tempting to see such groups of twelve peoples as an "amphictyony" attached to a common temple, with each in charge one month of the year; but the evidence is weak.⁶⁹

1.4.1 Geographical conditions: rainfall and the citadel

Rain, ascribed to the High God, made possible autonomous Mediterranean city-states not dependent on centralized irrigation like the Near Eastern empires. In them nothing is more precious, "water is best" even before gold, ἄριστον μὲν ὕδωρ (Pindar, *Olymp.* 1.1). An explicit contrast with Egypt is drawn. Deut 11,10-12: "For the land which you are going over to possess is not like the land of Egypt from which you are going out, where you sow your seed and water it with your foot [on the well-sweep].... It is a land of mountains and valleys, it drinks water from the rain of heaven,

לְמַטְרַת שָׁמַיִם תִּשְׁתְּהָהּ

(LXX ἐκ τοῦ ὕδατος τοῦ οὐρανοῦ πίεται ὕδωρ), a land which Yahweh your God watches over." So Herodotus 2.13.3 "When [the Egyptian priests] learned that the whole country of the Hellenes is rained on (ὑεται), and not irrigated (ἄρδεται) by rivers like their own, they said... 'If the god is not willing to rain on them (εἰ μὴ ἐθελήσει σφι ὑεῖν ὁ θεός), but wears them out by a

⁶⁹ See my discussion in "The Templum and the Saeculum...." ZAW 98 (1986) 420.

drought, the Hellenes will perish of hunger; for they have no other recourse for water except from Zeus alone' (οὐ γὰρ δὴ σφί ἔστι ὕδατος οὐδεμία ἄλλη ἀποστροφή ὅτι μὴ ἐκ τοῦ Διὸς μόνον)."

Egyptian officials who held the monopoly of irrigation supposedly thought their water-supply superior to the Greek. Plato *Timaeus* 22d, citing more Egyptian priests, "For us the Nile is a savior in all respects; ...in this land neither [during the Nile flood] nor at other times does water flow down from above on the fields (ἄνωθεν ἐπὶ τὰς ἀρούρας ὕδωρ ἐπιρρεῖ)." So Tibullus 1.7.26: in Egypt on account of the Nile *arida nec pluuiio supplicat herba Ioui* "no parched crop beseeches Jupiter Pluvius."

Karl A. Wittfogel, an historian of China, saw that control of irrigation by bureaucrats in the rainless valleys of Mesopotamia and Egypt, opening and shutting sluice-gates, then as now created a civilization under central management, which he names an *hydraulic society*. He notes the new level of freedom in lands where every farmer draws rain from heaven: "The representatives of rainfall farming made history in certain areas of the West [?], which was uniquely suited to this type of economy."⁷⁰ The Hamburg symposium⁷¹ draws a related contrast:

Der erwähnte Nordost-Bogen betrifft Länder, in denen Regenzeitkulturen vorherrschen. Deren Daseinsbedingungen sind grundsätzlich anders als im Niltal oder Zweistromland. Da aber jede Religion die numinosen Mächte nicht nur im spirituellem Bereich verortet, sondern sie als hintergründige Garanten und Urheber bei elementaren Lebensbedürfnissen erfährt, treten Götter des Regens, des Wetters überhaupt, neben Berge und Quellen wie von selbst in den Vordergrund and rufen entsprechende Kultformen und mythische Muster hervor.

70 Karl A. Wittfogel, *Oriental Despotism: A Comparative Study of Total Power* (1957) 18. His theory is reviewed by Robert C. Hunt and Eva Hunt, "Canal Irrigation and Local Social Organization," *Current Anthropology* 17 (1986), 389-411 (with comments): "...management roles for the local irrigation system are closely linked with systems of roles belonging to higher levels of integration, if such exist. In many cases, the local unit is incapable of resisting for any length of time many of the decisions made at higher levels of integration." See Raf Van Laere, "Le droit hydraulique selon la législation néobabylonienne," *Orientalia Lovaniensia* 8 (1977) 63-74; M. B. Rowton, "The Role of the Watercourses in the Growth of Mesopotamian Civilization" (on flooding and silting), *Alter Orient und Altes Testament* 1 (1969 = von Soden Festschrift), 307-316. The extensive series of volumes *L'homme et l'eau en Méditerranée et au Proche Orient* (ed. Pierre Louis, Jean Métral et alii; vols 1-4 = *Travaux de la Maison de l'Orient* vols 2, 3, 11, 14 [1981-1987]), looking at the ancient world through modern eyes, sees irrigation simply as a technical advance; see especially the analysis of Wittfogel in Jacques Bethemont, "Sur les origines de l'agriculture hydraulique," *L'homme et l'eau* vol. 2 (1982) 7-30.

71 OBO 129 viii.

The rain made peasants in the hill country comparatively free from political control by the lowlands. That freedom, as in other village societies (Chapter 7 below), included elements of equality for women. But it did not include its own writing-down. Both types of literacy—scribal literacy in a complex ideographic system, widespread alphabetic literacy—required an urban society.

Thus the geographic requirements of a free society included a *defensible citadel*—another prominent Mediterranean feature. "A city set on a hill cannot be hid" (Matt 5,14). All the sites called Ramah (Neh 11,33 רָמָה) mean "citadel, high place"; it may be that *Rōma* itself was so named by Phoenician traders.⁷² The citadel itself needed a water supply. King Hezekiah "made the pool and the conduit and brought water into the city" (II Reg 20,20); the word for "pool" (בְּרִיכה) has a deep relation to βροχή "rain, watering."⁷³ (Perhaps בְּרִיכה "blessing" was named from rain as the chief of blessings, Ez 34,26 גְּשָׁמֵי בְּרִיכה "showers of blessing.") The Siloam inscription (KAI 189) from the tunnel describes how the two parties of diggers met. An earlier state of the tunnel (II Sam 5,8) had the defect of providing entrance for an invader.⁷⁴ Mycenae had a spring (Pausanias 2.16.6) with a conduit to a cistern under the citadel;⁷⁵ Athens had a natural subterranean spring at the base of the citadel.⁷⁶ Strabo 12.3.39 says that his own city of Amaseia had internal water supplies, ὑδρεῖα. One wishing to render a city defenceless would destroy the setup (Strabo 12.3.38).⁷⁷

The citadel contained a temple to the High God responsible for the rain (Chapter 5 below) or to one of his associates. Around it spread the rain-watered fields and villages of its extended citizenship; ideally it was big enough to shelter them in time of siege, though at the risk of plague. In the hills were shepherds moving up and down with the seasons in "transhumance" (Article A, "Men of the Land"). The migratory life of those shepherds had an extension

72 A proposal of Martin Bernal: see Brown-Levin, *Ethnic Paradigm* 95-96. If that was obscurely remembered, Vergil's *altae moenia Romae* (*Aen.* 1.7) "the walls of high Rome" provides an actual translation.

73 See Brown-Levin *Ethnic Paradigm*, 92-93.

74 It now appears that the tunnel was the enlargement of natural fissures in the rock; *Science Times of the New York Times*, Aug. 9, 1994.

75 J. G. Frazer, *Pausanias's Description of Greece* (1913) iii.160-161.

76 M. Biernacka-Lubanska, "The Water Supply of the Mycenaean Citadels and its Relations with the Near East," pp. 181-189 of Jan G. P. Best & Nanny M. W. de Vries (eds.), *Interaction and Acculturation in the Mediterranean* [Amsterdam Congress 1980], *Publications of the Henri Frankfort Foundation* vol. 6 (1980).

77 At the last moment I saw the now indispensable work of Dora P. Crouch, *Water Management in Greek Cities* (1993) with its emphasis (p. 64) on "karst [limestone strata with underground water channels] as the hydrogeological basis of civilization."

in overland traders, adapting the ass with its pannier sacks for longer journeys. As the herder depended on the city for tools and protection, the city depended on the milk, wool, flesh and hides of his animals.

Greeks called the whole complex a Polis or city-state; we may speak of the city-states of Canaan and Israel, in part built into little kingdoms. But besides political independence, the city needed cultural contacts with others of its kind. Land commerce was slow and costly. Hence the city also required a *port* of its own or a similar culture. Athens had the best of both worlds, with access to its port of Piraeus between the Long Walls. Thus the relation of Jerusalem with the Philistine ports of Ascalon and Gaza, with Dor and Akko, with the Phoenician ports of Tyre and Sidon, was by no means just adversarial; whether the Israelites realized it or not, through those intermediaries spread a web of cultural sharing with the new city-states of Anatolia, the Aegean and Hellas, and ultimately the Etruscans and Latins of Italy.

1.4.2 Technological conditions for the city-state: iron and lime

The scarcity of tin made societies of the Bronze Age aristocratic monopolies.⁷⁸ Only the wealthy could afford the bronze panoply (Chapter 5) required by the warfare of a Goliath or Achilles. The abundance of iron ores, as soon as the higher temperature required for their smelting was attained, democratized warfare by putting adequate weapons in the hands of all free male citizens.⁷⁹ Also initially iron weapons gave the advantage to the defendants in the siege of a citadel, before the Assyrians invented new methods of siege warfare. Iron tools were as necessary as iron weapons or more so. An Etruscan Porsenna or Philistine overlord might deny his dependants iron weapons (p. 171 below), but iron tools were still indispensable for agriculture: to hammer them out into weapons was the signal for revolt. The Israelites had to go down to the Philistines to sharpen their tools: three are listed at I Sam 13,20.⁸⁰ The first, *מַחֲרָתוֹ*, does not appear elsewhere; it is from the root

78 See James David Muhly, *Copper and Tin: The distribution of mineral resources and the nature of the metals trade in the Bronze Age* (n.d.) = *Transactions of the Conn. Acad. of Arts & Sciences* 43 (1973) 155-535, 46 (1976) 77-136.

79 Naturally there were distinctions (as Levin notes). Thus in early Attica the fourth and lowest class of citizens, the *θητες*, those without even a yoke of oxen to their name, were not armed with much more than sticks and stones, and could not hold office; but when they became needed as rowers of the triremes they also grasped hold of the power of the state.

80 Discussion by Paula M. McNutt, *The Forging of Israel: Iron Technology, Symbolism, and Tradition in Ancient Society*; JSOT Sup. Series 108 (1990), who (p. 238) postdates

חרש "plow," Vg correctly *uomer* "plowshare." The second, אָתוּ, is of obscure origin; the Vg makes it *ligo*, which the OLD calls a "mattock," but the Latin texts cited make it simply an American "spade": it is interconvertible with a sword (Isa 2,4 = Mic 4,3; Joel 4,10).⁸¹ The third, קַרְדָּמוֹ, is non-Semitic; it is an "axe," Vg *securis*, used for cutting brush (Jud 9,48; Jer 46,22) or in warfare (Ps 74,5). The ceremonial axe is a divine and regal attribute (Article F "Ark and Janus").

These three define precisely the tasks for which iron tools were necessary in rough upland territory: *plowing* the rocky fields, after they had been cleared from brush by the *axe*; terracing fields with the *spade*, and digging cisterns to hold water over the long dry summer. The cisterns of Israel, now revealed by the modern spade, were the most necessary of all in occupying the hill country; unless they were rendered waterproof with lime, they would be (Jer 2,13) "broken cisterns that cannot hold water,"

בְּאֵרֹת נִשְׁבְּרִים אֲשֶׁר לֹא יִכְלֹו הַמַּיִם

Vg *cisternas dissipatas quae continere non ualent aquas*.⁸² Jerome, living in Bethlehem, endorses the prophet's disapproval of cisterns.⁸³

fons perpetuus est et uitales habet aquas, cisternae autem et lacus uel de torrentibus uel ex aquis turbidis terrae complentur et pluuiis.

"A spring is constant and has fresh water, but cisterns and pools are filled either from temporary streams [wadis] or from muddy water of the earth [from wells] and rains." But up there in the hills there was no alternative.

Lime can be produced by burning bones (Amos 2,1; Isa 33,12); stones are whitewashed with it so as to be written on, Deut 27,2: וְשָׂדֵת אֲתָם בְּשֵׂיד "you shall lime them with lime," and it is only accidental that the liming of cisterns is not attested. Theophrastus *de lap.* 64-69 describes the burning of limestone to γύψος "lime" in Phoenicia to cement buildings.⁸⁴

1.4.3 Social conditions of the city-state: elements of democracy

The reliance of the city-state on the products of independent upland farmers and shepherds, and for defense on its civic militia, gave both classes real power, and made absolute kingship in the ancient Near Eastern pattern

the passage on the grounds that "it is unlikely that iron technology had been adopted yet anywhere in Palestine by this time."

81 If we read a tool also at II Reg 6,5 וְאֵת הַבְּרִדָּל אִי we would have to translate "axe(-head?) of iron"; but the text is unclear.

82 The texts emphasize that cisterns had to be dug: Deut 6,11; II Chron 26,10; Neh 9,25.

83 Hieronymus in *Hieremiam* 2,13; Corp. Christ. 74.17.14ff.

84 See my discussion in *The Lebanon and Phoenicia* [i] 80-82.

impossible. Since the army was identical with the citizen body (Article A "Men of the Land"), democratizing the army also to some degree democratized the state. The irrigation-societies of Egypt and Mesopotamia created technology, art, law, commerce and literature at the cost of absolutism. Thus the first genuine freedom appears in the new citadels of the Mediterranean coasts surrounded by rain-watered fields, borrowing from Egypt and Assyria only what they needed. From upland shepherds arose the prophetism of an Amos or Hesiod, proclaiming the justice of the High God who through his rain guaranteed land tenure. Knowledge of the God was mediated by feminine figures of memory: the Muses of Hesiod, the spirit or spirits of Yahweh (Isa 11,2; Rev 5,6). Spokesmen of that justice with some degree of sacral immunity emerge: poet-prophets, at first shepherds, later urban, Isaiah and Solon; Roman tribunes of the *plebs*. Freedom leads to tales truthfully picturing men and women, and to reflection on human existence.

Above all, the dynamic character of freedom elicits genuinely historical texts recording the events by which it was won and preserved. Herein lies the fundamental distinction between societies of the Mediterranean world on the one hand, India and Iran on the other. Although the texts of Hinduism and Buddhism were eventually set down in a late form of alphabetic script, they record neither political history nor social structure. The Gathas of the Avesta come closest to Mediterranean character, for they refer to a concrete historical situation of the prophet, even though we are unable to locate it to anything approaching its true century; I treat it particularly in a study of Iranian imperialism, my "Prometheus" (Article H).

1.4.4 The scribal condition of the city-state: an alphabetic script

But those tales and thoughts would have perished with their makers if there had not been a way, in principle available to all, of setting them down on wax tablets or papyrus apart from the skills of a scribe in the pay of court, temple or business. Our Greek texts nowhere describe cuneiform script, although Herodotus must have seen cuneiform records in Babylon. Diodorus (2.13.2, from Ctesias) knew of an inscription at "Mount Bagistanon" (Behistun, Old Persian "The place of God") in "Syrian letters," but does not describe them, and has the meaning and even the relief all wrong.⁸⁵ Pliny 7.193 just knows that Babylonian astronomy was written on baked bricks (*coctilibus laterculis*).

85 But Rüdiger Schmitt, "Assyria grammata und ähnliche: Was wussten die Griechen von Keilschrift und Keilinschriften?," *Palingenesia* 36, 21-36, thinks (p. 24) that Diodorus' source Ctesias knew cuneiform.

But the classical world was familiar with Egyptian hieroglyphics, and understood their scribal character. Diodorus (3.3.3-5) believes that they were a priestly monopoly and required a great effort of memorization. Clement of Alexandria⁸⁶ knows that Egyptian came in three increasing orders of complexity, "epistolographic" (i.e. demotic, Diodorus 3.3.5 δημώδη), hieratic, and hieroglyphic.⁸⁷ Ammianus Marcellinus 17.4.10 elegantly contrasts the complexity of hieroglyphics with the simplicity of the alphabet:

Non enim ut nunc litterarum numerus praestitus et facilis exprimit quidquid humana mens concipere potest, ita prisci quoque scriptitarunt Aegyptii, sed singulae litterae singulis nominibus seruebant et uerbis; non numquam significabant integros sensus.

"For while now a fixed and simple series of characters expresses whatever the human mind can conceive, not so did the ancient Egyptians write; but individual characters stood for individual nouns and verbs, and sometimes signified complete phrases." So Diodorus 3.4.1 explains that hieroglyphic, with its pictures of animals, parts of the body, and tools, "does not express the intended notion by the combination of syllables [like Greek], but by the meaning of the objects copied." And with the alphabet on hand, the human mind could conceive *more* than under the burden of an ideographic script. As with rainfall, so with script, Egypt was the opposite against which the new free societies correctly saw themselves emerging.

In section 1.6 here I expand on the role of the alphabet. But these four conditions are by no means *sufficient* to generate a permanent literature. The cities of Lydia, Lycia and Etruria met them all, writing their own languages in a modified Greek alphabetic script; but they produced no group of people to preserve whatever literature they may have possessed. We may if we wish conjecture that they never generated high literary texts in the first place. Perhaps they were too small, or too dependent on their neighbors. Although the Phoenicians as a separate people propagated the alphabet, and surely wrote down psalms and epics of gods or men, nobody thought it worth while preserving them. Any literature produced by the Aramaeans of Damascus is lost. Why Israel and Hellas (and Rome after them) took another course is the mystery of historical emergence defying full explanation.

86 Clement, *Strom.* 5.20.3, p. 339.11 ed. Stählin-Früchtel GCS.

87 The "Rosetta stone" of Ptolemy V, 196 BC, at its end (OGIS 90.54) calls its three scripts τοῖς τε ἱεροῖς καὶ ἑγχωρίοις καὶ Ἑλληνικοῖς γράμμασιν "hieroglyphic, demotic and Greek letters."

1.5 Movement of peoples

The prehistoric contacts between Israel and Hellas, demonstrable by common vocabulary and otherwise, surely demand, besides movement of women and traders, movement of actual peoples. Here I briefly list parallels in ethnic and personal names from various periods in three categories: mercenaries and the like known to Hebrew (1.5.1); probable Aegeans in Canaan (1.5.2); probable Canaanites in Hellas, above all Boeotia (1.5.3). Not all can be conclusively proved; but they are the strongest cases for the prehistoric migrations in both directions that other data ask for. A full treatment would require one or several books.⁸⁸

1.5.1 Anatolian (and Libyan) mercenaries

At Ez 27,10-11 among mercenaries at Tyre were Lud (לוד, Λυδοί, *Lydi*, Luther *Lyder*) and Helech (חֵילֶךְ).⁸⁹ At Gen 10,13 Ludim (לודים) appear along with Lehabim (לִּהְבִּים) as sons of Egypt (Miṣrayim); the latter are probably the same as the Lubim, always in context of Egyptian peoples, as mercenaries at Nah 3,9 (לִּיבִים, Λιβύες, *Lybies*, Luther *Libyen*) etc. In the Aramaic of the Xanthos trilingual⁹⁰ Pixodarus is "satrap of Caria and Termila [Lycia]":

חשתרפנא זי בכרך ותרמילא

(For Moschoi and Tibarenoi = Meshech and Tubal see p. 175 below.)

1.5.1.1 Cilicians

Helech is the eponymous ancestor of the Cilicians; for coins of Tarsus of the 4th century BC have חלך;⁹¹ an Aramaic ethnic in the Arsames dossier is חלכין;⁹² Akkadian has *Hilakku*.⁹³ Then it corresponds to Κίλιξ Herodotus

88 Levin and I have treated many of these in grammatical categories in "Ethnic Paradigm"; most also are treated in separate articles of DCPD.

89 It is perplexing that at Ez 27,10 חֵילֶךְ must mean "your [fem. sing.] army," "Persia and Lud and Put were in your army." Either Ezekiel is doing a play on words or the text is in disorder; but I do not see how to eliminate חֵילֶךְ "Cilicia" from 27,11 "The sons of Arwad [Arados] and Heylek were on your walls."

90 H. Metzger et alii, Fouilles de Xanthos VI: La stèle trilingue du Létôon (1979).

91 B. V. Head, *Historia Numorum* (1910) 730.

92 G. R. Driver, *Aramaic Documents of the Fifth Century B.C.*, ed. minor (1957), no. 12.2.

93 For *Hilakku* see RLA iv.402-3.

1.74.3, already known to Homer (Κιλίκων *Iliad* 6.415). Herodotus 7.91 calls Kilix son of the Phoenician Agenor. Romans stereotyped them as pirates, Lucan 3.228 *Cilix...pirata*; for Greeks Κιλικισμός was "barbarous slaughter."⁹⁴

1.5.1.2 Libyans

Lubim, always with other Egyptians or Africans,⁹⁵ are certainly from "Libya," Λιβύη *Odyssey* 4.85. The southwest wind Lips (Herodotus 2.25.2 λίψ), is apparently named as blowing from there.⁹⁶

1.5.1.3 Lydians

Lud of Ez 27,10 is naturally interpreted with the LXX as eponym of the Lydians, Λυδός Herodotus 1.7.3. Ludim the archers in Egypt (Jer 46,9 לודים, LXX [26,9] Λυδοί) are not another people but Lydian mercenaries there (cf. Isa 66,19; Ez 30,5). For among Egyptian graffiti of mercenaries one is in Lydian,⁹⁷ and Ashurbanipal⁹⁸ says that Gyges of Lydia sent troops to Psammetichus of Egypt. For its capital Sardes see the Appendix. The Palestinian city Lod (לוד Neh 11,35)⁹⁹ or Λύδδα (I Makk 11,34) might be a Lydian military colony as Dor a Dorian one.

1.5.1.4 Carians

Queen Athaliah had a bodyguard of יִרְקָי (II Reg 11,4.19)¹⁰⁰ who are surely Carians; their eponym is Κάρι the mercenary,¹⁰¹ and Herodotus 2.154 knows them as mercenaries in Egypt. Either their Greek or Carian sounded strange, *Iliad* 2.867 Καρῶν ... βαρβαροφώνων; so Καρίζειν was "to speak barbarously" (Strabo 14.2.28). Risks proverbially were to be taken with an

94 Theopompus, Jacoby FGH 115 F 314.

95 Lubim further at II Chron 12,3; 16,8; Dan 11,43.

96 See DCP 259.

97 J. Friedrich, KASD 122.

98 M. Streck, Assurbanipal und die letzten assyrischen Könige (1916) ii.20-22; *Annals* II.95-115.

99 Here codex S of the LXX ("II Esdr 21,35") has Λύδδα.

100 But "Carians" is hardly to be read at II Sam 20,23.

101 Archilochus frag. 216, West IEG i.82.

expendable Carian.¹⁰² Later transcriptions show a more complex form of their name: the Aramaic of the Xanthos trilingual calls Caria כרר; and so Cowley 26.3 כררניא, Old Persian *Karka*.¹⁰³

1.5.1.5 Lycians

Their own name for themselves was Τερμίλαι (Herodotus 1.173); so in the Lycian of the Xanthos trilingual *Tr̄m̄mile*.¹⁰⁴

1.5.1.6 Hittites

The Κήττειοι (*Odyssey* 11.521, with variants Κήδειοι and Χήττειοι) are companions of the son of Telephos (Τήλεφος) king of Mysia. Since his name is close to the Hittite god and king Telipinus¹⁰⁵ the Keteioi may be our only Greek reference to the Hittites, Heb. יתת.

1.5.2 Aegean peoples in Canaan

I discuss the transcription of Ionians as "Yawan" at Chapter 2.5 (and also Iapetus [if Aegean] as Japheth); Gergithes and Girgashites elsewhere.¹⁰⁶ From the 8th century BC onwards there was a Greek settlement at al-Mina at the mouth of the Orontes in Syria,¹⁰⁷ not far from the probable site of Posideion (Ποσιδηίου genit. Herodotus 3.91); we have no name by which Syrians might have referred to it. In the 90 cities of Crete (*Odyssey* 19.175-7) "one tongue was mixed with others: for there were Achaeans, great-hearted True Cretans, Cydonians, Dorians with their three tribes and godlike Pelasgians":

ἄλλη δ' ἄλλων γλῶσσα μεμιγμένη· ἐν μὲν Ἀχαιοί,
ἐν δ' Ἐτεόκρητες μεγαλήτορες, ἐν δὲ Κύδωνες,
Δωριέες τε τριχάϊκες διοί τε Πελασγοί.

102 Plato *Euthyd.* 285C; Polybius 10.32.11; also Cicero *pro Flac.* 65, with other ethnic stereotypes.

103 Kent, Old Persian, p. 144; Darius Susa F 33. For the Carians see further DCP 90.

104 See DCP 266.

105 H. A. Hoffner, Jr., Hittite Myths (1990) 25-28.

106 "The Mediterranean Seer and Shamanism," ZAW 93 (1981) 374-400.

107 John Boardman, *The Greeks Overseas: Their early colonies and trade*; 2nd ed. (1973) 38-45.

Four of these can claim a foothold in Canaan (and the Cydonians live at the river Iardanos [*Odyssey* 3.292]); for the Pelasgians see p. 170 below.

1.5.2.1 Achaeans

Ἀχαιοί names the forces allied against Troy; in view of Latin *Achīuī* it was probably once *Ἀχαιῶι. They are likely the *Ahhiyawa* of the Hittite texts, although the territory meant is unclear.¹⁰⁸ It is then plausible to compare them with the "Hivites" חִוִּי of the Canaanites;¹⁰⁹ Shechem who took Dinah was one such (Gen 34,2), and note that they are not circumcised. At Jud 3,3 they appear with Sidonians; Menelaus the Achaean (*Odyssey* 3.141) on his return voyage stopped at Sidon (4.84).¹¹⁰

1.5.2.2 Cretans

The hero *Krt* of Ugaritic may be "the Cretan." At Zeph 2,5 (cf Ez 25,16) the כְּרִתִּי are a sea-people, where LXX Κρητῶν. Then David's bodyguard כְּרִתִּי (II Sam 8,18 etc.) are likely Cretans also. Plutarch *Aem.* 23.6 stereotypes them as liars, Κρητίζων πρὸς Κρητάς "acting the Cretan to Cretans." Tit 1,12 illogically certifies the verse "Cretans are always liars, evil beasts, lazy bellies":

Κρητες αἰεὶ ψεῦσται, κακὰ θηρία, γαστέρες ἀργαί.
as coming from "one of their own,"¹¹¹ i.e. the prophet Epimenides.¹¹²

1.5.2.3 Dorians

One of their tribes was the Pamphyloi (Παμφύλους Herodotus 5.68), so that Pamphylia in Asia Minor (Παμφυλία Thucydides 1.100) may be a Dorian

108 See my "Divine Kingship" p. 68.

109 Brown-Levin "Ethnic Paradigm..." 89; independently Othniel Margalith "The Hivites," ZAW 100 (1988) 60-70.

110 Hans G. Güterbock & M. J. Mellink, "The Hittites and the Aegean World," American Journal of Archaeology 87 (1983) 133-141.

111 Eustathius on *Iliad* 9.129, ii.677.16 ed. van der W., gathers several of these Greek stereotypes.

112 See M. Delcor, "Les Kerethim et les Crétois," pp. 314-327 of his *Etudes bibliques et orientales de religions comparées*; 1979.

foundation. Rhodes also was Dorian. Then¹¹³ the Palestinian city דִּוֶר Jud 1,27 or דָּאָר Jos 17,11 (cf. KAI 14.19 דָּאָר וַיִּפִּי "Dor and Joppa)," Δοῦρα Polybios 5.66.1, might be a Dorian military colony.¹¹⁴ Wen-Amom in the 11th century BC knows it as a city of the "Tjeker."¹¹⁵ It is unclear whether Egyptian records¹¹⁶ are too old to make its naming by Dorians possible.

1.5.2.4 Pandarus

The Trojan archer Πάνδαρος is said to be a "Lycian" (*Iliad* 5.171-3). Two Ugaritic texts¹¹⁷ have a *bn.pndr*; the first among what Gordon (p. 285) calls "a list of *mrynm*" or warriors. Is this a class name of mercenary archers?¹¹⁸

1.5.2.5 Mopsus

Μόψος, generic name of seers. One sent off the Argonauts (Pindar *Pyth.* 4.191). Another, the grandson of Teiresias (Apollodorus 3.7.7), lived at Colophon. After the Trojan war he defeated Calchas in divination.¹¹⁹ Strabo 14.4.3: "Callisthenes¹²⁰ says that Calchas died in Clarus, but that the people with Mopsus passed over the Taurus, and some remained in Pamphylia, while others were dispersed in Cilicia as far as Phoenicia." Amphilochous, Mopsus' half-brother, with him founded the oracle of Mallus in Cilicia; the two killed each other, but after their deaths became its joint patrons.¹²¹ Xanthus of Lydia¹²² says that Atargatis the goddess of Ascalon was captured by Mopsus the Lydian (Μόψου τοῦ Λυδοῦ) and drowned in its pool. The name is at home in Cilicia at Μόψου Ἑστία "Hearth of Mopsus" Strabo 14.5.19. At nearby Karatepe the great Phoenician-Luvian bilingual KAI 26 was written by Azitawad of the "House of Mopsus," I.16 לבת מפש. Here the

113 G. L. Huxley, *Early Sparta* (1962) 15.

114 But this connection is rejected by M. Görg, "Dor, die Teukrer und die Girgaster," *Biblische Notizen* 28 (1985) 7-14.

115 ANET³ 26.

116 ABD ii.223; DCPP 134.

117 Gordon UT 2070 rev 5 = KTU 4.322.rev 5; Gordon UT 2117.32 = KTU 4.617.32. The reading at Gordon UT 80:I.14 = KTU 4.35.I.14 is unclear.

118 See my discussion in Article D "Archery" p. 87.

119 Apollodorus *Epit.* 6.3; Strabo 14.1.27 = Hesiod frag. 278 Merkelbach-West.

120 So correctly one MS of Strabo for "Callinus" of the others.

121 Strabo 14.5.16; Frazer on Apollodorus *Epit.* 6.19 in the LCL; Plutarch *de def. orac.* 45 (= *Mor.* 434D).

122 Xanthos, Jacoby FGH 765 frag. 17 = Athenaeus 8.346E.

Hieroglyphic Luvian has *Mu-ka-so-so-n*:¹²³ the same pronunciation appears in Nicolaus of Damascus¹²⁴ Μόξος ὁ Λυδός; in Linear B *Mo-qa-so*;¹²⁵ and in Hittite *Mu-uk-šú-uš*.¹²⁶

1.5.2.6 Hegai

He is "the eunuch of the king" Ahasuerus, i.e. Xerxes, Esth 2,3

הגַּא סְרִיס הַמֶּלֶךְ

spelled הַגַּא at 2,8. Ctesias¹²⁷ knows a Greek "Hegias of Ephesus," τὸν Ἠγίαν τὸν Ἐφέσιον, as an officer of Xerxes. The parallel seems too good to deny, jointly confirming the historical character of two authors often thought legendary. Then this Hegias/Hegai is the only Greek historical person in the Hebrew Bible.

1.5.2.7 Tripolis of Phoenicia

The city Τρίπολις with its Greek name is attested in 350 BC, as the site of the council (συνέδριον) of the Phoenicians, Diodorus 16.41.1;¹²⁸ well before Alexander, Greek is a language of prestige in Phoenicia. Galling¹²⁹ then compares Ezra 4,9 טְרַפְלִיָּא among the co-signers of Rehum's complaint about Jerusalem to Artaxerxes: they come after two classes of officials and before the nationalities "Persians(?), men of Erech, Babylonians, men of Susa." The "men of Tripolis" here would then be either Phoenicians or another class of Mesopotamian expatriates.

1.5.3 Canaanites in Hellas

Elsewhere I discuss the Danites/Danaoi (Chapter 7), and compare Phinehas and Phineus (Excursus C). For Iardanos (Ἰάρδανος) and Jordan (יַרְדֵּן) as a

123 P. Meriggi, *Manuale di eteo geroglifico* (1967-1975) ii.177.

124 Nicolaus of Damascus, Jacoby FGH 90 frag. 16.

125 DMG², p. 562.

126 A. Goetze, *Madduwattas*; *Hethitische Texte III*, MVAG 32 (1927.1), 1928 p. 37. For Mopsus see further DCP 300.

127 Ctesias, Jacoby FGH 688 frag. 13.24 (from Photius).

128 See my discussion, *The Lebanon and Phoenicia* 204ff.

129 K. Galling, "Kronzeugen des Artaxerxes? Eine Interpretation von Esra 4,9f," *ZAW* 63 (1951) 66-74; see DCP 471.

river-toponym see Article G;¹³⁰ Mühlestein¹³¹ associates it with the theme of a hero killing a giant in his youth, for Nestor recalls his combat "at the streams of Iardanos," Ἰαρδάνου ἀμφὶ ῥέεθρα (*Iliad* 7.135). For the toponym Atabyris see Appendix.¹³² The hoard of cylinder-seals of the 14th century BC in Boeotian Thebes¹³³ proves it a site of Eastern influence; it commanded the Euripus, the Corinthian and Saronic Gulfs as τριθάλαττος (Strabo 9.2.2).¹³⁴ The four names that follow are located there.¹³⁵

1.5.3.1 Ismenos

The river of Thebes is Ἰσμηγός (Pindar *Nem.* 11.36 etc.); at the temple of Apollo Ismenios Herodotus (5.59) saw "Cadmeian letters" (Καδμήϊα γράμματα) on three tripods. The name sounds like the Phoenician god 𐤇𐤌𐤍,

130 "Templum and Saeculum" pp. 421-2.

131 Hugo Mühlestein, "Jung Nestor jung David," *Antike und Abendland* 17 (1971) 173-190.

132 Marginal is the toponym "Saron." Stephanus 557 attests Σάρων as a "place of Troizen," and Pausanias 2.30.9 gives the same name to its mythical king; the Saronic gulf is associated with one or both. Lewy 173 compared the Canaanite plain of Sharon, Isa 33,9 𐤍𐤏𐤍 where LXX Σάρων.

133 Edith Porada & J. A. Brinkman, "The Cylinder Seals Found at Thebes in Boeotia," *Archiv für Orientforschung* 28 (1981) 1-78.

134 Strabo quotes Ephorus, FGH 70 F 119; the point is made by W. W. How & J. Wells, *A Commentary on Herodotus*, 2 vols., 2nd ed. (1928) i.349.

135 Here I briefly note four further Boeotian names for which Phoenician originals have been claimed.

(1) *Thisbe* (Θῆσβη) the city (*Iliad* 2.502); also the lover of Pyramus, turned into a spring in Cilicia; Nicolaus in Walz, *Rhetores Graeci* i.271. Elijah (I Reg 17,1) was "the Tishbite," 𐤏𐤍𐤁𐤏, an unexplained ethnic. Levin is to study the parallelism in J. Bintliff (ed.), *Proceedings of the Sixth International Boeotian Conference*, 1989.

(2) *Elieus*. Hesychius E.2068 (ed. Latte ii.67) records Ἐλιεύς as title of Zeus at Thebes. M. C. Astour (*Hellenosemitica* [1965] 217) combined this with Pausanias 9.8.5: Thebes had a temple of "Zeus most High," Διὸς ἱερὸν ... ὑψίστου. The divine name 𐤇𐤌𐤍 𐤋𐤏 Gen 14,20 etc. appears in the LXX as ὁ θεὸς ὁ ὑψιστος.

(3) *Gephyraioi*. The Γεφυραῖοι were "Phoenicians of those who came with Cadmus" (Herodotus 5.57.1). Compare the two groups of Geshurites, 𐤇𐤌𐤍, in the northeast (Deut 3,14) and the Negev (I Sam 27,8). The phonetic discrepancy is shared by γέφυρα and Talmudic 𐤇𐤌, both "bridge."

(4) *Thebes* itself, Θῆβαι. Sometimes associated with Hebrew 𐤅𐤁𐤍 "ark," LXX and papyri θῆβις, both from Egyptian *db3.t* (Erman-Grapow v.561). But what could the semantic connection be? It remains mysterious also why *Iliad* 9.381, *Odyssey* 4.126 give an Egyptian city the same name; see the Oxford *Odyssey ad loc.*

transcribed Ἐσμουνοῦς by Damascius;¹³⁶ Damascius says he was the last of eight sons born to Sadykos, namely the Dioskouroi or Kabeiroi (Κάβειροι), and so named as being the eighth. He appears in Esarhaddon's treaty with king Baal of Tyre, ^d*Ia-su-mu-nu*.¹³⁷ Other pieces of evidence confirm a standing identification of Eshmun and Asclepius.¹³⁸ A temple was found on the left bank of the *Nahr Bisri* (Βοστρηνός) 5 km. N of Sidon with dedications of Bodashtart king of the Sidonians to Eshmun:

אית הבת ז בן לאלי עשמון

"He built this temple to his god Eshmun" (KAI 16). The site fits the "grove of Asclepius" (Ἀσκληπιίου ἄλσος) of Strabo 16.2.22. A Latin itinerary¹³⁹ so names its river, *illic currit fluvius Asclapius*. Thus it seems likely that the Phoenician name of the river was עשמון.

1.5.3.2 Kabeiros

A "Kabeiros" had a cult in Boeotia, with dedications to ΤΟΙ ΚΑΒΙΡΟΙ (dative).¹⁴⁰ Herodotus 2.51.2 says that the men of Samothrace took from the Pelasgians "the rites of the Kabeiroi," τὰ Καβείρων ὄργια. Dedications to the "Samothracian gods" never call them Κάβειροι at Samothrace or at an early date elsewhere; rather they are the "Great Gods," as a unique inscription from Samothrace reads,¹⁴¹ ΘΕΟΙΣ ΜΕΓΑΛΟΙΣ ΣΑΜΟΘΡΑΞΙ. Later texts, especially from Delos, make Herodotus' connection; thus a text from Delos of 102/101 BC¹⁴² has "of the Great Gods of Samothrace, Dioscuri, Kabe[iroi]," ΘΕΩΝ ΜΕΓΑΛΩΝ ΣΑΜΟΘΡΑΚΩΝ ΔΙΟΣΚΟΥΡΩΝ ΚΑΒΕ[ΙΡΩΝ]. Herodotus 6.47 says that the Phoenicians had mines in Thasos next to Samothrace; and Philo of Byblos¹⁴³

136 Damascius as quoted by Photius *Bib.* 242.302, the name of Asclepius in Berytus. Philo Byblius (Jacoby FGH 790 F 2.38) knows Asclepius as the 8th of the Kabeiroi, but not under this name. Ἐσμουνοῦς is in error cited by KAI ii.21 as from Herodotus 2.51.

137 R. Borger, *Die Inschriften Asarhaddons Königs von Assyrien; Archiv für Orientforschung Beiheft 9* (1956) 109.

138 In the trilingual dedication KAI 66 from Sardinia there is an equivalence עשמון = ΑΕΣΚΛΑΠΙΟ = ΑΕΣΚΛΗΠΙΩ; the god has healed the dedicator; see further p. 160 fn. 4 below.

139 Antoninus Placentinus, CSEL 39.159f.

140 IG 7.2457.

141 Susan Guettel Cole, *Theoi Megaloi: The cult of the Great Gods at Samothrace; EPROER* 96 (1984), text no. 19 (p. 150) with Plate Vb = IG 12 (8) 216.

142 Cole no. 26 (p. 153) = OGIS 430.

143 Philo Byblius, Jacoby FGH 790 F 2.14. Damascius (1.5.3.1 above) also calls the Kabeiroi Phoenician and makes them eight in number.

puts Kabeiroi in a Phoenician genealogy identified with Dioscuri, Corybantes and Samothracian (gods).¹⁴⁴ Hence it is attractive¹⁴⁵ to compare Hebrew כְּבִיר "great," a divine title at Job 34,17 (cf. 36,5) צְדִיק כְּבִיר "just and great." It would make a masc. plur. construct *כְּבִירִי from the Aramaized singular; a true Hebrew stative participle would be *כְּבָרִי. Κάβειροι further makes a feminine Καβειρώ (Strabo 10.3.21 genitive Καβειρούς, quoting Acusilaus and Pherecydes), likewise a perfect fit for probable Hebrew כְּבָרָה. Hemberg¹⁴⁶ doubts the Semitic etymology; but the double fit of masculine plural and feminine singular with the meaning "Great Ones" is irresistible. A likely connection is that Phoenicians called Aegean "Great Gods" *Kabeiroi* and Greeks picked up the name. The Boeotian connection goes with the other mysterious Phoenician parallels there.

1.5.3.3 Cadmus

Mostly the founder of Thebes is Cadmus (Κάδμος) the Tyrian who came to Greece in search of his sister Europa (Herodotus 2.49.3, 4.147.4) and founded Thebes; and he is surely connected with the בְּנֵי קְרָם "sons of the east" of Gen 29:1 etc. The *Iliad* calls the Thebans Καδμείωνας (4.385 with variant Καδμείοι 4.391); compare the people הַבְּנֵי קְרָם Gen 15:19.¹⁴⁷ Herodotus 5.58-59 relates that the Phoenicians who came with Cadmus also brought the alphabet, γράμματα...Φοινικῆτα or Καδμήτῆτα (1.6.1.2 below). Sophocles (*OR* 1) writes as if "Cadmus" meant "ancient," another sense of קְרָם:

ὦ τέκνα, Κάδμου τοῦ πάλαι νέα τροφή.

"O children, new offspring of ancient Cadmus." Edwards¹⁴⁸ after a long analysis says "the association of Kadmos with *qdm* (qadm) is plausible."¹⁴⁹

144 Macrobius 3.4.9 thinks that Vergil refers to them at *Aen.* 3.12 *cum sociis natoque, Penatibus et Magnis Dis.*

145 Brown-Levin, "Ethnic Paradigm" pp. 80, 90-91, 95.

146 Bengt Hemberg, *Die Kabiren* (1950) 320.

147 See my discussion in "The Mediterranean Seer and Shamanism" 382. Add now: Saul Levin, "ΚΑΔΜΕΙΩΝΑΣ (*Iliad* 4.385, 5.804, 23.680) and ΚΕΔΜΩΝΑΙΟΥΣ (*Gen.* 15:19): The nationality missing from the promised land and the settlement of Thebes," *Epēteris tēs Etaireias Boiōtikōn Meletōn* 1 (1988) 161-168.

148 Ruth B. Edwards, *Kadmos the Phoenician: A Study in Greek Legends and the Mycenaean Age* (1979) 146.

149 Rarely the founder of Thebes is called Ogygos (Ὠγγυγος, Pausanias 9.5.1). A chain with some weak links can be drawn between him and Agag (אַגַּג) the king of Amalek; for Amalek appears together with the "sons of the east," Jud 6,33 (cf. 7,12). Thus Agag himself could be considered one of the בְּנֵי קְרָם and an alternative name of Cadmus.

1.5.3.4 *Laius*

Oedipus' father (Λαῖος) may be so named as representing the people, λαός, presumably *λαῖός in view of the proper name ΛΑΦΟΠΤΟΛΕΜΟΣ.¹⁵⁰ Frisk compares Old English *leod* (frequent in *Beowulf*) and German *Leute*. Perhaps the Luvians of Anatolia (Hittite *lūwili* "in Luvian")¹⁵¹ simply called themselves "the people." Mendenhall¹⁵² proposed that the tribe of "Levi" (לֵוִי) carries their name—as a subordinated ethnic class? The parallel *λαῖοί ~ *lewíy* including the final accent is attractive; but more analysis is required.¹⁵³

1.6 *The alphabet*

1.6.1 Writing the alphabet.

1.6.1.1 *Creation of the Greek writing system*

Jeffery in her excellent study of the origin of the Greek alphabet still reflects two general assumptions. First, that the Greek adapter took over from his Semitic informant only the forms of the letters, their phonetic values (more or less), and their names; but was on his own for creating a Greek writing system, in particular *spelling*: when an alphabet is learned by one people from another, she says, "it is the natural instinct of the learner to accept it *en bloc* and fit the separate letter-signs to his own language."¹⁵⁴ Second, that the phonetic values of the new Greek vowels were derived from hearing the letter-names: "the usage of 'ālep, hē', and 'ayin to express *a*, *e*, and *o*, means that for the Greek, listening to the Semitic repetition of the alphabet, those vowels were the approximate Greek equivalents of the initial sounds in the names of the Semitic letters."¹⁵⁵ Here I maintain on the contrary that (a) some Semitic writing-system, in particular its spelling, was a prototype for the Greek; (b) it worked in large part through Semitic loanwords and proper names already in spoken Greek; (c) it operated above all in the

150 H. Collitz, *Sammlung der griechischen Dialekt-Inschriften* (1884-1915) 3.1.3151 on a vase from Corinth.

151 J. Friedrich, *Hethitisches Wörterbuch* (1952) 163.

152 George E. Mendenhall, *The Tenth Generation: The Origins of the Biblical Tradition* (1973) 163, among many proposed Luvian etymologies of Hebrew names.

153 See Brown-Levin *Ethnic Paradigm* 89-90.

154 Jeffery, *LSAG*² p. 4.

155 *LSAG*² 22.

creation of the Greek vowels; and (d) it resembled epigraphic Aramaic and Biblical Hebrew more than it did epigraphic Phoenician. I do not try to identify that prototype beyond the suggestion that it might have been a cursive Phoenician unknown to us.¹⁵⁶

The order of the Phoenician-Hebrew alphabet of 22 letters is known from Hebrew alphabetic Psalms, with the one irregularity that the alphabetic poems Lam 2-4 have *pe* coming before *ayin* rather than after. In an inexpert Hebrew alphabet written R to L on an early potsherd, again *pe* comes before *ayin*.¹⁵⁷ The Semitic names are known from Talmudic Hebrew. The same sequence of 22 is contained within the Ugaritic cuneiform alphabet of 30 letters written L to R on practice tablets;¹⁵⁸ among them are 5 consonants unused in Phoenician-Hebrew, with 3 additional signs at the end. It is likely that the Phoenician-Hebrew alphabet of 22 was obtained by subtraction from a larger Canaanite non-cuneiform alphabet of 27 corresponding to the first 27 of the Ugaritic.

The Greek alphabet is attested on a R-to-L ivory tablet from near Italian Cumae of about 700-650 BC, claimed both for Greek and Etruscan.¹⁵⁹ It begins with the 22 Phoenician letters and ends with the four early additions ΥΧΦΨ. Along with Ξ they were given different phonetic values in different cities;¹⁶⁰ here I focus on the old Ionic alphabet, continued with modifications in the text of Homer. The Aramaic side of an Akkadian-Aramaic bilingual of the 9th century BC from Tell Fekherye in Syria contains all 22 letters and illustrates the Semitic letter-forms at the approximate date of transmittal.¹⁶¹ The original Latin alphabet of 21 letters ABCDEFGHIKLMNOPQRSTVX (derived from either Etruscan or some Italian Greek alphabet) is attested in

156 Aramaic also occasionally appeared in Greece; see the inscriptions of a king Hazael on bronze harness-pieces from Eretria and Samos; F. Bron & A. Lemaire, "Les inscriptions araméennes de Hazaël," *Revue d'Assyriologie et d'Archéologie orientale* 83 (1989) 35-43.

157 A. Demsky & M. Kochavi, "An Alphabet from the Days of the Judges," *Biblical Archaeology Review* 4 (1978) 23-30.

158 KTU sect. 5. I do not here treat the variant cuneiform alphabet from Beth-Shemesh (DCPP 22 fig. 21). The large volume *Phoinikeia Grammata: Lire et écrire en Méditerranée*, Colloque de Liège nov. 1989, ed. C. Baurain et alii, Collection d'Etudes Classiques vol. 6 (1991) postdates the closing of entries for DCPP.

159 See LSAG² Plate 48.18, which also illustrates less expert alphabetic graffiti on amphoras.

160 Table of variations in Barry B. Powell, *Homer and the origin of the Greek alphabet* (1991) 51.

161 A. Abou-Assaf et alii, *La Statue de Tell Fekherye et son inscription bilingue assyro-araméenne*, *Etudes Assyriologiques* 10 (1982).

graffiti on the walls of Pompeii (low down, hence by schoolchildren).¹⁶² Cicero (*de nat. deorum* 2.93) calls them *unius et uiginti...litterarum*,¹⁶³ but Augustus in his *Res Gestae* used Y and Z for Greek words, as our MSS of Plautus *Merc.* 940 *Zacyntho*. Thus grammarians conservatively held to a minimum standard alphabet of 21 which everybody supplemented.

Of the 22 Phoenician consonants, just half or 11 were taken over into Greek with their phonetic values nearly unchanged: the 6 stops *bgdpkt*, the 4 sonants *lmnr*, and the sibilant *s* (Semitic ש *shin*). The transmittal was assisted by Phoenician loanwords where all these consonants found their correct equivalences in Greek (although with vowels inserted). All 11 equivalentes are found in 6 words, to which many more could be added: קנבן = λίβανος "frankincense"; קלן = γαυλός "bowl"; קב = κάδος "amphora"; קשפן = ἰασπις "jasper"; קלף = δελτός "tablet"; קנ = μύρρα "myrrh."

Seven other Semitic consonants were given special treatment.

Zayin appears in קנבן Jud 6,4 = Γάζα (Arrian *Anab.* 2.26.1) "Gaza" with folk-etymology to Iranian γάζα "treasure."¹⁶⁴ Greek Z mostly represented the double sound *zd* (*z* appeared in no other context): θύραζε (*Iliad* 18.29) "outdoors" from *θύρασ-δε.¹⁶⁵ So קנבן "Ashdod" was transcribed as Ἀζωτος Herodotus 2.157. The adapter, finding the sound *z* in a unique cluster, used *zayin* for the whole cluster.

Samekh was heard as a simple *s* just like *shin*: קנבן became σάφειρος "sapphire," קנבן Πέρσης "Persian." The adapter used it for a Greek cluster of (some guttural plus *s*). Why was a special sign felt necessary? Levin¹⁶⁶ shows that the final sound in κῆρυξ "messenger" can only be *ks* where *k* is a velar fricative, nearly as in Scotch *loch* or German *Ich*. It must have contained a separate initial phoneme to warrant a separate character. Likewise the adapter had no reason to invent Ψ to represent (some labial plus *s*) unless the labial was a separate phoneme, which could only be a labial fricative, *f* or the like, as in Κύκλωψ "Cyclops."

Teth in Semitic words was heard as simple *t*: Τουβίας "Tobias"¹⁶⁷ with קנבן Neh 2,10 (same family). The adapter saw it as a needless duplication,

162 CIL 4.2514-2549 with Plate XL; CIL 4 Sup 2 nos. 5452-5506. More advanced students wrote neater Greek alphabets of the then standard 24 letters (CIL 4 Plate XII.11), along with incomplete Oscan alphabets.

163 X was the last: Quintilian 1.4.9, Suetonius *Div. Aug.* 88.

164 Arabic قنطرة *ghazzatun* is not an older pronunciation but derived from the Greek, for the root קנבן , whence Gaza = "Stronghold," is spelled with an *ayin* in Arabic also.

165 L. R. Palmer, *The Greek Language* (1980) 210.

166 S. Levin, *IESL* 309-311.

167 *P. Cairo Zenon* 59075 = I Makk 5,13.

and transferred it to represent aspirate *th*, as he invented X and Φ to represent aspirate *kh* and *ph* respectively.¹⁶⁸

Qoph was heard as simple *k*: קֹפֶת "sack" = σάκκος. In early Greek texts the *k* sound is written ϕ before *o* and *u*. Powell (p. 40) suggests that the Phoenician informant heard the *k* of κεφαλή as a *kaph* before the *e* but the *k* of Κύπρις as a *qoph* before *u*.

Sadhe was heard again as simple *s*: שֶׁה "gold" as χρυσός. Its place in the alphabet was retained; its name probably became *san* in a general shift of the sibilant-names, and it was used in some early dialects.

Waw was used for a while in dialects that retained the *w*: thus Φοῖνος corresponding to Arabic وَين waynun (but Hebrew וֵין). But where Semitic *waw* (in scripts other than Phoenician) had a *u* vowel before or after, it was altered to become a pure vowel-letter Υ (below). And the Greek adapter might hear a consonantal *waw* as *u*: thus וַיְנַגְּהוּ (Ez 29,10) "Syene of Egypt" becomes Συήνη Herodotus 2.28.

Heth when heard as a consonant became X: χρυσός "gold" from שֶׁה. But initially before a vowel it was heard as the Greek *h* and sometimes so written. Thus Phoen. חַנְּה "Hanno" becomes classical Ἄνω, presumably once *HANO (with single *n*). In other dialects half of the *heth* was written as Ͱ for *h*, the "rough breathing"; and the full character ͱ, later H "eta" was used for Greek long *ē* (below).

In the Greek vowels the use of a Semitic prototype seems unmistakable.

(1) *Aleph*. The Semitic consonant often has an *a*-vowel; for "a slight widening of the throat" changes the consonant into vocalic *a* (Powell 43). The adapter heard only the vowel. For several words already in his language the Semitic spelling was a helpful prototype. Thus אַרְדּוּס "Aradus" (Ez 27,11) became the ethnic Ἀράδιος Herodotus 7.98. In a ritual lament הוֹי־אֲדוֹן "Woe, Lord!" (Jer 22,18) becomes colloquial Ἄδων Theocritus 15.149 (earlier Ἄδωνις in Sappho). The Hebrew has 6 phonemes ʾ*a*down with a glottal stop and a *w*-offglide¹⁶⁹ for the *o*; but writes it with 4 letters, as does the Greek (which hears only 4 phonemes), although the third is different. In Phoenician

168 It is not very probable that Homeric ὀθόνας "fine linen" (*Iliad* 18.595) represents אֲסִין Prov 7,16, so that *teth* here was heard as an aspirate. Nor is the parallel μάλαθα "wax" with מִלָּח Jer 43,9 likely.

169 Here I follow the usage of Saul Levin in his mimeographed Hebrew Grammar: An Objective Introduction to the Biblical Language (Binghamton, 1966) 7 who calls ʾ and ʾ offglides following a vowel. In his later IESL (1971) 299 he says that Hebrew and Aramaic made Phoenician ʾ, ʾ and ʾ do double duty: "(1) explosive consonants, as in Phoenician; (2) implosive, more precisely consonantal or quasi-consonantal sounds, that follow the vocalic nucleus of a syllable and can occur only after certain vowels..." He rejects (p. 300) the doctrine of long vowels in Hebrew and the theory that ʾ, ʾ and ʾ served as *matres lectionis* to mark them.

it has only 3 consonants, אֲדֹן מְלָכִים (KAI 14.18) "Lord of kings"; here then the prototype of the Greek is more like the Hebrew.

The final vowel in ἄλφα, and all the letter-names in -α following it, is mysterious. One can still ask if they are Aramaic emphatics: with βῆτα compare בֵּיתָא "the house" (Ezra 5,3) with 3 out of 4 letters identical. Aramaic "the ox" would be *אֲלָפָא; retrograde Cretan (which lacked Φ) would have identical consonants *ΑΠΛΑΑ. The Hebrew letter names are from some dialect other than Biblical Hebrew, for in recognizable words the vowels are different, יֹד "yodh" beside יָד "hand." That does not prove that they are Phoenician; nor yet the prototype dialect of the Greek adapter, in which they might have final -α.

(2) *Waw as upsilon*. The adapter knew χρυσός "gold" in Greek: Phoenician gave him only חָרָךְ, but the Phoenicianized Hebrew of Proverbs four letters, חָרָךְ. Plainly the first vowel was reduced in Phoenician. Although he reinterpreted the first and last, and made the offglide *waw* into a vowel, it is natural to assume that his informant wrote "gold" with four Semitic letters rather than with three, and in fact wrote the word for him. The adapter also knew Lydians, Λυδοί; in Hebrew the stem is identically spelled, לָוִד. In the Phoenician of Zenjirli (KAI 24.8, 825 BC) "king of Asshur" is מֶלֶךְ אֲשֹׁר, but in the Aramaic of Zenjirli (KAI 216.9, 730 BC) מֶלֶךְ אֲשֹׁר with a *waw* offglide as in Heb. אֲשֹׁר.¹⁷⁰ With such a prototype the adapter could simply transcribe *ΑΣΥΡ- with a single Σ, cf. Ἀσσύριοι Herodotus 1.131.3.

(3) *Yodh*. Linear B had consonantal *y* (signs conventionally written *ja* etc.); Greek retained it unwritten in words like ἵασπις "jasper" *i-yas-pis*. Semitic heard initial Greek vocalic *i* as *y*-, יָן from Ἰάων "Ionian." Conversely Greek heard Semitic *y*- as vocalic *i*: Ἰαπετός "Iapetus" from יָפֶת; Ἰάρδανος "river-name" from יַרְדֵּן. Hebrew frequently writes vocalic *i* with a *y* offglide, and the adapter could simply interpret the offglide as the vowel: κασία "cassia" from קָצִיעָה. Phoenician wrote "Sidon" with three letters צִדֹן (KAI 14.16) but Jos 11,8 with five צִידֹן; although Σιδών differs in two letters, it would be a big coincidence for it to have made two inserts in the Phoenician just where the Hebrew did. Homeric λέων "lion" is surely the same as לֵישׁ (Arabic لَيْسٌ *layṣun*) and is spelled exactly the same.

(4) *He* was originally used to transcribe all Greek E-vowels of any length or quality. The Phoen. man's name מְהַרְבַּעַל (KAI 64.2) with 6 consonants and (presumably) 4 vowels comes out Μέρβαλος (Herodotus 7.98) with 4 and 2 in its stem. Each unrecorded combination (vowel + guttural + vowel) is heard as a simple vowel; 5 out of 6 Phoen. letters are preserved in the transcription. Formally, ἔβενος "ebony" transcribes the consonants of הַבְּנִים

170 Cf. אֲתוּר in Aramaic Ahiqar (Cowley 212, p. 341 below).

although the vowels diverge; φέρε and פָּרַה imperatives "bear," though deep parallels,¹⁷¹ were probably not seen as such.

So *he* was originally used also for Greek long \bar{e} . The Ionic name of the "mina," *μνῆ, is unattested in the nominative, but see μνῆν Herodas 2.52; originally it was written *MNE, cf. the plural MNEAI at Ephesus.¹⁷² Heb. מְנָה Ez 45,12 is identically spelled; clearly in Phoenician the first vowel was reduced. Greek λέσχη "place of reclining" is written in Ionic form ΛΕΣΧΕ (though at Doric Rhodes, p. 141); it is the source rather than the product of Heb. לְשָׁכָה. —But Greek short and long *e* were quite different; so later *heth* was bisected, the left half was retained for the "rough breathing" *h*, and the whole was reused as H for long *e*.

In one word *all four* of the preceding Greek vowels appear in a plausibly reconstructed Semitic prototype. Heb. feminine ethnics like אֲרָמִיָּה I Chron 7,14 "Aramaean woman" refer only to women, the Greek also to lands.¹⁷³ Then from אֲשּׁוּרִי "Asshur" we can confidently reconstruct *אַשּׁוּרִיָּה "Assyrian woman," identical in spelling with the presumed original *ΑΣΥΡΠΙΕ of Herodotus 1.192.2 Ἀσσυρία "Assyria." Here 4 Semitic letters are preceded or followed by similar vowels; in Greek all 4 are reinterpreted as vowels, although a phonetician might have heard a quasi-consonant in each place.¹⁷⁴ Greek spelling conventions almost demand the use of such a prototype.

(5) *ʿAyin*. In the original adaptation, before Ω was invented, *ʿayin* was used for both short and long *o*. Why? The consonant had that vocalism in a few words like עוֹלָם "world" and עוֹז "strength" (Phoen. עֹלַם, עֹז) but not regularly.¹⁷⁵ The best explanation is a reverse extension of the "picture" principle by which a few of the original Semitic letter-forms picture the thing named. For its Semitic character, a circle with a dot in the center, clearly represented an "eye," and hence the Greek might have taken it for the first sound of ὀφθαλμός, which was otherwise lacking.

1.6.1.2 Meaning of the characters

The letter-names, meaningless in Greek, were given folk-etymologies. ἄλφα is assimilated to ἄλφι "barley"; λάβδα (so spelled, LSJ) to Λάβδα mother of

171 Brown-Levin, *Ethnic Paradigm* 83.

172 LSAG² plate 66 no. 53.

173 Brown-Levin "Ethnic Paradigm" 98. But note Ex 2,22 בְּאֶרֶץ נִכְרִיָּה "in a foreign land."

174 Likewise Λυδία Herodotus 1.93.1 "Lydia" (originally *ΛΥΔΙΕ) corresponds exactly to *לִי־יָהּ from לִיָּהּ. —But I confess that I cannot cite a dialect inscription in which the feminine ending -IE appears.

175 Nothing can be built on the agreement Ὀβόδας Josephus *AJ* 16.220 and Nabataean עבדא Cooke no. 95.

Cypselus (Herodotus 5.92b3).¹⁷⁶ Letters were used to name other things of their shape.¹⁷⁷ A δέλτα (Δ) was anything triangular like the Delta of the Nile (Herodotus 2.13) or a part of a woman (Aristophanes *Lys.* 151). The Lacedaemonians painted *labda* on their shields so that the front rank of the phalanx looked like a row of teeth: Eupolis¹⁷⁸ "he was frightened when he saw the labdas flash out"

ἐξεπλάγη γὰρ ἰδὼν στίλβοντα τὰ λάβδα.

Some of the Semitic letter-names have a clear meaning, and some of those in turn are represented in the characters. But conversely, as in Greek, some of the names were apparently meaningless and used to name things of that shape. Thus "hooks" (𐤇𐤍 Ex 38,28) may be things shaped like a *waw*; a "cross" (𐤍 Ez 9,4) is something shaped like a *taw*; perhaps "monkeys" (𐤍𐤏 I Reg 10,22) are "animals with a face like a *qoph*,"¹⁷⁹ and Talmudic 𐤍 "fish" is something shaped like a *nun*. Thus the Hebrew Bible may in fact contain hidden some of the names of the letters.

1.6.1.3 Cadmus

Hebrews took writing for granted from its use all around them and had little curiosity about it: Yahweh tells Moses to write (Ex 17,14) and can write himself (Ex 24,12). Not so Greeks. Herodotus 5.58 says that the "Phoenicians who came with Cadmus" and settled in Hellas brought other matters of learning (διδασκάλια) and in particular letters (γράμματα, lit. "scratchings"), somewhat varying them over time. Ionians took letters over at the instruction of the Phoenicians, made some changes in them (μεταρρυθμίσαντες) and called them "as was only right" Φοινικῆῖα "Phoenician." Eusebius (*Praep. Ev.* 10.5.10) already observed that the letters (στοιχεῖα) were not native to Hellenes (οἰκεῖα Ἑλληνῶν), but drawn from "barbarian [i.e. Hebrew] speech" as their name (ἐπωνυμίας) shows: "For how does Alpha (ἄλφα) differ from

176 Lewy 92, assuming that Hebrew *lamed* once meant "stick" (Jud 3,31 𐤍𐤏𐤍 "ox-goad"), ingeniously compared ῥάβδος "stick."

177 People were punningly named after letters of the alphabet: Ptolemy Hephaestion in Photius *Bib.* no. 90 (151b, iii.66 ed. Henry).

178 Eupolis frag. 359, Kock i.354.

179 κῆβος "long-tailed monkey" (Aristotle, *Hist. Anim.* 502a19) surely represents Egyptian *gjf* (Erman-Grapow 5.158.12-13). 𐤍𐤏 I Reg 10,22 is interpreted "monkeys" by most Versions, and so Rabbinic 𐤍𐤏. —But the 𐤍𐤏𐤍 of I Reg 10,22, in spite of the Versions, are not demonstrably "peacocks"; and τῶς "peacock," with its anomalous accent (Aristophanes *Aves* 102), is not surely related to the Hebrew; nor Latin *pauo* (Columella 8.11.5).

[Hebrew] Alph (ἄλφ)?" Powell,¹⁸⁰ looking at early Greek inscriptions in hexameter, thinks the Greek alphabet was devised just to write down the Homeric poems; but surely business use on perishable wax or papyrus was at least as old.

1.6.1.4 First-person texts

Writing makes the thing written on a kind of artificial person, which may speak for itself. The sarcophagus of Eshmunazar (KAI 14.2), represents him speaking from inside: "King Eshmunazar king of the Sidonians spoke, saying, 'I was snatched away...'"¹⁸¹

דבר מלך אשמנעזר מלך צדנם לאמר נגולת

This is striking in the Mesha stele (KAI 181) which does not represent him at all but is in first person, "I am Mesha son of Kemoshit king of Moab":

אנך משע בן כמשית מלך מאב

So with the inscriptions on early Greek statues. From Thebes, perhaps from the temple of Apollo Ismenios where Herodotus saw "Cadmeian letters" (1.5.3.1 above), comes the bronze statuette of a naked warrior with a graffito on his thighs in a horseshoe pattern:¹⁸²

ΜΑΝΤΙΚΛΟΣ ΜΑΝΘΕΕΚΕ ΦΕΚΑΒΟΛΟΙ ΑΡΓΥΡΟΤΟΧΟΙ

ΤΑΣ {Δ}ΔΕΚΑΤΑΣ ΤΥ ΔΕ ΦΟΙΒΕ ΔΙΔΟΙ ΨΑΡΙΦΕΤΤΑΝ ΑΜΟΙΒ[ΑΝ]

(Here Ψ represents *kh*.) "Mantiklos dedicated me to the Far-Darter, him of the silver bow, out of the tenth part. So do you, O Phoebus, grant me a pleasing gift in return." It is unclear whether the statue represents Mantiklos or Apollo; it refers to both in third person, and to itself in first person as different from either. So a more-than-life-size Kore from Delos is dedicated by Nikandre of Naxos to Artemis:¹⁸³ again the statue may represent either Nikandre or Artemis, and speaks of itself in addition to both. Greek inscriptions not attached to a statue continue to speak of themselves as "me" where (in contrast with any Semitic pattern) the stone itself is envisaged as speaking. Svenbro¹⁸⁴ has an elaborate analysis of these "speaking" texts.

180 Barry B. Powell, *Homer and the Origin of the Greek Alphabet* (1991).

181 So the stele of Bar-Rakab (ANEP² no. 281) shows the king in relief standing over the text which speaks in his name (KAI 216).

182 LSAG² 90-91; Powell 167-9.

183 LSAG² 291; Powell 169-171.

184 Jesper Svenbro, *Phrasikleia: An Anthropology of Reading in Ancient Greece*, tr. Janet Lloyd (1993).

1.6.1.5 Teaching the alphabet

The versified alphabets of the Calvinist primers (*In Adam's fall / we sinnèd all*) and Edward Lear were the educators and democratizers of the English-speaking peoples. So in the Third World, *alfabetización* is a subversive enterprise; Paulo Freire, who teaches language from the viewpoint of the peasant on the hacienda, set up the literacy program in Nicaragua after the 1979 revolution, where C was for CUBA and so on. On the pattern of the acrostic Psalms a lovely rhyming medieval Hebrew poem of 22 words, taken up into the synagogue liturgy, and suitable for beginning students of the language, has each word begin with a successive letter:

אֵל כְּרוֹךְ גְּדוֹל דָּעָה	הַכִּיִן וַפְעַל זְהָרֵי חֲמָה
טוֹב יֵצֵר כְּבוֹד לְשָׁמוֹ	מְאֹרוֹת נָתַן סְבִיבוֹת צָח
פְּנוֹת צְבָאִיו קְדוֹשִׁים	רוֹמְמֵי שְׂדֵי תְּמִיד

"God blessed, great in knowledge, prepared and made the rays of the sun; the Good One created a glory to his name; the luminaries he set round about his strength; the chiefs of his hosts are holy ones, exalters of Shaddai continually." Rabbis sang acrostic verses, *אלפבטרין* (*Ruth Rabbah* on 3,13)—a Greek word as the *ῥeth* shows.¹⁸⁵ Eusebius (*Praep. Ev.* 10.5) tried to read the Hebrew letter-names in sequence as if a Hebrew sentence: thus the first five become μάθησις οἶκου, πλήρωσις δέλτων αὐτή. (Note that he implicitly recognizes the kinship of δέλτα with δέλτος, below.) Jerome (*Epist.* 30.5-12) explains it:

Doctrina domus plenitudo tabularum ista: ...doctrina ecclesiae, quae domus dei est, in librorum reperriatur plenitudine diuinorum.

"*The teaching of the house is the fullness of tablets: the doctrine of the church, the house of God, is found in the fullness of the divine books.*"

Anth. Pal. 9.385 has a mnemonic of the 24 books of the Iliad beginning

Ἄλφα λιτὰς Χρύσου, λοιμὸν στρατοῦ, ἔχθος ἀνάκτων

"Alpha contains the prayers of Chryses, the plague in the army, the quarrel of the lords." In other acrostic poems¹⁸⁶ the first letter of each line spells out the author or recipient. Callias produced an "Alphabet-Revue," with a chorus of 24 women representing the letters (Athenaeus 10.453C):¹⁸⁷

τὸ ἄλφα, βῆτα, γάμμα, δέλτα, θεοῦ γὰρ εἶ...

Clement of Alexandria (*Strom.* 5.46-49) says that the "alphabetic teaching of children" (ἡ στοιχειωτικὴ τῶν παιδῶν διδασκαλία) was carried out through a "child's pattern" (ὕπογραμμὸς παιδικός) which contained the 24

185 ἄλφαβητάρι<ο>ν, Constantinus Porph. *de cerim.* 1.83 (CSHB 3.383.4).

186 E.g. the "Altar" of Vestinus appended to the Loeb "Greek Bucolic Poets" 510.

187 Athenaeus goes on to record that in several lost plays an illiterate spells out the name of Theseus (ΘΗΣΕΥΣ) by describing the form of each letter in turn.

letters of the Greek alphabet once and once only. One of his examples approaches a sequence of recognizable Greek words:

ΒΕΔΥ ΖΑΨ ΧΘΩΜ ΠΛΗΚΤΡΟΝ ΣΦΙΓΞ

He interprets this "Sphinx's riddle" as referring to the four elements (στοιχεῖα) of the cosmos, with the same name as the alphabet-letters.

Latin acrostics may not antedate Christian writers; but Fowler¹⁸⁸ noted that the first letters of *Aeneid* 7.601-604, the opening of the temple of Janus, read MARS. Quintilian 1.1.24-27 discusses teaching the alphabet, and approves giving children ivory letters. Including girls, Juvenal 14.209, "girls learn this before alpha and beta."

Hoc discunt omnes ante alpha et beta puellae.

But to over-exalt the properties of the alphabet leads to a restoration of guild-literacy or resacralization which defeats its purpose. The Rabbis (Bab. Talm. *Berakhoth* 55a) understood Ps 33,6 "By the word of the Lord were the heavens made," to mean that sky and earth were actually constructed out of the 22 letters. The elaborate calligraphy of Arabic or the Book of Kells again takes the text away from simple people.

1.6.2 Reading alphabetic texts

1.6.2.1 Use of the scroll as aide-mémoire

Jeremiah 36 explains how a scroll was used. Jeremiah cannot enter the house of Yahweh; so he calls Baruch, "and Baruch wrote [with ink, 36,18] from the mouth of Jeremiah all the words of Yahweh which he had spoken to him on the scroll of a book" (36.4):

וַיִּכְתֹּב בְּרוּךְ מִפִּי יְרֵמְיָהוּ אֶת כָּל־דְּבָרֵי יְהוָה אֲשֶׁר־דִּבֶּר אֵלָיו עַל־מְגִלַּת־סֵפֶר

Since Baruch had heard the spoken words, using the scroll to refresh his memory he read it through, first in the room of Gemariah, and then to Jehudi; Jehudi in turn, having heard Baruch's living voice, read from the scroll to king Jehoiakim. And "when Jehudi would read three or four columns" (36.23),

וַיְהִי כִּקְרֹא יְהוּדִי שְׁלֹשׁ דָּלְתוֹת וְאַרְבָּעָה

the king would cut them off with a penknife and throw them in the fire. Both oral recitation and the scroll are necessary. Jeremiah's verse is difficult enough so that nobody could read it off an unvowelled scroll without first having heard it. But his mixture of verse and prose is hard to memorize

188 D. P. Fowler, *Classical Quarterly* 33 (1983) 298.

unless one has the scroll at hand to remind him what is coming next. And so on down through the generations until the Masoretes put in the vowels.

Every other Hebrew text existed likewise primarily as an oral performance: the stories of Genesis around a campfire, the Psalms in the Temple, Canticles at a wedding. And so in Greek: epic in the mouth of the rhapsodes; choral lyric after the games, sung to a dance; drama in the theatre; Herodotus' history in his public recitations; Aristotle's works in lectures; Plato's perhaps in recited dialogues.¹⁸⁹ Unlike Hebrew texts, Homer was uniquely memorizable, and rhapsodes had both epics by heart (Plato *Ion* 530B ἐκμανθάνειν); but the written text was a necessary control. And paradoxically, it was the existence of writing that made possible the original composition of those long oral poems. Pliny the Elder spent free time in being read to and taking notes, without correcting the reciter's errors—but also without transferring matter from books to his notes; the human voice must intervene (Pliny the Younger 3.5). Croesus commissioned various prophecies, and looked them over; none pleased him until he *heard* the one from Delphi (Herodotus 1.48): "looking" at a text presupposes reciting the sounds out loud. The Ethiopian eunuch thinks he is alone (Act 8,30), but Philip *hears* him reading Isaiah.

1.6.2.2 Silent reading

Only for special purposes were texts read silently.¹⁹⁰ A cautious recipient reads a love-letter so (*sine murmure legi*) for fear of making a commitment in the presence of the gods (Ovid, *Heroides* 21.1-2). Caesar, standing beside Cato, got a note which he read in silence. Cato suspected treason; Caesar gave him the tablet (γραμματίδιον and δελτάριον), and Cato found it a love-letter from his own sister Servilia, mother of that Brutus thought to be Caesar's natural son, who later slew him (Plutarch, *Brutus* 5)... Augustine comes on Ambrose in his study (*Conf.* 6.3) and finds that "when he read, his eyes were led on from one page to another and his heart searched out the sense, but his voice and tongue were silent": *sed cum legebatur, oculi ducebantur*

189 See Rosalind Thomas, *Literacy and Orality in Ancient Greece* (1992); Henry Wansbrough (ed.), *Jesus and the Oral Tradition*, JSNT Sup. 64 (1991).

190 Josef Balogh, "'Voces paginarum.' Beiträge zur Geschichte des lauten Lesens und Schreibens," *Philologus* 82 (1927) 84-109, 202-240; Paul J. Achtemeier, "Omne Verbum Sonat: The New Testament and the Oral Environment of Late Western Antiquity," *JBL* 109 (1990) 3-27; some more exceptions by Frank D. Gilliard, "More Silent Reading in Antiquity, *non omne uerbum sonat*," *JBL* 112 (1993) 689-696 with bibliography.

per paginas et cor intellectum rimabatur, uox autem et lingua quiescebant. Augustine can only conjecture that the good bishop did this unusual practice "to save his voice," *causa seruandae uocis*.

1.6.2.3 Reading a previously unseen document

Pope has Eloïsa say:

Heaven first taught letters for some wretch's aid,
Some banished lover, or some captive maid.

But early stories about writing involve the folk-theme where a messenger bears his own death-warrant. David sends a letter to Joab (II Sam 11,15), "set Uriah in the forefront of the battle...and draw back from him." How did Joab read it, not having heard it before? He was expert at reading David's mind, or what he determined to be David's mind, as in killing Abner (II Sam 3,30).

Proetus gives Bellerophon a message to the same effect (*Iliad* 6.168-9):

πέμπτε δέ μιν Λυκίηνδε, πόρεν δ' ὄ γε σήματα λυγρά,
γράφας ἐν πίνακι πτυκτῶ θυμοφθόρα πολλά.

"and sent him off to Lycia, and gave him baneful signs, scratching many destructive things in a folding tablet."¹⁹¹ The author perhaps knew the new alphabetic script in which his poem would be recorded; the tale underlying both versions might be Anatolian, with the script hieroglyphic Luvian, since Uriah is a "Hittite," bearing a name perhaps Hebraized by folk-etymology.¹⁹² In each case the motive is sexual and political jealousy: David desires Uriah's wife Bathsheba; Bellerophon's stepmother in her desire for him falsely accuses him.¹⁹³ The messenger is either illiterate, or fearful to break the seal. Harris suggests that Greek letters "were largely reserved for grave occasions or for sensitive secret communications":¹⁹⁴

When letters are mentioned by fifth-century writers, they often have a surprisingly sinister import, like Proetus' letter in the *Iliad*: they are authoritative and deceptive at the same time, and so bring death to a powerful satrap [Herodotus 3.128], and (unjustly) to Hippolytus [Euripides *Hipp.* 1311-2] and to Palamedes [*Palam.* frag.

191 *Pinax* went into Rabbinic (*Avoth* III.17) with the sinister sense "debt-register" (2.4 below).

192 Full analysis of the possible routes of transmission by Peter Frei, "Die Bellerophontessage und das Alte Testament," OBO 129, 39-65.

193 Astour (Hellenosemitica [1965] 226-240) following Lewy 190-193 gives Βελλεροφῶν (Theocritus 15.92) a Semitic etymology *בעלרפאן "Baal heals" on the basis of CIS 1.41 בעלמרפא and similar Ugaritic phrases.

194 William V. Harris, *Ancient Literacy* (1989) 88.

578 Nauck]; important Medizers wrote them to the Great King [Herod. 8.120; Thuc. 1.128-137]. It is remarkable how much the letters in Thucydides—political of course—are instruments of death, betrayal and deceit.

Hilkiah the high priest tells Shaphan the scribe that he has found a book of the Law in the Temple; Shaphan "reads" it (II Reg 22,8)—out aloud, with vowels and accents. It was more or less our Deuteronomy. How could he do it? Taking the story at face value, Levin¹⁹⁵ discounts two answers: the scroll was planted to be discovered in the renovations; Shaphan already knew the same text in a private copy never lost. Then Shaphan was learned enough to puzzle out the intended pronunciation of a book on a familiar topic. That would explain why the tradition of Deut 33, the archaic Blessing of Moses, is in bad shape: Shaphan had fewer clues to reconstruct the unusual vocabulary.

1.6.2.4 *The handwriting on the wall*

Dan 5,25-26 implies a sophisticated blend of reading and writing. When the text was read out, the hearer was to visualize the written consonants on the wall; the reader had to provide them with vowels, which reinforced the natural interpretation as a money-changer's text:

מִנָּה מִנָּה שֶׁקֶל וּפְרָסִין

"a mina, a mina, a shekel [Aramaic for Hebrew שֶׁקֶל], half-minas." Already this marks "Babylon" (under Seleucid rule at the likely date of writing) as money-centered. Daniel solves the riddle by altering the consonants a little and putting in new vowels: "numbered" (מְנָה), "weighed" (תְּקִילָתָהּ), "divided" (פְּרִיסָתָהּ) and "Persians" (פְּרָסִין).

1.6.3 Writing as a substitute for memory

We have three sources of information; Sagan¹⁹⁶ quantifies them. He estimates that a human chromosome has 2×10^{10} bits of data in blocks of 4; the memory of a mature human being 2×10^{11} bits in blocks of 2; the average book 5×10^6 bits in blocks of 26. The data-content of the chromosome equals 4,000 books, and of the memory (if all it had to do was memorize books with total recall) 40,000 books. Grotius, citing from memory, had large parts of Greek

195 S. Levin, "חקריו, הטקסט היסודי של התנ"ך," in: הגות עברית באמריקה, Tel-Aviv, World Hebrew Union (1971) 1.83-86. English version to appear in *General Linguistics*.

196 Carl Sagan, *The Dragons of Eden: Speculations on the Evolution of Human Intelligence* (1977) 24-46.

and Latin literature in his head. A library is a bigger and more accessible extension of both inherited and acquired data. Plato (*Philebus* 38E) says that "our soul resembles a book," ἡ ψυχὴ βιβλίῳ τινὶ προσέοικεν. As cosmogony can only be imaged on the basis of existing technology, so mental functions; a computer society sees the mind as more like a computer.

1.6.3.1 "Mother of the Muses"

Prometheus (Aeschylus *PV* 459-461) begins his list of benefits to humanity:

καὶ μὴν ἀριθμόν, ἔξοχον σοφισμάτων,
 ἐξηῦρον αὐτοῖς, γραμμάτων τε συνθέσεις,
 μνήμην πάντων, μουσομήτορ' ἐργάνην.

"And I discovered counting for human beings, chief of inventions; and the combinations of letters, the memory of all things, the laborious mother of the Muses." Greek numerals needed much improvement: the alphabet does warrant his praise. Only by letters, says Diodorus 12.13.2, are "the dead carried in the memory of the living," οἱ τετελευτηκότες τοῖς ζῶσι διαμνημονεύονται. Language makes the human being a social creature, "a political animal"; phonetic script transmits wisdom without recourse to professional scribes. This has never been said better than by an American President. Lincoln describes "the invention of phonetic writing, as distinguished from the clumsy picture writing of some of the nations," and goes on:

That it was difficult of conception and execution is apparent, as well by the foregoing reflections as by the fact that so many tribes of men have come down from Adam's time to ours without ever having possessed it. Its utility may be conceived by the reflection that to *it* we owe everything which distinguishes us from savages. Take it from us, and the Bible, all history, all science, all government, all commerce, and nearly all social intercourse, go with it.¹⁹⁷

1.6.3.2 Memory and writing

In societies previously illiterate the alphabet transferred data from memory to writing. An inscription from Crete¹⁹⁸ of ab. 500 BC punched on a bronze armor piece commissions one Spensithios, ΣΠΕΝΣΙΘΙΟΣ, to act in some city in

197 Cited by Gary Wills, *Lincoln at Gettysburg: the Words that Remade America* (1992) 153-4, from Don E. Fehrenbacher, *Abraham Lincoln: Speeches and Writings*, 2 vols. (1989) ii.7-8 [not seen by me].

198 Lilian H. Jeffery & Anna Morpurgo-Davies, "ΠΟΙΝΙΚΑΣΤΑΣ and ΠΟΙΝΙΚΑΖΕΝ: BM 1969.4-2.1, A new archaic inscription from Crete," *Kadmos* 9 (1970) 118-150.

regard to "divine and human civic affairs," ΤΑ ΔΗΜΟΣΙΑ ΤΑ ΤΕ ΘΙΗΙΑ ΚΑΙ ΤΑΝΘΡΩΠΙΝΑ. His duties are defined by two infinitives, ΠΟΙΝΙΚΑΖΕΝ ΚΑΙ ΜΝΑΜΟΝΕΥΉΗΝ; the former has also a noun of agent ΠΟΙΝΙΚΑΣΤΑΣ. Since the Cretan alphabet had no Φ, the office is surely φοινικαστάς "writer of Phoenician letters" or less likely "filler-in of letters in red."¹⁹⁹ His tasks are first novel and second traditional, "to write and to remember." Many Greek states had ἱερομνήμονες or μνήμονες (Aristotle *Pol.* 1321b39), originally "ones who kept documents in memory"; thus Cretan Gortyn had a ΜΝΑΜΟΝ "secretary" who holds funds in escrow.²⁰⁰ Other texts show a new awareness of writing: Mytilene²⁰¹ had a ΦΟΙΝΙΚΟΓΡΑΦΟΣ; a decree of Teos of 470 BC curses anyone who "cuts out or renders illegible the *phoinikeia*,"²⁰² ΦΟΙΝΙΚΗΙΑ: ΕΚΚΟΨΕ[Ι:] Η ΑΦΑΝΕΑΣ ΠΟΙΗΣΕΙ. In a Hebrew parallel²⁰³ at II Reg 18,18 etc the two functions are divided:

שְׁבְנָה הַסֵּפֶר וַיֹּאחַז בְּנֵי־אֶסָף הַמְּזֻכָּר

"Shebna the scribe (LXX ὁ γραμματεὺς) and Joah son of Asaph the remembrancer (ὁ ἀναμνησκών)." In each text the new office of writer precedes the office of memory being superseded.

1.6.3.3 The "tablet," *deltos*

At Jer 36,23 the "columns" (as we say) of the scroll are called "doors," תִּלְתָּי; LXX [43,23] σανίδας "folding doors, wooden tablets"; Vg (which no longer knew the scroll) *pagellas* "notebook pages." In a Lachish ostracon (KAI 193) דלת probably means a tablet, "I have written on the *dlt* (evidently something other than the ostracon) according to all that [my lord] has sent to me".²⁰⁴

כתבתי על הדלת ככל אשר שלח ... אלי

Hence Greek δέλτος, Cypriote *ta-ta-la-to-ne ta-te*, i.e. τὰν δάλτον τάνδε.²⁰⁵ Herodotus 8.135 records its use in exactly the manner of Baruch, reporting a consultation in Carian at the oracle of Thebes, "to 'scratch' the things spoken by the prophet on the tablet," τὰ λεγόμενα ὑπὸ τοῦ προφήτεω γράφειν εἰς

199 R. F. Willetts, *The Civilization of Ancient Crete* (1977) 186-190, surveying the discussion tends towards the latter interpretation; but in any case the connection with writing is firm.

200 R. F. Willetts, *The Law Code of Gortyn*; *Kadmos Supplement I* (1967); XI.16.

201 IG 12.2.96-97.

202 Meiggs-Lewis no. 30 p. 62. Here again it is possible to interpret "removes the red paint from the letters." See p. 259 below.

203 See G. Patrick and Ruth B. Edwards, "The meaning and etymology of ΠΟΙΝΙΚΑΣΤΑΣ," *Kadmos* 16 (1977) 131-140.

204 And so perhaps *dlt* is "tablet" in the tiny Ugaritic document KTU 5.7.5.

205 Idalion tablet, O. Masson, *Les Inscriptions chypriotes syllabiques* (1983) no. 217.26.

αὐτήν [i.e. τὴν δέλτον]. As Heb. תִּתְּלֵךְ are twin swinging doors (I Reg 6,34), Greek for the Roman *duodecim tabulae* (Cicero *de off.* 1.37) is δώδεκα δέλτων (Dion. Hal. 2.27.3), perhaps in pairs. So you say (Euripides *Iph. Aul.* 98) κὰν δέλτου πτυχαῖς γράψας "writing it on the folding leaves of a tablet."

In metaphorical senses the word is a favorite of the Greek tragedians. Aeschylus *Eum.* 275 δελτογράφῳ δὲ πάντ' ἐπωπᾶ φρενί "[Hades] oversees everything with his mind, which records as on a tablet"; *PV* 789 "[Io,] write [your wanderings] on the mindful tablets of your *phrenes*":

ἦν ἐγγράφου σὺ μνήμοσιν δέλτοις φρενῶν.

So Sophocles²⁰⁶ "Set my words in the tablets of your *phren*,"

Θοῦ δ' ἐν φρενὸς δέλτοισι τοὺς ἐμοὺς λόγους.

Compare Prov 7,3 etc. "Write them on the tablet of your heart":

יְכַתְּבֵהוּ עַל-לִבִּי לְכָכֶךָ

Vg *scribe illam in tabulis cordis tui*, cf. Cicero *Acad.* 2.1 *in animo res insculptae*. *Hamlet* is Shakespeare's play about writing and reading, with its death-warrant letter and folk-songs; the hero lists for his father's ghost (*Ham.* I.v Folio) the documents he will delete from memory:

Yea, from the Table of my Memory,
He wipe away all triuiall fond Records,
All sawes of Bookes, all formes, all presures past,
That youth and observation coppied there;
And thy Commandment all alone shall liue
Within the Booke and Volume of my Braine.

1.6.3.4 Writing as metaphor of memory

After the ancients had gotten used to writing, they affected to see it as inferior to memory. Ovid (*Met.* 1.91-92) thinks the Golden Age without law and without writing also, *nec uerba minantia fixo / aere legebantur* "no threatening words were read [out loud!] from permanent bronze." Jer 31,33 contrasts the new covenant with the old, "I have put my law within them, and upon their hearts I write it,"

נִתְּנָה אֶת-תּוֹרָתִי בְּקִרְבָּם וְעַל-לִבָּם אֶכְתְּבֶנָּה

Plato in the *Phaedrus* (275A) fathers on a supposed Egyptian the criticism that writing "will induce forgetfulness in the souls of learners through their neglect of memory," τῶν μαθόντων λήθην μὲν ἐν ψυχαῖς παρέξει μνήμησ ἀμελετησίᾳ; preferable to writing is the word "written with understanding

206 Sophocles, *Triptolemus* frag. 597, TrGF iv.447.

in the soul of the learner" (276A), ὃς μετ' ἐπιστήμης γράφεται ἐν τῇ τοῦ μαθάνοντος ψυχῇ.

Paul is working over both Jeremiah and the Platonic tradition when at II Kor 3,1-3 he writes words to be read out at Corinth:

You yourselves are our letter, written on your hearts, recognized and read out aloud by all people; you make it plain that you are the letter of Christ delivered in our ministry by us, written not with ink but with the spirit of the living God, not on tablets (ἐν πλαξίν) of stone but on the tablets of hearts of flesh.

Here he is also using the contrast between the heart of stone and of flesh at Ez 36,26. Documents written on the clay of Mesopotamia or the stone and papyrus of Egypt bound rather than freed. The stone tablets of Moses were intended both as instruments of liberation (Lev 25,10, the text written on the Liberty Bell) and as intelligible (Neh 8,8). But Paul finds them an inflexible external burden.

Still our evidence that Paul thought so is precisely *his* letter (even though read out loud like the commandments), written in ink and signed. The written text of the Law was even for him a necessary preliminary, our "pedagogue (παιδαγωγός) which led us to Christ" (Gal 3,24). So John would rather not use paper and ink (χάρτου καὶ μέλανος II Joh 12) or pen and ink (μέλανος καὶ καλάμου III Joh 13) to communicate with his people, but in fact he does. The external letter of commendation and the internal commitment of the heart were each necessary as evidence of the other.

1.7 Theism and humanism

The content of Hebrew and Greek literatures is a new level of affirmations about gods and human beings. Here and in supplementary articles (p. 9) I note features of the divine in which Israel and Hellas agree. The feature in which they seem most different—the sole God of Israel against the pantheon of Olympus—is bridged in various ways: in particular by the High God's begetting a female counterpart, Wisdom (ἡσέκη) and Athena (Article A "The High God"). The attributes of Zeus and Yahweh as High God run parallel:

(1) The High God defeats a dragon as the first episode of creation (Chapter 2.5; Excursus B; Chapter 3.4).

(2) The High God (along with Roman Jupiter, and the other Olympians in Hellas) receives a cult consisting of the sacrifice of a bull or other large animal, which provides a meal to the sacrificers (Chapter 6).

(3) The High God's kingship (over both men and the other gods [Ps 95,3]) is the model for an original human kingship (Article C "Divine Kingship").

(4) The High God (including Jupiter) causes the falling of the elements from the sky, both harmful and helpful: lightning and thunder, snow and hail, rain and dew (Article B "The High God and the Elements").

(5) The High God, as the author of rain, is the source of justice among men, including the maintenance of land tenure (Article A "Men of the Land"). The theism is inseparable from the emergence of a human justice.

The stiffest classical humanists downplay the theistic background. Thus Vermeule:²⁰⁷

...an immortal god is without qualities most men possess, being incapable of death and consequently deprived of the gallantry and understanding which men, short-witted though they are, acquire through the individual contemplation and social experience of death.

But for the archaic poets Aeschylus and Pindar, gods and men, in their different statuses, are joint tenants of the cosmos, and the gods cannot be ruled out of court. Here I make the opposite point, and note a few parallels in the view of humanity, with both noble and realistic themes, shared by Israel and Hellas.

Dominion. Hebrew humanism comes out boldly in Ps 8,7, "Thou hast given him rule (לְיָדָיו) over the works of thy hands, thou hast put all things under his feet." The Chorus in Sophocles' *Antigone* (332-375) says "there is nothing more amazing than man," celebrates his control over birds, wild beasts and fish; and adds (vs 354) "he has learned speech and wind-swift thought," καὶ φθέγμα καὶ ἀνεμόεν φρόνημα ... ἐδιδάξατο. The Psalmist echoes Gen 1,28 "And have dominion (יָרְדוּ, LXX ἄρχετε, Vg *dominamini*, Luther *herrschet*) over the fish of the sea and the birds of the heavens and all the animals." Ovid (*Met.* 1.74-77), after likewise describing the birth of fish, beasts and birds, goes on:

Sanctius his animal mentisque capacius altae
deerat adhuc et quod *dominari* in cetera posset.

"There was still lacking a nobler animal than these, more capable of lofty thought, which could have *dominion* over the others." The Vulgate follows Ovid here in *dominari*; did Ovid have some tradition of the LXX?²⁰⁸

Good and evil. Eden held the tree of knowledge of good and evil (Gen 2,9); God makes both (Isa 45,7) and sets them before human beings (Deut 30,15). Achilles tells Priam (*Iliad* 24.527-8) "two jars stand on the threshold of Zeus such that [one] gives evil gifts, the other good gifts":

207 Emily Vermeule, *Aspects of Death in Early Greek Art and Poetry* (1979) 121.

208 Levin elegantly notes Pliny 7.3 *animal ceteris imperaturum*.

δοιοὶ γάρ τε πίθοι κατακείαται ἐν Διὸς οὔδει
δῶρων οἷα δίδωσι κακῶν, ἕτερος δὲ ἑάων.

Zeus appears as the *wanax* of a Minoan or Mycenaean palace, distributing food to his retainers from the big *pithoi* that we have found; we never get good unmixed, and are lucky if we do not get evil unmixed. Here it seems that humanity has no choice at all. But at the very start of the *Odyssey* (1.32-34) Zeus, as if to refute Achilles' words, says "Oh dear, how mortals blame the gods! For they say that evils come from us; but it is they themselves, by their own follies, who have woes over and beyond what is allotted them":

ᾠ πόποι, οἷον δὴ νυ θεοὺς βρότοι αἰτιῶνται.
ἐξ ἡμέων γάρ φασι κάκ' ἔμμεναι· οἱ δὲ καὶ αὐτοὶ
σφῆσιν ἀτασθαλίησιν ὑπὲρ μόρον ἄλγε' ἔχουσιν.

The worst failure is missing the mark in the two main enterprises of travel and war. It is defined by the two roots later specialized to mean "sinning." Aristophanes *Plut.* 961 "or have we wholly missed our way?"

ἢ τῆς ὁδοῦ τὸ παράπαν ἡμαρτήκαμεν;
Diomedes says of Pandarus' spear throw (*Iliad* 5.287) ἡμβροτες οὐδ' ἔτυχες, "you missed, you didn't hit me." Prov. 19,2:

אִישׁ בְּחֹר אֶטֶר יָד יְמִינֹו כְּלֹיָהּ קִלְעַ בְּאַבְן אֶל־הַשְּׂעָרָה וְלֹא יִטָּא

"He who is hasty with his feet misses [the way]," Vg *et qui festinus est pedibus offendit.* Jud 20,16

אִישׁ בְּחֹר אֶטֶר יָד יְמִינֹו כְּלֹיָהּ קִלְעַ בְּאַבְן אֶל־הַשְּׂעָרָה וְלֹא יִטָּא
"picked men without use of their right hand; each could sling with a stone at a hair and not miss;" LXX (A) ... οὐ διαμαρτάνοντες.

Old age and death. The Preacher (Koh 11,7) affirms "Light is sweet (LXX γλυκὺ τὸ φῶς), and it is good for the eyes to look at the sun":

וּמְתוֹק הָאוֹר וְטוֹב לְעֵינַיִם לְרְאוֹת אֶת־הַשֶּׁמֶשׁ

"For if a man lives many years, let him rejoice in them all; but let him remember that the days of darkness will be many." So Mimnermus:²⁰⁹

οὐδ' ἀνγὰς προσορῶν τέρπεται ἠελίου.

"[The old man] no longer takes pleasure in beholding the rays of the sun." Earlier 80-year old Barzillai has the same understanding (II Sam 19,36), "Can I distinguish between good and evil? Can your servant taste what he eats or what he drinks? Can I still hear the voice of singing men and singing women?"

209 Mimnermus frag. 1.8 ed. West IEG ii.83. Also Zeus took from Phineus (p. 181 below) "the sweet light of his eyes" (Apollonius 2.184), ὀφθαλμῶν γλυκερὸν φάος; Greek reminiscence in Koheleth? See p. 324 below.

For "the days of our years are threescore years and ten" (Ps 90,10 KJV), at most fourscore.²¹⁰ Petronius says of vigorous old age (43.7) *Et quot putas illum annos secum tulisse? Septuaginta et supra...aetatem bene ferebat, niger tamquam coruus*. "And how many years do you think he carried off with him? Seventy and more.... He carried his age lightly, his hair black as a raven." "Black as a raven" is an international proverb (p. 313 below).

Ps 90,5-6 sees human beings as creatures of a day, "You sweep them away, they are a dream, as grass renewed in the morning; in the morning it flourishes and is renewed, in the evening it fades and withers":²¹¹

וְרַמְתֶּם שָׁנָה יְהִיוּ בְּבֹקֶר כְּהַצִּיר יְהִלֵּךְ
בְּבֹקֶר יִצְיָץ וְחִלֵּךְ לְעֶרֶב יִמּוֹלֵל יִבָּשׁ

So *Iliad* 6.146 etc. "As is the generation of leaves, so is that of men":

οἷη περ φύλλων γενεή, τοίη δὲ καὶ ἀνδρῶν.

Before the "gleam from Zeus" (αἴγλα διόσδοτος) comes, Pindar (*Pyth.* 8.95-6) cries out ἐπάμεροι...σκιᾶς ὄναρ ἄνθρωπος "Creatures of a day! ...Man is the dream of a shadow." So in Aeschylus' *Prometheus* (83, 547) human beings are ἐφημέροισι creatures of a day;²¹² elsewhere θανάτ᾽ τε καὶ ἐφαμέρια ζῶα "mortal and ephemeral creatures"²¹³ like the mayfly ἐφήμερον (*Aristotle Hist. Anim.* 490a34); and so very often.²¹⁴ "A living dog is better than a dead lion" (Koh 9,4). Achilles in Hades will not let Odysseus gloss over his death: "For I would prefer to stay on the earth²¹⁵ as the serf (θητευέμεν) of another, of a man without property and little income, than to reign (ἀνάσσειν) over all the departed dead" (*Odyssey* 11.489-491).

The dark underworld. At death we go under earth in a gloomy state the next thing to nothing at all. Elsewhere (Article E "Shamanism") I discuss its rivers and snares (Ps 18,4-5) with Greek parallels. Its Greek name ἔρεβος is

210 Actually the Hebrew just has the regular words for "seventy" and "eighty." Lincoln at Gettysburg has the KJV in mind with "Fourscore and seven years ago...."

211 Watts' paraphrase further adds Heraclitus' image of time as a river: "Time, like an ever-rolling stream, / Bears all its sons away; / They fly, forgotten, as a dream / Dies at the opening day."

212 But E. Vermeule, *Aspects of Death in Early Greek Art and Poetry*, 24, thinks it usually has the sense of *Odyssey* 21.85 ἐφημέρια φρονέοντες "only thinking for one day at a time."

213 Timaeus of Locri 99d cited by LSJ s.v. ἐφημέριος.

214 Minnermus (frag. 2, West IEG ii.83) in elegiac mood expands on the Homeric theme "like the leaves of spring." Aristophanes *Birds* 685-687 has the chorus of immortal *Birds* address human beings with many synonyms of ἐφημέριοι, "like the generation of leaves," φύλλων γενεά προσόμοιοι and so on.

215 So the Oxford *Odyssey* ii.106 over against LSJ, which translates ἐπάρουπος "attached to the soil" as a serf.

almost identical to עֶרֶב "evening."²¹⁶ Compare the doublets "facing the darkness, towards *erebos*" (*Odyssey* 12.81), πρὸς ζόφον, εἰς ἔρεβος τετραμμένον; and "at evening at the going down of the sun" (Deut 16,6),

בְּעֶרֶב כְּבוֹא הַשָּׁמֶשׁ

Bernal²¹⁷ saw the similarity between Hebrew גַּיא "valley" and Greek γαῖα, γῆ "land," isolated in both languages. Levin²¹⁸ notes of the Hebrew that its "spelling and vocalization are both singularly inconsistent." Both words can designate the realm of the dead. In Hades Agamemnon asks his colleagues, "How did it happen that you entered the dark land?" (*Odyssey* 24.106), ἐρεμνὴν γαῖαν ἔδυτε with an adjective from ἔρεβος; compare "though I walk through the valley of darkness" (Ps 23,4):²¹⁹

גַּם כִּי אֶלֶךְ בְּגַיא צְלְמוֹת

Vulnerable and defiant nakedness. Transience would seem most evident in nakedness. Paul expects not to be found naked, γυμνοί "not to be unclothed but clothed upon" (II Kor 5,3-4). The tasks of society are defined by men's clothes. Cicero (*de off.* 1.77) defines the transition from war to peace, *cedant arma togae* "let armor yield to the toga." For the Hebrews, nakedness means shame and defenselessness, "Naked I came out from my mother's womb and naked shall I return there" (Job 1,21) as if the womb is the grave:

עָרָם יִצְתִי מִבֶּטֶן אִמִּי וְעָרָם אָשׁוּב שָׁמָּה

But the natural tasks of a single man are done naked. Not just sexuality; but also agriculture, Hesiod *Opera* 391-2, "sow naked, plough naked, reap naked"

... γυμνὸν σπείρειν, γυμνὸν δὲ βοωτεῖν, / γυμνὸν δ' ἄμάειν
echoed by Vergil (*Georg.* 1.299) *nudus ara, sere nudus.*²²⁰ Greek art, in a leap ahead from its Egyptian models, celebrates the male body in nakedness; it reflects and influences practice in the games. Thucydides (1.6.5-6):

[The Lacedaemonians] were the first to go naked (ἐγυμνώθησαν) [in athletics], getting undressed in public and after exercise (γυμνάζεσθαι) anointing themselves with oil (λίπα... ἠλείψαντο). Formerly even in the Olympic games athletes competed wearing loincloths around their private parts, and it is not many years since this

216 Levin IESL 340; Brown-Levin, "Ethnic Paradigm" 93. Each word has good cognates in its own family: in Indo-European, words for "darkness," Sanskrit *rajas*, Gothic *riqiz*, and esp. Armenian *erek*; Arabic *gharb(un)* "sunset, west." But the Greek and Hebrew are so close that at least they must have been mutually assimilated.

217 M. Bernal, *Black Athena* i.57.

218 Levin, IESL 481.

219 Here the LXX σκιάς θανάτου "shadow of death" records the ingenious Masoretic etymology of תַּלְמִיץ so pointed as if two words.

220 West, *Works and Days* 258, with further illustrations from literature and art, is at a loss to explain the rule.

practice ceased. Still some foreigners ("barbarians"), especially in Asia, wear loincloths for competitions in boxing and wrestling.²²¹

Plato (*Rep.* 452C), arguing that women should exercise naked along with men, notes "it is not a long time since the Hellenes thought, as most of the barbarians still do, that it was shameful and ridiculous for men to be seen naked" and that "first the Cretans, then the Lacedaemonians, introduced naked athletics (ἤρχοντο τῶν γυμνασίων)." Thuillier²²² illustrates from vase paintings various levels of protection for the genitals, and concludes that at first complete nakedness was an artistic convention exaggerating athletic practice, but in time creating a new practice.²²³

This outdoor unclothed humanity (in spite of Plato's theories) is almost wholly masculine; Homer's women and goddesses are "white-armed," λευκώλενος, and the female nude is slow to appear in art. The semi-naked athletics of the Spartan girls (Plutarch, *Lycurgus* 14-15) hardly appears elsewhere.²²⁴ In Athens male sexuality was attached to other men and boys. Greeks noted the prudery of Persians. A Greek general set out "barbarian" prisoners for sale as slaves naked, for them to be seen "white because of never taking their clothes off" (Xenophon *Hell.* 3.4.19), λευκοῦς διὰ τὸ μηδέποτε ἐκδύεσθαι. Ammianus Marcellinus (23.6.84) notes that Sassanids were so covered with iridescent flowing garments that "between shoes and head nothing appears unclothed," *ut...inter calceos tamen et uerticem nihil uideatur intectum.*

Plato (*Cratylus* 403B) denies that the "soul naked of the body," ἡ ψυχὴ γυμνὴ τοῦ σώματος can only go down to the underworld. In Israel ideal nakedness is projected back to Eden, where the couple are "naked and not ashamed" (Gen 2,25);²²⁵ the girl of Cant 5,3 says "I had taken off my tunic (ἡχιτῶν, LXX χιτῶνα), how could I put it back on?". In ecstasy Saul "prophesies" naked (I Sam 19,24); David dances before the ark naked or

-
- 221 Perhaps the "barbarian" athletics in Asia Minor spoken of by Thucydides is a Greek cultural export rather than a parallel.
- 222 Jean-Paul Thuillier, "La nudité athlétique (Grèce, Etrurie, Rome)," Nikephoros 1 (1988) 29-48. He regards as an anachronism the claim of Pausanias 1.44.1 that Orsippus of Megara in 720 BC introduced complete nakedness by winning through his greater speed when he dropped his girdle.
- 223 Thuillier 41 notes that the late origin of complete nakedness militates against theories that the games were a place of magical and ritual nudity over against ordinary life.
- 224 Hugh M. Lee, "SIG³ 802: Did women compete against men in Greek athletic festivals?," Nikephoros 1 (1988) 103-118," thinks they did not. The Delphic inscription of his title (AD 45) he interprets as of an all-female race in the stade, although men and women may have competed in singing to the kithara.
- 225 But Odysseus is ashamed (αἰδέομαι, *Od.* 6.221) to appear naked before Nausicaa's girls.

exposed, and prudish Michal uses the chance to break with him (II Sam 6,20).

The olive as preservative. With all that Greek naked athletics, rubbing with olive oil was essential for skin care. In Israel, with an equally hot and dry climate, it was regular (Mic 6,15; Deut 28,40) except in mourning (II Sam 12,20; 14,2) for both men and women (Ruth 3,3; Ez 16,9). Those texts use the verb סָחַף ; Ps 23,5 "thou anointest my head with oil" uniquely has שָׁחַף ; the verb we might expect, מָשַׁח , is specialized for the ritual anointing of prophets, priests and kings except at Amos 6,6. Even a Persian could be called Yahweh's "anointed one," יְהוָה־מָשִׁיחַ (Isa 45,1), and Μεσσίας (Joh 1,42; 4,25) or Χριστός is a title for Jesus.

Not for two millennia was the next best thing to nakedness, bronzed bodies shining with sun-tan lotion and bearing the merest scraps of cloth, again seen on Mediterranean shores. If the ozone hole spreads and ultraviolet comes through, one more part of our inheritance from the old world is lost. As olive oil extends the life of the skin, in ritual theory it extends life indefinitely. The Davidic king, in person or through his descendants, is seen as immortal. When Solomon is anointed the people say, "May King Solomon live" (I Reg 1,39), $\text{יְחִי הַמֶּלֶךְ שְׁלֹמֹה}$.

Deissmann²²⁶ calls Paul's world—the overlap of Israel and Hellas—the "world of the olive-tree."²²⁷ Attic vases show the olive harvest and the stones of the olive press.²²⁸ Its "fatness by which gods and men are honored" (Jud 9,9) makes it the center of Mediterranean life. The marriage bed of Odysseus and Penelope (*Odyssey* 23.190) is built into an olive tree; so Ps 128,3, "Your wife shall be like a fruitful vine within your house, your children like olive shoots round about your table." Plutarch (*Mor.* 723F) says that, with the laurel and the myrtle, the olive constantly puts out new leaves, "like cities, each is everliving," $\text{ὥσπερ πόλεις ἕκαστον ἀείζωνον}$. In effect it is the city. So Yahweh called his people "a green olive tree, fair with goodly fruit" (Jer 11,16); one day Israel's beauty will be like the olive or vine (Hos

226 Adolf Deissmann, *Paul: A Study in Social and Religious History*; tr. W. E. Wilson (from the second German edition of 1927); p. 39. For the olive see further: Hamish A. Forbes & Lin Foxhall, "The Queen of All Trees: Preliminary Notes on the Archaeology of the Olive," *Expedition* 21 (1978-9) 37-47; J. Boardman, "The olive in the Mediterranean: its culture and use," pp. 187-196 of J. Hutchinson et alii (eds.), *The Early History of Agriculture = Phil. Trans. R. Soc. London B.* 275 (1976); Marcel Detienne, "L'olivier: un mythe politico-religieux," *RHR* 3 (1970) 5-23, repr. as pp. 293-306 of M. I. Finley (ed.), *Problèmes de la terre en Grèce ancienne [Civilisations et Sociétés 33]*, 1973.

227 Gaul was not brought in until (Justin 43.4.3) colonists from Ionian Phocaea planted the vine and the olive.

228 R. J. Hopper, *Trade and Industry in Classical Greece* (1979); Plates 29-30.

14,6-7). Athena claimed Attica by planting an olive tree (Herodotus 8.55); Sophocles (*Oed. Col.* 700-1) says "what flourishes most of all in this land is the leaf of the grey olive which nurtures young life":

ὁ τῶδε θάλλει μέγιστα χώρα
γλαυκᾶς παιδοτρόφου φύλλον ἐλαίας.

Chapter 2: Literary Contexts of the Common Hebrew-Greek Vocabulary¹

How far was classical Hellenic culture related to the Ancient Near East? Answers differ widely, and our evaluation of particular data reflects our general answer. This suggests that our methods are not scientific enough. Only in Anatolia were Hellenes in continuous contact with older literate cultures; but the Hittite texts—still not fully available in translation and transcription—offer only moderate parallels. Oriental artefacts on Hellenic soil, like the cylinder-seals of Thebes (15th–13th century BC),² will probably remain too sparse for extensive conclusions. Adaptations of Oriental motifs in archaic Greek art are undeniable, but the nature of the contact involved is not always clear. It is tempting to look for Semitic etymologies of Hellenic place-names and heroes; but many of the proposals cannot be regarded as proved on their own merits. Comparison of mythological motifs shows striking parallels, some noted here; but the very conservatism of myth allows the parallels to have a fairly distant origin—perhaps as distant as the formation of the human psyche whose archetypes they reveal. The social structure of early epics allows a general comparison,³ and the structure of the city-state a more specific one;⁴ but the direction and type of influence involved are not made clear by the comparisons as such.

Barring new finds, we must operate mostly with the literatures. For reasons which I discuss in Chapter 1, Greek and Hebrew texts have been compared with all the ancient texts except those with which they are most comparable—each other. No Oriental texts come close to the Hebrew Bible with respect to exactness of phonetic writing, comprehensibility (due to its continuous preservation), or literary value; none are so close to Hellenic texts in respect

1 Revision of an article with the same title in *JSS* 13 (1968) 163-191.

2 Edith Porada, "The Cylinder Seals Found at Thebes in Boeotia," *Archiv für Orientforschung* 28 (1981) 1-78.

3 C. H. Gordon, *Homer and Bible: the Origin and Character of East Mediterranean Literature* (1967), reprint from *Hebrew Union College Annual* 26 (1955) 43-108.

4 See Chapter 1 above and my "From Divine Kingship to Dispersal of Power in the Mediterranean City-State," *ZAW* 105 (1993) 62-86.

to social origins, form or date. What we need are indisputable points of contact between the two literatures which will let us judge, at least in their vicinity, how far the literatures are comparable—and likewise, in consequence, the societies which produced them. Such a point of contact is provided above all by the *items of vocabulary common to Greek and Hebrew*. Hitherto the comparison has been made from a linguistic viewpoint and from a presumption that the common vocabulary is principally "Semitic loan-words in Greek." Granted those two limitations, the conservative analysis of Emilia Masson,⁵ with very few marginal or questionable items, is an excellent beginning. But it omits many words common to Greek and Hebrew, equal or more so in number and interest, where the source is other than Semitic or is unknown. Such for example are the old names for "wine" (Chapter 4) and of the "bull" (Chapter 6), each the carrier of numerous other terms and cultural parallels.

Most of the words are nouns: the names of Mediterranean animals, plants, minerals, artefacts, cultural institutions. Plato, though his examples are unfortunate, already suspected that "the Hellenes, especially those who live subject to the barbarians, have borrowed many words from them" (*Cratylus* 409E). He had no way of knowing that barbarians, in particular Hebrews, had in turn borrowed words from the Hellenes, or from Mediterranean springs where Greeks also had dipped their buckets. Here, after a modest nod to lexicography, I go on to compare the *literary contexts* of such words in Hebrew and Greek (and also Latin) texts. For in the end, lexica of languages no longer spoken are nothing more than interpretative concordances to their preserved texts. As new items of material culture, together with their names, were carried around the Mediterranean, a common way of life built upon them grew up; commerce creates social uniformity. Written texts attest features of those social patterns; the common vocabulary appears in parallel contexts or in clusters, because similar societies will be similarly described. At a later date, the LXX translates the bulk of the common Hebrew vocabulary by its Greek equivalents. Further, if a new item of culture appears in writing in the two societies, it will tend to be for the same purpose; the common vocabulary thus tends to generate parallel literary genres.

Whatever the precise genre, the earliest texts in both societies are "poetic" in the sense that names of familiar things, including the common vocabulary, are used as metaphors of moral, emotional or religious notions. Actually this is intrinsic to the nature of language, while the "prose" ideal of unambiguous literal meanings for fully defined visible objects seems a difficult *tour de force*, late in development, for limited purposes. We then observe that items

5 E. Masson, *Recherches sur les plus anciens emprunts sémitiques en grec*, *Etudes et Commentaires* 67, 1967.

of the common vocabulary have parallel metaphorical uses, which cannot be explained as independently derived from the physical properties of the thing denoted by the word. Rather: commerce and social parallelism produced similar views of the moral, emotional and divine worlds in Israel and Hellas (with of course characteristic differences also); and this similarity extends to adoption of the same things, together with their names, as metaphors of intangible ideas.

It is quite possible that (say) Phoenician traders brought oral quasi-literary texts to Greece, as knowledge of the Akkadian epic *Enuma Eliš* had arrived by the fourth century BC. But even if that never happened, the new way of life built around their merchandise produced Hellenic texts analogous to Hebrew ones; to a more limited degree, especially in the sacrificial cult (Chapter 6), the reverse process went on. The lingua franca of commerce and diplomacy became in both societies the basis of a native literature. In this sense we may speak of actual connections between those literatures, since both societies felt literature to be the principal deposit of culture. The contrast often drawn between "Hebraic and Hellenic world-views" (Chapter 1) rests of course on a comparison; and in fact there is far more basis for a comparison of Israel and Hellas than of either with any Ancient Near Eastern society. And a scientific comparison of the two societies should begin where they are most comparable: namely, in the use that they make of the same units of symbolic discourse—actual words. My theme here and in the chapters that follow is that the similarities are more striking than the differences. In several examples we shall see the New Testament, the joint heir of the two cultures, weaving ravelled but parallel threads back together again.

In this chapter I take up eight words from the common vocabulary (together with some associated ones) which can be treated more in isolation than the items in the thematic chapters (especially 4-6) that follow, and whose cultural and metaphorical functions are especially striking. It might have been more correct in method, or more prudent, to confine myself to undisputed etymologies. But in order to stress parallels in genre and metaphor, I have included three items—the names of the ritual "sickle" (no. 2.5), the "brick" (2.6), and the griffin/cherub (2.7)—where the etymology is less certain but the contextual parallels are particularly beautiful. If the examples of undisputed etymology are thought to validate the method, perhaps in turn the method will buttress the speculative etymologies.

2.1 *The concubine*

Hebrew פִּילָגֶשׁ, פִּילָגֶשׁ, where LXX always παλλακή; normal παλλακή does not fit hexameter, hence Homeric παλλακίς; best Latin form *paelex*. The Latin is not a deformation of Greek via Etruscan,⁶ for it is a more exact parallel to the Hebrew stem *piylaḡš*; rather the Greek is aberrant. Somehow connected also are πάλλαξ "young man" and Παλλάς as title of Athena. Rabin⁷ urges that the Hebrew form reveals a perfect Indo-European structure with three elements: a prefix *pi-* "towards"; the root **legh* "lie"; and a final sibilant, either a nominative singular ending or a normal enlargement of the root. It is thus semantically parallel to ἄλοχος (*Iliad* 2.700) "woman with whom a man lies, wife." What Indo-European language could it come from? Levin⁸ assumes it to be Pelasgo-Philistine (see p. 170) and boldly proposes that Πελασγοί "Pelasgians" is a form of the same word. That will only work if both "Pelasgians" and "Philistines" were a derogatory name given by outsiders to the people, "those of other stock, improperly married," and then taken up by the people themselves in defiance as their own name for themselves.

In support of Levin, I note that two other words, apparently Pelasgo-Philistine, have Anatolian cognates which may be their ultimate source; then Pelasgo-Philistine would be a form of Hittite or Luvian. The words for "helmet," κύμβαχος and כִּבְיָ (p. 165 below), have a Hittite cognate *kupahi* "turban" or the like. τύραννος "tyrant" is apparently from a source like Hieroglyphic Luvian *tar-wa-na-s*⁹ "king" in an inscription of Carchemish. It perhaps corresponds to Etruscan *Turan ati* of Venus "Mother Turan";¹⁰ see the gloss δροῦνα as ἀρχή.¹¹ It is surely cognate to Philistine for "tyrant, king," כְּרִי פְּלִשְׁתִּים construct plural. At Jud 16,5 כְּרִי פְּלִשְׁתִּים "tyrants of the Philistines" the LXX "A" has σατράπαι, "B" ἄρχοντες, but Targ. Jon. רַבֵּי פְּלִשְׁתִּינֵי seems to have identified it with Greek τύραννοι. Greek * τύραννοι Πελασγῶν is unattested but quite possible.

6 So Frisk and Ernout-Meillet.

7 Chaim Rabin, "The Origin of the Hebrew Word *Pilegeš*," *Journal of Jewish Studies* 25 (1974) 353-364.

8 Saul Levin, "Hebrew {*pi(y)lēgeš*}, Greek παλλακή, Latin *paelex*: The Origin of Inter-marriage among the Early Indo-Europeans and Semites," *General Linguistics* 23 (1983) 191-197.

9 P. Meriggi, *Manuale di eteo geroglifico* II.1, *Incunabula Graeca* 14 (1967) 58.

10 M. Pallottino, *Testimonia Linguae Etruscae* (1954) no. 754 on a bronze mirror showing Venus and Adonis (*atunis*).

11 Pallottino *ibid.* no. 829, from Hesychius.

Amyntor the father of Phoenix abandoned his proper wife, Phoenix's mother, for a concubine; the mother induced Phoenix "to lie with the concubine instead, so that the girl might come to despise the old man" (*Iliad* 9.452):

παλλακίδι προμιγῆναι, ἴν' ἐχθήρειε γέροντα

His father curses him with childlessness; in a passage cited only by Plutarch ("9.458-461")¹² he thinks of killing his father; his kinsmen put him under house arrest.¹³ Although Homer personalizes the events, both Phoenix's reaction and his kinsmen's show that this is seen as a political offence; he is claiming his father's place. Likewise the mother acts politically: she loses political power as queen when Amyntor takes the girl, and proposes to regain it as queen-mother through the son.¹⁴ In a variation on the theme, Heracles on his funeral pyre insists that his son Hyllos by Deianeira (responsible by her error for killing him) should marry his concubine Iole: Sophocles *Trach.* 1224 προσθοῦ δάμαρτα "take her as your wife."¹⁵

When kingship faded at home, Hellenes got a lively example of Oriental concubinage in Persia. When a Darius asks for Aspasia the concubine of his father Artaxerxes II, τῷ βασιλεῖ παλλακευομένην (Plutarch *Artaxerxes* 26.3), it is a claim to the throne; for there was a law (*ibid.* 27.1) that "he who touches the king's concubine (παλλακῆς βασιλέως) is punished by death."¹⁶ Athenaeus (13.556B–557B) compares Homeric and Persian concubinage with extracts from lost works:

Among the Persians the true queen (ἡ βασίλεια) tolerates the mob of *pallakides* because the king rules his wife as despot; also¹⁷... they do obeisance to her. Priam has many women and Hecuba does not take it amiss.... But among the Hellenes the mother of Phoenix does not tolerate the concubine of Amyntor.... [Similarly Medea and Clytaemnestra are offended. He quotes from a lost work of Aristotle:¹⁸] "Nowhere in the *Iliad* does Homer have a *pallakis* sleep with Menelaus, although Homer assigns women to all the men.... It appears that the Spartan respects Helen as his wedded wife.... It is less likely that the crowd of women was given Agamemnon for use (εἰς χρῆσιν) than as a mark of respect (εἰς γέρας)."

-
- 12 Plutarch *de aud. poet.* 8 (= *Mor.* 26F); Plutarch states that Aristarchus rejected these verses, but, unlike most passages of which this is said, they do not appear in any of our MSS of Homer.
- 13 Hainsworth in the Cambridge *Iliad ad loc.* feels that Homer has the story wrong: "The motive attributed to Amyntor's wife, a demonstration of Phoenix' superior vigour, is probably misconceived...the effect of Phoenix' action would be to alienate the *geron* not the *pallakis*." He goes on to cite the Hebrew passages we discuss below.
- 14 Euripides in his popular *Phoenix* (Nauck p. 121) varied the plot considerably.
- 15 See Apollodorus 2.7.7 with Frazer's notes in the Loeb.
- 16 Darius' brother Ochus, who became Artaxerxes III, was supposed to have had relations with his father's concubine Atossa (Plutarch *Art.* 26.2).
- 17 Quoting Dinon's *Persika*, Jacoby FGH 690 F 27.
- 18 Aristotle frag. 144 ed. V. Rose (1886) 121.

Aristotle has grasped the honorific implications of concubinage.

The Hebrew Bible is even more explicit. It is taken for granted that Saul has concubines (II Sam 21,11), as well as David (II Sam 5,13), Solomon (I Reg 11,3) and Rehoboam (II Chron 11,21). When David is driven out by Absalom he leaves ten concubines to keep the house (II Sam 15,16); the irreversible act by which Absalom commits himself to rebellion is to "go in" to them ceremonially in public in the roof-tent (II Sam 16,22). Thereafter David cannot in self-respect take them back (II Sam 20,3).¹⁹

This explains the earlier situation when the succession to Saul is disputed and Ishbaal the royal claimant asks Saul's cousin Abner (I Sam 14,50) "Why have you gone in to my father's concubine [Rizpah]?" (II Sam 3,7):

מִדָּוִד צִדְדִּי לְפִי שֶׁלֹּאֵלֶּיךָ שָׁבָה

LXX τί ὅτι εἰσῆλθες πρὸς τὴν παλλακὴν τοῦ πατρός μου; Vg *quare ingressus es ad concubinam patris mei?* Abner does not trouble to deny it, and proposes to transfer the kingdom to David, no doubt with himself as power behind the throne; he meant his act to be so understood, and disingenuously pretends it is a "fault concerning a woman." Eventually when David becomes undisputed king it seems that he takes Saul's wives, although we only hear this when it is mentioned incidentally by Nathan (II Sam 12:8); I Sam 14,50 suggests that Ahinoam was Saul's only wife.²⁰

Again, Abishag is brought to the aged David but he is unable to have relations with her (I Reg 1,4); hence (it has been thought) Adonijah, his eldest living son, claims the kingship (I Reg 1,5) on the grounds that impotence is a disqualification. Upon David's death and Solomon's accession Adonijah is pardoned (I Reg 1,53), but still has the queen mother Bathsheba ask Solomon to give him Abishag. Solomon interprets this as a continuation of

19 The similarity in plot was seen by the anonymous Christian commentator on Aristotle's *Nicomachean Ethics* 5.9 (1134a11-28), *Commentaria in Arist. Graeca* 20.229.20, ed. G. Heylbut (1892): "Phoenix in Homer, persuaded by his mother, lies with his father's *pallakis* 'to anger the old man'; so also Absalom." The commentator has reinterpreted Homer's story as a plot against Amyntor from the beginning, to draw a closer parallel to the Hebrew.

20 Of Saul's wives only Ahinoam is known (I Sam 14,50), and some identify her with the Ahinoam whom David married early (I Sam 25,43); see J. D. Levenson & B. Halpern, "The Political Import of David's Marriages," *JBL* 99 (1980) 507-518, p. 513. If so, and if David's wife Michal (as it would then seem) was her daughter, Levin points out that Ahinoam's marriage to David was incestuous under the Mosaic law. And then her son Amnon in raping his half-sister Tamar was further extending the fault of his birth. Further, it cannot absolutely be excluded that (as Levenson & Halpern propose) David's wife Abigail (II Sam 3,3 etc.) was in fact his own sister (I Chron 2,16; II Sam 17,25); but more likely this is a case of variant traditions about one dimly-remembered woman.

his claim, "Ask for him the kingdom also" (I Reg 2,22), and tells Benaiah to execute him.

These situations are projected back to the early history. Reuben though firstborn is demoted (Gen 49,4) because "he went and 'laid' Bilhah his father's concubine (LXX παλλακῆς)" (Gen 35,22):

וַיִּלֶךְ רְאוּבֵן וַיִּשְׁכַּב אֶת בִּלְהָהּ פִּיִּלְגָם אִשְׁרָתוֹ

I use the American vulgarism "laid" here because תָּשַׁב is the sign of the accusative (making שָׁכַב transitive), not the preposition "with"; cf. Gen 34,2 "and [Shechem] laid [Dinah]," הִתְשַׁב אֶת־הָאִשָּׁה where the MT vowels are to be preferred to the LXX ἐκοιμήθη μετ' αὐτῆς.²¹

In all these situations, a man's act in taking his father's bedfellow, whether wife or "concubine," is seen as primarily political, a claim to his father's authority, and is rejected or accepted according to its political success. We may if we wish conjecture after Freud that in the prehistoric human horde, the normal mode of transferring power was for the strongest of a man's sons to kill him and take his wives. Phoenix, in the verses added by Plutarch, further thinks of killing his father with "sharp bronze" (*Iliad* 9.[458]):

τὸν μὲν ἐγὼ βούλευσα κατακτάμεν ὄξεϊ χαλκῷ

Absalom, who took his father David's concubines (II Sam 16,22), certainly gave David the impression that he was prepared to kill him (II Sam 16,11). Elsewhere in Greece the twin acts of taking your father's bedfellow and killing your father were seen in the Oedipus story as the utmost pollution.²² Oedipus in Corinth (though he does not yet understand Apollo's deviousness in driving him to Thebes where he will carry out the oracle) regards it as wholly unacceptable when the god tells him that he is fated to lie with his mother (Sophocles *Oed. Rex* 791)

ὥς μητρὶ μὲν χρεῖη με μιχθῆναι ...

-
- 21 The frequent Hebrew idiom "go in to" cited above combines the senses of entering the tent of a woman and entering her physically. So in Latin *ineo* is mostly used of male animals, but as a vulgarism by Antony as cited by Suetonius (*Div. Aug.* 69.2) *Quid te mutauit? Quod reginam in eo? Uxor mea est.* "What has changed you? The fact that I lie with the Queen [Cleopatra]? She is my wife." And he goes on to use the same construction of Augustus, *tu deinde solam Drusillam inis*, etc.
- 22 Saul Levin points out nearly comparable situations in the family of Moses. Levi was the father of Kohath the father of Amram; Amram married Jochebed his father Kohath's sister, and begat Moses (Ex 6,16-20). But further, the LXX of Num 26,59 says that Jochebed "bore these [i.e. Levi's sons?] to Levi in Egypt"; that is, according to the Greek, Levi got Kohath on his daughter, and Amram got Moses on Jochebed who was at once his aunt and grandmother. See Levin's "Jocasta and Moses' Mother Jochebed," *Teiresias Supplement* 2 (1979) 49-61, cf. p. 52; "Greek Occupational Terms with Semitic Counterparts," *LACUS Forum* 1 (1974) 246-263, cf. p. 247; "An Unattested 'Scribal Correction' in Numbers 26,59," *Biblica* 71 (1990) 27-28.

and become the murderer of the [true] father who begot him (vs 793)

φονεὺς δ' ἐσοίμην τοῦ φυτεύσαντος πατρός

Perhaps the motivation was as much an abhorrence of palace revolution as of incest and patricide. In the Christian church it becomes solely a sexual offence (I Kor 5,1) "such *porneia* as is not found even among the Gentiles, that one should have his father's wife," *τοιαύτη πορνεία ἥτις οὐδὲ ἐν τοῖς ἔθνεσιν, ὥστε γυναῖκά τινα τοῦ πατρός ἔχειν.*

Shown clearly by the Attic orators,²³ papyri²⁴ and Roman comedians²⁵ is the role of the *pallake* in classical life. Her tenuous status is illustrated at Andocides 1.20, where a man's *παλλακή*, tricked by another's wife, gives both the men poison, believing it a love potion; still she is "broken on the wheel and turned over to the executioner," *τῷ γὰρ δημοκοίνῳ τροχισθεισα παρεδόθη.* In early Rome the *paelex* is subject to taboo. Aulus Gellius 4.3.3, discussing the etymology of *paelex*, cites a "law of Numa," *paelex aedem Iunonis ne tangito; si tangit, Iunoni crinibus demissis agnum feminam caedito* "Let a concubine not touch the temple of Juno; if she touches, let her sacrifice a female lamb to Juno with her hair loosed."

Can we locate the source of this ideally clear cultural contact? Perhaps for Homer, Achilles' tutor Phoenix is associated with the other Phoenix (*Iliad* 14.321) father of Zeus' mistress, whom Herodotus 1.2.1 knows as the Phoenician princess Europa. Ovid calls her (*Met.* 3.258) the "Tyrian concubine" of Jupiter, *a Tyria...paelice*, a phrase which even in Greek or Latin would have been intelligible to Solomon with his "Sidonian women" (I Reg 11,1), *תִּיַרִי ... יַמִּי*, some of them no doubt concubines (vs 3 *פְּלִגְשִׁי*). When Odysseus wishes to invent a plausible history, he has himself born of an *ὄνητή* ... *παλλακίς* (*Od.* 14.202-3), a "purchased concubine," to godlike Castor in Crete; and later spends time in Phoenicia (*Od.* 14.288ff). When David leaves his concubines behind he is accompanied by *הַכְרִתִּי* (II Sam 15,18), which the LXX translates *Κρητες* "Cretans" elsewhere (Ez 25,16; Zeph 2,5) though not here. Around 1000 BC Philistines or Minoans could

-
- 23 Law quoted by Demosthenes 23.53: a man may kill with impunity one who lies with "any concubine he may have for begetting legitimate sons [free, but ineligible for citizenship]." Pseudo-Demosthenes 59.122 makes a famous distinction: "We have *hetaerai* for pleasure (*ἐταίρας ἡδονῆς ἕνεκ'*), concubines for the daily care of our body (*παλλακάς τῆς καθ' ἡμέραν θεραπείας τοῦ σώματος*), but wives to beget legitimate sons and to have a faithful guardian of our household." See p. 233 below.
- 24 Marriage contracts from Egypt regularly provide that the man shall take "neither concubine nor boy," *μηδὲ παλλακὴν μηδὲ παιδικόν*; *P. Teb.* 1.104.19 and frequently.
- 25 At Plautus *Cist.* 37 respectable women call the prostitutes their *paelices*; thus the *paelex* stands in a specially defined position over against the legal wife; similarly Ovid, *Met.* 10.347.

have brought the social institution and the name from Crete to northern Greece and to Canaan.

The earliest definable home of the concubine may be Anatolia. At Sardes, "the lion that the *pallake* of king Meles bore him" (Herodotus 1.84.3) should have been taken around the walls to render the city invulnerable. Anatolian texts give a god a concubine. Thus in a Greek dedication of the second or third century CE from Tralles to the local Zeus, called Larasios:²⁶

[ΑΓ]ΑΘΗ ΤΥΧΗ. Λ. ΑΥΡΗΛΙΑ ΑΙ[Μ]ΙΛΙΑ ΕΚ ΠΡΟΓΟΝΩΝ ΠΑΛΛΑΚΙΔΩΝ ΚΑΙ ΑΝΙΠΤΟΠΟΔΩΝ Θ[Υ]ΓΑΤΗΡ Λ. ΑΥΡ.Σ[Ε]ΚΟΥΝΔΟΥ ΣΗ[Ι]ΟΥ ΠΑΛΛΑΚΕΥΣΑΣΑ ΚΑΙ ΚΑΤΑ ΧΡΗΜΟΝ. ΔΠΙ.
 "Good Fortune. L. Aurelia Aemilia, from women ancestors who were concubines with unwashed feet,²⁷ the daughter of L. Aurelius Secundus Seius [dedicated this] after having served as concubine and in accordance with an oracle. To Zeus."²⁸ Strabo 12.3.36 describes ritual prostitution at Comana. At 17.1.46 he says that sacred prostitutes in Egypt were called *παλλάδας* by Hellenes; but the usage is unexampled, perhaps an error for *παλλακίδας*.

The data are consistent with the conjecture that the native home of the *pallakis* is Anatolia, where she appears in cult, and that her name is Hittite or Luvian, though so far unattested as such; that concubinage was taken up by Pelasgo-Philistines; and that it went from there to Hellas and Israel as an honorific institution, the key to royal succession.

2.2 Cassia: with notes on other spices

Hebrew *קַסְיָא* *qasīyāh*; *κασία*; Latin *casia*. Hebrews surely thought of *קַסְיָא* "scrape"; but the form is more likely folk-etymology of an Oriental word, original language unknown.²⁹

Our discussion of concubinage leads naturally to marriage and its ceremonies. In Sappho's epithalamium for Hector and Andromache,³⁰

μύρρα καὶ κασία λίβανός τ' ὄνεμείχλυτο

26 W. M. Ramsay in BCH 7 (1883) 276-7.

27 The prophetic "Selloi" of Dodona (*Iliad* 16.235) also had unwashed feet (same Greek) and slept on the ground; see the Cambridge *Iliad* ad loc. for parallels among the pagan Prussians.

28 L. Robert (*Etudes Anatoliennes*, 1937, p. 407) published a similar inscription from Tralles; in it Melitine calls herself a *παλλακή*, and says that her mother Pauline acted as *pallake* in two successive five-year festivals to Zeus.

29 See E. Masson, *Recherches* 48, and so for most of the spice-names treated here.

30 Sappho frag. 44 Lobel-Page, PLF p. 36.

"myrrh and cassia and frankincense (*libanos*) were mixed." All three nouns are Semitic borrowings, here first attested. "Cassia" is the name of Job's second daughter (Job 42,14). For myrrh see Excursus A; for libanos see Chapter 6 below. Perhaps the spices were smeared straight onto clothing or linens, not burned or in unguents as in later usage. Ps. 45 seems an "epithalamium" for a Tyrian princess; and of the bridegroom it is said, vs. 9:

מִרְיָאֵלֶיךָ וְאֵלֶיךָ כָּל־בְּגָדֶיךָ

"myrrh and aloes and cassia are [on] all your garments"; LXX σμύρνα καὶ στακτὴ καὶ κασία, Vg *murra et gutta et cassia*, Jer. iux. Hebr. *zmyrna et stacte et cassia*. (For the true identification of "aloes" see Excursus A.8.) The exotic imports and their use generate in both languages the same literary form: a wedding-song describing the festivities. We may imagine Sappho, as Herodotus (1.1.3) imagined Io, "coming down to the sea" (ἐλθεῖν ἐπὶ τὴν θάλασσαν) to learn from the patois of Levantine traders the names and properties of the new fragrances.

When Vergil speaks of Dawn as "leaving the saffron couch of Tithonus" (*Georg.* 1.447),

Tithoni croceum linquens Aurora cubile,

he has in mind Ἥως ... κροκόπεπλος (*Iliad* 8.1), "Dawn with her saffron peplos," which may mean "dyed saffron-yellow." But he also permits the ambiguity "fragrant with saffron unguent," i.e. a scented wedding-bed as in Prov 7,17 below; for cf. *Georg.* 1.56-57:

...Nonne uides, croceos ut Tmolus odores,
India mittit ebur, molles sua tura Sabaei?

"Don't you see how Tmolus exports saffron scents, India ivory, the effeminate Sabaeans their frankincense?" The poetry of exotic goods from distant lands finds nearly identical expression in Latin and Hebrew; see Chapter 6.8 below.

The other appearances of "aloes" locate two more Hebrew epithalamia. The harlot of Prov 7,17 sings a parody:

נִפְתִּי מִשְׁכְּבִי מִרְיָאֵלִים וְקַנְמֹן

"I have perfumed my bed with myrrh, aloes and cinnamon"; Vg *aspersi cubile meum myrrha et aloë et cinnamomo*. Greek ἀλόη first appears in Joh 19,39 μίγμα σμύρνης καὶ ἀλόης "a mixture of myrrh and aloes," Vg *mixturem murrae et aloes*. Cinnamon was seen from the beginning to be a loanword, "those sticks which we have learned from the Phoenicians to call κινάμωμον" (Herodotus 3.111.2). Aloys and cinnamon reappear in the fanciful "paradise" of the Hebrew epithalamium *par excellence*, Cant 4,13-14: "Henna with nard, nard and crocus; canna and cinnamon, with all trees of libanos; myrrh and aloes with all choice balsams." In Excursus A we discuss the date and source of this list, with paragraphs on the spices not here treated.

The product cassia was well known to the classical technical writers.³¹ The Egyptian spice-trade, documented in business papyri,³² supplied the dedications³³ or games³⁴ of the Seleucids. And above all the pageants of the Ptolemies:³⁵ Callixeinus of Rhodes describes the great pageant of Ptolemy II with camels carrying varying weights of six spices: libanos, myrrh, crocus, cassia, cinnamon and "iris" (ἴριδος), i.e. its bulb, the orris-root of commerce. The South Arabian suppliers concealed the fact that cassia and cinnamon came from elsewhere—i.e. Ceylon (Taprobane) or even further, the one contact of the ancient world with the land we have learned to call Viet Nam. Cassia in fact is *Cinnamomum cassia* Blume of the Laurel family, from China; cinnamon is *Cinnamomum macrophyllum* Mig. of southeast Asia.³⁶ And so there grew up a mythical exoticism whereby they were made to grow in nearer but still romantic parts, like Sheba or Syria, together with the frankincense and myrrh of the Ḥadhramaut and Somalia. (So *Macbeth* V.i "all the perfumes of Arabia will not sweeten this little hand.") This motif, which is poetry in Canticles, becomes a traveler's tale in Herodotus, who puts frankincense, cassia and cinnamon together in "Arabia" (3.107-112). His fabulous birds beget the Phoenix, beloved of Latin poets, which builds its nest of cassia, nard, cinnamon and myrrh (Ovid, *Met.* 15.398-9); see Dante, *Inferno* 24.111

E nardo e mirra son l'ultime fasce.

So a fragment of Melanippides (d. 413 BC) describes the Danaids hunting in Phoenicia:

ἱερόδακρυν λίβανον εὐώδεις φοίνικας κασίαν τε
πατεῦσαι τέρενα Σύρια σπέρματα

"trampling [with their chariot-wheels] sacred tears of frankincense, sweet-smelling dates, and cassia, soft Syrian seeds."³⁷

-
- 31 Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 9.5.1-3 etc.; Strabo 16.4.19, 25; Pliny 12.85-98, 13.11-18.
 32 See Papyri greci e latini, vi (1920) no. 628, cited in Chapter 4; also *P. Cairo Zenon* 59069.
 33 Dedication of Seleucus I to Apollo of Didyma, OGIS 214.59 = C. B. Welles, *Royal Correspondence...* (1934) no. 5.
 34 Under Antiochus IV, Athenaeus 5.195 = Polybius 30.26.
 35 Under Ptolemy Philadelphus: Athenaeus 5.201A = Callixeinus of Rhodes, Jacoby FGH 627 F 2.32.
 36 J. Innes Miller, *The Spice Trade of the Roman Empire, 29 B.C. to A.D. 641* (1969) 42-47.
 37 Athenaeus 14.561F = Page, PMG no. 757. So Euripides *Bacchae* 144-7 (cited Chapter 4 below) speaks of "Syrian libanos."

2.3 *The clothes-moth*

Hebrew **סוּ**, Old Aramaic **סו**; Greek **σῆς**. In so short a word the phonetics do not quite demand a connection as E. Masson notes,³⁸ but the contextual parallels surely do. Either original Semitic, cf. Akkadian *sāsu*, or pan-Mediterranean.

A fragment of Pindar³⁹ reads **Διὸς παῖς ὁ χρυσός · κείνον οὐ σῆς οὐδὲ κίς δάπτει**, "Gold is the child of Zeus; neither moth nor worm tear it." In Biblical Hebrew only at Isa 51,8:

כִּי כַבְגָּד יֹאכְלֵם עֵץ וְצִדְקָתִי לְעוֹלָם תְּהִיָּה
וְכֶצֶמֶר יֹאכְלֵם סֹס וְיִשְׁעֵתִי לְדוֹר דּוֹרִים

"For the worm⁴⁰ will eat them up like a garment, and the moth will eat them up like wool (LXX ὡς ἔρια βρωθήσεται ὑπὸ σητός); but my righteousness will be for ever, and my salvation to all generations." In a list of pests in the treaty-curse of Sfire (KAI 222 A.31) **וסס וקמל** "moth and flea"; and perhaps also at Ahiqar 184-6.⁴¹

A text comparing righteousness with gold makes the circle back to Pindar, Prov 8,19-20:

טוֹב פְּרִי מַחְרוֹץ וּמַפָּז וְתְבוּאָתִי מִכֶּסֶף גְּבָחַר
בְּאֶרֶץ חֶצְדָּקָה אֶהְלֶךְ בְּתוֹךְ נְתִיבוֹת מִשְׁפָּט

"My [Wisdom's] fruit is better than gold, even fine gold, and my yield than choice silver. I walk in the way of righteousness, among the paths of justice." Both the Greek name of gold and the thing came from Phoenicia, where **חרץ** (poetical in Hebrew) is the normal prose word; see Chapter 9 below. Here is an elegant *contrast* between Hellas and Israel: Pindar finds gold an adequate symbol of eternal value, while the Hebrew pushes beyond it; but both use the moth as the symbol of transience. We may even suspect Pindar of reproducing Semitic parallelism in his two names of the moth.

Isaiah shows that the wool-moth is meant, for **צֶמֶר** is specifically "wool," as coming from sheep (Ez 34,3). Likewise in Greek, Aristophanes *Lysistrata* 729-730:

οἴκοι γάρ ἐστιν ἔριά μου Μιλήσια
ὑπὸ τῶν σέων κατακοπτόμενα ...

38 Masson, *Recherches* 93.

39 Pindar frag. 209 Bowra² (1947); I omit the words that follow, apparently corrupt.

40 Heb. **שץ** is not uncommon, and usually translated **σῆς** by the LXX.

41 Cowley p. 218.

"At home I've got Milesian wool being chopped up by moths." Aristotle⁴² says that the σῆτες grow well in wool, especially when it is dry. Aristotle's own MSS became moth-eaten (Strabo 13.1.54). Perhaps the moth and its name came to Hellas with fancy imported wools, Milesian or purple Phoenician, which would be laid off over the hot summer.⁴³

Apparently the Pindar passage became proverbial, for the moth and gold reappear in the NT at James 5,2-3 τὰ ἱμάτια ὑμῶν σητόβρωτα γέγονεν, ὁ χρυσὸς ὑμῶν καὶ ὁ ἄργυρος κατίωται, "Your garments have been eaten by moths (Peshitto ܟܣܬ ܡܢ ܩܬܐܟܠܐ), your gold and silver have rusted"; James goes beyond Prov 8,19 in deprecating gold by making it tarnish. More normal experience with destructive agents is catalogued by Menander:⁴⁴

οἶον ὁ μὲν ἰὸς τὸν σίδηρον, ἄν σκοπῆς,
τὸ δ' ἱμάτιον οἱ σῆτες, ὁ δὲ θρίψ τὸ ξύλον

"As rust, if you observe, [eats] iron, moths a garment, the borer wood." James is also echoing a saying of Jesus in Matthew's form (Matt 6,19, ctr. Luk 12,33) "Lay not up for yourselves treasures on earth where moth and rust corrupt," μὴ θησαυρίζετε ὑμῖν θησαυροὺς ἐπὶ τῆς γῆς, ὅπου σὴς καὶ βρῶσις ἀφανίζει; for "moth" the Syriac again correctly has ܟܣܬ.

2.4 The pledge

Heb. עָרַב; ἀρραβών; Latin *arrabo, arrha*; all "deposit, hostage, pledge, first instalment, down payment, advance salary." An unquestioned Semitic loanword in Greek from the root עָרַב "he pledged";⁴⁵ evidently both practice and name spread by Phoenician banking.

The commercial fabric of Hellenistic life suggested that our relation to the cosmos is a long-term business transaction. Thus in the comic poet Antiphanes, fourth century BC:⁴⁶

ἡμεῖς δ' ἔχοντες ἀρραβῶνα τὴν τέχνην
τοῦ ζῆν, ἀεὶ πεινώμεν ἐπὶ ταῖς ἐλπίσιν

42 Aristotle, *Hist. Anim.* 5.32 (557b3ff).

43 Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 1.10.4, 9.11.11 does note plants which repel the moth.

44 Menander frag. 538, ed. A. Koerte pars 2, 2nd ed. (1959) 178.

45 See Masson, *Recherches* 30-32.

46 Antiphanes frag. 123 Kock ii.59 from the *Knapheus* ("The Dry-Cleaner").

"Although we have our trade as the pledge of our livelihood, we still go hungry living off hopes." Conversely the *arrabon* can be the token of what we fear. Thus Menander:⁴⁷

ὅταν ἐκ πονηροῦ πράγματος κέρδος λάβῃς
τοῦ δυστυχῆσαι μάλλον ἀρραβῶν' ἔχεις.

"When you make profit from an immoral transaction, in reality you are just holding the pledge of bad luck." So Pliny 29.21, complaining about doctors' fees, *ne avaritiam quidem arguam rapacesque nundinas pendentibus fatis et dolorum indicaturam ac mortis arram*: "Let me not mention their greed, their hungry trafficking when a life hangs in the balance, the price they set for [relieving] our pains, the pledge required against death." Ostensibly the genitive *mortis* reverses normal usage to show, not what the pledge guarantees, but what it wards off; ironically it suggests normal usage: the doctor's fee (Levin) is a deposit to make sure that we die, that we don't back out of our bargain with the doctor to submit to his treatment until it kills us. With these varieties of usage compare the great parable of Rabbi 'Aqiba (*Avoth* III.17):

הכל נתון בערבון ומצודה פרוסה על-כל-החיים החנית פתוחה והחונני מקיף והפנסק פתוח

"Everything is given [to man by God] as a deposit, and the net is cast over all living; the shop is open, the shopkeeper extends credit, the ledger (πίναξ) is open..." All we have is given only on loan, and we will be required to repay it to the lender with interest, namely, an account of our stewardship; the point of Jesus' parable of the talents, Matt 25,27 (cf. Luk 19,23) "You should have given my money to the bankers (τραπεζίταις), and on my return I would have gotten my own back with interest (σὺν τόκῳ)." τραπεζιτης is a beautiful item of the Roman lingua franca. Jesus is supposed to have said "Become approved moneychangers," γίνεσθε δόκιμοι τραπεζίται.⁴⁸ Plautus frequently refers to a *tarpezita* (e.g. *Curc.* 341). So in the Midrash (*Numbers Rabbah* IV.8) לטרפסיטיס של מדינה "to the banker of a province."

Before the time of reliable law, the best way of securing performance was to attach a man's seal—the equivalent of a passport or driver's license, the proof of his identity. Judah promises Tamar a kid (Gen 38,17-18); as pledge (ערבון, LXX ἀρραβῶνα, Vg *arrabonem*) she asks for his signet (התקד, LXX δακτύλιον, Vg *anulus*) plus "cord and staff." Here "signet" is an Egyptian word (*htm* Erman-Grapow 3,350); in a true patriarchal story it might have been a cylinder-seal on a cord. Later it becomes an engraved stone in a finger-ring, whence the LXX and Vulgate. In the opposite romantic situation (Plautus, *Miles Glor.* 957-960) the girl sends the man her ring (*anulus*) as

47 Menandri Sententiae, ed. S. Jaekel (1964) p. 108 lines 109-110; variant p. 94 lines 155-156.

48 Clement Alex. *Strom.* 1.28.177.2 (ed. Stählin-Früchtel, GCS 109.13); and frequently.

arrabonem amoris, "pledge of love," to show that she will redeem it by her person. Pliny 33.28 mentions for any kind of contract *consuetudo uolgi, ad sponsiones etiamnum anulo exiliente, tracta ab eo tempore quo nondum erat arra uelocior*, "the popular custom even today that when a contract is made a ring should be displayed, drawn from the time when this was still the most expeditious form of pledge." Thus the Tamar story was transparent to the maker of the Vulgate from normal Roman practice.

The varieties of commercial usage of the "pledge" constitute a guiding thread through business practices of antiquity. An Aramaic loan-contract of 456 BC from Elephantine for 4 shekels authorizes the creditor in case of default

למלקח לך כל ערבן זי תשכח לי בי זי לבנן

"to take off for yourself whatever security you find with me in my files ('house of tablets')." ⁴⁹ For the "tablets," לבנן, see 2.6 below; once such records were shelves of clay tablets, and the old name persisted, even though now they are papyrus rolls like this very contract. So in Plautus' Punic play *Poenulus* 1359 *Leno, arrabonem hoc pro mina mecum fero*, "Pimp, I carry this off as my security for the mina"; at *Rudens* 46 one contracts for a girl at 30 minas and gives an *arrabo*. The ἀρραβών is "down-payment" in the 4th century BC (Isaeus 8.23); "contractor's deposit or bond" in Greek Olbia of the Crimea about 230 BC; ⁵⁰ in numerous Greek papyri from Egypt as "advance on wages" ⁵¹ or "option". ⁵² It appears in the Latin agreement of a loan-partnership from Dacia of AD 167 to share gains arising from a (forfeited) deposit, *arre natum...lucrum*, ⁵³ as "bribe," since it commits the recipient to perform, even if illegally. ⁵⁴ Hebrew עֲרָבִים is the participle "mortgaging" (Neh 5,3), LXX [II Esdr 15,3] διεγγυῶμεν.

In a little Ugaritic document *ʿrbnm* may mean "hostages," perhaps the original sense; ⁵⁵ cf. הַתְּעָרְבוּת "sons of pledges, hostages" (II Reg 14,14), Vg *obsides*. In drama a girl can serve as hostage (*arrabo*) for a debt, Terence *Heaut.* 603. Hence a group of men can be a single pledge; an early historian ⁵⁶ has, *cum tantus arrabo penes Samnites populi Romani esset* "since the Roman

49 Cowley no. 10.9. Similarly *ibid.* no. 42.5; E. G. Kraeling, *The Brooklyn Museum Aramaic Papyri* (1953) no. 11.10.

50 SIG³ no. 495 B.132 (i.742).

51 For a horse-trainer, *P. Oxy.* i.140 (AD 550); a woman working in an oil-press, *P. Fay.* no. 91; a mouse-catcher, *P. Oxy.* ii.299; an orchestra, *P. Oxy.* v.1275.22.

52 U. Wilcken, *Urkunden der Ptolemäerzeit* i (1927) no. 67.

53 Waxed wooden tablet from the Dacian mines, *CIL* iii.2, p. 950 no. xiii.

54 Plutarch, *Galba* 17.

55 Gordon, *UT* 1161 = *KTU* 3.3.1.

56 Gellius 17.2.21 = *Quadrigrarius frag.* 20 ed. H. Peter, *Historicorum romanorum fragmenta*, 2 ed. (1914).

people had so great a pledge (600 hostages) on deposit with the Samnites." In a Latin epitaph (CIL 6.7193a) *NEC SVM PENSIONIBVS ARRA* means "I am no longer a hostage to boarding-houses," my goods or person seized for non-payment of rent.

Greeks may have understood the word's Phoenician origin. For a Phoenician inscription, perhaps of 96 BC, from the Piraeus (KAI 60.5) has the shorter word *לכנת גו ערב* "to designate the corporation as security"; does this lie behind Latin abbreviated *arra*? Thales (said to be "Phoenician" by Herodotus 1.170), foreseeing a good crop, got an option on all the olive presses by distributing pledges, *ἀρραβῶνας διαδοῦναι* (Aristotle, *Pol.* 1.4.5, 1259a12).

Both Roman and Talmudic lawyers wondered how small a down-payment made a contract. Gaius 3.139 said that agreement on price and *arra* without payment sufficed, *nam quod arrae nomine datur argumentum est emptionis et uenditionis contractae* "for the item stipulated as pledge is proof that an agreement of purchase and sale has been concluded." The rabbis were divided (Bab. Talm. *Baba Mesia* 48b):

אתאמר ערבון (רב אומר) כנגדו הוא קונה רב יוחנן אמר כנגדו כולו קונה

"Rab said, 'A deposit is thought to effect title only to the extent of its own value.' R. Yohanan said, 'It effects title to the whole purchase.'"

Aulus Gellius 17.2.21 says that in his time *arrabo* was felt to be a business word, *sordidus*.⁵⁷ We need not then ask whether it came to Paul from his Hellenistic, Roman or Jewish background. Thus II Kor 1,22 (cf. 5,5) ὁ καὶ σφραγισάμενος ἡμᾶς καὶ δοὺς τὸν ἀρραβῶνα τοῦ πνεύματος ἐν ταῖς καρδίαις ἡμῶν "[God] who sealed us and gave the pledge (Vg *pignus*, Pesh. *רהבונא*) of the Spirit in our hearts." We have the "seal of God," τὴν σφραγίδα τοῦ θεοῦ (Rev 9,4) marked on us as if on a document. Perhaps Paul realizes that as with Tamar, Plautus and Pliny the pledge *was* a seal.

Underlying Eph 1,13-14 is an elaborate legal metaphor, "you were *sealed* with the *promised* holy Spirit, which is the *pledge* of our *inheritance*, until it has been fully *redeemed* as your *possession*":

ἐσφραγίσθητε τῷ πνεύματι τῆς ἐπαγγελίας τῷ ἁγίῳ, ὃ ἐστὶν ἀρραβὼν τῆς κληρονομίας ἡμῶν, εἰς ἀπολύτρωσιν τῆς περιποιήσεως.

Vg *signati estis spiritu promissionis sancto, qui est pignus hereditatis nostrae in redemptionem acquisitionis*. Originally we were entitled to an *inheritance* (life with God), which we alienated (through sin). But long since we were *promised* a reversal of that mortgaging, which has now been concretely realized by the *pledge* of the Spirit *sealed* on our hearts; eventually but surely we will enter into full *possession* of our inheritance, through the

57 But Lucian, *Rhet. Praec.* 17 calls ἀρραβὼν normal over against rare προνόμιον.

redemption or *reconciliation* (carried out by Christ on our behalf) which reverses our alienation.

The Fathers on these passages suggest that *arrabo* points to the certainty⁵⁸ or greatness⁵⁹ of what is yet to come. Origen⁶⁰ interprets Eph 1,14 in line with contemporary commercial practice: "As in the case of those who buy something and give an *arrabo*, the *arrabo* is in proportion to the total sum of money involved....," κατὰ τὴν ἀναλογίαν τῆς ποσότητος τοῦ ὅλου ἀργυρίου.

2.5 The ritual sickle; Iapetus and Japheth

Greek ἄρπη whence Latin *harpē*. Heb. חַרֵב "sword," fem. with construct plural חַרְבֹת; Ugaritic *hrb*; Talmudic חַרְבָּה "knife." In secular use, ἄρπη is a sickle for grain (Hesiod *Opera* 573), and hence the name of many other sickle-shaped things (LSJ). Perhaps English *harp* (Venantius Fortunatus 7.8.63 *harpa*⁶¹) is a "sickle-shaped musical instrument." The Greek word has possible cousins like ἀρπάζω "snatch," and possible Indo-European parallels like Lithuanian *sirpe* "sickle." The Semitic nouns correspond to the root חרב "attack." But the mythological parallels come close to proving that on one side or the other there has been either folk-etymology or contamination with a foreign word.

Kronos castrates his father Ouranos, Hesiod *Theog.* 179-181:

... δεξιτερῇ δὲ πελώριον ἔλλαβεν ἄρπην,
μακρὴν καρχαρόδοντα, φίλου δ' ἀπὸ μήδεα πατρὸς
ἔσσυμένως ἤμησε ...

"in his right hand he grasped the giant long *harpē* with jagged teeth, and swiftly 'reaped' the genitals of his own father." The verb ἤμησε shows awareness of the normal farm use of the implement. But this one is special, made by Earth as "a great sickle of grey adamant," πολιοῦ ἀδάμαντος ... μέγα δρέπανον (*Theog.* 161-2). West⁶² cites many texts to show that Hesiod thought of Kronos' weapon as a "simple agricultural sickle"; such were "often toothed" and the "normal weapon in Greek mythology for amputation

58 Chrysostom, *de res. mort.* 8 on II Kor 5,5 (PG 50.431).

59 Theodoretus on II Kor 1,21f (PG 82.384-5).

60 J. A. F. Gregg, "The Commentary of Origen upon the Epistle to the Ephesians," *JTS* 3 (1902) 243.

61 PL 88.244.

62 West, *Theogony* on vs. 175.

of monsters." Thus Heracles killed the Lernaean hydra, the number of whose heads is variously reported, with a golden *harpē* (Euripides *Ion* 190-2), which Quintus Smyrnaeus 6.218 says was toothed, ἄρπη ὑπ' ἀγκυλόδοντι. Perseus decapitated Medusa with an adamant *harpē* (Apollodorus 2.4.2), which Aeschylus⁶³ says was made by Hephaestus. Strabo 14.2.7 says that Kronos' *harpē* was made by the metallurgical Telchines. In a Greek red-figured vase, Maenads are attacking Orpheus with (among other weapons) a semicircular toothed sickle.⁶⁴ On *Theog.* 161 West suggests that legendary "adamant" may be a "pre-Iron Age word for iron, coined at a time when iron was known only by rumour"; but the story was obviously archaic when Hesiod wrote.⁶⁵

Yahweh assaults a dragon with a weapon similarly described, Isa 27,1:

בַּיּוֹם הַהוּא יִפְקֹד יְהוָה בְּחַרְבוֹ הַקָּשָׁה וְהַגְדוֹלָה וְהַתְּזָקָה עַל לִיְיֹתָן נְהַשׁ בְּרַם וְעַל לִיְיֹתָן
נְהַשׁ עַקְלָתוֹן וְהַרְג אֶת-הַתַּנִּינִן אֲשֶׁר בַּיָּם

"In that day Yahweh with his hard and great and strong *hereb* will punish Leviathan the fleeing(?) serpent (LXX τὸν δράκοντα ὄφιν φεύγοντα), Leviathan the twisting serpent (τὸν δράκοντα ὄφιν σκολιόν)⁶⁶ and will slay the *tanniyn* in the sea." This agrees with Hesiod in its accumulation of three adjectives including "big" for the weapon, abnormal in both languages. The passage is proved of old Canaanite origin by two Ugaritic texts:

k tmḥš ltn bṭn brḥ tkly bṭn ḳltn šlyt d šbʿt rašm ... bʿl mrym špn⁶⁷

"If you smite Ltn (Leviathan?) the fleeing(?) serpent, destroy the twisting serpent, the powerful one of seven heads... Baal of the heights of Šaphon." Again,

l mḥšt mdd il ym l klt nhr il rbm l ištbn tnn ištbn [...] mḥšt bṭn ḳltn šlyt d šbʿt rašm⁶⁸

"[Anath speaking?] Did I not crush Yam [Sea] the beloved of El? Did I not destroy Rabbim the Flood of El? Did I not muzzle the Tannin? [...] I crushed the twisting serpent, the strong one of seven heads." Yahweh crushed the heads (number unspecified) of the Tanninim and of Leviathan, Ps 74,13-14; see p. 126 below. For the mountain Šaphon see Excursus B.

Homer (*Iliad* 2.783) knows how Zeus lashes the ground over Typhoeus the successor of the Titans εἰν Ἀρίμοις "among the Arimoi." Strabo 13.4.6

63 Aeschylus, *Phorkides frag.* 252 Nauck = frag. 262 Radt (TrGF iii.362).

64 Eduard Gerhard, *Auserlesene griechische Vasenbilder III* (1847) no. 156.

65 For all these battles with dragons see Joseph Fontenrose, *Python: A Study of Delphic Myth and its Origins* (1959, repr. 1974).

66 The LXX may have in mind the description of the constellation Draco as σκολιότο δράκοντος, Aratus 70.

67 Gordon UT 67.I.1-3, 10 = KTU 1.5.I.1-3, 10; translation in ANET³ 138b.

68 Gordon UT ʿnt III.35-39 = KTU 1.3.III.38-42; tr. ANET³ 137a 35-39.

seems to identify these as Aramaeans; but the Ἐρεμβοί (*Od.* 4.84 Ἐρεμβούς with many variants) in a list of known peoples and places (Cyprus, Phoenicia, Egyptians, Ethiopians, Sidonians, Eremboi, Libya) perfectly fit Biblical עַרְמִיָּה Gen 25,20 etc. ʿārammīy "Aramaean" in every respect including the final accent. Hesiod also among the Arimoi places Echidna and Typhaon (Τυφάονα, *Theog.* 304-306). I do not try to separate what appear forms of a single name: Τυφωεύς, Τυφώς, Τυφῶν, Τυφάων. A fragment of Pindar⁶⁹ says that Zeus destroyed fifty-headed Typhon among the Arimoi;⁷⁰ in another place (*Pyth.* 1.17) Pindar places him at the "Cilician cave,"

Τυφῶς ἑκατοντακάρανος· τόν ποτε

Κιλικίον θρέψεν πολυώνυμον ἄντρον.

"hundred-headed Typhos whom once the Cilician cave of many names nourished."⁷¹ Apollodorus 1.6.3 as often gives the most archaic account. Zeus pelted Typhon with thunderbolts, and at close quarters struck him down with a "sickle of adamant," ἀδάμαντίνη ... ἄρπη, inherited I suppose from his father Kronos (Hesiod *Theog.* 175-179 cited above)! Then as the monster fled, Zeus pursued him as far as Mount Kasios overlooking Syria. There Typhon took the sickle from him, severed the tendons (νεῦρα) of his hands and feet, and took Zeus and the sinews separately off to the Corycian cave of Cilicia, described in romantic detail by Frazer.⁷² This would have been the end of Zeus if Hermes and Aegipan had not stolen the sinews back and fitted them to Zeus; with his old strength he pursued Typhon as far as Mount Aetna of Sicily, under which the monster lies to this day. —But now the many-headed Typhon of Mount Kasios must be in close relationship to the many-headed Leviathan associated with Mount Saphon—the very same peak (Excursus B). And then it is too much for coincidence that Zeus in Apollodorus strikes the monster with his inherited *harpē* of adamant, while Yahweh in Isaiah strikes it with the *ḥereḇ*.

Hesiod shows that the *harpē* is suitable for castration, of which circumcision seems like a mitigation. Here the proper tools are the "flint knives" of Jos 5,2-3, תַּרְבּוֹת צִרְיִים, LXX μαχαίρας πετρίνας, Vg *cultros lapideos*; the Palaeolithic tool must be used for the archaic operation. So Zipporah circumcises Moses with a flint (Ex 4,25), רֶצֶף (LXX ψήφον, Vg *acutissimam petram*). Attis castrates himself with a sharp flint, *acuto...silice* (Catullus 63.5). In embalming, the body must be cut with the "sharp Ethiopian stone" (Herodotus

69 Pindar frag. 240 Bowra² (1947) = Strabo 13.4.6; Bowra prints only the conjecture "hundred-headed" (here rejected).

70 Hesiod *Theog.* 820-868 has Zeus destroy hundred-headed Typhoeus at an unspecified site.

71 The passage is closely imitated by Aeschylus *PV* 348-354; see Chapter 3 below.

72 J. G. Frazer, *Adonis Attis Osiris; The Golden Bough* 3rd ed. part 4 (1955) i.152-161.

2.86.4), presumably flint or obsidian; it is then filled with myrrh and cassia. Diodorus 1.91.4 adds that the stone tool is a cultic requirement, and that the cutter is the object of ritual abuse. Balsam is so nearly human that it cannot abide steel (*ferro laedi uitalia odit* Pliny 12.115) and must be cut with a stone; cf. Josephus *AJ* 14.54, Tacitus *Hist.* 5.6.

In the three main ancient languages the name of the human male procreative principle is derived from that of plants: זרע, σπέρμα, Latin *semen*. A god may assist. Thus I Sam 2,20 (cf. Ruth 4,12)

יְשֻׁם יְהוָה לָךְ זֶרַע מִן־הָאִשָּׁה הַזֹּאת

"May Yahweh give you seed from this woman." Pindar *Pyth.* 3.15 says that Koronis, while already "carrying the pure seed of the god (Apollo)," φέρουσα σπέρμα θεοῦ καθαρόν, lay with a mortal. (Lev 11,37 envisages "pure plant seed," טְהוֹר ... זֶרַע, LXX σπέρμα ... καθαρόν.) Livy 1.47.6 *ipsa regio semine orta* "(Tullia), born from royal seed." The "seed" then becomes "offspring" as in I Sam 2,20. One wishes to see it. Gen 48,11

הֲרָאָה אֶתִּי אֱלֹהִים גַּם אֶת־זֶרְעֶךָ

"God has let me see your seed also"; Sophocles *OR* 1077-8 τοῦμόν δ'ἐγώ/ ... σπέρμ' ἰδεῖν βουλῆσομαι "I wish to see my seed." Further, Cicero *Phil.* 4.13 *uirtus...quae propria est Romani generis et seminis* "the special virtue of the Roman race and seed."

The agreement is remarkable since the *semen* bears only a functional relation to plant seed, and in matrilineal societies the role of a particular male was hardly observable. But Onan in his act of *coitus interruptus* (Gen 38,9) spills his seed on the ground as if it were a sowing. Thus some connection could be seen between the harvesting of grain and castration or circumcision. Early in the Neolithic revolution it was discovered that some of the edible seed must be preserved to sow in the fields the next spring.

The earliest sickle could have been nothing but a semicircle of flints tied onto a wooden frame; elements of one such have been found in the Shanidar cave of the Zagros.⁷³ Harlan on the slopes of Karacadağ harvested wild einkorn (*Triticum boeoticum* v. *thaoudar*) with a sickle using flints from Jarmo in Iraq about 9,000 years old at the rate of 2 pounds of clean grain per hour.⁷⁴ Later the flints might have been replaced by the more precious obsidian, identified as the first trade-goods from centers in the Near East

73 J. Mellaart, *The Neolithic of the Near East* (1975) 73.

74 J. R. Harlan, "A Wild Wheat Harvest in Turkey," *Archaeology* 20 (1967) 197-201. His grain contained 23% crude protein as over against 14% for modern red winter wheat. He pounded it with an Osage Indian mortar and pestle, sifted it with an Ethiopian grass screen, and boiled it like rice with a few chunks of meat to make a "delectable pilau."

since the eighth millennium BC.⁷⁵ Then the Greek descriptions of the jagged *harpē* preserve the memory of the Neolithic tool with flints irregularly tied on.

Iapetus and Japheth. Homer (*Iliad* 8.479-481) knows as fellow-sufferer with Kronos in Tartarus only Iapetus (Ἰαπετός), elder brother of Kronos and a Titan (Hesiod, *Theog.* 134, 207). Vergil (*Georg.* 1.278-280) associates him with other rebels:

...tum partu Terra nefando
Coelumque Iapetumque creat saeuomque Typhoea
et coniuratos caelum rescindere fratres

"on this day Earth in a horrid labor brings forth Coeus, Iapetus, savage Typhoeus, and the brothers who swore to break into the sky." Later Latin poets⁷⁶ put Iapetus under Inarime in the bay of Naples, as Pindar puts Typhos under Aetna. Generally Iapetus stands for a very antique generation.⁷⁷

Now behind Genesis there seems to lie a story in which Noah's sons did more than see him naked: Gen 9,24 "When Noah awoke from his wine and knew what his young son⁷⁸ had done to him..." What can this have been but castrating him? The association of Iapetus with Kronos, and hence with the castration of Ouranos, suggests that he is the same figure as Japheth youngest son of Noah; here as often the pausal form יָפֶֿתֿ Gen 9,18 *Yōpēi* provides the best vowels. The connection was already seen by Milton, who (*Par. Lost* 4.716-7) calls Prometheus "the unwiser Son / of *Japhet* brought by Hermes." Three further points make the connection conclusive.⁷⁹

(a) Japheth is the father of Javan (Gen 10,2 יָפֶֿתֿ), *Yōwōn*, unquestionably the eponym of the Ionians in all Semitic languages. Milton again (*Par. Lost* 1.508) correctly identifies "Th' *Ionian* Gods, of *Javans* Issue held." Iapetus was the father of Prometheus,⁸⁰ the father of Deucalion, the father of Hellen, the father of Xouthos, the father of Ion.⁸¹ From Ἰάουεζ *Iliad* 13.685 we must surely presume an unattested *Ἰάϕων.

75 Colin Renfrew, "Obsidian and early cultural contact in the Near East," *Proceedings of the Prehistoric Society* n.s. 32 (1966) 30-72.

76 Statius *Theb.* 10.915; Silius 12.148.

77 Aristophanes *Nubes* 998 etc.

78 Which son? If the Hebrew means "youngest son" it should refer to Japheth (Gen 5,32); but the context clearly implies the second son Ham, or even Noah's grandson Canaan.

79 M. L. West on *Theogony* 134 notes these points but still holds back from identifying Iapetus and Japheth absolutely.

80 Hesiod, *Theog.* 507-510.

81 Apollodorus 1.7.2-3, cf. Herodotus 7.94. Doubtless the whole genealogy stood in Hesiod's *Catalogues*.

(b) Japheth is the son of Noah; Iapetus is the grandfather of Deucalion the survivor of the Flood. See Pindar's pun, *Olymp.* 9.45-46 κτισσάσθαι λίθινον γόνον· λαοὶ δ' ὀνύμασθεν, "they founded a stone race and were called people." A Semitic pun on *ben* "son" and *'ēben* "stone" underlies Matt 3,9 "God can from these stones raise up sons to Abraham." Ovid *Met.* 1.414 *inde genus durum sumus* "hence we are a hard race."

(c) Iapetus has Minoan and eastern connections. Anchiiale in Cilicia was founded by a daughter of Iapetus;⁸² Cretan myth knew him and the other Titans at Cnossus (Diodorus 5.66.3); there is a dedication from Imbros⁸³ to ΕΙΑΠΕΤΟΣ, Kronos, other Titans, and the "Great Gods" (ΘΕΟΙ ΜΕΓΑΛΟΙ).

2.6 The brick

Hebrew לְבֵנָה (LXX usually πλίνθος); Targumic Aramaic לבינתא *lābīyānā*; Ugaritic fem. pl. *lbnt*; πλίνθος. The proposed Indo-European cognate Eng. *flint* is far off in meaning, and Eng. *t* regularly corresponds to δ, not θ. Since both words apply to the bricks of Babylon (below) where in Herodotus' time the vernacular was Aramaic, the Greek can be derived from the attested Aramaic by metathesis of awkward *lb-* and assimilation to the old ending -ινθος.

Prometheus son of Iapetus invented sun-dried bricks; previously (Aeschylus, *PV* 450-1) κοῦτε πλινθυφεῖς / δόμους προσείλους ᾗσαν "they did not know houses made out of bricks and dried in the sun." Hellenes first saw such construction on a large scale in Babylon (Herodotus 1.179):

ἐπλίνθευον τὴν γῆν τὴν ἐκ τοῦ ὀρύγματος ἐκφερομένην, ἐλκύσαντες δὲ πλίνθους ἱκανὰς ὥπτησαν αὐτὰς ἐν καμίνοισι· μετὰ δὲ τέλματι χρεώμενοι ἀσφάλτω θερμῇ...

"They made into bricks the earth dug out of the moat, and when they had hauled up enough bricks they baked them in ovens; then using hot 'asphalt' for mortar..."

Gen 10,6-10 knows as builder of Babylon Nimrod, the grandson of Japheth's brother Ham, and hence so to speak a cousin of Prometheus once removed. The building is described at Gen 11,3

גִּלְגַּנָּה לְבָנִים וְנִשְׂרָפָה לְשִׂרְפָּה וְתָהִי לְהֵם הַלְּבָנָה לְאַבְנֵי הַחֲמֶר הִיא לְהֵם לְחֶמֶר

82 Stephanus 23 = Athenodorus, Jacoby FGH 746 F1.

83 IG 12.8.74.

"Let us make bricks and burn them thoroughly.' And the brick (Targum אבנת) served them for stone, and 'asphalt' for mortar." The LXX follows the vocabulary of Herodotus,

πλινθεύσομεν πλίνθους καὶ ὀπτήσωμεν αὐτὰς πυρί. καὶ ἐγένετο αὐτοῖς ἡ πλίνθος εἰς λίθον, καὶ ἄσφαλτος ἦν αὐτοῖς ὁ πηλός.

Both languages make a denominative verb out of the noun "brick."

There were gold bricks, πλίνθοι ... χρυσαῖ, at Ecbatana (Polybius 10.27.12).⁸⁴ At Ugarit *hrš nsb lbnt* "gold is turned into bricks";⁸⁵ Akkadian ideograms at Amarna 19.38 presumably yield *libnat hurāše*. Then the phrase *אָרִיחַ אַבְנֵי לְבַנֵּי was intelligible Hebrew; early trade brought the whole phrase into Greek.⁸⁶ Compare Ex 24,10 אֲרָזִים אֲבָנִים לְבָנִים "pavement of 'sapphire' [blue tile?]" with the transcription of the LXX πλίνθου σαπφείρου; here Hebrew comes nearest to calling the sky blue (p. 106 below).

Prometheus the inventor of the arts further resembles Japheth's generation. He first revealed bronze and iron like Tubal-Qain (Gen 4,22); among the sons of Japheth are another Tubal "the Tibarenian" (p. 175 below). Prometheus first domesticated animals (Aeschylus *PV* 462-6) like Tubal-Qain's half-brother Jabal. He first taught γραμμάτων ... συνθέσεις (*PV* 460), the "combining of letters"; the languages came into existence at Babel. Philo Byblius⁸⁷ attests a similar genealogy of inventors in Phoenicia; his Chousor (Χουσώρ) whose relatives invented bricks is Ugaritic Kṯr who, like the third little piggy, built his house of bricks, *bt lbnt*.⁸⁸

The general theme of the Babel story came early to Hellas as Otos and Ephialtes, Vergil's "sworn brothers," who "planned to set Ossa on Olympos, and trembling Pelion on Ossa, so that heaven might become accessible" (*Od.* 11.315-316). A later generation got the motif in its original Babylonian setting. In Aristophanes' *Aves* (551-552) the internationalist Birds plan to have a single city:

κάπειτα τὸν ἀέρα πάντα κύκλω καὶ πᾶν τοῦτ' ἰὸ μεταξὺ
περιτειχίζειν μεγάλαις πλίνθοις ὀπταῖς ὥσπερ Βαβυλωνῶνα
"and then to wall in all this air round about, and everything inside, with big
burned bricks just like Babylon." They declare a Holy War on Zeus and the
Olympians to prevent their cohabiting with mortal women (559-560):

84 "Half-bricks of refined gold" Herodotus 1.50; gold bricks at Sardes, *Anth. Pal.* 9.423; at Jerusalem, Eupolemos, Jacoby 723 F. 2.34.3.

85 Gordon UT 51.VI.34-35 = KTU 1.4.VI.34-35.

86 The "brick" on which Ezekiel (4,1) drew the map of Jerusalem must have been a clay tablet; likewise the supposed "brick stele" (ἐκ πλίνθου [στήλη]) of Josephus *AJ* 1.71. See p. 309 below.

87 Eusebius *Praep. Ev.* 1.10.11 = Jacoby FGH 790 F 2.10.11.

88 Gordon, UT 51.V.73 = KTU 1.4.V.11.

... ἐπιβάλλειν

σφραγίδ' αὐτοῖς ἐπὶ τὴν ψωλήν, ἵνα μὴ βινῶσ' ἔτ' ἐκείναις.

"to fasten a seal on their prepuce, so that they can no longer have relations with them." Kronos castrated Ouranos, and Zeus overcame Kronos; Typhon nearly overcame Zeus (above), and the dynasty of Zeus will be overthrown if he takes a wife whose son is destined to be greater than his father. Hesiod says this of Metis (*Theog.* 897), and Aeschylus' Prometheus (*PV* 910) knows that Kronos predicted another such, namely Thetis (Pindar *Isthm.* 8.36).⁸⁹ The Birds envisage a third shift in dynasty with Zeus being castrated or rendered impotent. Compare the "sons of the Elohim" (Gen 6,4) who went in to the daughters of men. Aristophanes parodies Herodotus on Babylon, but knows more than the historian taught him. He reverses the myth of Babel or of Otos and Ephialtes; this time it is the gods who are presumptuous, and the builders of the brick city are like Prometheus, merely doing mankind a service. The Birds do all the work of bringing mortar (πηλόν, *Aves* 1143), no "Egyptian brick-carrier" (vss 1133-4, Αἰγύπτιος/ πλινθοφόρος) is needed.

2.7 The griffin and cherub

The "griffin" is γρύψ (nom. sing. attested at Lucian *Nav.* 44, LCL vi.482), stem γρύπ-; the "cherub" is כְּרוּב, *kəruwḇ*. The stems are identical except for the shift of voicing between the stops. This could have been assisted in Greek by assimilation to γύψ "bird of prey" etc.; in Hebrew to רכב "ride," cf. Ps 18,11 עַל-כְּרוּב וַיֵּרֶכֶב "and he rode on a cherub." Old High German *krump* "crooked" is at best a possible Indo-European parallel to the Greek; Akkadian *kuribu* (CAD) is nowhere described, and could be borrowed from Canaan. Etymologists are divided;⁹⁰ it is the texts and monuments in which the creatures appear that constitute the decisive evidence for identification. Crowley has an excellent collection of griffins, mostly on seals.⁹¹ See further the survey of Bisi⁹² and the special analysis of de Vaux.⁹³

89 In the strange tale of *Hom. Hymn to Apollo* 3.339 Hera bears Typhaon, "as much greater [than Zeus] as Zeus than Kronos."

90 See the discussion in Lewy 11.

91 Janice L. Crowley, *The Aegean and the East: An Investigation into the Transference of Artistic Motifs between the Aegean, Egypt, and the Near East in the Bronze Age* (1989); text on griffins pp. 46-53, plates 109-132 (pp. 422-425). Some supplements in the review by P. M. Warren, *Classical Review* 41 (1991) 431-433.

92 Anna Maria Bisi, *Il Grifone...*, *Studi semitici* 13 (1965).

93 R. de Vaux, "Les chérubins et l'arche de l'alliance; les sphinx gardiens et les trônes divins dans l'ancien Orient," *Mélanges de l'Univ. Saint-Joseph* 37 (1960/1) 93-124.

An epic of one Aristeas, about 625 BC, told how the one-eyed Arimaspians robbed the "gold-guarding griffins," τοὺς χρυσοφύλακας γρύπας (Herodotus 4.13).⁹⁴

As when a Gryphon through the Wilderness
With winged course o'er Hill or moorland Dale,
Pursues the *Arimaspian*, who by stealth
Had from his wakeful custody purloined
The guarded Gold... (Milton, *Par. Lost* 2.943-7)

Aeschylus (*PV* 803-6), also drawing on Aristeas, has Prometheus warn Io:

ὄξυστόμους γὰρ Ζητὸς ἀκραγεῖς κύνας
γρύπας φύλαξαι, τὸν τε μουνῶπα στρατὸν
Ἄριμασπὸν ἰπποβάμον', οἳ χρυσόρρυτον
οἰκοῦσιν ἀμφὶ νᾶμα Πλούτωνος πόρου.

"Watch out for the sharp-beaked griffins, the savage dogs of Zeus; and the one-eyed Arimaspians, who live by the gold-flowing stream of the river Plouton." In this mythical geography, nearby lies the "Ethiopian river."

Gen 3,24: "And he settled to the east of the Garden of Eden the cherubim, and the flame of the turning sword, to *guard* the way of the tree of life." Prominent in Eden are rivers, one of which (Gen 2,13) flows past Kush (LXX "Ethiopia".) The author shares with Aeschylus the notion that the sources of the Nile are towards the East; his cherubim are guardians, and the object of their care might once have been a river in gold-bearing country. In the Tyrian parallel to the Eden story (Ez 28,13-16) the precious thing of Eden, the holy mountain of God, is jewels and gold; and the "king of Tyre" (the god Melqarth?) is expelled by the "guardian cherub," כְּרוּב הַסֶּכֶךְ (vs 16), *Vg cherub protegens*.

The ostensible setting in Aristeas is Scythia, where winged lions figure prominently in steppe-art; but Hellenes can hardly have first learned the word *gryps* there. The splendid bronze griffin protomai from Olympia go back to the eighth century BC, before Aristeas, and surely did not then have a different name. In particular a griffin is something you ride on; Apollo had a griffin chariot,⁹⁵ and Artemis rode on one (painting reported by Strabo 8.3.12).

We saw that Yahweh rides on the cherub or cherubim; he also sits on them, Ps 80.2 יֹשֵׁב הַכְּרוּבִים. This is explained by Ezekiel, who saw a sapphire throne (Ez 10,1) with wheels assigned to the four cherubim, and self-propelled. It may be shown on a mysterious Palestinian coin (labelled יהד "Judah" or

94 J. D. P. Bolton, *Aristeas of Proconnesus* (1962), thinks Aristeas made a real trip to Russia.

95 Claudian 28.30-31 (*VI Cons. Hon.*).

יהוה "Yahweh") of a god on a winged wheel.⁹⁶ Thus the cherubim serve both as guardians of the divinity and as means of his mobility. When sedentary the complex becomes a simple throne, and whether in Canaan or Hellas the creatures on the two sides are winged lions. Ahiram of Byblos on his sarcophagus sits on one;⁹⁷ the priest of Dionysus had a griffin throne in the theatre of Athens.⁹⁸ The throne-room of Cnossus has a griffin mural.⁹⁹ Hiram the bronzesmith of Tyre made ten four-wheeled lavers with a frieze of lions, oxen and cherubim (I Reg 7,27-39); almost the exact item comes from Enkomi on Cyprus, a bronze four-wheeled laver with a fretwork frieze of "griffins."¹⁰⁰

2.8 Jasper

Etymology undoubted, see E. Masson: יִשְׁפָּה, ἰασπις, and (from the Greek) Latin *iaspis*; also Akkadian¹⁰¹ and Hittite forms. The word is of unknown provenance, perhaps Hurrian or Urartian; it is uncertain what range of minerals it denoted.

It appears first in Greek in the myth of Plato's *Phaedo* (110D): our jewels down here, "sards and jasper and emeralds" (σάρδια τε καὶ ἰασπίδας καὶ σμαράγδους) are only rubble from the rocks and mountains of the true Earth. The twelve stones of the High Priest's breastplate (Ex 28,20; 39,13) are perhaps a demythologizing of the Tyrian version (Ez 28,13), where the "king of Tyre" is covered with nine jewels set in gold. Both lists include יִשְׁפָּה, סַפִּיר and בְּרֻקֶת (Ez בְּרֻקֶת), which the Vg translates by *iaspis*, *sapphyrus*,

96 C. Seltman, *Greek Coins*, 2nd ed. (1955) XXXII.1.

97 ANEP² no. 458.

98 The present throne is perhaps a late reproduction of a fourth-century BC original; see A. W. Pickard-Cambridge, *The Theatre of Dionysus in Athens* (1946) 143 and fig. 39.

99 Bisi (note 92 above) Tav. VII.

100 de Vaux, note 94 above, Plate I. Hephaestus, besides his robot golden girls and bellows (*Iliad* 18.417-20, 468-471), built twenty robot golden three-wheeled vehicles (373-379). E. Gubel (art. "Sphinx," DCP 422) distinguishes sphinx and griffin; but in thrones (art. "Trône," DCP 472, "Griffon" 196-7) I cannot tell them apart. Pausanias 1.24.6 defines γρύπας as "beasts like lions, with the wings and beak of an eagle." I wish this work were illustrated, so that I could say with Carroll, "If you don't know what a Gryphon is, look at the picture." Briquel-Chatonnet 360-362 discusses the cherubim of the Jerusalem temple; according to Malalas (CSHB 38.260.22), Vespasian set them up in Antioch at the city gate.

101 An item in Amarna 22.4.6 is of *ia-dš-pu*.

smaragdus.¹⁰² (For sapphire see p. 84 above.) The association of jasper with a better world is already found in an Assyrian commentary on the New Year ceremonies, AN-ú KI.TA.MEŠ NA₄ aš-pu-u, i.e. *šamû šaplûti ašpû*, "the lower heavens are of jasper."¹⁰³

Greek κύανος, "enamel" or "lapis lazuli," also has an Oriental name. In Homer it ornaments armor; Athena (Pindar *Ol.* 13.70) is κυάναιγίς "of the blue-enamelled aegis." Directly the word comes from Hittite *kuwana(n)* of uncertain meaning,¹⁰⁴ but Akkadian *uqnû* "lapis lazuli" and Ugaritic *iqnu* must be the same word; for the latter see¹⁰⁵ *bht thrm iqnim* "a palace of jewels of lapis lazuli." Now it has appeared in a Phoenician inscription from Byblos¹⁰⁶ in the phrase כִּנְקָא תַסְכַּח "tax(?) on lapis lazuli." For Linear B *ku-wa-no* see p. 304 below.

Origen observes:¹⁰⁷

I think that Plato took the idea of the stones which on earth are regarded as precious, which he says are an emanation from the stones in the better land, from the words written in Isaiah (54,12)¹⁰⁸ ...about the city of God, of which it is written, "I will set your battlements of jasper."

Since Phoenicia is the commercial phase of Palestine and Israel, Origen is very close; other features also in Plato suggest a Phoenician source. The colors of that earth are sea-purple (άλουργής) and limestone (γύψος *Phaedo* 110C), two Lebanese products.¹⁰⁹ Civilized humanity is that which lives "from the Pillars of Heracles (Chapter 3 below) to Phasis...living around the Sea like ants or frogs around a marsh." So Isa 40,22 (cited at p. 110 below) "who sits on the circle of the earth, and its inhabitants are as grasshoppers." Goethe may have had both Plato and Isaiah in mind when he has Mephisto say of humanity:

Wie eine der langbeinigen Zikaden...

In jeden Quark begräbt er seine Nase.

Thus Platonic idealism, whose timelessness is often contrasted with the historicism of Hebrew thought, has in part precisely the same source—Phoe-

102 The LXX of both passages is disordered but probably intends the same equivalences.

103 E. Ebeling, *Keilschrifttexte aus Assur religiösen Inhalts*, Heft 6 (1922); WVDOG 34.2; p. 253, no. 307 obverse line 33.

104 J. Friedrich, *Hethitisches Wörterbuch* (1952) 122.

105 Gordon, *UT* 51:V:96-97 = *KTU* 1.4.V.34-35.

106 I. Schiffmann, "Studien zur Interpretation der neuen phönizischen Inschrift aus Byblos (Byblos 13)," *Rivista di studi fenici* 4 (1976) 171-177.

107 *Contra Celsum* 7.30.

108 Here the LXX has ἰασπιν but the Hebrew יָסַפְדִּים.

109 Vergil (*Aen.* 4.261-2) has Dido give Aeneas a sword ornamented with "tawny jasper" (*iaspide fulua*) and a cloak of "Tyrian murex" (*Tyrio...murice*); two Phoenician exports.

nician luxury exports and myth—seen by each culture under congenial categories.

John of Patmos, looking back to Exodus and Isaiah 54, also saw Plato; for at Rev 4,3 he picks out precisely the three stones of the *Phaedo*: "And he that sat was like in appearance to a jasper and a sard (λίθῳ ἰάσπιδι καὶ σαρδίῳ); and a rainbow around the throne like an emerald (σμαραγδίνῳ)." The end of humanity in the city is seen under the same symbolism as its beginning in the Phoenician Eden. John describes both the city and its lord (like Ezekiel's prince) as bejewelled. Likewise the lover of Cant 5,13-14: "His lips are lilies dropping liquid myrrh (מִרְרָה עֹרֵר); his thighs are work of ivory encrusted with sapphires."¹¹⁰ Maecenas wrote to Horace a famous jeweller's catalogue:

Lucentes, mea uita, nec smaragdos
beryllos neque, Flacce mi, nitentes
nec percandida margarita quaero
nec quos Thynica lima perpoliuit
anulos neque iaspios lapillos.¹¹¹

"My life, I don't want luminous emeralds, nor, my Flaccus, shining beryls nor whitest pearls; nor rings polished by a Bithynian file, nor jasper stones." Augustus parodied the piece: *Vale, mi ebum Medulliae, ebur ex Etruria... Tiberinum margaritum, Cilniorum smaragde, iaspi Iguuinorum*;¹¹² "Goodby, my ebony of Medullia (Latium), Etruscan ivory...pearl from the Tiber(!), emerald of the Cilnii, jasper of the Iguvines..." Augustus and Maecenas are taking on the Oriental attributes which they had wrested from the Seleucids and were to contest with the divine figure of the Apocalypse.

A late Latin poet suitably summarizes our materials by combining the jasper city with the paradise of cassia, in an epithalamium describing Venus' palace on Cyprus. Claudian 10.90-96 (*Epithalamium de nuptiis Honorii Augusti*):

Beryllo paries et iaspide lubrica surgunt
limina despectusque solo calcatur achates.
In medio glaebis redolentibus area diues
praebet odoratos messes; hic mitis amomi
hic casiae matura seges, Panchaeaque turgent
cinnama, nec sicco frondescunt uimina costo,
tardaque sudanti prorepunt balsama riuo.

110 Augustus (Suetonius *Div. Aug.* 86) criticized Maecenas' poems as "myrrh-dripping curls," *myrobrechis ut ait concinnos*. As a Greek word μυροβρεχής appears only at III Makk 4,6.

111 Isidorus, *Etym.* 19.32.6.

112 Macrobius, *Sat.* 2.4.12.

"The wall rises of beryl, the smooth thresholds with *jasper*, agate is trodden underfoot unnoticed. In the middle a rich threshing-floor yields scented harvests in odorous fields; here is the ripe grain of soft amomum, here of *cassia*; Panchaeian cinnamon swells, withes are green with costus never sere, and sticky balsams flow out in a sweating stream." With Claudian as with his greater successors Dante and Milton we must assume knowledge of both classical and Biblical originals; their art presupposes the unity of Mediterranean culture.

Excursus A: The nine spices of Canticles

There is a large bibliography on spices in antiquity, now headed by the work of Faure, a classical scholar well acquainted with the plants of Crete, the bazaars of Damascus, and the perfume industry of France.¹ The identification and trade-routes of the spices in the Roman period are discussed by Miller.² The function of the spices within the Greek world is treated by Detienne.³ The great procession of Ptolemy II Philadelphus is now the subject of a whole book.⁴ Levin reviews Aphrodite as patroness of scents.⁵ He further ingeniously proposes to derive Homeric *véκταρ* from a Hebrew participle attested in the medieval period, נִקְטָר "that which is wafted up";⁶ but the Greek is attested earlier than other Semitic spice-names, and the Hebrew much later.

Cant 4,13-14 has nine names of flowers or spices, seven of which are (more or less) transliterated in the LXX, and all of which have a plausible counterpart in Greek. You might think it more probable that the twelve jewels of Ex 28,17-20 (= 39,10-13) would be accurately represented in a translation; but in fact only the sapphire and jasper (and emerald doubtfully) are so treated. We usually think of words phonetically transliterated from one language to another as "proper nouns," the names of persons, divinities, peoples and places; in modern English (though not in German) we distinguish them from other nouns by beginning them alone with a capital letter. But also, when we compare Hebrew with Greek, the names of some animals, vegetables, and minerals, fabrics and musical instruments, fall in that category; we may call them "quasi-proper" nouns. Each is seen as a distinct individual in its own right, not as a species or example of something else. Overwhelmingly the names of spices are such quasi-proper nouns. Perhaps ancient languages

1 Paul Faure, *Parfums et Aromates de l'Antiquité* (1987).

2 J. Innes Miller, *The Spice Trade of the Roman Empire, 29 B.C. to A.D. 641* (1969).

3 Marcel Detienne, *Les Jardins d'Adonis* (1972).

4 E. E. Rice, *The Grand Procession of Ptolemy Philadelphus* (1983); see Athenaeus 5.201Aff = Callixenus of Rhodes, Jacoby FGH 627 F 2.32.

5 Saul Levin, "The Perfumed Goddess," *Bucknell Review* 24 (1978) 49-59.

6 Saul Levin, "The etymology of *véκταρ*: exotic scents in early Greece," *Studi Micenei ed Egeo-Anatolici* 13 (1971) 31-50.

harked back to a time when another human being was recognized by smell rather than looks or voice, so that a particular spice seemed more like a person than any other type of object. Thus Faure (p. 284):

...je me demande si les grandes civilisations d'autrefois ne devaient pas leur unité au fait qu'elles parlaient le même langage parfumé, c'est-à-dire qu'elles avaient les mêmes goûts et jouissaient des mêmes odeurs.

Cant 4,13-14: "Henna with nard, nard and saffron, calamus and cinnamon, with all trees of frankincense, myrrh and aloes, with all chief spices" (RSV). Dropping the duplication of "nard," we have the following equivalences:

		Canticles 4,13-14			
Hebrew	LXX	Vulgate	Luther	KJV	
(1) כְּפָרִים	κύπροι	cypri	Zyperblumen	camphire	
(2) נָרְד	νάρδος	nardus	Narden	spikenard	
(3) כְּרוֹס	κρόκος	crocus	Safran	saffron	
(4) קָנָה	κάλαμος	fistula	Kalmus	calamus	
(5) קִינָמוֹם	κιννάμωμον	cinnamomum	Zimt	cinnamon	
(6) לְבוֹנָה	λιβάνου	Libani(!) ⁷	Weihrauch- sträucher	frankincense	
(7) מֵר	σμύρνα	murra	Myrrhe	myrrh	
(8) אֲלוֹהִים	άλωθ	aloe	Aloe	aloes	
(9) בְּשָׂמִים	μύρων	unguentis	Gewürze	spices	

A.1 Henna

ἡ κύπρος, since Theophrastus *de odor.* 27, is "henna," *Lawsonia inermis*, a native Mediterranean flower; also the red dye and perfumed unguent made from its petals. See Meleager of Gadara (*Anth. Pal.* 4.1.42) cited at p. 151 below. *P. Cairo Zenon* 59009⁸ κύπρου ἀλ[αβ...] "an al[abaster vase] of henna ointment." Josephus *BJ* 4.469 particularly notes it at Jericho. κύπρινον is henna-ointment, the best from Egypt (Athenaeus 15.688F). Earlier at Cant 1,14 "my love is a spray of henna to me," אֲשֶׁלֶּה כְּפָר, LXX accurately βότρυς τῆς κύπρου, Vg *botrys cypri*. At least in folk-etymology Cyprus (Κύπρος *Od.* 4.83) was named after it, as Rhodes (Ῥόδος) from the rose;

7 The LXX is ambiguous as between *libanos* the spice and *Libanos* the mountain; the Vulgate opts for the latter.

8 Fragment of the same papyrus in vol. iv Appendix.

and cf. further the names of other (island-) cities named for plants Βύβλος, Μάραθος.

A.2 *Nard*; see Chapter 4 below.

A.3 *Crocus*

The "saffron crocus," *Crocus sativus*, is ὁ κρόκος (*Iliad* 14.348 etc.); Aeschylus *Ag.* 239 κρόκου βαφάς "dyeings of crocus," i.e. the yellow dye from its stigmas; Theophrastus *de odor.* 27 κρόκινον "saffron-scented ointment." The κρόκου θυλάκιον ἐσφραγισ(μένον) α' "1 sealed wallet of saffron" left behind by Zeno at Hermopolis⁹ was probably saffron dye. The Latin adjective *croceus* serves for both perfume and dye; see my discussion in Chapter 2.2 above.

כַּרְכֹּם at Cant 4,14 is unique in the Hebrew Bible.¹⁰ Is the LXX correct in identifying it with the saffron crocus? The same word is used for the 8th of the 13 ingredients of the Temple incense (Bab. Talm. *Kereth.* 6a כַּרְכֹּם), cited Chapter 4 below. Surely the same also is the Old South Arabian incense-altar for *kmkm*.¹¹ But are the anthers or any other part of the crocus a suitable ingredient for incense? Phonetically the Hebrew is closer to Sanskrit *kurkuma*, thought a name of "turmeric," *Curcuma domestica* Valetton, the root of an Oriental herb of the ginger family, now wholly domesticated, which like the crocus produces both a yellow dye and a fragrance (Miller 62-64). Akkadian *kurkanu*, a medicinal plant listed among aromatics, may well be the same (but the CAD hesitates). It cannot be coincidence that the saffron crocus and turmeric, both scented plants producing yellow dye, have similar names. This suggests three conclusions:

(a) Turmeric was Sanskrit *kurkuma* and Akkadian *kurkanu*, and probably the ingredient of the Temple incense called כַּרְכֹּם, but otherwise not well known in the West.

(b) The Mediterranean saffron crocus was named κρόκος, perhaps in Lydia, perhaps with an adaptation of the name of turmeric, which in its properties it resembled.

(c) Hebrew כַּרְכֹּם was extended to include the more familiar saffron crocus already at Cant 4,14, where its parallel henna was known not merely as a scent but also as a flower.

9 *P. Cairo Zenon* 59069 = Loeb Select Papyri i.181.

10 The variant כַּרְכֹּס of KB³ seems late and reflecting the Greek nominative.

11 CIS 4.3.682.

A.4 Reed

The nominative *κάννυα is not citable but probable in view of the genitive κάννης;¹² cf. Latin *canna* Ovid *Ars. Am.* 1.554. Its derivatives are earlier attested: κανόν *Iliad* 23.761 "weaver's rod"; κάνεον 11.630 "woven basket." Surely equivalent to Akkadian *qanû* "reed, rod"; Hebrew קִנְיָה Isa 19,6, Ez 40,3 קִנְיָה הַמִּדְּבָר "rod for measuring"; Ugaritic *qnm*¹³ "reeds for arrows." Thus both the plant and its principal use as a measuring-rod have parallel names in Greek and Semitic.

The use of a type of reed as aromatic is not very early. Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 9.7.1 describes the aromatic κάλαμος (along with another aromatic σχοῖνος "rush") east of Lebanon, in a marsh now drained. Polybius 5.45.10 confirms the location.¹⁴ Hort in the Loeb Theophrastus identifies the calamus as the arum *Acorus* "sweetflag," but this does not appear in Post's flora of Lebanon.¹⁵ In any case it might have been the product used in the Temple as Ex 30,23 קִנְיָה־בְּשֵׁם, LXX καλάμου εὐώδους (cf. Jer 6,20).

If the original meaning of the various forms of the word in Greek were simply the plant "reed," we might think it a Mediterranean substrate word, since there would be no reason to import a Semitic name for a native plant. But more likely, the original meaning was as "measuring-rod," and this could well have been a "Semitic loan-word in Greek," perhaps along with some actual standard of length.

A.5 Cinnamon

is discussed in the text above. Miller 153-172 discusses the "cinnamon route" by which the precious substances were carried in outriggers by monsoon winds from India to Madagascar, quoting Pliny 12.87-88 as derived from an excellent source. Rabin¹⁶ points out that many of the spices of Canticles and their names passed through India, and that Tamil poetry has erotic imagery derived from wooded mountains; he concludes that Canticles was written by

12 Cratinus frag. 197, Kock i.73.

13 Gordon UT 2 Aqht VI. 23 = KTU 1.17.VI.23; translation ANET³ 151b. The reeds make arrows to go with the famous composite bow for 'Anath.

14 See the discussion of the site in R. Dussaud, *Topographie historique de la Syrie ancienne et médiévale* (1927) 401; Strabo 16.2.16 erroneously locates the aromatics at Γεννησαρίτις, the Sea of Galilee.

15 George E. Post, *Flora of Syria, Palestine, and Sinai*; 2nd ed., 1933.

16 Chaim Rabin, "The Song of Songs and Tamil poetry," *Studies in Religion* 3 (1973/4) 205-219. See the elaborate work of Abraham Mariaselvam, *The Song of Songs and ancient Tamil love poems: Poetry and symbolism*; *Analecta Biblica* 118; 1988.

one in the time of Solomon who had heard of such poetry. But Brenner,¹⁷ although she does not wholly deny the possibility of such a connection, vindicates the usual date of the poem in the Persian period. To my mind the appearance of "paradise" (Cant 4,13) in the poem seems conclusive for a Persian date.¹⁸

A.6 Libanos

For this spice see Chapter 6 below. The LXX of Cant 4,14 λιβάνου correctly intends the spice rather than the mountain Lebanon, since their names differ in Hebrew. The Vulgate (looking only at the Greek) incorrectly opts for the mountain.

A.7 Myrrh

Aeolic μύρρα in Sappho, cited chapter 2.2 above, and so Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 7.6.3. The gum of *Commiphora* (*Balsamodendron*) *Myrrha* Engl. from NE Africa; see Miller 104-105. The word mostly appears in Greek as Ionic μύρρα (Herodotus 3.107.1) or Attic μύρρα Theophrastus 4.4.14. Latin *murra* or *myrr(h)a*, but Lucretius 2.504 *smyrna*. Frequently ζμ- in papyri, e.g.¹⁹ ζμύρρα μιν(α) ε' "5 minas of myrrh." Certainly Greeks felt a folk-etymology with the city Smyrna, Σμύρνη (Herodotus 1.149.1): an arbitrary one since the city does not appear as the source of the fragrance even by transshipment.

The Greek is from some such Oriental form as Hebrew מִרְרָה, Ex 30,23 מִרְרָה construct; cf. Akkadian *murru*. The Greek ending could be from Aramaic מורא (Targum Ex 30,23). The apparent Hebrew meaning "bitter" may be only a folk-etymology to מרר. Ugaritic²⁰ *šmn mr* = Hebrew Esth 2,12 מִרְרָה הַמִּרְרָה. Among the gifts of the Magi were μύρρα Matt 2,11 (Syriac מורא). Jesus "the Anointed one" was in fact three times anointed with named spices or given them: by the Magi with libanos and myrrh; by a woman with nard (Mark 14,3; John 12,3 [cf. Chapter 4.8]); by Joseph of Arimathea with myrrh and aloes (John 19,39).

17 Athalya Brenner, "Aromatics and perfumes in the Song of Songs," JSOT 25 (1983) 75-81.

18 See my discussion of "paradise" in "Prometheus, the Servant of Yahweh, Jesus: Legitimation and Repression in the Heritage of Persian Imperialism," pp. 109-125, 317-325 of David Jobling et alii (eds.), *The Bible and the Politics of Exegesis* [Norman Gottwald Festschrift], 1991; esp. pp. 118-119.

19 *Papiri greci e latini* 6 (1920) no. 628.

20 Gordon UT 12,2 = KTU 4.14.2.

The status of the similar noun μύρον "unguent" is problematical.²¹ Athenaeus 15.688C thought it the source of μύρρα. Frisk thinks it possibly Indo-European in view of Old High German *smero* "smear." But any initial s- in Greek is uncertain. It is perhaps preferable to take μύρον as an earlier borrowing in a less specific sense from the same source as μύρρα; perfumed ointments are coming into Homer (*Iliad* 14.171, *Od.* 18.192) but with no loan-vocabulary.

A.8 Aloes

While the Vulgate makes a plausible identification of תִּלְהַטָּ in Canticles as the Mediterranean herb *Aloe*, its true nature is uncertain. Dioscurides 1.22 attests ἀγάλοχον a bitter aromatic wood, probably *Aquilaria* of India and China (Miller 34-36). His detailed description makes plausible the etymology from Prakrit and Tamil *aghil*. Dioscurides distinguishes it from ἀλόη the herb bitter "aloes" (*Aloe*) and its sap, specified as bitter by Juvenal 6.181. Probably the Mediterranean herb rather than the imported wood is intended by ἀλόης Joh 19,39 mixed with myrrh for embalming. The aromatic substance תִּלְהַטָּ of Cant 4,14 appears at Prov 7,17 as מִלְהַטָּ (cf Ps 45,9 cited at p. 71 above). The phonetic agreement of the Hebrew with the Sanskrit supports the identification of the Biblical fragrance with the wood *Aquilaria* rather than the Mediterranean herb *Aloe*.

A.9 Balsam

Greek βάλαμον is *Commiphora opobalsamum* Engl., of the same family as frankincense (*Boswellia*) and myrrh (*Commiphora myrrha*). Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 9.6.1 locates βάλαμον in the "paradises" of Syria, by which here he means not the royal forest-preserves (as for the cedar at 5.8.1, the usage of מִלְהַטָּ Neh 2,8), but small cultivated gardens (as at Koh 2,5); probably in fact the plantation at Jericho, attested by Josephus *BJ* 1.138 (cf. Diodorus 19.98). How did it get there, since (Miller 101-102) it is native to southern Arabia? Miller thinks by tradition the gardens at Jericho and Jerusalem "were originally planted with seedlings brought to King Solomon by the Queen of Sheba." In fact she does come bringing מִלְהַטָּ I Reg 10,2. Often in the Hebrew Bible this seems to be "spices" in general, but perhaps occasionally "balsam" specifically. Evidently at some point seedlings were brought from Arabia to the "paradises" of Jericho and Jerusalem. But since Jericho nowhere

21 First attested in Archilochus frag. 205 West IEG.

appears in the Hebrew Bible as a city of spices, it seems likely that the importation came at a later date than that of Solomon.

The phonetic agreement between βάλαμον and 𐤁𐤒𐤁, seemingly loose, becomes near-perfect under the persuasive theory of Steiner.²² He holds that in Proto-Semitic, and to some degree later, the sounds ض (d) and ش (š)—corresponding respectively to Hebrew ז (š) and ש (š)—had a "lateral" or l-component. They are pronounced so in the modern South Arabian languages of Dhofar. Thus Arabic *q* still had a "lateral" component when the Spanish loanword *alcalde* "judge" was taken from اَلْقَاضِي *al-qāḏī* (attested as a participle at Quran 20.72). Steiner discusses the "balsam" words in detail at pp. 123-129.

The correspondence is strengthened by its reappearance in the name of the "Chaldaeans" (Steiner pp. 137-143). Besides its application to a northern people irrelevant for our purpose here,²³ Χαλδαῖοι is applied by Herodotus 1.181.5 to the priests of Zeus Belos at Babylon. This name plainly corresponds to the Kaldū (RLA v.291-297) of southern Babylonia that took the throne of Babylon after the fall of Assyria and founded the so-called "Chaldaeian dynasty" including Nebuchadrezzar. Berossus was known as one such (Josephus *AJ* 1.129). They were known to the West as astrologers, so Philo *de mut. nom.* 16 (LCL v.150) ἐχαλδάϊζε "he talked astrology." In Rome they gave their name to the profession of astrology, Lucretius 5.727 *Babylonica Chaldaeum doctrina* "the Babylonian teaching of the Chaldaeans." The same people appear in Hebrew with *sin* for the l-sound, 𐤎𐤒𐤁 since Gen 11,28 where LXX Χαλδαῖοι. Thus at II Reg 25,5 Nebuchadrezzar's army is 𐤎𐤒𐤁-ל-יְהוּ, Vg. *exercitus Chaldaeorum*.²⁴

-
- 22 Richard C. Steiner, *The Case for Fricative-Laterals in Proto-Semitic*; *American Oriental Series* 59; 1977.
- 23 Xenophon (*Anab.* 4.34.1) knows a northern people Χαλδαῖοι who appear with Armenians as mercenaries; Strato puts them in the Black Sea area. Stephanus 681 cites as a place in Armenia Χαλδίην with ethnic Χάλδοι. These must be the Ḫaldū of the Akkadian texts, and therefore unrelated to the Kaldū of the south; they left extensive cuneiform inscriptions in a non-Semitic, non-IE language.
- 24 Since the trade and diplomatic language of Chaldaeian Babylon was Aramaic, "Chaldaeian" was used to designate Aramaic, which older grammars used to call "Chaldee." Thus at Dan 2,4 the 𐤎𐤒𐤁 (LXX Χαλδαῖοι) speak in Aramaic, יִתְמַרְגָּ. At Dan 2,26 the LXX explain Daniel's other (Akkadian) name Belteshazzar as Χαλδαῖοῦ. Philo (*Leg. ad Gaium* 4, LCL x.4) designates the name "Israel" as Χαλδαῖοῦ, by which he may mean Hebrew-Aramaic without distinction, as opposed to Ἑλληνιστί "Greek." Athenaeus 12 529F-530A in an alternate account of the monument of "Sardanapallus" describes its inscription as in "Chaldaeian letters," Χαλδαῖοῦ γράμμασιν (pp. 324-325 below). Since in another account he quotes they are "Assyrian," both adjectives must mean Aramaic.

Excursus B: The god of Kasios and his adversary¹

Greeks knew two places called Mount Kasios, each with a cult of Zeus: one in Syria, the *Jebel Aqraf*, just south of the Orontes mouth; one (no more than a sand-dune) in eastern Egypt between Pelusium and Rhinocolura, where Pompey died and was buried. Semitic (and some Egyptian) texts attach to each place a divinity Baal-Saphon (בַּעַל צַפּוֹן). Although the Egyptian Kasios is earlier attested in Greek (by Herodotus) than the Syrian, two features indicate that the Syrian site is the original: it really is a mountain, and the divinity's name is Canaanite. The Tyrians made Baal-Saphon a god of storm at sea; Greeks made Zeus Kasios (from whichever site) protector of sailors from storm, as Hebrews did Yahweh. At each site Greeks regarded a figure called Typhon or the like as the god's adversary: at the Syrian site the dragon Typhon (in the variant forms of his name), successor to the Titans, whose home is Cilicia, defeated by Zeus; at the Egyptian site the demon Typhon otherwise called Seth, murderer of Osiris.

At each site Canaanites placed a victory of the high God over the watery powers of chaos: at the Syrian site a victory over the primeval sea; at the Egyptian site the triumph of the Exodus. Thus the twin cults mediated

1 Summary of materials in large part already treated by others. See above all Otto Eissfeldt, *Baal Zaphon, Zeus Kasios und der Durchzug der Israeliten durchs Meer* (1932). Further: W. F. Albright, "Baal-Zephon," pp. 1-14 of *Festschrift Alfred Bertholet* (ed. W. Baumgartner et alii, 1950); Pierre Chuvin & Jean Yoyotte, "Documents relatifs au culte pélusien de Zeus Casios," *Revue archéologique* 1986, 41-63; Wolfgang Fauth, "Das Kasion-Gebirge und Zeus Kasios: Die antike Tradition und ihre vorderorientalischen Grundlagen," *Ugarit-Forschungen* 22 (1990) 105-118; J. de Savignac, "Le sens du terme Şaphôn," *Ugarit-Forschungen* 16 (1984) 273-278; Francis Vian, "Le mythe de Typhée et le problème de ses origines orientales," pp. 17-37 of *Éléments orientaux dans la religion grecque ancienne: Colloque de Strasbourg* 22-24 mai 1958 (1960); Joseph Fontenrose, "Python: A Study of Delphic Myth and its Origins (1959/1974); Alain Ballabriga, "Le dernier adversaire de Zeus: le mythe de Typhon dans l'épopée grecque archaïque," *RHR* 207 (1990) 3-30.—These pages had gone to press when I saw C. Bonnet, "Typhon et Baal Şaphon," pp. 101-143 of E. Lipiński (ed.) *Phoenicia and the East Mediterranean in the First Millennium B.C.*; *Studia Phoenicia* 5; *Orientalia Lovaniensia analecta* 22 (1987); and Klaus Koch, "Ḥazzi-Safôn-Kasion: Die Geschichte eines Berges und seiner Gottheiten," *OBO* 129, 171-223.

between Canaan and Hellas (by all indications *from Canaan to Hellas*) the foundation myth of both societies: the vindication of the high God of order through his overcoming the forces of disorder. Hebrews historicized the myth at several points: at the original creative act (in its mythical version); at Noah's Flood; at the crossing of the Red Sea; at the return from Exile. Greeks kept it as a myth of how Zeus' kingship was confirmed (with an echo in Deucalion's Flood), until in Hellenistic Egypt they stumbled on a cultic version in the conflict of Osiris and Seth. In both societies the chaotic Sea seems to have features retained in folk-memory from the volcanic wave or tsunami of Thera about 1600 BC. It is possible that Typhon in his various forms continues the name of Saphon; and probable (Chapter 2.5 above) that the "sickle" or "sword" with which the high God kills his opponent has a common name.

It is only accidental that the Syrian mountain Kasios appears late in the full light of Greek history. Pliny 5.80 records the often-repeated story that on its summit the sun could be seen rising in the fourth watch of the night while the earth below remained in darkness. (Although only 1780 m. high, Jebel Aqra^c rises steeply straight from the sea.) Strabo 16.2.5 says that the men of Antioch honor Triptolemus as a hero and "celebrate a festival (ἄγουσιν ἑορτήν) on mount Kasios near Seleucia"; also that Seleucus Nicator I (312-281 BC) had settled the "descendants of Triptolemus" in Antioch, and probably the cult of Zeus Kasios came early in the Seleucid period (replacing no doubt an indigenous cult). Malalas² says in fact that Nicator discovered where to build Seleucia by sacrificing on mount Kasios; an eagle bore the offering to the destined site. Zeus Kasios appears on the coins of Seleucia.³ Trajan offered there in AD 113 an item from his victory over the Getae: the horn of a wild bull (*urus*) set in gold.⁴ Hadrian composed verses for Trajan's dedication (*Anth. Pal.* 6.332, cited p. 193 below), and himself about AD 129 went up there to see the early sunrise; when he sacrificed, a storm came up, and lightning struck victim and officiant.⁵ The emperor Julian also sacrificed to Jupiter there in AD 363 (Ammianus 22.14.4).⁶

Herodotus 2.158.4 (cf. 2.6.1) makes the Egyptian "Mount" Kasios the boundary between Egypt and Syria. Titus with his army passed by in AD 69

2 Malalas 8, CSHB 38.199.5.

3 W. Wroth, *Catalogue of the Greek Coins of Galatia, Cappadocia, and Syria* [in the British Museum] (1899) lxxii.

4 Suda 3.39, no. 454 Adler. (But the text provides no information going beyond Hadrian's verses.)

5 Script. Hist. Aug. *Hadrianus* 14.3; Dio 69.2.1 sets the same story at Antioch.

6 And see Julian *Misopogon* 361D.

(Josephus *BJ* 4.661). Strabo 16.2.33 says that "the Kasion is a sandy hill without water forming a promontory, where the body of Pompeius Magnus lies and there is a temple of Zeus Kasios":

ἔστι δὲ τὸ Κάσιον θινώδης τις λόφος ἀκρωτηριάζων ἄνυδρος, ὅπου τὸ Πομπηίου τοῦ Μάγνου σῶμα κεῖται καὶ Διὸς ἔστιν ἱερὸν Κασίου
 Nobody would have called a sandhill a mountain if the name were not authenticated from elsewhere. Romans who did not know the area were misled by the name "mountain" and gave the Egyptian site the characteristics of the Syrian: thus Lucan 10.434-5 *Lucifer a Casia prospexit rupe diemque / misit in Aegyptum* "Lucifer looked out from the cliff of Casius and sent day into Egypt."

For the Assyrian kings Syrian Baal-Saphon is the name of a mountain, perhaps divinized.⁷ Thus in the Annals of Tiglath-Pileser III (744-727 BC), 3rd year, the ruler claims to have restored to Assyria "the mountain *Ba'-li-ṣa-pu-na* as far as the Amanus."⁸ Albright (p. 2) finds in an Ugaritic text⁹ that *ḫlb špn* is equivalent to Akkadian *āl Ḫal-bi ḪUR.SAG Ḫa-zi* and thus that "the town of Ḫalbu of Mount Ḫazi" is "Ḫalbu of Saphon." It appears certain that Mount Ḫazi is Jebel Aqra^c;¹⁰ Albright and others assume it the original of Greek Kasios. But a broken Ugaritic text has *gr ks*¹¹; Gordon¹² translates "mountain of the cup" (though others quite differently), and I wonder if it is simply "mount Kasios."

In the story of the Exodus, the site *צפן בצל* is close to the place where Pharaoh's army is drowned (Ex 14.2.9; Num 33,7).¹³ As a divinity, Baal-Saphon is known from an Aramaic papyrus from Egypt (KAI 50.2-3) of the sixth century BC, where Bš' writes to her sister Ṛšt "I have blessed you by Baal-Saphon and all the gods of Taḥpanḥes":

ברכתך לבעל צפן ולכל אל תהפנחס

Albright, Chuvin-Yoyotte and Fauth give further attestation for the Egyptian cult of Baal-Saphon.

It does not seem possible to determine an "original" meaning of *צפון*. Savignac thinks it a common noun "storm." Frequently in the Hebrew it

7 Philo Byblius (Eusebius *Praep. Ev.* 1.10.9 = Jacoby FGH 790 F 2.10.9) has mount Kassion, along with Libanos, Antilibanos and "Brathy," named after divine heroes.

8 Ed. P. Rost, *Die Keilschrifttexte Tiglat-Pileasers III* (1893) 20; Eng. tr. ANET³ 282b. More fragmentary text in year 10 of Sargon's Annals, ed. H. Winckler, *Die Keilschrifttexte Sargons* (1889).

9 Gordon UT 113.50 = KTU 4.68.50.

10 RLA iv.241.

11 Gordon UT 'nt pl. ix III.12 = KTU 1.1.III.12.

12 C. Gordon, *Ugaritic Literature*, *Scripta Pont. Inst. Bib.* 98 (1949) 25.

13 Conjectures about the exact site of the Egyptian Baal-Saphon by Paul R. Raabe, *ABD* i.554.

means "north," so that the mountain and its divinity could be "Baal of the north." But it seems also possible that the meaning of the mountain's name is unknown; and that it loomed so large in Hebrew mythical geography that it came to serve as "north," just as ים "Sea" served for the "west"; cf. Gen 13,14 "north, south, east, west"

צַפְנָה וְנִגְבָּה וְקִדְמָה וַיְמָה

where נִגְב "south" may further mean "dry, desert." Isa 14,13 צַפּוֹן "on the flanks of Saphon" proves it a mountain, cf. Isa 37,24 (= II Reg 19,23) יַרְכְּתֵי לְבָנוֹן "the flanks of Lebanon."

Baal-Saphon is in charge of storms at sea. In Esarhaddon's treaty with king Baal of Tyre IV.10-11¹⁴, if the Tyrian breaks the treaty, he must acquiesce in the clause "May Baal-Sameme, Baal-Malage and Baal-Saphon (Ba-al-ša-pu-nu) raise an evil wind against your ships." Thus at Ez 1,4 "And I saw, and behold, a storm-wind coming from Saphon":

וַאֲרָא וְהִנֵּה רוּחַ סַעֲרָה בָּאָה מִן־הַצִּפּוֹן

Prov 25,23 "The wind from Saphon brings rain,"

רוּחַ צִפּוֹן תְּחַלֵּל גֶּשֶׁם

A number of Ugaritic texts plainly show Baal-Saphon as divinity.¹⁵ The Punic sacrificial "tariff" of Marseilles (KAI 69.1) almost certainly begins בַּת בַּעַל צַפּוֹן "Temple of Baal-Saphon"; the stone may have been carried there as ballast from Carthage. A midrash on Exodus¹⁶ understands that the place-name is also a divinity, "Baal-Saphon alone was left of all the deities in order to mislead the hearts of Egypt"

בַּעַל צַפּוֹן נִשְׁתַּיֵּר מִכָּל הַיְרֵאוֹת בְּשִׁבִיל לַפְתוֹת לְבָן שֶׁל מִצְרַיִם

For Greeks Zeus Kasios was a god who protected sailors.¹⁷ Presumably a god capable of stilling storms can also raise them. Procopius (*Hist.* 8.22.23-25) says that on Corcyra there was a ship of white stone dedicated by a merchant in a previous age to Zeus Kasios. For Corcyra was early identified with the mythical Scheria where Odysseus was saved from shipwreck. Two Latin dedications to Jupiter Casius (IovI CASIO) were found on Corcyra (CIL 3.576-577);¹⁸ and a Greek one in the Asclepieion of Epidaurus (IG 4.1287) "Hellanocrates son of Heracleides to Zeus Kasios," ΔΙΙ ΚΑΣΙΩΙ ΕΛΛΑΝΟΚΡΑΤΗΣ ΗΡΑΚΛΕΙΔΟΥ. Pliny 4.52 at Corcyra notes the *templo...Cassi Iouis* at its capital

14 Ed. R. Borger, Die Inschriften Asarhaddons Königs von Assyrien (Archiv für Orientforschung Beiheft 9, 1967) 109; Eng. transl. in ANET³ 534a.

15 Gordon UT 1:10 = KTU 1.39.10; Gordon UT 9:14 = KTU 1.46.14, cf. KTU 1.109.9. But at Gordon UT 125:6 = KTU 1.16.6 the translation in ANET³ 147a does not construe the two words together.

16 Mechilta i.190 ed. Lauterbach.

17 For Zeus Kasios as patron of sailors see Eissfeldt 42-43 and Albright 11-12.

18 Also one at Hedderheim in Germany, CIL 13.7330.

of Cassiope, where Nero sang *ad aram Iouis Cassii* (Suetonius *Nero* 22.3). Chuvin-Yoyotte illustrate anchors dedicated to Zeus Kasios. In Achilles Tatius' novel (3.6), when Clitophon and Leucippe have been shipwrecked they come to land at Pelusium and find the *agalma* of Zeus Kasios, where they ask for an oracle about the fate of their shipwrecked comrades. Yahweh also saves from shipwreck (Ps 107,25-32) and Jonah and Paul of Tarsus rely on him as such, even though Israel is so land-oriented.

A single text associates the Syrian Mount Kasios with the dragon Typhon. He was the offspring of Ge and Tartaros in the Cilician cave (Apollodorus 1.6.3, discussed p. 80 above), "the earthborn dweller of the Cilician cave," (Aeschylus *PV* 351-2). Apollodorus goes on "When the gods saw him rushing at heaven, they made for Egypt in flight, and being pursued they changed their forms into those of animals"; here we have a hint of the Egyptian Typhon. "Zeus pelted Typhon at a distance with thunderbolts, and at close quarters struck him down with an adamantine *harpē*; and as the monster fled, he pursued him closely as far as Mount Kasios, which overhangs Syria." What can Apollodorus' source have been? Anyway his account, set at Mount Kasios, makes a strong link between two bodies of myth: all that Hellenes said about Typhon under the varieties of his name; all that Ugaritic and Hebrew say about the combat of the high God (El or Yahweh) with the sea-dragon—Leviathan, Rahab, Tannin—and often in the vicinity of mount Saphon.

The Egyptian Mount Kasios (says Herodotus 3.5.2-3) is between the Serbonian marsh and the sea; and in this marsh (the story goes) Typhon was hidden, λόγος τὸν Τυφῶ κεκρύφθαι. Plutarch¹⁹ tells us that the Egyptian name for Typhon is Seth, Σήθ. It is not easy in Plutarch's account of the myth to determine the point at which Typhon was hidden in the marsh; Herodotus rather tells us (2.156.4) that Typhon searched for the infant Horus-Apollo son of Osiris whom Leto hid (κατακρύψασα) in the "floating island," and (2.144.2) that later Horus deposed Typhon. At Herodotus 3.5 is "Typhon" an error for "Horus"? Plutarch²⁰ tells how Typhon-Seth buried Osiris alive in a chest which came to land at Byblos; and later dismembered him,²¹ somewhat as Typhon dismembered Zeus (Apollodorus 1.6.3). Zeus Kasios of Egypt is shown as a youth (νεανίσκος, Achilles Tatius 3.6) and milder than the storm-god of Jebel Aqra'; perhaps he is assimilated to Horus. Typhon-Seth has the destructive character of the Typhon of indigenous Greek myth, and of the dragon-opponents of El and Yahweh.

19 Plutarch, *de Iside et Osiride* 41 = *Mor.* 367D.

20 Plutarch, *de Iside et Osiride* 13 = *Mor.* 356C.

21 Plutarch, *de Iside et Osiride* 18 = *Mor.* 358A.

Already then in Herodotus Typhon is the name for Egyptian "Seth," which latter he does not give, though he does mention Osiris, Isis and Horus. Did Greeks hit on the name "Typhon" for Seth by a simple comparison from their own mythology? But then it is too much of a coincidence that Zeus Kasios in Egypt has an adversary with the same name as Zeus Kasios of Syria. Either Greeks in Egypt realized that the legends of the two gods Zeus Kasios should be related; or "Typhon" in some language was the adversary of the good god in both places from the beginning.²²

Can we say anything about Greek Typhon in its various forms? It has long been suggested that in fact it is a simple takeover of Semitic Saphon. The nom. Τυφών (of the Egyptian adversary Herodotus 2.156.4) is close to תִּפּוֹן *səpōwn*; Τυφάων (citable as the acc. Τυφάονα Hesiod *Theog.* 306 etc.) to the (unrelated?) serpent-name שִׁפְּוֹנִי *siṣ'owniy* Isa 11,8 etc. Hesiod *Theog.* 859 refers to Typhoeus as ἄνακτος "lord"; then *ἄναξ Τυφών (not exactly attested as such) would be a nice equivalent for תִּפּוֹן בַּעַל. But Greek Typhon both in Syria and Egypt is the god's adversary; while Baal-Saphon is the cult figure of the two sites. Only in Esarhaddon's treaty is he given destructive attributes; but such dualism is characteristic of high gods everywhere. Thus we might conjecture that תִּפּוֹן בַּעַל meant "Master over Saphon"; the god is named as victor over his adversary. This supports the proposal of Savignac that תִּפּוֹן means "storm." That Jebel Aqra' is called צפון suggests that it was felt the source of winter storms. Fontenrose (p. 214) points out that in the Hurrian myth of Ullikummi preserved in Hittite, the god Tessub goes up to Mount Ḫazzi to see the giant stone man raised up by Kumarbi as his adversary;²³ perhaps the mountain in fact is identified with the stone man.

Israelite theology, here more than elsewhere following Canaanite-Ugaritic, describes the great acts of Yahweh in history as a victory over the sea-dragon, the force of disorder. In the initial act of creation he "crushed Rahab like a carcass" (Ps 89,11), and so at Job 26,12 (cited p. 114 below). At the Canaanite passage Isa 27,1 (cited p. 79 above) the killing of Leviathan is projected as if into the future. At Ps 74,14 Leviathan and the Tannin become useful and edible (as tuna?--Chapter 3). At Gen 1,21 the Tannin is domesticated and becomes part of creation, it sports in the sea (Ps 104,26) and praises its maker (Ps 148,7). The story of the Flood as we have it represents God as wholly in charge; Isa 51,10 "he dried up the sea, the waters of the great deep" evokes both the flood and the victory at the Red Sea. Rahab becomes another name of Egypt (Isa 30,7), and Pharaoh himself is a Tannin (Ez 29,3;

22 See A. B. Lloyd, Herodotus Book II (=EPROER 43), vol. 3 (1993) p. 111 on Herodotus 2.144.

23 Harry A. Hoffner, Jr., Hittite Myths (1990) no. 18.32, p. 55.

32,2). At Isa 51,9 again by a stroke of analogy the return from exile, precisely because on dry land, is made parallel to the Exodus.

The sea as enemy is not merely a figure of myth. Phoenicians and Greeks were well aware of the dangers of sea-voyaging. The great earthquakes of the Byzantine period produced tsunamis, with a recession phase followed by a flood phase.²⁴ So on a much greater scale must the eruption of Thera about 1600 BC have done.²⁵ The recession-phase of the tsunami is suggested by "Then the channels of the sea were seen, and the foundations of the world were laid bare" (Ps 18,15 = II Sam 22,16); the tidal wave by "the flood stood up in a heap" (Ex 15,8); the actual explosion by the plague of darkness, and the pillar of fire and cloud. There are echoes in the Greek versions of Deucalion's flood. Pindar (*Olymp.* 9.50-53) describes how "the force of the water drowned the black earth, but then by the plans of Zeus the ebbtide suddenly took off the flood":

χθόνα μὲν κατακλύσαι μέλαιναν
ὑδατος σθένος, ἀλλὰ
Ζηὸς τέχναις ἀνάπτωτιν ἐξαίφνας
ἄντλον ἐλεῖν.

Eissfeldt (in summary p. 71) boldly asks whether that Israelites originally ascribed the miracle of the Red Sea to Baal-Saphon, at whose temple on Egyptian "Mount" Kasios they found themselves, and only later transferred his power over the sea to Yahweh:

Wenn wirklich zunächst der Baal Zaphon es gewesen sein sollte, dem die Israeliten ihre Rettung dankten, und erst später Jahwe an dieses Gottes Stelle gerückt wäre, ...

Yahweh benefits from a comparable transfer of attributes also at the Syrian Mount Kasios, whether independently or not. We now can see that Zeus had almost exactly the same history: the desperate struggle of the Canaanite high god—El or Baal-Saphon or Yahweh—against the sea-dragon at the Syrian Mount Kasios is likewise transferred to Zeus; and the sea-dragon becomes Typhon, the even more dangerous successor of the Titans. But also Egyptian Horus has a parallel history; his adversary Seth in Greek versions takes on the name and attributes of Hellenic Typhon. The cult of Syrian Mount Kasios must have had exceptional power to infiltrate so deeply three cultures—Canaanite, Hellenic and Egyptian—and two of them without benefit of a common language. What was the source of that power? A convincing representation of a god protecting against storms at sea, taken up by the

24 See the texts I have gathered in *The Lebanon and Phoenicia* 130-137.

25 Evidence of tree-rings from Arizona and Ireland now suggests precisely 1628 BC for the eruption of Thera; D. A. Hardy & A. C. Renfrew (eds.), *Thera and the Aegean World III*; vol. 3, *Chronology* (1990).

three principal maritime powers of the eastern Mediterranean? No stone monument or literary text reveals it. One more reminder how wide the gaps in our knowledge are.

Chapter 3: Cosmological Myth and the Tuna of Gibraltar¹

3.1 The domed sky

Mostly in the Mediterranean the whole sky is clear. Even in winter by noon of a clear day it is hot in the sun and the ground is dry. In the summer of hazy Beirut or dusty Athens one notices the blueness of the sky less than its general brightness and heat. Greek, in its poverty of color-words, has no way of saying "the sky is blue"; Hebrew can only compare it with a "pavement of sapphire" (Ex 24,10, cf. p. 84 above). Contrast Latin, where from *caelum* "sky" is formed *caeruleus*, which beside "dark-colored, dusky" can mean simply "blue": Juvenal 13.164-5 *caerula...Germani lumina, flauam / caesariem* "the blue eyes and blond hair of a German." Hence Ennius² *caeli caerula templa* is more likely "the blue tracts of the sky" than "dark tracts."

Thus naturally one concluded that the sky must be a shiny material dome. But how did it support itself? As soon as metallurgy came in, the obvious explanation was that the sky was of metal, which at first could only be bronze. *Iliad* 5.503-504:

λευκοὶ ὑπερθε γένοντο κονισάλω, ὄν ῥα δι' αὐτῶν
οὐρανὸν ἐς πολύχαλκον ἐπέπληγον πόδες ἵππων.

"[The Achaeans] turned white all over with the dust that the horses' hooves dashed among them towards the bronze sky." Again, *Iliad* 17.424-425:

ὥς οἱ μὲν μάρναντο, σιδήρειος δ' ὄρυμαγδὸς
χάλκεον οὐρανὸν ἴκε δι' αἰθέρος ἀτρυγέτοιο.

"So they fought, and the ringing of iron reached through the barren(?) upper air to the bronze sky." The bronze sky was perhaps the floor of the divine abode which rose above it; Poseidon to Apollo (*Iliad* 21.438)

ἴομεν Οὐλύμπόνδε Διὸς ποτὶ χαλκοβατῆς δῶ.

"let us go to Olympus, to the bronze-floored house of Zeus."

1 Revision of an article with the same title in TAPA 99 (1968) 37-62.

2 Ennius *Ann.* 48 ed. Skutsch (1985), from Cicero *de div.* 1.40.

Normally one fights only in the good weather which northern Europeans cannot distinguish from drought. Hebrew invokes a drought in the same imagery at Deut 28,23-24

וְהָיוּ שָׁמַיִךְ אֲשֶׁר עַל־רֹאשְׁךָ גְחָשֶׁת וְהָאָרֶץ אֲשֶׁר־תַּחְתֶּיךָ בְּרֹזָל יִתֵּן יְהוָה אֶת־מִטְרֵךְ אֲרָצְךָ
אֶבֶן וְעָפָר

"And your heavens above your head shall be bronze, and the earth under you iron; may Yahweh make the rain of your land powder and dust (LXX κονιοπτώον)." This is an old treaty curse (p. 280 below), for it appears ab. 680 BC in the Vassal-Treaties of Esarhaddon 526-533:³ "May all the gods named in this tablet...turn your soil into iron.... Just as rain does not fall from a bronze sky, so may there come neither rain nor dew upon your fields and meadows, but let it rain burning coals in your land instead of dew." Iliad 5 has turned the curse into a descriptive motif. Both the Iliad and Deuteronomy record the ancient theory of a bronze sky, while anachronistically making a parallel with the iron that their characters are not supposed to know about.

With the progress of technology the sky itself becomes iron. *Odyssey* 15.329 = 17.565 of the Suitors:

τῶν ὑβρις τε βίη τε σιδήρεον οὐρανὸν ἵκει

"whose arrogance and force reach the iron sky." Compare the version of the covenant curse at Lev 26,19:

וְשִׁבַרְתִּי אֶת־גְּאוֹן עַצְמְךָ וְנָתַתִּי אֶת־שָׁמַיִכֶם בְּבְרוֹזָל וְאֶת־אֲרָצְכֶם בְּנְחָשָׁה

"And I shall break the pride (LXX ὑβρις, Vg *superbiam*, Luther *Stolz*) of your strength; and I shall make your heavens as iron, and your earth as bronze." The LXX ὑβρις might be an actual reminiscence of Homeric usage. (Greek ὑβρις, lacking an Indo-European etymology, has been compared with Hebrew עֲבָרָה; but the structure is not very close.⁴) Both passages are nearer metaphor than those of the bronze sky; and it is the same metaphor—arrogant men are put in the suitable setting of an iron sky. The Iron Age and its social conditions generate an international literary motif.

The pre-Socratics are supposed to have worked over the theory of a bronze sky: Lactantius using Varro *an si mihi quispiam dixerit aeneum esse caelum aut uitreum aut, ut Empedocles ait, aerem glaciatum, statimne adsentiar?* "Or if one tells me that the sky is brazen or vitreous, or, as Empedocles says, frozen air, should I right away agree?"⁵ "Orphics" saw the sky as performing the same function in the universe as "the shell in the egg," τὸ

3 Ed. D. J. Wiseman, *The Vassal-Treaties of Esarhaddon* (1958 = Iraq 20 [1958] part 1) 67-70; translated ANET³ 539.

4 Discussion at Lewy 72, who in the end rejects the etymology.

5 Lactantius *de opif. Dei* 17.6 = Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ 31 A 51 (i.293).

λεπυρόν ἐν τῷ ὠῶ, and the *aither* as the inner membrane,⁶ a neat picture of the modern "eggshell" construction of the sky-vault. When (Herodotus 1.131.2) the Persians are said to give the name "Zeus" to τὸν κύκλον πάντα τοῦ οὐρανοῦ, this is not "circle of the horizon" but "vaulted dome of the sky."

Israel, which remained pre-scientific, worked out the naive description more precisely. The root רקע means "beat out as a goldsmith," and the רקעי of Num 17,3 are "broad metal plates" (LXX λεπίδας, Vg *laminas*). Hence the noun רקיע of Gen 1,6-20 (LXX στερέωμα, Vg *firmamentum*) is a "vaulted metal dome." Since rain falls from what is normally a clear sky, there must be (Gen 1,7) "waters above the firmament"—the vaulted sky dome. It is perforated with "windows" (אֲרָבֹת Gen 7,11, Luther *Fenster*, cf. Mal 3,10) to let stars shine through or rain fall through. Dan 12,3 speaks of its brightness, בְּזֹהַר הַרְקִיעַ, Theod. ὡς ἡ λαμπρότης τοῦ στερεώματος, Vg *splendor firmamenti*. So behind the austere theology of Genesis lies a God who hammered the sky out like a tinker: Ps 19,2

הַשָּׁמַיִם מְסַפְּרִים כְּבוֹד־אֱלֹהִים וּמַעֲשֵׂה יְדָיו מְגִיד הַרְקִיעַ

"The heavens are telling the glory of El, and the firmament proclaims the work of his hands," LXX ... ποιήσιν δὲ χειρῶν αὐτοῦ ἀναγγέλλει τὸ στερέωμα, Vg *et opera manuum eius adnuntiat firmamentum*. Again the psalmist says of God that the heavens are "the works of your fingers" (Ps 8,4) מַעֲשֵׂי אֶצְבָּעֶיךָ, LXX ἔργα τῶν δακτύλων σου, Vg *opera digitorum tuorum*, Luther *deiner Finger Werk*.⁷ The same root רקע in the participle shows that the earth is of similar construction, Isa 44,24 (cf. 42,5; Ps 136,6):

נָטָה שָׁמַיִם לְבִדִּי רָקַע הָאָרֶץ

"who stretched out the heavens by myself, who beat out the earth..."

The cosmology of any society reflects the general state of its technology; the only language available to describe the work of a divine artisan is the language developed to describe the work of human artisans. In the alphabetic societies of the Mediterranean, metallurgy has mostly preempted any cosmologies derived from pottery-making or weaving. While our own current mathematical description of the birth of the cosmos may be quite correct, its name in American English "the big bang" reflects the mind-set of a nuclear power; a more peaceful society might have called it "the germination."

Homer's formal description of the cosmos is the shield of Achilles, dramatically worked into the narrative of *Iliad* 18; its hammering-out by Hephaestus may be a demythologized creation-narrative. Its closest prototypes are the

6 Achilles *Eisag.* 4 p. 33.17 Maas = Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ i.11 line 19.

7 However the Daktyloi of Greek myth are not hypostatized Fingers of a deity but dwarves, Thumbkins.

Phoenician silver bowls catalogued by Markoe,⁸ in particular the sumptuous gold-plated Bernardini bowl from Praeneste, now in the Villa Giulia.⁹ The bowl is surrounded by a serpent with its tail in its mouth, which reminds us of the "Ocean River" (ποταμοῖο ... Ὠκεανοῖο) around the rim of Achilles' shield (*Iliad* 18.607-8); perhaps this is meant by "Ocean flowing back into itself" (ἄψορρόου Ὠκεανοῖο *Iliad* 18.399). Some bowls show scenes of war and narrative sequences like the Bernardini, others animals wild and herded, though none both scenes of war and peace like Achilles' shield.¹⁰ More distant are the actual bronze shields from the Zeus Cave on Mt. Ida in Crete.¹¹ The common Helleno-Semitic vocabulary suggests γαυλός (Chapter 4.7) as a name for golden bowls such as one from Ras Shamra,¹² and κυμβίον (p. 167 below) for silver bowls.¹³

Fittschen¹⁴ has gathered together representations of Achilles' shield from the fifth century BC to our twentieth. A red-figured vase (Fittschen's Plate I) shows Thetis picking up the shield from Hephaestus' shop: it has a bird and four stars. Wall paintings from Pompeii (IV) show the shield with constellations. Julio Romano (1536-1539) and Martin Heemskerck (roughly contemporary) independently reproduce the scene with tantalizing glimpses of the shield. Archaeological reproductions of the shield illustrate more the taste of their makers than Homer's: e.g. those by Nicolas Vleughels (1715); Quatremère de Quincy (1819); A. S. Murray (1880); and L. Weniger (1912). Notable is the cluttered plastic version of Blake's rival Flaxman (1818), from which the goldsmiths Bridge and Rundell made bronze and silver casts, one now in the

8 G. Markoe, *Phoenician Bronze and Silver Bowls from Cyprus and the Mediterranean*; Univ. of Calif. Classical Studies 26 (1985). For Phoenician metallurgy see DCP 289-290.

9 Markoe no. E2, pp. 279ff.

10 The allegorist Heraclitus (F. Oelman, *Heracliti Quaestiones homericae* [1910] 43) sees the poet (or god?) as "hammering out in bronze Achilles' shield as an image of the cosmic circuit," τὴν Ἀχιλλέως ἀσπίδα τῆς κοσμικῆς περιόδου χαλκευσάμενος εἰκόνα.

11 Markoe 368-9.

12 Markoe 355.

13 The "Phoenician" silver or gilt shallow *paterae* we possess are frequently compared with the Phoenician silver mixing-bowl (ἀργύρεον κρητήρα) of *Iliad* 23.741 (as with the gilt one of *Od.* 4.613): see Falsone (DCPP 122-4); Maria Eugenia Aubet, *The Phoenicians and the West: Politics, colonies and trade* (tr. from the Spanish by Mary Turton), 1993, 106-108; and the Cambridge *Iliad* ad loc. (vi. 251) permits the same conclusion. But since the Iliadic *kreter* holds a substantial quantity of fluid it can hardly be identical with the shallow bowls we possess, more suitable for libations; it perhaps should be considered a *gaulos* rather than a *kymbion*.

14 K. Fittschen, *Der Schild des Achilleus*; *Archaeologia Homerica* II.N.1 (1973).

Huntington Museum in San Marino, California. The Cambridge *Iliad*¹⁵ has an elaborate discussion of the shield.

Pindar, who frequently works over Homeric materials, takes the bronze sky (like the Atlantic beyond Gades, as we shall see) as the off-limits sign for even the strongest men. "The bronze sky is inaccessible to him" (*Pyth.* 10.27), ὁ χάλκεος οὐρανὸς οὐ ποτ' ἀμβατὸς αὐτῷ. *Nem.* 6.1-4 like Hebrew myth makes the sky a divider:

Ἐν ἀνδρῶν,
 ἐν θεῶν γένος· ἐκ μιᾶς δὲ πνέομεν
 ματρὸς ἀμφότεροι· διείργει δὲ πᾶσα κεκριμένα
 δύναμις, ὡς τὸ μὲν οὐδέν, ὁ δὲ χάλκεος
 ἀσφαλὲς αἰὲν ἔδος
 μένει οὐρανός

"One and the same is the race of men and of gods;¹⁶ we both have our breath from one mother. But a distinction of power wholly separates us, so that one is nothing, while [for the other] the bronze sky remains as a secure seat forever."

Since the bottom of the sky-vault is obviously a perfect circle, so must be the plane of earth and water that it encloses. Herodotus 4.36.2 laughs at mapmakers (γῆς περιόδους γράψαντας) for "drawing Ocean flowing around the earth, which is made wheel-shaped as if by compasses," οἱ Ὠκεανὸν τε ῥέοντα γράφουσι πέριξ τὴν γῆν, εὐῶσαν κυκλωτέρεια ὡς ἀπὸ τόννου. (Some maps like that of Aristagoras, 5.49.1, were on a bronze plate, χάλκεον πίνακα.) The historian's travels had shown him the irregularities of the continents; his predecessors had worked by theory. Two related Hebrew passages, again theoretical, show the necessity of a neat fit. Job 22,14: יְהַלֵּךְ יְהוָה בְּמַעְרָב הַשָּׁמַיִם "he treads the circle of heaven," LXX καὶ γῦρον οὐρανοῦ διαπορεύσεται; Isa 40,22 with its elegant assonances:

הַיֵּשֶׁב חַוֵּי הָאָרֶץ וַיִּשְׁבְּיָהּ כַּחֲבִיבִים

"He sits upon the circle of the earth, and its inhabitants are as grasshoppers"; LXX ὁ κατέχων τὸν γῦρον τῆς γῆς ...; Vg *qui sedet super gyrum terrae*. (For a comparison of this last passage with Plato's *Phaedo* see p. 88 above.)

"Ocean" for the Greeks was a big river flowing around the outside of the circle of continents. Greeks early heard of the sea beyond the straits of Gibraltar. Herodotus (2.11) thinks that once the land-barrier between the Mediterranean and the Red Sea did not exist. Bolton¹⁷ proposes that once there was thought to be a strait, the Phasis (later identified with the Tanais

15 Mark W. Edwards, in the Cambridge *Iliad* V.200-233.

16 Some translate "the race of men is one, that of gods is another"; but C. M. Bowra, Pindar (1964) 96 note 1 refutes this.

17 J. D. P. Bolton, *Aristeas of Proconnesus* (1962) 56-57.

[Don]) leading from the Sea of Azov to an outer Sea. Hence it may have been correctly conjectured that Atlantic, Red Sea and Northeast Sea were all one Ocean; and incorrectly that three outlets from the Mediterranean and Black Sea marked off the earth into three continental islands. Ocean at first was not seen as a vast expanse of water but as a permanently rotating river. As the constellations set in the West they are bathed in Ocean, and only the circumpolar Bear is exempt (*Odyssey* 5.275 etc.).

A widespread folk-motif¹⁸ has the sun carried from West to East during the night in a golden bowl (a double of itself) ready to rise again in the morning. Heracles sometimes is the ferryman, getting the bowl back during the day from East to West ready for its evening passenger. Thus Stesichorus Ἄελιος ... δέπας ἔσκατέβαινε χρύσειον ... "the Sun entered the golden bowl."¹⁹ Mimnermus²⁰ has the sun go "from the Hesperides to the land of the Ethiopians," which indicates a counterclockwise flow of Ocean stream. Anyway, in the morning the sun finds itself in the eastern sector of Ocean, *Odyssey* 3.1-2

Ἡέλιος δ' ἀνόρουσε, λιπῶν περικαλλέα λίμνην,
οὐρανὸν ἐς πολύχαλκον ...

"And the Sun arose, leaving the most fair lake, into the bronze sky"—a passage which summarizes the cosmological picture so far. Psalm 19,5-7 similarly describes the Sun's course:

לְשֶׁמֶשׁ שָׁם־אֵהָלָה בְּהָם
וְהוּא כְּחֶזֶן יָצָא מִחֶפְתּוֹ
וְתִקְוַתוֹ עַל־קַצּוֹתָם
מִקְצֵה הַשָּׁמַיִם מוֹצֵאוֹ

"In [the heavens?] he has set a tent for the Sun, who comes forth as a bridegroom (LXX νύμφιος, Vg *sponsus*) from his chamber, and rejoices as a strong man (LXX γίγας, Luther *Held*) to run his course; his rising is from the end of the heavens, and his circuit to the end of them." In Greek, Ἡώς "Dawn" is feminine and "arises from her bed beside goodly Tithonus" (*Odyssey* 5.1-2), and so Latin Aurora (Vergil *Georg.* 1.447). Hebrew עֶרְוָה is masculine (Gen 19,15), but may have a womb (Ps 110,3 LXX); his eyelids are the first light, Job 3,9 עֵינַי פִּי־וְחַרְוֵי עֵינַי. Compare Sophocles *Ant.* 100-104 ἀκτίς ἀελίου ... ὦ χρυσεάς ἀμέρας βλέφαρον "ray of the Sun...O eyelid of golden Day."

Greek Dawn (Ἡώς) snatched away young men:²¹ Orion (*Odyssey* 5.121), Cleitus (15.250), Cephalus (Hesiod *Theog.* 986); and especially Tithonus.

18 C. M. Bowra, *Greek Lyric Poetry from Alcman to Simonides*, 2nd ed. (1961) 90-92.

19 Stesichorus frag. 8 in Page, PMG 100 no. 185 = Athenaeus 11.469E.

20 Mimnermus frag. 12 in West, IEG ii.86 = Athenaeus 11.470A.

21 Emily Vermeule, *Aspects of Death in Early Greek Art and Poetry* (1979) 162-177, discusses the theme at length. Apollodorus 1.4.4 explains that Aphrodite, piqued at Eos' affair with Ares, had caused her to be perpetually in love.

For Tithonus she unwisely asked from Zeus immortality but not also youth (*Homeric Hymn to Aphrodite* 5.218-227). But at first all was well: "As Dawn of the golden throne²² also snatched off Tithonus.... He lived by the streams of Ocean at the ends of the earth":

ὥς δ' αὖ Τιθωνὸν χρυσόθρονος ἤρπασεν Ἡώς ...

ναῖε παρ' Ὠκεανοῖο ῥοῆς ἐπὶ πείρασι γαίης

Attic vases show *winged* Dawn carrying off a young man.²³ The Elysian Fields (*Odyssey* 4.563) and Isles of the Blest (Hesiod *Opera* 169) are also at the πείρατα γαίης. The amazing parallel at Ps 139,9 is noted by Vermeule, "Let me take the wings of the dawn (Luther *Flügel der Morgenröte*) and dwell in the uttermost parts of the sea":

אָשָׂא כְּנָפֵי־שָׁחַר אֲשַׁכְּנָה בְּאַחֲרֵיתַיִם

Likewise Jonah proposes to go to the distant land of "Tarshish" to *escape* "from before the face of Yahweh" (יהוה מִלְּפָנָי יְהוָה) Jonah 1:3). Each man has the partly unwanted special attention of the divinity: the Psalmist, trying to escape from God's omniscience, finds still that far off in the sea "thy hand shall lead me"; Tithonus, though at first he enjoyed (τερπόμενος *Hom. Hymn* 5.226) life with Eos, had no choice in the matter.²⁴

Wisdom (Prov 8,27-29) describes the process of creation to date:

בְּהִכְיֵנו שָׁמַיִם שָׁם אָנִי	בְּחֻקוֹ חִגַּל עַל־פְּנֵי תְהוֹם
בְּאֲמָצוֹ שְׁחָקִים מִמַּעַל	בְּעֻזּוֹ עִינֹת תְהוֹם
בְּשׁוּמוֹ לַיִם חָקוּ	וּמַיִם לֹא יַעֲבְרוּ־פָיו
בְּחֻקוֹ מוֹסְרֵי אָרֶץ	

"When he established the heavens I was there, when he inscribed a circle on the face of the Deep (Vg *gyro uallabat abyssos*), when he made firm the clouds above, when he established (?) the fountains of the Deep, when he set for the sea its limit, that the waters might not disobey his mouth, when he inscribed the foundations of Earth..." The root חקק of vs 27 (the form here is anomalous) is used at Ez 4,1 for inscribing a city-map on a clay tablet. Hebrew for "compasses" is מְחַוֶּגֶה (Isa 44:13), the *nomen instrumenti* from חג "circle" of vs 27. Blake's famous drawing of a wind-blown God holding compasses over the deep follows the English KJV of vs 27 "When he set a compass upon the face of the depth." Evidently there is a circular boundary between earth and sea; the parallelism between the two halves of

22 Or "with golden embroidery"; for θρόνα ποικίλ(α) *Iliad* 22.441 is "variegated (woven) flowers," and hence Sappho's ποικιλόθρον(ε) (frag. 1 Lobel-Page PLF), whatever she thought it meant, was once "with variegated embroidered flowers."

23 Vermeule pp. 165-166.

24 Also, Artemis on behalf of the other gods, who were jealous, killed Orion (*Odyssey* 5.124); and Eos's son Phaethon by Cephalus was in turn carried off by Aphrodite (Hesiod *Theog.* 986-991).

vs 27 suggests that the circular base of the sky-hemisphere rests on the waters. For we can sail some ways out into Ocean without meeting Sky. Also the earth floats on the waters: Ps 24,2 (cf. 136,6)

כִּי יִהְיֶה אֶרֶץ מֵי־מַיִם

"For he established [the earth] upon the seas," LXX αὐτὸς ἐπὶ θαλασσῶν ἐθεμελίωσεν αὐτήν, Vg *super maria fundavit eum [orbem]*. That raises the same question as the parallel Greek concept of Ocean: what keeps the sky-vault from sinking into the waters? Perhaps our Greek-Hebrew parallels up until now can be explained by chance or independent cultural development. But their joint answer to the question requires a more definite contact, probably Phoenician: the sky-vault stays in place because it is *propped up by pillars*.

3.2 The pillars of the sky

Homer identifies Calypso (*Odyssey* 1.52-54):

Ἀτλαντος θυγάτηρ ὀλοόφρονος, ὅς τε θαλάσσης
πάσης βένθεα οἶδεν, ἔχει δέ τε κίονας αὐτὸς
μακράς, αἱ γαῖάν τε καὶ οὐρανὸν ἀμφὶς ἔχουσι

"the daughter of Atlas of destructive mind, him who knows the depths of the whole sea, and holds up the great pillars which keep earth and sky apart." Zeus assigned him this fate (Hesiod *Theog.* 520), no reason given. Eustathius²⁵ explains that "Atlas is thought to be one of the Titans; he rose up against Zeus to his own destruction, whence he is called 'destructive-minded,' and received as punishment the burden of the pillars." The notion of a mountain with roots in the sea and propping up the sky is dissociated into a giant man plus pillars. In Hesiod *Theog.* 517-520 only the man remains, in the West among the Hesperides. Herodotus 4.184 knows a mountain Atlas in western Africa which the natives call "pillar of heaven," κίονα τοῦ οὐρανοῦ. Euripides *Ion* 1-2 gives Atlas bronze shoulders like the sky he supports:

Ὁ χαλκείοισιν οὐρανὸν νῶτοις Ἄτλας
θεῶν παλαιὸν οἶκον ἐκτρίβων ...

"Atlas, propping up on bronze shoulders the sky, the ancient seat of the gods..." Of especial interest is the description in a late geographer:²⁶

25 Eustathius ad *Od.* 1.50, repr. 1970, i.18.16.

26 Dionysius Periegetes 63-68, GGM ii.107.

ἀρξάμεναι στοιχηδὸν ἀφ' ἐσπέρου Ὠκεανοῖο
 ἔνθα τε καὶ στήλαι περὶ τέρμασιν Ἡρακλῆος
 ἐστᾶσιν, μέγα θαῦμα, παρ' ἐσχατόωντα Γάδειρα,
 μακρὸν ὑπὸ πρηῶνα πολυσπερέων Ἀτλάντων
 ἦχι τε καὶ χαλκεῖος ἐς οὐρανὸν ἔδραμε κίων
 ἠλίβατος, πυκινοῖσι καλυπτόμενος νεφέεσσιν.

"[O Muses,] beginning in order from western Ocean, where the pillars of Heracles stand at the limits [of earth], a great wonder, at farthest Gadeira, under the great cliff of the far-spread Atlantes, where a steep bronze pillar runs up to the sky, covered with thick clouds." Here only are there several Atlas mountains, and the pillar is of bronze.

Likewise in Hebrew. Elsewhere²⁷ I compare the song of Hannah (I Sam 2,1-10) with the proem of Hesiod's *Opera* (5-8); each has the god of thunder reverse the status of rich and poor. In the present context see vs 8:

כִּי לַיהוָה מְצַקֵּי אָרֶץ נִשְׁתַּעַלְיָהֶם תְּבֵל

"For the pillars (Vg *cardines*) of the earth are Yahweh's, and on them he has set the world." If מְצַקֵּי is from the root צוּק, it is a cast-metal pillar; it is unclear what the pillars support and what they rest on. Elsewhere Hebrew calls the pillars מְמוּרֵי and envisages their being shaken by various causes. Thus Ps 75,4

נִמְגִים אָרֶץ וְכָל־יֹשְׁבֶיהָ אֲנֹכִי תִכְנַתִּי עֲמוּדֶיהָ

"[When] the earth and all its inhabitants totter, I keep its pillars steady," LXX ἐτάκη ἡ γῆ ... ἐγὼ ἐστερέωσα τοὺς στύλους αὐτῆς, Vg *liquefacta est terra...ego confirmaui columnas eius*. Here the cause is undefined and God is agent of stability. But at Job 9,6, God himself is agent of decreation:

הַמְרַגֵּז אָרֶץ מִמְקוֹמָהּ וְעֲמוּדֶיהָ יִתְפַּלְצוּן

"Who shakes the earth out of its place, and its pillars (Luther *Pfeilen*) tremble"; the LXX suggests earthquake, ὁ σειῶν τὴν ὑπ' οὐρανὸν ἐκ θεμελίων, οἱ δὲ στῦλοι αὐτῆς σαλεύονται, Vg *qui commouet terram de loco suo et columnae eius concutiuntur*.

A key passage is Job 26,7.10-13:

... תֵּלָה אָרֶץ עַל־בְּלִי־מָה	נָטָה צִפּוֹן עַל־תְּהוֹ
עַד־תִּכְלִית אֹר עַם־חֹשֶׁךְ	חִק־חַג עַל־פְּנֵי־מַיִם
וַיִּתְמְדוּ מִגְּעַרְתּוֹ	עֲמוּדֵי שָׁמַיִם יְדוּפְפוּ
וּבְתוֹבְנֹתוֹ מִחֵץ רָהֵב	בְּכַחוֹ רָגַע הַיָּם
הִלְלָה יְדוּ נַחֲשׁ בְּרִיתִי	בְּרוּחוֹ שָׁמַיִם שִׁפְרָהּ

27 "Men of the Land and the God of Justice in Greece and Israel," ZAW 95 (1983) 376-402, p. 391.

"He stretches out the north²⁸ over the void, and hangs the earth upon nothing... He has inscribed a circle on the face of the waters, at the boundary between light and darkness. [When] the pillars of heaven tremble, they are astonished at his rebuke. By his power he stilled the sea, by his understanding he smote Rahab. By his breath the heavens became fair; his hand pierced the fleeing(?) serpent." Vs 7 ignores the pillars, and in modern Newtonian fashion has the earth floating in space, LXX κρεμάζων γῆν ἐπὶ οὐδένοϋς, Vg *adpendit terram super nihil*. Vs 10, "He has inscribed a circle (Vg *terminum circumdedit*), אֶת־קֵוֹץ, has the same two roots as Prov 8,27 above וְהָיָה יְקוֹץ, but in inverse relation. The "boundary of light and darkness" may be the limit of chaos outside the sky-vault; but it reminds us of Night and Day "crossing the great bronze threshold" (Hesiod *Theog.* 749-750 ἀμειβόμενοι μέγαν οὐδὸν / χάλκεον) of sunset near where the "son of Iapetus" holds up the heavens. At vs 11 the pillars (LXX στῦλοι, Vg *columnae caeli contremescunt*) clearly hold up the sky; they are personified like Atlas, the trembling is their fault and they recognize rebuke, Vg *pauent ad nutum eius*. (For comments on vss 12-13 see in p. 126 below.)

There is some indication that the Biblical pillars are in the West. Job 38,8-10:

וְיִשְׁמְרֵם בְּרִיחַ יָם וְיִשְׁמְרֵם בְּרִיחַ יָם ... וְיִשְׁמְרֵם בְּרִיחַ יָם

"Or who shut in the sea with doors...when I set a bar and doors?" LXX ἔφραξα δὲ θάλασσαν πύλαις ... περιθεις κλειθρα καὶ πύλας. A fragment of Pindar²⁹ calls the Pillars of Heracles πύλας Γαδειρίδας "the gates of Gadeira"; nothing could so appropriately be called the "gates of the sea" as Gibraltar, which now as in Pindar's time has a Semitic name, *Jebel Tariq*, "Mount of Tariq [ibn Zayid]" (AD 711). Any Phoenician original of Hanno's *Periplous*³⁰ presumably had an equivalent to his "Pillars of Heracles," ἔξω στηλῶν Ἡρακλείων. (Blomqvist³¹ regards the Greek text as showing Ionic elements and written before 400 BC; if a translation, it is a very good one.) We should not expect closer location of the pillars of earth and sky from Hebrew, where places overseas like "Tarshish" are invested with vagueness and myth.

28 Heb. יָקוֹץ; see the discussion in Excursus B.

29 Frag. 271 Bowra² from Strabo 3.5.5.

30 Hanno 1, GGM i.1.

31 Jerker Blomqvist, The date and origin of the Greek version of *Hanno's Periplous*, *Scripta minora regiae societatis humaniorum litterarum Lundensis* 1979-1980:3. But Véronique Krings, "Les lettres grecques à Carthage," pp. 649-668 of *Phoinikeia Grammata: Lire et écrire en Méditerranée* [Colloque Liège, Nov. 1989], ed. Cl. Baurain et alii; *Collection d'études classiques* vol. 6 (1991), proposes that many works described as "Punic books," in view of the Hellenization of Carthage, were in fact in Greek; then perhaps there was *no* Phoenician original of Hanno's *Periplous*, and he or a

The Greeks located "pillars" in the West at the "Atlas" mountain, however defined; at Aetna (Pindar *Pyth.* 1.19, p. 124 below); and as the "pillars of Heracles." This initial ascription is unexplained; theories come later. For Herodotus they are always *στήλαι*, which normally implies free-standing inscribed monuments, not load-bearing; thus at 4.8.2 *πρὸς Γηδείροισι τοῖσι ἔξω Ἑρακλέων στήλέων ἐπὶ τῷ Ὠκεανῷ* "at Gadeira outside the Pillars of Heracles beside Ocean." But Philostratus (*Vit. Ap.* 5.5, cf. 2.23), although he describes the pillars in the temple of Heracles at Gades as of electrum and inscribed, still interprets them as "stays (*ξύνδεσμοι*) of heaven and earth." For Pindar they are the boundary of possible exploration. *Olymp.* 3.43-45 describes metaphorically the success of Theron of Acragas in the chariot race, 476 BC:

νῦν δὲ πρὸς ἐσχατιᾶν
 Θήρων ἀρεταῖσιν ἰκάνων ἄπτεται
 οἴκοθεν Ἑρακλέος
 σταλᾶν. τὸ πόρσω δ' ἐστὶ σοφοῖς ἄβατον
 κάσσοφοις.

"Now from his home reaching the world's end, Theron by his merits has grasped the Pillars of Heracles. What lies beyond is inaccessible to wise men and fools."³² (Cf. Pindar *Nem.* 4.69-70, sect. 3 below.) I suppose the real hindrance was the Punic monopoly, buttressed by tales of Atlantic terrors and monsters. Thus Horace *Carm.* 4.14.47-8 *beluosus...Oceanus*; Tacitus *Ann.* 2.24 (cf. *Germ.* 17.2) *uim turbinum et inauditas uolucres, monstra maris, ambiguas hominum et beluarum formas, uisa siue ex metu credita* "the force of storms, unknown fowl, monsters of the sea, forms intermediate between men and beasts, seen or believed by fear." Pliny 9.8 describes the *physeter* (whale-spout?) of the Gallic sea, and in the "ocean of Gades" the *rotae* and the *arbor* "which spreads itself out into such vast branches that from this cause it is believed never to enter the Straits"—giant squid?

All through the Middle Ages, though the Punic monopoly had long since disappeared, outside Norway the taboo on the Atlantic remained. I do not know from what Latin source Dante in his canto on Ulysses came so close to the language of Pindar (*Inferno* 26.106-109):

secretary wrote it down in Ionic Greek.

- 32 See the scholiast (ed. A. B. Drachmann, 1903) on *Olymp.* 3.44: "When Heracles in search of the oxen of Geryon reached the island by Ocean called Erytheia [Herodotus 4.8], after having traversed the entire navigable sea, he wished to go further; but when he found chaos and *zophos*, he set up *stelai*, by which he marked the end of the sea, to show that it was not further navigable."

Io e' compagni eravam vecchi e tardi
 Quando venimmo a quella foce stretta
 Dov' Ercule segnò li suoi riguardi
 Acciò che l'uom più oltre non si metta.

"I and my companions were old and slow when we came to that narrow strait where Hercules put up his markers so that man should not go further." So far as I can determine this is the origin of Latin *ne plus ultra*. That phrase³³ is attested in English since the 1660s as a prohibition of further advance and the utmost point reached, supposedly as "inscribed on the Pillars of Hercules"; later illogically it becomes "point of highest attainment." The first silver 8 Reales of the Spanish kings in the Americas have two hemispheres crowned, flanked by two crowned pillars with the boastful motto PLUS ULTRA on two scrolls. The prohibition still underlies Tennyson's *Ulysses*, "Beyond the utmost bound of human thought."

Strabo 3.5.5-7 offers a selection of geographical identifications of the legendary Pillars. Like the Hebrews, Greeks saw the pillars as gates to the Sea, and props of earth and sky. On any structurally sound cosmology, pillars at one point only in the circumference of Ocean could not hold up the sky-hemisphere. In fact we hear of pillars of Heracles also in Pontus (Servius on *Aen.* 11.262), Germany (Tacitus, *Germ.* 34) and India (Strabo 3.5.6)—columns of Ashoka? Hesychius³⁴ says that some reckoned three pillars and some four.

Appropriately then Prov 9,1 has:

חֲכָמוֹת בְּנִתּוּתָהּ בֵּיתָהּ חֲצֵבָה עֲמֻדֶיהָ שִׁבְעָה

"Wisdom has built her house, she has set up her seven pillars (LXX στύλους, Vg *columnas*)." What can her house be but the whole cosmos? Thus both in Israel and Hellas the universe is seen as a circular temple with pillars supporting a domed metal roof—what the Greeks called a *tholos* (*Odyssey* 22.442). Hadrian rebuilt Agrippa's circular temple into the Pantheon, a microcosm at the heart of Empire; Dio Cassius 53.27.2 says that "being in form a *tholos* it resembles the sky," *θολοειδὲς ὄν τῷ οὐρανῷ προσείκειν*.³⁵ The capitals of the pillars put up in it by Agrippa were of "Syracusan [bronze]," Pliny 34.13. The Caryatids by Diogenes of Athens were much praised (*in columnis templi eius Caryatides probantur inter pauca operum*, Pliny 36.38); they must at least have appeared to hold up the roof. It had Hellenistic prototypes

33 OED s.v. *ne plus ultra*.

34 Hesychius s.v. *stelas distomous*; ed. Schmidt (1862) no. 1815, iv.78. M. R. Cataudella, "Quante erano le colonne d'Ercole?," *Annali*, Univ. di Macerata, 22-23 (1989/90) 315-337, doubles each pillar at Gibraltar.

35 For the symbolism of the dome see further H. M. Howe, "The dome of Clement," *TAPA* 97 (1966) 261-273.

as at Magnesia about 195 BC, where one is to conduct a procession "bearing statues of all twelve gods in most fair garments, and to set up a *tholos* in the agora beside the altar of the twelve gods."³⁶ Eustathius³⁷ thinks that the pillars of Heracles may be statues (ἀνδριάντες) or cities or hills named after him.

Atlas varies between man, mountain and pillar. Heracles in one story sets up his own pillars; in another he temporarily takes the place of Atlas. In his supplementary eleventh labor (Apollodorus 2.5.11) he sends Atlas to gather the apples of the Hesperides for him while he takes up the burden of the sky; Atlas is unwilling to resume it, but Heracles tricks him by asking to get a pad for his head. An extant metope from the temple of Zeus at Olympia shows Heracles holding up the sky (with the pad already in place!) aided by Athena while Atlas brings him the apples. (See also the vase discussed in 3.4 below.) On the "chest of Cypselus" (Pausanias 5.18.4) Atlas is simultaneously holding up the sky and carrying the apples. The pillars of Job 26,11 are morally responsible.

A natural expression of this variation would be to represent pillars in human form. The fluting of columns, originally representing trees or papyrus, can be transformed into female drapery; the Caryatides of the Erechtheum at Athens are a natural development of the Ionic column. The use of the male figure in architecture is more baldly symbolic. Vitruvius 6.7.6 says that "representations of the male figure supporting brackets or cornices are called *telamones* in Latin [originally Greek also], *atlantes* in Greek," *si qua uirili figura signa mutulos aut coronas sustinent, nostri telamones appellant... Graeci uero eos atlantes uocitant*. A silver τελαμών supports Achilles' cosmic shield (*Iliad* 18.480). Hieron II of Syracuse had a great ship incorporating Doric architectural elements, including *atlantes* (Athenaeus 5.208B). Architectural *atlantes* are best known from the colossal Doric temple of Zeus Olympius at Acragas; one of the figures, much corroded, was restored in the 19th century, 7.6 m. high.

3.3 The Phoenicians in Gades

Gades is shown to have been Phoenician-speaking in 250 BC by its nice silver coinage: obverse, "Heracles" in lion's head; reverse, pair of tuna-fish

36 O. Kern, *Die Inschriften von Magnesia am Maeander* (1900) no. 98.41-44 = F. Sokolowski, *LSAM* no. 33.41-44, p. 94.

37 Eustathius on Dionysius Periegetes 64, *GGM* ii.228.

and the legends מבעל (obscure) and אנדר, with variations.³⁸ אנדר is evidently the city-name; the prefix may be the definite article. We have a Phoenician inscription from Cádiz (KAI 71) of a somewhat later date, and the inscribed "seated Astarte" from Seville of perhaps the 5th century BC.³⁹ Pliny 4.120,⁴⁰ followed by later writers, says that *Gadir* means "wall" in Punic; this is Hebrew גדר. Several Biblical cities are called Gedor or the like; and so the strongly Hellenized Gadara of the Decapolis (Pliny 5.74 etc.). Gadeira is first named in Pindar, *Nem.* 4.69 (abrupt in context):

Γαδείρων τὸ πρὸς ζόφον οὐ περατόν· ἀπότρεπε
αὐτίς Εὐρώπαν ποτὶ χέρσον ἔντεα ναός.

"That which lies on the dark westward of Gadeira is impassable; turn your ship's gear back to the continent Europe." Gadeira was said to be specifically a Tyrian colony;⁴¹ Velleius 1.2.3 dates its founding 80 years after the Trojan War and before Utica. The city known to Pindar was certainly Phoenician, and old enough then to have been heard of by Hebrew poets.

Surprisingly, no Semitic form of *Utica*, Ἰτύκη (Scylax 111),⁴² is recorded. Pseudo-Aristotle *de mir. aus.* 134 says it was founded by Phoenicians 287 years before Carthage. Hence its name might mean "Old City" as opposed to the "New City" of Carthage (קרתחדשת KAI 68.2). And in fact see the adjective קתיק "old" in Biblical Aramaic (Dan 7,9) with its mysterious similarity to *antiquus*. Vergil's *urbs antiqua* (*Aen.* 1.12), i.e. Carthage, would apply even better to Utica/Ityke.

There was a great sanctuary at Gades to a figure called in Greek "Heracles." It is discussed at length by Bonnet in her magisterial study of Heracles/Melqarth.⁴³ Silius *Punica* 3.17-31 describes the barefoot priests wearing linen dress with a purple stripe. Appian *Iberica* 2: "It appears also that the Phoenicians founded the temple of Heracles at the Pillars; the cult is even now conducted in the Phoenician manner, and their god is not the Theban Heracles, but the Heracles of the Tyrians."⁴⁴ Strabo 3.5.5 says that many people think the famous Pillars are really "the bronze pillars eight cubits high in the Heracleion of Gadeira, on which stands inscribed the cost of building the temple." This interpretation must be what visiting tourists were

38 B. V. Head, *Historia Numorum* (1910) 3.

39 E. Puech, "L'Inscription phénicienne du trône d'Astart à Séville," *Rivista di Studi Fenici* 5 (1977) 85-92; photo in DCPD 47.

40 = Ephorus, Jacoby FGH 70 F 129a.

41 Mela 3.46; Strabo 3.5.5; for the city see DCPD 181.

42 GGM i.89; for Utica see DCPD 489.

43 Corinne Bonnet, *Melqart: Cultes et mythes de l'Héraclès tyrien en Méditerranée*; *Studia Phoenicia* 8 (1988); 203-236.

44 Similarly Diodorus 5.20.2; Justin 44.5.2.

told; probably then the text was unintelligible, i.e. Punic. Pliny 2.242 describes them as *Herculis columnas Gadibus sacratas*.

Some idea of a more plausible text is given by two identical inscribed bilingual pillars from Malta of the 2nd century BC (KAI 47):

לאדנן למלקרת בעל צר אש נדר עבדך עבדאסר ואחי אסרשמר שן בן אסרשמר בן
עבדאסר כשמע קלם יברכם

ΔΙΟΝΥΣΙΟΣ ΚΑΙ ΣΑΡΑΠΙΩΝ ΟΙ ΣΑΡΑΠΙΩΝΟΣ ΤΥΡΙΟΙ ΗΡΑΚΛΕΙ ΑΡΧΗΓΕΤΕΙ

Punic: "To our lord Melqart, Baal of Tyre; that which was dedicated by thy servant 'Abd-Osir ('Servant of Osiris') and his brother Osir-shamar ('Osiris has preserved'), the two sons of Osir-shamar the son of 'Abd-Osir; because he heard their voice. May he bless them." Greek: "Dionysius and Sarapion the sons of Sarapion, Tyrians, to Heracles the Founder." The names illustrate how Egyptian cult infiltrated Phoenician as well as Hellenistic culture. Dionysius / 'Abd-Osir is the elder son, named after his grandfather by "papponymy" and mentioned first. The "synod of Tyrian merchants and captains" at Delos in 153/2 BC refer to Heracles as "founder of the fatherland," ΑΡΧΗΓΟΥ ΤΗΣ ΠΑΤΡΙΔΟΣ.⁴⁵ Nonnus 40.430ff gives a founding legend of Tyre in which Heracles fixes the previously floating island. For Heracles as ἀρχηγέτης of Sparta see Xenophon *Hell.* 6.3.6; as ἀρχηγός of Tarsus, Dio Chrys. 33.47; for Jesus as ἀρχηγός of life, Act 3,15; 5,31.

The Phoenician name of this Heracles was known to Greeks through Philo of Byblos: Μέλκαρθος ὁ καὶ Ἡρακλῆς.⁴⁶ He appears in the curses of Esarhaddon's treaty with king Baal of Tyre,⁴⁷ "May Milqart (^d *Mi-il-qar-tu*) and Eshmun (^d *Ia-su-mu-nu*) give your land over to pillage"; and is known since the 9th century BC from an Aramaic stele of a Bar-Hadad "king of Aram" at Aleppo (KAI 201). It does not seem wholly demonstrated that מלקרת is contracted from *מלך קרת and means "king of the city"; for it is never so explained, the uncontracted form never appears, and the contraction has no parallel. However for so naming a heroic figure I can cite the son of Hector, Ἄστυνάξ (*Iliad* 22.500), also "king of the city." We are told that "the sepulchre of Hercules was shown at Tyre, where he was cremated," [*sepulcrum*] *Herculis apud Tyrum, ubi igni crematus est.*⁴⁸ Arnobius (*adv. Nat.* 1.36.5): *Thebanus aut Tyrius Hercules, hic in finibus sepultus Hispaniae, flammis alter concrematus Oetaeis*: "...the Theban or Tyrian Hercules, the latter buried in the regions of Spain, the former cremated in the flames of Mount Oeta." There is also some indication that the god's burning was

45 F. Durrbach, *Choix d'Inscriptions de Délos*, I [all pub.] (1921), no. 85, p. 140.

46 Jacoby FGH 790 F 2.27 = Eusebius *Praep. Ev.* 1.10.27.

47 R. Borger, *Die Inschriften Asarhaddons Königs von Assyrien*; *Archiv für Orientforschung Beiheft* 9 (1956-1967), 109.

48 *Recog. Clem.* 10.24 (Migne PG 1.1434).

reenacted at Gades. Pausanias 10.4.6: Cleon of Magnesia "said that once he had been at Gadeira, and he and the rest of the crowd had sailed from the island according to the command of Heracles. When they came back to Gadeira, they found a sea-man cast ashore; he was about 5 plethra long, and burning because he had been struck by a thunderbolt from the god." There is thus a general parallel between the death by fire of Melqarth and that of Greek Heracles (for which see p. 188 below).

If the god in fact died, necessarily in cult he would have to be revived, no doubt annually. Josephus *con. Ap.* 1.116, quoting Menander of Ephesus: Eiomos of Tyre (Biblical Hiram) "first brought about the *egersis* of Heracles in the month Peritios," *πρώτος τε τοῦ Ἡρακλέους ἔγερσιν ἐποιήσατο ἐν τῷ Περιτίῳ μηνί.*⁴⁹ We might translate "had begun the erection of [the temple of] Heracles." But an inscription from Philadelphia ('Amman) of Jordan⁵⁰ supports the first interpretation: "The Council and People honor Maphtan (Martan?) son of Diogenes, gymnasiarch (ΓΥΜΝΑΣΙΑΡΧΟΝ)⁵¹..., *raiser of Heracles* (ἘΓΕΡΣΕ[ΙΤΗΝ ΤΟΥ?] ἩΡΑΚΛΕΟΥ[Σ])...." For the office of gymnasiarch is permanent. These texts so read suggest the meaning "awakener of the divinity" for Phoenician *אלם מקם* at Rhodes (KAI 44), Carthage (KAI 90 etc), Numidia (*אלם מיקם* KAI 161.4), and on Cyprus.⁵² Then also they identify the divinity with Heracles-Melqarth. That he was awakened from death rather than just sleep is suggested by the Phoenician gold lamella of Pyrgi (KAI 277 [Nachtrag] 8-9) *אלם בים קבר אלם* apparently "in the day of the burial of the divinity."

Sleep is the next closest thing to Death, in fact its brother, *ὕπνω ... κασιγνήτῳ Θανάτῳ* (*Iliad* 14.231).⁵³ A proper god ought not to sleep at all, much less die. "Behold, he that keeps Israel will neither slumber nor sleep" (Ps 121,4)

הַגֵּה לֹא-יָנוּם וְלֹא יִישָׁן שׁוֹמֵר יִשְׂרָאֵל

-
- 49 See the discussion in Bonnet 33-40 and Briquel-Chatonnet 306-309. I follow the text of Menander in Jacoby *FGH* 783 frag. 1.
- 50 IGLS 21; Pierre-Louis Gatier, *Inscriptions de la Jordanie*; BAH 114 (1986) no. 29 p. 51; see the discussion of previous editions by Bonnet pp. 145-6. Gatier himself reads *ἔγερσε[ίτην τοῦ] Ἡρακλε[ί]ου* and translates "constructeur de l'Héracléion"; but this seems less probable.
- 51 The *γυμνασίαρχος* "superintendent of athletics," a regular office in classical Athens, becomes part of the Mediterranean lingua franca: Cicero (*Ver.* 2.4.92) speaks of a *gymnasiarchus*, and *גמנסירכס* appears in a fragmentary inscription from Palmyra (J. Starcky, *Inventaire des Inscriptions de Palmyre*, fasc. 10: l'Agora [1949] no. 102).
- 52 Bonnet, Melqart p. 333.
- 53 See the comparison of Sleep and Death by E. Vermeule, *Aspects of Death in Early Greek Art and Poetry* (1979) 145-154.

So⁵⁴ "The eye of Zeus⁵⁵ does not sleep, and is near even though far off,"

... οὐχ εὕδει Διὸς

ὀφθαλμός, ἐγγύς δ' ἐστὶ καίπερ ὦν πρόσω.

Elijah taunts the prophets of Baal "Perhaps he is sleeping, and must be waked up" (I Reg 18,27): אֵלֵי יְשׁוּ הוּא וַיִּקְרָן. This Baal in fact may be Melqarth, the "Baal of Tyre." But Hebrews so speak of their own god also. "Awake, awake (עוֹרֵר), put on strength, O arm of Yahweh" (Isa 51,9). Baal may be "musing, or gone aside [to relieve himself], or on a journey" (I Reg 18,27); Yahweh may be in a drunken stupor, "Then the Lord awoke like a sleeper, like a hero sobering up(?) from wine" (Ps 78,65):

וַיִּקְרָן כְּיֵשׁוּ אֲדֹנָי כְּגִבּוֹר מִתְרוֹגֵן מִיַּיִן

And there is need for a liturgy to arouse the sleeping divinity, "Wake up! Why are you sleeping, O Lord? Awake! Do not cast us off forever" (Ps 44,24):

עוֹרֵר לְמָה תִישָׁן אֲדֹנָי הַקִּיצָה אֶל־תִּזְנַח לְנֹצָה

There is a beautiful parallel in the cult attributed to Demetrius at Athens in 291 BC where the choruses sang that "he was the only true god, while the others are sleeping or on a journey or nonexistent," μόνος θεὸς ἀληθινός, οἱ δ' ἄλλοι καθεύδουσιν ἢ ἀποδημοῦσιν ἢ οὐκ εἰσίν (Athenaeus 6.253C).⁵⁶

The two temple-pillars at Gades are surely derived from the two στῆλαι, probably free-standing, of the principal temple of "Heracles" at Tyre (Herodotus 2.44.2); one of "refined gold," one of "emerald stone (σμαράγδου λίθου) shining strongly at night." There was also a gold pillar in the "temple of Zeus" at Tyre,⁵⁷ said to have been a statue of Hiram's daughter⁵⁸—an Oriental prototype of the Caryatid. Ez 28,12-13 associates nine jewels (one, בְּרָקֶת, perhaps the origin of σμαράγδος) with the "prince" of Tyre—again very likely Melqarth.⁵⁹ Various late witnesses⁶⁰ attest to the symbolic origins of the pillars at Tyre. The two free-standing pillars of Solomon's temple (I Reg 7,15-21) were likewise probably adapted from a Phoenician prototype. Their names בְּרָקֶת and בְּצֵז are of uncertain meaning; their connection with the

54 In a tragic fragment, *Trag. adespot.* 485 Nauck = Radt TrGF ii.140.

55 For "the eye of Zeus" and "the eye of Yahweh" see my "Men of the Land...", ZAW 95 (1983) 376-402, p. 379 fn 16 and p. 272 below.

56 He cites Demochares, FGH 75 F 2. Athenaeus goes on to cite the actual hymn from Duris of Samos (FGH 76 F 13), where however "sleeping" is omitted, and I wonder if Athenaeus can have known the LXX of I Kings.

57 Menander, Jacoby FGH 783 F 1.118 = Josephus *con. Ap.* 1.118; Eupolemus, FGH 723 F 2b 34.16 = Eusebius *Praep. Ev.* 9.34.16.

58 Theophilus, FGH 733 F1 = Eusebius *Praep. Ev.* 9.34.19.

59 See Chapter 2.8 for the international jewel-name *jasper*.

60 See the original version of this essay, TAPA 99 (1968) 50.

cast bronze "sea" standing on twelve bulls (I Reg 7,23ff) suggests a symbolic picture of the Mediterranean cosmos.

Yahweh in his function as shaker of the pillars has as Greek counterpart Poseidon "Earthshaker." Tyre with its tall buildings was particularly vulnerable to earthquake (Strabo 16.2.23; Lucan 3.217 *Tyros instabilis*; Isa 23,11). There is a close Greek equivalent to the Hebrew fear of cosmic collapse in Pindar, *Paean* 4.37-40 (king Euxantius of Crete speaking):

τρέω τοι πόλεμον Διὸς Ἐννοσίδαν τε βαρύκτυπον,
 χθόνα τοί ποτε καὶ στρατὸν ἄθρόον
 πέμψαν κεραυνῶ τριόδοντί τε
 ἐς τὸν βαθὺν Τάρταρον

"I fear the war of Zeus, and Earthshaker of deep roar; they once sent the earth and the whole host [of Titans] by lightning and trident down to deep Tartarus." Elsewhere⁶¹ I have gathered testimonies to Syrian deities as responsible for earthquake.

Samson in doublet stories pulls down the two posts of the city gate of Gaza (Jud 16,3) and the pillars of the temple of Dagon (Jud 16,30). His name in Hebrew suggests the sun; his locks, shorn and growing back, the sun's rays. A plausible interpretation of the Western pillars would then be that a sun-god went through them into his house or pulled them down at sunset. This is almost said by Silius, *Punica* 10.537-8:

donec anhelantes stagna in Tartessia Phoebus
 mersit equos...

"until Phoebus brings his panting horses down into the waters of Tartessus." Now further, we saw above that Pindar (in Strabo 3.5.5) calls the Pillars "gates of Gadeira," πύλας Γαδειρίδας. The area of darkness in the West in both societies is assimilated to the gloomy underworld. At *Odyssey* 24.11-12 Hermes conducts the souls of the Suitors past the "streams of Ocean," Ὠκεανοῦ τε ροάς, the mysterious "white rock," and the "gates of the Sun," παρ' Ἡελίοιο πύλας.⁶² We saw also (Hesiod, *Theog.* 749-750) how Night and Day meet at the "great bronze threshold." When Patroclus asks Achilles to bury him, he says "let me pass by the gates of Hades" (*Iliad* 23.71),⁶³ πύλας Ἄϊδαο περήσω; for the house of Hades is broad-gated, εὐρύπυλές Ἄϊδος δῶ (*Iliad* 23.74 = *Odyssey* 11.571). Cassandra echoes this at Aeschylus *Agam.* 1291 Ἄϊδου πύλας.

Of the sick it is said (Ps 107,18, cf. 9,14) "and they drew near the gates of death," תַּנְּחֵם יְרֵי־שָׁרָיָה לַחַיִּים, LXX καὶ ἤγγισαν ἕως τῶν πύλων τοῦ θανάτου,

61 My *The Lebanon and Phoenicia* vol. I [all pub.] (1969) 114-122.

62 A. Heubeck in the Oxford *Odyssey* iii.360: "The sun god steers his team of horses through the πύλαι Ἡελίοιο after the sun has set."

63 Cf. *Iliad* 5.646, 9.312.

Jer. iux. Hebr. *et accesserunt ad portas mortis*. At Job 38,17 the "gates of death," מַנְתֵּי צְלָמוֹת are parallel to the "gates of darkness," מַנְתֵּי צְלָמוֹת. Hezekiah in his psalm (Isa 38,10) says "I am confined in the gates of Sheol,"

יְצַרְי לְאֵשׁ פְּקֻדָּתִי

where the LXX in a beautiful Homeric reminiscence has ἐν πύλαις ἄδου, Vg *ad portas inferi*,⁶⁴ Luther *des Totenreiches Pforten*. Thus when Jesus says (Matt 16,18) that the "gates of Hades" will not prevail against the church, πύλαι ἄδου, Vg *portae inferi*, Syriac ܕܫܘܘܠܝܢܐ ܕܥܘܠܡܝܢܐ, Luther *die Pforten der Hölle*, Matthew's echo of the LXX in fact brings him back to Homer.⁶⁵

3.4 The Pillars as scene of dragon-combat

A series of Greek texts locates a battle with a dragon at the various sites of the Pillars.⁶⁶

(a) *Typhos at Aetna*. Pindar (*Pyth.* 1.15-20) symbolizes by Typhos the barbarians (Etruscans and Carthaginians) defeated at Himera and Cumae, and imagines him as the related volcanoes Vesuvius and Aetna.⁶⁷

Τυφῶς ἑκατοντακάρανος, τόν ποτε

Κιλικίον θρέψεν πολυώνυμον ἄντρον ...

"Hundred-headed Typhos, whom once the Cilician cave of many names nourished..."

... κίων δ' οὐρανία συνέχει,

νιφόεσσ' Αἴτνα, πανέτης

χιόνος ὀξείας τιθήνα

"a heavenly pillar holds him down, frosty Aetna, the year-round nurse of sharp snow." The sky-pillar serves among other things to confine the underground dragon. In Chapter 2 we studied the texts about Typhos or Typhon from the point of view of Zeus' weapon (and Yahweh's too).

Aeschylus, probably using Pindar, has Prometheus (*PV* 348-350) lament the fate of his brother Atlas, comparing it with that of Typhon (Τυφῶνα):

... "Ἀτλαντος, ὃς πρὸς ἑσπέρους τόπους

ἔστηκε κίων' οὐρανοῦ τε καὶ χθονὸς

ᾧμοις ἐρείδων, ἄχθος οὐκ εὐάγκαλον

64 The Greek of the LXX appears further at Sap Sol 16,13; Ps Sol 16,2; III Makk 5,51.

65 For further Greek and Latin parallels see H. Hommel, "Die Tore des Hades," ZNW 80 (1989) 124-5.

66 Many of these materials, together with their Oriental parallels, are treated in J. Fontenrose, *Python: A Study of Delphic Myth and its Origins* (1959, repr. 1974).

67 Strabo 5.4.9 observes that Pindar (correctly) presumes a connected chain of volcanic activity from Naples to Sicily.

"Atlas, who stands by the western regions, holding up the pillar of heaven and earth on his shoulders, not an easy burden." The poet found the fates of Atlas and Prometheus already compared in Hesiod, *Theog.* 517-525. The beautiful black-figured vase of the Arcesilas painter in the Vatican collection, about 555 BC, shows Atlas at the left holding up the heaven, and Prometheus tied to a column at the right, attacked by the eagle.⁶⁸ Prometheus is then reminded how he saw Typhon punished (*PV* 351),

τὸν γηγενῆ τε Κιλικίων οἰκήτορα
 "the earthborn dweller of Cilicia"; he is hundred-headed (vs 353 ἑκατογκάρων) and put down (*PV* 365) "under the roots of Aetna," ῥίζαισιν Αἰτναίαις ὕπο.

(b) *The dragon of the Hesperides.* We saw that Heracles' eleventh labor was to steal (vicariously through Atlas) the golden apples from the garden of the Hesperides (Hesiod *Theog.* 215). These are guarded by a dragon.⁶⁹ Apollodorus 2.5.11 describes it as "an immortal dragon, the offspring of Echidna with a hundred heads [cf. (a) above], which spoke with many and different voices." It is clearly assimilated to Typhon.

(c) *Geryon at Erytheia.* Heracles went to the island Erytheia, where he killed the three-headed herdsman Geryon (Hesiod *Theog.* 287) and drove off his oxen. Herodotus 4.8 as we saw locates Erytheia "off Gadeira which is outside the pillars of Heracles in Ocean."

(d) *Ophion at Tartessus.* Scholiast A on *Iliad* 8.479:⁷⁰

When Zeus deposed his father Kronos from his kingdom and assumed the rule over the gods, the Giants, sons of Earth, in resentment prepare a great battle against Zeus in Tartessus (a city by Ocean). Zeus engages and defeats them, relegates them to Erebus, and grants his father Kronos rule over them all. And he defeated Ophion who thought himself superior to all, and put on him the mountain which is named Ophionion after him.

Herodotus (1.163) surely thought Tartessus a real city outside the Pillars (4.152); but it has proved quite undiscoverable, like the equally mysterious Tarshish of the Hebrew Bible. The mountain might be the island Ophioussa (Strabo 3.5.1), modern Formentera south of Ibiza within the Mediterranean. Pherecydes⁷¹ had said there was a bet between Kronos and Ophioneus that

68 The Vatican Collections: The Papacy and Art (1983) p. 185 no. 101; C. M. Stibbe, *Lakonische Vasenmaler des sechsten Jahrhunderts v. Chr.* (1972) no. 196 plate 63.

69 Euripides *Herc. Furens* 394-399; Pausanias 6.19.8; Ovid *Met.* 4.637ff.

70 Ed. G. Dindorf (1875) i.292.1ff.

71 Celsus in Origen *con. Celsum* 6.42 = Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ 7 B4; cf. Philo of Byblos, FGH 790 F 4.50 = Eusebius *Praep. Ev.* 1.10.50. See the new edition by Hermann S. Schibli, *Pherecydes of Syros* (1990) frags. 78-80.

whoever got pushed into "Ogenos" (Ocean) was the loser. Thallus⁷² says that Ogygos when defeated also fled to Tartessus.

Perhaps it will be granted that there is a common mythical motif here in Greek, where alternatively Zeus and Heracles defeat a dragon at the Pillars. It has a precise parallel in Hebrew. We saw at Job 26,10-13 how the trembling and rebuke of the Pillars is immediately followed by the wounding of Rahab. The parallelism identifies her with the Sea, her defeat implies its stilling and the dispelling of stormclouds. We also saw (Job 9,6) how Yahweh "shakes the earth out of its place and its pillars tremble"; a little further on (9,13) we read: *תַּחְתּוֹ שָׁחֲחוּ עֲזָרֵי רַהַב* "beneath him bowed the helpers of Rahab" (LXX *κἀῆτη τὰ ὑπ' οὐρανόν*). Yahweh as killer of Leviathan and Tannin appears at Isa 27,1—a text taken from a Canaanite original attested at Ugarit (Chapter 2.5 above).

The killing of the dragon is simply one aspect of the original fixing of boundaries for the primordial Sea. Thus at Ps 74,13-14.17

אַתָּה פּוֹרַרְתָּ בְּעֶזְךָ יָם
 שִׁבַרְתָּ רִאשֵׁי תַנִּינִים עַל־הַמַּיִם
 אַתָּה רִצַּצְתָּ רִאשֵׁי לְוִיָּתָן
 תַּתַּנְנֵנוּ מֵאֲכָל לֶעָם לְצִיִּים ...
 אַתָּה הִצַּבְתָּ כָּל־גְּבוּלוֹת אֶרֶץ

"You divided the Sea by your might, you broke the heads of the Tanninim (LXX *δρακόντων*) upon the waters. You crushed the heads of Leviathan (LXX *δράκοντος*, Vg *Leuiathan*), you gave him as food to the people of the wilderness(?). ... You fixed all the bounds of the earth." Leviathan or Tannin has numerous heads like Typhon and the guardian of the apples. Ugaritic *Ltn* has seven heads (p. 79 above), *šlyt d šb't rašm*.⁷³ A famous cylinder seal of about 2300-2200 BC from Tell Asmar⁷⁴ in Iraq shows two gods attacking a fiery dragon with seven heads (three active, four inoperative). The dragon of Rev 12,3 and the beast of 13,1, each with ten horns and seven heads, are drawn from sources unknown to us. The edibility of sea-monsters appears in apocalypses of uncertain date.⁷⁵ In Ps 89,9-11 the crushing of Rahab/Yam is connected with creation. At Isa 51,9-10 the slaying of Rahab/Tannin is historicized as the drying up of the Flood and the passage through the Red Sea or Jordan. The dragon must be killed before the cosmos can be stabilized and history proceed.

72 Theophilus *ad Autol.* 3.29 = FGH 256 F2.

73 Gordon UT 67.1.3 = KTU 1.5.1.3.

74 ANEP² p. 221 (no. 691), cf. no. 671 on a shell plaque.

75 Enoch 60,7-9.24 (J. H. Charlesworth, *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha* [1983] i.42); Syriac Baruch 29,4 (Charlesworth i.630); IV Esdras (Latin) 6,52 (Charlesworth i.536).

It is often presumed that underlying these passages is an original Yahwist creation-myth expunged from Genesis and parallel to *Enuma Eliš*. When Marduk kills Tiamat,⁷⁶

He split her like a shellfish into two parts:
Half of her he set up and ceiled it as sky,
Pulled down the bar and posted guards.

In Hebrew we can imagine the "waters above the firmament" as the upper half of Rahab, and the sea as the lower; the "bar and gates" of Job 38,10 (םִלְתַּתְּךָ הַיָּם, LXX κλειῖθρα καὶ πύλας) are clearly a barrier to keep the sea out.

Obviously the Straits of Gibraltar could be interpreted either as letting the Atlantic waters into the Mediterranean or keeping them out. Pliny 3.4 holds the first view: "the locals call [the facing mountains] Columns of that god [Hercules], and believe that when they were excavated they let in the previously excluded sea and thus changed the face of nature," *indigenae columnas eius dei uocant, creduntque perfossas exclusa antea admisisse maria et rerum naturae mutasse faciem*. In fact, on some geologic reconstructions, the present Mediterranean was a great valley below sea-level until the Atlantic broke through at Gibraltar. Diodorus 4.18.5 says that many held this view; and that Heracles likewise had previously drained the Thessalian plain by cutting the Peneius gorge—an act which Herodotus (7.129.4) rationalistically attributed to an earthquake mythologized as Poseidon the Earth-mover.

But Diodorus prefers an alternative which implies the Greek and Hebrew myth of the dragon-combat at the Pillars. Heracles, says Diodorus, built the Pillars as promontories from Libya and Europe towards each other, both as memorials of his campaigns and to narrow the passage, "so that by making it narrow and shallow the great whales might be prevented from passing out of Ocean into the inner Sea," ὅπως ἀλιτενοῦς καὶ στενοῦ γενομένου κωλύηται τὰ μεγάλα κήτη διεκπίπτειν ἐκ τοῦ ὠκεανοῦ πρὸς τὴν ἐντὸς θάλατταν. Pindar, in a unique passage where he calls the pillars κίονες (*Nem.* 3.20-24), has Heracles engage in combat with the sea-monsters:

... οὐκέτι πρόσω
ἀβάταν ἄλα κίωνων ὑπὲρ Ἡρακλέος περᾶν εὐμαρές,
ἦρωος θεὸς ἃς ἔθηκε ναυτιλίας ἐσχάτας
μάρτυρας κλυτάς· δάμασε δὲ θήρας ἐν πελάγεϊ
ὑπερόχους ...

"It is not a light matter to go beyond the impassable sea, beyond the Pillars of Heracles, which the hero god set as notable monuments of his farthest

76 *Enuma Eliš* 4.136-138, ANET³ 67.

voyage. He overcame the monsters that rose up in the deep." The Scholiast here⁷⁷ adds "he killed sea monsters like the *ketos*."

The dashing of Ocean against the rocks is mythologized as the futile resistance of the dragon to the hero; the pillars are bounds or "gates" of the sea. At Jer 5,22 sand is a "bound" (גְּבוּל, LXX ὄριον, Vg *terminum*) for the sea, a "perpetual barrier" (הַקֶּץ־עוֹלָם). We saw at Prov 8,28 that the waters themselves could be seen as disobedient element. None but Yahweh (Job 38,11) shut in the sea with doors and said, "Thus far shall you come and no farther, and here shall your proud waves be stayed":

עַד־פֶּה תָּבוֹא וְלֹא תִסָּיֵךְ וּפֹאֲרֵי־שֵׂית בְּגֵאוֹן גְּלִיךְ

Vg *usque huc uenies et non procedes amplius...*; Luther ...*hier sollen sich legen deine stolzen Wellen*.

In comparing Hebrew and Hellenic myth we seldom have so clear an indication of possible lines of transmission. We need only presume that Tyrian Melqarth has fallen heir to traits ascribed to Canaanite gods, the El or Baal of Ugarit. Abundant evidence shows that in the western Mediterranean Heracles has been given features of Melqarth. A double line of descent leads from Ugaritic mythology to Hebrew: by direct continuance, as in the verbal agreement between Isa 27,1 (p. 79 above) and Ugaritic; and by the period of syncretism in the time of Elijah.

3.5 The tuna and the tanniyn

Actually the Mediterranean is not always that much more peaceful than the Atlantic. The reality of cetaceans outside the Pillars needed no coloring by mythology or exaggeration from Phoenician monopolists to impress ancient sailors. And an adequate natural source for the motif of the dragon-combat exists in the migration of tuna through the Straits of Gibraltar—especially in view of their far greater abundance in antiquity. All the texts cited here and many others are gathered together in the definitive work of Thompson.⁷⁸

The coins of Gadeira are evidence enough of "fishermen who sail out from Gadeira" in the "outer sea."⁷⁹ In a work of uncertain date ascribed to Aristotle⁸⁰ we read:

77 Ed. A. B. Drachman (1903) iii.47.

78 D'Arcy Wentworth Thompson, *A Glossary of Greek Fishes* (1947) 79-90.

79 Aristides, *Orat.* 48 (Egyptian) ii.474 ed. Dindorf.

80 Pseudo-Aristotle, *de mir. auscult.* 136 = 844a24-35.

They say that the Phoenicians who colonized the place called Gadeira, sailing with the east wind (*Apeliotes*) outside the Pillars of Heracles for four days, arrived at certain deserted regions, full of rushes and seaweed (φύκος), which are not touched by the water at ebbtide but are submerged at fulltide. Here they find an exceptional number of tuna, incredible both in size and fatness, whenever they run ashore. They pickle these, store them in casks, and bring them back to Carthage. These are the only tuna which the Carthaginians do not export; they consume them themselves because of their excellent taste.

There is no question here of rumors of the Sargasso Sea, since it is coastal banks of seaweed or other plants that are described. Strabo (3.2.7) quoting a lost book of Polybius⁸¹ describes their feeding:

Much fat thick tuna comes here [to Turdetania, above Gadeira] from the opposite coast [Africa]. They feed on acorns of a dwarf "oak" that grows in the sea....⁸² When it ripens, the seacoast both inside and outside the Pillars is covered with its acorns washed up by the tides.... Polybius says that these acorns spread out as far as Latium—while allowing for the possibility that they are produced by Sardinia and the adjacent mainland. The nearer the tuna get to the Pillars, as they are carried in from the outside, the thinner they become as their food fails them. So this creature may be called a sea-hog. For it loves the acorn and grows fat on it; whenever there is a good crop of acorns there is a good crop of tuna.

These statements are confirmed by the gastronomic texts quoted in the seventh book of Athenaeus. Aristotle⁸³ knew that in summer the tuna had a parasite which made it jump out of the water into fishing-boats. Hence Theodoridas (Athenaeus 7.302C):

θύννοι τε διοιστρήσονται
Γαδείρων δρόμον

"And tuna will dart gadflied through its course past Gadeira." Athenaeus 3.116C quotes verses of Euthydemus describing the "huge tuna hearts" (ὀγκύνοιο τρίγωνα) from Gadeira or Tarentum, packed tightly in casks and brought by Bruttian or Campanian ships—ancestor of canned tuna-chunks. Thompson as his frontispiece illustrates a charming Campanian comic vase of a tunny-merchant. Tyrian merchants in Jerusalem in the fifth century BC sold fish on the Sabbath (Neh 13,16)—probably *marīæ*, an important source of iodine. (So the tuna sandwiches in our children's school lunchboxes in

81 Polybius 34.7; same extract less fully given in Athenaeus 7.302C.

82 Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 4.6.4 refers to similar plants. Hort in the Loeb Theophrastus (ii.446) thinks the sea-oaks of Polybius are seaweed, *Cytoseira ericoides* and *Sargassum vulgare*. Prof. Sebastiano Genovese ("Il tonno, la sua storia e la sua vita," Atti, Società Peloritana di Scienze Fisiche Matematiche e Naturali 2.3 [1956] 3-11, reprint kindly sent me by the author) thinks it the seed-plant *Posidonia Caulinii*.

83 *Hist. An.* 602a25.

Beirut were not a mere Americanism, but had a respectable ancestry.) Similarly Athenaeus 7.315CD:

The *orkynos* (giant tuna). Dorion, in *On Fishes*, says that the *orkynoi* make their way from the [Atlantic] Sea at the Pillars of Heracles and come into our sea. Hence very many are taken in the Iberian and Etruscan seas, whence they disperse to other seas. Hicesius says that those caught at Gadeira are fatter; and next after them, those caught in Sicily. But those a long ways from the Pillars of Heracles are lacking in fat because they have swum a longer distance.

Today the bluefin tuna (*Thunnus thynnus* Linn.) appear in summer at Cádiz in two states. In May and June they appear from the Atlantic, very fat and with gonads ripening, the *derecho* "coming season" of Spanish fishermen. In July and August they proceed west through the Straits (the *revés*, "return season") and up the Spanish coast, thin (15% lighter) and with gonads in post-spawning state.⁸⁴ Studies at Messina indicate that in fact they refuse food when at sexual maturity.⁸⁵ In ancient and medieval times they were unquestionably more abundant and bigger than today.⁸⁶ Careful records have been kept in Spain; one fishery in 1552 produced 99,000 fish in the yearly catch which may net 5,000 today.⁸⁷ All the phenomena described by the ancient sources are consistent with the present picture on a scale ten times as great. Here is one of the few concrete records of environmental degradation extending back for more than two millennia. (It is comparable only to the evidence for the deforestation of the Lebanon; the emperor Hadrian placed hundreds of markers IMP. HADR. AVG. DEFINITIO SILVARVM ON the mountain slopes where today there is nothing but sun-baked shale.⁸⁸) The fish must have made Gades very wealthy indeed. In fact they were the one contact of the Mediterranean peoples with the American continent: for tuna marked off the Bahamas have been taken at Bergen and Narvik in

-
- 84 Julio Rodríguez-Roda, "Biología del Atún..." *Investigación Pesquera* 25 (Barcelona 1964) 33-146.
- 85 Sebastiano Genovese, "Sul regime alimentare di *Thunnus thynnus* (L.)," *Bollettino di Pesce, Piscicoltura e Idrobiologia* 36 (n.s. 15) fasc. 2 (1960) 177-188 (Roma 1962).
- 86 Aristotle *Hist. Anim.* 8.30 (607b31) describes an old fish of 15 talents (ab. 1125 lbs.); the biggest fish of many hundreds reported by Rodríguez-Roda was 425 kg (1045 lbs). Prof. Rodríguez-Roda kindly writes me (letter of April 25, 1964) "Sí, creo que la población atunera haya descendido, ya que los medios de captura actuales son muchos más che los antiguos."
- 87 Luis Lozano Y Rey, *Peces fisoclistos, Subserie Toracicos, seg. part. Ordenes Labri-formes y Escombriformes = Memorias de la Real Academia de Ciencias exactas, físicas y naturales de Madrid; serie de ciencias naturales* 14 (1952) 501-512.
- 88 The inscriptions have been collected by Jean-François Breton in *IGLS VIII,3 Les Inscriptions forestières d'Hadrien dans le Mont Liban* (1980).

Norway in as little as 50 days; and fish tagged at Cape Cod and Bergen recovered off Cádiz and in the Bay of Biscay.⁸⁹

The participation of Phoenicians in the tuna-fishery left an unmistakable name behind in the Mediterranean. Strabo 6.2.1 attests Greek Πάχυνος as the southern cape of Sicily, cf. Vergil *Aen.* 3.669 *saxa Pachyni*. Numerous ancient sources describe the catch from Gades to Sicily, the watchpoints along the coasts (Strabo 17.3.16 θυννοσκοπεῖον), and the fishing by means similar to the complex net, *tonnara*, of today. The great Brazilian photographer Sebastião Salgado⁹⁰ has documented one of the two remaining tuna-sweeps at Trapani of Sicily. Its association with the Holy Week liturgy and ritual features mark it as of indefinite antiquity—a true descendant of the well-documented ancient practice. Over-fishing and the progressive pollution of the Mediterranean have reduced the catch to a small fraction of what it once was. As the tuna swept in from Gibraltar and around Sicily to the eastern Mediterranean, Pachynos was a key point for the fishing. Thus Solinus 5.6 (cf. Athenaeus 1.4C) *Pachyno multa thynnorum inest copia ac propterea semper captura larga*, "At Pachynus there is great abundance of tuna and hence the catch is always large." Since Strabo attests that there was no town there, nothing can have existed on land to justify a name but a lookout point for the tuna fishery. This strongly supports the beautiful comparison of Lewy⁹¹ with Isa 23:13 Q בְּחִינֵי "its watchtowers."

Aristotle knows the tuna mainly in the Black Sea,⁹² the wealth of Byzantium came in large part from this fishery (Strabo 7.6.2, Tacitus *Ann.* 12.63). Schliemann found a layer of tuna-bones (with supposed sharks) at Troy.⁹³ The fish was important at Sinope (Strabo 12.3.11,19); Cyzicus⁹⁴ in the sixth century BC minted electrum staters with a tuna head.⁹⁵ Even so our sources agree that the tuna going through the Hellespont and Bosphorus were comparatively small; the lower salinity of the Black Sea and its cyclic production of hydrogen sulphide prevent its being a permanent home for the species.⁹⁶

89 Julio Rodríguez-Roda, "Movimientos migratorios del atún....," Publicaciones Técnicas de la Junta de Estudios de Pesca, Ministerio de Comercio, Dirección general de pesca marítima, Pub. num. 3 (Madrid 1964) 279-304.

90 Workers: An Archaeology of the Industrial Age (1993) 103-119.

91 Lewy 15.

92 Aristotle, *Hist. Anim.* 6.17, 571a8-23 etc.

93 H. Schliemann, *Ilios* (1881) 318.

94 B. V. Head, *Historia Numorum* (1910) 523.

95 See Jacques Dumont, "La pêche du thon à Byzance à l'époque hellénistique," *REA* 78-79 (1976-1977) 96-120.

96 Curt Rosswig, "Some Biological Aspects of Fishery Work in Turkey," Publications of the Hydrobiological Research Institute of the Faculty of Science of the Univ. of Istanbul 1.3 (1953) 215-223.

Oppian, *Hal.* 3.620-648, describes the migration from the Atlantic to Sicily; Aelian, *Nat. Anim.* 15.3 etc. alleges migration from Sicily to the Black Sea. Prof. E. Postel⁹⁷ kindly informs me that in his opinion there is no possibility of migration between the Atlantic and the Black Sea. However, I wonder if over-fishing may not have broken up a former more extensive migration-pattern of which the Gibraltar and Hellespont migrations were only parts.⁹⁸

Aristotle⁹⁹ was well aware that the dolphin, porpoise (MSS φώκη, read φώκαινα?) and whale (φάλαινα), all of which he classifies as κήτη, have breasts and produce milk. Nevertheless in popular usage the tuna is called a cetacean.¹⁰⁰ Arcestratus (Athenaeus 7.301F) says that the Samians call the tuna *orkys*, but others call it *kētos*. Oppian (*Hal.* 1.369) among the species of κήτεα includes ἐν δὲ μέλαν θύννων ζαμενὲς γένος. Strabo 3.2.7 observes that κήτη are bigger in the Atlantic. Cf. Horace *Serm.* 2.5.44:

plures adnabunt thynni et cetaria crescent.

Scymnus 162¹⁰¹ says generally that Gadeira is where the biggest κήτη are found. Sharks and whales being rare, the tuna (with the scarcer swordfish) was the biggest well-known marine animal, and certainly the biggest regularly eaten. In view of the edibility of Tannin and Leviathan (Ps 74,14 above), the immense shoals of tuna coming in through Gibraltar past the Punic *tonnara* form a natural basis in fact for the mythological theme of Yahweh, Melqarth or Heracles killing sea-monsters by the Western Pillars.

These considerations give added force to the etymological comparison between θύννος and Hebrew תַּנִּינִי *tanniyn* in spite of the difference in vowels. While sometimes "land serpent," the Hebrew often is clearly marine; the LXX translates κήτη at Gen 1,21, the Vulgate *cetus* also at Job 7,12, Isa 27,1. The *-iyn-* of *tanniyn* is apparently part of the word, though at Ez 29,3 תַּנִּינִי. Thus the Hebrew may show the fish-suffix *-in* attested in Greek δελφῖνες, ἐρυθρίνος, σαρδῖνος etc.; it would then be "Mediterranean." θύννος went

97 Office de la Recherche Scientifique et Technologique Outre-Mer, Div. de Océanographie, Paris; letter of May 19, 1964.

98 The little species *Euthynnus alletteratus* is common off the Phoenician homeland: C. J. George et alii, *The Fishes of the Coastal Waters of the Lebanon = American Univ. of Beirut, Publications of the Faculty of Arts & Sciences, Misc. Papers in the Nat. Sciences*, no. 4, 1964. *Thunnus thynnus* and *Th. alalunga* have been reported but are unknown to them from specimens.

99 Aristotle, *Hist. Anim.* 3.20, 521b21-25.

100 A Byzantine gloss to Oppian quoted by R. Strömberg, "Studien zur Etymologie und Bildung der griechischen Fischnamen," Göteborgs Högskolas Årsskrift 49 (1943:2) 74, gives a series of fish-names in order of increasing size as stages in development of one species: tsiphos, skombros, koloios, pelamys, lakedra, thynnos, orkynos, ketos.

101 From Ephorus, Jacoby FGH 70 F 129b.

into Talmudic as **טננינא**.¹⁰² Our *tuna* comes from Spanish *atún*. Beirut fishermen call *Euthynnus alletteratus balamida*—i.e. *πηλαμούδα*.

Our Hebrew texts generally show that Tannin, Leviathan and Rahab are practically identified, and that their slaying takes place at the Pillars; this is suggested for Tannin in particular at Ps 74,13 above. At Job 7,12 *tanniyn* is parallel to Sea, at Ps 148,7 to תְּהוֹמוֹת "depths"; at Isa 27,1 to Leviathan, at 51,9 to Rahab. Unlike the *tanniyn*, Greek θύννος is mostly secular; but Antigonus of Carystus (Athenaeus 7.297E) says that at one site people sacrificed a tuna to Poseidon in a good season.¹⁰³

Pisistratus was given an oracle (Herodotus 1.62) about the success of his ambush:

ἔρριπται δ' ὁ βόλος, τὸ δὲ δίκτυον ἐκπεπέτασται,
θύννοι δ' οἰμήσουσι σεληναίης διὰ νυκτός.

"The cast has been made, the net is spread wide, the tuna will come darting through the moonlit night." The Greek sailors at Salamis (Aeschylus *Pers.* 424-426), dealing with the drowning enemy,

τοὶ δ' ὥστε θύννοους ἢ τιν' ἰχθύων βόλον
ἀγαῖσι κωπῶν θραύμασιν τ' ἐρειπίων
ἔπαιον ...

"hit them with broken oars and bits of wreckage as if they were tuna or a haul of fish."¹⁰⁴ So the Pharaoh (Ez 32,2ff, cf. 29,3ff) thought himself a lion among nations; but in reality "you are like a *tanniyn* in the seas."¹⁰⁵ The prophet goes on, "I will throw my net over you with a host of many peoples, and they will haul you up in my seine." Then he is made food for birds and animals as in Ps 74. In these comparisons of the defeated Oriental enemy to the tuna caught in the fisherman's net we have a good candidate for a Phoenician literary motif.

102 Bab. Talm. *Aboda Zara* 39a and *Hullin* 66b preserve five Greek fish-names much corrupted.

103 M. Detienne & J.-P. Vernant, *The Cuisine of Sacrifice among the Greeks*, tr. P. Wissing (1989) on p. [116] show a Greek vase with a large fish, perhaps a tuna, being prepared for sacrifice by two men on an altar; see discussion pp. 127, 221 note 8 (citing Julian *ad matrem deorum* 176C).

104 See B. M. Lavelle, "The Compleat Angler: Observations on the rise of Peisistratos in Herodotos (I.59-64)," *Classical Review* 41 (1991) 317-324.

105 At Isa 30,7 (cf. Ps 87,4) Rahab becomes a derogatory name for Egypt.

Chapter 4: The Mediterranean Vocabulary of the Vine¹

On most of the shores of the ancient Mediterranean, before any historical record, the cultivated grape vine, *Vitis vinifera* Linn., was grown. Its relationship to the wild vine of Eurasia, *Vitis silvestris* Gmel., is uncertain.² Its pips can mostly be distinguished from those of the wild vine, and have been found in Egypt and Syrian Hama from the fourth millennium BC, at Lachish and Jericho in the early Bronze, at Troy II during the Bronze, in the Peloponnesus from Early Helladic, in Crete from the Early Minoan. Renfrew³ states that it "appears to have been introduced into Italy by the Etruscans." Only in France, which we think of as the center of wine-making, is a time of introduction recorded. The Phocaeans of Ionia, though not specially noted for their wine, were preeminent in colonizing the western Mediterranean, in particular Massilia (Strabo 4.1.4). Justin (*Epit.* 43.4.1-2) records that under the influence of Phocaeon colonists the Gauls "began to prune the vine and plant the olive," *Galli...uitem putare...oliuam serere consuerunt*. Syrian Laodicea, which provided the bulk of the wine to Alexandria, "had the mountain lying above the city covered with vines (κατάμπελον) almost to its summits" (Strabo 16.2.9); so had many Near Eastern cities before the coming of abstemious Islam.

Renfrew notes that "the plants are extremely sensitive, requiring moisture, but not in excessive amounts at the wrong time, and heat for ripening the fruit which can, however, be ruined by the dry summer winds"; and quotes White⁴ "Vines require a greater degree of tendance and control of the environment than any other Mediterranean crop." It seems evident that the uniform techniques of Mediterranean viticulture, along with the manufacture of wine, were not hit on independently in different places, but spread from an unknown source.⁵ The texts that we control most securely—Hebrew,

1 Revision of an article with the same title in *Vet. Test.* 19 (1969) 146-170.

2 Jane M. Renfrew, *Palaeoethnobotany: The prehistoric food plants of the Near East and Europe* (1973) 125-131.

3 *Ibid.* p. 127.

4 K. D. White, *Roman Farming* (1970), 229.

5 Mago of Carthage wrote on viticulture (Columella 3.12.5), perhaps not in Punic but Greek (p. 115 note 31 above). See art. "Viticulture" DCP 492.

Greek and Latin—not only agree in their description of viticulture, but in much of their vocabulary, above all in the name of "wine" itself, (4.2) below. Further, they witness to the central status of the vine and its juice in society, cult and poetic symbolism; in both Israel and Hellas a divinity is seen as a vineyarder, (4.1) below. The grape is half-personified, for wine is its blood, Deut 32,14 (cf. Gen 49,11) "And of the blood of the grape (Luther *Traubenblut*) you drank wine,"

וְדָם־עֵנָב תִּשְׁתֶּה־הֶחָמֶר

LXX καὶ αἷμα σταφυλῆς ἐπιον οἶνον, Vg *et sanguinem uuae biberet meracissimum*.⁶ In Achilles Tatius 2.2, purportedly at Tyre, Dionysus tells the herdsman that wine is "the blood of the grape," αἷμα βότρυος. In both cultures wine is the primary symbol for the ecstatic irrational component of society. Here and in the sacrificial cult (Chapt. 6) the unity of Mediterranean society is most concretely documented.⁷

And so symbolic themes involving the vine became the common property of European civilization. A beautiful example involves the great enemy of the vine at an early period, the wild boar with its sweet tooth, before hunting had driven it back from the farms.⁸ The God of Israel brought Israel as a vine out of Egypt and planted it (Ps 80,9, 4.1 below), but (Ps 80,14) "the boar from the forest roots it up,"

בְּכַרְסָמָנָה חָזַר מֵיַעַר

LXX [79,14] ἐλυμήνατο αὐτήν σὺς ἐκ δρυμοῦ, Jerome *iux. Hebr. uastaut iam aper de silua*. Phoenix tells how Artemis sent the Calydonian boar against the vineyards of Oineus (Οἰνεύς, 4.1 below) the eponym of vineyarders (*Iliad* 9.539-40):

ᾠρσεν ἐπι χλούνην σὺν ἄγριον ἀργιόδοντα,
ὃς κακὰ πόλλ' ἔρδεσκεν ἔθων Οἰνήνος ἀλώην

"She raised up the fierce wild boar with shining teeth, that did much harm haunting the orchard of Oineus." Shakespeare had read about the Calydonian *aper* in Ovid (*Met.* 8.294)

sternuntur grauidi longo cum palmite fetus

"The heavy clusters with their trailing vines are overturned"; whenever the 16th of the month fell on a Sunday, if the bard went in to Matins he heard

-
- 6 So Sirach 39,26 in a beautiful text listing the needs of humanity: "water, fire, iron, salt, wheat flour, milk, honey, the blood of the grape (αἷμα σταφυλῆς), olive, clothing."
 - 7 A Phoenician inscription from Cilicia now documents the grant of a vineyard (כרם); P. G. Mosca & J. Russell, "A Phoenician Inscription from Cebel Ires Daği in Rough Cilicia," *Epigraphica Anatolica* 9 (1987) 1-28.
 - 8 The San Francisco Chronicle reported on Oct. 9, 1993, that feral pigs had eaten up (besides corn, pumpkin and low-hanging fruit) a large part of the pinot noir crop in Healdsburg, in preference to the chardonnay.

Psalms 79-81 read. The emblem of Richard III was the boar; and so Richmond says (*Richard III* V.ii.7-11 Folio):

The wretched, bloody and vsurping Boare,
 (That spoyl'd your Summer Fields, and fruitfull Vines)
 Swilles your warm blood like wash, & makes his trough
 In your embowel'd bosomes: This foule Swine
 Is now euen in the Centry of this Isle...

Reminiscences of the Psalter and *Metamorphoses* reinforce each other.⁹

Here we take up twelve items of common vocabulary, which fall in every possible category. The names of wine (4.2) and the bull (4.9, Latin *taurus*) are in the oldest stratum of the vocabulary common to Semitic and Indo-European. Three names of the vine, Greek *ampelos* (4.1), *botrys* (4.11), and *thyrsos* (4.12), show characteristic "Mediterranean" fluctuation of form. The old name of the amphora, Latin *cadus* (4.5), is a commercial term of uncertain origin. Greek *gaulos* (4.7), a "vessel" in both senses of a cup and a freighter, is a Semitic loan-word from Phoenician; and Latin *dōlium* "cask" (4.6) from Punic. The "wine-hall," Greek *leschē* (4.3), went into Hebrew as a loan-word from Greek, and likewise a rarity, the verb "mix" (4.4). The tambourine, Greek *tympanon* (4.10), is a cultic word of uncertain provenance, perhaps Anatolian. Nard (4.8) along with its Sanskrit name arrived in the Mediterranean in the historic period.

4.1 The name of the vine

Pausal גָּרְבַּן *gōḇēn* Jud 9:12 etc.; ἄμπελος; Latin *pampinus*. It is plausible that all three are variations on a "Mediterranean" word. As names of a tree, the Greek and Hebrew words are feminine, and the Latin can be (OLD). The vowels of the Hebrew pausal form, as often, agree more closely with the Greek than the non-pausal; *l* and *n* regularly interchange. The extra *m* of the Greek and Latin is paralleled in כִּוְבָח ~ κύμβαχος "helmet" (Chap. 5.1 below). There is agreement in the plural endings גָּרְבָּי ,¹⁰ ἄμπελοι (*Odyssey* 9.110), *pampinī* (Columella 4.6.1). Perhaps the original form began with an intractable consonant, differently treated in each language.

9 I do not here discuss Adonis as another victim of the boar (Ovid *Met.* 10.681-739, a passage redone by Shakespeare [1593]); see W. Atallah, Adonis dans la littérature et l'art grecs; *Etudes et Commentaires* 62 (1966), 63-74.

10 Bab. Talm. *Baba Qanuna* 92a.

Hebrew *gpn* was perhaps generic, since Jud 13,14 (cf Num 6,4) defines it as גִּפְנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל, LXX (cod. B) ἐξ ἀμπέλου τοῦ οἴνου. That was the only way for the LXX to say it; in the land of the Cyclopes (*Odyssey* 9.110-111) there grow ἄμπελοι, αἳ τε φέρουσιν / οἴνον ἐριστάφυλον "vines which bear wine made from fine grapes." Latin **pampinus uini* is unattested but possible.

Yahweh's role as vineyarder is stated at Ps 80,9

הָבִיטְךָ יְיָ אֱלֹהֵינוּ שָׂרְשָׁרֵינוּ מִצְרַיִם מִמִּצְרַיִם

"You brought a vine (LXX ἄμπελον) out of Egypt; you drove out the nations and planted (κατεφύτευσας) it." The same theme at Isa 5,1-7; Jer 2,21; Ez 19,10-14. Apollodorus 1.8.1 summarizes the story of Oineus: Οἰνεὺς δὲ βασιλεὺς Καλυδῶνος παρὰ Διονύσου φυτὸν ἀμπέλου πρῶτος ἔλαβε, "Oineus king of Calydon was the first to receive from Dionysus the plant of the vine." From time to time in Hellas, Dionysus with his vine seems like the *only* god. In the *Homeric Hymn* VII to Dionysus, the indication to the "Tyrsenian pirates" (p. 171 below) that they have kidnapped a god is the growth of a vine across the sail. The Athenian potter Exekias painted the scene in a black-figured cup of about 525 BC—found appropriately at Vulci in Etruria:¹¹ "grape-leaves on the rowlocks, / heavy vine on the oarshafts" (Pound, *Canto* II). Jesus combines the attributes of Dionysus and Israel (Joh 15,5): ἐγὼ εἰμι ἡ ἄμπελος, ὑμεῖς τὰ κλήματα "I am the vine (Syriac ܐܬܦܘܠܐ), you are the branches," Vg *ego sum uitis, uos palmites*.

The first pleasure or duty of men, following the example of the god, is to plant the vine. Thus Alcaeus¹²

μηδ' ἔν ἄλλο φυτεύσης πρότερον δένδριον ἀμπέλῳ

"Plant no other tree before the vine"; or as Horace translates him (*Carm.* 1.18.1), "Varus, plant no tree before the sacred vine":

nullam, Vare, sacra uite prius seueris arborem.

Israel is defined as the vine (here exceptionally masculine), Hos 10,1 יִשְׂרָאֵל כַּרְמֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל "Israel is a luxuriant vine," LXX ἄμπελος εὐκληματοῦσα Ἰσραήλ, Vg *uitis frondosa Israhel*.

4.2 The name of "wine"

Forms with *w-* are standard. Thus Cretan dialect genitive FOINO, identical with syllabic Cypriote genitive *wo-i-no* (p. 144 below); classical οἴνος with οἴνη "vineyard" (Hesiod *Opera* 572). Latin *uinum*, Iguvine *uinu* accus.,

11 M. Robertson, *Greek Painting* (1957) p. 71.

12 Alcaeus frag. 342, Lobel-Page PLF p. 268.

Etruscan *vinum*. Hittite [ʷi-?]-*ja-na-aš*;¹³ Hieroglyphic Hittite *wa-ā-na-a-s*. Arabic *wayn* "black grapes"; Sabaeen *wynyhmw* "their vineyards."¹⁴ Over against these, the West-Semitic initial *y-* is an innovation. Thus Hebrew יָיִן, emphatic יָיִן, suffixed *yeyn-* (Cant 5,1); Samaritan ostraca יָיִן; Ugaritic *yn*. Forms are also quoted from Ethiopic, Armenian and Caucasian languages.

The word evidently spread with the thing it denotes, and perhaps need not be looked for in any hypothetical original Indo-European¹⁵ or Semitic language. A single Arabic text known to me reads:

كَأَنَّ الْوَيْنَ إِذَا يَجْنَى الْوَيْنَ

kaʿannahu ʾlwaynu ʾidan yujnā ʾlwaynu "it is like black grapes when the black grapes are picked."¹⁶ The *w-* is presupposed in Homeric prosody, and attested in Cypriote (p. 144 below) and the law-code of Gortyn (10.37-39) ΠΡΟΚΟΟΝ ΦΟΙΝΟ "a *prochoos* of wine."¹⁷ The vocabulary of the vine is very extensively treated by Sereni from an Italian viewpoint.¹⁸ Delcor discusses it from the Semitic side.¹⁹

We saw that Israel is *called* a vine. Other districts of the Mediterranean are similarly named after their product. The same Phocaeans who (as we saw) brought the vine to the Gauls "founded a city of the land Oenotria," Οἰνωτρίας (Herodotus 1.167.3); Servius, commenting on *Aeneid* 1.532 *Oenotri*, as his first alternative derives the name "from the superior wine produced in Italy," *a uino optimo quod in Italia nascitur*. The city Οἰνόανδα of Asia Minor (Strabo 13.4.17) shows the word for "wine" with an Anatolian suffix. Americans live on soil first named *Winlanda*—here with a Germanic

- 13 J. Friedrich, *Hethitisches Wörterbuch* (1952) 255, who also (2 *Ergänzungsheft* 44) cites Luvian *ūniyant-*. It would be valuable to cite the contexts, as I have done with more accessible languages.
- 14 J. C. Biella, *Dictionary of Old South Arabic, Sabaeen Dialect*, *Harvard Semitic Studies* 25 (1982) 127.
- 15 R. S. P. Beekes, "On Indo-European 'wine'," *Münchener Studien zur Sprachwissenschaft* 48 (1987) 21-26.
- 16 From the author al-Aʿrābi, quoted in *ibn Manẓūr, Lisān al-ʿArab* (Beyrouth ed., 1988) xv.424 s.v. *wyn*.
- 17 Ed. R. F. Willetts, *The Law Code of Gortyn* (1967).
- 18 Emilio Sereni, *Per la storia delle più antiche tecniche e della nomenclatura della vite e del vino in Italia*, *Atti e Memorie dell' Accademia Toscana di Scienze e Lettere* 29 (1964) 75-204; see pp. 82ff for the words for "wine" in what Sereni believes its original Near Eastern homeland.
- 19 Mathias Delcor, "De l'origine de quelques termes relatifs au vin en hébreu biblique et dans les langues voisines," pp. 346-356 of *Etudes bibliques et orientales de religions comparées* (1979); for *yayin* etc. see pp. 347-350. See further Mario Provera, "La coltura della vite nella tradizione biblica ed orientale," *Bibbia e Oriente* 24 / 132 (1982) 97-106.

suffix; Adam of Bremen²⁰ ab. AD 1075 says that the island was so named because "vines grow there of their own accord, bearing the best wine," *eo quod ibi uites sponte nascantur, uinum optimum ferentes*.²¹ It appears from Gen 9,20 that wine was first prepared on the slopes of Mt Ararat (Gen 8,4 טַרְרָר). This equivalent of Urartu appears in an beautifully exact transcription at Herodotus 7.79 as the ethnic Ἀλαρόδιοι. Strabo 15.1.58 praises the wine of Armenia and adjacent parts.

In Homer *oinos* falls together with Indo-European *mead*, i.e. fermented honey. Thus at *Iliad* 7.467 ships from Lemnos bring οἶνον, which at vs 471 is called μέθυ. It came to Greek with a fixed Indo-European adjective, μέθυ ἡδύ (*Odyssey* 4.746 etc.) "sweet mead." Schmitt²² quotes genitive *svādór...mádhvah* from *Rigveda* 1.84.10ab as a clear instance of Indo-European *Dichtersprache*. So in the Middle English *Towneley Mysteries* 28.11 (ca AD 1460) "It is swetter than med."²³ Greeks (like Hebrews) did not know mead proper nor any other native fermented drink; except that perhaps the Ciconian wine of *Odyssey* 9.208, still potent when diluted twenty to one, may have been a kind of brandy, concentrated by freezing in chilly Thrace.

Homer describes (*Iliad* 3.246-7) how heralds carry

ἄρνε δύω καὶ οἶνον εὐφρονα, καρπὸν ἀρούρης,
ἀσκαῶ ἐν αἰγείῳ ...

"two lambs and wine that makes glad the *phren*, the fruit of the earth, in a goatskin." So Ps 104,15

וַיֵּין יְשִׁמַח לִבְב־אָנוּשׁ

"and wine that makes glad the heart of man," where the LXX translate Homerically καὶ οἶνος εὐφραίνει καρδίαν ἀνθρώπου; Vg *et uinum laetificat cor hominis*. It affects gods similarly. Nausicaa (*Odyssey* 6.309) describes her father's throne

τῷ ὃ γε οἶνοποτάζει ἐφήμενος ἀθάνατος ὧς

"on which he sits and drinks wine like an immortal." So in Jotham's fable the vine, presumably unaware of Hebrew monotheism, asks (Jud 9,13)

הֲהִלֵּיתִי אֶת־תִּירוּשֵׁי הַמְּשַׁמֵּחַ אֱלֹהִים וְאָנָשִׁים

"Shall I leave my new wine which cheers god(s) and men (Luther *Götter und Menschen*)?"; LXX (codex B) ... τὸν οἶνόν μου τὸν εὐφραίνοντα θεὸν καὶ ἀνθρώπους, Vg *uinum meum quod laetificat deum et homines*. At Jud

20 Adam Bremensis, *Gesta Hammaburgensis Ecclesiae Pontificum* 4.38, ed. B. Schmeidler, 3rd ed., *Scriptores Rerum Germanicarum...* (1971) 275.17.

21 *Vinlanda Insula* on the map published by R. A. Skelton et alii, *The Vinland Map and the Tartar Relation* (1965); but this is now often thought a modern forgery.

22 R. Schmitt, *Dichtung und Dichtersprache in indogermanischer Zeit* (1967) 256.

23 OED s.v. *mead*.

9,9 the Vulgate has the olive speak of its fatness *qua et dii utuntur et homines*. "Gods and men" sounds very Homeric: thus in the *Homeric Hymn* to Demeter (2.403) of Persephone in her resurrection "you will come up again a great marvel to gods and mortal men,"

αὐτίς ἄνει μέγα θαῦμα θεοῖς θνητοῖς τ' ἀνθρώποις

Both societies for overland transport of wine used a small animal skin: I Sam 10,3 etc. נֶבֶל-יָיִן, LXX ἄσκὸν οἴνου; a Samarian ostracon (KAI 185) נבל ין ישׁ "a skin of old wine." Less danger so of bursting than with new. Elihu's belly is like wine pent up (Job 32:19), "like new wineskins it will burst," צִבְצִבּוֹת יַיִן וְשִׁבְצִי תִכְבֹּב. So Matt 9,17 οὐδὲ βάλλουσιν οἶνον νέον εἰς ἀσκοὺς παλαιούς, "nor do they [Aramaic periphrasis for the passive] put new wine into old skins," Vg *neque mittunt uinum nouum in utres ueteres*.²⁴

Euripides (*Bacchae* 141-145) gives the characteristic effects when Dionysus appears on land:

ῥεῖ δὲ γάλακτι πέδον, ῥεῖ δ' οἶνω, ῥεῖ δὲ μελισσᾶν νέκταρι
Συρίας δ' ὡς λιβάνου κα-
πνὸν ὁ Βακχεὺς ἀνέχων

"The ground flows with milk, flows with wine, flows with the nectar of bees. And as the Bacchic celebrant raises up the smoke of Syrian *libanos*..." So Ovid of the golden age (*Met.* 1.111-2):

flumina iam lactis, iam flumina nectaris ibant,
flauaque de uiridi stillabant ilice mella

"Streams of milk, streams of nectar flowed, and yellow honey dripped from the green oak." See the echo of this passage in Jerome (p. 4 above). When the LXX came to "a land flowing milk and honey" (Ex 3,8)

אַרְבָּת לְבַב וְדָבַר

they must have had a Dionysiac twinge as they translated γῆν ῥέουσαν γάλα καὶ μέλι. The Theban scene is mirrored in Cant 5,1 with sexual coloring: "I gather my myrrh with my spice; I eat my honeycomb with my honey; I drink my wine with my milk."

The setting in real life for the imagery used in the orgy of Euripides and the sexuality of Canticles is the symposium. Its elements are summarized in an elegy of Xenophanes.²⁵ He mentions the wreaths of flowers, the scented ointment, the altar, and the "ready wine" (οἶνος ἐτοῖμος). Libanos (for which see Chapter 6.8 below) sends up its sacred odor (ἀγνήν ὀδμήν λιβανωτὸς ἴησιν); a table is laden with cheese and rich honey (μέλιτος πίονος). Cant 4,13 gives its garden an Iranian name, "paradise," as in the LXX of the Garden of Eden (Gen 2,8). Eden with its rivers flowing four ways is comparable

24 See *Avoth* IV.20 for a contrast between new and old wine.

25 Diels-Kranz, FVS⁸ 21B1 (i.126) = West, IEG ii.164.

to Calypso's island (*Odyssey* 5.68-71) with *its* four rivers. And Calypso's has "a flourishing cultivated vine, bursting with clusters of grapes,"

ήμερίς ἤβώωσα, τεθήλει δὲ σταφυλῆσι
 ἡμερίς implies ἄμπελος understood, as contrasted with ἀγρία "wild vine," and perhaps the phrases are so old as to mark the transition from *Vitis silvestris* to *vinifera*. At the end of this chapter we will discover a golden representation of Eden whose principal feature is a vine.

4.3 The drinking-hall

λέσχη; לֶשְׁכָּה (לֶשְׁכָּה Neh 3.30 etc.). The variation *liškoh* / *niškoh* in Hebrew suggests a foreign word; there is a nice agreement in the feminine singular endings. An archaic inscription from Kamiros on Rhodes reads²⁶ ΕΥΘΥΤΙΔΑ ΗΜΙ ΛΕΣΧΕ. Although the editors read Doric λέσχα, the final E in the photo is clear. It may be "I am the tomb of Euthytides," but the Ionic form and anomalous spelling are perplexing. In later Attic its meaning becomes "council, conversation," perhaps because of a popular etymology from λέγω; but it may be from the root λεχ- and mean "place of rest, tomb," and then "place of reclining at ease." At any rate the earliest Greek literary texts agree with the Hebrew in "hall, place for drinking."

Melantho the maid says to disguised Odysseus (*Odyssey* 18.328-332):

οὐδ' ἐθέλεις εὐδὲν χαλκῆϊον ἐς δόμον ἐλθῶν,
 ἢ ἐπου ἐς λέσχην, ἀλλ' ἐνθάδε πόλλ' ἀγορεύεις,
 θαρσαλέως πολλοῖσι μετ' ἀνδράσιν, οὐδέ τι θυμῷ
 ταρβεῖς· ἢ ῥά σε οἶνος ἔχει φρένας, ἢ νύ τοι αἰεὶ
 τοιοῦτος νόος ἐστίν ...

"Why don't you go off and sleep at the bronzesmith's house—or off to the *leschē*, instead of saying many insolent things here with many people? Aren't you frightened at all? Either wine has your *phrenes*, or you are always in this frame of mind." Hesiod (*Opera* 493-4) suggests that the *leschē* is not so much contrasted with the smithy as attached to it:

παρ δ' ἴθι χαλκεῖον θῶκον καὶ ἐπαλέα λέσχην / ὄρη χειμερίη ...

"Leave to one side the bronzesmith's seat and the warm(?) *leschē* in wintertime." It is a place where you sit around idle (*Opera* 501). It would seem then to be a room attached to the smithy for winter warmth, where men would sit, talking (the later sense) and inevitably drinking.

The Jerusalem temple had a number of rooms called *liškoh*. Jeremiah is ordered (Jer 35,2) "to bring [the Rechabites] into the house of Yahweh, into one of the *liškoh*'s (LXX [Jer 42,2] αὐλῶν) and give them wine to drink":

וַיְהִי בַּיּוֹם הַהוּא יָבִיאוּ אֹתָם בֵּית יְהוָה אֶל־אֶחָת הַלְשָׁכוֹת וַיִּשְׁפְּתוּ אֹתָם יַיִן

At I Sam 9,22 Samuel brings Saul into the הלְשָׁכָה? (LXX κατάλυμα, Vg *triclinium*) where thirty persons are eating. That the *leschē* / *liškoh* is some kind of a common room or village pub in both societies reinforces the evidence for the Hebrew being a loan-word from Greek. The λέσσαι at Sparta retained archaic features. Symposia were held there (Plutarch *Lycurgus* 25.1-2), and one had a Phoenician connection: Pausanias 3.15.8 says that at Sparta there was "a painted *leschē*, and shrines beside it of the hero Cadmus son of Agenor," λέσχη ... ποικίλη καὶ ἡρώα πρὸς αὐτῇ Κάδμου τοῦ Ἀγήνορος.²⁷

4.4 "To mix"

μίσγω, μίγνυμι; Latin *misceo*. Hebrew root מִסַּךְ with מִסַּךְ and מִמְסַךְ "mixture"; מִזְג with מִזְג "mixture"; Ugaritic *msk* "to mix" and "mixture." Gesenius²⁸ long ago saw the parallel, but attributed it either to an original connection between Semitic and Indo-European or to chance. But the root-variation in Hebrew suggests borrowing; and μίσγω offers an excellent source, where the unvoiced *s* beside voiced *g* creates instability, resolved by Hebrew in both possible ways. Furthermore the verbs take the same object, "wine." This rare instance of a borrowed verb is motivated by the emigration of a Greek custom: mixed drinks.

In the *Homeric Hymn to Demeter* (2.207-9) the goddess will not drink straight wine, "for she said it was not proper for her to drink red wine, but told [Metaneira] to mix in meal, water and soft mint, and give it to her to drink":

... οὐ γὰρ θεμιτόν οἱ ἔφασκε
πίνεῖν οἶνον ἐρυθρόν, ἄνωγε δ' ἄρ' ἄλφι καὶ ὕδωρ
δοῦναι μίξασαν πῆμεν γλήχωνι τερπίνη.

This mint julep is related to the elaborate cocktail called the *kykeōn* (*Iliad* 11.624-641). Commoner in the Hellenic world was the mixing of wine and water for dilution; *Odyssey* 1.110

27 Walter Burkert has now an elaborate study from a slightly different viewpoint, "Lescha-Liškah: Sakrale Gastlichkeit zwischen Palästina und Griechenland," OBO 129, 19-37.

28 W. Gesenius, *Geschichte der hebräischen Sprache und Schrift* (1815) 66-7.

οἱ μὲν ἄρ' οἶνον ἔμισγον ἐνὶ κρητήροισι καὶ ὕδωρ
 "Some [of the heralds] mixed wine and water in the craters." (At *Iliad* 3.268-270 the wine of two parties to an agreement is mixed.) Hebrew normally disapproves of mixed drinks. Prov 23,30:

לְמֵאֲחָרִים עַל-הַיַּיִן לְבָאִים לְהִקָּר מִמֶּסֶךְ

"Those who tarry over wine, those who go in to try a mixture." Cf. Isa 5,22 "mixing liquor," לְמִסְךְ שָׁכַר, Vg *ad miscendam ebrietatem*; Ps 75,9 "For there is a cup in the hand of Yahweh, and the wine foams(?), full of mixture," מִלֵּא מִסְךְ, Vg *uini meri plenus misto*. At Isa 65,11 mixed drinks, מִמֶּסֶךְ, are attributed to the foreign cult of Meni, Good Fortune.

Ugaritic epic is not under this restraint. Thus:²⁹ *alp kd yqh bhmr, rbt ymsk bmskh* "He takes a thousand jars of liquor; he mixes ten thousand in his mixture." Again:³⁰ *tnm tšqy msk hwt* "A second time [Paghat] makes [Yatpan] drink the mixture." Also³¹ *ks ymsk* "he mixes a cup." In special contexts Hebrew can approve mixed drinks. Sexual: Cant 7,3 "may it never lack mixed wine," מִזְגָּה (the unique Biblical form of *mzg*). Mystical: Prov 9,2 (cf 9,5) מִסְכָּה יַיִנָּה. When the Vulgate must translate *miscuit uinum*, and Luther *Sie hat...ihren Wein gemischt*, we have an uncanny feeling that Latin and German are part of the same linguistic world as Hebrew.³²

4.5 The winejar

κάδος, syllabic Cypriote *ka-to-se*, Latin *cadus*. Hebrew כַּד *kad*, Ugaritic *kd*; also Punic and imperial Aramaic.³³ E. Masson³⁴ regards it as a Semitic loanword in Greek; but in fact it would seem to be a fully international word with no clear linguistic origin.

For landborne trade, we saw that wine was stored and transported in small animal skins. For seaborne trade it was carried in pottery amphoras with an international name, the *cadus*. Archilochus³⁵ testifies that sailors were accustomed to sample the cargo:

29 Gordon UT 'nt I.15-17 = KTU 1.3.I.15-17.

30 Gordon UT I *Aqht* 224 = KTU 1.19.IV.61.

31 Gordon UT 67:I:21 = KTU 1.5.I.21.

32 German *Wein* must be an early loan from Latin.

33 DISO 115.

34 E. Masson, *Recherches* 42-44; and likewise Rosén, *L'Hébreu* 9-10.

35 Archilochus frag. 4 in West, IEG i.2-3 = Athenaeus 483D.

ἀλλ' ἄγε σὺν κώθωνι θοῆς διὰ σέλματα νηὸς
 φοῖτα καὶ κοίλων πάματ' ἄφελκε κάδων,
 ἄγρει δ' οἶνον ἐρυθρὸν ἀπὸ τρυγός· οὐδὲ γὰρ ἡμεῖς
 νηθέμεν ἐν φυλακῇ τῆδε δυνησόμεθα

"But come with your cup along the benches of the swift ship, and lift the lids from the hollow *kadoi*, and take the red wine off the lees; for we shall not be able to stay sober on this watch." Many amphoras have been found in ancient shipwrecks: our text, illustrating a constant danger to navigation in the wine-trade, will suggest to archaeologists why so many wrecks of wine-ships are to be found.

Cambyzes sent various Levantine products to the "Ethiopians" (Herodotus 3.20.1, cf 2.86.4), of which the best received was a "jar of date wine," φοινικηίου οἴνου κάδον. Anacreon alleges that he "tossed off a jar of wine," οἴνου δ' ἐξέπιον κάδον.³⁶ Plautus in general draws both from Greek plays and from contemporary Punic commercial usage. In his Punic play *Poenulus* the slave Milphio (vs 259) suggests that he be rewarded "with a jar of old wine," *cado uini ueteris*; so at *Amphitryon* 429 *cadus erat uini* and frequently. So Vergil (*Aen.* 1.195-6) near Phoenician Carthage describes how Aeneas "shares out the wines which good Acestes had stowed in *cadis*,"

uina bonus quae deinde cadis onerarat Acestes / diuidit...

Statius also suggests a Phoenician origin for the word (*Silv.* 3.2.140) *quo purpura suco / Sidoniis iterata cadis*, "the juice with which purples were twice-dipped in Sidonian vats."

These literary testimonies are solidly anchored in commercial usage. A syllabic Cypriote inscription records *wo-i-no ka-to-se*, surely Φοίνω κάδος.³⁷ Across the water at Ugarit an accounting of rations³⁸ has two entries beginning *kd yn*. An impeccable international phrase: *cadus uini* = οἴνου κάδος = *wo-i-no ka-to-se* = *kd yn* = Heb. *יַיִן כַּדָּ.³⁹

In landlubber Israel the *kad* was used rather for storage and transport of water: Gen 24,14-16 (Rebecca at the well), I Reg 18,34 (Elijah on Carmel). Gideon's men (Jud 7,16) had lamps in their jars, מִיַּדְּיָם לְתוֹכָהֶם לְנֵר, LXX (codex B) λαμπάδας ἐν ταῖς ὑδρίαις. Elsewhere³⁹ I discuss how λαμπάς migrated to Canaan as the יַיִן כַּדָּ.

The widow of Phoenician Sarepta kept her meal in a *kad* (I Reg 17,12). Pliny 18.307 quotes Varro as saying that "beans and legumes stored in oil-jars with a covering of ashes keep a long time," *fabam et legumina in oleariis cadis oblita cinere longo tempore seruari*. So at Ugarit foodstuffs

36 Page, PMG frag. 28 (no. 373) p. 189.

37 O. Masson, Les inscriptions chypriotes syllabiques (1961) no. 318 VII.1 p. 317.

38 Gordon UT 1099.27-28 = KTU 4.269.27-28.

39 "The Mediterranean Seer and Shamanism," ZAW 93 (1981) 374-400, p. 386.

were kept, *alp kd nbt kd šmn mr*⁴⁰ "100 jars of honey, a jar of ointment of myrrh." The same usage in Latin agriculture: Ovid *Fasti* 1.186

et data sub niueo candida mella cado

"and clear honey in a white *cadus*." Olive oil also was kept in *cadi* (Martial 1.43.8, Columella 12.53.3).

4.6 The wine-cask

Heb. דָּלִי; Latin *dōlium*. Isa 40,15 קָמַר מְדָלִי "as a drop from a bucket," LXX ὥς σταγὼν ἀπὸ κάδου, and cf. the vowel in Num 24,7 מְדָלִי. The Heb. pausal form might be *דָּלִי *dōliy*. Plautus *Cist.* 542 *dolium uini* "a cask of wine" would be Hebrew *דָּלִי יַיִן. Also used for water, Tibullus 1.3.80 of the Danaids collectively

in caua Lethaeas dolia portat aquas.

"They transfer the waters of Lethe into leaking casks." Both the phonetics and the meaning are as close as one could hope for; here we have a Punic commercial loan-word in Latin unrecognized by Ernout-Meillet.⁴¹

The Semitic word is used for Aquarius in the Zodiac; thus in Talmudic⁴² and in Palestinian synagogue zodiacal mosaics, in particular that of Beth-Alpha SW of the Sea of Galilee.⁴³ Epiphanius⁴⁴ ab. AD 337 transliterates the Hebrew of all twelve signs, a unique witness to the pronunciation of Hebrew. Comparison with the well-attested Latin and Greek forms⁴⁵ illustrates another international theme of the ancient world. (At Beth-Alpha Capricornus is damaged, and the last two names have a superfluous "and".)

40 Gordon UT 12.2 = KTU 4.14.2.

41 Another likely Punic loan-word in Latin is *marra* "hoe" (Columella 10.72, Juvenal 3.311), cf. Hesychius μάρρον; in Rabbinic, Bab. Talm. *BM* 82b מַר וּפְסֵל וְקַרְדּוּם "hoe and mattock and axe."

42 Texts in Brown, Lebanon and Phoenicia 10-14.

43 Reproduced and studied by Rachel Hachlili, "The Zodiac in Ancient Jewish Art: Representation and Significance," *BASOR* 228 (1977) 61-77. For a similar mosaic (damaged) see Moshe Dothan, *Hammath Tiberias: Early Synagogues and the Hellenistic and Roman Remains* (1983).

44 Epiphanius, *Panarion* 15.2 ed. K. Holl, GCS (1915).

45 The Greek zodiac in more archaic form at Aratus *Phaen.* 545-549; for the Latin see Cicero's translation vss 320-331 (ed. W. W. Ewbank, *The Poems of Cicero* [1933] 93).

Signs of the Zodiac			
Latin	Greek	Beth-Alpha	Eriphanus
Aries	Κριός	אלט	τελά
Taurus	Ταῦρος	רור	σώρ
Gemini	Δίδυμοι	תאומים	θωμίμ
Cancer	Καρκίνος	רטר	סαρατάν
Leo	Λέων	אריה	ἀρί
Virgo	Παρθένος	בתולה	βεθουλά
Libra	Ζυγόν	מאזנים	μωζανή[μ]
Scorpio	Σκορπίος	עקרב	ἀκράβ
Sagittarius	Τοξότης	קשת	κέσετ
Capricornus	Αἰγοκέρωσ	[גדי]	γαδί
Aquarius	Ἵδροχόος	דלי(ו)	δαλλι
Pisces	Ἰχθύες	דיגים(ו)	δεγγίμ

Two of the animal-names are international: רור (Biblical שור) is the old name for the "bull," ταῦρος and *taurus* (Chapter 6 below); עקרב (Deut 8,15 collective), quadrilateral like several names of animal pests, seems the Mediterranean name of the thing, related to σκορπίος. תאומים Gen 38,27 "twins" is familiar from "Thomas the twin" (Joh 11,16 etc.), Θωμάς ὁ λεγόμενος Δίδυμος. Eriphanus' vowels show that קשת as sign is "bow," not "archer"; and likewise that דלי is "water-jar," not its bearer.

4.7 The (golden) "vessel"

Heb. גלגל, Ugaritic *gl*, Akkadian *gullatu* C (CAD); γαυλός, Latin *gaulus*. Compare γαυλός "round (Phoenician) freighter" with a circumflex accent. The Phoenician might have been *גלגל *gullot*, close to γαυλός apart from being feminine. Both forms of the Greek word are treated as loans from Semitic by E. Masson.⁴⁶

English "vessel" covers both a bowl and a ship like the Greek. The bowl as luxury item first in Greek in a fragment of the *Chrysis* of Antiphanes, ab. 330 BC.⁴⁷ Among possessions of the bridegroom are

46 E. Masson, *Recherches* 39-42; cf. Rosén, *L'Hébreu* 10 footnote 1.

47 Antiphanes frag. 224 Kock ii.110 = Athenaeus 11.500E.

(A)...γαυλοὺς ὀλοχρύσους. (B) πλοῖα; (A) τοὺς κάδους μὲν οὖν
καλοῦσι γαυλοὺς πάντες εἰ προγάστορες.

"(A) ...*gauloi* all of gold. (B) Boats (*gaúloi*)? (A) Everybody gives the name *gauloi* to *kadoi* if they are potbellied." The grammarians vouch for the distinction of accent. The context in Antiphanes implies that the *gauloi* are wine-cups, and similarly Theocritus 5.104. A Byzantine lexicon⁴⁸ specifically calls it a "vessel for wine" (οἰνηρὸν ἀγγεῖον); Plautus (*Rudens* 1319) lists *gaulus* in a catalogue of wine-vessels.

There is a beautiful parallel in Ugaritic:⁴⁹

yṣq bgl ḥṭi yn b*gl ḥrṣ nbt

"[Keret] pours wine in a bowl of silver(?), honey (Heb. תַּבֵּי) in a bowl of gold." Hebrew compares the *gullḥ* to the *kaḏ* as Antiphanes does, Koh 12,6:

עַד אֲשֶׁר ... וְתִרְךָ לְתֵלֶךָ הַזֶּהב וְתִשְׁבֵּר כַּד עַל-הַמַּבְנוֹץ

"Until the golden bowl is crushed, and the pitcher broken at the well." Here the Preacher uses the normal Hebrew word for "gold," זָהָב. But the Tyrian passage Sach 9,3 uses the Phoenician word and gives its vowels, חֶרֶץ. The root ללג means "roll, be round," which fits nicely with the "potbellied" of Antiphanes. The *gullḥ* as capital of a pillar (I Reg 7,41f), made by the Phoenician Hiram, also is round; cf. Akkadian *gullatu* A "column base." An unidentified ornament in Akkadian (*gullatu* B) is of gold, *gul-la-tum KU-GI*. On the basis of Pindar *Isthm.* 1.20 φιάλαισί τε χρυσοῦ "and with phials of gold" we may reconstruct *γαυλὸς χρυσοῦ out of Antiphanes. Here then is another model international phrase: *γαυλὸς χρυσοῦ = *gl ḥrṣ* = *חֶרֶץ תֵּלֶךָ = *gullatu ḥurāsi*.

Pastoral and technical uses of γαυλός are earlier attested in Greek than this luxury one. Among his milk-vessels (ἄγγεα) Polyphemus had γαυλοί (*Odyssey* 9.222-3). Herodotus 6.119 implies that γαυλός was the normal word for a well-bucket; in the sweep of the "asphalt" (petroleum) well at Ardericca it was replaced by half a skin, ἀντί δὲ γαυλοῦ ἤμισυ ἄσκοῦ. In inscriptions from Delos⁵⁰ it is a well-bucket of wood and equivalent to κάδος. With Keret's bowl of honey we may compare Theocritus 5.58-59, dedicating to Pan *gauloi* of milk and *skaphides* of honey.

Keret might as well have had the wine in the golden bowl as in the silver (?) one; and he might as well have mixed it as poured it. Thus we know how to say in Ugaritic "he mixed wine in a bowl of gold," **msk yn bgl ḥrṣ*. Translating into Phoenicianizing Hebrew we obtain

* מִסְךָ יַיִן בְּגֵלֶת חֶרֶץ *

48 Suda 1.509 ed. A. Adler (1929).

49 Gordon *UT Krt* 164f = *KTU* 1.14.IV.1-2.

50 BCH 76 (1952) 562-571.

Likewise we can turn the same sentiment into a respectable Homeric hexameter (Levin has improved the meter):

* ἐν γαυλῶ χρυσέῳ ὁ γ' ἐμίσγετο (F)οῖνον ἐρυθρόν
 "He mixed (red) wine in a bowl of gold." In this special commercial and epic realm something close to an international lingua franca existed.

It was the Phocaeans again who were first of the Hellenes to undertake long sea-voyages (Herodotus 1.163)—not as you might expect in "round [cargo] ships," στρογγύλησι νηυσί (more seaworthy?)⁵¹ but in penteconters, i.e. warships or "long ships" (πλοῖα μακρά Herodotus 5.30.4), faster but probably less stable. A Phoenician cargo ship is a γαῦλος, clearly derived from a Phoenician cognate of Hebrew נָזַל and meaning "round." Epicharmus (5th century BC)⁵² speaks of

αὐτὸς ὁ Ποτιδᾶν ἄγων γαῦλοισιν ἐν Φοινικικοῖς
 "Poseidon himself, carrying [fish] in Phoenician *gauloi*."⁵³ Scylax in his *Periplus* 112⁵⁴ seems to attest *gauloi* as a Phoenician term along with *skēnai* "tents" (Chapter 5.3). An epigram of Callimachus⁵⁵ has the dedicated object say:

Κύπροθε Σιδόνιός με κατήγαγεν ἐνθάδε γαῦλος
 "A Sidonian *gaulos* brought me here from Cyprus." A Latin lexicographer affirms that the *gaulus* was "a type of ship nearly round," *genus nauigii paene rotundum*.⁵⁶

4.8 Nard and other ointments

Sanskrit *naladaḥ*; Heb. נָזַל, with suffix נָזַל; νόρδος; Latin *nardus*.⁵⁷ It probably came into the Mediterranean through Iranian, which lacked the consonant *l*. See the discussion by E. Masson.⁵⁸

At the classical symposium, as we saw (p. 140 above) the participants will have bathed, anointed themselves with perfumed unguents, and put on

51 The *gauloi* are discussed in Lionel Casson, *Ships and Seamanship in the Ancient World* (1971) 66.

52 Frag. 54, A. Kaibel, *Doriensium comoedia...* (1899) = Athenaeus 7.320C.

53 The *gauloi* in Herodotus (3.136-7, 6.17, 8.97) are all Phoenician; cf. further Xenophon *Anab.* 5.8.1, Aristophanes *Birds* 598-602.

54 GGM i.94.

55 Frag. 384.50 ed. Pfeiffer (1949) i.318.

56 Festus p. 85 ed. W. M. Lindsay (1913).

57 See W. H. Schoff, "Nard," *JAOS* 43 (1923) 216-228.

58 E. Masson, *Recherches* 56.

wreaths of flowers. The ancients did not have concentrated alcohol to dissolve scents in, and anyway the unguent, mostly olive oil, was better for the skin. In another fragment of Antiphanes,⁵⁹ one visits the perfumer's (μυροπώλης) and brings back cinnamon and nard ointments, κινναμώμινα, νάρδινα (μύρα). By the Roman period nard is preferred. The middle-aged Horace, borrowing a theme of Alcaeus,⁶⁰ suggests to his lady friend, "Why don't we lie down under this high platanus or pine, just as we are, scenting our grey hairs with roses while we can, and drink, anointed with Assyrian nard?" (*Carm.* 2.11.13-17).⁶¹

cur non sub alta uel platano uel hac
pinu iacentes sic temere et rosa
canos odorati capillos
dum licet, Assyriaque nardo
potamus uncti...?

As the symposiasts chip in to provide the necessities, Horace (*Carm.* 4.12.16-17) encourages his friend to get the most expensive item, "You can purchase wine with nard; a little onyx of nard will fetch a *cadus*":

nardo uina merebere
nardi paruus onyx eliciet cadum.

For nard is thought to win the girl's favor. Antiphilus of Byzantium (*Anth. Pal.* 6.250) sends his girl friend a purple chiton, rose-red wool for knitting, and "nard for your dark hair, enclosed in a grey glass bottle":

... ἐς κυανότριχα χαιτήν

νάρδον, ὑπὸ γλαυκῆς κλειομένην ὕαλου.

The function of nard as love-charm is verified by Cant 1,12-14, spoken by the girl: "While the king was on his couch, my nard (נָרְדֻס, LXX νάρδος, Vg *nardus*) gave forth its fragrance; my beloved is to me a bag of myrrh that lies between my breasts; my beloved is to me a cluster of henna blossoms (בֹּטְרֵס כִּפְרִי, βότρυσ τῆς κύπρου, *botrys cypri*)." (For the vocabulary see Chapter 2 above.) Schoff saw that nard, in its original language and home, is already a love-charm.⁶²

āñjanasya madughasya kuṣṭasya naladasya ca

turo bhagasya hastābhyām anurodhanam udbhare

"Of ointment, of *madugha* (licorice?), of costus, and of nard, by the hands of Bhaga, I bring up quick a means of subjection."

Nard originally denoted only Indian *Nardostachys Jatamansi* DC, but later also valerians of the same family. Costus is the root of *Saussurea lappa*

59 Antiphanes frag. 35 Kock ii.24 = Athenaeus 15.690A.

60 Alcaeus frag. 50 Lobel-Page, PLF p. 135.

61 Cf. Hor. *Epod.* 13.9, Tibullus 3.6.63-64.

62 *Atharva Veda* 6.1025-6; my colleague Roshni Rustomji has helped with the Sanskrit.

G. B. Clarke (Compositae) of the Kashmir. Pliny 12.41-42 knew that "a root and a leaf have the most value among the Indians: the root is costus...the leaf nard," *radix et folium Indis in maximo pretio: radix costi...de folio nardi*. Costus (putchuk) and nard as trade-items are discussed by Miller.⁶³

These poetic catalogues hardly do more than transcribe technical writers. That does not make them less poetic: for the Latin poets, nothing is more evocative than foreign lands and their exotic exports. And so Milton (*Comus* 998-991):

...there eternal Summer dwels,
And West winds, with musky wing
About the cedar'n alleys fling
Nard, and *Cassia's* balmy smels.

Theophrastus (*Hist. Plant.* 9.7.3) lists twenty plants used for unguents including nard and costus (κόστος). Pliny 13.18 describes a "royal" ointment made of 24 items—unless this is a list misinterpreted as a recipe. The Talmud (Bab. Talm. *Kerethoth* 6a) for the temple-incense combines the ingredients of the Biblical incense (Ex 30,34) with the anointing-oil (Ex 30,23f) and new items, most with international names: stacte, onycha ("fingernail"), galbanum, libanos, 70 minas ea.; myrrh, cassia, "spike of nard," crocus, 16 minas ea.; costus, 12 minas; bark (?), 3 minas; cinnamon, 9 minas:

הצרי והציפורן והחלכנה והלבונה ... מור וקציעה שיכולת נרד וכרכום ... הקושט
קילופה ... וקנמון

By counting correctly we can verify the "thirteen spices" (unspecified) of Josephus *BJ* 5.218. With Pliny 12.126 *galbanum* cf. Ex 30,34 הלְבָנָה (LXX χαλβάνην) and Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 9.7.2 χαλβάνην. These prescriptions are verified by actual dedications: a stone of Seleucus I⁶⁴ giving Apollo of Didyma cassia, costus etc.; a Christian text of the fourth century which lists properties in Tyre and Egypt supplying oil of nard, cassia, balsam, storax, stacte and saffron to St Paul's basilica in Rome.⁶⁵

The value of the spice-trade is verified by a tax-list (*uectigal*) of Marcus Aurelius⁶⁶ containing 54 items, among them costus, *nardi stachys* and 18 other spices; and by the attempt of Diocletian's Maximum-Price Edict to control "oil of nard" along with many other unguents.⁶⁷ Documents of the

63 Miller, *Spice Trade* 84-92.

64 OGIS 214.60 = C. B. Welles, *Royal Correspondence in the Hellenistic period...* (1934) no. 5.

65 L. Duchesne, *Le Liber Pontificalis* (1886-1892) i.178f.

66 Digest 39.4.16.5-7.

67 Ed. M. Giacchero, *Edictum Diocletiani et Collegarum de pretiis rerum venalium* (1974) 34.52.

actual spice-trade are the *Periplus* 39.13,⁶⁸ which lists costus and nard as passing through various ports; commercial papyri of the third century BC, one of which⁶⁹ lists Minaean libanos, "zmyrna," dry nard, "an alabaster of cinnamon ointment," and cassia; another⁷⁰ of 257 BC in the Zenon archive has "sealed bags" (against theft) of nard, libanos, smyrna, purple, and saffron.

The Phoenicians were the entrepreneurs at many points along the spice-route; they were with Alexander gathering "spikenard" (valerians?) in the desert of Gedrosia (Arrian, *Anab.* 6.22.5). Their mystifications (or somebody's) account for it that Arrian (7.20.2) describes the nard of Arabia, and Diodorus (2.49.3) the costus and cassia of Arabia Felix. Faure⁷¹ believes that the principal reason for Alexander's expedition was to control the sources or markets for spices. Aramaic Enoch in the Northeast describes the mountains of "choice nard, mastic, cardamom and pepper":⁷²

[נ]רד טב וצפר וקרדמן [ופ]לפלין

Mythical geography passes back into poetry. The paradise of Cant 4,13f (Chapter 2) contains nine spices and flowers, mostly non-Syrian. The *Stephanos* of Meleager of Gadara (*Anth. Pal.* 4.1) compares each poet he has "anthologized" to a flower. Besides crocus and myrrh, see vss 42-44:

φοίνισσάν τε νέην κύπρον ἀπ' Ἀντιπάτρου·
καὶ μὴν καὶ Συρίαν σταχυότριχα θήκατο νάρδον,
ἕμνοθέταν, Ἑρμοῦ δῶρον ἀειδόμενον.

"And he put in the fresh scarlet henna of Antipater, and the Syrian spikenard (valerian), the hymn-maker, Hermodorus." The flower-poetry of Jesus comes from the same part of the world and the same century.

At Mark 14,3 Jesus is anointed at a meal with ointment of nard, perhaps in token of his Messiahship, by a woman otherwise undefined; at Joh 12,3 she is Lazarus' sister Mary. Luk 7,37 describes a similar event, but without specifying the ointment as nard; here she is "of the city" like Horace's lady friend Lyde the *scortum* (*Carm.* 2.11.21). Mark is impressed with its cost: ἀλάβαστρον μύρου νάρδου πιστικῆς πολυτελοῦς "an alabaster jar of precious ointment of true(?) nard."

68 Ed. L. Casson (1989), 191-193.

69 Papyri greci e latini 6 (1920) no. 628.

70 C. C. Edgar, [Cairo] Zenon Papyri i (1925) no. 59069 = Select Papyri (Loeb) i.181.

71 P. Faure, *Parfums et Aromates de l'Antiquité* (1987) 177.

72 J. T. Milik, *The Books of Enoch: Aramaic Fragments of Qumran Cave 4* (1976) 232.

4.9 The bull

In Chapter 6 below I discuss the extensive parallelism between Hebrew and classical texts in the sacrificial cult involving the bull. Here I note a normal sequence in Mediterranean public religion: the sacrifice of a bull with the libation of wine. Thus at Num 15,10-11:

וַיִּזְן מִקְרִיב לְגֹסֶךָ ... כִּכָּה יַעֲשֶׂה לְשׂוֹר הָאֶחָד

"And you shall offer wine (LXX οἶνον) for the drink-offering...thus shall it be done for each bull (Luther *Stier*)." At Deut 33,17 the LXX for שׂוֹר בְּכוֹר etymologically has πρωτότοκος ταύρου, Vg *primogeniti tauri*. In Greek pagan religion I do not easily find a text with both the actual words ταῦρος and οἶνος, although the reality is frequent: thus when Alexander crossed the Hellespont "he sacrificed a bull to Poseidon and poured a libation from a golden vial to the Nereids" (Arrian *Anab.* 1.11.6), σφάξαντα ταῦρον τῷ Ποσειδῶνι καὶ Νηρηΐτι σπένδειν ἐκ χρυσοῦς φιάλης. There is an exact parallel to the Hebrew in the only classical texts with detailed ritual prescriptions—the tables of Iguvium in the Umbrian language. In the version in the Latin alphabet we read *uitlu toru trif fetu...heri uinu heri poni fetu*, "he shall sacrifice three calves of a bull (Latin **uitulos tauri*)...either with wine or with (other) drink he shall sacrifice."⁷³ Wine also appears as *vinum* in the Etruscan *liber linteus* of Zagreb.⁷⁴

As the bull is most frequently made a sacrifice to the high God, so the wine. Num 15:10 "wine...to Yahweh," לַיהוָה ... וַיִּזְן, LXX οἶνον ... κυρίῳ, Vg *uinum...Domino*. *Iliad* 6.266 "to pour out ruddy wine to Zeus," Διὶ λείβειν αἴθοπα οἶνον. Ovid *Fasti* 4.898 *uina Ioui*.

4.10 The tambourine

Hebrew תֶּף (LXX always τύμπανον and Vg *tympanum*), denominative verb תִּפֵּף, Phoenician מתִּפֵּף (KAI 49.7) "drummer"; τύπανον and later τύμπανον; Latin (from the Greek) *tympanum*. E. Masson⁷⁵ thinks it possibly a Semitic loanword in Greek. Greek *tympanon* can also designate a hand-drum; but in

73 J. W. Poultney, *The Bronze Tables of Iguvium*; *Philolog. Monogr. of the Am. Philolog. Assoc.* 18 (1959) VI.B.45-6; essentially identical is the doublet in the Umbrian alphabet, I.B.4-6.

74 M. Pallottino, *Testimonia Linguae Etruscae* (1954) p. 15, ix.6-7; the letters transcribed as *v* and *u* are distinguished in the Etruscan alphabet.

75 E. Masson, *Recherches* 94.

art it appears sometimes to have rattles attached, exactly like the modern tambourine.⁷⁶ Elsewhere⁷⁷ I discuss the use of the drum by Siberian shamans.

There is no strong evidence for an original Semitic root *tp̄p* or the like;⁷⁸ the participles תַּפְּפִיתָ Nah 2,8, תַּפְּפִיתָ Ps 68,26 (LXX τυμπανιστριῶν) seem clearly denominative. Also the usage of the *top̄* is foreign or at least abnormal. On the surface, τύπανον is derived from τύπτω "I strike" with the instrumental suffix -ανο-. But then it is remarkable that the Hebrew restores the original unsuffixed root. Greek usage suggests an Anatolian provenance, either with folk-etymology to τύπτω, or from an Anatolian cognate to it. Greek *mp* is a good equivalent to Hebrew *pp*, since Hebrew doubled stops normally appear in Greek as nasal plus stop; compare the words for "lamp, lightning," λαμπάδ- and לַמְּבָרָה.

Our fullest statement of Dionysiac cult and orgy is the *Bacchae* of Euripides; there is a summary of its features in his *Cyclops* 63-67:

οὐ τάδε Βρόμιος, οὐ τάδε χοροὶ
 Βάκχαι τε θυρσοφόροι,
 οὐ τυμπάνων ἀλαλαγμοὶ
 κρήναις παρ' ὕδροχύτοις,
 οὐκ οἴνου γλωραὶ σταγόνες.

"Bromios (Dionysus) is not here, nor are the choruses, the Bacchantes carrying their *thyrsoi*, the noise of tambourines by watery springs, yellow drops of wine." A papyrus letter⁷⁹ of 256 BC shows us the reality of the tambourinist at a feast—no doubt accompanied by wine:

ἀπόστειλον δὲ ἡμῖν καὶ Ζηνόβιον τὸν μαλακὸν ἔχοντα τύμπανον καὶ κύμβαλα καὶ κρόταλα, χρεῖα γάρ ἐστιν ταῖς γυναιξίν πρὸς τὴν θυσίαν.
 "Send us on also Zenobios the effeminate with his tambourine, cymbals and castanets; the women need him for the sacrifice."

Zenobios has a counterpart in Bob Dylan's *Mr. Tambourine Man* (1964):

Hey! Mr. Tambourine Man, play a song for me.
 I'm not sleepy and there is no place I'm going to.
 Hey! Mr. Tambourine Man, play a song for me.
 In the jingle jangle morning I'll come followin' you.

Like Dionysus, the Tambourine Man dispenses a drug of oblivion—and on shipboard, *Take me on a trip upon your magic swirlin' ship*; and does a

76 A seeming *tympanum* with rattles in a Pompeian fresco from the "house of Lucretius": Daremberg-Saglio i.625a, fig. 703; see a Phoenician ceramic piece of a woman playing a tambourine, DCCP Plate V.c.

77 "The Mediterranean Seer and Shamanism," ZAW 93 (1981) 374-400, p. 381.

78 DISO 332.

79 *P.Hibeh* I (1906) no. 54.

variation on the proverb "Sufficient unto the day" (Chapter 9), *Let me forget about today until tomorrow*.

Isa 24,7-9 describes the overthrow of a village festival:

אָבֶל תִּירוֹשׁ	אֶמְלֵלָהּ-גִּפְּן
נֶאֱנָחוּ כָּל-שִׂמְחֵי-לֵב	שָׁבַת מְשׁוֹשׁ תַּפִּים
חָדַל שְׂאוֹן עֲלִיזִים	שָׁבַת מְשׁוֹשׁ כְּגוֹר
בְּשִׁיר לֹא יִשְׁתוּ-יַיִן	יִמַר שֶׁכָּר לְשִׁתּוֹ

"The *tiyrows* mourns, the vine languishes (LXX πενθήσει οἶνος, πενθήσει ἄμπελος); those merry in heart sigh, the mirth of the tambourines (*tympanon*, *tympanorum*) is stilled; the noise of the jubilant has ceased, the mirth of the lyre (κιθάρας, *citharae*) is stilled; no more do they drink wine (οἶνον, *uinum*) with singing, strong drink (σίκερα)⁸⁰ is bitter to its drinkers." Especially when in sect. 12 below we connect *tiyrowš* and Greek *thyrsos*, the two scenes look very much alike.

In both societies women or homosexuals have a practical monopoly on the tambourine. Aristophanes, looking back to the sailing for Syracuse in 415 BC, asks (*Lysistrata* 387-9):

ἄρ' ἐξέλαμπε τῶν γυναικῶν ἡ τρυφή
 χῶ τυμπανισμὸς χοῖ πυκνοὶ Σαβάζιοι
 ὃ τ' Ἀδωνιασμὸς οὐτός οὐπὶ τῶν στεγῶν;

"Has the women's abandon broken out again, the shaking of timbrels, the celebrations for Sabazios, this mourning for Adonis on the roofs?" ("Ἀδωνίς represents ἰδῆ as the title "Lord" of the god Tammuz.⁸¹) The Homeric Hymn to the Mother of the Gods (14.3) says that she is pleased with "the sound of castanets and tambourines, the wailing of flutes":

ἦ κροτάλων τυπάνων τ' ἰαχὴ σύν τε βρόμος αὐλῶν/εὔαδεν

Euripides *Bacchae* 59 says that the *tympana* were the invention of Rhea and Dionysus.

Likewise in Israel the tambourine is associated with women, more prominent than in normal Mosaic religion. Jephthah's daughter comes out playing the *tuppiym*, is sacrificed, and yearly lamented by the daughters of Israel (Jud 11,34-40)—a sequence with parallels to the cult of Adonis. The *tympanon* is the instrument of Miriam the ecstatic (Ex 15,20) and of Judith (Judith 16,20). Milton, reading between the lines, guessed a Canaanite origin of the *toḗ* in the cult of "Moloch" (*Par. Lost* 1.394f):

Though for the noyse of Drums and Timbrels loud
 Their childrens cries unheard.

Lucretius (2.618-620) lists instruments in the cult of Cybele:

80 Note this LXX transcription of the Hebrew.

81 For Adonis see p. 245 below.

Tympana tenta tonant palmis et cymbala circum
 concaua, raucisonoque minantur cornua cantu
 et Phrygio stimulat numero caua tibia mentis.

"They strike the stretched *tympana* (drums here rather than tambourines) with their palms, and the hollowed cymbals; the horns threaten with their hoarse song, and the hollow flute stirs emotions in its Phrygian mode." So when the ark is brought up to Jerusalem (II Sam 6,5), David and all Israel make merry before Yahweh with "zithers, lyres, tambourines, castanets, cymbals":

וּבְכַנְרֹת וּבְנִבְלִים וּבְתַפִּים וּבְמַנְעֻנְעִים וּבְצִלְצָלִים

Vg *et citharis et lyris* (LXX *νάβλαις*) *et tympanis et sistris et cymbalis*. From נִבְּל comes *νάβλαις*⁸² and *nablia* (Ovid *Ars Am.* 3.327). There is some agreement then for an international cultic or orgiastic orchestra. A similar list in Isa 5,12 at a symposium, "zither and harp, tambourine and flute":

וְהָיָה כְּגֹר וְנִבְּל תִּתֵּן וְנִבְּלִים

LXX *κιθάρας καὶ ψαλτηρίου καὶ τυμπάνων καὶ αὐλῶν*. Saul meets a band of prophets with exactly the same orchestra (I Sam 10,5).

The indecent "triangle" dance. The orchestra of II Sam 6,5 presumably continued when David did his indecent dance (6,15-23). At another victory celebration (I Sam 18,6) the women came out to meet Saul and David *וּבְשֵׁלֶשֶׁת תַּפִּים בְּשִׂמְחָה* "with tambourines, rejoicing and 'triangles'." Eupolis in the *Baptai* shows an Athenian in women's dress:⁸³

ὄς καλῶς μὲν τυμπανίζεις
 καὶ διαψάλλεις τριγώνοις
 κάπικινεῖς ταῖς κοχώναις
 καὶ τιθεῖς ἄνω σκέλη

"You who play the tambourine nicely, and sing to the 'triangle,' and swing with your bottom, and lift your legs." Juba⁸⁴ said that the *trigonos* was a Syrian invention; the 'triangles' cannot be further identified.

4.11 The (unripe) grape-cluster

בֶּרֶךְ "unripe grapes"; βότρυς "grape-cluster." Szemerényi⁸⁵ regards the Greek as a loan from the Semitic. At least we have here an old Mediterranean

82 Philemon frag. 44 Kock ii. 489 = Athenaeus 4.175D.

83 Eupolis frag. 77 Kock i.276.

84 Juba, Jacoby FGH 275 F 15 = Athenaeus 4.175D.

85 O. Szemerényi, review of Chantraine in *Glotta* 43 (1971) 661.

word of uncertain origin. A Phoenician city is called Βότρυς (Strabo 16.2.18). It appears with the word for "vine." Job 15,33 "He will shake off, like the vine, his unripe grapes": בָּרַדְוּ בְּפֶנֶן בְּרִמָּה; *Homeric Hymn to Dionysus* 7.39-40 "a vine with clusters" ἄμπελος ... βότρυες. And in proverbs relating to ripening of the grapes. Jer 31:29 "The fathers have eaten sour grapes (LXX ὄμφακα), and the sons' teeth are set on edge":

אָבוֹת אָכְלוּ בֶּרֶךְ וְשׁוֹנֵי בְנֵיהֶם תִּקְהִינָה

Julian *Or.* 7.225B "cluster ripens beside cluster," βότρυς πρὸς βότρυν πεπαίνεται. As conclusion to the fable of the fox and grapes (Babrius 19.8), the fox says "sour grapes," ὄμφαξ ὁ βότρυς.

4.12 The vine-stem

Heb. שִׁירֵת "(new?) wine," Phoenician שרת; Hieroglyphic Luvian *tuwarsa*; θύρσος "branch" (Hesychius), "staff twined with ivy and vine"; Latin *thyrsus* the same, also "stalk of lettuce."⁸⁶

The interpretation and also the transcription of Hieroglyphic Hittite, better "Luvian," are still rudimentary. An inscription of Sultanhan in Turkey, as interpreted by Meriggi,⁸⁷ refers to a god ^DTRH-hu-í-n tu-wa-r-s³-sa-a-an "Tarhui of the vine." Paragraphs 24-25 read: à-wa TRH-hu-í-s-í-a tu-wa-r-s³-í ma-s-ha-na-a-ti à-wa wa-à-na-a-s ?a-r-tí-a, "And (the god) Tarhui will favor(?) this vineyard, and the vine (will grow?)." In spite of all uncertainties, the apparent sense of *tuwarsa* is a midpoint between the ritual vine-staff and the vine. Latin *thyrsus* "stalk of lettuce" (Suetonius *Aug.* 77, Pliny 19.129) preserves an older meaning lost from the Greek except in Hesychius, and nearer to the Hittite.

Our comparison (4.10 above) of Isa 24,7-9 with Dionysiac texts is even more pointed if *tiyrowš* / *thyrsos* is an old ritual word differently specialized in the two languages. The connection of *thyrsos* with wine is clear from Euripides *Bacchae* 706-711:

ἄλλη δὲ νάρθηκ' ἐς πέδον καθῆκε γῆς,
καὶ τῆδε κρήνην ἐξανῆκ' οἴνου θεός·
... ἐκ δὲ κισσίνων
θύρσων γλυκεῖαι μέλιτος ἔσταζον ῥοαί.

86 For a connection among these words see Sereni (note 18 above) 105ff; Delcor (note 19 above) 351-353; C. Rabin, "Hittite Words in Hebrew," *Orientalia* 32 (1963) 113-139, esp. p. 137.

87 P. Meriggi, *Manuale di eteo geroglifico II.1, Incunabula graeca* 14 (1967) 116-119.

"Another (Bacchant) struck her narthex into the ground, and the god sent up for her a fountain of wine...and from the ivied thyrsos there flowed sweet streams of honey." *Tiyrowš* forms part of an old formula,⁸⁸ which once includes honey, II Chr 31,5 "grain, wine, oil, honey": **דָּגָן תִּירוֹשׁ וַיִּצְחַר וַיִּדְבֵּשׁ** . It was certainly fermented, Hos 4,11 **וַיִּזַּן וַתִּירוֹשׁ יִקַּח לֵב** "wine and *tiyrowš* take away the heart." It was formulaic in Hebrew because it was the normal word in Phoenician. Thus in the Karatepe bilingual:⁸⁹

וכן הקרת ז בעלת שבוע ותרוש ועם ז אש ישב בו יכן בעל אלפס ובעל צאן ובעל
שבוע ותרוש

"And this city will be mistress of grain (lit. 'plenty') and of wine; and this people which lives in it will be master of oxen, master of sheep, master of grain and of wine." The use of **שבוע** "grain" appears at Prov 3,10

וַיִּמְלֵא אֶסְמִיךָ שְׂבֹעַ וַתִּירוֹשׁ יִקְבִּיךָ יִפְרֹצֵי

"Then your barns will be filled with plenty (LXX σίτου 'grain') and your vats will be bursting with wine."

Antiochus IV in 169 BC forced the Jews into Dionysiac processions wearing ivy-wreaths (κισσοῦς, II Makk 6,7); you might expect *thyrsos* also. Either he found something in contemporary cult which suggested it, or his innovations caught on in spite of all. For not long after in 164 BC (II Makk 10,7) the rebels celebrated the rededication in the same manner, carrying "*thyrsos* and fair branches and palm fronds," **θύρσους καὶ κλάδους ὠραίους, ἔτι δὲ καὶ φοίνικας**. Morton Smith,⁹⁰ starting from our passage in Achilles Tatius (Introd., above), takes these passages at more than face value, and concludes that Yahweh from the beginning had attributes of Dionysus. Stern⁹¹ holds that "Jewish writers in Greek used *θύρσος* for the *lulav*," and likewise Goldstein;⁹² but it is strange that the author of II Maccabees, who knew that ivy belonged to Dionysus, innocently should use *thyrsos* as if wholly Jewish. The natural conclusion is that some syncretism for a time took place in Jewish ceremony.

88 L. Köhler, "Eine archaische Wortgruppe," ZAW n.F. 5, 46 (1928) 218-220. With Deut 28,51 LXX σίτον οἶνον ἔλαιον cf. Aristophanes *Thes.* 420 ἀλφίτων ἔλαιον σίτον.

89 KAI 26A III.7-9 & C IV.7-9. I cannot determine the translation in the Hieroglyphic Hittite version.

90 Morton Smith, "On the Wine God in Palestine (Gen. 18, Jn 2, and Achilles Tatius)," Salo Wittmayer Baron Jubilee Volume (1974) ii.815-829.

91 Menahem Stern, *Greek and Latin Authors on Jews and Judaism* (1976-1984) i.561 on Plutarch, cited below.

92 J. A. Goldstein on II Makk 10,7, *Anchor Bible* (1983): "If a non-Greek ritual object had some resemblance to one used by Greeks, Greeks would naturally give the non-Greek object the same Greek name as their own."

Judith, whom we saw with a *tympanon*, likewise takes up *thyrsos* and distributes them to her women (Judith 15,12). Plutarch thought that there was a festival at which the Jews "go into the Temple bearing *thyrsos*," and others playing the lyre (κιθαριζοντες); and that somewhere on the Temple was carved θύρσος ἐντετυπωμένος καὶ τύμπανα "an engraved *thyrsos* and tambourines."⁹³ Tacitus (*Hist.* 5.5) combines this report with the sacred orchestra:

sed quia sacerdotes eorum tibia tympanisque concinebant, hederam uinciebantur, uitisque aurea in templo reperta, Liberum patrem coli, domitorem Orientis, quidam arbitrati sunt.

"But since their priests sang to the flute and tambourines, and were wreathed with ivy, and a golden vine was found in the temple, some have thought that they worshipped Liber Pater, the conqueror of the East."

The presence of a golden vine in the Temple is well established; the Mishna (*Middoth* III.8) describes it:

גפן של זהב היתה עומדת על פתחו של היכל ומודלה על גבי כלונסות

"A golden vine stood by the door of the Temple and was trained over the tops of the columns (כלונסות for Latin accus. plural *columnas*)"; offerings were made in the form of a golden leaf or berry or cluster and added to it. Josephus (*BJ* 5.210, *AJ* 15.395) describes its grape-clusters as tall as a man. But there was another golden vine there, which Aristobulus sent to Pompey; Strabo (quoted by Josephus *AJ* 14.36-37) called it a garden (κῆπος) and said its name was τερπωλή. Hence Marcus (in Josephus *ad loc.*) conjectures that its Hebrew name was עֵדֶן "delight," and that it represented the Garden of Eden. Pliny 37.14 describes what appears to be the identical object from the Acts of Pompey's triumphs, *Pompei triumphorum acta*, "a square mountain of gold with stags, lions and fruit trees of every kind, surrounded with a golden vine," *montem aureum quadratum cum ceruis et leonibus et pomis omnium generis circumdata uite aurea*. Here is evidence mostly overlooked that Jews also saw Eden as the "mountain of God" (Ez 28,14); and one of its trees, most likely the Tree of Life, as a golden vine.⁹⁴ Then Milton (*Paradise Lost* 4.257-260) was not all that innovative in planting the vine in Eden:

Another side, umbrageous Grotts and Caves
Of coole recess, o're which the mantling Vine
Layes forth her purple Grape, and gently creeps
Luxuriant...

93 Plutarch, *Quaest. conviv.* 4.6.2 = *Mor.* 671D.

94 See the discussion in H. Heubner & W. Fauth, *Tacitus: Historien Bd V* (1982) 86-87.

Chapter 5: Peace Symbolism in Ancient Military Vocabulary¹

The precious novelty represented by the Mediterranean city-state with its walled acropolis at first required physical defense. It had to maintain its existence in a world of fire and sword far removed from the peaceful matriarchies conjectured in old Europe.² Cicero gives the fixed Latin formula, *huic urbi ferro ignique minitantur* "they threaten this city with sword and fire" (*Philip.* 11.37). Likewise Jud 1,8 (cf. Isa 66,16) "and smote it with the mouth of the sword, and burned the city with fire":³

וַיִּכְרַח לְפָנֵי־הַרְבֵּב וְאֶת־הָעִיר שָׁלַח בְּאֵשׁ

Vergil (*Aen.* 4.626) has Dido the Phoenician adapt the phrase in her evocation of Hannibal, *face...ferroque*. Two beautifully parallel texts show the fate of a city that did not take thought for its preservation. "As when the smoke of a burning city goes up to the broad heaven..." (*Iliad* 21.522-523):

ὥς δ' ὅτε καπνὸς ἰὼν εἰς οὐρανὸν εὐρύν ἴκηται

ἄστεος αἰθομένοιο ...

So Jos 8,20 (cf Jud 20,40) "the smoke of the city went up to heaven":

לָעָלָה עָשָׁן הָעִיר הַשְּׂמִימָה

where the LXX Homericly has καπνὸν ἀναβαίνοντα ἐκ τῆς πόλεως εἰς τὸν οὐρανόν.

On the citadel there rose a temple to the high God who provided the rain, as to Yahweh at Jerusalem and to Iuppiter Optimus Maximus on the Capitoline at Rome; or alternatively, to one of his associates, as at Athens, whose name Ἀθῆναι is just the plural of its tutelary goddess.⁴ Homer ascribes to Athena

1 Revision of an article with the same title in Vet. Test. 21 (1971) 1-23.

2 Marija Gimbutas, *The Goddesses and Gods of Old Europe, 6500-3500 BC: Myths and Cult Images*; 2 ed. (1982) 238: "The earliest European civilization was savagely destroyed by the patriarchal element and it never recovered, but its legacy lingered in the substratum which nourished further European cultural developments."

3 Reversal of the more natural idiom at Hos 8,14 etc. וְשָׂלַחְתִּי־אֵשׁ בְּצָרְיָי "And I shall send fire on his cities."

4 But there is no special tendency in Greek for the tutelary divinity whose temple rests on the citadel to be Zeus: the altar of Zeus at Pergamum is on the acropolis, but the temples of Zeus at Acragas, Dodona and Olympia are in the plain. The temple of Tyre

a temple on the acropolis of Troy, frequented by women (*Iliad* 6.297); but Zeus also felt that his altar there never lacked attention (4.48 etc.). Yahweh is often spoken of as a *fortress* (Ps 18,3 with several synonyms); Luther, working over Ps 46, called him a *feste Burg*. The city wall was indispensable to protect the law which it enclosed. Heraclitus⁵ said that "The people must fight for its law as for its wall," μάχεσθαι χρῆ τὸν δῆμον ὑπὲρ τοῦ νόμου ὅκωσπερ τείχεος. If the wall is destroyed, all (it seemed) was lost: "Yahweh determined to lay in ruins the *wall* (תַּמִּית, LXX τεῖχος) of the daughter of Zion; ...her king and princes are among the nations, the *law* (הַיָּת, LXX νόμος) is no more" (Thr 2,8-9).⁶

Military readiness originally had the indispensable function of guarding the city and its citadel, where alone the new emergent of free humanity appeared at about the same time in Israel and Hellas. The earliest alphabetic texts are epics of war, which still approach the horror of their topic with a singular realism; their heroes are men of war, an Achilles or David. It might seem as if only defensive techniques were needed; but we all know that the best defense is a good offense. The classical parallel to this modern proverb contrasts peace and war: Vegetius 3 prol. *qui desiderat pacem praeparet bellum* "Let him who desires peace prepare for war."⁷ Aristotle cautions⁸ that "war is for the sake of peace," πόλεμον μὲν εἰρήνης χάριν; and so Cicero (*de off.* 1.35) *suscienda quidem bella sunt ob eam causam, ut sine iniuria in pace uiuatur* "wars are to be undertaken so that one may live unharmed in peace."⁹ Hebrew sees war and peace as simple opposites: Koh 3,8 (cf Mic 3,5; Deut 20,10-12) "a time for war and a time for peace,"

עַתָּה מְלָחָמָה וְעַתָּה שְׁלוֹמַי

LXX καιρὸς πολέμου καὶ καιρὸς εἰρήνης, Vg *tempus belli et tempus pacis*. So Heraclitus¹⁰ (cf. *Iliad* 2.797) "God is day and night, winter and summer, war and peace," ὁ θεός ... πόλεμος εἰρήνη; Livy 2.1.1 *res pace belloque gestas* "deeds done in peace and war."

was to "Heracles" (Herodotus 2:44), i.e. Melqarth; the temple on the citadel of Carthage was of Asclepius, τὸ Ἀσκληπιεῖον Strabo 17.3.14, and the Carthaginian dedications CIS 1.4834-4836 are each by a "slave of the house of Eshmun," עַבְד בֵּית אֵשְׁמוֹן.

5 Frag. 44, Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ i.160.

6 But Levin translates "her king and princes are among the nations [where] there is no law."

7 Generally cited as *si uis pacem, para bellum*; in English form a proverb since 1548 (ODEP³ 616).

8 Aristotle *Pol.* 7.13.8 = 1333a35 echoing Plato, *Leg.* 628D. Further catena in Grotius 3.25.2.

9 As an English proverb since 1399 (ODEP³ 866) "For of bataile the final ende is pees" (Gower).

10 Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ Heraclitus frag. 67, i.165.

Later however the humanism generated and protected by the militant city-state came to see itself as an international society, an academy or synagogue, whose highest task was precisely to preserve those texts which narrated its origins. As such it no longer needed that original military protection, which it viewed as more and more inconsistent with its own ideals. In the end military protection was taken away from it. About 587 BC Nebuchadnezzar took Jerusalem by siege and broke down its walls (II Reg 25,10). In 404 BC the Long Walls of Athens between the city and Piraeus were torn down "to the music of flute-girls"; perhaps by the returning exiles themselves rather than by the Lacedaemonians, although Xenophon (*Hell.* 2.2.23) leaves it ambiguous.

But before the wall was destroyed, both in Jerusalem and the Greek city-states its most precious contents had been transferred to international institutions which no longer needed the protection of the wall. Tertullian in a famous passage (*de praescript. haer.* 7.9)¹¹ asks *Quid ergo Athenis et Hierosolymis? quid academiae et ecclesiae?* "What then have Athens and Jerusalem to do with each other? What do the academy and the church?" The very form of the questions demands an answer "Much" rather than the "Nothing" he intended. For by putting Athens and Jerusalem in parallel he shows that they are examples of the same genus; he does not compare either with the capitals of the Ancient Near Eastern empires, Memphis or Nineveh. And he shows further that in his own understanding the academy and the church (with its predecessor the synagogue) are the true heirs of the city-states.

So in fact the Law of Moses survived its apparent requiem in Thr 2,9. The rebuilding of the walls by Nehemiah, perhaps in 445 BC, was transitional; Eliot (*Choruses to the Rock*, IV) in a burst of conservatism sees it as necessary then as always (Neh 4,16-18):

So they built as men must build
with the sword in one hand and the trowel in the other.

But at a fairly early date local synagogues rose up. Ps 74,8

שָׂרְפוּ כָל-מוֹעֲדֵי-אֱלֹהִים בְּאֶרֶץ

while of uncertain date certainly means "they have burned all the meeting places of God (Luther *Gotteshäuser*) in the land." If the physical synagogue is burned on one Sabbath, its members if still alive and at freedom can meet on the next Sabbath. For many centuries, even if the scrolls of the Law or of Homer were burned, they could be recited and reconstructed from memory. The only wall that academy or synaogue needed was similar to itself; the very beginning of Rabbinic tradition is the precept (*Avoth* I.1):

וְעָשׂוּ סִיג לַתּוֹרָה

11 Corp. Christ. ser. lat. 1.193.

"and make a fence for the Torah." Rabbi 'Aqiba (*Avoth* III.14) defined the fence as tradition, תורה.

As the old walled city-states fell to newer empires—Babylon, Persia, Macedon, Rome—the concept of citizenship was transformed. Zeno of Citium with his Phoenician background may have played a role in mediating ideas from the Semitic world to the Greek. Epictetus the former slave defines man as a "citizen of the world," πολίτης ... τοῦ κόσμου (*Arrian Epic.* 2.10.3). Cicero (*Leg.* 1.61) contrasts the new state of affairs and the old, without himself being able to step beyond Rome: *seseque non... circumdatum moenibus popularem alicuius definiti loci, sed ciuem totius mundi quasi unius urbis agnouerit*: "[When the mind] recognizes that it is not shut in by walls as the resident of some fixed spot, but is a citizen of the whole world, as of a single city,..." The acropolis can be seen, not as a place of safety, but as the seat of a tyrant, which however is to be overthrown not by "fire and sword" but by right opinions: οὐ σιδήρῳ οὐδὲ πυρὶ (*Arrian Epic.* 4.1.86). In Israel, Zion the "city of God" is the birthplace of all nations (Ps 87), and its temple "a house of prayer for all peoples" (Isa 56,7, cf. Mark 11,17). The author of Hebrews makes a great point of it that the salvation event happened "outside the gate," ἔξω τῆς πύλης (Heb 13,12); for "here we have no abiding city" (Heb 13,14, beautifully set in Brahms' *Deutsches Requiem*), "our citizenship (πολίτευμα, Luther *Heimat*) is in heaven" (Phil 3,20).

Thus in principle the original rationale for the existence of military readiness, whether defensive or offensive, has been removed, although the world at large is remarkably slow about realizing that fact. Already in the ancient world the old military character of the hero comes to be used metaphorically to describe new ideals of character—the philosopher and prophet. Socrates the good soldier found it inconceivable (*Plato Apol.* 28E) that when the god had stationed him to spend his life searching out wisdom (τοῦ δὲ θεοῦ τάττοντος ... φιλοσοφούντά με δεῖν ζῆν) he should leave his post (λίπομι τὴν τάξιν) for fear of death. So God tells the prophet (Jer 1,10) "I have stationed you (נִתְּנָתָּהּ, LXX κατέστακά σε) this day over peoples and kingdoms." The character ascribed to the divinity undergoes a comparable transformation.

This general parallelism between the two societies is made more concrete when we can attach it to common vocabulary items and literary motifs. Such motifs are generated in particular by military innovations entering the city-states at about the same time and bringing their names with them. Here then I discuss three such innovations—the bronze defensive panoply, the iron offensive lance, and the tent—and show how their use passes from a literal description of war to a figurative description of peace. In another

place¹² I similarly discuss the symbolic themes generated by the words for "arrows" (ῥῆπ, ὄστοί, *sagittae*).

5.1 The defensive panoply

The single combat of Homeric heroes, if ever real, was firmly displaced in Greece about 650 BC by the mutual clash and pushing of two heavily armed "hoplite" phalanxes.¹³ But the "panoply" of defensive items, though their shape and functions changed, bridges the two periods. Livy (1.43.2), describing the reforms of Servius Tullius, gives a concise definition of ancient armor: *galea, clipeum, ocreae, lorica, omnia ex aere, haec ut tegumenta corporis essent; tela in hostem hastaque et gladius*, "helmet, round shield, greaves, breastplate, all of bronze, to protect the body; as weapons against the enemy, spear and sword." Polybius (6.23) expands this and replaces *clipeus* by the long shield, *scutum*: the "Roman panoply," ἡ Ῥωμαϊκὴ πανοπλία, consists of the long shield, θυρεός; bronze helmet, περικεφαλαία χαλκῆ; greaves, προκνημίδες; chain-mail breastplate, ἀλυσιδωτούς ... θώρακας; and various offensive weapons. The four defensive items in their original form are a Late Bronze development, which generates parallel literary motifs in Israel and Hellas.¹⁴ In both societies this panoply lends itself to allegorization of spiritual defence; whereas the iron attacking weapons generate the motif of being hammered in and out of existence.

The word "panoply" first appears as adjective in a poem of Tyrtaeus the Spartan, describing a battle of two infantry phalanxes,¹⁵

τοῖσι πανόπλοισιν πλησίον ἰστάμενοι

"standing opposite their fully-armed opponents." Herodotus, who describes foreign arms fully, feels the πανοπλίη Ἑλληνικὴ (4.180.3) too familiar to warrant description. Homer delights us by describing the familiar; never static, he brings a man's armor before us by getting him dressed in it. A fixed item in the oral repertory is a description of the warrior arming himself, used for both Trojans and Achaeans.¹⁶ The basic formula is:

12 "Archery in the Ancient World," *BibZ* 37 (1993) 26-42.

13 See V. D. Hanson (ed.), *Hoplites: The Classical Greek Battle Experience*, 1991.

14 For the archaeology of Greek armor, see A. M. Snodgrass, *Early Greek Armour and Weapons from the end of the Bronze Age to 600 B.C.* (1964); —, *Arms and Armour of the Greeks* (1967); H. L. Lorimer, *Homer and the Monuments* (1950); *Archaeologia Homerica* I.E.1-2 "Kriegswesen" (1977-1980).

15 Tyrtaeus frag. 11.38 West IEG ii.157.

16 For Paris, *Iliad* 3.330-338; for Agamemnon, 11.17-43; for Ajax, 15.478-482 (a shorter

κνημίδας μὲν πρῶτα περὶ κνήμησιν ἔθηκε
καλὰς ἀργυρέοισιν ἐπισφυρίοις ἀραρυίας·
δεύτερον αὖ θώρηκα περὶ στήθεσσι ἐδυνεν ...
ἀμφὶ δ' ἄρ' ὤμοισιν βάλετο ξίφος ἀργυρόηλον
χάλκεον, αὐτὰρ ἔπειτα σάκος μέγα τε στιβαρόν τε.
κρατὶ δ' ἐπ' ἰφθιμῷ κυνέην εὐτυκτον ἔθηκεν
ἵππουριν, δεινὸν δὲ λόφος καθύπερθεν ἔνευεν.

"First he put on his shins fair greaves, fitted with silver ankle-straps. Second, he put a breastplate on his chest. And across his shoulders he slung the bronze sword fitted with silver studs, then afterwards the large heavy shield. And on his strong head he set the well-made helmet with a horse-hair crest; the plume nodded terribly above it." Finally one or two spears may be added, in varying language. The Achaean warrior dressed himself from bottom to top. Hephaestus made Achilles only the four defensive items, in the order shield, thorax, helmet with cheek-pieces, greaves (*Iliad* 18.609-613).

A unique Hebrew text, the description of Goliath (I Sam 17,5-7), is more or less contemporary with the *Iliad* and strikingly similar. His name תְּלִיָּא is roughly comparable with Lydian Alyattes ('Αλυάττης, Herodotus 1.6), which appears on coins as something like *valves*.¹⁷ "There was a helmet (טַבַּחַת, LXX περικεφαλαία, Vg *cassis*) of bronze on his head, and he was clothed in a breastplate of scales (מִשְׁרָפָה יִיִרֹשׁ, θώρακα ἀλυσιδωτόν, *lorica squamata*); and the weight of the breastplate was 5000 shekels of bronze. And there were greaves (תְּנִיָּו, κνημίδες, *ocreae*) of bronze on his legs, and a javelin (יִדְבִּי) of bronze between his shoulders. And the shaft of his spear was like a weaver's beam; and the point (תְּבִיָּה, λόγχη, *ferrum*) of his spear was 600 shekels of iron. And the bearer of his shield (תְּנִיָּה) walked before him." Iron is just coming in. The style of the passage, giving weights, is related to palace-inventories like those of Amarna, Ugarit or Cnossus. The eye goes naturally from the top down. The LXX and Vulgate no longer knew what the big man-covering shield (תְּנִיָּה) was, but realized that Goliath must have a shield, and so interpret יִדְבִּי as ἀσπίς, *clipeus*. The LXX interpret helmet and breastplate in the exact language of their contemporary Polybius. Greaves do not reappear in the Hebrew Bible; the three remaining defensive pieces (including תְּנִיָּה) are carried by the Lydians at Carchemish (Jer 46,4). Sirach 46,6 attributes a *panoplia* to Joshua.

list, since he is an archer); for Patroclus, 16.131-139; for Achilles, 19.369-373.

17 J. Friedrich, KASD 123. Anchises (Ἀγχίσσης *Iliad* 5.268) beloved of Aphrodite also likely bears the same name as another Philistine of Gath, king שִׁכְזָא (I Sam 21,12), especially in view of the LXX Ἀγχούς; see D. Christensen in ABD i.55-56.

The Iliadic formula is imitated in an almost complete poem of Alcaeus,¹⁸ describing the armor of his own day. In Page's translation:¹⁹ "The great house is agleam with bronze, and all the roof is full-dressed with shining helmets (κυνίαισι); white horse-hair plumes wave down from them —adornments for the heads of men. Bronze shining greaves (κνάμιδες) hang round and hide the pegs—a fence against the arrow's might. Corslets (θόρρακες) of fresh linen and hollow shields (ἄσπιδες) lie thrown upon the floor. Beside them are blades (σπάθαι) from Chalcis, beside them many a belt and tunic. These we may not forget, since first we stood to this our task." Page believes this to be an old-fashioned pre-hoplite outfit.

Vergil in his asymmetric way adapts the making of Achilles' shield by Hephaestus, when Venus (*Aen.* 8.620-5) brings the arms of the Roman future to Aeneas:

terribilem cristis *galeam* flammisque minantem
 fatiferumque *ensem*, *loricam* ex aere rigentem
 sanguineam ingentem, qualis cum caerulea nubes
 solis inardescit radiis longaeque refulget;
 tum leuis *ocreas* electro auroque recocto
hastamque et clipei non enarrabile textum.

"The helmet bristling with its crest and shooting flames; the death-dealing sword; the great blood-red breastplate stiff with bronze, as when a dark cloud takes fire from the rays of the sun and shines far; then the greaves, smooth with electrum and refined gold; the javelin; and the indescribable design of the shield." In fact Vergil goes on to describe the design of the shield for a hundred more sumptuous lines. It is a common comparison that Achilles' shield (p. 109 above) on the one hand represents the whole world with two cities, one at war and one in peace, and in fact comes from a rationalized creation-narrative; whereas Aeneas' shield represents coming history down to the poet's own time. It ends with the battle of Actium, Augustus' triumph and universal pacification, "Euphrates now went more gently with its waves" (*Aen.* 8.726).

The name of the helmet. Its Hebrew name is also spelled קִנְיָע (Ez 23,24, and with variants at I Sam 17,38); the variation suggests a foreign word. It is worn by foreign troops (Ez 23,24; 38,5; Jer 46,4). In the defense of Tyre (Ez 27,10), the small shield (קִנְיָע) and helmet (כִּנְיָע) were hung up by "Persians and Lydians and Libyans" (so the LXX): פָּרִיס וְלִיָּדִים וְלִיָּבְיָנִים. We might then expect to find such a Philistine-Lyidian item at Troy; and in fact there is a suitable Epic word, κτύμβαχος, which in its unique original use means "crest of helmet" or the like.²⁰ *Iliad* 15 describes a battle between Dolops the

18 Alcaeus frag. 357, Lobel-Page, PLF p. 274.

19 D. L. Page, *Sappho and Alcaeus* (1955) 211.

Trojan and Meges the Achaean. First Dolops casts at Meges; then (*Iliad* 15.535-538):

τοῦ δὲ Μέγης κόρυθος χαλκήρεος ἵπποδασειῆς
 κύμβαχον ἀκρότατον νύξ' ἔγχεϊ ὄξυόεντι,
 ῥήξε δ' ἀφ' ἵππειον λόφον αὐτοῦ· πᾶς δὲ χαμάξε
 κάππεσεν ἐν κονίησι, νέον φοίνικι φαεινός.

"And Meges with his sharp sword lunged at the tip of the crest (*kymbachos*) of [Dolops'] bronze helmet thick with horsehair, and tore the horsehair plume off it; the whole plume fell to the ground in the dust, new shining with purple." Hesychius²¹ gives as his second meaning for *kymbachos* "the uppermost part of the helmet," τὸ ἀνώτατον μέρος τῆς περικεφαλαίας. So Eustathius²² has "the top of the helmet, to which the plume is attached," τὸ τῆς περικεφαλαίας ἄκρον, ᾧ ἀνίεται ὁ λόφος.

Kymbachos appears a second time at *Iliad* 5.585-586 meaning "headlong":

αὐτὰρ ὃ γ' ἀσθμαίνων εὐεργέος ἔκπεσε δίφρου
 κύμβαχος ἐν κονίησιν ἐπὶ βρεχμὸν τε καὶ ὤμους.

"And [Mydon] fell gasping from the well-made chariot headlong into the dust on his forehead and shoulders." The reappearance of "in the dust" suggests that this passage is a reminiscence of *Iliad* 15 which has lost the meaning of *kymbachos*. Later literary usage derives from *Iliad* 5; thus Heliodorus *Ethiopica* 10.30.4, where a bull falls κύμβαχος ... ἐπ' ὤμους καὶ νῶτα "headlong on its shoulders and back."

The Greek and Hebrew words have independently both been compared with Hittite *kupahi*, which appears in a single ritual text.²³ At IV.18 it is put on a sacrificial lamb with a verb (*šī-ia-an-zi* from *šāi*) which implies "put on the head." At III.4-5 (cf. II.10) we read *nu-za-an LÚ pa-ti-li-iš ku-pa-hi-in tar-na-a-i* "the *patiliš* priest takes off his *kupahis*." This suggests a turban, which fits nicely with Targumic Aramaic. Two Hebrew words are translated κιδάρεις by the LXX and קַבְצִים by the Targum, both "turbans": קַבְצִים Ex 28,40 and פְּאַרִי Ez 44,18.

20 The etymology was independently noted by O. Szemerényi, *Die Sprache* 11 (1965) 1-6 and by myself in "Kothar, Kinyras, and Kythereia," *JSS* 10 (1965) 197-219, p. 213 note 7. See earlier E. Sapir, "Hebrew 'helmet,' a loanword, and its bearing on Indo-European phonology," *JAOS* 57 (1937) 73-77.

21 Hesychius ii.546 ed. K. Latte (1966).

22 Eustathius on *Iliad* 5.586, ed. van der Valk (1976) ii.152.24.

23 F. Sommer & H. Ehelolf, "Das hethitische Ritual des Papanikri von Komana," *Boghazköi-Studien* 10 (1924).

The phonetics of the "helmet" words is corroborated by a similar and possibly related pair of words meaning "cup." In Semitic: Ugaritic *qb^ct*;²⁴ Hebrew קִבְעַת Isa 51,17.22 (LXX κόνδυ); in a Cypriote Phoenician inscription from Larnax of ab. 330 BC, "to my lord Melqarth cups of silver"(vs. 4).²⁵

לאדני למלקרת קבעם של כסף

Athenaeus 11.483A, 482E quotes κύμβη "cup" beside Paphian κύββα; these are alternative treatments of Semitic doubled *b*. Greek variants are κύμβιον Demosthenes 21.33 etc., κύμβος Nicander *Alex.* 128. The equivalence is strongly verified by the fact that as at Larnax the κύμβιον can be silver: so at Delos;²⁶ Vergil *Aen.* 5.267 *cymbiaque argento perfecta*. As the only attested name of a Phoenician silver vessel, the *kymbion* may represent the well-known silver "pateras," like the cosmological one discussed in Chapter 3 above. Like other names of "vessels" such as *gaulos* (Chapter 4 above) it doubles as a ship-name in a fragment of Sophocles:²⁷

ἵπποισιν ἢ κύμβαισι ναυστολεῖς χθόνα;

"Do you travel the earth with horses or skiffs"? Pliny 7.208 says that the Phoenicians invented it, *onerarium Hippius Tyrius inuenit, lembum Cyrenenses, cumbam Phoenices*, "Hippus of Tyre invented the freighter, the men of Cyrene the cutter, Phoenicians the skiff." It is standard for Charon's skiff, Vergil *Aen.* 6.303 *et ferruginea subuectat corpora cumba* "and he ferries bodies in his dark skiff."²⁸

The Homeric self-arming of the hero is a dynamic description; but it is essential narrative when Saul arms David, I Sam 17,38:

וַיִּלְבַּשׁ שְׂאוֹל אֶת־דָּוִד מְדֵי־יָו וַנִּתֵּן קִבְעַת נְחֹשֶׁת עַל־רֹאשׁוֹ וַיִּלְבַּשׁ אֹתוֹ שָׂרְיֹן

"And Saul put his own gear on David; he set a bronze helmet on his head, and clothed him in a corslet"; Vg *et imposuit galeam super caput eius, et uestiuit eum lorica*. Already it is a big step away from the Bronze Age that David cannot operate in this foreign gear, and instead defeats the awkward Western invader by indigenous guerrilla tactics. It seems retrogressive then that Judas Maccabaeus "puts on a corslet like a giant," ἐνεδύσατο θώρακα ὡς γίγας I Makk 3,3.

At first when gods take up arms in men's quarrels, the divine realm seems only a mythical projection of the human; thus along with men below Athena puts on her corslet (θωρήσασετο *Iliad* 8.388) for battle. But it is discovery of

24 Gordon, *UT I Aqht* 216 = KTU 1.19.IV.56.

25 A. M. Honeyman, "Larnax Tes Lapethou, a Third Phoenician Inscription," *Le Muséon* 51 (1938) 285-298.

26 IG 11.2 no. 145.46-48 etc.

27 Sophocles frag. 127 TrGF iv.158 = frag. 123 Nauck².

28 The meaning "headlong" for *kymbachos* was affected by the obscure word for "head" attested by the *Etym. Magnum* as κύμβη or κύβη, also perhaps related to κυβιστάω

a transcendent principle in history when, in Israel though not in Hellas, the divine arming makes human arming unnecessary. It was from the lack of any man to intervene that Yahweh (Isa 59,17) "put on righteousness as a breastplate and a helmet of salvation on his head,"

וַיִּלְבַּשׁ צָדִיקָה כְּשָׂרָן וְכֹבֵעַ יְשׁוּעָה כְּרֵאשׁוֹ

LXX καὶ ἐνεδύσατο δικαιοσύνην ὡς θώρακα καὶ περιέθετο περικεφαλῶν σωτηρίου ἐπὶ τῆς κεφαλῆς; Vg *indutus est iustitia ut lorica, et galea salutis in capite eius*. Jerome on this passage says:²⁹ *Sicque armatus processit ad bellum, ut redderet ultionem inimicis suis*, "And armed thus he proceeded to war, to do vengeance on his enemies." Cf. Ps 35,2 (addressed to God) "take hold of shield and buckler," הַחֹזֶק מִגֵּן וְצַנָּה. A Midrash on Ex 15,3 "The Lord is a man of war" goes further. After collecting all the passages where God's armor is described, it explains "The Lord is his name"; "With his name does he fight and does not need any of those instruments":³⁰

בשמו הוא נלחם ואינו צריך לאחת מכל המדות

The Stoics developed the theme of life as a military campaign into a Hellenistic commonplace.³¹ Thus Seneca (*Ep.* 96.5) *uiuere militare est*, "to live is to go to war"; Arrian *Epict.* 3.24.34 στρατεία τις ἐστὶν ὁ βίος ἐκάστου "each one's life is a kind of military campaign." A text perhaps reflecting the thought of Posidonius³² picks up the Homeric theme of self-arming. Everything in the universe is governed by the will of a single invisible agent, God. It is as "when the trumpet signals to a camp; when each hears its voice, one takes up his shield, one puts on his corslet, another clothes himself in greaves or helmet or belt...":

ἐπειδὴν ἡ σάλπιγξ σημήνη τῷ στρατοπέδῳ τότε γὰρ τῆς φωνῆς ἕκαστος ἀκούσας ὁ μὲν ἀσπίδα ἀναιρεῖται, ὁ δὲ θώρακα ἐνδύεται, ὁ δὲ κνημίδα ἢ κράνος ἢ ζωστήρα περιτίθεται.

The rhetoric distributes among several persons the successive acts of one.

A text of Alexandrian Judaism (Sap Sol 5,17-20) extends Isa 59,17; it shows the righteous God completing his self-arming:

"tumble."

29 Jerome in *Isa.* 59,17, Corp. Christ. 73A.687.29.

30 *Mechilta* ed. J. Z. Lauterbach (1949) ii.30, 35.

31 A. Harnack, *Militia Christi: die christliche Religion und der Soldatenstand in den ersten drei Jahrhunderten* (1905, Eng. tr. 1981); H. Edmonds, "Geistlicher Kriegsdienst: Der Topos der militia spiritualis in der antiken Philosophie," pp. 21-50 of L. Herwegen (ed.), *Heilige Überlieferung, Ausschnitte aus der Geschichte des Mönchtums und des heiligen Kultus* (1938).

32 Ps.-Aristotle, *de mundo* 399 b 4-7.

λήμψεται πανοπλίαν τὸν ζῆλον αὐτοῦ ...
 ἐνδύσεται θώρακα δικαιοσύνης
 καὶ περιθήσεται κόρυθα κρίσιν ἀνυπόκριτον·
 λήμψεται ἀσπίδα ἀκαταμάχητον ὀσιότητα.

"He will take up his zeal as a panoply.... He will put on justice as a corslet, and set on his head unfeigned judgement as a helmet; he will take up invincible holiness as his shield (Vg *scutum*)." The use of κόρυς "helmet" suggests that the author has gone back to Homer (*Iliad* 18.611), which however he sees through Stoic eyes; his use of "panoply" is Hellenistic-Roman. Jesus affirms on the contrary (Luk 11,22) that a "strong man," apparently Satan, has a πανοπλίαν (Syriac ܡܢܝܐ), which is taken from him by a stronger one.

Paul might seem simply to be inserting his new triad of faith, hope and love into Isa 59,17 LXX when he writes (I Thess 5,8) "But since we are of the day let us be sober, putting on the corslet of faith and love, and for a helmet the hope of salvation," ἐνδυσάμενοι θώρακα πίστεως καὶ ἀγάπης, καὶ περικεφαλαίαν ἐλπίδα σωτηρίας, Vg *induti loricae fidei et caritatis, et galeam spem salutis*. But further, he has replaced the Semitic-epic motif of God arming himself by the Stoic motif of the philosopher arming himself. This completes the evolution in the Hebrew world of the theme of self-arming from literal description to metaphor.

Eph 6,13-17 applies the same transformation to the fuller version of the "panoply of God" in Sap Sol 5,17-20. Here τὴν πανοπλίαν τοῦ θεοῦ is ambiguous, for it shifts from "the armor which God wears" as in Wisdom to "the armor which God supplies." Four defensive items are listed: "putting on the corslet of righteousness" as in Isaiah and Wisdom, ἐνδυσάμενοι τὸν θώρακα τῆς δικαιοσύνης; "shoeing yourselves to prepare the gospel of peace," a replacement for the epic greaves; "taking the shield of faith," τὸν θυρεὸν τῆς πίστεως, Vg *scutum fidei*, i.e. the long shield in the Roman language of Polybius; and "the helmet of salvation," τὴν περικεφαλαίαν τοῦ σωτηρίου as in the LXX of Isaiah. Clement of Alexandria, commenting on the passage,³³ emphasizes the paradoxical character of its warfare. Like the *de mundo*, Clement speaks of the trumpet (σάλπιγξ) and identifies it with the Gospel, and keeps returning to the theme of peace: he speaks of Christ's "peaceful soldiers," εἰρηνικούς; he says "let us arm ourselves peaceably," ἐξοπλισώμεθα εἰρηνικῶς; "so peacefully does the Apostle station us," εἰρηνικῶς ἐκτάττει, the theme of Socrates.

33 Clement Alex. *Protrepticus* 11, ed O. Stählin (GCS 1905) i.82. Similarly Ignatius *ad Polyc.* 6.2 "Let your faith be as a helmet, your love as a spear, your patience a panoply"; Tatian *Orat.* 16 (ed. E. J. Goodspeed, *Die ältesten Apologeten*, 1914) "armed with the *thorax* of the Spirit."

Elsewhere³⁴ I have discussed the military metaphor running through Paul's letters, in particular *Romans*. Harnack³⁵ shows that in the East, the true "soldier of Christ" was specialized as the monk, above all by Origen. In the West, the ambiguity of *sacramentum* ("oath of allegiance" in the army, "mystery" in the church) reinforced the symbolism of the soldier, which was attached especially to the martyr by Tertullian and Cyprian. But when martyrdom ceased, the New Testament symbolism of war was applied unambiguously to the victory of a Constantine. Thus the Middle Ages and the official Protestant reformers—as opposed to the Anabaptists—inherited a faith (strengthened by contact with the Moslem *jihād*) where the holy war of a Joshua was once again at home in the form of a crusade.

But even in the monuments of paganism a different view lingered. The Vatican statue of Augustus from the Prima Porta, recently sent on tour by the Vatican, shows his body-fitting corslet (a "thorax" in both the military and the anatomical sense) being stretched out by a centaur as a world-mantle; and it goes beyond the shield of *Aeneid* 8 by containing only scenes of pacification.

5.2 The lance

Romans and Hebrews had to take on the metallurgy of iron against the opposition of (respectively) Etruscans and Philistines. There is some relationship between those two peoples. At *Iliad* 16.233, where the received text has Πελασγικέ "Pelagian" as title of Zeus, the scholiast³⁶ gives variants Πελαργικέ and Πελαστικέ; the latter suggests a kinship with the Philistines, Hebrew פִּלְשְׁתִּי and place-name פְּלִשְׁתִּי.³⁷ Although the "Pelagians" (Πελασγοί) are a shadowy folk of uncertain language, they were obviously maritime; the Philistines certainly settled in the land which later gave its name to "Palestine", perhaps originally as colonists of Ramses III of Egypt about 1190 BC.³⁸ Normally in Herodotus (e.g. 1.105.1) their name is an adjective modifying "Syria," ἐν τῇ Παλαιστίνῃ Συρίῃ with folk-etymology to πάλαι "ancient"; the brief form at 7.89.1 ἐν τῇ Παλαιστίνῃ is a bridge to later usage. Greeks gave the Pelasgo-Lemnian women credit for murdering their husbands, as Hebrews gave the Philistine Delilah for betraying hers (Chapter 7 below).

34 "Inversion of social roles in Paul's letters," *NovT* 33 (1991) 303-325.

35 *Militia Christi*, note 31 above.

36 Ed. H. Erbse vol. iv (1975) p. 220.

37 See the discussion in Brown-Levin "Ethnic Paradigm....," *General Linguistics* 26 (1986) 71-105, pp. 80, 88.

38 H. J. Katzenstein, "Philistines: History," *ABD* 5.326-328.

It is still unclear whether the Etruscans with their non-Indo-European language were indigenous or settlers in Italy. But in any case they also were maritime; the "Tyrsenian pirates" of the *Homeric Hymn* to Dionysus (7.7-8, ληϊσταί ... Τυρσηνοί) are either pre-Etruscan sea-rovers or merchants of the Etruscans themselves seen as pirates. Sophocles³⁹ speaks of Τυρσηνοῖσι Πελασγοῖς. The only parallel to the Etruscan language is in a non-Greek inscription of Lemnos,⁴⁰ where (Herodotus 6.138.1) the original population was Pelasgian. Thucydides 4.109.4 (cf. Herodotus 1.57.1) says that the majority of the population of the peninsula Acte were "Pelasgic, of the Tyrsenians that once lived in Lemnos and Athens," Πελασγικόν, τῶν καὶ Λημνόν ποτε καὶ Ἀθήνας Τυρσηνῶν οἰκησάντων..

Originally Judah was unable to conquer the low country because its people had chariots of iron (Jud 1,19)—nine hundred of them (Jud 4,3). At that point the Israelites had no iron-metallurgy. I Sam 13,19-20: "And a blacksmith (שָׁרָף, LXX τέκτων σιδήρου, Vg *faber ferrarius*) was not to be found in all the land of Israel; for the Philistines said, 'Lest the Hebrews make themselves sword or spear (רִיבֵן אוֹ רֶבֶן, ῥόμφαίαν καὶ δόρυ, *gladium aut lanceam*)'. And all Israel went down to the Philistines to sharpen (שָׁטְטָל, χαλκεύειν [!], Vg *exacueret*) every man his plowshare, his spade or his axe" (see p. 25 above). The use of χαλκεύειν "work bronze" by the LXX illustrates the tenacity of old terms. There was a tradition at Rome that Porsenna the Etruscan had actually taken the city, and Pliny 34.139 records: *in foedere, quod expulsis regibus populo Romano dedit Porsina, nominatim comprehensum inuenimus, ne ferro nisi in agri cultu uteretur*, "I found it expressly stipulated in the treaty which Porsina gave the Roman people, after the kings had been expelled, that it should not use iron except for agriculture."

For the metallurgy of iron and the history of its introduction we now have an excellent survey.⁴¹ In Hellas the new technology is attested as semi-magical. *Odyssey* 9.391-3 compares the sizzling of the Cyclops' eye under the red-hot olivewood beam:

ὥς δ' ὅτ' ἀνὴρ χαλκεὺς πέλεκυν μέγαν ἤε σκέπαρνον
εἰν ὕδατι ψυχρῷ βάπτῃ μεγάλα ἰάχοντα
φαρμάσσων· τὸ γὰρ αὐτε σιδήρου γε κράτος ἐστίν

"As when a bronzesmith (!) plunges a great axe-blade or plane into cold water, hissing mightily, and so tempers it—for this is the strength of iron—,..." The smith still has the old name; φαρμάσσω more usually has the connotation "poison" or "bewitch" (for the ancients could hardly separate the operation

39 Sophocles, frag. 270 (*Inachus*) Radt TrGF iv.258 = Dionysius Hal. 1.25.4.

40 J. Friedrich, KASD 144.

41 T. A. Wertime & J. D. Muhly (eds.), *The Coming of the Age of Iron* (1980).

of poison from witchcraft). Herodotus 1.68.1 tells of the surprise of Lichas the Spartan when he "came into a bronze-smith's and saw iron being beaten out," ἐλθὼν ἐς χαλκήιον ἐθηεῖτο σίδηρον ἐξελανόμενον.

In Herodotus' tale (1.67.4) the iron fulfilled the Delphic oracle "woe on woe," πῆμ' ἐπὶ πῆματι, for "iron was discovered to the hurt of man" (1.68.4), ἐπὶ κακῷ ἀνθρώπου σίδηρος ἀνεύρηται. This is a widespread theme. Mishna *Middoth* III.4

שהברזל נברא לקצר ימיו של אדם

"For iron was created to shorten men's days"; Pliny 34.138 *optumo pessimoque uitae instrumento est [ferrum]*, "iron serves as the best and worst implement of life."

The prerequisite for full civic independence was the acquisition of forging. The words which Joel 4,10 ironically speaks to the nations must earlier have been the signal for revolt:

כתו אתיכם לְהַרְבּוֹת וּמְזַמְרֵתֵיכֶם לְרִמְחֵי

"Beat your ploughshares into swords, and your pruning-hooks into lances," LXX συγκόψατε τὰ ἄροτρα ὑμῶν εἰς ῥομφαίας καὶ τὰ δρέπανα ὑμῶν εἰς σειρομάστας, Vg *concidite aratra uestra in gladios, et ligones uestros in lanceas*. Vergil at *Aen.* 7.633-640 describes the making of armor, and with his usual accuracy as in 8.620-625 (above) includes all items of the defensive panoply (with the corslet doubled in Latin and Greek): *thoracas aënos* "bronze corslets"; *lēuis ocreas* "smooth greaves"; *galeam* "helmet"; *clipeum* "round shield"; *auroque trilicem lorica* "a gold three-layered corslet"; and an *ense* "sword." He summarizes the process at vs 635-636:

uomeris huc et falcis honos, huc omnis aratri
cessit amor; recoquont patrios fornacibus ensis.

"At this point all respect for plowshare or pruning-hook ceases, all love for the plow; they reforge ancestral swords in furnaces." Vergil is reworking Lucretius, who describes the passage from bronze to iron and the invention of war, 5.1286-1294:

posterius ferri uis est aerisque reperta
et prior aeris erat quam ferri cognitus usus...
inde minutatim processit ferreus ensis
uersaque in obprobrium species est falcis ahenae.

"The strength of iron was discovered later than that of bronze; and the use of bronze was known earlier than that of iron.... Thence little by little the iron sword made its way, and the beauty of the bronze pruning-hook was rejected in disdain." In the Golden Age "there were no helmets or sword," *non galeae, non ensis erant* (Ovid *Met.* 1.99).

Now in Israel, the freedom which had once been won through a city militia or rural guerrilla force came to be seen as leading to a peace "at the

end of days" (בְּאַחֲרֵית הַיָּמִים) Isa 2,2) where those things would no longer be needed. So the old formula is reversed, Isa 2,4 = Mic 4,3:

וְכַתְּתוּ חֶרְבוֹתָם לְאֵתִים וְחַנְיֹתֵיהֶם לְמִזְמְרוֹת

"And they shall beat their swords into plowshares, and their spears into pruning-hooks." The LXX of Micah has: καὶ κατακόψουσιν (Isaiah συγκόψουσιν) τὰς ῥομφαίας (Isa. μαχαίρας) αὐτῶν εἰς ἄροτρα καὶ τὰ δόρατα (Isa. τὰς ζιβύνας) αὐτῶν εἰς δρέπανα. And Vergil, who in his maturity celebrates the work of the swordsmith, in his youth complains about the prevalence of war, *Georgics* 1.505-8:

quippe ubi fas uersum atque nefas: tot bella per orbem,
tam multae scelerum facies; non ullus aratro
dignus honos; squalent abductis arua colonis
et curuae rigidum *falces conflantur* in ensem.

"For here right and wrong are reversed: so many wars around the world, so various the forms of atrocity; there is no proper respect for the plow; the fields are ill-kept with their cultivators drafted, and the curved pruning-hooks are melted down into a stiff sword." Vergil has no Hellenistic prototype here; can any hint of the LXX have come his way?⁴² The indebtedness of *Aeneid* 7 to Lucretius and to his own *Georgics* 1 is clear. And when Jerome came to revise the translation of Isaiah, it was the *Georgics* that echoed in his inner ear. Thus Isa 2,4 Vg *et conflagunt gladios suos in uomeris, et lanceas suas in falces*; contrast Mic 4,3 *et concident gladios suos in uomeris, et hastas suas in ligones*. We shall return to Jerome's own commentary on these passages; but first we must make an excursion through the ancient Near East in search of the lance and its name.

We may begin with the רִמְחָיִם of Joel 4,10, which the Vulgate perceptively translated *lanceas*. Elsewhere, as in the song of Deborah (Jud 5,8), the LXX (codex B) translated רִמְחָיִם by λόγχη. Since the Greek and Latin words denote the iron tip of a spear or of a thin flat lance, for which steel would seem requisite, they can hardly be from a Mediterranean substrate. Varro⁴³ said that "*lancea* is not a Latin but an Spanish word," *lanceam...non Latinum sed Hispanicum uerbum esse*. The Romans may well have gotten the weapon or its steel from Spain; but certainly the Latin and Greek names are connected, and the Greek antedates most knowledge of Spain.

Furthermore, the Greek and Latin words cannot be separated from the Hebrew. From the form רִמְחָיִם "their lances" Neh 4,7 (LXX "II Esdras 14,7" λόγχας αὐτῶν) we may lift the construct plural רִמְחָיִם *romhey*, to which

42 R. A. B. Mynors, *Virgil: Georgics* (1990) on 1.508 cites Ovid *Fasti* 1.699 *uersique in pila ligones* "mattocks were turned into javelins" but no Greek texts.

43 Cited by Aulus Gellius 15.30.7.

λόγχοι is a complete morphological parallel. Elsewhere⁴⁴ parallels are given for the plural endings. Also the rough breathing on initial Greek *rho* marked an unusual sound which was felt inappropriate for initial *r* of other languages; then *l* was the next recourse. And if Semitic *h* became *χ*, the preceding nasal must assimilate in Greek, *m* → *ñ*.

The same logic suggests a second Greek word as derived from *romh-*. If the alternative choices are made, hearing Semitic *r* as *ρ*, and retaining the Semitic *m* with assimilation of the following aspirate, *h* → *φ*, the stem would come out *ρομφ-*. That points strongly to *ρομφαία* "broad sword," attested in the LXX and from the 3rd century BC. Plutarch *Aem. Paul.* 18.3 says that Thracians carried "straight broadswords of heavy steel," ὀρθὰς ... ῥομφαίας βαρυσιδήρους. At Luk 2,35 the Syriac translates ῥομφαία by ܪܘܡܗܐ. An aberrant Latin form, perhaps via Etruscan, is *rumpia*, attributed to Thracians at Livy 31.39.11.

Further lines of evidence show the identity of *λόγχοι* and *קִמָּחִי*. Aeschylus has Persians ascribe the lance to Greek troops (*Pers.* 149), and anachronistically puts it at Troy (*Agam.* 404). The *Batrachomyomachia* (124-131) expands the epic formula to arm the Mice with greaves, corslet, shield, helmet and *λόγχοι*. The old Canaanite superiority in metal-work reappears when the prophets of Baal (I Reg 18,28) cut themselves with swords and lances, בַּתְּרֵיבוֹת וּבְרֵמָחִים, Vg *cultris et lanceolis*, like the Gallois of Syria (Lucian *de dea Syria* 50, LCL iv.402). The Chronicler (I Chron 12,9 etc.) and the *Qumran War* (V.6) retrospectively assign the lance to Israelite armies. It is among foreign troops that the identity comes out most clearly.

Of all the infantry contingents in the army of Xerxes, only certain Anatolians carried lance-heads. Herodotus 7.78: "The Moschoi (Μόσχοι) wore wooden helmets on their heads; they carried shields and short spears (αἰχμάς), on which were large lance-heads (λόγχοι). The Tibarenoi (Τιβάρηνοί), Macrones and Mossynoikoi took the field in the same gear as the Moschoi." Eighty years later Xenophon's men had to fight their way past the Chaldaioi of Armenia (*Anab.* 4.3.4), Chalybes (4.7.15), Macrones (4.8.3), and Mossynoikoi (5.4.12); in each case he mentions specifically their being armed with the lance. A little further along (*Anab.* 5.5.1) they come to another group of Chalybes, who mostly made their living from iron-working (ἀπὸ σιδηρείας); thence to the Tibarenoi.⁴⁵ Strabo (11.2.17f, 12.3.18) locates the Moschoi and Tibarenoi, with other peoples, on the south-east coast of the Black Sea bordering Armenia. Iron-working in these parts is mostly assigned to the

44 Brown-Levin, "Ethnic Paradigm..." 86.

45 The Tibarenoi and Moschoi were also known to Hecataeus: Jacoby FGH 1 F 204 and 288, both from Stephanus.

Chalybes, the σιδηροτέκτονες ... Χάλυβες of Aeschylus PV714f who gave their name to high-grade iron or steel, χάλυβος (PV 133 genitive).

The Moschoi and Tibarenoi are surely identical with the Muski and Tabal of Assyrian texts from the 12th century BC on. Thus in the *Prunkinschrift* of Sargon II, 720 BC:⁴⁶

To Ambaris of Tabal (*Ta-bal-ai*), whom I had placed upon the throne of Hullu his father, I had given my daughter, together with the land of Cilicia (*Hi-lak-ki*), which had not belonged to the territory of his father, and had extended his land. But that faithless one sent a messenger to Ursa of Urartu and to Mita (*Mi-ta-a*) of Muski (*Mu-us-ki*), proposing to seize my territory.

This Mita is probably "Mides (Μίδης) the son of Gordieus, king of Phrygia" (Herodotus 1.14.2 etc.), for *d* and *t* fall together in Hittite.⁴⁷ Thus in a general way Muski and Tabal are eastern elements of the Phrygian kingdom.

At Gen 10,2 among the sons of Japheth are Tubal and Meshech, תִּבְלֵל וּמֶשֶׁךְ; the LXX Μόσοχ = Vg *Mosoch* provides vowels closer to the Greek and Akkadian; but cf. the Μέσχοι of Procopius (cited below). In Chapter 2 above I discuss the apparently certain identity of Japheth and Greek Iapetus. Prometheus the son of Iapetus (so to speak a brother of Tubal and Meshech) first discovered bronze and iron, silver and gold under the earth (Aeschylus PV 502), in line with the general tradition of Anatolian metallurgy. Yawan (Ionia), Tubal and Meshech traded with Tyre in slaves and vessels of bronze (Ez 27,13). Among the descendants of Cain (קַיִן, apparently "the smith") was another with the same name, Gen 4,22 תִּבְלֵל קַיִן "Tubal (the) smith," a worker or the father of workers in bronze and iron. It is natural to take him as the eponym of Tibarenian smiths.

We may now see a final indication that the Greek and Hebrew words for "lance" are connected. Ez 38-39 is a prophecy against Gog, "chief"⁴⁸ prince of Meshech and Tubal" (38,2-3; 39,1)

גֹּג ... נְשִׂיא רֹאשׁ מְשֶׁךְ וְתִבְלֵל

It is plausible to interpret him as Gyges of Lydia, attested in Akkadian by Asshurbanipal as *Gu-ug-gu* king of the land of *Lu-ud-di*.⁴⁹ His figure is encrusted with legend in Greek, where Herodotus 1.8 tells how he saw

46 H. Winckler, *Die Keilschrifttexte Sargons* (1889) p. 102, sect. 29-31; English tr. in D. D. Luckenbill, *Ancient Records of Assyria and Babylonia* (1926) ii sect. 55.

47 The supposed grave of Midas at Yazilikaya is marked in Phrygian ΜΙΔΑΙ ... ΦΑΝΑΚΤΕΙ; Friedrich KASD 125.

48 Luther in ראש saw a proper name *Rosch*; and American fundamentalists see in it a prophecy of Russia and the Cold War!

49 *Annals* II.5, ed. M. Streck, *Assurbanipal und die letzten assyrischen Könige...*, Vorderasiatische Bibliothek 7 (1916), ii.20; see W. Röllig "Gyges," RLA iii.720-721, who dates him ab. 685-652 BC.

Candaules' wife naked, and Plato *Rep.* 359E about his ring of invisibility; but Archilochus⁵⁰ treats him as if historical, "the affairs of Gyges of much gold do not concern me":

οὐ μοι τὰ Γύγεω τοῦ πολυχρύσου μέλει.

At Sardes there was a λίμνη ... Γυγαίη (Herodotus 1.93.5); in the *Iliad* (2.865, cf. 20.391) the lake has become a nymph, but remains the sole Homeric reference to an historical person.⁵¹ —Ez 39,9 predicts that the invaders will fail, and that Israel will burn their weapons: "shield and buckler, bow and arrows, hand-pike and lance (LXX λόγχαις)":

חַמְשַׁת הַיָּרֵךְ וְרֶגֶל הַקֶּלֶבֶן וְרֶגֶל הַקֶּלֶבֶן וְרֶגֶל הַקֶּלֶבֶן וְרֶגֶל הַקֶּלֶבֶן

As in the times of Xerxes and Xenophon to come, the lance is carried by the metal-working peoples of Pontus.

Scattered evidence associates the mining and metallurgical peoples of Spain, the Western Ἰβηρίη (Herodotus 1.163.1), with the Iberians of the Caucasus, of whom the "Meschoi" are said in a late historian to be subjects: Procopius *Hist.* 8.2.24 Μέσχοι Ἰβήρων ἐκ παλαιοῦ κατήκοοι. Sardinia⁵² (Σαρδῶ Herodotus 1.170.2) seems to have its name from those Shardana of the Sea Peoples who attacked Egypt; they may have their origins or a settlement in Pontus, for Herodotus 2.105 says "Colchic linen is called Sardonic (Σαρδονικόν) by the Hellenes." And these peoples alone in the ancient world share certain matrilineal customs.⁵³

Apollonius of Rhodes (*Argon.* 2.1009-1015), after bringing his heroes past the blacksmith Chalybes, continues: "After these, they rounded the cape of Zeus Genetaios and sailed safely past the land of the Tibarenoi (Τιβαρηνίδα γαίαν). Here when women bear children for their men, the men lie in bed and groan with their heads bound; the women tend them with food and fix childbirth baths (λοετρὰ λεχώια) for them." Diodorus 5.14 similarly describes the *couvade* of Kyrnos (Corsica): "When the woman bears, no care is taken of her in childbirth; but her husband lies down as if ill and is in travail (λοχεύεται) certain days as if his body suffered." And Strabo 3.4.17 of the Iberians of Spain: "After the women have given birth they take care of their husbands, putting them to bed instead of themselves."

50 Archilochus frag. 19.1 West IEG i.8 = Plutarch *de tranq. anim.* 10 (*Mor.* 470B).

51 Kirk in the Cambridge *Iliad* (i.260) on 2.865 thinks that the Gygaean lake "was presumably named after an ancestor of the famous Guges"; but there is no further evidence for such a one. Rather the reference puts this passage at least relatively late, well after the date (real or legendary) of the only Gyges we know.

52 The name of Sardinia may appear in the obscure archaic Phoenician inscription of Nora (KAI 45.3) as 𐤓𐤓𐤕.

53 See the discussion in E. Herzfeld, *The Persian Empire: Studies in Geography and Ethnography of the Ancient Near East*; ed. G. Walser (1968) 256-257.

This striking agreement can be explained either as survival of pre-Indo-European peoples such as the Basques (classical *Vascones*, Silius 3.358 *Vasco insuetus galeae* "the Vasco unused to a helmet"); or by early Iron Age migrations; or by independent development in mining communities. It seems likely that mining peoples are matrilineal, the men being much absent and dying early; and that the *couvade* is the man's way of claiming paternity in such a society.

After men had gone to all that trouble discovering and spreading the metallurgy of war, the prophets affirm that they had to unlearn it. Jerome pushes Vergil's logic to the end and sees the prophecy of peace as fulfilled by Augustus.⁵⁴ On Micah 4,3⁵⁵ he says "The Roman Republic itself was torn by civil wars," *ipsa Romana respublica bellis lacerabatur ciuilibus*; but when Rome emerged as a "single empire," *singulare imperium*, under the *imperium Christi*, "the world was opened to the travelling of the Apostles," *apostolorum itinere peruius factus est orbis*. On Isa 2,4:⁵⁶ when the Savior was born under Augustus and Quirinius, "the peace of the Roman Empire was prepared for the teaching of the Gospel," *euangelicae doctrinae pax Romani imperii praeparata*. All wars ceased and the countryside was turned back to agriculture. Of course under imperial protection: "zeal for fighting was turned over solely to soldiers and Roman legions against barbarous nations," *militibus tantum legionibusque Romanis contra barbaras nationes bellandi studio delegato*. Jerome interprets the prophecies in the light of the greatest art-work of Rome, the *Ara Pacis Augustae*.

But we must add that the Empire played a role in lifting the two forms of the lance against the bearers of its salvation. Simeon tells Mary (Luk 2,35) "And the broadsword (ῥομφαία, Syriac ܪܘܡܗܐ) will pierce your own soul also"; a (Roman) soldier pierced Jesus' rib (Joh 19,34) with the λόγχη (Syriac ܒܠܘܚܝܬܐ, Vg *lancea*), and from that second Adam came his bride the Church.⁵⁷ For the prophecies of peace to be taken with radical seriousness, history had to wait until the unofficial Reformation of Menno Simons and George Fox.

5.3 The tent

Homer knows neither the tent nor its name, σκηνή; the Achaean invaders live each in a "lean-to," κλισίη. For there was little nomadism in Hellas; at

54 Isa 2,4 was first cited in the Church by Justin, *Apol.* 39.1, *Dial.* 110.3.

55 Jerome in *Mic.* 4,3; Corp. Christ. 76.469.121-126.

56 Jerome in *Esa.* 2,4; Corp. Christ. 73.30.28.

57 This lance (or a similar one) was taken to Constantinople in AD 644; *Chronicon Paschale* 385 (Migne, PG 92.988C = CSHB 22.705.8).

most, shepherds moved seasonally to mountain pastures and set up semi-permanent quarters. The usefulness of a true nomad tent for a mobile field army could only be learned from actual nomadism.

Greeks first saw tents as luxury quarters for Persian officers. The booty at Plataea included tents with gold and silver fittings (Herodotus 9.80.1), among which the tent of Mardonius was memorable (9.70.3). When Xerxes was on the march, each Greek city had to fix him up a tent (7.119.3). The height of indiscipline in the Ionian fleet was when they "pitched tents on the island like an army and sat in the shade" (Herodotus 6.12.4), οἶα στρατιῆ σκηνάς τε πηξάμενοι ἐν τῇ νήσῳ ἐσκητητροφέοντο in face of the threat from the Phoenician fleet.

A land force carried the tents in army wagons, σκηναῖς τροχλάτοις (Aeschylus *Pers.* 1000) "in the wheel-borne tents." When Xerxes reviewed his fleet (Herodotus 7.100.2) he transferred "to a Sidonian ship and sat under a golden tent," ἐς νέα Σιδωνίην ἵζετο ὑπὸ σκηνῆ χρυσοῦν. The flagship of Tyre had the same feature (Ez 27,7):

תְּכֵלֶת וְאַרְגָּמָן מֵאֵי אֵלִישָׁה הָיָה מִכֶּסֶד

"Scarlet and purple from the coasts of Elisha (Cyprus?) was your awning (LXX περιβόλαια, Vg *operimentum*)."

Hebrew, from its nomadic background (real or theoretical), has several words for "tent"; normal is תֵּלָא. The Temple is given an elaborate portable prototype, the "tabernacle," for which the preferred word is תְּשֻׁבָה. (Likewise Ugaritic alternates *ahl* and *mškn*.) תְּשֻׁבָה is frequently translated σκηνή as at Ex 25,9 (Vg *tabernaculi*). Num 9,18 "the cloud rested on the tabernacle" has a double use of the root *škn*:

יִשְׁכְּבֵן עַל־הַתְּשֻׁבָה

LXX σκιάζει ἢ νεφέλη ἐπὶ τῆς σκηνῆς. But very often the LXX translates the verb יִשְׁכְּבֵן by κατασκηνώω; thus at Ez 43,9 "And I will dwell in their midst forever," אֲשָׁכְבֵן בְּתוֹכָם לְעוֹלָם the LXX has καὶ κατασκηνώσω ἐν μέσῳ αὐτῶν τὸν αἰῶνα. Here as elsewhere, when the LXX is led by similarity of sounds to a Greek translation of the Hebrew, it may accidentally have hit on an actual Semitic loanword.

Phoenician ships on extended voyages also carried merely functional tents. In the *Periplus* ascribed to Scylax, an admiralty-guide of the period shortly before Alexander, it is said of the northwest coast of Africa:⁵⁸

οἱ δὲ ἔμποροὶ εἰσι μὲν Φοίνικες· ἐπὶ δὲ ἀφίκωνται εἰς τὴν νήσον τὴν Κέρνην, τοὺς μὲν γαύλους καθορμίζουσιν, ἐν τῇ Κέρνῃ σκηνάς ποιησάμενοι αὐτοῖς.

"Their traders are Phoenicians; when they come to the island Kerne, they moor their *gauloi* and pitch themselves tents in Kerne." The use of γαῦλος validates the passage as genuine Phoenician nautical vocabulary (Chapter 4.7 above); then σκηνή may fall in the same category, so that Greeks could have learned it from Phoenicians. Paul and Silas were σκηνοποιοί (Act 18,3), where Vg *scenofactoriae artis*, Syriac לוּלְרִי (a loan from Latin *lorarii*). Although the exact task of "tent-makers" cannot be more closely defined, it seems that Easterners in the Roman Empire had a traditional claim on the craft.

It would be regular for the root *škn* also to make a noun without prefix. The Masoretes read Deut 12,5 לְשֹׁכְנוֹ "for his dwelling," but the context is obscure. A masculine noun seems present at Sirach 14,25:⁵⁹

וְנוֹטָה אֶהְלֵךְ עַל יְדֵי וְשֹׁכֵן שֹׁכֵן טוֹב

"He will pitch his tent by her [Wisdom's] hand, and dwell in an excellent dwelling"; LXX στήσει τὴν σκηνὴν αὐτοῦ κατὰ χεῖρας αὐτῆς καὶ καταλύσει ἐν καταλύματι ἀγαθῶν. The Greek translator used up σκηνή in the first clause. The construction of cognate verb and object is paralleled in the tactical writer Polyaeus (*Strat.* 7.21.6) σκηνάς ... σκηνώσας "pitching tents." Perhaps then Phoenician had a noun *שכנת "tent," where the *t* might be pronounced (cf. σκῆνος below) or quiescent (σκηνή).

In post-Biblical Hebrew the root שכן has a derivative שְׁכִינָה "the Presence of God indwelling as in a tent"; structurally it is nearly identical with σκηνή. Thus R. Hananiah at *Avoth* III.2:

אֲבָל שְׁנַיִם שׁוֹשְׁבֵינֵי וַיֵּשׁ בֵּינֵיהֶם דְּבָרֵי תוֹרָה שְׁכִינָה שְׂרוּיָה בֵּינֵיהֶם

"Where two sit and there are words of Torah between them, the Shechinah rests between them." The usage comes from texts like Ez 43,9 above and Ex 25,8:

וַעֲשׂוּ לִי מִקְדָּשׁ וְשֹׁכְנָתִי בְּתוֹכָם

"And let them make me a sanctuary, so that I may dwell in their midst."

The concept of the divinity living in a tent is also Phoenician; for Diodorus 20.65.1 in 307 BC refers to "the sacred tent [of the Carthaginian army] near the altar," τὴν ἱερὰν σκηνὴν ... πλησίον οὖσαν τοῦ βωμοῦ; cf. Euripides *Ion* 806 σκηνάς εἰς ἱεράς. A neuter derivative σκῆνος from σκηνή was taken up by medical writers to mean "body." Thus Democritus in a pejorative sense:⁶⁰ ὁ τὰ ψυχῆς ἀγαθὰ αἰρεόμενος τὰ θεϊότερα αἰρέεται ὁ δὲ τὰ σκῆνεος τὰ ἀνθρωπῆϊα, "He who chooses the goods of the soul chooses the more divine; he who chooses the goods of the body, the merely human." This dualism is echoed in the Hellenistic passage II Kor 5,4 "We who are in

59 Ed. I. Lévi, *The Hebrew Text of the Book of Ecclesiasticus*, Semitic Study Series no. 3 (1904).

60 Democritus frag. 37, Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ ii.155.

the body (Vg *in tabernaculo*, Luther *Hütte*) groan, being weighted down," οἱ ὄντες ἐν τῷ σκηνῆναι στενάζομεν βαρούμενοι.

In early Israel the Tabernacle shares the function of the Ark as talismanic presence of God in battle.⁶¹ Thus at II Sam 7,6-9 Yahweh has travelled with Israel in a tent, and through his presence has cut off David's enemies before him. In the Johannine literature, as over against Paul, the true Semitic sense of the exaltation of the body by divine indwelling is preserved. In it the usage of σκηνή and its verb σκηνώ represents a transcendence of the original understanding, partly military, of God's presence. In one stream of thought (Luk 16,9; Rev 13,6) the σκηναί or σκηνή of God are in heaven. But the content of God's "covenant of peace" with human beings (Ez 37,26f) is that "my dwelling shall be upon them," הָיָה מְשֻׁבְּנִי עֲלֵיהֶם, LXX καὶ ἔσται ἡ κατασκήνωσίς μου ἐν αὐτοῖς, Vg *et erit tabernaculum meum in eis*. Likewise with the corresponding verbs: Sach 2,14 בְּתוֹכְךָ אֶדְוֶנָּה "And I shall dwell in your midst," LXX καὶ κατασκηνώσω ἐν μέσῳ σου.⁶²

These themes are taken up in the far-reaching passage Rev 21,3 "Behold, the tabernacle of God is with men, and he will dwell with them": ἰδοὺ ἡ σκηνή τοῦ θεοῦ μετὰ τῶν ἀνθρώπων, καὶ σκηνώσει μετ' αὐτῶν, Vg *ecce tabernaculum Dei cum hominibus et habitabit cum eis*. If this passage were Hebrew, הָיָה מְשֻׁבְּנִי would represent the sense of σκηνή perfectly. Elsewhere in the Syriac, Greek σκηνή is translated מְשֻׁבְּנִי; thus at Heb 11,9 ἐν σκηναίς comes out בְּמִשְׁכָּנָא. The author of Rev 21,3 understood from the usage of the LXX that σκηνή was the proper translation of מְשֻׁבְּנִי, and (κατα)σκηνώ of the verb שָׁבַן. In the Greek, which the LXX picked out for its similarity of sound to the Hebrew, we can see the Hebrew shining through—and can add further that the Greek may be an old loan from Semitic. This gives an unexpected further resonance to the central verse of the New Testament, Joh 1,14 "And the word became flesh and dwelt among us," καὶ ὁ λόγος σὰρξ ἐγένετο καὶ ἐσκήνωσεν ἐν ἡμῖν. The author understood that Hebrew שָׁבַן had somehow made its way into Greek as (κατα)σκηνώ. He means us to understand that the incarnation of the Logos is parallel to the dwelling of the God of Israel in the Tabernacle (but now no longer with a military function); and he sees that the Shechinah of contemporary Judaism points to the same mystery.

61 See my "The Ark of the Covenant and the Temple of Janus: The magico-military numen of the state in Jerusalem and Rome," *BibZ* 30 (1986/7) 20-35.

62 A popular song of the U. S. Civil War, "We're tenting tonight on the old camp ground," sees the tent as the sign both of military readiness and nomadic existence.

Excursus C: Phinehas and Phineus.

The priest Phinehas (פִּינְחָס, LXX Φίνεος) son of Eleazer son of Aaron killed the Israelite man and the Midianite woman with a *lance* (רֶמֶחַ), Num 25,7. Besides this virtuous Phinehas, there was a wicked priest Phinehas the son of Eli, priest at Shiloh (I Sam 1,3). The good son of Eleazer was priest at Bethel (Jud 20,27-28), but also in one story associated with Shiloh (Jos 22,12f). So the two Phinehas cycles may represent favorable and unfavorable views of the same Shilonite priesthood. Phinehas the son of Eli was father of Ahitub (I Sam 14,3) the father of Ahimelech the father of Abiathar (I Sam 22,20, although there are some problems with the genealogy). Ahimelech was killed by Doeg (I Sam 22,18) and Abiathar expelled by Solomon (I Reg 2,27); so that the bad character given to Phinehas son of Eli may reflect the disfavor of his descendants. The name Phinehas is agreed to be Egyptian, "the Negro." It is carried, either as proper name or title "Viceroy of Kush", by one Panehsi or Penhase (*P3-nhsj*), appointed to Thebes by Ramses XI (ab. 1099-1069 BC), who later rebelled.¹

The Phinehas cycles share several themes with the myths about Greek Phineus (Φίνεός) with his similar name, which with a little adjusting can be fitted into a single mythical cycle. Apollodorus 2.1.4 quotes Euripides as his authority that Belus in Egypt was the father not only of Aigyptos and Danaos, but also of Cepheus and Phineus.² In the story of Andromeda as told by Apollodorus 2.4.3, Cepheus is king of Ethiopia, and Phineus is his wicked brother, later petrified by Perseus. Conon³ locates the story at Phoenician Joppa, and makes Cepheus king of Phoenicia; Andromeda's two suitors are Phoenix and her uncle Phineus, the brother of Cepheus.

Several themes in the two cycles point to identification.

1 Helck-Otto v.662.

2 According to Hesiod (frag. 138 Merkelbach-West) Phineus was the son of Phoenix the son of Agenor, both Phoenicians.

3 Jacoby FGH 26 F 1.40.

1) The blind seer

Eli father of the bad Phinehas was blind (I Sam 3,2; 4,17). Phineus the seer of Thracian Salmydessos was blind; the reason is variously reported.⁴ Phineus also blinded his sons (3 below).

2) The stolen banquet

The meals of Phineus in Thrace were stolen by harpies (Apollonius 2.188). The sons of Eli sent their servants to steal the food from the people by spearing it with "tridents" (I Sam 2,13f).

3) The unworthy sons

The sons of Eli also lay with the sanctuary women (I Sam 2,23) and in punishment were killed by Philistines (I Sam 4,11). When Phineus married his second wife Cleopatra, she falsely accused her two stepsons of corrupting her (Apollodorus 3.15.3). They were blinded by Phineus, or by Cleopatra herself (Sophocles *Ant.* 966-976).

4) The Nubian connection

The Hebrew name Phinehas means "the Negro"; Phineus is the brother of the king of Ethiopia (Apollodorus 2.4.3).

5) The Canaanite connection

Andromeda was exposed to the dragon at Joppa, where Conon places Phineus; Shiloh of the Phinehas cycles is directly inland from Joppa. M. Scaurus brought the bones of the monster to Rome (Pliny 9.11); and Jonah (1,3) had a similar adventure to Andromeda's at Joppa. The city is Ἰόπη (Strabo 16.2.28, יֹפֶי Jos 19,46; יֹפִי KAI 14.19), probably "Fair [City]," cf. Gen 12,14 יֹפֶי "fair" (fem.). Then further see Theseus' wife Ἰόπη (Plutarch, *Thes.* 29).

4 Apollonius 2.184; Hesiod frag. 157 Merkelbach-West.

Chapter 6: The Sacrificial Cult and its Critique¹

6.1 Sacrifice as banquet

Nowhere are Israel and Hellas more alike than in their sacrificial cult: the public slaughter of a large animal, ideally a bull, mature or young. Burkert² outlines "the course of an ordinary Greek sacrifice to the Olympian gods," and I summarize.³ The preparations include: washing and putting on clean clothes and wreaths; a procession with song "departing from the everyday world" to the place of sacrifice; a girl with a basket (containing barley and a hidden knife) leading the way; the sacrificial animal accompanying as if willingly, decorated, with gilt horns. At the place of sacrifice is the altar which is to be bloodied, with a fire on top, a censer, a water jug. The sacrifice is begun by washing the participants and the animal with water; eliciting its apparent agreement; throwing the barley on the altar and animal as if by way of discard; cutting hairs from the animal and throwing them in the fire. Then the animal is killed; the women scream; the blood is caught and poured on the altar. The animal is carved up: the heart is placed on the altar; a diviner interprets the form of the liver; the organs are quickly roasted and eaten. The bones with the tail and fat, along with token pieces of meat, are burned; the skull is preserved; the skin is sold to benefit the sanctuary; the fire blazes up as cakes and wine are put on it. Then the participants have a feast on the roasted meat of the animal.

Already Homer makes it clear that most of the sacrificial meat was eaten on the spot by the participants, but part was thrown on the fire to a god or gods. *Iliad* 9.219-220:

... θεοῖσι δὲ θῦσαι ἀνάγει

Πάτροκλον, ὃν ἑταῖρον· ὁ δ' ἐν πυρὶ βάλλε θυηλάς

-
- 1 Extensive revision of an article "The Sacrificial Cult and its Critique in Greek and Hebrew," *JSS* 24 (1979) 159-173, 25 (1980) 1-21; much is new.
 - 2 Burkert, *Homo Necans* (Eng. edit.) 3-6.
 - 3 The fullest ancient single account, Lucian *de sacr.* 12-13 (LCL iii.168), is satirical and shows little feeling for the rite.

"[Achilles] told his comrade Patroclus to sacrifice to the gods; and he threw the offerings in the fire." Hesiod *Theog.* 540-555 tells how Prometheus tricked Zeus into choosing ox-bones covered with fat rather than the edible meat; "and hence the races of men on earth burn white bones upon fragrant altars to the immortals" (556-557):

ἐκ τοῦ δ' ἀθανάτοισιν ἐπὶ χθονὶ φύλ' ἀνθρώπων
καίουσ' ὅστέα λευκὰ θυθέντων ἐπὶ βωμῶν.

Menander *Dyscolus* 451-3 has the father Knemon point out that "men offer the tip of the tail, the gall and the inedible bones⁴ to the gods, and themselves swallow down the rest":

... οἱ δὲ τὴν ὀσφῦν ἄκραν
καὶ τὴν χολήν, ὅστέα τ' ἄβρωτα, τοῖς θεοῖς
ἐπιθέντες αὐτοὶ ἅλλα καταπίνουσι ...

Meat-dinners, though lavishly projected back to the heroic age, were rare in classical Greece; the *θυσία* was an occasion of general rejoicing, so plainly little of the meat was wasted for the gods.

Punic stelae from Carthage illustrate scenes of sacrifice⁵ but without text, so that for the Semitic vocabulary of sacrifice we are thrown back on the Hebrew Bible. Over against the Greek pattern, the Hebrew Bible specifies a type of sacrifice, the *לֶעֶל*, which is burned entire. At Lev 1,9 "the priest shall burn the whole [of an ox or the like] on the altar as an *לֶעֶל*, an offering by fire (LXX *θυσία*), a pleasing odor to Yahweh":

וְהִקְטִיר הַכֹּהֵן אֶת-הַכֹּל הַמִּזְבֵּחַ לֶעֶל אֲשֶׁר רִיחַ-נִיחֹחַ לַיהוָה

Theophrastus⁶ understood that "Syrians," including Jews, "conducted whole burnt sacrifices" (*ὀλοκαυτοῦντες*), and notes with surprise that "they get no feast from the sacrifices," οὐ γὰρ ἐστιώμενοι τῶν τυθέντων. But Hebrew also knows a type of sacrifice followed by a feast, much more like the Greek, for which the generic term is *זָבַח* (and a specific one *זָבַח שְׁלָמִים* "peace-offerings"). Thus at Lev 3,9-10.16 "And one shall offer up from the sacrifice of peace-offerings (*זָבַח שְׁלָמִים*, LXX τῆς *θυσίας* τοῦ σωτηρίου) as a fire-offering to Yahweh the fat, all the tail...and the lobe(?) of the liver (LXX καὶ τὸν λόβον τὸν ἐπὶ τοῦ ἥπατος, Vg *reticulumque iecoris*), *וְאֵת-הַיֶּתֶר עַל-הַכֶּבֶד*; all fat is for Yahweh." Originally perhaps the participants ate up the meat by themselves; later regulations (Lev 7,30-34) assign the breast and thigh to Aaronic priests. Josephus *AJ* 3.225 clearly distinguishes the two types of *ἱερουργίαι*: "In the first the whole sacrificed victim is

4 Following the quotation in Clement Alex. *Strom.* 7.31.1; the Bodmer papyrus and Athenaeus 4.146E have ὅτι ἔστ'.

5 DCPD art. "Sacrifices," 382-383.

6 In a fragment of the *de pietate* preserved by Porphyry *de abstin.* 2.26; see Stern i.10 for text and commentary.

burned entire...; the second is in thanksgiving and is performed to make a feast for the sacrificers." The Law may have magnified the role of the wasteful $\eta\lambda\upsilon$ and downplayed the extent to which (as in Hellas) the whole sacrificial apparatus was utilized to give a religious sanction to a meat dinner.

In fact it became a religious duty to finish up the animal on the day of the sacrifice. Thus at Lev 7,15 "And the flesh of the sacrifice of the peace offerings for thanksgiving shall be eaten on the day of one's offering; one shall not leave any of it until the morning." So Ex 12,10 of the passover lamb. Likewise in a sacred law from Lindos⁷ $\tau\alpha \theta\upsilon\theta\epsilon\omicron\upsilon\tau\alpha \alpha\upsilon\tau\epsilon\iota \kappa\alpha\tau\alpha\chi\rho\eta\theta\epsilon\alpha\iota$ "the things sacrificed are to be consumed on the spot"; in an Attic law⁸ $\omicron\upsilon\ \phi\omicron\rho\alpha$ "nothing is to be carried away."

Why does Lev 3,10 insist that the lobe of the liver (if that is what the Hebrew means) be burned? Yerkes⁹ observed that this was precisely the part of the liver used for divination in Babylonia and in the West; the primary reason it was burned was to prevent such divination. For at Aeschylus *PV* 495 Prometheus taught mortals the technique of divination including the "varied proper form of the lobe" of the liver, $\lambda\omicron\beta\omicron\upsilon \tau\epsilon \pi\omicron\iota\kappa\acute{\iota}\lambda\eta\nu \epsilon\upsilon\omicron\mu\omicron\rho\phi\acute{\iota}\alpha\nu$. At Ez 21,26 the king of Babylon "inspects the liver," $\text{לִבְכֶּבֶד הִבִּיט}$, LXX $\eta\pi\alpha\tau\omicron\sigma\kappa\omicron\pi\eta\sigma\alpha\theta\alpha\iota$, Vg *exta consuluit*; Herodian 8.3.7 $\pi\epsilon\pi\epsilon\tau\omicron\iota \dots \eta\pi\alpha\tau\omicron\sigma\kappa\omicron\pi\acute{\iota}\alpha\nu \epsilon\mu\pi\epsilon\acute{\iota}\rho\omega\nu$ "men skilled in liver-inspection." Vitruvius 1.4.9 rationalizes: generals "used to inspect livers" (*inspiciebant iocinera*) to determine the salubrity of the pastures grazed by the victim. We have a Babylonian clay liver-model for divination¹⁰ and a very similar bronze one from Etruria.¹¹ Burkert¹² discusses at length the connection from Babylon to Greece and Etruria demonstrated by hepatoscopy.

7 Sokolowski, LSCGSup no. 88, p. 151.

8 Sokolowski, LSCG no. 18 *passim*. See Burkert *Homo Necans* (Eng. ed.) p. 7 note 28.

9 R. K. Yerkes, *Sacrifice in Greek and Roman Religions and early Judaism* (1952) 156. J. R. Porter, "Ancient Israel," pp. 191-214 of M. Loewe & C. Blacker (eds.), *Divination and Oracles* (1981), p. 207 much less plausibly suggests that the manipulation of the liver and other organs in Lev 3 and Ex 2 *disguises* their use in divination. So also O. Loretz, "Opfer- und Leberschau in Israel...", *OBO* 129, 509-529.

10 ANEP² p. 196.

11 M. Pallottino, *Etruscologia*, 6th ed. (1960) Plate XXX.

12 Walter Burkert, *The Orientalizing Revolution* (Eng. edit.) 46-53. He discusses and with regret rejects the parallel between Latin *haruspex* "diviner" and Sumerian ĜAR "liver"; for surely, he says, it was the Akkadian equivalent (i.e. *kabattu*, R. Labat, *Manuel d'Epigraphie akkadienne*; 4th ed. [1963] no. 401) that would have travelled. But the job of the *haruspex* is to study the liver, *iecur* (Livy 8.8.19 etc.); and who knows whether Babylonian diviners kept some archaic Sumerian terminology? Perhaps we should leave the matter open.

A second reason for burning the liver (and other entrails) was that pagans ate them: II Makk 6,7 (cf. vss 8, 21) "[The Jews] were forced on the monthly birthday of the king [Antiochus IV] to eat the entrails of sacrifices," ἤγοντο δέ ... εἰς τὴν κατὰ μῆνα τοῦ βασιλέως γενέθλιον ἡμέραν εἰς σπλαγγνισμόν. It was much more Greek than Jewish that "Mr. Leopold Bloom ate with relish the inner organs of beasts and fowls" (Joyce, *Ulysses*).

Fortunately the gods were of ethereal enough substance that they could mostly be satisfied with the *smell* of burning meat. When Noah instituted sacrifice, Gen 8,21 (cf. I Sam 26,19) "Yahweh smelled the pleasant smell,"

יָרַח יְהוָה אֶת-רִיחַ הַנְּחִיחִים

Luther *roch den lieblichen Geruch* as if proposing a cognate for the Hebrew. God's final rejection (Lev 26,31) is "I will not smell your pleasant smells,"

וְלֹא אֲרִיחַ בְּרִיחַ נְחִיחֵיכֶם

Thus at *Iliad* 1.317 etc. "And the smell [of a sacrifice including bulls, τούρων] spiralling in the smoke went up to heaven":

κνίση δ' οὐρανὸν ἵκεν ἐλισσομένη περὶ καπνῶ

Iliad 8.549 "And the winds bore the smell from the plain up to heaven,"¹³

κνίστην δ' ἐκ πεδίου ἄνεμοι φέρον οὐρανὸν εἶσω.

Achilles (*Iliad* 1.65-67) presumes that Apollo will avert the pestilence if he receives "the smell of lambs or perfect goats," ἀρνῶν κνίσης αἰγῶν τε τελείων. The Homeric theory is baldly stated by Phoenix at *Iliad* 9.497, 500 "for the gods are pliable (στρεπτοί)," and men who have sinned "influence them with libation and smell," λοιβῆ τε κνίση τε παρατρωπῶσ' ἄνθρωποι.

Less ethereally the gods or their priests are compared to the flies that surrounded the sacrifice. *Gilgamesh* 11.159-160 "The gods smelled the sweet savor, the gods crowded like flies (*ki-ma zu-um-bi-e*) around the sacrificer." Callimachus in an unknown context:¹⁴ "Like flies around a goatherd or wasps from the earth or Delphians from a sacrifice, they[?] swarm in clouds"

... ὡς παρ' αἰπόλῳ μυῖαι

ἢ σφήκες ἐκ γῆς ἢ ἀπὸ θύματος Δελφοί,

εἰληδὸν [έσ]μεύουσιν ...

For the rapacity of the Delphians see p. 323 below; for "Lord of the flies" see Excursus D below.

While Hellas has some analogies to the whole burnt offering of Israel, the striking comparison is between their banquet sacrifices, where the god is fobbed off with inedible parts of the animal, and men enjoy a festival. Yerkes saw the general parallel but offered no explanation. de Vaux¹⁵ considers but rejects the possibility that Mycenaeans had brought the "holocaust

13 [Plato] *Alc. II* 149D adds an apocryphal line "but the blessed gods did not feast on it."

14 Callimachus frag. 191.26-28 Pfeiffer.

15 R. de Vaux, *Studies in Old Testament Sacrifice* (1964) 49.

and communion sacrifice" to Canaan, and concludes that "these rites would be the relics of a civilization spread throughout the eastern Mediterranean basin before the installation of the Hellenes and the Canaanites." Schmid¹⁶ is inclined to attribute the Hebrew banquet sacrifice to Mycenaean influence in Canaan. Casabona¹⁷ as we shall see (p. 259) thinks that ὄρκια τάμνω "a tout chance d'être, chez Homère, la dernière trace d'un tel rituel [i.e. perhaps Anatolian] de pacte militaire." Burkert,¹⁸ while noting the general agreement of the ancient world in animal sacrifice, adds:

One peculiarity of Greek sacrifice presents a problem for the modern historian: the combination of a fire-altar and a blood-rite, of burning and eating, corresponds directly only with the burnt offerings (*zebah, selamim*) of the Old Testament—although the details of Ugaritic and Phoenician sacrificial cults are uncertain—and these differ markedly from Egyptian and Mesopotamian, as well as Minoan-Mycenaean rites, all of which have no altars for burning whole animals or bones.

Schmid (p. 94) and de Vaux (p. 49) note agreements in the Greek and Hebrew vocabularies of sacrifice: Schmid's list has five items: βωμός the altar, μῶμος "flaw" in the sacrificial animal, μᾶζα "some kind of bread," ταύρος the bull, and οἶνος "wine." Of these I treat "wine" in Chapter 4, μῶμος in Chapter 7, and μᾶζα in the Appendix. To "altar" and "bull" I here add Latin *cornu* the bull's "horn," χιτῶν the sacrificer's "tunic," λίβανος "frankincense" to cover up the slaughter-house smell; and a bold new proposal, the verb σφάζω "slaughter" beside Hebrew שָׁחַ. Further I cite actual texts from Greek and Hebrew (and other languages too) to illustrate the usage of those words in context and in phrases. Then a vast panorama opens before us: an international and prehistoric *language of sacrifice*. Of the seven words I treat in this connection, *libanos* is a Semitic loanword in Greek of the historic period (as is its use also), and χιτῶν of the prehistoric one; Hebrew שָׁחַ with its anomalous morphology appears a loanword *from* Greek to Hebrew. The equivalents for "bull," "horn," "wine," "slaughter" might extend indefinitely far back into prehistory—perhaps before the differentiation of Indo-European and Semitic, though Levin rather thinks of prehistoric bilingualism. And the archaic character of the cult vocabulary corresponds to the archaic character of the cult itself.

16 Rudolf Schmid, *Das Bundesopfer in Israel: Wesen, Ursprung und Bedeutung der alttestamentlichen Schelamim*; SNT 9 (1964) 92-95; discussed by L. Rost, "Erwägungen zum israelitischen Brandopfer," pp. 112-119 of *Das Kleine Credo und Andere Studien zum Alten Testament* (1965); David Gill, "Thysia and š'lāmim: Questions to R. Schmid's *Das Bundesopfer in Israel*," *Biblica* 47 (1966) 255-262.

17 Casabona 218.

18 Burkert, *Homo Necans* (Eng. ed.) pp. 9-10.

6.2 Critique of the cult and modern theories

Moderns are puzzled and embarrassed by the sacrificial cult. So were Greek philosophers and Hebrew prophets, and they expressed their feelings in a *critique* or reevaluation of the cult. We may suspect that they had not fully grasped the social function of that which they rejected; René Girard regards concealment of the true nature of sacrifice as essential to its operation.¹⁹

Thus our most concise definition of Greek sacrificial cult is already a rejection, in a fragment of Empedocles.²⁰ For men of the Golden Age, he says, the only goddess was the "Cyprian queen" Aphrodite: men of that time honored her with offerings, paintings and unguents, "with sacrifices of pure myrrh and fragrant *libanos*, pouring libations of tawny honey onto the ground; but no *altar* was wet with the unmixed blood of *bulls*":

σμύρνης τ' ἀκρήτου θυσίαις λιβάνου τε θυώδους
ξανθῶν τε σπονδὰς μελίτων ῥίπτοντες ἐς οὐδὰς·
ταύρων δ' ἀκρήτοισι φόνους οὐ δεύετο βωμός.

Two more points of comparison appear in texts describing the fatal sacrifice of Heracles—a transformation of the cult by which the sacrificer becomes the victim. After the hero's last battle, says Apollodorus 2.7.7, "he built an *altar* (βωμόν) to Zeus of Cape Kenaion. And, intending to offer sacrifice, he sent a messenger to Trachis to fetch fine clothing. From the messenger, Deianeira [Heracles' wife] found out about Iole [his fair captive]. Afraid that he would prefer the captive to herself, and believing that the spilt blood of Nessus [the Centaur] was really a love-charm, she smeared the *tunic* (τὸν χιτῶνα) with it." Sophocles (*Trach.* 609-613) has Deianeira in her innocence speak of the "day of *bull-slaying*," ἡμέρα ταυροσφάγῳ on which she has vowed that she will "array [Heracles] in this *tunic*, for him to appear before the gods, a new sacrificer in a new vestment":

στελεῖν χιτῶνι τῷδε, καὶ φανεῖν θεοῖς
θυτήρα κοινῷ κοινὸν ἐν πεπλώματι.

So in Hebrew. A prophetic critique of the cult puts its features on the level of Canaanite practice (Isa 66,3): "He who slaughters a *bull* (Luther *Stier*) is a man-slayer; he who *sacrifices* (LXX θυσιάζων) a lamb breaks a dog's neck; he who offers cereal [offers] swine's blood; he who makes a memorial offering of *libanos* (LXX λίβανον) blesses an idol":

19 "The accepted manners and customs of an earlier time can become abominations, at once incredible and repulsive, to a later age": Bernard Lonergan, *Insight: A study of human understanding*; 5 ed. (1992); Collected Works vol. 3; 71.

20 Empedocles frag. 128, Diels-Kranz FVS⁶ i.362; it is quoted by Porphyry *de abstinentia* 2.20 from Theophrastus *de pietate*, before the quotation we have already seen.

שׁוֹחֵט הַשׁוֹר מִבְּהֵי־אִישׁ זֹבֵחַ הַשֶּׁה עֵרַף כָּלֵב
מַעֲלָה מִנְחָה דַם־חַיִּיר מְזִכִּיר לְבָנָה מִבְּרַךְ אֲנִי

The mature animal (שׁוֹר) was mostly used for work, and probably gelded; more frequently spoken of is the young bullock, פָּר; Ps 69,32 "This will be pleasing to Yahweh more than a bull, a bullock with horns and hoofs":

וְתִיטֵב לִיהוָה מִשׁוֹר פָּר מִקָּרִין מִפָּרִים

At Jud 6,25-26, where the altar (מִזְבֵּחַ) of Baal is replaced by that of Yahweh, one may speak of פָּר־הַשׁוֹר.

In the Levitical cult (Lev 16,3-4), Aaron sacrifices a "young bull of the herd" (בְּפָר בֶּן־בָּקָר) and wears a holy linen tunic (בְּתִנְת־בִּד, LXX χιτώνα λινοῦν, Vg *tunica linea*); at Lev 8,13-15 Moses clothes the sons of Aaron in tunics (בְּתִנְת, LXX χιτώνας, Vg *tunicis lineis*), and then puts the blood of the פָּר on the horns of the altar (קַרְנוֹת הַמִּזְבֵּחַ, LXX τὰ κέρατα τοῦ θυσιαστηρίου, Vg *cornua altaris*). But מִזְבֵּחַ is a replacement for the Canaanite בָּמָה (whatever its exact nature and function). Thus at Num 22,41–23,1, Balak takes Balaam up to "Bamoth Baal" (בָּמֹת בָּעַל); there they build seven altars (מִזְבֹּחוֹת, LXX βωμοὺς) and sacrifice seven bullocks (פָּרִים). In the pure Hebrew cult (Lev 9,18) Aaron "slaughters a bull" (וַיִּשְׁחַט אֶת־הַשׁוֹר, LXX ἔσφαξεν) in a "sacrifice of peace offerings" (זִבְחַת הַשְּׁלָמִים) and throws its blood on the altar (הַמִּזְבֵּחַ). In the prophetic critique the same language is derisory (Hos 12,12): "Though in Gilgal they slaughter bulls,²¹ their altars shall become as heaps of stones":

בְּגִלְגָל שֹׁרִים זָבְחוּ גַם מִזְבֹּחוֹתָם כְּגִלִים

What function did the rite serve in the community, Greek or Israelite? Obviously it had much social legitimacy. Here we do not need to form a hypothesis; rather, the common features of the rite in Israel and Hellas may point more clearly to the function. Still it may be useful to note a few theories. Hubert & Mauss²² maintain:

This [common sacrificial] procedure consists in establishing a means of communication between the sacred and profane worlds through the mediation of a victim, that is, of a thing that in the course of the ceremony is destroyed.

Over against them, Girard holds that the supposed sacred world is a fraud, and that the sole original function of sacrifice is to hold the community together by discharging its mutual tensions on the victim:

21 A unique plural, evidently in the northern dialect; everywhere else (see below) the collective בָּקָר serves as the only plural of שׁוֹר.

22 Henri Hubert & Marcel Mauss, "Essai sur la nature et la fonction du sacrifice," *L'Année sociologique*, 1898 [French ed. not seen by me]; *Sacrifice: its nature and function*, tr. W. D. Halls (1964) 97.

Le sacrifice polarise sur la victime les germes de dissension partout répandus et il les dissipe en leur proposant un assouvissement partiel. ...L'opération sacrificielle... suppose une certaine méconnaissance. Les fidèles ne savent pas et ne doivent pas savoir le rôle joué par la violence. Dans cette méconnaissance, la théologie du sacrifice est évidemment primordiale. C'est le dieu qui est censé réclamer les victimes...²³

Burkert sees the sacrifice as the living memory of the Palaeolithic hunt:

...the hunting situation is often evoked and acted out in later civilizations, as if one had to catch a wild beast so as to sacrifice it at a predetermined place. ...Sacrifice as an encounter with death, an act of killing that simultaneously guarantees the perpetuation of life and food, grew up out of the existence of the Palaeolithic hunter and remained the formative core of the sacred ritual.²⁴

The book of essays edited by Detienne & Vernant²⁵ sees sacrifice in Greek society (p. 4) "at the center of its dietary practices and politico-religious thought"; it studies the victim's "status and place in the bestiary [always domesticated]," "methods for dismembering the animal," "types of cooking," and "modalities of the distribution and division of the victim's flesh." I am less certain that sacrifice was a "daily practice" (p. 1) and that classical Hellas was to so great a degree as they suggest a meat-eating society.

6.3 *The bull and its name*

The name of the bull. Greek τᾰῦρος; Latin *taurus*; Oscan ΤΑΥΡΟΜ accus. sing.; Iguvine *toru* (Latin alph.) and *turup* (native), both accus. pl.; Lithuanian *tauras* "bison," Old Prussian *tauris*²⁶ and Old Church Slavonic тоуръ, both prob. "bison" also. With interchange of *r* and *w* in Keltic: Gallic TARVOS "Bull-god," Irish *tarb*; and also in Finnish and Estonian *tarvas* nom. sing. I do not know how to interpret the apparent spelling ΤΑΥΡΟΣ in a Cretan inscription of the 5th century BC.²⁷ Hebrew תור שׁור (freq. translated τᾰῦρος

23 René Girard, *La Violence et le Sacré* (1972) 22, 21; see also his *Le Bouc émissaire* (1982). V. Rosset, pp. 109-110 of A. Schenker (ed.), *Studien zu Opfer und Kult im Alten Testament; Forschungen zum AT 3* (1992), lists reviews and studies of Girard's work.

24 Burkert, *Homo Necans* [Eng. ed.] 15, 296.

25 M. Detienne & J.-P. Vernant (eds.), *The Cuisine of Sacrifice among the Greeks*; tr. P. Wissing (1989); full bibliography; French ed. not seen by me.

26 Known only from the "Elbinger Vocabular" of the 15th cent. (ed. E. Berneker, *Die preussische Sprache* [1896] no. 648): "Wesant: *Tauris*."

27 Sokolowski, *LSCG* no. 146 (Gortyn), p. 247.

by the LXX); transcribed as σῶρ by Epiphanius (Chapt. 4.6 above); Bib. Aram. תֹּרַיִן abs. pl. (Ezra 6,9), and so generally in Aramaic; Syriac תור *tawr* (for ταῦρος at Matt 22,4); Phoenician in Greek transcription θῶρ (Plutarch *Sulla* 17); Ugaritic *ṭr*; Arabic ثور *ṭawr(un)*; Old South Arabic *ṭwr*; Akkadian *šūru*. The Minotaur is Μινώταυρος (Plutarch *Thes.* 15) or τὸν ταῦρον τὸν Μίνω καλούμενον (Pausanias 1.24.1 etc.), Etruscan *θevrumines*.²⁸ The Ταυρίσκοι (Polybius 2.15.8) of the Alps may be "Bull-men."²⁹

For Levin³⁰ the words for "bull" are the principal exemplar of a noun-paradigm. In particular he compares in the accusative singular Greek ταῦρον with Arabic ثور *tawran*; the nominative plural ταῦροι (Latin *taurī*) with Aramaic תורֵי *towrey*; the genitive dual *ταύροις³¹ with Arabic pausal ثورين *ṭawrayn*. Also marginally the word forms a feminine with near-identical suffix. The Sefire treaty (KAI 222A.23) has [ושבע] שורה "[and seven] cows"; *shin* for *tau* shows that the Aramaic is Canaanizing. Hesychius³² has Ταυρώ as epithet of Artemis; and so Θουρώ in Philo Byblius,³³ and in Plutarch *Sulla* 17 beside θῶρ.

What bovid did these words originally name? Two wild ones are not excluded. The European bison (*Bison bonasus* Linn.) is clearly depicted at Lascaux in a mild interglacial period about 13,000 BC, and was well known to the classical zoologists.³⁴ Pausanias 10.31.1 at Delphi saw the bronze head of a Paenonian βίσωνος... ταύρου. A modern Lithuanian author describes the Caucasian subspecies (which became extinct in 1921): *baikštūjei taurai, laukines ožkos* "timid bison, wild goats" (nom. plurals).³⁵ The northern

-
- 28 M. Pallottino, *Testimonia linguae etruscae* (1954) no. 755: bronze mirror showing the Minotaur so labelled, with Mīnos (*mine*) and Ariadne (*ariaθa*). When Μινώταυρος is a man-bull it is perplexing that Κένταυρος is a man-horse.
- 29 But the mountain Ταῦρος (Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 8.2.9) is probably a folk-etymology of Biblical Aramaic טור Dan 2,35 "mountain," as are also the Scythian tribe Ταῦροι (Herodotus 4.103). Also the group of words represented by Gothic *stiur* (English *steer*), Old Icelandic *piðrr*, Avestan *staora* is not so clearly related.
- 30 Saul Levin, "Comparative Grammar of Indo-European and Semitic: Is this the right time?," *General Linguistics* 30 (1990) 152-164; summary of materials to appear in his big Semitic and Indo-European Comparative Grammar.
- 31 Unattested, but cf. the dual accusative ταύρω at Apollonius Rhod. *Argonautica* 3.410, where Jason yokes two bulls to the plow.
- 32 Hesychius T 273, iv.133 ed. Schmidt.
- 33 Philo Byblius, Jacoby FGH 790 F 10.43.
- 34 Aristotle, *Hist. Anim.* 630a18ff, describes its shaggy mane and small horns under the name βόνασος from Paenonia; cf. Pliny 8.38 *iubatos bisontes*.
- 35 Antanas Žukauskas (b. 1882) in the anthology by A. Senn, *Handbuch der litauischen Sprache*; 2 vols. (1957) ii.128.2. But A. Bezenberger, *Beiträge zur Geschichte der litauischen Sprache...* (1877) 331, thinks *taūras* a loanword from Greek into Lithuanian like other glosses which he cites.

subspecies is now semi-wild again in Poland and Belarus, where it was reintroduced from zoos after 1945.

The other wild bovid was the wild ox, *Bos taurus primigenius* Bojanus, close to the ancestor of domestic cattle. Mishna *BQ* IV.7 applies the old word to a recollection of it, שׁוֹר הַמִּדְבָּר "ox of the wilderness." The last truly wild specimen died in Poland in 1627; but the Director of the Berlin zoo, Dr L. Heck, partially bred it back between 1931 and 1946 from domestic cattle.³⁶ It dominates the paintings at Lascaux, which accurately show the male as much bigger, blacker, and more heavily horned than the female. So the wall painting at Level V of Çatal Hüyük of an enormous red bull being attacked by hunters must represent the wild ox. But domestic cattle then were closer to the wild ox than today; the animal in the "bull-leaping" Late Minoan fresco of Cnossus is a very impressive beast. *Iliad* 2.480-481 attests sexual dimorphism among domestic cattle:

ἦὔτε βοῦς ἀγέληφι μέγ' ἔξοχος ἔπλετο πάντων
ταῦρος· ὁ γάρ τε βόεσσι μεταπρέπει ἀγρομένησι

"[Agamemnon] stood far above the others like the bull-cow in a herd, for he is conspicuous among the wandering cows." As the bulls of Lascaux are the oldest theme of European art, continued down to the Minotaurs of Picasso, so the bull-fight of Çatal Hüyük and Cnossus; a golden bowl from Ugarit (a *gaulos*?) shows a hunter in a chariot charging bulls and gazelles.³⁷ Plato *Crit.* 119E describes a ritual bull-chase in mythical Atlantis.³⁸ Another favorite theme of the later Picasso is the bullfight. The tables are turned at Pamplona where bulls chase men through the streets.

Ernout-Meillet think that the root-vowel *a* marks out *taurus* as "belonging to the technical vocabulary of popular character." But if *taurus* had spread along Indo-European lines, however popular, on the analogy of *paruus* / παῦρος "small" and *neruus* / νεῦρον "sinew" we would have expected *more* differences: e.g. a Latin **taruus*, which is actually the Keltic form. This suggests that the word spread both outside and inside Indo-European as a loanword to express some special breed or function of cattle. A nice parallel in the full light of history is the spread from the Black Forest to Syria of the Germanic name *ūr* of the wild ox.

The Germanic is attested in Old English *ūr*, and compounded with "ox" in Old High German *ūr-ohso* (modern *Auerochse*). Siegfried on his last hunt slew

...einen wisent und einen elch
starker ūre viere und einen grimmen schelch.

36 F. H. Van Den Brink, *Die Säugetiere Europas* (1957) 148.

37 ANEP² p. 56.

38 There is a possible chase of heifers in the Iguvine Tablets at Ib.40-44, VIIa.52-54.

"a bison and an elk, four mighty wild oxen and a fierce *schelch*."³⁹ The Old English word gave its name to the second letter of the runic "alphabet": *feoh, ur, þorn*. We have a complete alphabetical poem, with the second stanza:⁴⁰

Ur byþ ânmod and oferhyrned
felafrecne deôr feohteþ mid hornum
mære môrtstapa þæt is môdig wuht.

"*Ur* is fierce and horned above; the very bold beast fighteth with horns; a mighty moor-stepper, that is a courageous wight." Caesar (*Bell. Gall.* 6.28) learned the name from the locals and describes the beast at first hand:

Tertium est genus eorum qui uri appellantur. Hi sunt magnitudine paulo infra elephantos, specie et colore et figura tauri. Magna uis eorum est et magna uelocitas.... Amplitudo cornuum et figura et species multum a nostrorum boum cornibus differt. Haec studiose conquisita ab labris argento circumcludunt atque in amplissimis epulis pro poculis utuntur.

"Third is the species of what are called *uri*. These in size are little smaller than elephants, with the appearance, color and shape of a bull. They are very strong and very swift.... The size, shape and appearance of their horns are very different from the horns of our oxen. [The Germans] acquire them with care, plate the lip with silver, and use them in their most lavish banquets as cups." From Caesar it went over into poetry (Vergil *Geor.* 2.374):

siluestres uri adsidue capraeque sequaces

"forest oxen...following goats." Hence uniquely in Greek it appears in an epigram (*Anth. Pal.* 6.332) attributed to Hadrian which describes the dedication made by Trajan in Syria from the booty of the Getae:

Ζηνὶ τόδ' Αἰνεάδης Κασίῳ Τραϊανὸς ἄγαλμα
κοίρανος ἀνθρώπων κοιράνω ἀθανάτων,
ἄνθετο, δοιὰ δέπα πολυδαίδαλα, καὶ βοὸς οὔρου
ἀσκητὸν χρυσῷ παμφανόωντι κέρας.

"Trajan, descendant of Aeneas, made this offering to Zeus Kasios [Excursus B], a ruler of men to the ruler of the gods: two ornamented cups, and the horn of an *urus* ox set in shining gold."

39 Niebelungenlied 16.945, ed. Ursula Hennig after MS C (1977). Siegfried in the same hunt kills a lion(!) and a wild boar. It has been proposed to identify the *schelch* with the now extinct Giant Deer or "Irish Elk," *Megaloceros giganteus*, which may have survived as late as 500 BC near the Black Sea.

40 J. M. Kemble, "On Anglo-Saxon runes," *Archaeologia* 28 (1840) 327-372. How did the Germanic peoples rediscover the Hebrew pattern of a sequence of nouns, whose initial sounds are the principal phonemes of the language, and whose pictorial representations (e.g. the horns of the ox) stand for the phonemes?

When a bull is sacrificed, it is regularly dedicated to the High God. Deut 17,1 (cf Lev 9,4) "You shall not sacrifice to Yahweh your God a bull or a sheep in which there is a blemish (LXX μῶμος)":

לֹא־תִזְבַּח לַיהוָה אֱלֹהֶיךָ שׁוֹר נֶשֶׁה אֲשֶׁר יְהִיָּה בוֹ מוֹם

On μῶμος see Chapter 7 below. Xenophon *Cyr.* 8.3.11 in a Persian setting "perfect bulls were led to Zeus," ἤγοντο τῷ Διὶ ταῦροι πάγκαλοι. Sacred law of Magnesia, 196 BC:⁴¹ ἀναδείκνυσθαι ... τῷ Διὶ ταῦρον "to display a bull to Zeus." At Act 14,13 "the priest of [the temple of] Zeus outside the city," believing Barnabas to be Zeus, brings out bulls (ταύρους, Syr. תּוּרָא, Vg *tauros*), preparing to sacrifice (θύειν). Julian *Ep.* 58 to Libanius, AD 363⁴² καὶ ἔθυσσα τῷ Διὶ βασιλικῶς ταῦρον λευκόν, "And I sacrificed in royal manner a white bull to Zeus." So in an Oscan dedication from Vibo in Greek script⁴³ ΔΙΟΥΦΕΙ ΦΕΡΣΟΦΕΙ ΤΑΥΡΟΜ "A bull to Jupiter Victor." Same formula in the Arval brotherhood, AD 213⁴⁴ ΙΟΥΙ VICTORI Β(ΟVEM) Μ(ΑRΕΜ) Α(VRATVM)...ET LARIBVS MILITARIBVS ΤΑΥΡVΜ ΑLΒVΜ "To Jupiter Victor a gilt white ox...to the Lares Militares a white bull."

A federation of twelve peoples sacrifices twelve. At Num 7,3 the leaders of the tribes "brought their offerings before Yahweh, six covered wagons and twelve oxen (וְשֵׁנֵי עֶשֶׂר בָּקָר), a wagon for every two of the leaders, and for each one an ox (וְשׁוֹר לְאֶחָד)." ⁴⁵ Here the plural of שׁוֹר as normally is the collective בָּקָר with a strange resemblance to Latin *pecus*, pl. *pecora*. Likewise at *Odyssey* 13.181-187 the leaders of the Phaeacians, namely "twelve ruling kings" (*Odyssey* 8.390-391), "standing around the altar" (ἑσταότες περὶ βωμόν) offer twelve bulls (ταύρους) to "king Poseidon" (Ποσειδάωνι ἄνακτι).

If a god has bulls sacrificed to him, he is likely to be thought of as a bull. Aaron made one "calf" (עֲגֹל) of gold and Jeroboam two; the apostates blend together in tradition, for both say "Behold your gods (god?), O Israel, who brought you up out of the land of Egypt" (Ex 32,4; I Reg 12,28). Yahweh was worshipped in the golden cult-statue of Bethel, which Hos 8,6 calls the "calf of Samaria." "Calf" in these passages marks the contempt of an outsider, but Ps 106,19-20 lets it slip that Yahweh was in fact worshipped as a bull: "They made a calf (עֲגֹל) in Horeb and worshipped an image; they exchanged their Glory⁴⁶ for the likeness of a Bull (שׁוֹר) that eats grass." In Akkadian the "father of the gods" addresses Adad as "bull of the heavens," *šū-ur*

41 SIG³ 589.7 (ii.112) = Sokolowski, LSAM no. 32.7.

42 LCL ed. iii.202.

43 R. S. Conway, *The Italic Dialects* (1897) i.3.

44 *Acta Fratrum Arualium* ed. Henzen (1874) cxviii.27.

45 I cannot explain the twelve oxen (בָּקָר) under the metal "sea" of I Reg 7,44.

46 Scribal correction for כְּבוֹדוֹ "his [God's] glory."

ša-ma-a-i.⁴⁷ So the chief god of Ugarit is a bull, and behaves like a bull in the china-shop of the cosmos:⁴⁸

al yšm'k tr il abk lys' alt tbtk
lyphk ksa mlkk lytbr hṯ mṯṯtk

"Let not Bull El thy father hear you, or else he will pull out your dwelling's pillars(?), overthrow your throne of kingship, break your staff of dominion." In the Aramaic of Palmyra Bel is a bull, בל תור, ⁴⁹ cf. בל Isa 46,1 "Bel of Babylon."

Poseidon likewise is the "bull-like Earthshaker," τάρπεος Ἐννοσίγαιος ([Hesiod] *Scutum* 104-5). When Zeus carried Europa off to Crete, he "changed himself into a bull," ἤλλαξεν ἑαυτὸν εἰς ταῦρον.⁵⁰ Plutarch records a cult-song for Dionysos addressing the god as ἄξιε Ταῦρε "worthy Bull."⁵¹ The dedication of "Parisian sailors" (ΝΑΥΤΑΕ ΠΑΡΙΣΙΑΚ[Ι]) under Tiberius found under Notre-Dame is a square pillar of black stone with panels of four gods: one records Gallic for "bull," TARVOS TRIGARANVS, and illustrates just that, "a bull with three cranes."⁵²

6.4 The bull's horn

Latin *cornu*, Gothic *haurn*, κέρας, Sanskrit *çr̥ṅgam*; Hebrew קַרְנֵי קַרְנֵי; Arabic *qarn(un)*, Ugaritic *qrn*.

In Indo-European it is related to words for "head": Latin *cerebrum*⁵³ and Old High German *hirni* "brain," Sanskrit *çirah*, Homeric plural κάρηνα, ἐπικάρ "headlong" *Iliad* 16.392, Attic κάρᾱ. And also to words for "horned animal": Latin *ceruus*, Gallic *carw*, Old English *heorot*, all "stag"; κριός "ram," Old Icelandic *hreinn* "reindeer"; κεραός "horned." Latin *cornu* and

47 W. H. P. Römer, "Studien zu den altbabylonischen hymnisch-epischen Texten: Ein *kummu* Lied auf Adad (CT 15,3-4)," *Heidelberger Studien zum alten Orient* (FS A. Falkenstein), ed. D. O. Edzard (1967) 185-199, cf. p. 186.

48 Gordon UT 49:VI:26-27 = KTU 1.6.VI.26-27. See p. 000 below.

49 H. Ingholt et alii, *Recueil de Tessères de Palmyre*, BAH 58 (1955) 55.

50 Hesiod *Cat. frag.* 140 Merkelbach-West (paraphrase in Scholiast on *Iliad* 12.292), cf. Apollodorus 3.1.1. See Winfried Bühler, *Europa: Ein Überblick über die Zeugnisse des Mythos in der antiken Literatur und Kunst* (1968).

51 Plutarch *Quaest. Gr.* 36 = *Mor.* 299B.

52 CIL 13.3026 = ILS 4613. The pillar is now in the Roman baths of the Musée des Thermes de l'Hôtel de Cluny.

53 The suffix is separable, for see Ennius *Ann. frag. spur.* 5 Skutsch *saxo cere comminuit brun.*

ceruus form an alliterative half-hexameter, built into larger alliterative patterns:

effugeret canis Hyrcano de semine saepe
cornigeri incursum cerui... (Lucretius 3.750-1)

si forte fugacem
conspexit capream aut surgentem in cornua ceruum (Aeneid 10.724-5)
dat sparso capiti uiuacis cornua cerui (Ovid, Met. 3.194)

These patterns, foreign to the Greek hexameter, came into Latin from an alliterative Indo-European poetry like the Germanic; for in Old English the same etymological pair is found alliterating (on a different letter):

þeah þe hæþstapa hundum geswenced
heorot hornum trum holtwudu sēce

"Though the Heath-stalker, hard pressed by hounds, the *hart* strong of *horns*, should seek the woodland" (*Beowulf* 1368-9).

Levin observed⁵⁴ that Hebrew and Indo-European agree in parts of the body that come in pairs, with two morphological features: (1) a final *-n* (perhaps non-radical): עַיִן and Old English *egan* (gen.-dat.) "eye"; אָזְן and Gothic *ausona* (nom.-acc. pl.) "ear"; קַרְנֵי and Dutch *horen* "horn." (2) A dual ending: אֵינָיִם (Deut 29,3), οὐάτοις;⁵⁵ אֵינָיִם Hab 3,4, κεράτοις "twin tusks of an elephant" (Aelian *Hist. Anim.* 11.15). An Arabic text⁵⁶ has both duals for "bull" and "horn":

أَثُورُ مَا أُصِيدُكُمْ أَمْ ثُورَيْنِ أَمْ هَذِهِ الْجَمَاءُ ذَاتُ الْقَرْنَيْنِ

ʔaṭawra mā ʔaṣīdukum ʔam ṭawrayn ʔam hādihi ljamā ʔa dāta lqarnayn
"Is it one bull I hunt for you, or two, or this ewe possessing two horns?"
Beside well-attested Latin *cornu tauri* Levin compares the alternative Arabic genitive sing. **qarnu ṭawri*. Although "horn" has no noun cognates in Semitic, it can hardly be a loanword there; rather it must go back to a remote agreement between the two language-families or their ancestors.⁵⁷

54 S. Levin, IESL 339-343.

55 Hippocrates *de glandis* i.494 Kühn.

56 Ibn Manẓūr, Lisān al-ʿarab (Beyrouth 1988) xi.136B under *qarnun*; variant form from a different author at ii.150A under *thawrun*. The word for "ewe" implies that it normally is hornless, so that the quotation is a paradox, but I do not understand it. The editions only partially vocalize.

57 See Allan R. Bomhard, *Toward Proto-Nostratic: A new approach to the comparison of Proto-Indo-European and Proto-Afroasiatic*; Amsterdam Studies in the Theory and History of Linguistic Science IV.27 (1984); p. 179. On the basis of postulated equivalences between reconstructed sound-systems, he rejects the comparison of the "horn" words: "many lexical look-alikes (such as, for instance, Akk. *qarnu* 'horn' and Latin *cornū* 'horn') have been taken to be cognates when they are not." But it would seem more prudent to base phonetic equivalences on the most promising etymologies, rather than vice versa.

The words for "horn" agree further in numerous derived uses. Thus "horn" as a trumpet of ram's horn;⁵⁸ as a mountain peak;⁵⁹ as "horn of the moon".⁶⁰ In particular to designate elephant "tusks." Herodotus 3.97 says that the Ethiopians brought the Persian king tribute including logs of ebony (φάλαγγας ἔβένου) and "teeth of ivory (or of 'elephant')," ἑλέφαντος ὀδόντας. Pliny 8,7 comments *quae Iuba cornua appellat, Herodotus tanto antiquior et consuetudo melius dentes* "those [weapons] which Juba calls 'horns' are better called 'teeth' by Herodotus, a much older author, and by custom."⁶¹ Ez 27,15, listing the African trade of Tyre, has

קרנות שן והבנים (והבנים Q)

"horns of tooth and ebony," Vg *dentes eburneos et hebeninos*.

Likewise for the drinking-horn. Herodotus 7.126 states that on the seacoast of Thrace "there are many lions(!) and wild oxen (βόες ἄγριοι); their horns imported into Hellas are extremely large (τὰ κέρα αὐπερμεγάθεα)." Theopompus⁶² agrees with Caesar in describing the drinking horns of Paeonia (W. Thrace): "The oxen grow great horns there, so as to fill 3 or 4 *chous* (9-12 quarts); [their kings] make drinking-horns out of them, overlaying the rims with silver or gold." The endless dowry of the Iranian princess Tatuhepa of Mitanni included (Amarna 25:III.43-44):

1 qaran rîmi hurâšu uhhuz ... 1 qarnu ša alap šadî hurâšu uhhuz
"one aurochs (Heb. קָרָן) horn set in gold...one horn of a wild ox set in gold." (How did the two differ?) The exact phrase *qaran...hurâšu* went over to Greek in a fragment of Sophocles⁶³ ἐκπιόντι χρύσειον κέρασ "tossing down a golden horn," and we can postulate Phoenicianizing Hebrew *קרן חרוץ.⁶⁴

In cult the horn may supplant the bull; compare the prehistoric room of horns at Çatal Hüyük and the horn-room of Cnossus (where Europa's bull and the Minotaur also appear). The horns of a bull to be sacrificed may be gilt: Nestor orders the goldsmith Laerkes to come (*Odyssey* 3.426, cf. 384)

... ὄφρα βοὸς χρυσὸν κέρασιν περιχεύῃ

58 Jos 6,5; Xenophon *Anab.* 2.2.4; Lucretius 2.619.

59 Isa 5,1; Xenophon *Anab.* 5.6.7.

60 Aratus 733; Vergil *Georg.* 1.433; Ugaritic *yrh...bqrn* "the moon with its horn(s)", Gordon UT 3 Aqht obv. 10 = KTU 1.18.IV.9.

61 See Juba in Jacoby FGH 275 F 47.

62 Jacoby FGH 115 F 38 = Athenaeus 11.476D.

63 Sophocles frag. 483 TrGF iv.389 = Athenaeus 11.476C.

64 Likewise beside attested κέρατα οἴνου "horns of wine" (Xenophon, *Anab.* 7.2.23) we can restore Heb. *קרנות יין (cf I Sam 16,13).

"so that he may spread gold (leaf) on the horns of an ox."⁶⁵ See the late-Minoan vase from Cnossus representing a bull's head in green-black steatite: its eyes of rock crystal, its nostrils shell, its horns gilt. In the pageant of Ptolemy Philadelphus there were led in procession 2,000 "bulls with gilt horns," ταῦροι ... χρυσοκέρω where each of the three underlying nouns has its Hebrew and Akkadian counterpart.⁶⁶ Thus in the Hellenized offering of first fruits at Mishna *Bikk.* III.3:

והשור הולך לפניהם וקרניו מצופות זהב ועטרת של זית בראשו החליל מכה לפניהם
 "And the bull goes before them, and its horns are plated with gold; and there is a garland of olive-leaves on its head; the flute plays before them."⁶⁷

The second month of the year, like an early letter of the alphabet, is a bull (Chapter 4.6 above). Martial 10.51 calls the Zodiacal sign *Tyrius... taurus* and identifies it with Europa's bull. It is notably horned: Ovid, speaking of the perils on Phaethon's Zodiacal journey, warns (*Met.* 2.80):

per tamen aduersi gradieris cornua Tauri

"You will pass between the horns of the hostile Bull." It can be treated as a sacrificial animal to inaugurate the year (Vergil, *Georg.* 1.216-7):

candidus auratis aperit dum cornibus annum / Taurus...

"When the white Bull with gilt horns opens the year."

The Blessing of Moses in part compares the tribal leaders to animals—it is a prototype of a Zodiacal poem. Of Joseph it says: "He has majesty like the firstborn of his bull (שׁוֹרָי, LXX ταῦρου, Vg *tauri*, Luther *Stier*), his horns are the horns of a wild ox (קַרְנֵי רְאִים, κέρατα μονοκέρωτος, *cornua rhinocerotis*)" (Deut 33,17). The LXX and Vulgate, which no longer knew what the wild ox was, interpret as a rhinoceros (though one-horned!); medievally, who did not know what a rhinoceros was either, interpret as a unicorn (so KJV). So in Ugaritic of the gods:⁶⁸

ilm yp'r šmthm bhm qnm km ṯm wgbṯt km ibrm

"The gods proclaim their own names; they have horns like bulls and humps like wild oxen."⁶⁹

65 Heracles' third labor was to bring back from the North the "doe with golden horns," χρυσοκέρων ἔλαφον Pindar *Olymp.* 3.29.

66 Athenaeus 5.202A = Jacoby FGH 627 F 2.

67 Discussion by Saul Lieberman, *Hellenism in Jewish Palestine*, 144-146. See C. Kühne, "Voropfer im alten Anatolien," *OBO* 129, 225-284, p. 276, with other "preliminary rites."

68 Gordon *UT* 75:I:28-32 = *KTU* 1.12.I.28-32.

69 We may add further bull-gods: the river Acheloos, a "high-horned bull," ὑψικέρω ... ταύρου (Sophocles *Trach.* 508); Dionysus the "bull-horned god," ταυροκέρων θεόν (Euripides *Bacch.* 100).

Human beings are assimilated to the bull. Ex 34,29 says of Moses that "the skin of his face was horned," קָרְן עוֹר פָּנָיו Vg *cornuta esset facies sua*. Morris⁷⁰ thinks that Moses was represented as wearing a bull-mask, a kind of Minotaur. Cf. Ovid *Amores* 3.11A.6 *uenerunt capiti cornua sera meo* "Horns, though late, have come to my forehead"; the opposite of the Renaissance image of cuckolding, he has finally become a man. Zedekiah (I Reg 22,11) makes the symbolism of Deuteronomy a reality by putting on iron horns. Cf Plautus *Pseud.* 1021 *ne in re secunda nunc mi obuertat cornua* "lest now that things are going well he turn his horns against me."

The bull-symbolism is sublimated but not forgotten when David (Ps 18,3) says that God is "the horn of my salvation," קָרְן יְשׁוּעִי, LXX κέρασ σωτηρίας μου, Vg *cornu salutis meae*; Luther *Berg meines Heiles* (treating קָרְן as "mountain peak"). Luk 1,69 picks up the phrase in the Benedictus, ἡγειρεν κέρασ σωτηρίας ἡμῶν. Also for a woman: Hannah (I Sam 2,1) says

רָמָה קַרְנֵי בַיהוָה

"My horn is high in Yahweh." In Hebrew this represents the enabling of the poor, for Hannah goes on "he lifts the needy from the ash-heap." Horace *Carm.* 3.21.17-20 says to wine *addis cornua pauperi* "you add horns to the poor man" so that he will not fear kings or soldiers.

6.5 "To slaughter"

The words for "bull" are frequently the object of a verb "to slaughter." Thus with the root זבח: II Sam 6,13 שׁוֹר יִזְבַּח "And [David] slaughtered a bull"; Lev 4,10 מִשׁוֹר זָבַח "from the bull of sacrifice"; Hos 12,12 שְׁוֹרֵי זָבַח "they slaughter bulls" with a derived form of the verb and a unique plural of the noun. So with the verb σφάζω Xenophon *Anab.* 2.2.9 σφάζαντες ταῦρον "after they slaughtered a bull" (and other animals); Herodotus 6.76.2 σφαγιασάμενος δὲ τῆ θαλάσση ταῦρον "after [Cleomenes] slaughtered a bull to the Sea"; Arrian *Anab.* 1.11.6 σφάζαντα ταῦρον τῷ Ποσειδῶνι "after [Alexander] slaughtered a bull to Poseidon"; Euripides *Helen* 1582 ταυρείῳ σφαγῆ "by the slaughter of a bull."

The Hebrew and Greek verbs look much more alike in forms which show the stem: Gen 31,54 יִזְבַּח wayyilzbaḥ "and he slaughtered"; imperative Ps 50,14 זָבַח zābah; *Odyssey* 10.532 ἐσφαγμένα. In Hebrew *zbaḥ* the first two consonants are coordinated in that both are voiced; the third is not. Greek

70 Sarah P. Morris, *Daidalos and the Origins of Greek Art* (1992) 185; but her general comparison of Moses and Minos does not rest on any close agreement either in texts

sphag- differs mostly just in a shift of voicing: the first two consonants are unvoiced, the last is voiced. Further, the Greek *a* vowel is unexplained; but the Hebrew vowel is regular before a guttural.⁷¹

When we remember that West-Semitic *w* and *m* frequently interchange, in addition to *l* and *n*, the words for "king," מֶלֶךְ *mēlek* and (F)άννακ- *wanak-*, look very much alike.⁷² We can now add that a king may conduct the slaughter of a bull. I Reg 1,18-19 (cf. vs 25; II Sam 6,12-13) "Adonijah has become king...and has slaughtered a bull":

אֲדֹנִיָּה מֶלֶךְ ... וַיִּזְבַּח שׁוֹר

Old South Arabian *mdbht bh ydbhn mlkn twrn* "altar on which the king sacrifices a bull."⁷³ *Iliad* 2.402-422 Agamemnon "king of men" (ἄναξ ἀνδρῶν vs 402) and others slaughter (ἔσφαξαν vs 422) an ox (βοῦν vs 402) to Zeus (vs 412). Euripides *Herc. Furens* 601-2 ἤξει γὰρ αὐτός ... κάμ' ἐπισφάξων ἄναξ "for that king himself shall come to slaughter me also."

A covenant is ratified by the blood of bulls and other animals. Ex 24,5-8 (cf. Sach 9,11) Moses throws the blood of bullocks (פְּרִים) on altar and people: "Behold the blood of the covenant that Yahweh has cut with you":

הִנֵּה דָם הַבְּרִית אֲשֶׁר כָּרַת יְהוָה עִמָּכֶם

Aeschylus *Septem* 43-44 the Seven made their oath (ὠραωμότησαν vs 46) when they "slaughtered a bull into a shield rimmed with black [iron] and touched the bull's blood with their hands":

ταυροσφαγοῦντες ἐς μελάνδετον σάκος

καὶ θιγγάνοντες χερσὶ ταυρείου φόνου.

See p. 260 below and on "licking" blood pp. 282-3.

A verb similar to זָבַח, namely טָבַח, seems in Hebrew little more than a phonetic variant. The corresponding verbs in Arabic, دَبَحَ *dabaha* and طَبَخَ *tabaha*, differ also in the third consonant; they have been partially assimilated in Hebrew, and either could lie behind σφάξω. At Prov 7,22 the second verb is in a proverb "As an ox comes to the slaughter":

כְּשׁוֹר אֶל־טִבַּח (טָבַח) יָבוֹא

or monuments.

71 Here the LXX version by its very awkwardness points to an embarrassment on the part of the translators. ταῦρος translates שׁוֹר frequently in legal and narrative use (e.g. Exod 21,35-36) but not in sacrificial context except at Jud 6,25 MS "B". Likewise σφάξω is normal in translating שָׁחַט, but appears for forms of זָבַח only at Amos 5,25; Lev 17,5; Ez 34,3. Thus the LXX distances itself from normal Greek sacrificial vocabulary.

72 See my discussion in "From Divine Kingship to Dispersal of Power in the Mediterranean City-State," ZAW 105 (1993) 62-86, p. 77.

73 Joan C. Biella, Dictionary of Old South Arabic, Sabaeen Dialect; Harvard Semitic Studies 25 (1982) 543.

LXX ὥσπερ δὲ βοῦς ἐπὶ σφαγὴν ἄγεται. An anonymous dramatic fragment⁷⁴ reflects the same proverb:

... ἔοικα βοῦς ἐπὶ σφαγὴν μολεῖν

"I seem to be coming as an ox to the slaughter"; [Lucian] *Demosth. Enc.* 40 (LCL viii.286) βοῦν ἂν ἐπὶ σφαγὴν ἤγομεν; "Would we lead him as an ox to slaughter?"⁷⁵ With the same root כּבַּט compare Isa 53,7 (p. 218 below); Ps 44,23. So Rev 5,6 (and 13,8) ἀρνίον ... ὡς ἐσφαγμένον "a lamb as if slain."

6.6 The altar

Greek βωμός and Hebrew בְּמָה, with their perplexing resemblance, each normally refers to the altar of sacrifice. At *Iliad* 8.441 βωμοῖσι appears to be a "pedestal" for a chariot; at *Odyssey* 7.100 βωμῶν "bases" for golden statues holding torches. Elsewhere βωμός is "altar," usually with a base. It is often taken from βαίνω "I go"; then "base" would be primary, as with βάσις "that which something stands on, base, pedestal." In Odysseus' last look at Scheria, the twelve kings are preparing to sacrifice twelve bulls, "standing around the altar" (*Odyssey* 13.187) ἐσταόσῃσιν περὶ βωμόν.

The connections of בְּמָה within Semitic are unclear. Ugaritic *bmt* may mean "back": *yštn aṯrt l bmt ʿr* "he sets Athirat on the back of an ass."⁷⁶ But Akkadian *bamātu* is now interpreted "open country, plain" (CAD) not "mountain ridges." At Ez 36,1-2 הָרֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל "the mountains of Israel" runs parallel to בְּמֹת עוֹלָם "ancient heights." But mostly the בְּמָה is a place of worship, after the beginning pagan or idolatrous, and often sacrificial; little is explained by calling it a "high place" with the LXX and Vg. At I Sam 9,12 Samuel attends one such, without criticism: "For the people have a sacrifice today at the *bamah*":

כִּי זָבַח הַיּוֹם לְעֵם בְּמָה

At I Reg 3,4 "The king went to Gibeon to sacrifice there, for it was the great *bamah*; Solomon used to sacrifice a thousand burnt offerings on that altar":

וַיֵּלֶךְ הַמֶּלֶךְ גִּבְעֹנָה לְזֹבַח שָׁם כִּי הָיָא הַבְּמָה הַגְּדוֹלָה אֲלֶף עֲלוֹת יַעֲלֶה שְׁלֹמֹה עַל הַמְּזֹבֵחַ הַהוּא

(There is a "great altar" at Jos 22,10 [מְזֹבֵחַ גְּדוֹל, LXX βωμόν μέγαν]; cf Aeschylus *Ag.* 383 "the great altar of Justice," μέγαν Δίκας βωμόν.) Since the men of Gibeon were "Hivites" (Jos 9,7, see p. 32 above), here is a route by which an "Achaean" word could have reached Israel.

74 Kock iii.521 treats as a comic fragment, Adespot. 631.

75 It is picked up in the proverb-collections, Apostolius 7.59 = CPG ii.409 etc.

76 Gordon UT 51:IV:14 = KTU 1.4.IV.14.

We saw at Num 22,41—23,1 above that altars (מִזְבְּחֹת) are built at the **בְּמֹת בְּעֵל**; at Ez 6,3-4 the two words are strictly parallel, where Yahweh says to the mountains of Israel:

וְאַבְדֵּתִי בְּמֹתֵיכֶם וְנִשְׁמֹוּ מִזְבְּחֹתֵיכֶם

"I will destroy your *bamoth*, and your altars shall become desolate." At Hos 10,8 the altar of Bethel is called alternatively the "*bamoth* of wickedness" (בְּמֹת אֶוֶן, LXX βωμοί!) and "their altars" (מִזְבְּחֹתֵם). After the early period, normally **בְּמָה** is used of idolatrous worship. It seems that in Canaanite paganism the **בְּמָה** served about the same function as the Hebrew מִזְבֵּחַ. Jerome on Jer 32,35⁷⁷ says flat out *notandumque, quod arae et excelsa Hebraico sermone appellentur bamoth*, "Note that in Hebrew 'altars' and 'high places' are called *bamoth*." In spite of all archaeology in Israel, nothing clearly identifiable as a **בְּמָה** has been found.⁷⁸ The Moabite "stele" of Mesha (KAI 181.3) has

וּאֵעַשׂ הַבַּמֹּת זֹאת לַכֶּמֶשׁ

"And I built this *bmt* for Chemosh"; but the original site is unknown; also any connection with the **בַּת בַּמֹּת** of vs 27 is unclear. In Roman Syria the altar itself is divinized: ΔΙΙ ΒΩΜΩ (IGLS 2.569); ΔΙΙ ΜΑΔΒΑΧΩ (IGLS 2.465) = Aramaic מְדַבְּחָא Ezra 7,17.

Further, the *bamah* as place of sacrifice, whether approved or disapproved, is used specifically for cattle; three demonstrable equivalents of **שׁוֹר** can be found in this context.

(a) We saw in 6.2 above that **פָּר** denotes the **שׁוֹר** or its young; and that seven **פָּרִים** are sacrificed at the **בְּמֹת בְּעֵל** (Num 22,41—23,1).

(b) "Calf" (**עֲגֹל**) as pejorative of **שׁוֹר**. Jeroboam (I Reg 12,31-32) made a **בַּיִת בְּמֹת** and sacrificed "calves" on the altar (מִזְבֵּחַ) at Bethel. We have seen (Ps 106,19-20) that the "golden calf" was really a bull, and it is plausible that bulls were sacrificed to it.

(c) **בָּקָר** serving as plural of **שׁוֹר**. It is a collective "herd" with a masculine plural adjective (I Reg 5,3). It can then be used to count individuals: Ex 21,37

חֲמִשָּׁה בָּקָר יִשְׁלַם תַּחַת הַשׁוֹר וְאַרְבַּע־צֹאן תַּחַת הַשֶּׂה

"He shall repay five cattle for the steer, and four sheep [or goats] for the sheep." Phoenician has the same structure (KAI 24.11, Kilamuwa):

וּמִי בַל חֹז פִּן שׁ שְׁתֵּי בַעַל עֹדֶר
וּמִי בַל חֹז פִּן אֶלֶף שְׁתֵּי בַעַל בָּקָר

"And whoever had not seen the face of a sheep, I made him possessor of a flock; and whoever had not seen the face of a cow, I made him the possessor

77 Corp. Christ. 74.343.14.

78 ABD iii.196-200 s.v. "High Place."

of a herd." The Chronicler claims (I Chron 21,29) "the altar of burnt offering at that time [of David] was in the *בְּמֶה* of Gibeon." Since David could not reach Gibeon for the plague, he did at Oman's threshing floor (the future site of the Temple) what he would have done at Gibeon: he builds an altar (vs 26) and offers *זָקָר* (vs 23), of which the singular would be *שֹׂר*.

The Hebrew altar *מִזְבֵּחַ* (not so in our attestation the *בְּמֶה*) like the *βωμός* drips with blood during the sacrifice. Lev 3,2:

וְזָרְקוּ ... הַכֹּהֲנִים אֶת־הַדָּמִם עַל־הַמִּזְבֵּחַ סָבִיב

"And the priests shall throw the blood on the altar round about"; Deut 12,27 "And the blood of your sacrifices shall be poured out on the altar of Yahweh your God, but the flesh you shall eat." Bacchylides 11.110-111

ταὶ δ' αὐτίκα οἱ τέμενος βωμόν τε τεῦχον
χραῖνόν τέ μιν αἵματι μῆλων

"And [the daughters of Proteus] immediately built [Artemis] a precinct and altar, and stained it with the blood of sheep." Theocritus *Epigr.* 1.5 βωμόν δ' αἰμάξει κεραὸς τράγος "And a horned he-goat shall make the altar bloody."⁷⁹

Cult objects associated with horned victims themselves tend to acquire horns. An altar has horns which a suppliant may grasp (I Reg 1,50 etc.); the tenth-century incense altar from Megiddo has four nice ones.⁸⁰ The Haghia Triadha Minoan sarcophagus shows a table or altar with four double horns.⁸¹ The altar Keraton (τὸν Κερατῶνα βωμόν Plutarch *Thest.* 21) at Delos was composed of left-hand horns alone.⁸² Theophrastus (*Char.* 21.7) says that the Mikrophilotimos ("He who thinks small"), if he sacrifices, puts up the cow's skull garlanded over his door. Hence the Hellenistic altars with garlands and *boukrania* which reach their acme in the Ara Pacis Augustae.

Among the passages where *בְּמוֹת* means something like "heights" are six apparently plural where the Masoretes pointed *בְּמֹתַי*, either on the text⁸³ or the Qeri.⁸⁴ Four speak of the heights of the earth, e.g. Mic 1,3 "For behold, Yahweh is coming forth out of his place, and will come down and tread on the high places of the earth (*בְּמֹתַי אֶרֶץ*), LXX ὑψη τῆς γῆς, Vg *excelsa*)." Or since clouds look like mountains, the ambitious one says "I will go up on the backs of the clouds": *עַב*, *בְּמֹתַי*, Vg *super altitudinem nubium* (Isa 14,14). So Job 9,8, "Who alone stretched out the sky, and trod on the ridges of the sea (*בְּמֹתַי יָם*), Vg *super fluctus maris*)." The morphology as a construct plural is unparalleled; while the stem *bomōtley* corresponds phoneme for

79 See the critique at Lucian *de sacr.* 13 (LCL iii.168).

80 ANEP² p. 192.

81 M. Robertson, *Greek Painting* (1959) 26.

82 Cf. Callimachus in *Apoll.* 2.62-63.

83 Job 9,8; Isa 14,14; Amos 4,13.

84 Deut 32,13; Isa 58,14; Mic 1,3.

phoneme to Greek nom. sing. βωμός! It is perplexing that this apparently Greek form should have a non-Greek meaning; still, in addition to the common meaning "altar" of the two words, it is a further argument for a Greek loanword in Semitic.⁸⁵

6.7 The tunic

Greek and Hebrew agree in three groups of words for "linens": primary is the one which also means "tunic"; more briefly I discuss the words for "byssus" and the *sinдон*. Normal χιτών has dialect forms with reversed aspiration or none: Ionic κιθώνι Herodotus 1.8.3;⁸⁶ Sicilian Doric κιτῶνος.⁸⁷ Levin proposes that in Hebrew also such words had unmarked aspiration (not the well-marked fricativization) on one consonant or the other but not both.⁸⁸ It seems already to appear in Linear B:⁸⁹ *ri-no re-po-to qe-te-o ki-to...e-pi-ki-to-ni-ja*, i.e. λίνον λεπτόν ... (?) χιτών ... *ἐπιχιτώνια. It is uncertain whether Latin *tunica* is a deformation of the Greek via Etruscan.

These correspond to Semitic words with two meanings "tunic" and "linen," although the line is not easy to draw. The "tunic" words in Semitic are mostly feminine: thus Ugaritic *ktm* is shown feminine by the numeral in the dual *ktm*.⁹⁰ The Greek is closest to Egyptian Aramaic which has כתון Cowley 42.8. The Hebrew forms are all suffixed, either with a fixed first vowel כתנת *kuttonet* Gen 37,31 (pl. כתנות *kuttonot* Ex 28,40); or a variable one in the same verse, כתנת *kātonet* (pl. כתנות *kātonot* Ex 39,27). Perhaps the second form is Phoenician, which elsewhere has the pre-tone vowel reduced.⁹¹ If the Phoenician was unsuffixed and masculine it could be the exact ancestor of the Greek, where the *ι* of χιτών could be an addition to keep it from falling together with χθών "earth." In Egyptian Aramaic כת

85 See F. Aspesi, "Semitico bm.t e gr. βωμός," pp. 179-186 of G. Bolognesi et al. (eds.), *Linguistica e Filologia* (Convegno Milano 1984), 1987.

86 Also Aeolic κιθωνας (Sappho frag. 140 Lobel-Page PLF) and non-literary (e.g. *P.Oxy.* 17.2149.6).

87 Sophron frag. 35 Kaibel 159; also non-literary κιτῶνα (e.g. *P.Oxy.* 10.1269.30).

88 Saul Levin, "Grassmann's 'Law' in the early Semitic loan-word χιτών, κιθών," *Studi micenei ed egeo-anatolici* 8 (1969) 66-75.

89 DMG² 222, p. 320.

90 Gordon UT 1110.6 = KTU 4.132.6.

91 The development of Phoenician clothing is discussed at DCP 490-491, with bibliography.

can mean simply "linen": Cowley 20.5 **לְבָשֵׁי קִמָּר וְכֹתֵן** "garments of wool and linen."

It seems likely that the West-Semitic words are derived from Akkadian *kitû* "linen, linen garment," itself apparently from Sumerian GADA which serves as its ideogram. Perhaps Arabic *quṭ(u)n* "cotton" (the source of the English word) is also somehow related.

The words for "tunic" are the normal name for what was originally in summer the *only* garment. As dress became more elaborate, and eastern culture moved into cooler climates like Italy in winter, the tunic became the undergarment at all seasons. Since ceremonial dress is an elaboration of ordinary dress, current or archaic, the tunic is the proper dress of sacrificing priests and other officials. Finally, above all in Greek, the tunic takes on the symbolism of the *self*.

The tunic is a badge of various offices. The Amarna inventories (e.g. 14.III.11) list many *kitû* "for the king." Niqmad of Ugarit⁹² brought as tribute to the Hittite *ks ḫrs ktn mit pḫm mit iqni lmkṭ* "a gold cup, a tunic, 100 red stones, 100 pieces of lapis lazuli, for the Queen." When God replaces the steward Sheba by Eliakim (Isa 22,21) he says "And I will clothe him in your tunic," **וְהִלְבַּשְׁתִּיו בְּתֻנְתְּךָ**, Vg *et induam illum tunica tua*. Tamar wore a **כְּתֹנֶת פְּסִים** (II Sam 13,18) "tunic to the hands and feet," LXX "to the wrists" **χιτῶν καρπωτός**, Vg "to the ankles," *tunica talari*. Joseph wore the same garment (Gen 37,3), wrongly interpreted by the LXX and Vg as "tunic of many colors."⁹³ Hebrew law explains the use of the tunic from modesty: the "linen tunics" (Ex 39,27) for Aaron and his sons, **שֵׁנֵי הַתְּנִינֹת**, LXX [36,34] **χιτῶνας βυσσίνους**, Vg [39.25] *tunicas byssinas* are motivated (Ex 38,42-43) "to cover the flesh of their nakedness...lest they bring guilt on themselves and die." So at Rome. Old regulations on the *flamen Dialis*, the priest of Jupiter (Aulus Gellius 10.15.19-25) prescribe:

Farinam fermento inbutam attingere ei fas non est. Tunica intima, nisi in locis tectis, non exuit se, ne sub caelo tamquam sub oculis Iouis nudus sit.... Locum in quo bustum est numquam ingreditur, mortuum numquam attingit.

"It is not permitted for him to touch flour mixed with yeast. He never takes off his inner tunic except under cover, lest he be naked under the sky as if under the eyes of Jupiter.... He never enters a place where there is a tomb, he never touches a corpse."⁹⁴

92 Gordon UT 118.27-28 = KTU 3.1.27-28.

93 But KB³ iii.892 think the meaning of the Hebrew uncertain.

94 These and other restrictions on the *flamen* are paralleled in Leviticus and in the Mishnaic restrictions on the king (*Sanh.* II.5). Thus the Israelite priests ate unleavened bread, the chief priest (Lev 21,11) could not enter a cemetery.

Greeks and Romans felt that typical Oriental versions of the tunic, full-length or purple, were suitable only for foreigners, gods or effeminate. Babylonians wore a "linen tunic to the feet," *κιθῶνι ποδηνεκέϊ* (Herodotus 1.195); although a Theseus might wear a "purple tunic," *χιτῶνα πορφύρεον* (Bacchylides 18.52), only a Persian king would wear a "purple tunic to the feet," *χιτῶνα πορφύρεον ποδήρη* (Xenophon *Cyr.* 6.4.2).⁹⁵ Athena of the Parthenon wore a "tunic to the feet," *χιτῶνι ποδήρει* (Pausanias 1.24.7). In Rome to wear "tunics reaching the hands and feet" (*manicatis et talaribus tunicis*, Cicero *Cat.* 2.82) marked a man as effeminate. Only the triumphator might wear the *tunica palmata* (Livy 10.7.9) with palm-leaves, called *tunica Iouis* (Juvenal 10.38) because kept in his temple.

This critique of Orientalism disguised how far men already had taken the tunic up. At Gen 37.33 Jacob recognizes Joseph's coat, *ἡλῆθ, LXX χιτῶν, Vg tunica*. In a dancing floor like that of Cnossus (*Iliad* 18.595-6):

*τῶν δ' αἱ μὲν λεπτὰς ὀθόνας ἔχον, οἱ δὲ χιτῶνας
εἶατ' ἐϋνήτους, ἦκα στίλβοντας ἐλαίῳ*

"the girls had light *othonai*, and the boys wore well-woven tunics, lightly shining with oil." The tunic becomes so universal that it can be generalized of any garment covering the chest, including a chain-mail corslet: thus the Achaeans are "bronze-tunicked," *χαλκοχιτῶνων* (*Iliad* 1.371 etc.); and so the "tunic of Zeus" (*χιτῶν[α] ... Διός*) which Athena puts on (*Iliad* 5.736). Thucydides 1.6.3 says that only recently had Athenian men given up wearing linen tunics, *χιτῶνας ... λινοῦς*; and (1.6.6) that the old style was one of the ways that older Hellas was like contemporary barbarism. Herodotus 5.87.3 says that about the same time Athenian women were forced to give up Dorian dress, so as not to have the weapon of the fibula available, and went over to the linen tunic, *τὸν λίνεον κιθῶνα*. Cicero *Verr.* 2.5.3 *tunicamque eius a pectore abscidit* "[Antony] tore [Aquilus'] tunic off his chest" to show his battle-scars.

Elsewhere the imported tunic became a man's undergarment beneath the cloak (*ἱμάτιον, pallium*). This is clear in the proverbial verse (Plautus *Trin.* 1154) *tunica propior palliost* "the tunic is closer the skin than the pallium," i.e. blood is thicker than water. So at *Iliad* 2.262 where Odysseus threatens to strip the clothes off Thersites:

χλαῖνάν τ' ἠδὲ χιτῶνα, τά τ' αἰδῶ ἀμφικαλύπτει

"[first] the cloak and [then] the tunic which cover your shame." Luk 6,29 implies the same sequence, *ἀπὸ τοῦ αἵροντός σου τὸ ἱμάτιον καὶ τὸν χιτῶνα μὴ κωλύσης*, "When somebody snatches your coat (Vg *vestmentum*) [which you have thrown off], don't deny him your tunic (Vg *tunicam*) [which

95 The meaning of the *τερμιόμεντα χιτῶνα* (*Odyssey* 19.242, Hesiod *Opera* 537) is uncertain.

you are still wearing]." Matt 5,40 presumes the same dress but a different situation: "When somebody sues you to confiscate your tunic (χιτώνα, Vg *tunicam*), give him your cloak (ιμάτιον, *pallium*) also"; for the cloak was inviolable (Ex 22,26) as the poor man's only night covering.

In Hellas and Rome the new outer garment, the *himation* or toga, became white and fell heir to the ceremonial function of the Oriental tunic. But with a difference; for it now served as the collective badge of the free citizenry in their state. Under Greco-Roman influence the Aaronic tunic came to be seen as pure white: thus in the Qumran *Bellum* VII.10

שבעה כוהנים מבני אהרון לובשים בגדי שש לבן כתונת בד

"seven priests, sons of Aaron, wearing garments of white fine linen, tunics of linen." The Church saw its egalitarian society as a universal priesthood, a βασιλείον ἱεράτευμα (I Pet 2,9) of those whose "commonwealth" (πολίτευμα) was in heaven (Phil 3,20); both then on religious and on civic grounds the great multitude of Rev 7,9 are "clothed in white garments."

Underneath those outdoor ceremonial civic vestments the actual tunic became an undergarment next the skin, a second skin standing for the private matters of birth, sexuality, mourning and death.

(a) *The skin as tunic in birth.* The body, says a Greek verse epigram from north Italy (IG 14.2241), is the tunic of the soul, Σ[ΜΑ] Χ<Ι>ΤΩΝ ΨΥΧΗΣ; so Arrian, *Epict.* 1.25.21 with his characteristic diminutives τὸ τελευταῖον χιτωνάριον, τοῦτ' ἔστι τὸ σωματίον "the poor little tunic, our little body." Empedocles⁹⁶ says that some feminine power "clothes [souls] in an alien tunic of flesh":

σαρκῶν ἀλλογνῶτι περιστέλλουσα χιτῶνι

What then are the "tunics of skin" Gen 3,21 עֹר קְתָנוֹת (LXX χιτώνας δερματίνους, Vg *tunicas pelliceas*) with which God clothed man and woman? A child asked if God killed for this purpose the animals he had just made. Perhaps they are the actual human skin, or the entire bodily frame, for a creation which up until then had been of subtler substance. The Rabbis suggest the latter (Bab. Talm. *Niddah* 25a) "The Holy One, blessed be He, makes no skin for a human being before he is formed":

שׂאין ... עושה עור לאדם אלא אם כן נוצר

(b) *The tunic of sexuality.* The prime symbol of sexuality is the woman's taking off her tunic. Gyges felt that "a woman puts off her modesty along with her tunic" (Herodotus 1.8.3), ἅμα δὲ κιθῶνι ἐκδυμένῳ συνεκδύεται καὶ τὴν αἰδῶ γυνή. Similarly Anacreon⁹⁷ ἐκδῦσα κιθῶνα δωριάζειν "for a woman to take off her tunic and act Doric" like the naked woman athletes of

96 Empedocles frag. 126, Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ i.362.

97 Anacreon frag. 400 Page PMG p. 199.

Sparta. It is an open invitation when the girl says (Cant 5,3) "I put off my tunic, how could I put it on again?":

שָׁשַׁף יָתִי אֶת כְּתָנִי אֵיכָבֶה אֲלֶבְשָׁנָה

The LXX needs no language but that of Herodotus, ἔξεδυσάμην τὸν χιτῶνα μου, Vg *expoliaui me tunica mea*. Ovid *Fasti* 2.171 of the nymph Callisto *exuerat tunicas* where the plural is for the sake of meter. The strongest reversal of roles is for women to wear the tunics of men, ἀνδρείοις χιτῶσι as happened during the Hybristika at Argos.⁹⁸

(c) *The tunic torn in mourning*. If it is a skin, then tearing it is as good as tearing your skin. So Sappho has Aphrodite say to the votaries of dying Adonis:

—καθναίσκει, Κυθήρη', ἄβρος Ἄδωνις: τί κε θεῖμεν;

—καττύπεσθε, κόραι, καὶ κατερείκεσθε κίθωνας.

"—O Cytherean, soft Adonis is dying; what shall we do? —Beat your breasts, girls, and tear your tunics."⁹⁹ Likewise Tamar after her shame "tore her long tunic" (II Sam 13,19) קָרָעָה ... וְכָתַתָּה הַפְּטִים, LXX τὸν χιτῶνα τὸν καρπωτόν ... διέρρηξεν, Vg *scissa tunica talari*. In the Middle East of men also. Hushai came to David (II Sam 15,32) "with his tunic torn," וְצִרְיָו קָרָע, LXX διερρηχῶς τὸν χιτῶνα αὐτοῦ; so at Ahiqar 41¹⁰⁰ "he tore his tunic lamenting": בּוֹעַ כְּתוּנָה הִלֵּל. Mark 14,63 with a conventional plural says that the high priest "tore his tunics," διαρρήξας τοὺς χιτῶνας αὐτοῦ.

(d) *The tunic of death*. Job 30,18 "[My pain] binds me about like the neck of my tunic," כִּפְּי כְּתָנִי יֶאֱדָנִי. Jesus' tunic is all of a piece (Joh 19,23) ὁ χιτῶν ἄρραφος, Vg *tunica inconsutilis*; and so the one-piece tunic of the High Priest, Josephus *AJ* 3.161 ἔστι δ' ὁ χιτῶν οὗτος οὐκ ἐκ δυοῖν περιτμημάτων ὥστε ῥαπτὸς ... εἶναι "And this tunic is not of two pieces so that it would need to be stitched." Hence the tunic is used of various modes of death.

By stoning. Hector says to Paris (*Iliad* 3.57) "You would have put on a stone shirt," λάϊνον ἔσσο χιτῶνα. *By binding*. Apollodorus *Epit.* 6.23 says that the garment in which Clytemnestra trapped Agamemnon was a "tunic without armholes or neckhole," χιτῶνα ἄχειρα καὶ ἀτράχηλον. *By burning*. At Rome one mode of execution was to set on fire an inflammable shirt, Juvenal 8.235 *tunica punire molesta*; Seneca *Epist.* 14.5 calls it "that tunic both soaked in inflammable materials and originally woven out of them," *illam tunicam alimentis ignium et inlitam et textam*. Something similar was used against the Christians, Tacitus *Ann.* 15.44.¹⁰¹ Perhaps Heracles' poisoned

98 Plutarch *de mul. virt.* 4 = *Mor.* 245E.

99 Sappho frag. 140a Lobel-Page PLF 95.

100 Cowley p. 213.

101 See M. J. Mans, "The 'tunica molesta' and the Neronian persecution of the Christians,"

shirt is reminiscent of some such mode of execution: Apollodorus 2.7.7 says that it "grew into his body," τὸν δὲ χιτῶνα ... προσπεφυκότα τῷ σώματι. Eliot makes it an allegory of the severe divine love, "the intolerable shirt of flame / which human power cannot remove."

More briefly I note two other common nouns for "fine linen."

Byssus. βύσσος with Latin *byssus*; it can also denote silk (Strabo 15.1.20) or cotton (Philostratus *Vit. Ap.* 2.20); Heb. בוץ; Akkadian *bûsu*.

The linen band. σινδών; Martial 4.19.12 in *Tyria sindone*; Heb. יָרֵךְ (LXX often σινδών); Akkad. *sad-din*, prob. from Sumerian SUDIN "garment."

The doubled Akkadian consonant in *sad-din* explains Greek *-nd-*. The equivalence of both words is shown by a beautiful international phrase. Herodotus says that both Persian physicians (7.181.2) and Egyptian undertakers (2.86.6) wrap limbs with strips of "sindon of byssus," σινδόνοϛ βυσσίνηϛ. Mishna *Yoma* III.4 says that after the high priest is brought into the sanctuary "they spread a sindon of byssus (סִדִּין שֶׁל בּוּץ) between him and the people."¹⁰² The inscription of Esarhaddon at the Lycus River refers to Egyptian linen as *sad-din bu-u-si*.¹⁰³ Likewise Josephus *AJ* 3.153 has the high priest wear a double linen garment σινδόνοϛ βυσσίνηϛ¹⁰⁴

Byssus replaces ordinary linen. Thus Kilamuwa boasts (KAI 24.12-13) "And he who from his youth had not seen linen, in my days was clad in byssus":

ומי בל חז כתן למנערי ובימי כסי בץ

In Greek a tunic of byssus is attested for the sorceress of Theocritus 2.73:

ὠμάρτευν βύσσοιο καλὸν σύροισα χιτῶνα

"I followed wearing my elegant tunic of byssus." The *sindon* also wavers between sexuality and death. The יָרֵךְ is made and sold by the good wife (Prov 31,24, LXX σινδόνοϛ); it appears in a catalogue of feminine luxury (Isa 3,23). Antigone in her tomb hung herself with her veil, the "gauzy noose of her sindon" (Sophocles *Ant.* 1222) βρόχω μιτώδει σινδόνοϛ. The Jer. Talmud (*Kilayim* 32b4) says that "Rabbi was buried in a single sindon,"

בסדין אחד נקבר רבי

The body of an earlier Rabbi was also wrapped in a σινδόνι (Mark 15,46), where Vg *sindone* and Sinaitic Syriac סדינא.

Acroterion (Univ. Stellenbosch, South Africa) 29 (1984) 53-59.

102 So Iamblichus, *Vit. Pyth.* (17).72 (ed. Deubner 1937) uses "within the veil," ἐντὸς σινδόνοϛ, of an esoteric matter.

103 R. Borger, *Die Inschriften Asarhaddons*, 67.21, p. 101.

104 The same passage attests the problematical Greek transcriptions χεθομένη and χέθον.

6.8 Libanos, "frankincense"

In Greek the names of the spice and of Mount Lebanon partially fall together. The spice is both λίβανος and λιβανωτός; Hebrew לְבָנָה, Phoenician לבנת. The mountain is Λίβανος since Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 9.7.1; Hebrew לְבָנָה; Phoen. in בעל לבנת "Baal of Lebanon" (KAI 31, Cyprus). The Phoenician pronunciation with reduced vowel after the *b* is attested by Hittite *Niblani* and *Lablana*; Akkadian *Labnanu*,¹⁰⁵ Targumic לְבָנָה; modern Arabic لَبْنَان *Lubnān*.

Both the spice and the mountain surely have their name from לָבָן "white." The double name of the spice in Greek can be explained as alternative hearings of the Phoenician, perhaps **libnwt* or the like.¹⁰⁶ Since the spice-traders created a mystification about the source of the commodity, it was assumed in Greek that it came from the mountain of similar name, and the assumption helped the names to come out the same.

A "granule" of frankincense is μάννα λιβάνου Dioscorides 1.68.6, a word already in Hippocrates. It is surely from לֶמֶן Exod 16,31 "edible plant-droppings" or the like, given a folk-etymology Exod 16,15 הֲוֵא לֶמֶן "what is it?" The LXX followed by Joh 6,31 gave it the name μάννα already in Greek medical usage.

Miller¹⁰⁷ discusses the homeland of frankincense (*Boswellia carterii* Birdw.) in Arabia as well as the similar plant myrrh. The southern Arabian peninsula was well known to Theophrastus (*Hist. Plant.* 9.4.2), who says that libanos and myrrh (incorrectly adding cassia and cinnamon) grow around Σαβὰ καὶ Ἀδραμῦτα καὶ Κιτίβαινα καὶ Μίναια. Μαῖν (Minaia) and Qataban are unknown to the Hebrew Bible, but Gen 10,26-28 joins תְּחִינָה and אֲשֵׁר (Ḥadhramaut and Saba).¹⁰⁸

The poetry of the Red Sea commerce was visually illustrated in the great pageant of Ptolemy II:¹⁰⁹

κάμηλοι δ' αἱ μὲν ἔφερον λιβανωτοῦ μνᾶς τριακοσίας, συμύρης τριακοσίας, κρόκου καὶ κασσίας καὶ κινναμώμου καὶ ἴριδος καὶ τῶν λοιπῶν ἀρωμάτων διακοσίας.

105 Texts in RLA vi.641-2.

106 See W. W. Müller, "Zur Herkunft von λίβανος und λιβανωτός," *Glotta* 52 (1974) 53-59.

107 J. Innes Miller, *The spice trade of the Roman Empire, 29 B.C. to A.D. 641* (1969) 102-5.

108 Müller in ABD iii.85-86 discusses attestation of the Ḥadhramaut in Greek and Semitic.

109 Callixeinus of Rhodes, *Jacoby FGH* 627 F 2.32 = *Athenaeus* 5.201A.

"Some camels carried 300 minas of libanos, others 300 of myrrh, or 200 of saffron, cassia, cinnamon, iris or other spices." Isa 60,6 envisages a similar pageant for Jerusalem:

שָׁפַעַת גַּמְלִים תְּכַסֶּךָ בְּכָרֵי מִדְיָן וְעִיפָה
כָּלֵם מִשֶּׁבַּא יָבֹאוּ זָהָב וְלִבְנָה יִשָּׂאוּ

"A multitude of camels (LXX καμήλων) shall cover you, the young camels of Midian and Ephah; all those from Sheba (Σαβά) shall come, they shall bring gold and libanos (LXX χρυσίον καὶ λίβανον)."

Jerome in his commentary on Ez 27,7 notes that Vergil has an analogous poetry of exotic commerce:¹¹⁰

Describitur ergo quid unaquaque mittat prouincia, secundum illud Vergilianum:

India mittit ebur, molles sua tura Sabaei.
At Chalybes duri ferrum, uirosa que Pontus
castorea...

Byssus in Aegypto quam maxime nascitur.

"So there is described what each province exports, after that Vergilian phrase (*Georg.* 1.57-59): 'India sends forth ivory, the effeminate Sabaeans their frankincense; the tough Chalybes send iron, and Pontus pungent castor.' The greatest source of byssus is Egypt." Compare *Georg.* 2.116-117

...Sola India nigrum

fert ebum, solis est turea uirga Sabaeis

"Only India bears black ebony, only the Sabaeans have the branch of frankincense." And so when Jerome or an earlier translator came to Isa 60,6, the Vergilian rhetoric was lying to his hand: *Inundatio camelorum operiet te, dromedarii Madian et Ephā; omnes de Saba uenient aurum et thus deferentes.*

The descriptions of embalming in Herodotus, with their ample use of foreign nouns, must rest on Egyptian originals. The embalming of human beings (Herodotus 2.86, cf. the burial of Asa, II Chron 16,14) used cassia, myrrh and most spices except libanos. The embalming of "male cattle" (Herodotus 2.38-41) uses a large part of our vocabulary. The priests wear "newly washed linen vestments" and papyrus shoes. The marked animal is led to the βωμός where the priests light fire, pour wine over the victim and sacrifice. At embalming the body of the bull is filled with libanos and myrrh.

These themes are picked up in two texts which associate libanos with gold. Pindar in a fragmentary dirge¹¹¹ describes the abode of the dead:

110 Corp. Christ. 75.361; similarly on Jer 6,20 (Corp. Christ. 74.171) *Quod tura de Saba ueniant, nemo dubitat; unde et illud Vergilianum est (Aen. 1.416-417) centumque Sabaeo ture calent arae.*

111 Pindar frag. 114 Bowra², from two quotations by Plutarch.

φοινικορόδοις δ' ἐνὶ λειμώνεσσι προάστιον αὐτῶν
καὶ λιβάνῳ σκιαρὸν καὶ χρυσεῖς καρποῖς βεβριθός.
... ὄδμὰ δ' ἐρατὸν κατὰ χῶρον κίδναται
αἰεὶ θύα μειγνύντων πυρὶ τηλεφανεῖ παν-
τοῖα θεῶν ἐπὶ βωμοῖς.

"in meadows of purple roses is their dwelling, shaded with libanos and laden with golden fruits.... Over the lovely spot spreads the odor of those who mix every kind of spice with far-seen fire on the altars of the gods." When the Magi bring gold and libanos and myrrh, χρυσὸν καὶ λίβανον καὶ σμύρναν (Matt 2,11), it is a cult celebration both of death and of life, of this age and a better one.¹¹²

Beside other critiques of the sacrificial cult, Plato (*Laws* 8.847B) banishes libanos along with purple as exotic and superfluous. But Antiochus I of Commagene (OGIS 383.142) has "let [the officiant] make generous offerings of libanos and other scents on these *altars*," ἐπιθύσεις ἀφειδεῖς λιβανωτοῦ καὶ ἀρωμάτων ἐν βωμοῖς τούτοις ποιείσθω. In both cultures the burning of incense on an altar may be unconnected with animal sacrifice and honor a goddess as in Empedocles, 6.2 above. In a fragment of Sappho¹¹³ Aphrodite is called from Crete to a sacred grove of apple-trees where are "altars smoking with libanos," βῶμοι δὲ τεθυμιάμενοι λιβανώτω. The whole place is shadowed with roses (βρόδοισι). The goddess is asked to "pour gracefully in golden chalices wine that is mixed with our festivities." In the *Acts of Conon*¹¹⁴ the command to "take a little libanos and wine" (λάβε λίβανον βραχὺ καὶ οἶνον) mitigates the command "sacrifice" (θῦσον).

In a more urban setting than Sappho's, the temple of Aphrodite at Corinth had prostitutes for foreign sailors. One Xenophon dedicated a hundred girls, and Pindar¹¹⁵ celebrates his munificence. He addresses the "girls of many strangers, daughters of persuasion," and goes on

αἶ τε τᾶς χλωρᾶς λιβάνου ξανθὰ δάκρη
θυμῖατε, πόλλακι ματέρ' ἐρώτων
οὐρανίαν πτάμεναι
νόημα ποττὰν Ἀφροδίταν.

112 For the early Church, the resurrection of Jesus was symbolized by that of the Phoenix, whose tomb is of "libanos and myrrh" (I Clem 25,2, cf. Herodotus 2.73), and whose resting place is the "altar of the sun" (I Clem 25,4).

113 Sappho frag. 2, Lobel-Page PLF p. 5.

114 Acts of Conon 4, ed. H. Musurillo, Acts of the Christian Martyrs (1972) 188.

115 Pindar frag. 107 Bowra² (1947) = Athenaeus 13.573E. This is the Xenophon of Corinth for whom *Olymp.* 13.1 was written; Athenaeus says that he vowed to render *hetaerae* to Aphrodite if he won.

"who burn the tawny tears of yellow libanos, often flying in your mind to Aphrodite Ourania, mother of Erotes"; cf. Chapter 7 below.

The temple-incense of Ex 30,34-7 contained libanos; the prohibition of its private use implies that it was in fact used privately. Philo (*Spec. Leg.* I.274-6)¹¹⁶ says that the incense-altar was golden; very likely, for as we all know one extravagance warrants another. A golden incense altar at Babylon (Herodotus 1.183); a golden censer at Rev 8,3. A similar composition of incense-spices was surely used by the idolatrous priests "whom the kings of Judah had set to burn incense in the *bamot* (בָּמוֹת) at the cities of Judah" (II Reg 23,5). Among the *bamot* were those which Solomon had built for Sidonian Ashtoreth (אֲשֶׁת־רִתַּי, LXX τῆ Ἀστάρτη, Luther *Astarte*), II Reg 23,13.¹¹⁷ The "house of Ashtaroth" in Philistia (I Sam 31,10 בַּיִת עֲשָׁת־רִתַּי, LXX τὸ Ἀσταρτεῖον) is probably the "temple of Aphrodite Ourania" at Ascalon of Herodotus 1.105 (τῆς οὐρανίης Ἀφροδίτης τὸ ἱερόν). We have Phoenician dedications to עֲשֶׁת־רַתַּי (e.g. KAI 17 from Tyre).¹¹⁸ Thus the offering of libanos on a βωμός to Aphrodite can hardly be separated from the offering of libanos at a מִזְבֵּחַ to Ashtoreth.¹¹⁹ The transcription Ἀστάρτη appears first in an inscription of Delos:¹²⁰ "To Zeus Ourios [bringing fair winds] and Astarte of Palestine Aphrodite Urania, gods who hear prayer, Damon son of Demetrius, of Ascalon, saved from pirates, [fulfilled] his vow." See Achilles Tatius 1.1.2. Ἀφροδίτη "Foam-Born" could be a folk-etymology of אֲשֶׁת־רִתַּי but there seems no way to prove this conclusively.¹²¹

6.9 Further features of the sacrifice

6.9.1 The hide of the victim belongs to the priest

Burkert:¹²² "The skin of the sacrificial animal is generally sold to benefit the sanctuary, to purchase...new victims; in this way, the cult insures its own

116 LCL ed. vii.258.

117 The Jews in Egypt (Jer 44,17) vowed to burn incense to the Queen of Heaven (לְמִלְכַת) whose non-Hebrew vowels suggest a foreign dialect, perhaps Phoenician.

118 For the cult of Ashtoreth in the Phoenician world see DCP 46-48.

119 The Greeks used libanos at a new-month festival (νοσηνιαξ, Aristophanes *Vespae* 96); so did the Hebrews (Isa 1,13) so that the LXX had νοσηνιαξ ready to hand. A ritual text from Carthage (KAI 76) includes בֹּרֶךְ and לְבַנַּת קִשְׁרַת "incense of fine libanos"; this surely implies priests wearing linen vestments and offering incense as at Lev 6,2-8.

120 P. Roussel & M. Launey, *Inscriptions de Délos* v (1937) no. 2305, p. 188; after 166 BC.

121 But see S. Levin, "The Perfumed Goddess," *Bucknell Review* 24 (1978) 49-59.

122 Burkert, *Homo Necans* (Eng. ed.) p. 7.

continuance." (But the hide surely fetched less than the cost of a new animal!) Lev 7,8 "The hide (LXX δέρμα) of the burnt offering is the priest's":

עֹר הַעֲלֶה לַכֹּהֵן ...

Likewise in the Punic sacrificial tariff at Carthage (KAI 74.5) "And the hide shall be to the priests," [וכן הערת לכהנם]. (But at KAI 69 [Massilia] the sacrificer keeps the hide and pays the priest a flat fee.) At Pergamum¹²³ "the wardens who receive the hides turned over by the sacrificers and sell them shall give [the proceeds] to the temple administrator":

ιερονόμους παραλαμβάνοντας τὰ τιθέμενα δέρ[μ]ατα ὑπὸ τῶν θυόντων καὶ πωλοῦντας διδόναι νεωκόρω.

6.9.2 Usurpation of the meat by priests

I Sam 2,14 "All that the ['three-toothed' vs 13] fork (הַמְזֵלֶג, LXX κρέαγρα) brought up the priest would take for himself." An anonymous *Life of Aesop*¹²⁴: "Whenever one comes to offer sacrifice to the god, the Delphians stand around the altar with their knives; and when the priest(?) has slaughtered and flayed the victim and taken out the entrails, each of the bystanders cuts off whatever part he can and goes off with it, so that the sacrificer himself often goes home with nothing." See p. 323 below.

6.9.3 A sacrifice of three different animals

Gen 15,9 Yahweh asks of Abraham a heifer, she-goat and ram (where the two birds are differently treated). Xenophon *Anab.* 2.2.9 Hellenes & barbarians "slaughter a bull, boar and ram" (σφάξαντες ταῦρον καὶ κάπρον καὶ κριόν) into a shield and dip their weapons in the blood. Demosthenes 23.68, one who brings in a charge of murder must take a special oath, "standing on the 'pieces' of a boar, a ram and a bull, slaughtered by the correct persons on the correct days," σταῖς ἐπὶ τῶν τομιῶν κάπρον καὶ κριοῦ καὶ ταύρου, καὶ τούτων ἐσφαγμένων ὑφ' ὧν δεῖ καὶ ἐν αἷς ἡμέραις καθήκει. Burkert¹²⁵ shows a black-figured vase of 550 BC with a sacrificial procession including bull, sow and sheep. In Rome the sacrifice of a boar, sheep and bull has a compound name *suovetaurilia*: it is performed to purify the army after a census (Livy 1.44.2) and on numerous other occasions. But not to Jupiter:

123 SIG³ 982.23-24, iii.109 = Sokolowski, LSAM 12.

124 *P.Oxy.* 1800.33-46.

125 Burkert, *Homo Necans* (Eng. ed.), Plate I.

Capito¹²⁶ *itaque Ioui tauro, uerre, ariete immolari non licet* "one must not sacrifice a bull, boar and ram to Jupiter."

6.9.4 Covenanting parties pass between the halves of slaughtered victims

Thus a defeated army in Hittite texts between the slaughtered halves of various victims or of a puppy alone.¹²⁷ Jer 34,18 "And I shall make the men who broke my covenant...which they cut before me [to become as] the calf which they cut in two and passed between its pieces":

... הַעֲגֹל אֲשֶׁר כָּרְתוּ לְשֹׁנִים וַיַּעֲבְרוּ בֵּין כְּתָרָיו

(They had evidently sworn, "If we break the covenant, may we become as....") At Herodotus 7.39.3 the Persian army marches between the halves of the body of Pythius' son. At Plato *Leg.* 753D an elector must "pass between the halves of the victim," διὰ τομίῳν πορευόμενος. At Pausanias 3.20.9 Helen's suitors take an oath between the τομίῳν of a horse (Chapter 7 below).¹²⁸ In Livy 40.6.1-2 at the time of purifying (*lustrandi*) the Macedonian army, a dog is cut in two, and "between the victim so divided the armed forces are led," *inter hanc diuisam hostiam copiae armatae traducuntur*. So again with a dog the Boeotians as a purification, καθαρός.¹²⁹

6.9.5 Slaughter may be accompanied by a libation of wine to the High God

Besides the texts in Chapter 4.9 see Deut 32,38 "Where are their gods...who ate the fat of their sacrifices and drank the wine of their libations?"; Herodotus 2.38-39 Egyptian sacrifice uses "male cattle" (τοὺς δὲ βουῶς τοὺς ἔρσενας) led to an altar; after the priests pour out a libation of wine (οἶνον ... ἐπισπείσαντες) they slaughter (σφάζαντες) the victim.

126 Macrobius *Sat.* 3.10.3, 7 on *Aeneid* 3.21.

127 O. Masson, "A propos d'un rituel hittite pour la lustration d'une armée; le rite de purification par le passage entre les deux parties d'une victime," *RHR* 137 (1950) 5-25.

128 See Apollodorus 3.13.7; Dictys Cretensis 1.15; Diodorus 1.65.6; Quintus Curtius 10.9.12.

129 Plutarch *Quaest. Rom.* 111 = *Mor.* 290D. See further Weinfeld "Loyalty Oath" 400-401; Casabona 224; Elias Bickerman, "'Couper une alliance'," *Studies in Jewish and Christian History; Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums* 9; 2 vols (1976) i.1-32; J. Henninger, "Was bedeutet die rituelle Teilung eines Tieres in zwei Hälften? Zur Deutung von Gen. 15,9ff," *Biblica* 34 (1953) 344-353.

6.9.6 A heifer for the sacrifice must never have been yoked

An Homeric formula for an offering to Athena (*Iliad* 10.292-4 = *Odyssey* 3.382-4):

σοὶ δ' αὖ ἐγὼ ρέξω βοῦν ἦνιν εὐρυμέτωπον
ἀδμήτην, ἣν οὐ πω ὑπὸ ζυγὸν ἤγαγεν ἀνὴρ·
τὴν τοι ἐγὼ ρέξω χρυσοῦν κέρασιν περιχεύας.

"And I will offer you a yearling(?) heifer, broad-browed, unbroke, which no man has yet brought under the yoke; I will plate its horns with gold and offer it to you." Deut 21,3 (cf. I Sam 6,7) in the same way doubles the qualifications of the red heifer:

עָגֵלַת בָּקָר אֲשֶׁר לֹא-עָבַד בָּהּ אֲשֶׁר לֹא-מְשַׁכָּה בָּעֵל

"a heifer of the herd with which no work has been done, which has never pulled under the yoke." At Num 19,2 its flawlessness is doubled:

פָּרָה אֲדָמָה תְּמִימָה אֲשֶׁר אֵין-בָּהּ מוּם אֲשֶׁר לֹא-עָלָה עָלֶיהָ עֵל

"a red heifer, perfect, in which there is no blemish, on which no yoke has come," LXX δάμαλιν πυρρὰν ἄμωμον, ἥτις οὐκ ἔχει ἐν αὐτῇ μῶμον καὶ ἣ οὐκ ἐβλήθη ἐπ' αὐτὴν ζυγός.¹³⁰ So Vergil (*Georg.* 4.540, 551; cf. *Aeneid* 6.38) specifies for a sacrifice *intacta... ceruice iuuenas* "heifers with necks untouched [by the yoke]." Macrobius (*Sat.* 3.5.5) gives the technical term *iniuges* for such, *id est quae numquam domitae aut iugo subditae sunt* "that is, those which have never been tamed or brought under the yoke," with the same doubling as in Homer.¹³¹

6.10 Human sacrifice

The logic of sacrifice, and the grounds for its critique, reach a climax when a god tells a father to sacrifice his child. The child pathetically speaks its ignorance, and is replaced at the last moment by an animal. Advocates of moral progress believe that this represents the replacement of human sacrifice by animal; but this is not absolutely certain. Isaac in his ignorance says (Gen 22,7): "Here is the fire and wood; but where is the lamb for the burnt offering (לְעֹלָה לְעֹלָה)?" Agamemnon is about to sacrifice Iphigeneia when in one version (Apollodorus *Epit.* 3.22)¹³² Artemis carries her off and "substitutes

130 For *mōmos* see Chapt. 7 below.

131 Saul Lieberman, *Hellenism in Jewish Palestine*, 156-157; see the whole section 144-163 for pagan infiltrations into Rabbinic theory and practice.

132 Cf. Proclus' summary of the *Cypria*, in Allen's OCT ed. of *Homeri Opera* ed. 2 v.104

a deer for her at the altar," ἔλαφον ἀντ' αὐτῆς παραστήσασα τῷ βωμῷ. In Euripides' *Iphigeneia at Aulis* 676 the girl says:

στήσομεν ἄρ' ἀμφὶ βωμόν, ὦ πάτερ, χορούς;

"Father, shall we perform dances around the altar?" Lucretius (1.90), for whom the story condemns all religion, has Iphigeneia observe that "the acolytes are hiding the knife," *ferrum celare ministros*; Isaac notes the fire and wood but not the knife although the narrator specifically mentions it; is it hidden?

We began (6.2 above) with the critique of the sacrificial cult in Empedocles. Already Samuel asks (I Sam 15,22) "Does Yahweh have as much delight in burnt offerings and sacrifices (LXX ὀλοκαυτώματα καὶ θυσίαι) as¹³³ in obeying the voice of Yahweh?":

הֲפֶחֶה לַיהוָה בְּעֹלוֹת וּבְחֵיִם כְּשֶׁמֶץ בְּקֹל יְהוָה

And so more absolutely the prophets. Amos 5,25 (quoted Act 7,42) "Did you bring me sacrifices and offerings in the wilderness?"; Isa 1,11 "What to me is the multitude of your sacrifices? ...I do not delight...in the blood of oxen (LXX αἶμα ταύρων)"; Jer 7,22 "I did not speak to your fathers...concerning burnt offerings and sacrifice (עֹלֹת וְזֶבַח); cf. Hos 6,6; Ps 50,13. For Plato (*Laws* 782C) it is a distant ideal hope that men "should not defile the altars of the gods with blood," οὐδὲ τοὺς τῶν θεῶν βωμοὺς αἵματι μιáινειν. Heb 10,4 (citing Ps 40,7) "It is impossible that the blood of bulls and goats (αἶμα ταύρων καὶ τραγῶν) should take away sin." And so Latin philosophers—in texts known only from quotation by Christians. Varro¹³⁴ "true gods neither desire nor demand sacrifice," *dii ueri neque desiderant [sacrificia] neque deposcunt*. Seneca¹³⁵ "God is not to be worshipped with sacrifices and much blood," *deum...non immolationibus nec sanguine multo colendum*.

Isaiah 66,3 (6.2 above) regards animal sacrifice as equivalent to murder. Empedocles, having in mind "the myth concerning the transmigration of the soul," (Origen *con. Cels.* 5.49)¹³⁶ τὸν περὶ ψυχῆς μετενσωματουμένης μῦθον, writes:

μορφήν δ' ἀλλάξαντα πατὴρ φίλον υἱὸν αἰείρας
σφάζει ἐπευχόμενος μέγα νήπιος ...

"A father lifting up his own son who has changed his form slaughters him with prayer, in great folly."¹³⁷

line 19.

133 The Hebrew variants *k*, *b*, *l*, *m* all emphasize that the rejection of sacrifice is relative, not absolute.

134 Cited by Arnobius *adv. nat.* 7.1.

135 Cited by Lactantius *div. inst.* 6.25.3.

136 Ed. Koetschau GCS p. 54.

137 Empedocles frag. 137 Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ i.367.

A response to these critiques is the affirmation of a willing human sacrifice. Girard¹³⁸ contrasts Sophocles' *Oedipus Rex* and the Gospels. In both a unanimous movement of crowd and authorities expels the protagonist from society. Girard assumes that originally Oedipus was an innocent victim, and that the elaborate revelation of his parricide and incest reflects the viewpoint of persecutors, for whom the scapegoat must deserve his fate. He regards the Gospels as the first version of the old story to be told from the viewpoint of the victim; and emphasizes the quotation of Ps 35,19 at Joh 15,25 "they hated me without a cause."

Isa 53,7 adapts the proverb (p. 200 above) לְיִזְבֵּחַ כַּבֵּשׂ לְחֶזֶק "He was led as a lamb to the slaughter" (LXX ὡς πρόβατον ἐπὶ σφαγὴν ἤχθη, cited Act 8,32). Compare Heb 10,12 "He offered for all time a single sacrifice for sins," μίαν ὑπὲρ ἁμαρτιῶν προσενέγκας θυσίαν εἰς τὸ διηνεκές and so frequently in the New Testament. Thus I Kor 5,7 "Christ our passover has been sacrificed for us," τὸ πάσχα ἡμῶν ἐτύθη Χριστός. The Christian notion is somehow anticipated by the Greek pretense that the bull acquiesces in its own slaughter. Euripides in the last genuine lines of the *Iphigeneia in Aulis* suggests the same. Thus at 1397 "I give my body for Hellas," δίδωμι σῶμα τοῦμόν Ἑλλάδι, cf. Luk 22,19 τὸ σῶμά μου [τὸ ὑπὲρ ὑμῶν διδόμενον].¹³⁹ *Iph. Aul.* 1483-5 "so that if necessary by my blood and sacrifice I may wipe off the curse," ὡς ἐμοῖσιν, εἰ χρεῶν, / αἵμασι θύμασι / θέσφατ' ἐξάλειψω. Cf. Rev 5,9 of the slain lamb "you who were sacrificed and bought [many] for God by your blood" ἐσφάγης καὶ ἠγόρασας τῷ θεῷ ἐν τῷ αἵματί σου; and for "wiping out," Kol 2,14 "wiping out the ordinance against us," ἐξάλειψας τὸ καθ' ἡμῶν χειρόγραφον.

138 R. Girard, *Le Bouc Emissaire* (1982), chapters 3 and 9.

139 The words in [...] are omitted by MS "D" and the Old Latin version.

Excursus D: "Lord of the flies"

The story of Ahaziah presumes that Philistines had a god "Baalzebub the god of Ekron" (II Reg 1,2 etc):

בַּעַל זְבוּב אֱלֹהֵי עֶקְרוֹן

The LXX each time has τῆ βααλ μυῖαν θεὸν Ἀκκαρων treating "Baal" as feminine (as if replaced by בִּשְׁת "shame") and זְבוּב as if in apposition; Vg *Bēelzebub deum Accaron*. (Here Aquila¹ correctly had βααλζεβουβ but Symmachus Βεελζεβούλ.) There is no reason to doubt that the author of Kings understood "Lord of flies" as pejorative. Nor that "Baalzebub" was approximately the Philistine form, for all their attested gods have Canaanite names; we know nothing about any gods they may have brought with them. Certainly the Philistines understood the original as honorary; either the original was different, or they took "Averter of flies" as a praiseworthy attribute.

Divinities or heroes who avert flies from the sacrifice are widely attested in the ancient world. In a sense the God of the Hebrews was himself an "avertter of flies," for among the ten wonders done in the sanctuary (*Avoth* V.5) the third was that "no fly was seen in the slaughterhouse,"

וְלֹא נִרְאָה זְבוּב בְּבֵית הַמִּטְבַּחִים

Pausanias 5.14.1 says that the men of Elis at Olympia, following the example of Heracles, sacrifice to "Zeus Averter of flies," τῷ Ἀπομυίῳ Διί (cf. Aelian *nat. anim.* 5.17, 11.8); so in Arcadia (Paus. 8.26.7) to the hero Μύαγρον "Flycatcher." Clement Alex. *Protrept.* 2.33 says "The men of Elis sacrifice to Zeus Apomyios, and the Romans to Heracles Apomyios," Ἀπομυίῳ Διὶ θύουσιν Ἑλλῆσι, Ῥωμαῖοι δὲ Ἀπομυίῳ Ἡρακλεῖ. The second clause may be in part Clement's interpretation. But Pliny 10.79 verifies it to this extent: *Romae in aedem Herculis in foro Boario nec muscae nec canes intrant*, "at Rome neither flies nor dogs [evidently by the power of the divinity] enter the temple of Hercules in the Forum Boarium."

The "prince of the demons" in the Synoptic Gospels (Matt 12,24 etc.) in Greek is always either Βεεζεβούλ (B always, ⲛ except at Mark 3,22, hardly any others) or Βεελζεβούλ (all other witnesses, including the Bodmer papyrus P⁷⁵ in Luk 11,15 etc.). The absence of *l* in Vaticanus and Sinaiticus may

1 Ed. F. Field, *Origenis hexaplorum quae supersunt*, 2 vols. (1875/1964), i.651.

reflect an original weakened pronunciation. The Greek *never* has "Beelzebub." Earlier witnesses of the Old Latin have *Beelzebul*, and so Tertullian *adv. Marc.* 4.26.12² *Belzebulem* accus. The Vulgate always, and some witnesses to the Old Latin, have *Beelzebub*. The Old Syriac wherever extant and the Peshitto uniformly have בעלזבוב in agreement with the Vulgate. "Beelzebub" is not due to Jerome, who hardly revised the Gospels, but to an earlier agreement of Latin and Syriac.

Still Jerome states (*Comm. in Ev. Matt.* on 10,25)³ *Beelzebub idolum est Accaron, quod uocatur in Regum uolumine idolum muscae. Beel ipse est bel siue baal, zebub autem musca dicitur*, "Beelzebub is the idol of Ekron, which in the book of Kings is called the idol of a fly. *Beel* is 'Bel' or 'Baal' and *zebub* means 'fly'." Again in his *Liber Interpret. Hebr. Nom.*⁴ *Beelzebub habens muscas aut uir muscarum. In fine ergo nominis B littera legenda est, non L. Musca enim zebub uocatur*. "Beelzebub means 'having flies' or 'man of flies.' So at the end of the name the letter B is to be read, not L; for 'fly' is *zebub*."

Jerome seemingly takes it for granted that the figure of the Gospels is identical with that of Kings, ignores the reading of all our Greek MSS (and presumably of those known to him), and follows the later Latin MSS. It is not clear where the Gospels found "Beelzebul." Are they correct in attributing knowledge of it to the "scribes" (Mark 3,22 etc.)? Were the scribes in contact with a tradition (of which no vestiges remain to us...) going back to Ugaritic *zbl bʿl rʿš*, perhaps "Prince Baal of the earth"⁵? Or is it Jesus' own coinage "Lord of the mansion," merely translated at Matt 10:25 "If they have called the master of the house (οἰκοδεσπότην, Syriac מרֵא דבֵּיתָא Beelzebub...")?

Was the temple of Heracles in the Forum Boarium (the "Cattle Market") itself a Phoenician foundation? This was proposed by van Berchem⁶ and has been much discussed. At many Mediterranean sites Greco-Roman Heracles can be shown an heir of Phoenician Melqart. A Roman-Carthaginian treaty of perhaps 306 BC (Polybius 3.24.12-13) presumes that Romans are traders at Carthage and vice versa: "In the part of Sicily that the Carthaginians control [a Roman] may do and sell whatever (πάντα καὶ ποιείτω καὶ πωλείτω) is permitted to a [Carthaginian] citizen; and a Carthaginian in Rome may do

2 Corp. Christ. ser. lat. i p. 617.

3 Migne PL 26.65.

4 Corp. Christ. ser. lat. 72.142, strangely placed under the Gospel of John.

5 See the discussion by T. J. Lewis in ABD i.638-640. The Ugaritic appears at Gordon UT 49.(I).14 = KTU i.6.IV.16; translated at *ANET*³ 140a.

6 D. van Berchem, "Hercule Melqart à l'Ara Maxima," *Rendiconti della Pontificia Accademia Romana di Archeologia*, 3rd series, 32 (1959/60) 61-68.

likewise (καὶ ὁ Καρχηδόνιος ποιείτω ἐν Ῥώμῃ)." Corinne Bonnet in her study of Melqart⁷ finds no Semitic influence on Roman Hercules; but notes (p. 302) with surprise that no advocate of the theory has appealed to the human sacrifice of a Greek man and woman and a Gallic man and woman buried alive (supposedly at the instruction of the Greek Sibylline Books) in the Forum Boarium in 216 BC (Livy 22.57.6). The parallel roles of Heracles, Zeus, Yahweh and the god of Ekron as "Lord of the flies" give some additional support to the connection; and at least illustrate a pan-Mediterranean theme.

7 Corinne Bonnet, *Melqart*, 294-303, with full bibliography of the question.

Chapter 7: The Shifting Roles of Women¹

Marxism steered classical scholars in the former Socialist bloc, and by reaction scholars in the West, to the study of ancient slavery.² Feminism has created a substantial literature on the status and roles of women, in both classical antiquity and the Biblical world. (But as in other realms, classical and Biblical feminist studies hardly intersect.) Ideological battles over ancient slavery acted as proxy for battles over modern class structure. Ideological battles over the status of women in Israel and the early Church are even more intense, because in the Church the Bible still often stands as an authoritative model for contemporary social structures.

Marxism and feminism each brought an embarrassing truth to light. The ancient societies which humanists and Christians had seen as the matrix of a new individualism and freedom—the Hellenic Polis and monarchic Israel—are precisely those where restrictions on slaves and women (in spite of local variations among Greek cities) are clearest. In part the notable restrictions reflect better documentation; in part they are real. Gould³ points out that, since we have no texts or monuments from classical Athens made by women,⁴ we cannot "look at the world as it was seen by women"; we can only deal with "the dominant, male model of society." Roger Just⁵ as an anthropologist adds that the "male view of society still retains its significance, for social reality is a social construct and what people think themselves and others to be remains a primary object of social enquiry." No doubt Athens, Just goes on, had a different "social reality constructed by women"; but it is irrecoverable. Modern historians can only record "an important, but 'partial' in every sense

-
- 1 Extensive revision of an article with many misprints, "The Role of Women and the Treaty in the Ancient World," *BibZ* 25 (1981) 1-28. Prof. Eve Levin of the University of Ohio read an intermediate draft and made many helpful suggestions.
 - 2 See my discussion in "Men of the Land and the God of Justice in Greece and Israel," *ZAW* 95 (1983) 376-402.
 - 3 John Gould, "Law, Custom and Myth: Aspects of the Social Position of Women in Classical Athens," *JHS* 100 (1980) 38-59, p. 39.
 - 4 Apart from descriptions of their embroidery, e.g. in the robe carried up to the Athenian acropolis (Plato, *Euth.* 6C) with representations of struggles between the gods.
 - 5 Roger Just, *Women in Athenian Law and Life* (1989) 3-4: the work on this subject that I have found most helpful.

of the word, truth about women: not what they were, but what men saw them to be. This is to limit the study of Athenian women and to reorient its findings; but it is no means to invalidate that study."

Exactly the same can be said about the status of women in Israel. But we may add: only through the eyes of the same male writers—and, in the Greek case, artists—can we discern the status of children, slaves (until Epictetus), sailors, or for that matter kings and rulers. In the historic breakthrough by which Israel and Hellas achieved a new self-awareness, that awareness is recorded by a small part only of the society. How could it have been otherwise? When a Hebrew or Greek book has come down to us, its author's understanding of society (whatever his limitations) must have been shared by some at least of those he was writing about, and writing *for*: otherwise it would not be in our hands at all. It is the place where its society's self-understanding is concentrated.

In this impressionistic survey, I prefix to the situation of classical Israel and Hellas what they document about an archaic state of their societies; and add as coda the situation after their loss of independence to new empires. (7.1) In early Israel and Hellas, women had more power and freedom of action; but not such a freedom as would generate a permanent record of itself. (7.2) In the classical independent states, which did generate such a record, the necessities (military and political) of maintaining independence reduced women's freedom of action, and sharply divided them into two categories: insider and outsider, housewife and harlot. (7.3) When independence was lost to new empires (eventually to Rome), general freedom of action was reduced, and dependence was subsumed in a universal pecking-order of debt. The restrictions on women (and on slaves) were reduced, those remaining seemed by contrast less burdensome; and women's roles became more of a continuum.

7.1 Women's freedom of action in the archaic period

7.1.1 Women at work

An anthropologist⁶ in a small village of southern France found that "both men and women in this peasant society actually work to maintain the idea of

6 S. C. Rogers, "Female Forms of Power and the Myth of Male Dominance: A Model of Female/Male Interaction in Peasant Society," *American Ethnologist* 2 (1975) 727-756, cf. p. 729 [not seen by me]; cited by Carol Meyers, *Rediscovering Eve: Ancient Israelite Women in Context* (1988) 42.

male dominance while not subscribing to it as a reality. Women's power is culturally muted but functionally active." Meyers sees the figure of Eve in such a light in the hard frontier conditions of the Palestinian highlands, requiring full energies of both husband and wife. A longer text plainly reflecting women's freedom of action in a peasant society is the book of Ruth. We see only a little of the 18-year-old wife whom Hesiod recommends for the 30-year-old farmer (*Opera* 695-8): but even the misogynist poet (*Theog.* 600) admits (*Opera* 702-3) "For a man wins nothing better than a good wife—and nothing worse than a bad one..."

οὐ μὲν γάρ τι γυναικὸς ἀνὴρ λήϊζεν ἄμεινον
τῆς ἀγαθῆς, τῆς δ' αὖτε κακῆς οὐ ρίγιον ἄλλο ...

For a lively Greek picture of women in village society we must go back again to Palestine, to the first two chapters of Luke.

In other archaic texts, no doubt idealized, a young girl has an idyllic freedom of action. Nausicaa has gone out with her handmaids to do the laundry, but feels confident to deal with the naked stranger thrown up by the sea and daydream (*Odyssey* 6.244-5) "If only some such husband as this should be called for me, one living here—and if this one were pleased to stay here":

αἱ γὰρ ἐμοὶ τοιόσδε πόσις κεκλημένος εἶη
ἐνθάδε ναϊετάων, καὶ οἱ ἄδοι αὐτόθι μίμνειν

Rachel goes to the well with her father's sheep. When Jacob realizes that she is his cousin he rolls the stone away from the well; and she lets herself be kissed by him (Gen 29,11) before she in turn learns who he is.

7.1.2 Matrilineal and matriarchal societies

Through Bachofen and Engels the doctrine entered the Marxist schema of historical development that early society was matrilineal. What evidence there is comes from archaic societies on the fringe of the Greek world—as it happens, unattested in Israel. The best evidence for the Amazons defeated by Priam (*Iliad* 3.189) and Bellerophon (6.186) are the graves of "Sauromatae" (Herodotus 4.110) from the fourth century BC containing skeletons of women and horses, with spears.⁷ Herodotus 1.173.4-5 says that the Lycians "name

7 Mary R. Lefkowitz, *Women in Greek Myth*, 1986, 22-23, citing T. David, "La position de la femme en Asie Centrale," *Dialogues d'Histoire Ancienne* 2 (1976) 129-162. She notes that the great river of Brazil was called the Amazon because the Spaniards saw native women there fighting beside their men. Herodotus does transmit (4.110) an apparently genuine Indo-European name for such given by Scythians, οἰόπρατα "manslayers," ἀνδροκτόνοι; it should perhaps be "rulers over men," compare Latin

themselves from their mothers" (καλέουσι ἀπὸ τῶν μητέρων ἑωυτούς) and not their fathers; so that if a free woman (ἄσπῆ) lives with a slave, her children are counted freeborn (γέννηται); but if a free man (ἄστός) has a foreign wife or concubine (παλλακίην), his children are without status (ἄτιμα). We have Lycian inscriptions, but their witness is unclear: Bryce thinks the Lycians may in fact have been matrilineal, but Carruba that Herodotus' informant misinterpreted Lycian grammar.⁸ Glaucus the Lycian (*Iliad* 6.196-211) traces his ancestry along the male line; possibly Herodotus is just setting up one more "opposite of the standard practice of the Greeks."⁹ But certainly Epyaxa the wife of king Syennesis of nearby Cilicia took the initiative in negotiating with the Persian pretender Cyrus, and perhaps slept with him (Xenophon *Anab.* 1.2.12).

Etruscan funeral texts name both father and mother: thus¹⁰ *Partunus Vel Velthurus Satlnalc Ramthas clan avils XXIX lupu* "Vel Partunu, son of Velthur and of Ramtha Satlnei, died at 28 years." Theopompus¹¹ thought that the Etruscans had women in common, and that the women "did not dine with their own husbands, but with whatever men happened to be present," ἀλλὰ παρ' οἷς ἂν τύχῳσι τῶν παρόντων. But Warren,¹² showing by tomb-paintings from Tarquinia that Etruscan [unlike Greek] husbands and wives dined together, thinks that Theopompus found this incredible and misinterpreted. In fact the data are simply not there to determine the degree of sexual equality in Lycia or Etruria.

A true matriarchal society would consider as brothers those with the same mother. When the inherited Indo-European word for *brother* (cf. Latin *frater*) became φράτηρ "fellow clansman" in Greek, Homer substituted κασίγνητος (origin unknown) and less common ἀδελφεός. The latter corresponds exactly to Sanskrit *ságarbhya* "from the same womb." Homer in fact uses it for sons of the same mother: Zeus, Poseidon and Hades, sons of Rhea (*Iliad* 15.187); Hector and Alexander (Paris) (*Iliad* 7.2 etc.) sons of Hecuba (Apollodorus

uir and δεσπότης "master." Ephorus (FGH 70 F 160) has that sense, the Sauromatai are γυναικοκρατούμενοι "ruled by women."

- 8 T. R. Bryce, "Two Terms of Relationship in the Lycian inscriptions," *JNES* 37 (1978) 217-225; O. Carruba, "Alle Origini del Matriarcato," *Istituto Lombardo, Rendiconti, Classe di Lettere e Scienze Morali e Storiche* 124 (1990) 239-246. P. Vidal-Naquet, "Esclavage et Gynécocratie dans la tradition, le mythe, l'utopie," pp. 63-80 of *Recherches sur les structures sociales dans l'antiquité classique [Colloque Caen 1969]* (1970).
- 9 Mary R. Lefkowitz, *Women in Greek Myth* (1986) 20-21, citing other studies of the Lycian texts.
- 10 M. Pallottino, *Testimonia Linguae Etruscae* (1954) 128; discussed by Pallottino, *Etruscologia*, 6th Italian ed. (1968) 402.
- 11 Jacoby FGH 115 F 204 = Athenaeus 12.517D.
- 12 Larissa Bonfante Warren, "The Women of Etruria," *Arethusa* 6 (1973) 91-102.

3.12.5); Agamemnon and Menelaus (*Iliad* 2.586 etc.) sons of Aerope (Apollodorus 3.2.2). But the Sanskrit lexicon¹³ defines it as "a brother of whole blood; one by the same father and mother"; and since Hellas and India are on the whole patrilineal, ἀδελφεός is more likely to presuppose polygamy (as in Priam's Troy) to denote sons of one woman out of the many in the palace.

An Athenian legend shows that somebody wished the city to have been matriarchal. Varro¹⁴ says that in the beginning king Cecrops consulted an assembly including women, whether Minerva (Athena) or Neptune (Poseidon) should be the city's tutelary deity. The women, outnumbering the men by one, voted for Minerva; Neptune sent a flood, and the men imposed three penalties on the women: "that they should not again have the vote, that no child should take its mother's name, and that nobody should call them Athenian women,"

ut nulla ulterius ferrent suffragia, ut nullus nascentium maternum nomen acciperet, ut ne quis eas Athenaeas uocaret.

One people—the Pelasgo-Philistines (p. 170 above)—was believed by both Greeks and Hebrews to be matriarchal and was feared for it. Apollodorus 1.9.17 says that at Lemnos, where the original population was "Pelasgian" (Herodotus 6.138), the women refused to honor Aphrodite, who in retribution made them all stink. So their husbands took Thracian mistresses; the Lemnian women, dishonored, killed their menfolk. Jason found them ruled by a queen Hypsipyle, who came out to meet him "in her father's armor," ἐνὶ τεύχεσι πατρός (Apol. Rhod. 1.638). The Hebrews gave Philistine women a bad name. Samson had three in all: the one of Timnah who extracted his riddle (Jud 14); the harlot of Gaza (16,1); and Delilah who betrayed him (16,19).

The stories between them suggest a sensational etymology.¹⁵ From Herodotus 6.138.2 Πελασγίδων γυναικῶν "Pelasgian women" we can restore the singular *γυνή Πελασγίς "Pelasgian woman." From the masculine "Philistine" I Sam 17,8 יתִּשְׁבֵּי we can restore the feminine *יתִּשְׁבֵּי. The woman of Gaza was a harlot, הַזֵּזָה, so Hebrew for "Philistine harlot" was *יתִּשְׁבֵּי הַזֵּזָה. Yahuda,¹⁶ among much that is fanciful, compared the two nouns; further, the whole phrases are comparable. A foreign word for "woman" would naturally designate a harlot. The Indo-European word came twice into English as *queen* and *quean* "harlot"; Byron (*Don Juan* 6.96) describes the mistress of a harem as

13 Monier-Williams 1125. Hesychius A 1061 (1.39 ed. Latte) understands that ἀδελφεός means "born from the same womb," since he is aware of δελφός "womb."

14 Varro, quoted by Augustine *de civ. Dei* 18.9.

15 Brown-Levin, *Ethnic Paradigm* 100.

16 Joseph Yahuda, *Hebrew is Greek* (1982) 46, 425.

This modern Amazon and Queen of queans.

The frequent form נָּזַח treated in the lexica as the participle of a root נָּזַח could in fact be the original form and the verb denominative.¹⁷

Another international tale involves the death of the men in mass marriages, dealt with at length by Astour.¹⁸ When Dinah has been taken by Shechem the "Hivite" (יִּזְרְחָדְנָאֵר Gen 34,2), and his father Hamor asks for Jacob's daughters to be married to his men, Jacob insists that they must be circumcised; on the third day Simeon and Levi kill them. Apollodorus 2.1.4 (cf. Aeschylus *Sup.* 317-324) says that Egyptian Belus was father of Danaus and Aegyptus. Aegyptus has fifty sons; Danaus has fifty daughters, who for fear of the sons emigrated to Argos. The sons of Aegyptus follow them; Danaus makes a feast and gives his daughters daggers, they kill all of the fifty but one. There is an imperfect phonetic parallel between the descendants of Danaus, the $\Delta\alpha\nu\alpha\omicron\iota$ (*Iliad* 1.42), and the Danites, דָּנִיֵּל Jud 13,2; as between Dinah דִּנְחָה (Gen 34,1), Danae the mother of Perseus ($\Delta\alpha\nu\acute{\alpha}\eta$ Herodotus 2.91.2) and the Danaids of Aeschylus, $\Delta\alpha\nu\acute{\alpha}\iota\delta\epsilon\varsigma$.¹⁹ In Chapter 1 we noted the parallel between $\text{חִי\text{ווי}}$ *hiwwiy* and "Achaeans," Ἀχαιοί . Perhaps underlying is a migration of "Danaoi" from Canaan or Egypt to Hellas, carrying with it the story of the mass marriage fatal to the husbands.

7.1.3 Matrilocal succession

Succession to kingship may stay with the mother as "matrilocal": it goes to whoever marries the king's daughter. (However the king also may be happy with this arrangement, for it allows him to select his heir.) Menelaus became king of Sparta, though not immediately, by having been chosen as Helen's husband (Apollodorus 2.11.2). When Oedipus solves the Sphinx's riddle (3.5.8), becoming king of Thebes and marrying Jocasta are parts of a single

-
- 17 C. D. Buck (The Greek Dialects: Grammar, Selected Inscriptions, Glossary; 3rd ed. [1965] 58-59) thinks that gamma became a spirant ζ in Cypriote. But the supposed sound ζa of one sign in the syllabic texts corresponding to normal ga is only conjectural, see O. Masson, *Les inscriptions chypriotes syllabiques* (1983); and $\gamma\upsilon\nu\acute{\alpha}$ comes out *ku-na* as it should (e.g. text no. 11, p. 107).
- 18 Michael C. Astour, *Hellenosemitica: An ethnic and cultural study in West Semitic Impact on Mycenaean Greece* (1965) 1-112. Alternatively the Danaoi are thought "river-men" from the widespread river-toponym *dan*; see my "The *Templum* and the *Saeculum*..." ZAW 98 (1986) 415-433, p. 421 note 34.
- 19 Astour further compares the דָּנָנִי of the Azitawadd inscription (KAI 26.1.2 etc.), and *Da-nu-na* of Amarna 151.52. Any such connection is denied by H. M. Niemann, *Die Daniten: Studien zur Geschichte eines altisraelitischen Stammes*; FRLANT 135 (1985) 288-291.

package. If Antinous could kill Telemachus and marry Penelope he would become king of Ithaca (*Odyssey* 22.52-53). So it must mean that David is in line for the kingship that Saul twice offers him a daughter (I Sam 18,17ff). Cant 3,4 (= 8,2) assumes a matrilocal society: "I held him, and would not let him go until I had brought him into my mother's house, and into the chamber of her that conceived me." Although no kingship is involved, Samson visits each Philistine woman only occasionally at the mother's house (Jud 15,1 etc.).

A "prenuptial ordeal"²⁰ is laid on a suitor where a woman's hand is kingship: thus the hundred foreskins that Saul asks from David for Michal (I Sam 18,25).²¹ After the king of Lycia fails to kill Bellerophon according to the secret message he brought from Proetus, the king retroactively treats Bellerophon's feats (like killing the Chimaera) as such an ordeal, *Iliad* 6.192-3, giving him his daughter and half the kingdom. In particular the ordeal may be a *riddle* containing more than meets the eye.

Did Oedipus in fact answer the Sphinx's riddle correctly? Just on the surface a better response would have been "Oedipus himself!":²² more than other men going on all fours at birth because of his swollen feet; more than others walking on two feet at maturity because a king; more than others using a cane or third foot in old age because blind. The riddle was not tailored for every comer, but for Oedipus alone. If the Sphinx was truly prophetic she should have seen that his answer only led the more surely to his destruction; then her suicide itself was just a ruse to lure him on.

But we may discern yet another layer underneath. The name Οἰδίπους is supposed to mean "Swellfoot" from his pierced ankles when he was exposed at birth; but they did not bother him as a man. If we did not know that story, from the comic adjective *πεοίδης*²³ we would take it as "with swollen penis"; its fluctuating declension (LSJ) suggests that both nouns *πούς* "foot" and *πέος* "penis" are at work. The preserved riddle (*Anth. Pal.* 14.64), which says nothing about three stages of life, has *καὶ τρίπων· ἀλλάσσει δὲ φύην μόνον* "...and three-footed; for it alone changes its shape" of all crea-

20 Sarah B. Pomeroy, *Goddesses, Whores, Wives, and Slaves: Women in Classical Antiquity* (1975) 19.

21 Even better attested when no kingship but only the girl is involved. Thus with Caleb and Othniel (Jud 1,12). So Odysseus in one of his fictitious autobiographies (*Odyssey* 14.211-2); Othryoneus is promised Cassandra if he drives back the Achaeans (*Iliad* 13.365-7); Atalanta and her suitors.

22 F. J. H. Letters, *The Life and Work of Sophocles* (1953) 224, quoting De Quincey.

23 Kock iii.591 Adespota no. 1111 (no context).

tures.²⁴ Then the third foot can also be seen as the penis of the one man potent enough to take his mother to wife.

Samson's riddle-contest was also once a nuptial ordeal, since when he loses it, the woman is given to his best man (Jud 14,20). The "companions" are really suitors: רְעִים (Jud 14,11) is used of "lovers" at Jer 3,1 etc. (Vg *amatoribus*); only so does the rhyming verse Jud 14,18 make sense, "If you had not plowed with my heifer, you would not have found out my riddle":

לֹיְלֵא תִרְשָׁתֶם בְּעֹגְלֹתַי לֹא מִצְאֶתֶם חֵידָתִי

If the verse riddles preceded their prose context, no more than the companions could we guess "honey in the lion's body." Their supposed answer (Jud 14,18),

מִה־מְתוֹק מִדְּבַשׁ וּמִה עֹז מֵאֲרִי

"What is sweeter than honey? What is stronger than a lion?," in itself is not an answer but a double riddle, two questions with a single answer, namely "Love." Both comparisons are proverbial (Exc. E below). What then about the original riddle? What is its answer? Jud 14,14:

מִהָאֵכֶל יָצָא מֵאֲכָל וּמִעֵז יָצָא מְתוֹק

"Out of the eater came food, and out of the strong came sweetness." It can be illustrated by folktale, where the vagina "eats up" the penis: "Out of the vagina came secretions, out of the penis came semen." What could only have been discovered by "plowing with my heifer" was that the Philistine woman had brought in some non-Canaanite sexual novelty: intercourse which was oral or in which the woman also became aroused. Thus riddles may be double or triple, with a hidden sexual orientation underneath the ostensible one.²⁵

7.1.4 The foreign princess

When a woman remains matrilocally in the city of her parents, her power needs no guarantee.²⁶ When she acts as agent of their house in her husband's city, an agreement or treaty (Chapter 8 below) guaranteeing her status is

-
- 24 In the U.S. Army the mass inspection for venereal disease was commonly called "short-arm drill."
- 25 If we bring our adult understanding to nursery riddles, what do we think of as being "As round as an apple, As deep as a cup, And all the king's horses Cannot pull it up"? How do we explain "Two bodies have I, Though both joined in one; The stiller I stand, The faster I run"? (Iona & Peter Opie, *The Oxford Dictionary of Nursery Rhymes* [1951].) "A well," "an hourglass" are answers to satisfy children; the true difficulty of a riddle is how to dispel the elemental image it raises and come up with an alternative solution proper for mixed company.
- 26 Saul Levin notes that Megacles' daughter complained effectively when Pisistratus mistreated her sexually (Herodotus 1.61.1-2).

required. In the Hittite vassal treaties the final paragraph may enforce the vassal's fidelity to his wife, "the daughter of the Great King of the Hatti land."²⁷ Powerful rulers might marry out many daughters born from their harem to bind subordinates to them; the woman served as the overlord's ambassador-in-residence. In yet a third sense she is an honest woman "sent to *lie* abroad" for the good of her country. Jezebel's privileged status in Jerusalem, holding Ahab's seal (I Reg 21,8) and promoting Sidonian religion, is naturally explained if Ethbaal has some guaranteed lordship over Israel. (But also she was a stronger personality than Ahab.) So in the agreement between Laban and Jacob: Laban says, "If you ill-treat my daughters, or if you take wives beside my daughters, although no man is with us, remember that Elohim is witness between you and me" (Gen 31,50). Here God takes the place of the Great King as enforcer of the treaty, as generally treaty language is adapted for the covenant between Israel and its God (Chap. 8).

Helen, in accounts other than Homer's, had so many suitors not just because of her beauty, but also because of the power of Sparta which passed through her. Tyndareus, in the oath he imposed on the suitors (Apollodorus 3.10.9), followed the Greek treaties (Chapter 8.2.4) with their pledges to "assist" (βοηθεῖν): "[Odysseus] told [Tyndareus] to exact an oath from all the suitors that they would assist [the chosen bridegroom]," πάντας εἶπεν ἐξορκίσει τοὺς μνηστῆρας βοηθήσειν.²⁸ After Helen's abduction her status shifts from matrilocal to foreign princess. A new compact and oath are required. And so at *Iliad* 3.253-7 (cf. 3.69-75) Alexander (Paris) and Menelaus are to fight with long swords "over the woman":

τῷ δέ κε νικήσαντι γυνή καὶ κτήμαθ' ἔποιτο·

οἱ δ' ἄλλοι φιλότητα καὶ ὄρκια πιστὰ ταμόντες ...

"the woman and her property are to fall into the hands of the winner; all the others, cutting friendship and faithful oaths" are to inhabit Troy, Argos and Achaia as before (cf. Chapter 8.1.5 below).

Weinfeld²⁹ points out how treaty-formulas parallel marriage contracts; in fact, they are the original marriage contracts. The foreign princess, with her status as representing the Great King's overlordship, creates a new role available to other women carrying the prestige of their houses. To define the treaty as "friendship" (φιλότητα) marks its role as regulating sexual intercourse, denoted by the same word; after Paris is defeated by Menelaus he says to Helen (*Iliad* 3.441) "Come, let us go to bed and turn to making love":

27 ANET³ 206b: Suppiluliuma and Kurtiwaza.

28 Thucydides 1.9.1 misreads the situation when he opposes Agamemnon's power to the oaths of the suitors as causes of the war.

29 M. Weinfeld, "Covenant Terminology in the Ancient Near East and its influence on the West," JAOS 93 (1973) 190-199, p. 196.

ἀλλ' ἄγε δὴ φιλότῃσι τραπέιομεν εὐνηθέντε

So at Deut 7,9 (Chapt. 8.1.9) the "treaty" between God and Israel has the double title "covenant and kindness," הַבְּרִית וְהַחֶסֶד. "Kindness" may have a sexual connotation; at Jer 2,2 Yahweh says to Jerusalem, "I remember the devotion ("kindness") of your youth, the love of your betrothals":

זָכַרְתִּי לָךְ חֶסֶד נְעוּרֶיךָ אֲהַבַת כְּלוּלֹתֶיךָ

So חסם is used of Yahweh's favor: Ex 33,19 etc.: "I will be gracious to whom I will be gracious, and show compassion on whom I show compassion":

וְהִנַּנְתִּי אֶת-אֲשֶׁר אֶחֱזַן וְרַחֲמַתִּי אֶת-אֲשֶׁר אֲרַחֵם

Its physical sense (cf. רָחַם "womb") is at Isa 49,15 "Can a woman forget her suckling child, that she should have no love for the son of her womb?":

הֲתִשְׁכַּח אִשָּׁה עוּלָהּ מֵרַחֵם בֶּן-בִּטְנָהּ

The two words come together in a context both of covenant and of marriage at Hos 2,20-21: Yahweh will "cut a covenant" (בְּרִית ... וְכָרַתִּי) with the creation and goes on "I will betroth you to me...in love and compassion":

וְאֲרֻשְׁתִּיךָ לִי ... וּבְחֶסֶד וּבְרַחֲמִים

In Athens, restrictions on women are partly compensated for in drama. In tragedy feminine strength is projected onto the past; in comedy onto the Utopian future. Two of Aristophanes' plays deal with the bases of male power: landowning with voting rights, military service. In the *Ecclesiazusae* the women take over the assembly; in the *Lysistrata* they take over the military, and will come back to their men only under a treaty (*Lys.* 1185):

ὄρκους δ' ἕκει καὶ πίστιν ἀλλήλοισι δότε

"There give oaths and good faith to each other." The women, whose rights were originally defined by the vassal treaty, in the poet's vision take the treaty power back into their own hands.

7.1.5 The concubine

When the Great King (Hittite or other) disappears, his former vassals continue the honorific practice of taking foreign women, but now in the lesser status of concubine (Chapter 2.1). The concubine retains, though not in her own name, the political role of the matrilocal princess as the key to the succession. She is the perquisite of the former king, like his throne and sceptre, and whoever claims her claims his office. The Levite divides the body of his concubine and sends it to the twelve tribes (Jud 19,29) as if she were the divided animal (I Sam 11,7). No foreign man could achieve social status in a state; David's foreign mercenaries like the Cretans, הַכְּרִתִּי (II Sam 8,18; 20,23) are under a native Israelite, Benaiah. It is through foreign women, particularly the concubine, that foreign customs and words enter a society.

In her baggage, like the foreign princess, she brings fine linens, spices and ointments, jewels, cosmetics; in her new home she calls each item by its name, and reinforces with her handmaidens the linguistic borrowings mediated in a different context by traders.

A formula of praise for a woman seems an international word. ἀμύμων "faultless" is often said of men in Homer and occasionally of a woman, thus *Iliad* 14.444 νύμφη ... νηΐς ἀμύμων "the faultless naiad nymph." Rarer ἄμωμος applies only to women; thus Hesiod *Theog.* 259 among the daughters of Nereus is "Euarne lovely in shape and without blemish of form":

Εὐάρνη τε φυὴν ἐρατὴ καὶ εἶδος ἄμωμος

Both are related to μῶμος "blame": *Odyssey* 2.86 ἐθέλοις δέ κε μῶμον ἀνάψαι "you would like to attach blame to us." Hebrew מום "flaw" is used in identical contexts. Thus of a man, Absalom, II Sam 14,25 "there was no flaw in him," לֹא־הָיָה בּוֹ מוֹם; the LXX translates with the Greek word of nearly identical sound and meaning, οὐκ ἦν ἐν αὐτῷ μῶμος. And so of the woman of Cant 4,7 "there is no flaw in you," וְמוֹם אֵינְךָ, LXX μῶμος οὐκ ἔστιν ἐν σοί. Only as applied to women, with their greater mobility, can the word's travelling be explained.

The Hebrew word is also used in the sacrificial cult: Lev 22,20 etc. מוֹם כֹּל אֲשֶׁר־בוֹ מוֹם "whatever has a flaw in it," where the LXX again πάντα ὅσα ἂν ἔχη μῶμον ἐν αὐτῷ. (Thus as applied to women these words would denote the absence of any merely physical defect.) Hence Gordon³⁰ thinks it was carried by the cult. But neither μῶμος nor its derivatives are attested as a sacrificial term before the LXX: the μωμοσκόπους "inspectors of blemishes" of Philo³¹ is surely derived from the LXX as is μῶμοι II Pet 2,13. The Hebrew variant reading מוֹם at Dan 1,4; Job 31,7 may be only a late folk-etymology connecting it with מְאוֹמָה "anything." The form of *-mūm-* seems more Semitic than Indo-European, but the original source is not easy to locate.

7.2 Housewife and harlot in the autonomous city-state

7.2.1 The split in women's roles

In the first period the roles of women are all of a piece: moving between households, between societies, they have elements both of foreignness and

30 Cyrus Gordon, *Homer and Bible* (1967) sect. 36.

31 Philo, *de agric.* 130 (LCL ed. iii.174).

of domesticity. Helen at home, abroad and home again remains the same person. The exotic foreigner may be praiseworthy like the queen of Sheba, or a despot like Jezebel. But under the independent city-state the domestic and alien traits are firmly divided between two categories, in principle always separated: housewife and harlot. Most remarkably, in both societies the new dichotomy is reflected in *allegories* of the choice between Virtue and Vice. Prodicus (Xenophon *Mem.* 2.1.21-28) describes Heracles' choice between two women, modest and immodest. In Prov 7-9 right and wrong conduct for men are allegorized as two women, Wisdom (הַכְּמָה) and her opposite, the foreigner (7,5 נְכַרְיָהָ, LXX ἀλλοτρίας) and harlot (7,10 זוֹנָה, LXX εἶδος ἔχουσα πορνικόν).

When the allegories are demythologized, a man's choice of women in the actual social world is described in exactly the same terms. Above (p. 69) we cited Ps.-Demosthenes 59.122 "We have *hetaerae* for pleasure, concubines for the daily care of our body, wives to beget legitimate children and to have a faithful guardian of our domestic affairs":

τὰς μὲν γὰρ ἑταίρας ἡδονῆς ἕνεκ' ἔχομεν, τὰς δὲ παλλακὰς τῆς καθ' ἡμέραν θεραπείας τοῦ σώματος, τὰς δὲ γυναῖκας τοῦ παιδοποιεῖσθαι γνησίων καὶ τῶν ἔνδον φύλακα πιστὴν ἔχειν.

The anonymous orator³² emphasizes the differences because he is out to get Neaera and Stephanus for palming off their alleged daughter as an eligible bride; still he must be appealing to perceptions generally held by his (male) audience. (Menander [*Dyskolos* 842 and elsewhere] uses the loaded phrase "for the *plowing* of legitimate children," παίδων ἐπ' ἀρότῳ γνησίων, which may come from Attic law.) The gulf is between wives and the other two. The *hetaera* differs from the concubine by being independent and often available to other men (at a price); both are non-Athenians and defined solely in their sexual capacity. Neaera in the same oration ([Demosthenes] 59.49) is characterized as originally a slave (δούλη), twice sold (ἐπράθη), "making her living by her body as an *hetaera*" (ἡργάζετο τῷ σώματι ὡς ἑταίρα οὖσα), and now an alien (ξένη). See Prov 23,27 with blatant imagery, "For a harlot is a deep pit, a foreign woman a narrow well":

כִּי־שׂוֹחָה צִמְקָה זּוֹנָה וּבָאָר צָרָה נְכַרְיָהָ

Wisdom demythologized is the "woman of worth," אִשְׁת־יָחִיל of the acrostic poem Prov 31,10-31. The good woman is carefully regulated, Gen 3,16 "Your desire shall be for your husband, and he will rule over you":

וְאֵל־אִשְׁךָ תִּשְׁקָתָּ וְהוּא יִמְשָׁל־בְּךָ

32 Perhaps Apollodorus son of Pasion, who appears in the suit. See the commentary by Christopher Carey, Apollodoros Against Neaira: [Demosthenes] 59 (1992).

Athenian wives were under many restrictions. Women were not the only restricted group in Hellas; they were invisible to Rostovtzeff, who, as Pomeroy³³ points out, noticed "only two unenfranchised classes in Greece: the resident aliens and the slaves." Aristotle (*Pol.* 1.5.8 = 1260a10) says that by nature (φύσει) there are several categories of rulers and ruled:

ἄλλον γὰρ τρόπον τὸ ἐλεύθερον τοῦ δούλου ἄρχει καὶ τὸ ἄρρεν τοῦ θήλεος καὶ ἀνὴρ παιδός.

"For in a different way [in each case] the free rules the slave, the male the female, and the man the child." The differences (he goes on) are because "the slave lacks the deliberative part (τὸ βουλευτικόν) [of the soul] altogether; the female has it, but inconclusively (ἄκυρον);³⁴ the child has it, but in an undeveloped form (ἀτελής)."³⁵ The Hebrew Bible is in general agreement, though not so programmatically. Mal 1,6 "Son honors father and slave his master";

בְּן יִכְבֵּד אָבִיךָ וְעַבְדְּךָ אֶת־יְיָ

The Church after Paul in its *Haustafel* of subordination settled on precisely Aristotle's three categories. "Wives, be subject³⁶ to your own husbands as to the Lord," αἱ γυναῖκες τοῖς ἰδίοις ἀνδράσιν [ὑποτάσσεσθε] ὡς τῷ κυρίῳ (Eph 5,22);³⁷ "Children, obey your parents," τὰ τέκνα, ὑπακούετε τοῖς γονεῦσιν ὑμῶν (Eph 6,1); "Slaves, obey your masters after the flesh," οἱ δούλοι, ὑπακούετε τοῖς κατὰ σάρκα κυρίοις (Eph 6,5).

For Aristotle, everybody outside Hellas is on one level. At *Pol.* 1.1.5 (= 1252b5) he states that "among the barbarians the female and the slave have the same rank," ἐν δὲ τοῖς βαρβάροις τὸ θῆλυ καὶ τὸ δούλον τὴν αὐτὴν ἔχει τάξιν; and in fact, since barbarians lack any natural ruling class (τὸ φύσει ἄρχον [by virtue of its deliberative or rational powers]), "barbarian [men evidently included] and slave are the same by nature," ὡς ταῦτό φύσει βάρβαρον καὶ δούλον ὄν. So he approves the words which Euripides (*Iph. Aul.* 1400-1) puts in the mouth of Iphigeneia:

βαρβάρων δ' Ἕλληνας ἄρχειν εἰκός, ἀλλ' οὐ βαρβάρους,
μητρὸν, Ἑλλήνων· τὸ μὲν γὰρ δούλον, οἱ δ' ἐλεύθεροι.

33 Sarah B. Pomeroy, *Goddesses, Whores, Wives, and Slaves: Women in Classical Antiquity* (1975) xii.

34 This is why (Aristotle implies) she needs a κύριος in law.

35 On this passage see Just p. 188. Raphael Sealey, *Woman and Law in Classical Greece* (1990) I, on the basis of the word order in passages like Herodotus 8.40.1 "to evacuate children and wives from Attica" (παῖδάς τε καὶ γυναῖκας) suggests that "Greek men valued their children for their own sake and valued their wives for supplying them with children"; but this goes beyond the evidence.

36 The verb is lacking in P^{to} "B," but in any case is implied from the preceding verse.

37 Note the echo of Attic legal language which would imply "as to your lawful *kyrios*."

"It is proper for Hellenes to rule over barbarians, but not, mother, barbarians over Hellenes; for one party is slave, but the others free." However there has been a change in the New Testament, for Paul himself rejects any subordination for precisely this variant set of three categories: Gal 3,28 οὐκ ἔνι Ἰουδαίος οὐδὲ Ἕλληνα, οὐκ ἔνι δοῦλος οὐδὲ ἐλεύθερος, οὐκ ἔνι ἄρσεν καὶ θήλυ, "In [Christ] there is neither Jew nor Hellene, slave or free, male or female."³⁸

Thus for Aristotle, as man rules over woman in the family, so the state rules over non-citizens and "barbarians"; for the state is a family writ large. "The primary partnership made out of several households for more than daily needs is the village" (*Pol.* 1.1.7 = 1252b16) ἡ δ' ἐκ πλειόνων οἰκιῶν κοινωνία πρώτη χρήσεως ἔνεκεν μὴ ἐφημέρου κόμῃ. And in turn (*Pol.* 1.1.8 = 1252b29) "the perfect partnership made out of several villages is the Polis," ἡ δ' ἐκ πλειόνων κωμῶν κοινωνία τέλειος πόλις; it exists by nature, and hence (*Pol.* 1.1.9 = 1253a3) "man is by nature a political animal," ὁ ἄνθρωπος φύσει πολιτικὸν ζῷον. At another place (*Pol.* 3.5.14 = 1281a1) he puts clans (γένη) practicing intermarriage between the family and the village. Likewise Jos 7,14 puts two levels between the whole state and the household: the tribe (בְּרָכָה, LXX φυλή, Vg *tribus*) broken down into clans (תַּיְבָּרִים, LXX δῆμοι, *cognationes*), and clans broken down into households (בְּיָתֵיכֶם, LXX οἶκος, *domus*).

7.2.2 The status of men

In contrast I outline the status of men in the autonomous city-state. It was (from a long-term viewpoint) an ephemeral social form threatened on land or sea by neighbors of its size, and by bigger but distant empires. Its only defence was a militia, and in some cases a navy, composed of the entire free male adult population. Aristotle (*Pol.* 4.10.10 = 1297b16ff):³⁹ "The first form of constitution (πολιτεία) among the Hellenes after kingships was drawn from those who were actually fighting, originally from the cavalry; ...but as the Poleis grew and those in heavy armor (τῶν ἐν τοῖς ὅπλοις) got more power, more men came to have a share in the *politeia*." Under Draco (*Ath. Pol.* 4.2) "the state [citizenship?] had been entrusted to those who provided themselves with arms," ἀπεδέδοτο μὲν ἡ πολιτεία τοῖς ὅπλα

38 Similar, but lacking "male/female," are Rom 10,12 and I Kor 12,13; inferior MSS of Kol 3,11 add "male and female" from Gal 3,28.

39 Aristotle wrongly thought that the dominance of small cavalry forces in the earliest period was due to lack of tactical science (rather than to lack of iron weapons), but states the facts correctly.

παρεχομένοις.⁴⁰ So in Num 1,3 etc. Israel consists of males twenty years and over (up to some unspecified age) "who go forth to the army," אֲנָשֵׁי־לְבָבָא נְרָצָא. Deut 20,5-8 in principle exempts those who have built a house, planted a vineyard, betrothed a wife; and the "fearful and fainthearted." Tribal males in Israel, though not voting, had a monopoly on the privileges of law, cult and economy; they are close to the Greek idea of a citizen.

A poem of Simonides⁴¹ quoted by Plato (*Protag.* 339A-346D) begins: "It is hard for a man to become truly good, foursquare (τετράγωνον) in his hands and feet and mind, constructed without fault." The poet probably had in mind a parallel between man and the ideal square city, as Plato sees a parallel between man and the state. Plato (*Rep.* 427E) uses the poem to ask about the relation among the four virtues Wisdom, Courage, Temperance, Justice.⁴² Wisdom (σοφία) is the virtue of the statesman (his "guardian," *Rep.* 428D), and courage (ἀνδρεία) of the soldier (430A). Plato is unhappy when the same person is "trader, fighter and legislator"; justice exists when each "does his own business" (*Rep.* 434). The situation he criticizes was that of the Polis as correctly seen by Simonides: the men entitled to vote and run for office are precisely those who own real estate, and therefore can afford to buy armor and fight in the militia. Plato wants to move from democracy towards a smaller highly trained standing army and an aristocratic ruling class. As "a member of the ruling and landed class in a slave-owning society, his passion for unity, therefore, ...took the reactionary form of a demand for subordination."⁴³ The Woods⁴⁴ summarize a long discussion:

For all its philosophical complexity, Plato's is at bottom the ethic of an urbane leisure class whose fundamental moral distinctions correspond to the contrast between aristocratic style and common vulgarity.

But beyond Plato's critique of the existing order, his quadrangle of virtues opens a window on the reality of power in the Polis; each free adult male, as claimed, mirrors the whole state. Of the two remaining virtues, temperance (σωφροσύνη) is "the agreement of the naturally superior and inferior which of them should rule" (*Rep.* 432A); against his better judgement he (*Rep.*

40 Draco's supposed constitution is thought by many scholars a piece of oligarchic propaganda from the late fifth century BC which imposed on Aristotle; but the general principle stated here was widespread.

41 Simonides frag. 37, Page PMG 282.

42 At *Protag.* 349B Plato adds a fifth, Holiness.

43 Alban Dewes Winspear, *The Genesis of Plato's Thought*, 2nd ed. (1956) 214. But Saul Levin reminds me that Plato was disgusted with what he saw as rule by the mob and stayed out of Athenian politics.

44 Ellen M. Wood & Neal Wood, *Class Ideology and Ancient Political Theory: Socrates, Plato, and Aristotle in Social Context* (1978) 155.

book 5) elevates some women to the rank of guardians, but only reinforces the rule that *some* majority should be ruled rather than rule. Justice (δικαιοσύνη) finally he declares to consist in "having and doing what is one's own and belongs to one" (*Rep.* 433E); it does not directly challenge the current distribution of landed property. Thus the ideal Greek man is courageous as a soldier; wise in his participation in the political process; prudent in his rule over his natural inferiors (including women); and just in maintaining the reciprocal rights (including his own) of landowners.

The basis for participation in Israel also is hereditary possession of landed property, with its accompanying obligation of military duty. The king, though not absolute, was an idealized model; and so when Judaism came under Platonic influence, the four virtues were ascribed to Solomon (*Sap Sol* 8,7): "[Wisdom] teaches temperance and prudence, justice and courage," σωφροσύνην γὰρ καὶ φρόνησιν διδάσκει, δικαιοσύνην καὶ ἀνδρείαν.

In both societies the democratization of power was regressive for women. The privileged female roles created by matrilocal houses and the vassal treaty were lost along with the institutions. Subordination of women was inevitable since the new autonomous city-state rested on two types of power, of which one, landowning, was on the whole (with some variations, as in Sparta) a male monopoly; and the other, the citizen militia, was necessarily in the conditions of ancient warfare a male monopoly.

7.2.3 Status of the housewife

The upper-class woman supervises servants or slaves in a domestic mode of production: storing and cooking food, stockpiling and repairing equipment, spinning wool. Women in Homer and vase-painting are "white-armed," λευκώλενος; the indoor organizational role of the housewife of Prov 31⁴⁵ is parallel to the instruction which Ischomachus gives his fifteen-year-old wife. She grasps her job so quickly that Socrates exclaims, "By Hera, you testify that your wife has a masculine intelligence," ἀνδρικήν γε ἐπιδεικνύεις τὴν διάνοιαν τῆς γυναικός (*Xenophon, Econ.* 10.1). The housewife "puts her hands to the distaff (רִישֵׁי) and her palms hold the spindle (גִּלְגָּל, LXX ἄτρακτον, Vg *fusum*)" (Prov 31,19). Andromache drops the shuttle (κερκίς) only when she hears the outcry that announces Hector's death (*Iliad* 22.448). Calypso is constantly plying hers (*Odyssey* 5.62). Even an unusual queen, Pheretima of Cyrene, is refused the armies she asked for and given a "golden spindle and distaff" (ἄτρακτον χρύσειον καὶ ἡλακάτην, Herodotus 4.162.5).

45 But further she "considers a field and buys it" (Prov 31,16); in this case she acts as steward of the estate.

Peace is apparently when a woman can walk along the highway spinning (KAI 26.II.6). A Paeonian girl could simultaneously carry water on her head, draw a horse with a bridle on her arm, and turn the spindle, στρέφουσα τὸν ἄτρακτον (Herodotus 5.12.4). It is treated as a release when Dionysus frees women from looms and shuttles (Euripides, *Bacchae* 118).

In Hellas "the ceaseless weaving acquires a magical quality, as though the women were designing the fate of men";⁴⁶ the lives of human beings are spun on the "spindle of Necessity" (Ἀνάγκης ἄτρακτον Plato *Rep.* 616C). Odysseus "will suffer whatever Fate and the weighty Spinners wove in his thread at birth, when his mother bore him" (*Odyssey* 7.197-8):

πείσεται ἄσσα οἱ αἴσα κατὰ Κλωθῆς τε βαρεῖαι
 γεινομένῳ νήσαντο λίνῳ, ὅτε μιν τέκε μήτηρ.

Here we have remnants of a cosmology modelled on a female spinning divinity of Germanic style.⁴⁷

The manageress of such a domestic textile factory is under many restrictions, particularly on her ownership of real estate. Athens had complex legislation to keep land with the original family. Although a woman never owned her property "in the sense of being able to dispose of it, it could never be alienated from her at all, or from her paternal family except through her children; so far as we can see it was always able to return to her family unless she had adult descendants."⁴⁸ A girl with no brother (ἐπίκληρος) had an absolute right to inherit her father's property, but must marry her next of kin on the male side to keep it in the family. Just summarizes:⁴⁹

the only women who benefited by the archon's oversight [namely, widows claiming to be pregnant and *epikleroi*] were those through whom a male heir could be supplied for an *oikos* [household] which was temporarily bereft. The concern of the law in this respect was to ensure the correct transmission of property and, importantly, of religious rights and duties via direct *male* descent...

So in Israel⁵⁰ if a man dies without a son, his property passes to his daughter, and only if he is childless to his brother or nearest male kinsman (Num 27,8-11); the daughter is under a special obligation to marry within the tribe (Num 36,3-9). But if such a man has been living beside his brother on ancestral property, his brother must take his widow as wife, and the first son she bears is reckoned the offspring of the original brother (the levirate, Deut 25,5-10). As in the vassal treaties, the woman acts as representative of

46 Pomeroy, *Goddesses, Whores...* 30.

47 Levin wonders if rather the classical theme of a spinning deity has influenced Germanic mythology.

48 W. K. Lacey, *The Family in Classical Greece* (1968) 139.

49 Just, *Women in Athenian Law and Life*, 32.

50 R. de Vaux, *Ancient Israel*, 2 vols. (1965) i.166.

her own family in her husband's house; the difference is that her family, being close at hand, does not need to delegate any personal powers to her.

Sealey⁵¹ almost in parenthesis explains why a woman's property had to be managed for her by her *kyrios*. Not because women were perpetual children:

Judicial legislation among the Greeks had originated from self-help. Public authority intervened to interrupt the pursuer's act of self-help and entrust the issue to a court for decision. Fossilized relics of self-help persisted, for example in the designation of the plaintiff as "the pursuer" [ὁ διώκων]. People who have recourse to self-help usually bear arms. Greek women, including Athenian women, were excluded from armed and organized fighting. That exclusion may explain why an Athenian woman could not protect property by self-help or later by litigation...

7.2.4 The heightening of sexuality; the harlot and her cosmetics

Hebrew locates human likeness to the divine in bisexuality, Gen 1,27 "And God created mankind in his own image...male and female created he them":

וַיִּבְרָא אֱלֹהִים אֶת־הָאָדָם בְּצַלְמוֹ ... זָכָר וּנְקֵבָה בָּרָא אֹתָם

Aristophanes in the myth of Plato's *Symposium* (189-193) sees each of us as only a half-person, and our couplings as efforts to restore an original unity. Exotic trade-goods brought by merchants and foreign women—jewels, diaphanous linen garments, perfumes—produced a heightened sexuality and the new genre of the epithalamium (2.2). When this sexuality collided with military-based male domination, in Athens male erotic sentiment was partially transferred to boys or other men, especially in the military and in what amounted to the reserve training of the gymnasium. More broadly Just observes:⁵²

Homosexual relationships were the sole form of sexual relationship which could, outside the bonds of legitimate marriage, be entered into by partners who were both of the same social status. Furthermore, they were the sole form of sexual relationship in which an element of mutual admiration and respect might be considered fundamental...

Although for Homer the love of Achilles and Patroclus hardly has sexual overtones, Phaedrus in Plato's *Symposium* (179E) takes it for granted that one must be lover (Patroclus) and one beloved (Achilles).⁵³ The love of

51 Raphael Sealey, *Women and Law in Classical Greece* (1990) 152.

52 Just, *Women in Athenian Law and Life*, 147.

53 The relations between Achilles and Patroclus have been much discussed; see B. Effe, "Der griechische Liebesroman und die Homoerotik," *Philologus* 131 (1987) 95-108, p. 103.

David and Jonathan comes closer, II Sam 1,26, "Your love to me was more wonderful than the love of women":

נִפְלְאָתָה אֶהְבֵּתְךָ לִי מֵאַהֲבַת נְשִׁים

The Sacred Band of Three Hundred at Thebes was supposed to consist of pairs of lovers, and Plutarch says of it (*Pelopidas* 18) that "a military corps composed by erotic love is indissoluble and unbreakable," τὸ δ' ἐξ ἐρωτικῆς φιλίας συνηρμοσμένον στίφος ἀδιάλυτον εἶναι καὶ ἄρρηκτον.

The need to keep real estate in the family imposed a double standard, so that respectable women in general had to be ever more secluded and circumspect in view of the sexual license in Attic comedy and the Song of Songs—and in Athens the ever-present representations of the phallus.⁵⁴ The new sexuality demanded non-respectable female roles. For a while Athens maintained the marginally respectable role of the educated *hetaera* like Pericles' Milesian mistress Aspasia, who "brought up girls to be *hetaerae*," παιδίσκας ἐταρούσας τρέφουσαν (Plutarch, *Pericles* 24.3, who strongly disapproves of the whole enterprise).⁵⁵ But more and more, female roles were polarized into the alternatives of housewife and harlot. Herodotus (1.2-4) initially proposes to motivate foreign wars through the mutual capture of princesses: Phoenicians took Io to Egypt; Hellenes carried Europa to Crete and Medea from Colchis; Paris took Helen to Troy—violent counterparts of the vassal-treaty arrangement. Aristophanes (*Acharn.* 524-8) in parody motivates the Peloponnesian War by the mutual seizing of harlots, πόρναι. Drunken Athenians had stolen from Megara a harlot Simaetha; the Megarians in turn had stolen two harlots from the whorehouse managed by Aspasia. The harlot's name comes from πέρνημι "sell," she is a purchased woman.

The identity of prostitution in Israel and Hellas, and of the fashions for which it set the tone, is illustrated in shared cosmetics, perceived no less than in later centuries as exotic: thus Pope, *Rape of the Lock* 1.133-4:

This casket India's glowing gems unlocks,
And all Arabia breathes from yonder box.

The Roman matron's *ornatrix* (Ovid *Ars Am.* 3.239) painted her out of the various jars "which contained her daytime face,"⁵⁶ white, red and black. For her face did not sleep with her, *nec tecum facies dormiat* (Martial 9.37.6).

54 See Eva C. Keuls, *The Reign of the Phallus: Sexual Politics in Ancient Athens*; 2nd ed. (1993).

55 If Pericles really said, as Thucydides (2.45.2) quotes him, that "great credit is also due the woman of whom there is least talk among men whether in praise or blame," μεγάλη ἡ δόξα καὶ ἥς ἂν ἐπ' ἐλάχιστον ἀρετῆς πέρι ἢ νόγου ἐν τοῖς ἄρσεσι κλέος ἦ, his words do not reflect very favorably on Aspasia.

56 J. Carcopino, *Daily Life in Ancient Rome* (1960) 169.

Our Hebrew sources only mention the darkening of the eyes with mascara. Jezebel in her last hour "set off her eyes with stibium," II Reg 9,30

הַיָּנִיָּה בַּפִּיךָ מִשְׁתִּיבָה

LXX ἐστιμίσατο τοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς αὐτῆς, Vg *depinxit oculos suos stibio*. στίμι is an Egyptian word⁵⁷ and appears in various spellings, e.g. in Antiphanes;⁵⁸ Strabo 16.4.17 of the Trogodyte women στιβίζονται.

Hebrew הַיָּנִיָּה suggests Greek φῦκος, which in addition to "seaweed" (*Iliad* 9.7) meant some kind of cosmetic. At Theocritus 15.16, Praxinoa sends her husband to the grocery store:

πάππα, νίτρον καὶ φῦκος ἀπὸ σκανᾶς ἀγοράσδειν
"Daddy, get some soap and *phykos* from the shop." Both words have Hebrew counterparts which appear in Jeremiah's theme of Israel as harlot. At Jer 2,22 "though you wash yourself with soap":

כִּי אַמְרֵי כֶסֶף בְּנִתְרָה

LXX εὐὰν ἀποπλύνη ἐν νίτρον, Vg *si laueris te nitro*. Again at Jer 4,30 (cf Ez 23,40) "that you enlarge your eyes with *puwk*,"

כִּי יִקְרַעְךָ עֵינֶיךָ בַּפִּיךָ

LXX εὐὰν ἐγχαρίση στίβι τοὺς ὀφθαλμούς σου, Vg *cum... pinxeris stibio oculos tuos*. Nitron in the form λίτρον is the principal element in embalming (Herodotus 2.86.4-6) and is also from Egyptian.⁵⁹

LSJ identifies φῦκος with the word meaning "seaweed" and implausibly explains it as orchil dye from lichens used as rouge. At *Anth. Pal.* 9.415 (Antiphilus) the two senses are felt different enough to create a pun: the speaker is alternatively a ship and a prostitute:

ἔστιν ἑταίρειος μὲν ἔμοι στόλος, εἰσὶ δὲ λεπτὰ
κάρπασα, καὶ λεπτὸν φῦκος ἐπὶ σανίδων.

"My rig befits a lady of pleasure; my *carpasa* (both "sails" and "dress") are light, there is light *phykos* on my timbers." (For *karpasos* see Appendix.) Frisk derives φῦκος in both senses from the Hebrew and thinks that the cosmetic is primary.

What kind of cosmetic were φῦκος and Latin *fucus*? In Greek it mostly appears to be one particular kind, which can only be rouge. Thus in Pseudo-Lucian *Amores* 41 παρειὰς ἐρυθθαίνουσιν ἐπιχρίστοις φύκεσιν, ἵνα τὴν ὑπέρλευκον αὐτῶν ... χροιάν τὸ πορφυροῦν ἄνθος ἐπιφοινίξῃ "[loose women] redden their cheeks with *phykos* in ointment, so that the crimson color may empurple their pale skin"; Sap Sol 13,14 of the manufacturer of

57 Egyptian *mšdm.t* (Erman-Grapow ii.153) "stibium," from the verb *šdm* (iv.370) "paint the eyes"; J.-L. Fournet, "Les emprunts du grec à l'égyptien," *Bull. de la Soc. de Linguistique de Paris* 84 (1989) 55-80, p. 65.

58 Antiphanes frag. 189, Kock ii.88.

59 Egyptian *np* Erman-Grapow ii.366; Fournet 64.

idols καταχρίσας μίλτω καὶ φύκει ἐρυθθίνας χροάν αὐτοῦ, "smearing it with ochre and reddening its skin with *phykos*," Vg *perliniens lubrica et rubicundum faciens fuco colorem* where the translator intended *fuco* as etymological equivalent. Latin *fūcus* mostly designates "cosmetic, artifice" in the abstract. But in Propertius 2.18C.31-32 it must mean "eye-shadow":

an si caeruleo quaedam sua tempora fuco
tinxerit, idcirco caerulea forma bona est?

"Or if some girl paints her eye-sockets with steel-blue *fucus*, on that account is a blue complexion fine?" Both the Latin and Greek must come from the Orient: Latin, as it seems independently of the Greek, retains the original sense "mascara," while Greek transfers the meaning to "rouge."

The local men of a small ancient city could not support substantial prostitution by themselves. The prostitutes of Aphrodite Ourania at Corinth, increased at a stroke by a hundred through the munificence of Xenophon, and celebrated with embarrassment by Pindar (p. 212 above), serviced the seaport trade. The proverb "not every man has the luck to sail to Corinth":⁶⁰

οὐ παντὸς ἀνδρὸς εἰς Κόρινθον ἐσθ' ὁ πλοῦς

indicates that they provided offices elsewhere unavailable. An alert city, recognizing the value of having a foreign trader in residence, gave him quasi-civic status through a local sponsor, a *xenos*. Earlier the stranger was given quasi-religious status by attaching guest-houses to a temple, where he had the divine protection resting on a stranger.⁶¹ Aristophanes (*Ranae* 112-116) lists the needs of a traveler: "harbors, bakeries, whorehouses (πορνεῖα) rest-stops, turn-offs, springs, roads, cities, guest-suites, women innkeepers and as few bedbugs as possible." Some of what is called "sacred prostitution" simply provided for the needs of travelers under protection of a sanctuary. At Babylon it must be with a stranger, ἀνδρὶ ξείνῳ (Herodotus 1.199.1), and so at Byblos (Lucian, *de dea Syria* 6). The places where Aphrodite was called Hetaera (Tmolos, Samos, Ephesus, Athens south of the Acropolis [Athenaeus 569-573]) were commercial centers. By the Roman period inns were desacralized; Casson⁶² cannot clearly determine whether establishments at Rome and Pompeii with erotic frescoes were inns, brothels or bars (*popinae*).

As foreign residents, prostitutes formed a potentially disloyal enclave; hence parallels between classical and Hebrew stories.⁶³ When Capua was

60 Aristophanes frag. 902a, Kock i.591.

61 See my discussion of the divine protection resting on strangers in "From Hesiod to Jesus: Laws of Human Nature in the Ancient World," *NovT* 35 (1993) 313-343, p. 323.

62 Lionel Casson, *Travel in the Ancient World* (1974) 197-218.

63 H. Windisch, "Zur Rahabgeschichte. (Zwei Parallelen aus der klassischen Literatur)," *ZAW* 37 (1917/8) 188-198; W. Baumgartner, "Israelitisch-griechische Sagenbeziehun-

taken by the Romans in 210 BC (Livy 26.33.8), a certain Cluvia, who "made her living by her body" (*quaestum corpore fecisset*) had secretly brought food to needy captives; she was one of two women restored their property and freedom by the Senate. Another text⁶⁴ explains why there was a temple of Aphrodite Porne at Abydos:

When the city [Abydos] was reduced to slavery, the soldiers garrisoned in it once conducted a sacrifice, and after drinking took several harlots. One of them, after she saw that the soldiers were asleep, took their keys, climbed over the wall and told the men of Abydos [who were outside]. They immediately came under arms, killed the guards, took the walls, and regained control; they gave the harlot the gift of freedom and built a temple of Aphrodite Porne.

Similarly Rahab the harlot of Jericho (Jos 6,22-25) alone is saved with her household for having befriended the Israelite spies in her φιλοξενία (I Clem 12). Her house was built into the city wall (Jos 2,15), so that it was easy for her to get them out—her status was less sacral than extraterritorial. That Paul was let down from Damascus in a basket (Act 9,25; II Kor 11,33)⁶⁵ suggests that he was staying at the inn by the gate like any out-of-town stranger. His stiffness against *porneia* is motivated when we realize that he was constantly working in close quarters with *pornai*.

7.2.5 The breakdown of distinctions

Nothing so unsettled men as the breakdown of clear distinctions between respectable and non-respectable women. Elsewhere⁶⁶ I discuss women able to raise the dead, Sibyls and the witch of En-Dor, and the connection of Gergithes and Gergashites. Euripides' *Bacchae* reveals the (male) fear that city women under the influence of Dionysus can become homicidal fanatics. In Rome, the fear of a slave uprising was tempered by the annual temporary reversal of roles at the Saturnalia; and so by tradition or prudence, women were allowed tasks and festivals where their restrictions were temporarily removed. In Hellas the women alone celebrated the Thesmophoria, the most widely spread of all Greek festivals.⁶⁷ In Attica (Isaeus 8.19) the wives of

gen," pp. 147-178 of his *Zum Alten Testament und seiner Umwelt* (1959), reprinted from *Schweizerisches Archiv für Volkskunde* 41 (1944) 1-29.

64 Neanthes, Jacoby FGH 84 F 9 = Athenaeus 13.572.

65 Curiously it is Paul himself, the participant, who at II Kor 11,33 cites the LXX of Jos 2,15 διὰ τῆς θυρίδος "through a window"; Luke the second-hand narrator at Act 9,25 expresses himself differently.

66 "The Mediterranean Seer and Shamanism," ZAW 93 (1981) 374-400, part IV.

67 The festival is described by the scholiast on Lucian *Dial. Mer.* 2.1, conveniently

the demesmen (γυναῖκες αἱ τῶν δημοτῶν) elected (προῦκριναν) women from their number to preside (ἄρχειν) at the annual festival; rotten pork drawn up from pits (μέγαρα)⁶⁸ was mixed with grain on the altars.

Women had a special expertise in mourning; in Israel, for four days annually in memory of Jephthah's daughter (Jud 11,40). And in rejoicing too. David's lament calls on the "daughters of Israel to weep" and for all to "tell it not in Gath...lest the daughters of the Philistines rejoice" (II Sam 1,19-24). The daughters of Judah are to rejoice over the justice of Yahweh and the fortification of Zion (Ps 48,11). The daughters of Jerusalem have the task of locating lovers for each other (Cant 5,8), and are not to weep for Jesus but for themselves and their children (Luk 23,28).

In the *Iliad* it is more often women who "wail" (ἐπι δὲ στενάχοντο γυναῖκες 19.301 etc.) although the same verb is applied to old men (19.338) and citizens generally (22.429). At the wake for Hector there is a differentiation of function, 24.722:

οἱ μὲν ἄρ' ἐθρήνεον, ἐπι δὲ στενάχοντο γυναῖκες
 "The men [skilled at singing] sang the lament, and the women wailed [non-verbally]." A fable of Aesop⁶⁹ describes how at the death of a daughter a rich man "hired mourning women," τὰς θρηνούσας ἐμισθώσατο, evidently professionals.

In Israel and Hellas, the most prominent cult in which women could exercise their specialty of mourning was the same. Ezekiel (8,14) in the Temple found "women sitting and lamenting for Tammuz":

וְנָשִׁים יְשִׁיבֹת מְבַכֹּת אֶת תַּמְּצוּז

LXX θρηνούσαι τὸν Θαμμουζ, Vg *plangentes Adonidem*. Lucian *de dea Syria* 8 describes the cult of Adonis at Byblos, and Milton (*Par. Lost* i.446-453) sumptuously versifies both texts:

...*Thammuz* came next behind,
 Whose annual wound in *Lebanon* allur'd
 The *Syrian* damsels to lament his fate
 In amorous dittyes all a Summers day,
 While smooth *Adonis* from his native Rock
 Ran purple to the Sea, suppos'd with blood
 Of *Thammuz* yearly wounded; the Love-tale
 Infected *Sions* daughters with like heat...

reprinted by Ludwig Deubner, *Attische Feste* (1932) 40. See Saul Levin, "Θεσμοφόρος = *legifera*: the Import of the Primeval Thesmophoria," *General Linguistics* 31 (1991) 1-12.

68 There is a possible Semitic connection for the festival in that this word for "pit" is often compared with Hebrew מַצְלָה "cave," in particular as place of burial (Gen 23,9).

69 Aesop 310 "The rich man and the mourning women," ed. E. Chambray.

The Akkadian god Dumuzi mostly appears in the form Du'uzi, *Gilgamesh* VI.46. A Syriac text ascribed to Melito bishop of Sardes⁷⁰ tells the story in a Hellenized form; it is rare enough that I print it in full (in Hebrew script):

סגרו בני פוניקא ושבקת מלכותה ואת עמרת בגבל כרכא דפוניקא ובה בזבנא שעבדת לכלהון כפרונא לכותר מלכא מטל דמן קדם תמוזא רחמת הות לארוס וגרת בה ואחדה הופסטט בעלה וטן בה ואתא קטל לתמוזא בלבנן טורא כד עבד חזירא בורזא ומנה מן זבנא קיית בלתי בגבל ומיתת באפקא מדינתא אתר דקביר תמוזא

"The people of Phoenicia worshipped Balthi, queen of Cyprus, because she fell in love with Tamuz, son of Cuthar, king of the Phoenicians, and left her own kingdom, and came and dwelt in Gebal, a fortress of the Phoenicians, and at that time she made all the Cyprians subject to the king Cuthar: for before Tamuz she was in love with Ares, and committed adultery with him, and Hephaestus her husband caught her, and was jealous over her, and came and slew Tamuz in Mount Lebanon, while he was hunting the wild⁷¹ boar; and from that time Balthi remained in Gebal, and died in the city Aphaca where Tamuz was buried."⁷²

Greeks had a distant reflection of the deity's original name. Plutarch⁷³ tells how a supposed Egyptian pilot Thamous hears his name called from on shore and is asked to convey the message Πᾶν ὁ μέγας τέθνηκεν "Great Pan is dead." Solomon Reinach⁷⁴ plausibly conjectured that the story rationalized a ritual cry *Θαμοῦς πάμμεγας τέθνηκε "Thamous all-great is dead." Jerome on Ez 8,14⁷⁵ connects the god with the Hebrew month *Thamuz* of sowing (Mishna *Taan*. IV.5 תמוז) and refers to the "seeds which die in the earth," in *seminibus quae moriuntur in terra*. Elsewhere (*Epist.* 58.3) he identifies Tammuz with Adonis, *Bethleem nunc nostram...lucis inumbrabat Thamuz, id est Adonidis* "Bethleem where I now live was once overshadowed by a grove of Thammuz, that is of Adonis." Sappho (p. 208) tells the votaries of Adonis to tear their tunics; Aristophanes (p. 154) describes the *tympanismos* of tambourines at her rites. Theocritus 15 describes the Syracusan ladies Gorgo and Praxinoa at the ceremony for Adonis in the palace of Ptolemy II. Jerome is referring to the intentionally short-lived "gardens of

70 W. Cureton, *Spicilegium Syriacum* (1855) 25 top (tr. p. 44).

71 The lexicon gives רזא "wild boar"; the construction is awkward.

72 The cult of Aphrodite at Aphaca, Ἀφακά, the great spring at the source of the Adonis river, is well-known from Zosimus 1.58 etc. Jos 13,4 אַפְקָה shows the same name and perhaps the same site; see my *Lebanon and Phoenicia* 67-69.

73 Plutarch, *de defectu orac.* 17 = *Mor.* 419B.

74 Salomon Reinach, "La mort du grand Pan," BCH 31 (1907) 5-19 = his *Cultes, mythes et religions*, 2nd ed (1913) ii.1-15. The Egyptian name Θαμοῦς (Plato, *Phaedrus* 274D) made the story possible.

75 Hieronymus *In Hiezechielem* 8,14; Corp. Christ. 75.99.

Adonis" (Plato *Phaedr.* 276B Ἀδώνιδος κήπους); they seem to appear at Isa 17,10 "therefore you plant pleasant(?) plants, and set out slips of a strange god:"⁷⁶

על-כן תטעי נטעי נעמנים וזמרת זר תזרענו

7.3 Women under the universalizing of restrictions.

7.3.1 Women in relation to slaves and criminals

As women had a kind of alternative society with their own cults, so did the poor and slaves: their spokesman had a sacral immunity.⁷⁷ So in Hellas did the youth or ephebes. Jason, when he built the gymnasium in Jerusalem (II Makk 4,12), for a brief time "organized the noblest of the ephebes and made them wear the Greek hat," τοὺς κρατίστους τῶν ἐφήβων ὑποτάσσωσιν ὑπὸ πέτασον ἤγαγεν. Thus women, youths and slaves each formed a kind of city within the city.

The kinship of women with slaves shows up in the foundation legends of our societies. The ancestors of Israelites had been slaves in Egypt, with their liberation begun by women—the midwives and Miriam. So the ancestors of all Romans were the fugitive slaves under Romulus and the respectable Sabine women whom they abducted—as the Benjaminites took the "daughters of Shiloh" (Jud 21,21). According to Polybius (12.5.6) Locri of Italy was founded from its mother-city in Greece by the union of women with slaves; and so the aristocracy of the Italian city traced descent from the mother, πάντα τὰ διὰ προγόνων ἔνδοξα παρ' αὐτοῖς ἀπὸ τῶν γυναικῶν, "all ancestral nobility among them is reckoned from the women." Strabo 6.3.3 explained the founding of Tarentum by the "Partheniai"⁷⁸ through the oath of Spartan men not to return to their wives until they had captured Messene. As the war dragged on, the younger men, who had not taken the oath, returned to Sparta and lay with as many women as they could.

76 Lewy *Fremdwörter* 49 thinks קָצַיִל a title of Adonis, and compares the flower-name "anemone" ἀνεμώνη with a folk-etymology "windflower." For Ovid *Met.* 10.737-9, while suppressing its name, has it come up from the blood of Adonis. See in general the article "Adonies" DĈPP 6-7; Marcel Detienne, *Les Jardins d'Adonis* (1972); Sergio Ribichini, *Adonis: Aspetti "orientali" di un mito greco* (1981).

77 My "From Divine Kingship to Dispersal of Power in the Mediterranean City-State," *ZAW* 105 (1993) 62-86, p. 82.

78 See Aristotle *Pol.* 5.6.1 = 1306b30.

Elsewhere⁷⁹ I discuss how Persia and its successor empires (the Hellenistic kingdoms, Carthage, Macedon, Rome) took over the previously independent city-states and introduced new sanctions, in particular crucifixion. As rebels were crucified, their women were prostituted, and a new solidarity between the two groups appeared. Sennacherib,⁸⁰ after he killed the leaders of Ekron and hung their bodies on "poles surrounding the city," seized the daughters and concubines of besieged Hezekiah. At the capture of Jerusalem (Th 5,11-12) "women are ravished in Zion...princes are hung up by their hands":

נָשִׁים בְּצִיּוֹן עָנוּ ... שָׂרִים בְּיָדָם נָתְלוּ

Pheretima queen of Cyrene crucified the leading rebels of Barca, and cut off their wives' breasts and nailed them to the city walls (Herodotus 4.202). Alexander Jannaeus crucified captives while drinking and reclining with his concubines (Josephus *BJ* 1.97). And legend gives each crucified rebel a female companion, as those executed found a woman, a Rizpah or Aphrodite (Chapter 8.4.14), to keep the dogs and vultures off their bodies by day and night.

So the companion of Prometheus is Io, Ἴω, once a princess with the misfortune to captivate Zeus (Aeschylus *PV* 560ff), now a heifer stung by the οἶστρος of sexual heat (567, 675); she is pursued over land and sea by the fly, and by thousand-eyed Argos, seen alternately as her cattleherd and as an unsleeping secret police. Their fates are interwoven: Prometheus declares what her future will be; a descendant of hers (Heracles) is to release him. As the "cow-horned maid" (τᾶς βούκερω παρθένου vs 588) she resembles the moon; perhaps then her name is Egyptian, compare the Bohairic of Matt 24,29 *pi-iah* "the moon."

The empathy for women of Second Isaiah is sometimes missed. Israel is doubly represented in the Servant of Yahweh and in the "captive daughter of Zion" (52,2). She has been sold into slavery, in effect prostitution, the "shame of your youth" (54,4); now the "time of her service" (40,2) is ended and like Hosea's woman she is remarried to Yahweh in a "covenant of peace" (54,10). Future roles will be reversed and the "daughter of the Chaldeans" will be sold into prostitution (47,1-3) and set to work at the mill. Job 31,10 wishes the same for his wife if *he* has been unfaithful, although "grind for another" may also have a sexual connotation (p. 280 below). At Lysias 1.18 another's slave girl is threatened to be "whipped and thrown into the mill," μαστιγωθεῖσαν εἰς μύλωνα ἐμπεσεῖν.

79 "Prometheus, the Servant of Yahweh, Jesus: Legitimation and Repression in the Heritage of Persian Imperialism," pp. 109-125 of D. Jobling et alii (eds.) *The Bible and the Politics of Exegesis* [N. K. Gottwald Festschrift] (1991).

80 D. D. Luckenbill, *The Annals of Sennacherib* (1924) pp. 32-34 (iii.10,46); transl. in ANET³ 288a.

7.3.2 "Publicans and harlots"

Jesus ironically accepts the hostile designation of his followers, Matt 21,31 "Verily I say to you that the publicans and harlots (οἱ τελῶναι καὶ αἱ πόρνοι, Vg *publicani et meretrices*) enter the kingdom of God before you." The harlot of Prov 7,19-20 lives with one who has a "bag of silver," חֶסֶד־רִיבָּ, perhaps himself a tax-collector. Even more so the parallelism is classical. Theophrastus (*Char.* 6) says that the man of ἀπονοίας or Shameless one is "a great one to manage an inn and to be a brothel-keeper and to bid on tax-contracts," δεινὸς δὲ καὶ πανδοκεῦσαι καὶ πορνοβοσκῆσαι καὶ τελωνῆσαι. In fact Athens had a prostitution-tax, πορνικὸν τέλος (Aeschines 1.119).⁸¹ In Latin "harlot" can be *publica*; Didymus the grammarian (Seneca *Ep.* 88.37) asked "whether Sappho was a prostitute," *an Sappho publica fuerit*. Cicero, withdrawing from his praise of the *publicanorum ordo*, alleges (*Ver.* II.3.78) that Verres in Sicily had a mistress Pipa who also worked as tax-collector, whom he styles in a nice pun as *mulierculae publicanae*. The Rabbis criticized the Romans in the same terms (Bab. Talm. *Shabb.* 33b). "Rabbi Yehuda said, 'How splendid are the works of this people! They build markets, they build bridges, they build baths.' ...R. Simeon b. Yohai answered and said, 'All that they build, they build only for their own needs: they build markets to set harlots (זונות) in them, baths for their own pleasure, bridges to collect toll (מכס) on them'."

The Gospels skate on the thin ice of giving Jesus a romantic connection with one such woman. It is said ambiguously of that nameless one of the city who kisses his feet that she has "loved much" (Luk 7,47). The life-of-Jesus industry has gingerly circled around an affair with Mary Magdalen "from whom seven demons had gone out" (Luk 8,2)—colored by other women of the story. Rembrandt makes the woman taken in adultery the representative of all such. His painting of 1644 (now in London) sets the woman, at once harlot and princess, in a temple of soaring architecture never seen on land or sea, where incalculable treasures of gold appear out of the darkness.

Ernest Renan in his *Life of Jesus* says of Mary Magdalen:

...elle avait été affectée de maladies nerveuses en apparence inexplicables. Jésus, par sa beauté pure et douce, calma cette organisation troublée. La Magdaléenne lui fut fidèle jusq'au Golgotha...

And so in his description of the Easter event:

Mais telle était la trace qu'il avait laissée dans le cœur de ses disciples et de quelques amies dévouées que, durant des semaines encore, il fut pour eux vivant et consolateur. ...Disons cependant que la forte imagination de Marie de Magdala joua

81 So did the Chersonesus, ΤΟΥ ΤΕΛΟΥΣ ΤΟΥ ΠΟΡΝΙΚΟΥ (IGRR i.860.15).

dans cette circonstance un rôle capital. Pouvoir divin de l'amour! moments sacrés ou la passion d'une hallucinée donne au monde un Dieu ressuscité!⁸²

So a popular identification of one of the women at the Cross and empty tomb as a harlot was inevitable, though Joh 19,25 thought it more suitable for Jesus' mother to occupy first place. Toynbee⁸³ compares the Passion narrative with Plutarch's accounts of the proletarian reformers Agis and Cleomenes of Sparta, Tiberius and Gaius Gracchus of Rome. Cornelia the mother of the Gracchi is a figure somewhat like Jesus' mother; the wives of the Spartans were executed with them. Vogt⁸⁴ attaches importance to the fact that both Jesus and his mother define themselves as slaves (Mark 10,44; Luk 1,38); in the Church the Saturnalia in principle become permanent, the first is slave of all (Mark 10,44).

7.3.3 The universality of debt

The loss of male autonomy with the fall of the city-state can be seen in the all-embracing category of the debtor. As Carthage, Greece and the Hellenistic empires were taken over by Rome, every independent ruling class was absorbed. As the distinction between citizen and foreigner became blurred, slavery was subsumed under debt. Even under the Polis a foreigner was in danger of enslavement, and debt looked much like slavery. So Prov 22,7 "the debtor is slave to the creditor,"

וְצָבֵד לְוָה לְאִישׁ מְלָנָה

Likewise Deut 28,12 "You will lend to many nations and you will not borrow":

וְהָלַיְתָ גֹזִים רַבִּים וְאַתָּה לֹא תִלְוָה

LXX καὶ δανιεῖς ἔθνεσιν πολλοῖς, σὺ δὲ οὐ δανιεῖ, Vg *et foenerabis gentibus multis et ipse a nullo foenus accipies*. The LXX follows classical usage: Demosthenes 35.11 ἀποδώσουσιν οἱ δανεισάμενοι τοῖς δανείσασσι τὸ γιγνόμενον ἀργύριον "the debtors will pay the money due the creditors."

Pericles says that Athens, far from owing money herself, took pains to do benefits *gratis*, "since the person bound is more lukewarm, knowing that he is destined to demonstrate fidelity, not as a favor, but as a debt (ἐς ὀφείλημα)" (Thucydides 2.40.4). The promise of the Israelite covenant was freedom from debt (Deut 28,12.44), or equivalently, freedom from slavery (Deut 28,68). But under the Empire the old pattern of obligation represented by

82 Ernst Renan, *Vie de Jésus* (1864), chaps 9 & 26.

83 Arnold Toynbee, *A Study of History* (1939) Vol. vi Annex ii, pp. 478-491.

84 Joseph Vogt, *Ancient Slavery and the Ideal of Man*, tr. T. Wiedemann (1975) 152.

the vassal treaty was privatized into a universal pecking-order of debt. The situation was grasped clearly by Jesus, who presumes that everybody is simultaneously, in different relationships, both debtor and creditor. In the most familiar text of the ancient world he asks (Matt 6,12) "and forgive us our debts as we forgive our debtors," καὶ ἄφες ἡμῖν τὰ ὀφειλήματα ἡμῶν ὡς καὶ ἡμεῖς ἀφήκαμεν τοῖς ὀφειλέταις ἡμῶν. Vg *et dimitte nobis debita nostra sicut et nos dimisimus debitoribus nostris*. The language is that of the late Roman republic. Thus Appian *Ital.* 9 "[Manlius] forgave all those who owed to him their debts," πᾶσιν ἠφίει τοῖς ἑαυτοῦ χρήταις τὰ ὀφλήματα; Cicero *Att.* 13.23 "and don't expect that those who normally try to claim what is not owed them, will forgive what is really owed them," *nec existimes eos, qui non debita consecrari soleant, quod debeatur remissuros*.

Even if Jesus' prayer includes the notion of debt as sin against God, we cannot ignore its surface meaning. Social unrest brings a demand to destroy the records of debt. When the wicked "covet fields and seize them" (Mic 2,2) and "add field to field" (Isa 5,8), there will be a warm welcome for a remission of land-leases every 50 years (Lev 25,8-17) or of debt every 7 years (Deut 15,1-6). Did it really happen? Money-lenders and the poor in need of loans at least thought it might, and Hillel devised the פרוזבול to cancel the cancellation of loans in the Sabbatical year (Mishna *Shev.* X.3-4).⁸⁵ Solon⁸⁶ says "I removed the markers everywhere fixed" in black Earth

ὄρους ἀνεῖλον πολλαχῆ πεπηγότας

Under Agis of Sparta Agesilaus had mortgages (γραμματεῖα) burnt (Plutarch *Agis* 13.3, cf. *Cleomenes* 10.6). In 86 BC a law of Valerius Flaccus at Rome had debts contracted in silver paid off in copper at 75% loss.⁸⁷ In AD 66 the Jewish rebels burned the archives (ἀρχεῖα) of debt (Josephus *BJ* 2.427).

In late republican Rome the old language of treaty-making was transferred, under the symbolism of debt or obligation, to the place of real politics—namely, to the party-politics of aristocratic families. Thus Cicero *de domo sua* 66, in reference to an agreement between Clodius and the two consuls, "Gabinus broke the agreement, while Piso remained in good faith," *fregit foedus Gabinus, Piso tamen in fide mansit* (cf. Chapter 8.1.6). But even the aristocrats no longer possessed the autonomy of the ruling class of the Polis, since power had moved over to what were essentially private armies. Hence roles previously subordinate came into their own, since now they were now no more subordinate than any other. Women and slaves achieved equality, not on the level of public institutions, but in alternative cultures inside imperial

85 Surely a Greek word, but distorted beyond recognition; see Daniel Sperber, *A Dictionary of Greek and Latin Legal Terms in Rabbinic Literature* (1984) 154-6.

86 West IEG frag. 36.5-7 = Aristotle *Ath. Pol.* 12.3.

87 Sallust *Cat.* 33, cf. Velleius 2.23.

society. And the wheel comes full circle in that the bond of that equality is expressed in the archaic treaty language.

7.3.4 Roman elegiac poets and their mistresses

Within the city of Rome, a new role is given the mistress by the elegiac poets of the late Republic—along with rejection of traditional career goals and inversion of the language in which they were expressed. Hallett⁸⁸ shows how the language of party politics is turned upside down. Thus Catullus 109.6 asks the great gods that his relationship with Lesbia may endure throughout their lives; but he calls it *aeternum hoc sanctae foedus amicitiae*, "this eternal treaty of our sacred friendship." This is treaty language as in Livy 23.33.9 *foedusque cum eo atque amicitiam iungit* "[Philip] made a treaty and friendship with [Hannibal]." Catullus loves Lesbia *pater ut gnatos diligit et generos* (72.4) "as a father loves his sons and sons-in-law"—sons-in-law especially, since he picked them out with utmost care to create alliances which will further his position and his family's. So Propertius 3.20.15-16 "first I must make a treaty, decree rights, and sign a law in my new love":

foedera sunt ponenda prius signandaque iura
et scribenda mihi lex in amore nouo

Cicero (*pro Archia* 4.6) speaks of the relation between Heraclea and Rome *aequissimo iure ac foedere* "with a most well-balanced law and treaty." The lover is slave of his mistress, *seruus amoris* (Propertius 2.13.36).

In particular, while the elegiac poets express towards literal war an ostentatious and un-Roman pacifism, they turn military imagery upside down to express their relations with their beloved, in language strangely reminiscent of the New Testament. Tibullus (1.10.1-2)⁸⁹ asks with a weak pun:

Quis fuit, horrendos primus qui protulit enses?
quam ferus et uere ferreus ille fuit!

"Who was it that first brought out horrible swords? How savage he was, and literally iron!" Then at 1.1.75 "Here I am a general and a good soldier," *hic ego dux milesque bonus*, cf. II Tim 2,3 Vg *labora sicut bonus miles Christi Iesu*. Propertius 1.6.30-31 "I was not born fit for praise or arms; this is the campaigning which the fates wish me to undertake":

non ego sum laudi, non natus idoneus armis;
hanc me militiam fata subire uolunt.

cf. II Kor 10,4 Vg *nam arma militiae nostrae non sunt carnalia*.

88 Judith P. Hallett, "The Role of Women in Roman Elegy: Counter-Cultural Feminism," *Arethusa* 6 (1973) 103-123.

89 Compare the pacifism of Propertius at 2.7.14; 2.15.43ff.

It seems wildly paradoxical to compare the relationship of Propertius and Cynthia with that of Jesus and Magdalen (even as inflated by Renan). But the literary subculture of Rome and the new community of Jesus share several features. (1) They use treaty or covenant language to express a separation from that imperial society which claims all legitimacy. (2) The mistress (at Rome upper-class of course) or harlot is the point of breakthrough for increased equality of women. (3) Symbolically with the poets (in the theme of the lover as the mistress' slave), sociologically in the church, an area is found for increased equality of slaves. (4) Their equalizing the role of the woman and slave is associated with an explicit non-violence.

The last point is illustrated by Eph 5-6, whose version of the *Haustafel* we discussed earlier. In spite of its subordination-ethic, the mutuality that it sees in the relation of husband and wife, master and slave, parent and child is so big a step from paganism that it can only be taken through putting on "the whole armor of God" (Chapter 5.1 above), which in the end involves the renunciation of any other kind of militarism. The connection is emphatic in the six antitheses of Matt 5,21-48. As Tribble claims inaccurately, and with (misdirected) disapproval, that "the laws of Israel address only men,"⁹⁰ the commands in Matthew really are all addressed to men. For they deal on the one hand with the sexual exploitation (seduction and divorce) of women by men; on the other hand with aggression, revenge and self-defense, in the context of violence by men against men. The conclusion is inescapable that for the New Testament violence against women is part and parcel of violence against men, so that they must be dealt with together or not at all; its feminism and non-violence are inseparable.

90 Phyllis Tribble, "Woman in the OT," IDB Sup (1976) 964.

Chapter 8: Treaty and Loyalty-Oath

By definition, a treaty is the primary official document shared between two states; from the 15th and 14th centuries BC we have actual texts of several Akkadian treaties with translation into other languages—Ugaritic, Hittite, Egyptian. They achieved a nearly fixed form which was then continued by treaty-texts in a single language in various places. By the nature of things, most treaties were not between equals, and therefore contained as their operative feature a *loyalty-oath* of the weaker party or "vassal" to the stronger. The format is illustrated by six representative texts over the centuries:¹ (1) Suppiluliuma-Kurtiwaza (**05**, 14 cent. BC); (2) Vassal Treaties of Esarhaddon (**17**, 672 BC); (3) Deuteronomy; (4) Ephebic and Plataean Oaths (as if a single text; **20 + 40**, 4th c. BC); (5) Smyrna-Magnesia (and Seleucus II; **45**, ab. 243 BC); (6) Augustus-Paphlagonians (**52**, 3 BC).

Structure of Loyalty Treaties

Text as numbered above	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
A Historical Summary	Ob 1–58	1–12	1,1–4,24	1–6	—	1–7
B God-List (position 1)	—	13–40	4,26–40	—	70	8–9
C First Provisions	Ob 59–Re 13	—	(4,41–49)	—	71	—
D Loyalty Oath	Re 14–34	41–372	5,1–11,32	6–14	73	9–16
E Second Provisions	Re 35–39	373–413	12,1–27,10	—	—	—
F Promise to seize rebel	—	"	13,10	14–16	76	16–24
G God-List (position 2)	Re 40–58	—	—	16–20	—	—
H Curses	Re 59–69	414–668	27,11–26 28,15–68	40–46	78	25–35
I Blessings	Re 70–7	—	(28,1–14)	"	"	—
J Authentication	?	669–end	29–31	47–51	—	36–42

1 Numerals in **boldface** refer to the Catalogue at the end of this chapter. Treaties involving the Phoenicians are catalogued by Lipiński in the art. "Traité," DCP 468–469.

Thus the principal difference is in the placement of the god-list.

Shortly after the Hittite vassal treaties were found at Boghazköy, and their juristic contents analyzed by Korošec,² it was seen that they were a close formal precedent for the covenant of Deuteronomy; there is a full treatment by McCarthy. The covenantal materials of the books of Moses used several standard formulas of the vassal treaty between unequals—in this case, Israel and its God. In the original vassal treaties the curses are pronounced by the vassal over himself if he should break loyalty. Hillers showed how such curses appear also in the curses of the Hebrew prophets; some of those in Deuteronomy repeat in exact sequence the curses in the loyalty treaties to Esarhaddon. Crawford has analyzed in detail the curses in West-Semitic inscriptions. Bickerman (1952) showed that the treaty between Hannibal and Philip V of Macedon (47, 215 BC), as preserved by Polybius (7.9) from Roman archives in a Greek text, must be the translation by Hannibal's chancery of a Punic original. Weinfeld in two seminal articles (1973, 1976) showed that to a great extent the structure of the Near Eastern treaties and the provisions of their loyalty oath were continued in Greek and Latin treaties. Karavites gathers Near Eastern parallels to treaty-like "agreements" in Homer. In this chapter I organize and occasionally supplement all those results.

The treaties are a strong proof that belief in the gods was no convention or legal fiction, but a living reality in ancient society. With no media or world public opinion, how could states be trusted to keep their word? At the height of the Greek enlightenment, in the Peace of Nicias (33, 421 BC), Athens and Sparta each required the other to swear "the strongest local oath" (Thucydides 5.18.9, see 8.1.2 below). Those who had the most interest in not being deceived by a state—namely, its enemies—judged that it took its gods seriously enough for its promises under oath to be relied on—of course, with due caution. It was not that enlightened Athens exploited Spartan credulity. In this respect the states were as alike as two peas in a pod. The basis on which Athenians judged Spartan fear of the gods was their own fear of the gods.³ Even so, treaty-violation was frequent; but the injured party genuinely believed that the offended god would take their side (Levin).

The treaties constitute the highest-level contact between the classical world on one hand, and the world of Israel and the ancient Near East on the other. The old treaty between Rome and Carthage (25, Polybius 3.26.1, 508/7 BC?) shows how specific "Semitic" formulas could enter the Greek and Latin worlds. In the treatment here, (8.1) the *nomenclature and formal*

2 For all such references see the Supplementary Bibliography at the end of this chapter.

3 Grotius 2.13.10-15 has an excellent analysis of the force of treaty obligations, illustrated from the Bible and Greco-Roman history.

aspects of a treaty are summarized out of the studies by Weinfeld. The provisions of (8.2) the *loyalty oath* and (8.3) the *appeal to the elements as divine witnesses* appear in diverse contexts. The most concrete parallels between the classical and Semitic worlds appear in (8.4) the *catalogue of curses* which the superior party required the inferior one to lay on himself; when those curses appear outside of formal treaty or covenant context, as in the book of Psalms and Greek tragedy, conversely we may suspect that a treaty lies in the background.

The child's world reminds us how urgent it can be to persuade a doubtful party that we mean what we say. In New England in the '30s we said "Cross my heart and hope to turn purple all over" if we broke our word; the archaic use of "hope" shows the traditional character of the formula. The Assyrian rulers adapted their curses to individual cases; the landlubber Esarhaddon lays it on Baal king of Tyre "May Baal-shamem raise an evil wind against your ships," invoking a local deity (18, 680 BC). Laying curses on others without their assent or knowledge is known to be less reliable, but unavoidable (e.g.) in preventing violation of sepulture; perhaps it was felt that all persons were under implicit oath not to rob a tomb. Every child knows how to ward off such: "Sticks and stones may break my bones, but words can never hurt me." Tragedy comes when we are held up to our own voluntary words. Thus Jephthah, "For I have opened my mouth to Yahweh, and I cannot take it back" (Jud 11,35):

וְאֶנְכִי פָצִיתִי פִי אֶל־יְהוָה וְלֹא אֵיכָל לְשׁוֹב

so Oedipus, "And it was none other than I that laid these curses on myself" (Sophocles, *OR* 819-820):

... καὶ τὰδ' οὐτίς ἄλλος ἦν

ἢ γὰρ π' ἐμαυτῷ τὰσδ' ἀρὰς ὁ προστιθείς

The concept of the treaty was modified when it moved from the absolutist regimes of the Near East to the more democratic societies of Canaan, Hellas and republican Rome. But the Hellenistic kings, and their successors the Roman emperors, aspired to continue in the line of the Near Eastern monarchs, and so the loyalty-oaths to them show a remarkable conservatism. Others began to perceive that the power of the old ruler was unjust and illegitimate, and the treaty-format underwent adjustments. The great King might be replaced by a figure—the God of Israel or the Greek Polis—seen as just and legitimate. The divine elements originally invoked as deities might be retained with personification, as in Hellas; or in Israel as fellow-creatures of the one God along with those covenanting.

8.1 Nomenclature and formal aspects of the treaty.

8.1.1 A treaty or compact has two essential features: things promised on *oath* (which can name the whole transaction); and a *curse* pronounced by the maker on himself if he fails to carry out the promises⁴

Thus Deut 29,13 "And it is not with you alone that I 'cut' this covenant (Vg *hoc foedus ferio*) and this curse":

וְלֹא אַתֶּם לְבַדְכֶם אֲנֹכִי כָרַת אֶת־הַבְּרִית הַזֹּאת וְאֶת־הָאֱלֹהִים הַזֹּאת

LXX ... διατίθεμαι τὴν διαθήκην ταύτην καὶ τὴν ἄρᾶν ταύτην. Num 5,21 "And the priest shall make the woman swear through an oath [validated by] a curse":

וְהִשְׁבִּיעַ הַכֹּהֵן אֶת־הָאִשָּׁה בְּשִׁבְעַת הָאֱלֹהִים

LXX... ἐν τοῖς ὄρκοις τῆς ἀρᾶς ταύτης. In a real-life oath the curse comes first, often (but see 8.4.1) euphemistically abbreviated: "God do so to me and more also if before the sun sets I taste bread or anything" (II Sam 3,35):

כֹּה יַעֲשֶׂה־לִּי אֱלֹהִים וְכֹה־יִסִּיף בִּי אִם־לִפְנֵי בּוֹא הַשֶּׁמֶשׁ ...

Hence in later usage the order is reversed, "And they entered into a curse and an oath" (Neh 10,30, cf. Dan 9,11):

וּבָאִים בְּאֵלֶּה וּבְשִׁבּוּעָה

LXX ("II Esd 20,30") εἰσήλθοσαν ἐν ἀρχῇ καὶ ἐν ὄρκῳ. Euphemizing the curse points the way to discarding it in favor of a pure oath, such as ἴστω Ζεὺς and חִי יִהְיֶה.

Thus in the compact of the Delphic amphictyony (19 = Aeschines 2.115) "And there was added to the oath a strong curse," καὶ προσῆν τῷ ὄρκῳ ἀρὰ ἰσχυρά. Plato *Critias* 119E (at Atlantis) "And on the pillar besides the laws there was an oath invoking strong curses (ὄρκος ἦν μεγάλας ἀρὰς ἐπευχόμενος) on violators." In Athens-Keos (38, 362 BC) ΤΩΝ ΠΑΡΑΒΑΝΤΩΝ ΤΟΣ ΟΡΚΟΣ ΚΑΙ ΤΑΣ ΣΥΝΘΗΚΑΣ "of those violating the oaths (i.e. τοὺς ὄρκους) and the agreements," ὄρκοι denotes the unity of (oath + curse) as opposed to the promises. So in Rome-Astypaleia line 43 (50, 105 BC)

8.1.2 Between equals, where the temptation to break the treaty is greatest, a "strong oath" or "curse" is specified⁵

Besides the examples in (8.1.1), the Arabs in an inscription of Ashurbanipal say that they were defeated because they "did not keep the great oaths of the

4 See Weinfeld 1973, 190-196, who derives the usage from Akkadian.

5 Weinfeld 1973, 198 note 108.

god Asshur.⁶ Jud 21,5 the "sons of Israel" (בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל) say, "For the great oath (הַגְּדוֹלָה הַזֶּה הַצְּבִיחַ, LXX ὄρκος μέγας) was on whoever did not go up to Yahweh at Mizpah: 'He shall be put to death.'" *Iliad* 1.233: Achilles swears that the "sons of the Achaeans" (υἱας Ἀχαιῶν vs 240) will one day regret his absence from battle, "But I tell you outright and swear a great oath" (like the others such, unspecified):

ἀλλ' ἕκ τοι ἔρέω καὶ ἐπὶ μέγαν ὄρκον ὁμοῦμαι

The Peace of Nicias between Athens and Sparta (33 = Thucydides 5.18, 421 BC) prescribes "and let the parties from each city swear the strongest local oath," ὁμνύντων δὲ τὸν ἐπιχώριον ὄρκον ἑκάτεροι τὸν μέγιστον ... ἐκάστης πόλεως.

8.1.3 Both oath and curse are "of" the high God

II Sam 21,7 "the oath of Yahweh," יהוה בְּעַתָּה, LXX τὸν ὄρκον κυρίου (cf. I Reg 2,43; Ex 22,10). Deut 29,11 "for you to enter the covenant of Yahweh your God and his curse," LXX ἐν τῇ διαθήκῃ τοῦ κυρίου ... καὶ ἐν ταῖς ἀραῖς αὐτοῦ

לְעִבְרָךְ בְּבְרִית יְהוָה אֱלֹהֶיךָ וּבְאֲלָתֶיךָ

Jud 9,4 "Baal of the covenant,"⁷ בַּעַל בְּרִית, LXX Βααλ διαθήκης.

Iliad 3.107 "the oaths of [i.e. by?] Zeus" (Διὸς ὄρκια); 7.411 "Let Zeus recognize the oaths" (ὄρκια δὲ Ζεὺς ἴστω); Theognis 824 "the oaths of the gods" (θεῶν ὄρκια); Sophocles *Phil.* 1324 "Zeus of the Oath"; *Oed. Col.* 1767 "and the all-seeing Oath of Zeus" (χὼ πάντ' αἴων Διὸς Ὀρκος). At Pindar *Pyth.* 4.167 Zeus himself is "the strong oath" (καρτερὸς ὄρκος). Plato *Leg.* 881D "may one fall under the curse of Zeus," ἀρᾶ ἐνεχέσθω Διός. Apuleius *Met.* 7.16 (cf. Vergil *Aen.* 12.200) *nec hospitalis Iouis seruato foedere* "breaking the covenant of Jupiter who protects guests."

8.1.4 "To utter a curse" and similar phrases are expressed by a denominative verb with cognate accusative

8.1.4.1 A curse

I Reg 8,31 "a curse to adjure(?) him," אָלַח לְהִאָּלַח, LXX ἀρὰν τοῦ ἀρᾶσθαι αὐτόν. Sophocles *Oed. Col.* 952 ἀρὰς ἤρᾶτο "he uttered curses" (cf. Euripides

6 Assurbanipal, *Annals* 9.72, ed. Streck ii.78; translated ANET³ 300a.14.

7 Less a separate divinity than a title of Yahweh, "Master of the Covenant"?

Phoen. 67, *Iliad* 9.566-7, Aeschylus *PV* 910-912). It is tempting to speculate that the root אלה is merely denominative of the noun אלה; that the noun is related to the root conventionally called ארר; and that both are loanwords from Greek.

8.1.4.2 An oath

Num 30,3 with three examples, "When a man vows a vow to Yahweh or swears an oath to bind a pledge on himself":

אִישׁ כִּי־יִדְרֹךְ נֶדְרָ לַיהוָה אִי־הִשָּׁבַע שְׁבַע לְאִסְרֹךְ אִסְרֹךְ עַל־נַפְשׁוֹ

The LXX finds equivalents for the verbal parallels: ὅς ἂν εὐξήται εὐχὴν κυρίῳ ἢ ὁμόσῃ ὄρκον ἢ ὀρίσῃται ὀρισμῶ. Aristophanes *Lys.* 187 τίν' ὄρκον ὀρκώσεις ποθ' ἡμᾶς; "What oath will you make us swear?"; Thucydides 8.75.2 ὄρκωσαν πάντας τοὺς στρατιώτας τοὺς μεγίστους ὄρκους "they made all the soldiers swear the greatest oaths."

8.1.4.3 An oblation

Isa 30,1 "and to pour a [treaty-]oblation," מִסֵּכָה יִנְסֹךְ; Thucydides 5.14.4 (cf. 4.16.2), "they did not wish to make another treaty," καὶ ἀλλὰς [σπονδὰς] οὐκ ἠθέλον σπένδεσθαι.

8.1.4.4 An observance

Deut 11,1 וְשָׁמַרְתָּ מִשְׁמֶרֶת יְיָ "and you shall keep his observance," LXX φυλάξῃ τὰ φυλάγματα αὐτοῦ. Plato *Leg.* 758D τὰς φυλακὰς ταύτας φυλάττειν "to watch over these matters" (literally Xenophon *Anab.* 2.6.10 "to stand guard"); Rome-Jews (49, I Makk 8,26) φυλάξονται τὰ φυλάγματα αὐτῶν "they shall keep their obligations."⁸

8.1.5 A treaty is "cut," with reference to sacrificial animals

With Deut 29,13 (8.1.1 above) and its double object cf. *Iliad* 3.73 etc. "cutting friendship and faithful oaths," φιλότητα καὶ ὄρκια πιστὰ ταμόντες. A single object is commoner: Gen 21,32 וַיִּכְרְתוּ בְרִית "And they cut a covenant," LXX διέθεντο διαθήκη; *Iliad* 2.124 "cutting faithful oaths," ὄρκια πιστὰ ταμόντες. That these are sacrificial animals is shown by *Iliad* 3.268-9 where heralds "led the 'faithful oaths' of the gods," ὄρκια πιστὰ θεῶν σύναγον.

8 See Weinfeld 1973, 193.

So Sefire (16 = KAI 222.A7, 8th cent. BC) "And these agreements are those which Bargaiah cut,"

וּעֲדִיא אֶלֶן זִי גֹזֵר בַּרְגַּאִיָּה

Law of Chios (23, 575-550 BC) ὄρκια ἐπιτάμνεται "let him make an agreement"; of Halicarnassus (29, 465-450 BC) κατοπερ τα ὄρκια ἐτάμον "as they made the agreement." Euripides *Helen* 1235 with a bold mixture of idioms σπονδὰς τέμωμεν "let us cut libations"(!). The Greek usage is Ionic: Homer, Herodotus,⁹ these civic documents, and by imitation Polybius.¹⁰ Casabona 218 is inclined to derive the Greek usage from the Semitic by *les rites de pactes militaires*.¹¹

8.1.6 One may speak of "breaking" a treaty which has been "cut"

Deut 31,16 (cf. Jer 11,10) "And [this people] will break my covenant which I cut with them,"

וְהָפֵן אֶת-בְּרִיתִי אֲשֶׁר כָּרַתִּי אִתּוֹ

Iliad 3.105-107 "And bring the strength of Priam so that he may cut the oaths himself (ὄφρ' ὄρκια τάμνη / αὐτός), for his sons are arrogant and untrustworthy (ἄπιστοι), lest some man damage the oaths of Zeus (Διὸς ὄρκια δηλήσεται) by overstepping them." Livy 1.24.4 *foedus ferire* "to strike a treaty"; 2.33.4 *ictum foedus* "a treaty was struck"; 42.40.3 *foedus rumpit* "he broke the treaty," Cicero *de domo sua* 66 *fregit foedus*. The metaphor comes from breaking the tablet or stone seen as identical with the treaty; to *break a treaty* remains normal English.¹²

8.1.7 To break the tablet is to break the treaty

Vassal Treaties of Esarhaddon 410-413 (17, 680 BC) "If you remove [this tablet], consign it to fire, throw it into water, bury it in dust, or by some trick destroy, annihilate or turn it face down..." Ex 32,19 (cf. Deut 9,17) "And he threw the tablets out of his hands and broke them at the foot of the mountain." Elis-Heraea (26, ab. 500 BC) "If anybody destroys these (Attic ταδί) written letters," ΑΙ ΔΕ ΤΙΡ ΤΑ ΓΡΑΦΕΑ ΤΑΙ ΚΑΔΑΛΕΟΙΤΟ. Curse at Teos (ab. 470 BC)¹³

9 Herodotus 4.70 (cf. 8.1.8 below) and 4.201.2 (8.3.2 below).

10 Polybius 21.32.9, 15; 21.43.1; 29.3.6.

11 See Weinfeld 1973, 196; Karavites 61ff.

12 See Casabona 211-220; Weinfeld 1973, 197.

13 Meiggs-Lewis p. 64 no. 30.35-39. See p. 52 above.

"Whoever breaks the stelae in which the curse is written, or cuts out letters (*phoinikeia*) or makes them unreadable...".¹⁴

ΟΣ ΑΝ ΤΑΣΤΗΛΑΣ: ΕΝ ΗΙΣΙΝ ΗΠΑΡΗΣ ΓΕΓΡΑΠΤΑΙ: Η ΚΑΤΑΞΕΙ: Η ΦΟΙΝΙΚΗΙΑ: ΕΚΚΟΨΕ[Ι:]
Η ΑΦΑΝΕΑΣ ΠΟΙΗΣΕΙ

The urgency of preserving the written text shows that there was little sense of a binding oral agreement whereof the written document was a mere record. Diodorus 12.13.2 says that written treaties are the most reliable.

8.1.8 A covenant is cut with a bloody sacrifice

Ex 24,8 "Behold the blood of the covenant that Yahweh has cut with you,"

הִנֵּה דַם־הַבְּרִית אֲשֶׁר כָּרַת יְהוָה עִמָּכֶם

Ps 50,5 "those who have cut my covenant over a sacrifice":

כָּרַתִּי בְרִיתִי עָלֵי־זֶבֶחַ

Herodotus 4.70 the Scythians "mix together [with wine] the blood of those making the compact," αἷμα συμμίσγουσσι τῶν τὸ ὄρκιον ταμνομένων, dip weapons in it and drink it. So in *Götterdämmerung* I.2 Siegfried and Gunther drink each others' blood in *Blut-Brüderschaft*. At Euripides *Supp.* 1196, 1202 Theseus is to "cut victims" (τέμνειν σφάγια) over a tripod and "engrave oaths" (ἐγγράψων ὄρκους) on it.¹⁵ See in general Chapter 6.5 above.

8.1.9 A treaty may be designated by a pair of nouns naming the oath (or some other formal feature) and the promised result

Deut 7,9 "the faithful God keeping covenant and mercy with those who love him,"¹⁶

הָאֵל הַנֶּאֱמָן שָׁמַר הַבְּרִית וְהַחֶסֶד לְאֲהַבָיו

Sefire (16 = KAI 223.B2, ab. 750 BC) "the treaty and goodness which the gods have made":

עֲדִיא וטבתא ז[ני] עבדו אלהן

See *Iliad* 3.73 (8.1.5 above). Acarnanians (32 = Thucydides 3.114.3, 426 BC) "and for the time thereafter they made a treaty and alliance for a hundred years," καὶ ἐς τὸν ἔπειτα χρόνον σπονδάς καὶ ξυμμαχίαν ἐποίησαντο ἑκατὸν ἔτη. Aetolians-Acarnanians (43, ab. 263 BC, heading of bronze stele) ΣΥΝΘΗΚΑ ΚΑΙ ΣΥΜΜΑΧΙΑ "Treaty and Military Alliance." Hannibal-Philip

14 In general see Weinfeld *bryt* 265.

15 See Casabona 212-219.

16 When Hiram and Solomon "cut a treaty" the result is "peace" (I Reg 5,26); Briquel-Chatonnet 41-44.

(47, 215 BC); Livy 23.33.9 summarizing the actual text in Polybius 7.9 *foedusque cum eo atque amicitiam iungit* "[Xenophanes] made a treaty and friendship with [Hannibal]." ¹⁷

8.1.10 Clauses may be added or subtracted only by joint agreement, but not at all if a god is one partner

Athens-Sparta (34 = Thucydides 5.23.6, 421 BC);¹⁸ Rome-Latins (27 = Dionysius Hal. 6.95.2, 493 BC); Hannibal-Philip (47 = Polybius 7.9.17, 215 BC); Rome-Astypaleia (50, 105 BC) 46. Contrast Deut 13,1 (cf. 4,2; Koh 3,14) "You shall not add to [what I command you] nor take from it"; Rev 22,18-19 "If anyone adds to these things, God will add to him the plagues written in this book; and if anyone takes away from the words of the book of this prophecy, God will take away his share in the tree of life."

8.1.11 The agreement is recited and renewed annually or periodically

Suppiluliuma-Kurtiwaza (05, 1350 BC) "At regular intervals(?) shall they read [this tablet] in the presence of the king of Mitanni." Deut 31,10-11 "At the end of every seven years...at the feast of booths...you shall read this law before all Israel in their ears." Peace of Nicias (33 = Thucydides 5.18.9, 421 BC) "and both parties shall renew the oath annually," τὸν δὲ ὄρκον ἀνανεοῦσθαι κατ' ἐνιαυτὸν ἀμφοτέρους.¹⁹ Malla-Lyttos (46, 221 BC) "And let them read the stele annually," ἀναγιγνώσκοντων δὲ τὰν [Σ]τάλαν κατ' ἐνιαυτὸν at stated festivals of each city in the presence of representatives of the other. At the accession of Tiberius in AD 14, Tacitus *Ann.* 1.8 *addebat Messala Valerius renouandum per annos sacramentum in nomen Tiberii* "Messala Valerius added the proposal that the oath to Tiberius' name should be renewed annually."²⁰

17 Karavites 194-200 discusses the duration of the treaty. Weinfeld 1973 *passim* discusses a formula with two near-synonyms denoting the treaty's expected result of "peace and friendship" etc. It is well-attested in the Greek world but not in Akkadian; and the Hebrew examples ("peace and prosperity" Deut 23,7, "good and prosperity" Jer 33,9) are not in covenantal context.

18 This provision was a cause of concern to others, Thucydides 5.29.2, 5.47.12.

19 The same year Athens and Sparta further made a treaty (34 = Thucydides 5.23.4), which is to be renewed annually; and now delegations from each party shall go to the other at a stated festival.

20 Generally see Weinfeld 1976, 393-4; Herrmann 107-110; Karavites 187-194.

8.1.12 A whole people including women and children may take the oath

II Chron 15,13.15 (cf. Deut 29, 1.10) "...from small to great, from man to woman ...and all Judah rejoiced at the oath (הַשְּׁבוּעָה)." Therans-Cyreneans (22) 44-46 "making a curse on themselves and all coming together (ΕΠΙΛΕΩΜΕΝΟΙ ΠΑΝΤΕΣ ΣΥΝΕΝΘΟΝΤΕΣ), men and women and boys and girls." Augustus *Res Gestae* V.25 IVRAVIT IN MEA VERBA TOTA ITALIA SPONTE SUA "All Italy of its own accord swore in my words." Tacitus *Hist.* 2.81 under Vespasian, *Syria omnis in eodem sacramento fuit* "All Syria was under the same oath."²¹

8.2 Provisions of the loyalty-oath.²²

8.2.1 "I will have no lord but you"

Suppiluliuma-Hukkanas (08, 1350 BC)²³ "You, Hukkanas, recognize as to lordship the Sun [the Great King of Hatti] alone." Vassal Treaties of Esarhaddon 301 (17, 680 BC) "Another king, another lord you shall not set over yourselves." In the original Decalogue, Ex 20,3 (cf. Deut 5,7) "You shall not have another god (but Luther *andere Götter*) before me,"

לֹא יִהְיֶה לְךָ אֱלֹהִים אֲחֵרִים עַל-פָּנָי

LXX οὐκ ἔσονται σοι θεοὶ ἕτεροι πλὴν ἐμοῦ. At Deut 6,13 over and above the Hebrew, LXX MS "A" has "you shall worship him *alone*," αὐτῷ μόνῳ λατρεύσεις, whence the citation in Matt 4,10 = Luk 4,8. Oath of the Cypriotes to Tiberius (53, AD 14)²⁴ "and to propose the voting of [divine honors] with the other gods solely to Rome and Tiberius Caesar Augustus [space of 12 letters]²⁵ son of Augustus and to the sons of his blood and to none other at all":

-
- 21 See Weinfeld 1976, 392-393 and footnote 137 on features of the "mass assembly"; Karavites 127-147 on role of the "people" (Homeric and Near Eastern).
 - 22 I have treated a number of these from a somewhat different point of view in "From Hesiod to Jesus: Laws of Human Nature in the Ancient World," *NovT* 35 (1993) 313-343.
 - 23 Similarly in the "Instruction for Hittite Officers" (04) 1.13, "As to lordship, do not recognize another man."
 - 24 Mitford lines 17-21 = Herrmann 214.
 - 25 The space was to allow the insertion of ΑΥΤΟΚΡΑΤΟΡΟΣ "Imperator" if that title should be voted Tiberius.

μετά τε τῶν ἄλλων θεῶν μόνοις Ῥώμῃ καὶ Τιβερίῳ Καίσαρι Σεβαστοῦ
 υἱῷ Σεβαστῷ [νν 12] υἱοῖς τε τοῦ αἵματος αὐτοῦ καὶ οὐδενὶ ἄλλῳ τῶν
 πάντων εἰσηγήσασθαι ψηφίσι[α]σ[θαι].

At Joh 19,15 the high priests are aware of the loyalty oath, throwing it back
 in Pilate's face, "we have no king but Caesar," οὐκ ἔχομεν βασιλέα εἰ μὴ
 Καίσαρα.²⁶ The claims of God in the Decalogue and of Caesar were based
 on the same Near Eastern prototype. Mark 12,17 makes them incompatible,
 "render to Caesar the things of Caesar and to God the things of God."

8.2.2 "I will be friend to your friends and enemy to your enemies"²⁷

Suppiluliuma-Tette II.6 (06, 1350 BC)²⁸ "And with my friend he shall be
 friend, and with my enemy he shall be enemy." Exod 23,22 Yahweh promises
 reciprocally "I will be an enemy to your enemies and an adversary to your
 adversaries,"

וְאֶבְרַתִּי אֶת אֹיְבֵיךָ וְצַרְתִּי אֶת צַרְרֵיךָ

and Israel responds (Ps 139,21 etc., cf. II Chron 19,2) "Shall I not hate those
 who hate you, O Yahweh?"

הֲלוֹא מְשֻׁנְאֵיךָ יְהוָה אֲשֶׁנָּא

Yahweh it seems had no other friends to whom Israel could be friendly. But
 the Qumran *Manual of Discipline* I.4 restores the parallelism, "to love all
 that [God] has chosen and to hate all that he has rejected,"

וְלֹאֲהוֹב כּוֹל אֲשֶׁר בָּחַר וְלִשְׂנוֹא אֶת כּוֹל אֲשֶׁר מֵאָ

The same formula very common in Greek treaties. Thus Ionia-Athens (30
 = Aristotle *Ath. Pol.* 23.5, 478-7 BC) "And [Aristides] swore oaths to the
 Ionians to have the same enemy and friend, to confirm which they sank
 lumps of iron in the sea," καὶ τοὺς ὄρκους ὤμοσεν τοῖς Ἴωσιν ὥστε τὸν
 αὐτὸν ἐχθρὸν εἶναι καὶ φίλον, ἐφ' οἷς καὶ τοὺς μύδρους ἐν τῷ πελάγει
 καθεῖσαν. The treaty was in perpetuity, "until the iron should reappear";
 Herodotus 1.165 (8.3.2 below) so explains a comparable clause. Athens-
 Corcyra (31 = Thucydides 3.75.1, 427 BC) in a formula of equality, "they

-
- 26 In Russian this becomes a beautiful truism, нет у нас царя кроме кесаря, where
 "tsar" is the same word as "Caesar," but entering the language earlier with different
 phonetics. The priests had made the same point earlier at Joh 19,12 "If you free this
 man you are not a friend of Caesar," for "friend" is a regular Hellenistic title.
- 27 Karavites 48-56 discusses more generally the role of friendship, φιλότης. See further
 Grotius 2.15.6.3 for a discussion of this provision.
- 28 Similarly in a letter of Suppiluliuma to Niqmadu of Ugarit (07, PRU iv.35 doc.
 17.132 lines 7-13; cf. pages 49 & 51) "Just as previously your fathers were friends
 and not enemies of Hatti, now, Niqmadu, likewise be enemy with my enemy and
 friend with my friend."

made a treaty to recognize the same friends and enemies," σπονδάς ... ποιησαμένους ... ὥστε τοὺς αὐτοὺς ἐχθροὺς καὶ φίλους νομίζειν. The normal formula of inequality in Athens-Sparta (36 = Xenophon *Hell.* 2.2.20, 404 BC) after Sparta won the war, "The Lacedaemonians made peace ... on the terms that [the Athenians] should have the same enemy and friend, *and follow the Lacedaemonians on land and sea wherever they should lead*":

Λακεδαιμόνιοι ... ἐποιοῦντο εἰρήνην ἐφ' ᾧ ... τὸν αὐτὸν ἐχθρὸν καὶ φίλον νομίζοντας Λακεδαιμονίοις ἔπεσθαι καὶ κατὰ γῆν καὶ κατὰ θάλατταν ὅποι ἂν ἡγῶνται.

"To follow wherever you lead" is itself a marginal provision of the loyalty oath: see the woman's promise Ruth 1,16 "I will go wherever you go":

לְאֵלֹהֵי יְהוָה אֲלֶיךָ אֵלֵךְ

LXX σὺ ὅπου ἐὰν πορευθῆς πορεύσομαι; it is formulaic in the New Testament, Matt 8,19 = Luk 9,57 ἀκολουθήσω σοι ὅπου ἐὰν ἀπέρχῃ, and compare Joh 13,36; Rev 14,4.

The theme continues with Hellenistic-Roman rulers. Eumenes-Antigonos (42 = Plutarch *Eumenes* 12.2, 319 BC) "to be loyal...to have the same enemy and friend," εὐνοῆσειν ... τὸν αὐτὸν ἐχθρὸν ἕξειν καὶ φίλον. Paphlagonian oath to Augustus (52 = OGIS 532.12-13, 3 BC) "recognizing as friends those whom [Augustus and his descendants] recognize, and considering as enemies those whom they determine," [φί]λους ἡγού[μενος] οὓς ἂν ἐκεῖνοι ἡγῶντα[ι] ἐχθροὺς τε ν[ομίζων] οὓς ἂν αὐτοὶ κρίνωσιν. Cypriotes to Tiberius (53, AD 14) "to have the same friend and enemy as they," τὸν αὐτὸν ἐκείνοις φίλον τε καὶ ἐχθρὸν ἕξειν. Lusitanians to Caligula (54 = ILS 90.5-7, AD 37-41)²⁹ "That I will whole-heartedly (cf. 8.2.4 below) be an enemy to those whom I learn to be enemies to Gaius Caesar Germanicus," EX MEA ANIMI SENTENTIA VT EGO IIS INIMICVS ERO QVOS C. CAESARI GERMANICO INIMICOS ESSE COGNOVERO.

Likewise the principle of individual heroic conduct and of *Realpolitik* (though later abrogated and reversed by philosophers and Jesus) is to "love one's friends and hate one's enemies." I have worked this out in detail elsewhere³⁰ and omit it here.³¹

29 Similarly an oath of the Assians, IGRR iv.251 = Smallwood no. 33.

30 "From Hesiod to Jesus: Laws of human nature in the ancient world," *NovT* 35 (1993) 313-343.

31 In general for this section see Weinfeld 1973, 198 note 103; — 1976, 390-391; Hermann 21-22.

8.2.3 "I will guard you more than my own life and children"

Ashurnirari V—Mati-ilu V.1-4 (15, 750 BC) "If our death is not your death, if our life is not your life, if you do not seek the life of Ashurnirari, his sons and officials, as your own life, and the life of your sons and officials..." Paphlagonians-Augustus 15-16 (52, 3 BC) "not to spare my body or soul or life or children," μήτε σώματος φείσεσθ[αι μή]τε ψυχῆς μήτε βίου μήτε τέκνων. Lusitanians-Caligula (54, AD 37)³² "I shall hold neither myself nor my children dearer than [Gaius'] safety," [NEQVE ME] NEQVE LIBEROS MEOS EIVS SALVTE CARIORES HABEBO. Luk 14,26 (cf. Matt 10,37-8, Mark 10,29) "If one comes after me and does not hate (οὐ μισεῖ) his father and mother and wife and children and brothers and sisters, and further his life (τὴν ψυχὴν αὐτοῦ), he cannot be my disciple."³³

8.2.4 "I will do it with all my heart [and all my soul, etc.]"

Suppiluliuma-Tette II.18 (06, 1350 BC)³⁴ "...and is not faithful with his heart..." Deut 6,5 (and frequently, cited Mark 12,30 and parallels) "And you shall love Yahweh your God with all your heart and all your life and all your strength":

וְאֶהְיֶה לְךָ לֵבָב וְכָל נַפְשִׁי וְכָל מְאֹדִי

LXX ... ἐξ ὅλης τῆς καρδίας σου καὶ ἐξ ὅλης τῆς ψυχῆς σου καὶ ἐξ ὅλης τῆς δυνάμεως σου. At Jer 32,41 Yahweh promises reciprocally "And I will plant them in this land in truth with all my heart and with all my soul":

וְנִטְעַתִּים בְּאֶרֶץ הַזֹּאת בְּאֵמֶת כְּכֹל לִבִּי וְכָל נַפְשִׁי

LXX [39,41] ... ἐν πίστει καὶ ἐν πάσῃ καρδίᾳ καὶ ἐν πάσῃ ψυχῇ.

Delphic amphictyony (19 = Aeschines 2.115) "to take vengeance with hand and foot and voice and all strength," τιμωρήσειν καὶ χειρὶ καὶ ποδὶ καὶ φωνῇ καὶ πάσῃ δυνάμει. Rome-Latins (27 = Dion. Hal. 6.95.2, 493 BC) "and they are to aid those who are fighting, with all their strength," βοηθεῖτωσάν τε τοῖς πολεμουμένοις ἀπάσῃ δυνάμει. Probably in a translation from Punic in Hannibal-Philip (47 = Polybius 7.9.8, 215 BC) "with all readiness and goodwill," μετὰ πάσης δὲ προθυμίας καὶ εὐνοίας Athens-Corcyra (37, 375 BC)³⁵ "I will assist the people of the Corcyreans with all my strength so far as I can," βοηθήσω Κορκυραίων τῷ δήμῳ παντὶ σθένει κατὰ τὸ δύνατον; and so reciprocally as restored. Smyrna-Magnesia (45,

32 Greek paraphrase at Dio Cassius 59.9.2.

33 See Weinfeld 1976, 385.

34 Also in the treaty Mursilis-Niqmepa, PRU iv.89.20.

35 Tod no. 127.17, and frequent in treaties of the 4th century BC.

243 BC) "with all readiness at every time," μετὰ πάσης προθυμίας ἐμ παντὶ καιρῷ. Oath to Eumenes II (44 = OGIS 266.31) "And I shall provide all other need gladly and without excuse with all readiness according to my ability": ... [με]τὰ πάσης προθυμίας εἰς δύναμιν εἶναι τὴν ἐμήν. Supposed treaty Rome-Jews (49 = I Makk 8,25-27) "And the nation of the Jews will fight as chance is given them with their whole heart...the Romans will fight from their soul as chance is given them," συμμαχήσει τὸ ἔθνος τῶν Ἰουδαίων ὡς ἂν ὁ καιρὸς ὑπογράφη αὐτοῖς καρδίᾳ πλήρῃ ... συμμαχήσουσιν οἱ Ῥωμαῖοι ἐκ ψυχῆς ... Antony's funeral oration over Caesar (51 = Appian *Bell. Civ.* 2.145) "And [Antony] again read the oaths that all would guard Caesar and Caesar's person with all their strength," καὶ αὐθις ἀνεγίνωσκε τοὺς ὄρκους ἢ μὴν φυλάξειν Καίσαρα καὶ τὸ Καίσαρος σῶμα παντὶ σθένει πάντας. The reciprocal promises of Yahweh here and at 8.2.2 suggest a treaty between equals as alternative model for the covenant. The phrases "so far as I can," "according to my ability," "as chance is given them" appear to be escape-clauses negotiated by the weaker party.³⁶

8.2.5 "I will be faithful night and day"

Vassal Treaties of Esarhaddon 198ff (17, 680 BC) "If someone in the palace starts a revolt, whether by day or by night, you must not listen to him." Oath of the ephebes of Dreros 36-41 (21, 220 BC) "[I swear] I will never think well of the men of Lyttos as a result of any means or contrivance, whether at night or by day".³⁷

ΜΗ ΜΑΝ ΕΓΩ ΠΟΚΑ ΤΟΙΣ ΛΥΤΤΙΟΙΣ ΚΑΛΩΣ ΦΡΟΝΗΣΕΙΝ ΜΗΤΕ ΤΕΧΝΑΙ ΜΗΤΕ ΜΑΧΑΝΑΙ ΜΗΤΕ ΕΝ ΝΥΚΤΙ ΜΗΤΕ ΠΕΔ ΑΜΕΡΑΝ.

8.2.6 "I will put my hand on the rebel"

Deut 13,10 "Your hand shall be the first to put [your brother the idolater] to death, and afterwards the hand of all the people." Oath of the Delphic amphictyony (19 = Aeschines 2.115, cf. 8.2.4 above) "And if anyone pillages the property of the god or knows of it or plans anything against the holy place, to avenge him with hand and foot and voice and all strength." Athenian

36 See Weinfeld 1973, 198 note 104; — 1976, 385; — *bryt* 261.

37 See further Weinfeld 1976, 388.

decree of 410 BC (Andocides *On the Mysteries* 97) "I will kill even with³⁸ my own hand if I can, whoever shall overthrow democracy in Athens":³⁹ κτενω̄ καὶ τῇ ἐμαντοῦ χειρί, ἂν δύνατος ᾶ, ὃς ἐὰν καταλύσῃ τὴν δημοκρατίαν τὴν Ἀθήνησι.

8.3 *The elements as divine witnesses*

8.3.1 Divinities prescribed or forbidden for oath or service are specified in a triple division of the universe: heaven, earth, [waters] under the earth

Ex 20,4 (= Deut 5,8) "any likeness of anything that is in heaven above, or that is in the earth beneath, or that is in the waters under the earth." *Iliad* 15.36-38 = *Odyssey* 5.184-186:

ἴστω νῦν τόδε Γαῖα καὶ Οὐρανὸς εὐρύς ὕπερθε
καὶ τὸ κατειβόμενον Στυγὸς ὕδωρ, ὃς τε μέγιστος
ῥρκος δεινότατός τε πέλει μακάρεσσι θεοῖσι.

"Now let Earth know this and broad Heaven above; and the downflowing water of Styx, which is the greatest and most feared oath for the blessed gods."⁴⁰ Livy 1.32.10: a Roman legate seeking reparations from a foreign people, if his requests are refused, says: *Audi, Iuppiter, et tu, Iane* [MSS Iuno] *Quirine, dique omnes caelestes uosque, terrestres, uosque, inferni, audite.* "Hear O Jupiter, and you Janus(?) Quirinus; and all the heavenly gods, and you the earthly ones, and you the infernal ones, hear."⁴¹

8.3.2 A covenant is to stand as long as the elements retain their mutual positions

Gen 8,22 in the covenant with Noah "All the days of the earth seedtime and harvest, cold and heat, summer and winter, day and night shall not cease":

38 I print the MS reading and omit the transposition of editors.

39 Akkadian texts state a more generalized duty not to hide rebels but to turn them in; Weinfeld 1976, 387-390. See Karavites 148-156 on the "fate of fugitives."

40 For a "great oath (*horkos*) of the gods" see Aeschylus *Agam.* 1284.

41 In what are in effect creation-texts there is a different triple division, namely of heaven, earth and sea: Ex 20,11; *Iliad* 18.483, cf. Hesiod *Theog.* 427. See Ernst Günther Schmidt, "Himmel—Meer—Erde im frühgriechischen Epos und im alten Orient," *Philologus* 126 (1981) 1-24; Burkert, *Orient. Rev.* (Eng. edit.) 90-91. In the triple division of the universe by lot at *Iliad* 15.187-193 Poseidon gets the sea, Hades the "misty darkness," and Zeus the broad heaven "both in brightness and in clouds," while earth and Olympos are shared.

עד כַּל־יְמֵי הָאָרֶץ יָרַע וְקָצִיר וְקָר נָחַם
וְקִיץ וְחֹרֶף וַיּוֹם וְלַיְלָה לֹא יִשְׁבְּתוּ

Of Azitawadd it is said (KAI 26C.V.6-7, 720 BC) "May the name of Azitawadd stand forever like the name of the sun and moon":

[שם] אֹתוֹר {י} יִכֵּן לְעֵלָם כִּם שֶׁם שֶׁמֶשׁ וַיִּרָא

Deut 11,21 "So that your days and the days of your sons may be long in the land which Yahweh swore to your fathers to give them, all the days that the heavens are above the earth,"

... כִּימֵי הַשָּׁמַיִם עַל־הָאָרֶץ

Ps 89,36-38 (cf. 72,5-7) "Once for all I have sworn by my holiness. I will not lie to David. His seed shall be forever, and his throne as the sun before me. Like the moon, it will be established forever."

אֶחָת נִשְׁבַּעְתִּי בְקִדְשִׁי אִם לְדוֹר אֲכַזֵּב
וְרָעוּ לְעוֹלָם יִהְיֶה וְכִסְאוֹ כְשֶׁמֶשׁ נִגְדִי
בְּיָרֵחַ יִכּוֹן עוֹלָם

God's oath is in the usual human form with אִם except that of course the curse cannot be prefixed, "God do so to me and more also, if..." Jer 33,25-26 (cf. 31,33-37 and 33,20-21):

אִם לֹא בְרִיתִי יוֹמָם וְלַיְלָה חֻקוֹת שָׁמַיִם וָאָרֶץ לֹא־שָׁמַתִּי גַם־יָרַע וְעָקוֹב וְדוֹר עַבְדִּי

אֲמַאֵס

"If I have not established my covenant [as in fact I have] as regards day and night, the ordinances of heaven and earth, I will also reject the seed of Jacob, and David my servant." The use of בְּרִית "covenant" here with heaven and earth suggests that a connection was felt with בָּרָא "create."

In the *Foedus Cassianum* between Rome and the Latins (27 = Dion. Hal. 6.95.2, 493 BC) "Let there be mutual peace between the Romans and all the cities of the Latins as long as heaven and earth have the same position,"⁴² Ῥωμαίοις καὶ ταῖς Λατίνων πόλεσιν ἀπάσαις εἰρήνην πρὸς ἀλλήλους ἔστω, μέχρις ἂν οὐρανός τε καὶ γῆ τὴν αὐτὴν στάσιν ἔχωσι. At Herodotus 1.165.2-3 the Phocaeen colonists "made strong curses on the man who should desert them.... And they sank a lump of iron in the sea, and swore not to return to Phocaea until 'this lump shall reappear':"

ἐποίησαντο ἰσχυρὰς κατάρας τῷ καταλειπομένῳ ... καὶ μύδρον σιδήρεον κατεπόντωσαν καὶ ὄμοσαν μὴ πρὶν ἐς Φώκαιαν ἦξειν πρὶν ἢ τὸν μύδρον τοῦτον ἀναφανῆναι.

Still more than half of them got homesick and became "false to their oath," ψευδόρκοι. So in the treaty Athens-Ionia (30 cited at 8.2.2 above = Aristotle *Ath. Pol.* 23.5). Athenian oath (Herodotus 8.143.2) to [an earlier] Alexander

42 In fact the treaty itself was still extant in Latin in the time of Cicero "on a bronze column behind the Rostra" (Cicero *pro Balbo* 53, cf. Livy 2.33.9).

of Macedon, "We will never join alliance with Xerxes so long as the sun keeps the same course which it now travels," ἔστ' ἂν ὁ ἥλιος τὴν αὐτὴν ὁδὸν ἦ τῆ περ καὶ νῦν ἔρχεται, μήκοτε ὁμολογήσειν ἡμέας Ξέρξη.

The formula lent itself to an ambiguous oath. At Herodotus 4.201.2 the Persians besieging Barca dig a trench and cover it by night. "Then they made the following agreement, striking oaths on the hidden trench, that the oath should remain valid in the land 'as long as this earth remains thus':"

τὴν δὲ ὁμολογίην ἐποιεῦντο τοιήνδε τινὰ, ἐπὶ τῆς κρυπτῆς τάφρου τάμνοντες ὄρκια, ἔστ' ἂν ἡ γῆ αὕτη οὕτως ἔχῃ, μένειν τὸ ὄρκιον κατὰ χώρην. Then when the men of Barca are off guard the Persians break down the covering and occupy the city.⁴³ In *Macbeth* (V.v) it is the supernatural power that engages in "equivocation" and "lies like truth" when Birnam wood comes to Dunsinane.

8.3.3 Divine elemental witnesses to a treaty are heaven and earth, rivers and springs

Suppiluliuma-Tette IV.44 (06, 1350 BC):⁴⁴ "Mountains, rivers, springs, the great sea, heaven and earth, winds, clouds." Sfire (16 = KAI 222.A11-12, 750 BC) "In the presence of heaven [and earth, of the Deep(?)] and springs, of day and night":

וקדם שמי[ן] וארק וקדם צו[ל]ה ומעינן וקדם יום ולילה

Deut 30,19 (cf. Ps 50,4) "I call heaven and earth to witness against you this day":

הַעִידֵתִי בְּכֶם הַיּוֹם אֶת הַשָּׁמַיִם וְאֶת הָאָרֶץ

Micah 6,2 "Hear, you mountains, the controversy of Yahweh, and you enduring foundations of the earth":

שָׁמְעוּ הַרִים אֶת דְּבַר יְהוָה וְהַאֲתָנִים מַסְדֵי אֶרֶץ

The strong personification of the Hebrew texts suggests that the treaty invocations were a living tradition.

Iliad 3.276-280 (and cf. 19.258-60), treaty before the duel:

Ζεῦ πάτερ, Ἴδηθεν μεδέων, κύδιστε μέγιστε,
Ἥελιός θ', ὃς πάντ' ἐφορᾷς καὶ πάντ' ἐπακούεις,
καὶ ποταμοὶ καὶ γαῖα, καὶ οἱ ὑπένερθε καμιόντας
ἀνθρώπους τίνυσσον, ὅτις κ' ἐπίορκον ὁμόσση,
ὑμεῖς μάρτυροι ἔστε, φυλάσσετε ὄρκια πιστά.

43 See Weinfeld 1973, 198-9 note 109.

44 Akkadian text in Sumerian ideograms, Weidner 1923, 69; similar text at PRU iv.90.6-7; same list in Hittite with similar ideograms in the treaty Mursilis—Duppi-Teshub, 09. Reconstruction of the formula at ANET³ 204. The treaty Suppiluliuma-Kurtiwaza (05) for "springs, the great sea" has "Tigris and Euphrates."

"Zeus father, watching from Ida, most honored and greatest,⁴⁵ and you Sun who see all things and hear all things, and rivers and earth, and you two⁴⁶ who below take vengeance on men that have died and broken an oath; you be witnesses, and guard these faithful oaths." Note how extensively this beautiful text echoes the language of the Hittite treaties.

Hannibal-Philip (47 = Polybius 7.9.2, 215 BC) "before...Sun and Moon and Earth, before rivers and seas and waters," ἐναντίον ... Ἡλίου καὶ Σελήνης καὶ Γῆς, ἐναντίον ποταμῶν καὶ λιμένων [MS δαιμόνων] καὶ ὑδάτων. This could go directly back to a Semitic source. See the commentary by Barré. Oath of Athenian epebes (20, 4th cent. BC) "Gods attesting: ...Thallo 'Increase,' Auxo 'Growth,' Hegemone, Heracles, frontiers of the fatherland, grainfields, barley fields, vineyards, olive-orchards, fig-orchards": Ἴστορες {ο} θεοί ... Θαλλῶ, Αὐξώ, Ἡγεμόνη, Ἡρακλῆς, ὄροι τῆς πατρίδος, πυροί, κριθαί, ἄμπελοι, ἐλάαι, συκαί. Cf the metrical oath (ἔμμετρον ὄρκον Plutarch *Demosth.* 9.4) ascribed to the orator:

μὰ γῆν, μὰ κρήνας, μὰ ποταμούς, μὰ νάματα

"by earth, by springs, by rivers, by fountains."⁴⁷ Oath of the epebes of Dreros on Crete (21) "and earth and heaven and heroes and heroines and springs and rivers," ΚΑΙ ΤΑΓ ΓΑΝ ΚΑΙ ΟΥΡΑΝΟΝ ΚΑΙ ΗΡΩΑΣ ΚΑΙ ΗΡΑΣΣΑΣ ΚΑΙ ΚΡΑΝΑΣ ΚΑΙ ΠΟΤΑΜΟΥΣ. Maussollus-Phaselis (39, 4th cent. BC) "swearing by Zeus and Sun and Earth," [ΟΜΟΣ]ΑΝΤΕΣ ΔΙΑ ΚΑΙ ΑΛΙΟΝ ΚΑΙ ΓΑΝ.⁴⁸ Philo *Spec. Leg.* II.⁵⁴⁹ permits and seems to encourage an oath by "earth, sun, stars, heaven, the whole universe," γῆν, ἥλιον, ἀστέρας, οὐρανόν, τὸν σύμπαντα κόσμον. But Jesus at Matt 5,34-5 (cf. 23,16-22) quoting Isa 66,1 says "Do not swear at all: either by heaven, for it is the throne of God; or by earth, for it is his footstool."⁵⁰

8.3.4 An aggrieved party calls on the witnessing elements, in particular heaven and earth, to testify that a covenant has been broken

The book of Isaiah begins (1,2) "Listen, heavens, and hear, earth, for Yahweh has spoken: Sons I have reared and brought up, and they have rebelled against me":

45 Source of the Latin formula *Iuppiter Optimus Maximus* (e.g. Livy 1.12.7).

46 Pluto and Persephone.

47 But perhaps a parody by the comic poet Antiphanes, see Plutarch *Mor.* 845B, Antiphanes frag. 296 (Kock ii.128).

48 The triad is very frequent in Hellenistic treaties.

49 LCL ed. vii.308.

50 See Weinfeld 1976, 395-397; Barré 88-93; Grotius 2.13.11.1.

שְׁמַעוּ שָׁמַיִם וְהָאָרֶץ וְהַיָּם וְהַיַּבֵּשׁ
 כִּי יְהוָה דִּבֶּר
 בְּנֵי אֱדֹמִים וְגִלְגָּלַיִם וְרֹמְמַתַּי
 הֵם שָׁעוּ בִּי

This theme, and the whole Hittite apparatus of the elemental witnesses, remarkably appears at Aeschylus *Prom. Bound* 88-92 in Prometheus' first words:

ὦ δῖος αἰθήρ καὶ ταχύπτεροι πνοαί,
 ποταμῶν τε πηγαί, ποντίων τε κυμάτων
 ἀνήριθμον γέλασμα, παμμῆτόρ τε γῆ,
 καὶ τὸν πανόπτην κύκλον ἡλίου καλῶ·
 ἴδεσθέ μ' οἶα πρὸς θεῶν πάσχω θεός.

"O divine Sky and swift-winged winds, the springs of the rivers, the innumerable laughter of the sea-waves, and Earth mother of all; I call also on the all-seeing wheel of the Sun; see what things I a god suffer at the hand of gods." And they are repeated in his last words (1091-3)

ὦ μητρόσ ἐμῆσ σέβασ, ὦ πάντων
 αἰθήρ κοινὸν φάος εἰλίσσων,
 ἐσορᾶσ μ' ὡσ ἔκδικα πάσχω.

"O honor of my mother [Earth], O Sky that rolls along the common light of all, you see what injustices I suffer."⁵¹

At Jer 31,35-37 and 33,19-22 the appeal to the elements is combined with the innumerability of sand and stars as in Aeschylus (Excursus E). With Isa 1,2 cf. Jer 2,12-13 "Be appalled, heavens, at this." In the Servant poems of II Isaiah the Servant out of his present suffering calls on the elements (on the basis of the covenant) to witness his future vindication: thus Isa 44,23 (cf. 49,13; 52,9) "Sing, heavens...; shout, foundations of the earth." Then at Isa 42,10 "Sing to Yahweh a new song" the subject is the elements as in Ps 96,1 "Sing to Yahweh a new song," 96,11 "Let the sea roar and all that fills it."

As the present book of Isaiah begins with the appeal to heaven and earth, at the end it invokes new heavens and a new earth (Isa 66,22) as witnesses to the eternity of Israel. The cited speeches of Prometheus are his first and last words of the play. Genesis begins with the creation of the covenantal witnesses as does the Fourth Gospel. Three prophetic books end with a curse: Isa 66,24; Jer 51,64; the Twelve, Mal 3,24; also the Apocalypse and the New Testament (Rev 22,18-19, cf. 8.1.10 above, the curse on one who adds or subtracts). The treaty format affects the overall Biblical structure.

Prometheus' first speech is a fusion of Mediterranean (as we have seen) and Indo-European elements. The "wheel of the sun" (also *Persae* 504 λαμπρός ἡλίου κύκλος) is an original IE phrase: thus *Rigveda* 6.56.3 *súraṣ cakráṃ*

51 See Weinfeld 1976, 395-7; Delcor.

hiraḡyāḡaḡ "the golden wheel of the sun."⁵² Further: Euripides *Electra* 465 κατέλαμπε ... κύκλος ἀελίοιο. Old Icelandic *sunnu... hvél*,⁵³ Old English *sunnan hweozul* translating *solis rotam*.⁵⁴ In Sanskrit the sun is the eye of all-seeing Varuna⁵⁵ as of Zeus in Greek. The theme is shared with Semitic, Ps 33,18 "the eye [here uniquely singular] of Yahweh is on those who fear him":

הָנָה עֵינַי יְהוָה אֶל־יְרֵאָיו

For the "swift-winged winds" see Ps 18,11 (cf. 104,3) "on the wings of the wind," עַל־כַּנְפֵי־רוּחַ; for the "laughter of the sea" cf. Ps 98,8 "let the rivers clap their hands": נְהַרְרוּת יַמָּאֻר־כַּף. At Rom 8,22 Paul affirms "we know that the whole creation groans and travails together until now"; this again takes up the theme of the Suffering Servant, for what the creation witnesses and shares is the suffering of the people of God together with that of Christ, Rom 8,17 συμπάσχομεν.

8.4 The curses of the oath-taker on himself

As the most concrete feature of the treaty, the curses which the oath-taker must accept, or pronounce on himself, are the clearest indication of a specific connection between cultures. Their extension into apparently non-covenantal realms suggests that a treaty still lies in the background. In the Semitic world they are especially studied by Crawford and Hillers.

8.4.1 The curse consists of pledging one's life by a symbolic action

This holds in general: here are some more examples. The action is accompanied by a wish that the maker may suffer in the same way if he breaks his oath. Vassal-Treaties of Esarhaddon 652-654 (17, 680 BC): "Just as this waterskin is slit and its water runs out, so may your waterskins be slit in a region of thirst and famine." II Reg 6,30-31 "And [the king of Israel] tore his garments...and said, 'God do so to me and more also [i.e., tear me apart]

כֹּה־יַעֲשֶׂה־לִי אֱלֹהִים וְכֹה יוֹסֵף

if the head of Elisha the son of Shaphat remains on him today." Neh 5,13 "I also shook out my lap and said, 'So may God shake out every man from his

52 See Schmitt 166-167.

53 *Harmsöl* 36.7, Schmitt p. 169.

54 OED s.v. "wheel," III.8, ca AD 1000, *Hymns* (Surtees) 22/25.

55 West, *Works and Days* on vs. 267. For the eye of the divinity see my "Men of the land...", ZAW 95 (1983) 376-402, p. 379 fn 16.

house and from his labor who does not perform this promise. So may he be shaken out and emptied.' And all the assembly said Amen," accepting the curse. At *Iliad* 3.299-301 before the duel Achaeans and Trojans pray to Zeus and the other gods

ὁπότεροι πρότεροι ὑπὲρ ὄρκια πημήνειαν,
ὧδέ σφ' ἐγκέφαλος χαμάδις ῥέει ὡς ὄδε οἶνος,
αὐτῶν καὶ τεκέων, ἄλοχοι δ' ἄλλοισι δαμεῖεν.

"Whichever ones first violate these oaths, let their brains flow out on the ground like this wine, theirs and their children's; and let their wives be subjected (var. μιγεῖεν) to others."⁵⁶

8.4.2 "As this wax melts, so may I melt"

Hittite soldiers' oath I.41 (03) "Just as this wax melts...whoever breaks these oaths, [shows disrespect to the king] of the Hatti [land], let him melt like [wax]." Vassals in the treaties of Esarhaddon (17, 680 BC) were kept busy with symbolic actions; at 608-611 "Just as one burns a wax figurine in fire, dissolves a clay one in water, so may they burn your figure in fire, submerge it in water."⁵⁷ Treaty of Sfire (16 = KAI 222A.35-39) "As this wax burns in the fire, so may Arpad burn and [its daughter cities?], and may Hadad sow in them salt⁵⁸...and as this man of wax is blinded, so may Matti-il be blinded":

איך זי תקד שעותא זא באש כן תקד ארפד ו[בנתה ר]בת ויזוע בהן הדר מלח ...
ואיך זי יעד גבר שעותא כן יעד מתעא[ל]

This magical action finds a sensational parallel in the oath of the Therans and colonists of Cyrene on a later stone (22, ab. 630 BC?):⁵⁹ "And making wax figures they burned them and made an oath (ΚΗΡΙΝΟΣ ΠΛΑΣΣΑΝΤΕΣ ΚΟΛΟΣΟΣ ΚΑΤΕΚΑΙΟΝ ΕΠΑΡΕΩΜΕΝΟΙ) all together, men, women, boys and girls [8.1.12 above], 'Whoever does not abide by these oaths but breaks them shall melt

56 The libation of wine generally stands for the pouring out of a life: *Iliad* 23.218-220, Lucretius 3.434.

57 Similar curse Hammurabi 28.37 (01); see Crawford 188.

58 Abimelech also sowed Shechem with salt (Jud 9,45); a widespread account in modern historians has Carthage sowed with salt in 146 BC, but this is a mere invention of a chapter in the Cambridge Ancient History: see R. T. Ridley, "To be taken with a pinch of salt: the destruction of Carthage," *Classical Philology* 81 (1986) 140-146, and further S. T. Stevens CP 83 (1988) 39-41, P. Visonà 41-42. Hadad appears as a hypocoristic king's name הדר (Gen 36,35) in Edom; Ἀδαδος Nicolaus of Damascus FGH 90 F 20 = Josephus AJ 7.101. But as a god Ἄδωδος Philo Byblius FGH 790 F 2.31; *Adad* Macrobius *Sat.* 1.23.17, and in compound names II Sam 8,3 הדר־עַר.

59 Meiggs-Lewis p. 5 no. 5.44-51.

and flow away like these figures (ΤΟΜ ΜΗ ΕΜΜΕΝΟΝΤΑ ΤΟΥΤΟΙΣ ΤΟΙΣ ΟΡΚΙΟΙΣ ΑΛΛΑ ΠΑΡΒΕΩΝΤΑ ΚΑΤΑΛΕΙΒΕΣΘΑΙ ΝΙΝ ΚΑΙ ΚΑΤΑΡΡΕΝ ΩΣΠΕΡ ΤΟΣ ΚΟΛΟΣΟΣ), himself and his offspring and possessions'," and likewise vice versa.⁶⁰

In the Psalms, the same symbolism in a curse on others. Ps 68,3 "As wax melts before fire, let the wicked perish before God":

כְּהִמָּס דֹּנַג מִפְּנֵי-אֵשׁ יֵאָכְדוּ רְשָׁעִים מִפְּנֵי אֱלֹהִים

LXX ὡς τήκεται κηρός ..., Jer. iux. Hebr. *sicut tabescit cera*. The sufferer of Ps 22,15 may feel himself rejected from the covenant, "My heart has become like wax, it is melted within my body":

הֲיֵה לִבִּי כְּדֹנַג נִמָּס בְּתוֹךְ מִעֵי

LXX ὡσεὶ κηρός τηκόμενος, Vg *tamquam cera liquescens*. In poetry it is sheer magic. The sorceress of Theocritus 2.28-9 says:

ὡς τοῦτον τὸν κηρὸν ἐγὼ σὺν δαίμονι τάκω,
ὡς τάκοιθ' ὑπ' ἔρωτος ὁ Μύνδιος αὐτίκα Δέλφιδς.

"As I melt this wax with the divinity (Hecate?), so may Delphis of Myndos speedily melt with love." Vergil at *Ecl.* 8.80-81, imitating Theocritus:

limus ut hic durescit et haec ut cera liquescit
uno eodemque igni, sic nostro Daphnis amore.

"As this clay hardens and this wax melts in one and the same fire, so may Daphnis in my love."

8.4.3 "As this animal is struck, so may I be struck"

Treaty of Sfire (16 = KAI 222.A.40) "Just as this calf is cut in two, so may Mati-il be cut in two, and his nobles be cut in two":

[ואיך זי] יגזר עגלא זנא כן יגזר מתעאל ויגזרן רבוה

Saul cuts up a yoke of oxen and sends them to Israel (as the Levite the body of his concubine, Jud 19,29) and says (I Sam 11,7) "Whoever does not come out after Saul and Samuel, so shall it be done to his oxen"; but the narrator may have softened an original meaning "so shall it be done to *him*." Once in Israel as frequently elsewhere (6.9.4 above) those taking the oath pass between the halves of the victim: Jer 34,18 "And I shall make the men who broke my covenant...which they cut before me, as the calf which they cut in two and passed between its pieces."⁶¹

Livy 1.24.8 (28) gives the formula for determining the outcome of a war by representative combat:

60 Discussion Karavites 115 note 16; Bickerman 1950, 16; Weinfeld 1976, 400.

61 See Crawford 188; Karavites 63.

Si prior defexit publico consilio dolo malo, tum tu illo die Iuppiter⁶² populum Romanum sic ferito ut ego hunc porcum hic hodie feriam; tantoque magis ferito quanto magis potes pollesque.

"If [the Roman people] first departs [from these terms] by public consent with malice aforethought, then you, Jupiter, on that day so strike the Roman people as I here today strike this pig; and strike as much harder as you are more powerful and stronger." Then the priest strikes the pig with a flint (*saxo silice*). Perhaps the same flint was used every time, brought out from the temple of Jupiter Feretrius: so Festus⁶³ s.v. *Feretrius, ex cuius templo sumebant sceptrum per quod iurarent et lapidem silicem quo foedus ferirent* "from whose temple they brought a staff for them to swear by and a flint for them to strike the compact with," where the *foedus* is identified with the pig. Also the flint is identified with Jupiter: Servius on *Aen.* 8.641 says that the fetial priests determined that the pig should be struck with a flint *ea causa quod antiqui Iouis signum lapidem silicem putauerunt esse* "because the ancients thought the flint to be a sign of Jupiter."

Somehow then this flint is related to the *Iuppiter lapis* thrown away in an oath (8.4.4); but not the same, if it is kept for the next sacrifice. The throwaway stone is first attested in the old treaty with Carthage; the stone to strike an animal seems Punic, since Livy ascribes its use to Hannibal (21.45.8), unless Livy is giving him a Roman custom:

agnum laeua manu dextra silicem retinens, si falleret, Iouem ceterosque precatus deos, ita se mactarent quem ad modum ipse agnum mactasset, secundum precationem caput pecudis saxo elisit.

"He held a lamb in his left hand and a flint in his right, and prayed Jupiter and the other gods that, if he broke his word, they should slay him just as he slew the lamb; then accordingly he struck the animal's head with the stone."

8.4.4 "As I throw away this stone, so may I be thrown away"

Jer 51,63-64 "When you finish reading this book, tie a stone to it, and throw it into the middle of the Euphrates, saying, 'So shall Babylon sink, to rise no more!':"

כָּכָה תִּשְׁקַע בְּבַל וְלֹא תִקּוּם

Jesus says of an offender (Matt 18,6), "It would be better for him, if a millstone were hung around his neck, and he were cast into the sea."

Polybius (3.26.1) found an old treaty between Rome and Carthage on a bronze tablet in the treasury of the quaestors, in archaic Latin (3.22.3),

62 MSS *tum ille dies Iuppiter*; I print Ogilvie's conjecture.

63 Ed. Lindsay 81.16.

usually put at 508/7 BC (25). In it the Romans swore (Polybius 3.25.6-9) by Δία λίθον, i.e. (below) *per Iouem lapidem*: "he who makes the oaths concerning the treaty (ὁ ποιούμενος τὰ ὄρκια περὶ τῶν συνθηκῶν)" takes the stone and says, if he breaks the oath, "May I alone be cast away, even as this stone now" (ἐγὼ μόνος ἐκπέσοιμι οὕτως ὡς ὄδε λίθος νῦν) and throws the stone away. Cinna so took the oath of loyalty to Sulla, saying before witnesses (Plutarch *Sulla* 10.4) "May I be thrown out of the city, as this stone out of my hand," ἐκπεσεῖν ἐκ τῆς πόλεως, ὥσπερ ὁ λίθος διὰ τῆς χειρός. To swear "by Jupiter the Stone" *Iouem lapidem iurare* (Cicero *Fam.* 7.12.2) was the most sacred (Gellius 1.21.4) and oldest oath (Apuleius *de deo Soc.* 5). Festus⁶⁴ gives the formula:

lapidem silicem tenebant iuraturi per Iouem, haec uerba dicentes, Si sciens fallo, tum me Dispiter salua urbe arceque bonis eiciat, ut ego hunc lapidem.

"Those who were to swear by Jupiter held a flint stone and said these words, 'If knowingly I break this oath, then may Dispiter, while maintaining the city and citadel in safety, throw me out of my possessions, as I throw this stone'." See 8.4.3 above.

8.4.5 "May the king be cast down from his throne and his sceptre broken"

Among numerous curses in the Code of Hammurabi on a ruler who violates it is (01)⁶⁵ "May mighty Anum, the father of the gods..., break his scepter....May Sin...deprive him of the crown [and] throne of sovereignty."⁶⁶ In the Ugaritic tale of Baal and Anat⁶⁷ *lyhpk ksa mlkk, lytbr hī mīptk* "[E] will overthrow the throne of your kingship, he will break the staff of your judgement." The sarcophagus of Ahiram of Byblos (13 = KAI 1, 1000 BC) says of whoever violates it, "The staff of his justice shall be broken, the throne of his kingship shall be overturned" (the latter clause as the Ugaritic):

תחתף חטר משפטה תהתפך כסא מלכה

Isa 14,5 of the king of Babylon (cf. 9,3; 14,29; Jer 48,17; Sach 10,11) "Yahweh has broken the staff of the wicked, the sceptre of rulers":

שִׁבְר יְהוָה מִטָּה רַשְׁעִים שִׁבְט מִשְׁלֵיָם

Ps 89,45 complains "And you have cast [David's] throne to the ground":⁶⁸

64 Festus s.v. *lapidem silicem*, p. 102 Lindsay.

65 Code of Hammurabi rev. 26.45-51 & 27.45 (ANET³ 179).

66 Similarly in the treaty of Shamshi-Adad V (14), Weidner 1932/3, 29.

67 Gordon UT 49.VI.28-29 = KTU 1.6.VI.28-29; tr. ANET³ 141.

68 Some editors radically emend the preceding clause in line with the general theme to read "You have removed the sceptre from his hand."

הַקִּיָּא לְאַרְךָ מִגְּתָךְ

Luk 1,52 following Sir 10,14 makes the old curse an occasion of rejoicing, "He has brought down the mighty from their thrones,"⁶⁹ καθεῖλεν δυναστὰς ἀπὸ θρόνων.

The double curse appears in tragedy. Io asks Prometheus (Aeschylus *PV* 761, 767) with two plurals of majesty "At whose hand will [Zeus] be stripped of his tyrant sceptre? ... Is he to be cast out of his throne by a wife?"

πρὸς τοῦ τύραννα σκῆπτρα συληθήσεται; ...

ἢ πρὸς δάμαρτος ἐξανίσταται θρόνων;

At 907-12 Zeus' coming marriage "will cast him unseen from his throne," θρόνων τ' ἄϊστον ἐκβαλεῖ; and so "the oath of his father Kronos will be accomplished, πατρός δ' ἀρὰ / Κρόνου ... κρανθήσεται, "which he swore when he fell from *his* majestic throne":

ἦν ἐκπίτνων ἠρᾶτο δηναιῶν θρόνων.

So Oedipus (Sophocles *Oed. Col.* 425-6) "So that he who now holds the sceptre and the throne may not remain,"

ὡς οὐτ' ἂν ὃς νῦν σκῆπτρα καὶ θρόνους ἔχει / μείνειεν ...

8.4.6 "May my bow be broken"

This curse is used both literally and of sexual potency. Elsewhere⁷⁰ I have gathered ancient Near Eastern versions of it. In Homer it appears as the action of Zeus, not so far as we can see as a result of a curse, *Iliad* 15.463-4 (but cf. 6.305-310) "[Zeus] broke the close-twisted tendon in [Teukros'] faultless bow as he was drawing":⁷¹

ὃς οἱ ἐϋστρεφέα νευρὴν ἐν ἀμύμονι τόξῳ

ρήξ' ἐπὶ τῷ ἐρύοντι ...

8.4.7 "May the earth not accept my body"⁷²

Curse of Iahdun-lim of Mari (02)⁷³ on a violator of his temple, "May the dead not accept [him]." Vassal Treaties of Esarhaddon 483-484 (17) "May

69 See Hillers 61.

70 "Archery in the Ancient World: 'Its Name is Life, its Work is Death'," *BibZ* 37 (1993) 26-42, 37-39. Cf. Hammurabi (01) 27.88, 28.1.

71 See Griffin 41, Karavites 111.

72 See generally Karavites 112-113.

73 Cf. Weinfeld 1976, 399.

the earth not receive your corpses." Oath of the Paphlagonians to Augustus 33-35 (52, 3 BC) "And may neither earth nor sea receive the bodies of my men or my children," καὶ μήτε σ[ώματα τὰ] τῶν ἐμῶν ἢ ἐξ ἐμοῦ μήτε γῆ μ[ήτε θάλασ]σα δέξαιτο.

8.4.8 "May my wife, my fields, my herds not bear their kind"

What we expect in the course of nature is (Hesiod *Opera* 235, contrast 244) that "women bear children like their parents":

τίκτουσιν δὲ γυναῖκες ἐοικότα τέκνα γονεῦσιν
 so at Gen 1,21 "according to their kind," אֲחַיִלָּ, LXX κατὰ γένη αὐτῶν.
 Reversed in the curse. Hittite Soldiers' Oath ii.38-42 (03) "Let not his wife bear sons and daughters. Let his land and his fields have no crop, and his pastures no grass. Let not his cattle and sheep bear calves and lambs." Deut 28,18 (with corresponding blessing 28,4) "Cursed be the fruit of your womb and the fruit of your ground, the increase of your cattle and the young of your flock." Job (31,40) pronounces the curse on himself, "Let thorns grow instead of wheat, and cockles for barley." Amphictyonic oath of Delphi (19 = Aeschines 2.111) citing Hesiod "May the earth not bear crops; nor women bear children like their parents, but monsters; and may cattle not produce offspring according to their nature":

μήτε γῆν καρπούς φέρειν, μήτε γυναῖκας τέκνα τίκτειν γονεῦσιν ἐοικότα, ἀλλὰ τέρατα, μήτε βοσκήματα κατὰ φύσιν γονὰς ποιεῖσθαι.

Almost the same formula on stone in the Oath of Plataea 42-47 (40). Oedipus' curse (Sophocles *OR* 269-271) "And for those who do not do these things, I pray that the gods may not send up any fruit of the earth's plowing for them, nor children of their wives":⁷⁴

καὶ ταῦτα τοῖς μὴ δρῶσιν εὐχομαι θεοὺς
 μήτ' ἄροτον αὐτοῖς γῆς ἀνιέναι τινα
 μήτ' οὖν γυναικῶν παῖδας ...

8.4.9 "May your soldiers take up the distaff and spindle"

Hittite soldiers' oath ii.51 (03) "Let [these oaths] break the bows, arrows and clubs in their hands, and [let them put] in their hands distaff and mirror." II Sam 3,29 "And never let there be lacking from the house of Joab one with a discharge, or leprous, or *holding the spindle*" (לְהַבְּרָה קְיִימָה, Vg *tenens fusum*).

74 See Weinfeld 1976, 399.

At *Iliad* 7.96 as an insult Menelaus calls the soldiers 'Αχαιῦδες, οὐκέτ' 'Αχαιοί "Achaean women, not Achaeans." Heracles in servitude to Omphale is a favorite illustration of unmanliness, thus Seneca *Herc. Oet.* 372-3 (cf. Ovid *Her.* 9.116) "Captured by love, he sits at the light distaff, twisting the moist wool with fierce hand:"⁷⁵

et amore captus ad leues sedit colus
udum feroci stamen intorquens manu.

8.4.10 "May your wound be incurable"

Code of Hammurabi (01) rev. xxviii. 50 "May Ninkana [i.e. Gula the doctor-god]...inflict upon him in his body a grievous malady...a serious injury which never heals." Treaty of Esarhaddon and Baal iv.3 (18, 680 BC) "May Gula the great physician put an unhealing sore in your body." Jer 15,18 (cf. 30,12-13) "Why...is my hurt incurable, refusing healing?"

וּמִקְחֵי אֲנִי־שָׁחָה מֵאֵנָה הַרְפָּא

Apollodorus *Epit.* 3.27 speaks of the "incurable wound" (ἀθεραπεύτου ... ἔλκους) of Philoctetes from the water-snake (*Iliad* 2.723). In Latin the phrase means "fatal": Ovid *Met.* 10.189 *immedicabile uulnus*; Seneca *Ep.* 108.28 *senectus...insanabilis morbus* "old age is an uncurable malady."⁷⁶

8.4.11 "May naphtha be your ointment"

So in the Vassal Treaties 491 (17), *nap-tu lu pi-šat-ku-nu*. The noun "crude petroleum" went into Rabbinic נפט (Mishna *Shabb.* II.2), Greek βάφθα (LXX Dan 3,46; Plutarch *Alex.* 35; II Makk 1,36; Strabo 16.1.15) and Latin *naphtha* (Pliny 2.235).

8.4.12 "May our wives be taken by others"

Vassal Treaties of Esarhaddon 428-9 (17) "May Venus, the brightest among stars, let your wives lie in the embrace of your enemy before your eyes." II Sam 12,11 (cf. 16,20-22; Jer 8,10) "And I will take your wives before your eyes and give them to your neighbors":

וְלָקַחְתִּי אֶת־נְשֵׂיךָ לְעֵינֶיךָ וְנָתַתִּי לְרַעֲיָה

75 See Hillers 66; Karavites 112.

76 See Hillers 64.

Job 31,10 "May my wife grind for another, and may others bow down on her":

תִּטְחַן לְאַחַר אִשְׁתִּי וְעַלֶּיהָ יִכְרַעַן אֲחֵרִין

(clearly both verbs have a sexual connotation). *Iliad* 3.301 (cited 8.4.1 above)
"And may their wives be subjected to others."⁷⁷

8.4.13 "May you eat the flesh of your children"

Treaty of Ashurnirari V & Mati-il, rev. iv.11 (15) "May they eat the flesh of their sons and daughters"; likewise in the Vassal Treaties 550, 572 (17). Lev 26,29 (cf. Jer 19,9) "And you will eat the flesh of your sons, the flesh of your daughters will you eat"; much extended Deut 28,53-57. Aeschylus *Ag.* 1593 "Atreus served [Thyestes] a banquet of his sons' flesh".⁷⁸

Ἄτρεὺς παρέσχε δαῖτα παιδείων κρεῶν

8.4.14 "Your heavens shall be bronze/iron"

At p. 107 above we saw how this curse from the Vassal Treaties 526-533 is echoed very precisely at Deut 28,23-24 with strong parallels in Homer. The Akkadian is shown earlier in that the curses are arranged by a distribution among the gods. A literary connection is required by the sequence:

(a) Leprosy	Vassal Treaties 419	Deut 28,27
(b) Darkness	421	29
(c) Others to lie with wives	428	(30)
(d) Sons not to inherit	429	32
(e) Foreigners to possess goods	430	33

8.4.15 "Your corpse will be food for the vultures and dogs"

I Reg 21,24 (cf. 14,11; 16,4) "That one of Ahab who dies in the city the dogs will eat, and that one who dies in the country the birds of the air (עוֹף הַשָּׁמַיִם) will eat." Deut 28,26 (cf. Jer 7,33 etc.; Ps 79,2) "And your corpse shall be food for all birds of the air, and for the beasts of the earth; and there will be no one to frighten them away." I Sam 17,44 Goliath threatens David "Come to me, and I will give your flesh to the birds of the

⁷⁷ See Hillers 63, Karavites 111.

⁷⁸ See Hillers 62-63.

air and to the beasts of the field." Midianite leaders are named for carrion-eaters (Jud 7,25) רָבִיב Oreb, "Raven" and זֵבִיב Zeeb, "Wolf."⁷⁹

Iliad 22,41-43 Priam speaks of Achilles, "I wish he were as beloved by the gods as by me; soon the dogs and vultures would eat him lying there":

... αἶθε θεοῖσι φίλος τοσσόνδε γένοιτο
ὄσσον ἐμοί· τάχα κέν ἐ κύνες καὶ γῦπες ἔδοιεν
κείμενον ...

Similarly at 18,271 "the dogs and vultures will eat many," πολλοὺς δὲ κύνες καὶ γῦπες ἔδονται. Elsewhere in the *Iliad* "vultures" is replaced by apparently more colorless "birds," e.g. at the beginning, 1.4-5

... αὐτοὺς δὲ ἐλώρια τεύχε κύνεσσιν
οἰωνοῖσί τε δαῖτα ...

"And made them prey to dogs and a banquet (so Zenobius for MSS πᾶσι) for birds." It is tempting to compare γύψ "vulture" with Hebrew הָיָב "birds" in this context.

The creatures are variously specified as ravens and wolves (Lucian *Timon* 8); vulture and raven, dogs and wolves (Catullus 108.4-6). Sherlock Holmes says of the convict Selden's body on the moor (*The Hound of the Baskervilles*), "We cannot leave it here to the foxes and ravens." Jesus notes only the birds (Matt 24,28 = Luk 17,37) "Wherever the corpse is, there also the eagles will be gathered"; Gorgias called vultures "living tombs," γῦπες ἔμψυχοι τάφοι ([Longinus] *On the Sublime* 3.2). Horace *Epist.* 1.16.48 (cf. Petronius 58.2) *non pasces in cruce coruos* "you will not feed crows on the cross." The theme is taken up in a Greek verse-inscription from Caria of the 2nd or 1st century BC.⁸⁰ A man murdered by his slave is speaking: "But my fellow-citizens hung up alive for the beasts and birds the one who did it to me":

ἀλλὰ πολῖται ἐμοὶ τὸν ἐμὲ ῥέξαντα τοιαῦτα
θηρσὶ καὶ οἰωνοῖς ζῶν ἀνεκρέμασαν

Vermeule outrageously observes:

Where carnivorous animals and birds had been made the agents for the cleansing of the dead, they prevented pollution, first physically, then spiritually. They assisted the natural cycle of birth and death in an economical style, and were in a sense allies of those who kept order, the gods.⁸¹

Art shows only the birds. Thus in a wall painting at Level VII of Çatal Hüyük ab. 6200 BC (now in the Ankara Museum) vultures devour headless corpses.⁸² In the "Vulture Stele" of Sumerian Eannatum from Tell, ab. 2500

79 It is doubtful whether the curse appears in Esarhaddon's Vassal-Treaties; see Karavites 112-113.

80 W. Peek, *Griechische Vers-Inschriften* i [all pub.] (1955) 1120.7-8.

81 Emily Vermeule, *Aspects of Death in Early Greek Art and Poetry* (1979) 109.

82 Volume of Plates to *Cambridge Ancient History*, 2nd ed., I-II (1977) Plate 6-A.

BC, vultures carry off corpses of those slain in battle.⁸³ In an Assyrian relief of the 7th century BC from the palace of Senaccherib at Nineveh birds pick at the enemy slain.⁸⁴ On an Etrusco-Corinthian pitcher, about contemporary with the Assyrian relief, vultures hover over a corpse.⁸⁵

But a female watcher by day and night may keep animals (and birds) off the corpse. Thus II Sam 21,10 "And [Rizpah Saul's concubine] did not let the birds of the air rest on [the corpses of her sons] by day or the beasts of the field by night"; *Iliad* 23.185-6:

ἀλλὰ κύνας μὲν ἄλαλκε Διὸς θυγάτηρ Ἀφροδίτη
ἦματα καὶ νύκτας ...

"But Aphrodite the daughter of Zeus kept the dogs off [Hector's corpse] day and night."⁸⁶

8.4.16 "May the dogs (or lion) lick my blood in the gate"

I Reg 21,19 "In the place where the dogs licked (יִפְּלוּ, LXX ἔλειξαν, Vg *linxerunt*) the blood of Naboth, shall the dogs lick (יִפְּלוּ, λείξουσιν, *lambent*) your blood also"; 22,38 "And one washed off the chariot by the pool of Samaria, and the dogs licked (יִפְּלוּ, ἐξέλειξαν, *linxerunt*) his blood, and the harlots washed themselves." In all three languages, as in English *lick* and German *lecken*, the verbs are onomatopoeic and strikingly similar. Aeschylus *Agam.* 827-828 "the flesh-eating lion licked its fill of tyrant blood":

...ὠμηστῆς λέων

ἄδην ἔλειξεν αἵματος τυραννικοῦ

Priam prophesies his death in similar language as if by curse: *Iliad* 22.66-67 "And myself last of all the flesh-eating dogs will tear apart at the front of my gates":

αὐτὸν δ' ἂν πύματόν με κύνες πρώτῃσι θύρῃσιν

ὠμησταὶ ἐρύουσιν ...

22.70 "they will drink my blood in their frenzy":

οἱ κ' ἐμὸν αἶμα πίνοντες ἀλύσσοντες ...

Compare II Reg 9,36 "The dogs shall eat the flesh of Jezebel"; Num 23,24 "Behold a people; as a lion it rises up...it does not lie down until it devours the prey, and drinks the blood of the slain."

By a reverse action to lick blood can be the substance of an oath. Thus the Lydians "lick each others' blood" (Herodotus 1.74.6), τὸ αἶμα ἀναλείχουσι

83 ANEP² no. 301; cf. Vermeule (note 82 above) 47.

84 Vermeule p. 104.

85 Otto J. Brendel, *Etruscan Art* (1978) 67.

86 See further Gordon 55; and in general Griffin 115-122; Hillers 68.

ἀλλήλων; and so the Parthians, Tacitus *Ann.* 12.47 *cruorem lambunt*. At Aeschylus *Eum.* 106 Clytemnestra's ghost implies that the vampirish Erinyes have licked (ἐλείξατε) blood in her sacrifices; cf. *Agam.* 1478 ἔρωσ αἱματολοιχός "desire to lick blood." Pliny *Paneg.* 48.3 alleges that Domitian "licked the blood of his relatives," *propinquorum sanguinem lamberet*; cf. Luke 6,21 "the dogs licked the sores" of Lazarus, ἐπέλειχον, Vg *lingeabant*.

8.4.17 "May the enemy put a yoke on my neck"

Deut 28,48 "Yahweh will put a yoke of iron on your neck,"

וְנָתַן עַל פְּרִזְלֵי עַל צַוְאַרְךָ

Jeremiah (chapter 27ff) concretely symbolizes the curse by putting a yoke on his own neck. Liberation comes when (Gen 27,40, cf. Isa 10,27, Jer 28,2) "you will break his yoke from off your neck,"

וְפָרַקְתָּ מֵעַל צַוְאַרְךָ

Theognis refuses any such (1023-4), "Never shall I offer my stiff neck to enemies to go under the yoke":

οὔποτε τοῖς ἐχθροῖσιν ὑπὸ ζυγὸν ἀνέχυνα θήσω / δύσλοφον

Slavery is a yoke, Sophocles *Ajax* 944 δουλείας ζυγά (but at Gal 5,1 ζυγὴ δουλείας the Torah is meant!). So in Latin, Cicero *Phil.* 1.6 *cuius a ceruicibus iugum seruile deiecerant* "[the city] from whose neck they had thrown off the yoke of slavery"; Valerius Max. 6.9.2 *deuictae Carthaginis ceruicibus imposito iugo* "when the yoke had been placed on the neck of conquered Carthage."

The image of the yoke can be extended to burdens that are universal or self-accepted. *Hom. Hymn to Demeter* 2.217 "for the yoke [of subjection] lies on the neck [of us mortals]," ἐπὶ γὰρ ζυγὸς ἀνέχνη κείται. Pindar *Pyth.* 2.93 "It is better to take the yoke on one's neck and bear it lightly," φέρειν δ' ἐλαφρῶς ἐπαυχένιον λαβόντα ζυγὸν / ἀρήγει. At *Avoth* III.6 the "yoke of the Torah," עול תורה is beneficial; the "yoke of the kingdom of heaven" (עול מלכות שמים, Mishna *Berakh.* II.2) is the recitation of the Shema. At Sirach 51,26 the yoke is instruction generally, "put your neck under the yoke," τὸν τράχηλον ὑμῶν ὑπόθετε ὑπὸ ζυγόν. So what was once a curse comes full circle as a blessing at Matt 11,29-30 "Take my yoke upon you...for my yoke is easy": ἄρατε τὸν ζυγὸν μου ἐφ' ὑμᾶς ... ὁ γὰρ ζυγός μου χρηστός.

Chronological Catalogue

Treaties and the like cited in Chapter 8

- 01 Code of Hammurabi [curses rev. xxvi-xxviii]; tr. with bibliography at ANET³ 163-180.
- 02 Yahdunlim of Mari; 18th cent.; foundation-deposit with curse on violator; Akkadian; ed. Dossin; tr. ANET³ 556.
- 03 Soldiers' oath; Hittite; ed. Friedrich 1924; tr. ANET³ 353.
- 04 Instructions for officers; Hittite; ed. von Schuler.
- 05 Suppiluliuma & Kurtiwaza of Mitanni; ab. 1350 BC; Akkadian; ed. Weidner 1923, 2.36; partial tr. ANET³ 205.
- 06 Suppiluliuma & Tette of Nuhasi; ab. 1350 BC; Akkadian; ed. Weidner 1932, 58; cf. ANET³ 204.
- 07 Suppiluliuma & Niqmad II of Ugarit; Akkadian text in PRU iv.30; Ugaritic text in Gordon UT 118 = KTU 3.1.
- 08 Suppiluliuma & Hukkanas; ab. 1350 BC; Hittite; ed. Friedrich 1930, 106.
- 09 Mursilis II & Duppi-Tesub of Amurru; ab. 1330 BC; Hittite text in Friedrich 1926, 4; Akkadian in Weidner 1923, 76; tr. ANET³ 203.
- 10 Muwattalis & Alaksandus of Wilusa ["Alexander of Ilium"?]; Hittite; ed. Friedrich 1930, 50.
- 11 Hattusilis III & Ramesses II; ab. 1275 BC; Akkadian text in Weidner 1923, 112, tr. ANET³ 201; hieroglyphic text from Karnak, tr. ANET³ 199.
- 12 Initesub of Carchemish; ab. 1235 BC; decree from Ugarit; ed. PRU iv.156.
- 13 Ahiram of Byblos; ab. 1000 BC; curse on violators of sepulture; Phoenician; ed. KAI 1; tr. ANET³ 661.
- 14 Shamshi-Adad V & king of Babylon; ab. 815 BC; Akkadian from Kuyunjik; ed. Weidner 1932/3.
- 15 Assurnirari VI & Mati-il of Arpad; ab. 750 BC; Akkadian; ed. Weidner 1932/3; tr. ANET³ 532.

- 16 Bargayah of *Ktk* & Mati-il of Arpad; ab. 750 BC; Aramaic treaty of Sefire; ed. KAI 222-224; tr. ANET³ 659.
- 17 Esarhaddon & Median princes; ab. 680 BC; "Vassal Treaties" from Nimrud; Akkadian; ed. Wiseman 1958; tr. ANET³ 534; 9 copies, each sealed by a different prince.
- 18 Esarhaddon & Baal of Tyre; ab. 680 BC; Akkadian; ed. Borger 107; tr. ANET³ 533.
- 19 Pact of Delphic Amphictyony; 7th cent BC?; Greek; Aeschines 2.115 etc.; SVA ii.104.
- 20 Oath of Athenian ephebes; stone of 4th cent. BC from Acharnae & literary paraphrases; Tod 204; same stone as no. 40.
- 21 Oath of ephebes of Dreros (Crete); SIG³ 527; stone of 220 BC.
- 22 Therans & colonists of Cyrene; 630 BC?; Meiggs-Lewis no. 5; SVA ii.103; stone of 4th cent. BC with older materials.
- 23 Law of Chios; 575-550 BC; Meiggs-Lewis no. 8; frag. of orig. pillar.
- 24 Sparta & Croesus; ab. 550 BC?; Herodotus 1.69; SVA ii.113; historical?
- 25 Rome & Carthage; 508/7 BC?; lost archaic Latin orig. seen by Polybius (3.22.3, 3.26.1) on bronze tablet on Capitoline; Greek in Polybius 3.22-23; SVA ii.121.
- 26 Elis & Heraea; ab. 500 BC; bronze tablet from Olympia in dialect Greek; Meiggs-Lewis 17; SVA ii.110.
- 27 Rome & Latin cities; "*Foedus Cassianum*"; 493 BC; lost Latin on bronze tablet at Rostra, seen by Cicero (*pro Balbo* 53); Greek version in Dion. Hal. 6.95.2; SVA ii.126.
- 28 Fetial declaration of war; Latin; Livy 1.24.8.
- 29 Law of Halicarnassus; ab. 460 BC; Meiggs-Lewis 32.
- 30 Ionia & Athens; naval treaty; 478-7 BC; Aristotle *Ath. Pol.* 23.5; SVA ii.132.
- 31 Athens & Corcyra; ab. 427 BC; Thucydides 3.75.1; SVA ii.172.
- 32 Acarnanians & others; 426 BC; Thucydides 3.114.3; SVA ii.175; "100 year treaty."
- 33 Athens & Sparta; 421 BC; "Peace of Nicias"; Thucydides 5.18; SVA ii.188.
- 34 Athens & Sparta; 421 BC; alliance; Thucydides 5.23; SVA ii.189.
- 35 Athens & Carthage; 406 BC; negotiations; Meiggs-Lewis 92; SVA ii.208; small fragment.
- 36 Athens & Sparta; peace treaty after Peloponnesian War, 404 BC; Xenophon *Hell.* 2.2.20; SVA ii.211. Notably unequal terms.
- 37 Athens & Corcyra; 375 BC; Tod 127; SVA ii.263.
- 38 Athens & Keos; 362 BC; Tod 142; SVA ii.289.
- 39 Maussolos & Phaselis; 360 BC; SVA ii.260.

- 40 Oath of Athenians at Plataea; 4th cent. BC?; Tod 204, stone from Acharnae; authenticity doubtful but oath old; same stone as no. 20.
- 41 Philip II of Macedon & Athens; 338 BC; Latin vers. in Justin 9.4.5; SVA iii.402.
- 42 Eumenes & Antigonos; 319 BC; Plutarch *Eumenes* 12; SVA iii.418.
- 43 Aetolians & Acarnanians; 263 BC; SIG³ 421A; SVA iii.480; bronze stele.
- 44 Soldiers of Eumenes; 263-241 BC; OGIS 266 from Pergamum; SVA iii.481.
- 45 Smyrna & Magnesia; 246-226 BC; OGIS 229; SVA iii.492; long & complete text including loyalty oath to Seleucus II.
- 46 Malla & Lyttos (both of Crete); 221 BC; Inscr. Cret. I.231; SVA iii.511.
- 47 Hannibal & Philip V of Macedon; 215 BC; Polybius 7.9; SVA iii.528; Greek translation from Roman archives of Hannibal's Punic original; Latin summary in Livy 23.33; commentary by Bickerman 1944 & Barré.
- 48 Rome & Kibyra; 200-150 BC; OGIS 762.
- 49 Rome & Jews; 160 BC?; I Makk 8; not surely authentic.
- 50 Rome & Astypaleians; 105 BC; Sherk 1969, 16.
- 51 Caesar's party; 50 BC; Appian *Bell. Civ.* 2.145; loyalty oath cited by Antony in his funeral oration for Caesar.
- 52 Paphlagonians to Augustus; 3 BC; Greek; OGIS 532; Ehrenberg-Jones 315.
- 53 Cypriotes to Tiberius; AD 14; Greek; Mitford 1960.
- 54 Lusitanians to Caligula; AD 37; Latin; ILS 190; Smallwood 32.

Supplementary Bibliography to Chapter 8

Baltzer: Klaus Baltzer, *The Covenant Formulary in Old Testament, Jewish and Early Christian Writings*; tr. D. E. Green (1971).

Barré: Michael L. Barré, *The god-list in the treaty between Hannibal and Philip V of Macedonia; A Study in the Light of the Ancient Near Eastern Treaty Tradition* (1983).

Bi[c]kerman 1944; Elias J. Bi[c]kerman, "An Oath of Hannibal," *TAPA* 75 (1944) 87-102.

Bickerman 1950: —, "Couper une alliance," *Studies in Jewish and Christian History*, 2 vols., i.1-32 (1976); *Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums IX*; orig. pub. in *Archives d'histoire du droit orientale* 5 (1950).

Bickerman 1952: —, "Hannibal's Covenant," *AJP* 73 (1952) 1-23.

Borger: Riekele Borger, *Die Inschriften Asarhaddons Königs von Assyrien*; *Archiv für Orientforschung Beiheft* 9 (1956, repr. 1967).

Casabona: Jean Casabona, *Recherches sur le vocabulaire des sacrifices en grec des origines à la fin de l'époque classique*; *Pub. des Ann. de la Fac. des Lettres Aix-en-Provence n.s.* 56 (1966).

Crawford: Timothy G. Crawford, *Blessing and Curse in Syro-Palestinian Inscriptions of the Iron Age*; *American Univ. Studies* vii.120 (1992).

Delcor: Mathias Delcor, "Les attaches littéraires, l'origine et la signification de l'expression biblique 'prendre à témoin le ciel et la terre'," *Etudes Biblique et Orientales de Religions Comparées* (1979) 49-66; orig. pub. in *Vet. Test.* 16 (1966) 8-25.

Dossin: Georges Dossin, "L'inscription de fondation de Iahdun-lim, roi de Mari," *Syria* 32 (1955) 1-28.

Friedrich 1924: J. Friedrich, "Der hethitische Soldateneid," part 1 of *Hethitische Studien* (1924), orig. pub. in *Zeitschrift für Assyriologie n. F.* 1 (1924) 161-192.

Friedrich 1926, 1930: —, *Staatsverträge des Ḫatti-Reiches in hethitischer Sprache*: 1. Teil (= *Hethitische Texte*, ed. F. Sommer, Heft II = *MVAG* 31 [1926,1]); 2. Teil = *MVAG* 34 (1930,1).

Gordon 1955: Cyrus H. Gordon, *Homer and Bible: The Origin and Character of East Mediterranean Literature*; repr. from *HUCA* 26 (1955) 43-108.

Griffin: Jasper Griffin, *Homer on Life and Death* (1980).

Herrmann: Peter Herrmann, *Der römische Kaisereid: Untersuchungen zu seiner Herkunft und Entwicklung; Hypomnemata* 20 (1968).

Hillers: Delbert R. Hillers, *Treaty-Curses and the Old Testament Prophets; Biblica et Orientalia* 16 (1964).

Karavites: Peter (Panayiotis) Karavites, *Promise-giving and Treaty-making: Homer and the Near East; Mnemosyne Suppl.* 119 (1992).

Korošec: Viktor Korošec, *Hethitische Staatsverträge: Ein Beitrag zu ihrer juristischen Wertung; Leipzig rechtswissenschaftliche Studien* 60 (1931).

Langdon-Gardner: S. Langdon & A. H. Gardiner, "The Treaty of Alliance between Ḫattušili, king of the Hittites, and the Pharaoh Ramesses II of Egypt," *Journal of Egyptian Archaeology* 6 (1920) 179-205.

Lieberman 1942: Saul Lieberman, "Oaths and Vows," pp. 115-143 of *Greek in Jewish Palestine....* (5702/1942).

McCarthy: Dennis J. McCarthy, S.J., *Treaty and Covenant: A Study in Form in the Ancient Oriental Documents and in the Old Testament; 2nd ed.; Analecta Biblica* 21A (1978).

Mendenhall: G. E. Mendenhall, *Law and Covenant in Israel and the Ancient Near East* (1955); repr. from *Bib. Arch.* 17.2 (1954) 26-46 & 17.3 (1954) 49-76.

Mitford: T. B. Mitford, "A Cypriote Oath of Obedience to Tiberius," *JRS* 50 (1960) 75-79.

Schmitt: Rüdiger Schmitt, *Dichtung und Dichtersprache in indogermanischer Zeit* (1967).

Sherk 1969: Robert K. Sherk, *Roman Documents from the Greek East: Senatus Consulta and Epistulae to the age of Augustus*.

Sherk 1984: —, *Rome and the Greek East to the death of Augustus; Translated Documents of Greece and Rome* vol. 4.

Smallwood: E. Mary Smallwood, *Documents illustrating the Principates of Gaius, Claudius and Nero* (1967).

Streck: Maximilian Streck, *Assurbanipal und die letzten assyrischen Könige...; Vorderasiatische Bibliothek* 7; vol. II, Texte (1916).

Täubler: Eugen Täubler, *Imperium Romanum: Studien zur Entwicklungsgeschichte des römischen Reichs; Erster Band [all pub.], Die Staatsverträge und Vertragsverhältnisse* (1913).

Tod: Marcus N. Tod, *A Selection of Greek Historical Inscriptions; vol. ii: from 403 to 323 B.C.* (1948).

von Schuler: Einar von Schuler, *Hethitische Dienstanweisungen...; Archiv für Orientforschung Beiheft* 10 (1957).

Waterman: Leroy Waterman, *Royal Correspondence of the Assyrian Empire...; vol. II* (1930).

Weidner 1923: Ernst F. Weidner, Politische Dokumente aus Kleinasien: Die Staatsverträge in akkadischer Sprache aus dem Archiv von Boghazköi; Boghazköi-Studien 8 & 9; repr. as one vol. 1970.

Weidner 1932/3: —, "Der Staatsvertrag Aššurnirâris VI. von Assyrien mit Mati'ilu von Bit-Agusi," Archiv für Orientforschung 8 (1932/3) 17-34.

Weinfeld 1973: Moshe Weinfeld, "Covenant Terminology in the Ancient Near East and its Influence on the West," JAOS 93 (1973) 190-199.

Weinfeld 1976: —, "The Loyalty Oath in the Ancient Near East," Ugarit-Forschungen 8 (1976) 379-414.

Weinfeld *bryt.* —, article *berith*, TDOT ii.253-279 = TWAT i.781-808.

Wiseman 1953: D. J. Wiseman, The Alalakh Tablets.

Wiseman 1958: —, The Vassal-Treaties of Esarhaddon; repr. from Iraq 20 (1958) part 1.

Chapter 9: Proverb-Book and Gold-Economy¹

In both Hebrew and Greek the proverb is the most standardized of literary genres. Of the three Hebrew books recognized by the Masoretes as in poetic parallelism and provided with a special system of accents, Proverbs is more formulaic than Job and more regular in structure than Psalms. In fact, the pattern of two parallel half-lines fits many of the Psalms badly, and is irrelevant to the prose preface and conclusion of Job. Thus perhaps the special accentual system was originally devised for Proverbs, and later extended to Psalms and Job.

Likewise in Greek the "elegiac couplet" of hexameter + pentameter is the only verse-form where a gnomic thought is regularly confined to one or two lines, and where there is often parallelism between the two lines of the couplet, or between half-lines at the caesura. There is preserved only one early corpus of elegiac verse, that ascribed to Theognis. Thus the book of Theognis is *prima facie* comparable to the Proverbs of Solomon. Besides parallels illustrating a generally upper-class attitude to justice and wisdom, the two books share their most concrete imagery: the *testing and refining of gold* as a symbol of men's character, with actual common vocabulary. The spread of a gold-economy in Israel and Hellas may then be associated with a class of goldsmith-bankers, including Phoenicians, which we can discern behind both proverb-books. Although that well-to-do class seems to be the original transmitter of the ideas of justice and of the symbolism of gold, in both societies each of those innovations went through parallel developments which undercut and criticized the ideals of the carrying class.

1 Revision of an article "Proverb-Book, Gold-Economy, Alphabet" in JBL 100 (1981) 169-191. The third section of that article, on the alphabet, has been utilized instead at Chapter 1 of the present work.

9.1 *The proverb-book*

The brief pointed generalization which we call a proverb has a special ability to diffuse across linguistic and cultural boundaries—because of its applicability to the two principal international enterprises, business and war. Lieberman 1942² takes it for granted that numerous proverbs in Greek and Latin migrated eastward to Palestine, where they are recorded in Rabbinic texts; in Excursus E we shall excerpt the materials he has turned up. West³ equally takes for granted a *westward* movement of proverbs:

Rome which accepted oriental gods and superstitions also accepted from the Near East, through the mediation of the Greek world, a good deal of more harmless mental fodder, fables, commonplaces, points of view, styles of argument.

Prov 22,17—24,22 has close parallels of both matter and order to the demotic *Instruction of Amen-Em-Opet* of the seventh century BC or earlier;⁴ it seems probable⁵ that the Hebrew is the borrower, as illustrated for example by its blurring of ideas.⁶ Lichtheim in a most valuable work, with copious transliterations of the demotic, compares late Egyptian proverbial collections with the surrounding Hellenistic world, noting parallels to Proverbs, Sirach, and Rabbinic also. Sanders⁷ concludes that Sirach knew and echoed Theognis. But nobody has yet thought to compare the two classical didactic works which have been under our noses all along: the collections of proverbs ascribed to Solomon and Theognis. Each book is a collection of materials from different sources. The Proverbs of Solomon has several sections, nearly all titled.⁸ Albright wishes to make Proverbs dependent on a lost Canaanite-Phoenician didactic literature; he thinks that while its final editing is of

-
- 2 For such references see the supplementary bibliography at the end of Excursus E.
 - 3 M. L. West, "Near Eastern Material in Hellenistic and Roman Literature," *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 73 (1968) 113-134.
 - 4 Partial translation and bibliography in ANET³ 421-425.
 - 5 See Diethard Römheld, *Wege der Weisheit: Die Lehren Amenemopes und Proverbien 22,17—24,22*; BZAW 184 (1989).
 - 6 Thus the reason why riches "takes to itself wings, flying like an eagle toward heaven" (Prov 23,4-5) is only explained by the Egyptian (sect. 7) where the riches came by robbery.
 - 7 Jack T. Sanders, *Ben Sira and Demotic Wisdom*; SBL Monograph Series 28 (1983) 29ff.
 - 8 (A) Prov 1.1—9,18; (B) 10,1—22,16; (C, the parallel to Amen-em-opet) 22,17—24,22; (D) 24,23-34; (E) 25,1—29,27; (F) 30,1-14; (G) 30,15-33; (H) 31,1-9; (I) 31,10-31. These divisions, arrived at by internal analysis of the Hebrew, are nearly all mirrored in the alternate arrangement of the LXX, which drops most of the titles and has the materials in the order: A (ending with additions 9,18 a-d); B; C (ending with additions 24,22 a-e); F; D; G; H; E; I.

about the 5th century BC, it contains no substantial matter of post-exilic date, and that aphorisms may go back to the early monarchy.⁹ Crenshaw thinks that the latest identifiable block is the initial one (Prov 1,1—9,18).¹⁰

The book of Theognis also had a complex redaction, and more than any other Greek work became the repository for floating matter in its own genre—elegiac couplets of didactic content. For the text see now the edition by West.¹¹ Van Groningen emphasizes its dependence on Homer.¹² It has a clearly identifiable nucleus: a collection of poems by an historical man, Theognis of Megara. Most agree that the poems which contain an address to his friend Kynos in the vocative constitute the bulk of that nucleus. West dates the genuine poems earlier than others do, between 630 and 600 BC, before the fall of an old oligarchy in Megara and the rise of a new oligarchy which honored Theognis' memory.¹³ Besides their correspondence in standardized genre, line-by-line parallelism and traditional matter, the two collections agree in what I call an *upper-class orientation*. We may note some agreements in general theme.

Justice and wealth. Theognis 753 (cf. 197ff) "Make money justly" (δικαίως χρήματα ποιοῦ); Prov 15,6 (cf. 13,11; 21,5) "[In] the house of the righteous (פִּי־דָר) is much treasure." Poverty "comes neither into the Agora nor the courts" (Theognis 268), "the tongue of the poor is tied" (179); so "a rich man's wealth is his strong city; the poverty of the poor is their ruin" (Prov 10,15; cf. 18,11).

A man's companions. "Do not converse with evil men, but always hold fast to good men" (Theognis 31-32); above all when taking counsel about a "weighty matter" (69-72), business or politics. Prov 14,7-8: "Leave the presence of a fool, for there you do not meet words of knowledge; the wisdom of a prudent man is to discern his way." And only the good man is likely to remember the benefits you do him (Theognis 112; Prov 9,8-9).¹⁴

-
- 9 W. F. Albright, "Some Canaanite-Phoenician Sources of Hebrew Wisdom," pp. 1-15 of M. Noth & D. W. Thomas (eds.), *Wisdom in Israel and in the Ancient Near East*; FS H. H. Rowley; *Vet. Test. Sup* 3 (1969).
 - 10 J. L. Crenshaw, "Proverbs, Book of," *ABD* v.513-520, esp. pp. 514b-515a. Many others have tried their hand at discovering the book's composition.
 - 11 M. L. West, *IEG* i.172-241.
 - 12 B. A. Van Groningen, *Theognis: Le premier livre; Verhandelingen der Koninklijke nederlandse Akademie van wetenschappen; Afd. Letterkunde n.r. 72 no. 1* (1966).
 - 13 M. L. West, "The Life and Times of Theognis," *Studies in Greek Elegy and Iambus; Untersuchungen zur antiken Literatur und Geschichte* 14 (1974) 65-71.
 - 14 Half of this sentiment appears in the Hebrew-Egyptian parallelism: "Make no friendship with a man given to anger" (Prov 22,24); "Do not associate to thyself the heated man" (Amen-Em-Opet ix = 11.13, ANET³ 423a).

Enlightened self-interest. "Do well and you will fare well" (εὖ ἔρδων εὖ πάσχει Theognis 573); "A man who is kind benefits himself" (Prov. 11,17; cf. 11,25 etc.). But it is essential to avoid the unlimited obligation of a pledge (Theognis 284; Prov 6,1¹⁵ etc.).

"A city stands by virtue of good men." Theognis 43 (authentic):

οὐδεμίαν πω, Κύρν', ἀγαθοὶ πόλιν ὤλεσαν ἄνδρες

"Good men, O Kyrnos, never destroyed a city." Prov 11,11 "By the blessing of the upright a city is established":

בְּבִרְכַּת יְשָׁרִים תָּרוּם קָרַת

Vg *benedictione iustorum exaltabitur ciuitas*. Almost by definition, good or upright men are those identified with civic affairs and the maintenance of order.

"How is this just?" But things are so arranged in the world that the good man cannot always count on appropriate recognition. "How, O King of the immortals, is this just... that one who is just does not receive just treatment?" (Theognis 743-752, cf. 373ff and Job 21,17); "A good man, though an acropolis and tower for the empty mob, received little honor" (Theognis 233-234); "There was found in [that city] a poor wise man, and he by his wisdom delivered the city; yet no one remembered that poor man" (Koh 9,15).

Sometimes themes come so close in the two collections as to suggest or demand literary connection. The following proverbs, which by attestation are shown to have circulated internationally, cut one level beneath conventional praise of the good or just man; all but the first point to dangers and pitfalls of which the upper class above all need to be aware.¹⁶

Proverb 1: "Rich folk have plenty of friends." Prov 14,20 "Even by his neighbor the poor man is hated, but the friends of the rich man are many":

גַּם לְרַעְיוֹתָי יִשְׂנֵא רַשׁ וְאֶהְיֶי עֲשִׂיר רַבִּים

LXX ... φίλοι δὲ πλουσίων πολλοί. Prov 19,4 "Wealth adds on many friends, but the poor man is deserted by his friend":

הוּן יִסִּף רַעִים רַבִּים וְדָל מְרַעְיוֹתָי יִפְרֹד

A beautiful agreement of thought and language at Theognis 697-698 (anonymous) "When I am faring well I have many friends; but if some disaster happens, few retain a faithful sentiment":

εὖ μὲν ἔχοντος ἔμοῦ πολλοὶ φίλοι· ἦν δέ τι δειλὸν
συγκύρσῃ, παῦροι πιστὸν ἔχουσι νόον.

Compare Theognis 621 (anonymous) "Everyone honors a rich man and dishonors a poor man":

15 Cf. further Prov 11,15; 17,18; 20,16; 27,27.

16 The five proverbs shared by Theognis and "Solomon" are continued in the listing of international proverbs in Excursus E.

πάς τις πλούσιον ἄνδρα τίει, ἀτίει δὲ πενιχρόν.

In the mouth of a rich man the saying sounds merely complacent; it could equally well have occurred to a poor man, on whose lips it suggests that friends are more often bought than found.

Ovid follows Theognis (no reason to assume any knowledge of the LXX on his part here), *Tristia* 1.9.5-6 "As long as you are safe and sound, you will count many friends; if cloudy times come along, you will be alone":

donec eris sospes, multos numerabis amicos;
tempora si fuerint nubila, solus eris.¹⁷

Chaucer (*Melibee* 1558 [*2748]), citing medieval authorities, perhaps is resting on both Ovid and Proverbs:

If thou be right riche thou shalt fynde a greet nombre of felawes and freendes. And if thy fortune change that thou wexe povre, farewel freendshipe and felaweshipe.

This sentiment is an especial favorite of the pawky Scots:¹⁸ "Rich folk have routh of friends" (1832); "Poor folks' friends soon misken them" (1721). And so in German, "Reiche Laut haben freunde viel."¹⁹

Proverb 2: "Pride goeth before a fall." Both proverb-collections have a strain of pessimism over the likely tenure of any holder of power; an inner contradiction in wealth or power is seen by which the holder tends to bring about his own destruction. Prov 16,18 "Pride goeth before a fall, and a haughty spirit before destruction":

לִפְנֵי-שֹׁבֵר גָּאוֹן לִפְנֵי כְשָׁלוֹן גְּבוּהַ רִוּחַ

LXX πρὸ συντριβῆς ἡγείται ὕβρις ...; Luther *Wer zugrunde gehen soll, der wird zuvor stolz; und Hochmut kommt vor dem Fall*. Here the LXX looks back to Greek moralism. Theognis 151-152 (authentic), often considered a superlatively Greek thought, with many parallels:²⁰

ὑβριν, Κύρνε, θεὸς πρῶτον κακῶ ᾤπασεν ἀνδρὶ,
οὐ μέλλει χῶρην μηδεμίαν θέμεναι

"O Kyrnos, God first bestows *hybris* on a man whose place he wishes to set at nought."²¹ ὕβρις has been compared with עֶבְרָה "fury," but the Hebrew word is not used in this context.

17 Several more Latin versions in Otto 22.

18 Oxford Dictionary of English Proverbs, 3rd ed. (1970) 638, 674; hereafter "ODEP³."

19 Andreas Lüder of Marburg has kindly suggested German versions of many of these international proverbs. I have supplemented his list from the work of Wander (here iii.1617 no. 72)—so comprehensive that it is difficult for a non-German to tell which items are genuinely popular proverbs.

20 See the Greek texts I have gathered in "Men of the Land and the God of Justice in Greece and Israel," ZAW 95 (1983) 376-402, pp. 394-395.

21 See ODEP³ 647; an English proverb since 1350, but mostly as a reminiscence of Prov 16,18.

Proverb 3: "Man proposes, God disposes." Prov 19,21 (cf 16,1,9; Ps 94,11) "Many are the thoughts in the heart of a man; but it is the purpose of Yahweh that will stand":

רבות מַחְשְׁבוֹת בְּלִב־אִישׁ וְעֶצְתָּהּ יְהוָה הִיא תִקְוֶה

This seems an isolated verse indebted to Amen-Em-Opet (19.16)²² "One thing are the words which men say; another is that which the god does." Both halves of the contrast beautifully appear at Theognis 141-142 (authentic):

ἄνθρωποι δὲ μάταια νομίζομεν, εἰδότες οὐδέν·

θεοὶ δὲ κατὰ σφέτερον πάντα τελούσι νόον.

"We men think vain thoughts, since we know nothing; the gods bring all things about according to their intention."²³ The *de Imitatione Christi* 1.19.2 (partly echoing Prov 16,9) has *Nam homo proponit sed deus disponit*, the sentence is often quoted in English writers;²⁴ Langland in 1377 quotes the Latin. Zealand is supposed to have put the saying on its coins, but I have not seen any such.²⁵ Nor have I found a source for the fugitive version "Der Mensch lenkt, Gott schenkt" attributed to Luther.

Proverb 4: "Sufficient unto the day." Prov 27,1 "Do not boast about tomorrow, for you do not know what a day may bring to birth":

אַל תִּתְהַלֵּל בְּיָמֵי מָחָר כִּי לֹא תֵדַע מַה יַּיְלֶד לְךָ יְיָ

LXX μὴ καυχῶ τὰ εἰς αὔριον ..., *Vg ne glorieris in crastinum...* Theognis 159-160 (authentic) "O Kyrnos, never speak a bold word; for no man knows what a night and a day will bring to a man":

μήποτε, Κύρν', ἀγορᾶσθαι ἔπος μέγα· οἶδε γὰρ οὐδεὶς

ἀνθρώπων ὅτι νύξ χημέρη ἀνδρὶ τελεῖ.

Horace (*Carm.* 4.7.17-18) takes up the Hellenistic theme, "Who knows whether the gods above will add tomorrow's times to today's sum?":

Quis scit an adiciant hodiernae crastina summae
tempora di superi?

Jesus picks up the sober thought current in both the Jewish and Greek worlds and fits it into his theme of avoiding "anxiety," μέριμνα (Matt 6,34) "So do not be anxious about tomorrow, for tomorrow will be anxious for itself. Sufficient unto the day is the evil thereof":

μὴ οὖν μεριμνήσητε εἰς τὴν αὔριον, ἡ γὰρ αὔριον μεριμνήσει ἑαυτῆς· ἄρκετόν τῇ ἡμέρᾳ ἡ κακία αὐτῆς.

Vg nolite ergo esse solliciti in crastinum, crastinus enim dies sollicitus erit sibi ipse; sufficit diei malitia sua.

22 See ANET³ 423.

23 A less specific parallel at *Od.* 8.570-571: "So the old man spoke; but those things a god might bring about, or they might remain undone, as it seemed good to his mind."

24 ODEP³ 506.

25 Samuel Purchas, *Pilgrimes* (1625) 19.506-7 as cited by ODEP³ 506.

Proverb 5: "Drink from your own well." Prov 5,15 "Drink water from your own cistern, flowing water from your own well":

שְׁתֵּה מַיִם מִבּוֹרְךָ וְנַזְלִים מִתּוֹךְ בְּאֵרְךָ

This is plainly a sexual metaphor, "lie only with your own wife," for at 5,18 "your fountain" is parallel to "the wife of your youth." LXX²⁶ πίνε ὕδατα ἀπὸ σῶν ἀγγείων, καὶ ἀπὸ σῶν φρεάτων πηγῆς. Theognis 959-962 (anonymous) "When I drank from my spring of black water, the water seemed to me sweet and good; but now it is muddied, and one water is mixed with another(?); I shall drink of another spring or river":

ἔστε μὲν αὐτὸς ἔπινον ἀπὸ κρήνης μελανύδρου,
ἡδύ τί μοι ἐδόκει καὶ καλὸν ἦμεν ὕδωρ·
νῦν δ' ἤδη τεθόλωται, ὕδωρ δ' ἀναμίσγεται ὕδει·
ἄλλης δὴ κρήνης πίομαι ἢ ποταμοῦ.

Hudson-Williams, not citing Proverbs, independently sees this as an "erotic figure."²⁷

While Hebrew and Greek scholars have recognized the class orientation of their respective texts, they have failed to identify the class more closely, due to their reliance on a generalized sociology rather than on the language of the texts. Thus in the case of the Proverbs of Solomon. Kovacs²⁸ believes that it comes from a scribal background, while recognizing that it contains no specific references to scribalism. Heaton,²⁹ on the basis of the Egyptian parallels, regards it as "the work of men who had received a scribal education and affords the most direct evidence we possess for the school or schools which Solomon must have established in order to train candidates for his new bureaucracy." von Rad³⁰ points out, correctly on the basis of negative evidence, that the world in which the sayings of Proverbs exist is not the court; but concludes without any real data that wisdom "must have found at an early stage centres where it was nurtured in a broader cultural level in the country and where it was concerned more with the kind of questions asked about life by the middle classes and the landowners." Gordis³¹ creates a

26 Similar sentiment in the added verse LXX Prov 9,18c "Avoid another's water, and do not drink from another's spring."

27 T. Hudson-Williams, *The Elegies of Theognis* (1910) 235.

28 B. W. Kovacs, "Is There a Class-Ethic in Proverbs?," pp. 171-190 of *Essays in Old Testament Ethics*, ed. J. L. Crenshaw & J. T. Willis (1974), p. 186.

29 E. W. Heaton, *Solomon's New Men: The Emergence of Ancient Israel as a National State* (1974) 123.

30 G. von Rad, *Wisdom in Israel* (Eng. tr. 1972) 17; *Weisheit in Israel* (1970) 30 "Offenbar schon früh muss [Weisheit] in einer breiteren Bildungsschicht im Lande Pflegestätten gefunden haben, wo sie sich mehr den Lebensfragen einer bürgerlich-grossbäuerlichen Schicht zugewendet hat."

31 R. Gordis, "The Social Background of Wisdom Literature," *HUCA* 118 (1944) 77-118

detailed (and too late) sociology solely on the basis of general considerations:

Wisdom Literature... was fundamentally the product of the upper classes in society, who lived principally in the capital, Jerusalem. Some were engaged in large-scale foreign trade, or were taxfarmers, like the Tobiades. Most of them were supported by the income of their country estates, which were tilled either by slaves, or by tenant farmers, who might have once owned the very fields which they now worked as tenants. The patrician group was allied by marriage with the high-priestly families and the higher government officials, who represented the foreign suzerain, Persian, Ptolemaic or Seleucid.

There are more general analyses in recent collective volumes.³²

Classical scholars do begin with passages in the text of Theognis, and Lloyd-Jones describes the position of Theognis correctly so far as he goes:

His own friends and associates are good, his enemies bad. Perhaps the most striking instance of the use of *agathos* in a non-ethical sense occurs in a passage [53-68] in which Theognis laments that men who till lately lived outside the city and wore goatskins are now good and men who until lately were good are now bad. Here the poet boldly uses the word good to mean "belonging to the prevailing group," which has now come to consist of those who until lately were termed bad. This is not his usual usage, for he generally reserves the title good for his own party; but until the recent revolution that party had always retained power, so that though good usually means "belonging to the party of the nobles," it can also be used abnormally to mean "belonging to the party in power." However, a close examination of the poems shows that the words meaning "good" usually connote certain moral qualities apart from or in addition to power, social status and martial prowess [e.g. loyalty and endurance].³³

Starr³⁴ rejects the view that Theognis' *kakoi* are the "cream of an urban bourgeoisie of commercial and industrial origin," among other reasons because merchants and artisans were primarily *metoikoi*, resident aliens; Starr assumes rather that the *kakoi* were a secondary class of landowners just like the *agathoi*. The goatskins that Theognis speaks of were "the conventional attire of backwoods farmers"; Starr takes Hesiod to be such a "semi-aristocrat." Cerri³⁵ has elaborately analyzed the contrast between Theognis' "good" and

= his Poets, Prophets and Sages: Essays in Biblical Interpretation (1971) 162.

- 32 Thus J. G. Gammie & L. G. Perdue (eds.), *The Sage in Israel and the Ancient Near East* (1990) with 46 contributed chapters; see also R. N. Whybray, "The social world of the wisdom writers," pp. 227-250 of R. E. Clements (ed.), *The World of Ancient Israel: Sociological, Anthropological and Political Perspectives* (1989).
- 33 H. Lloyd-Jones, *The Justice of Zeus* (1971) 46-47.
- 34 C. G. Starr, *The Economic and Social Growth of Early Greece, 800-500 B.C.* (1977) 124-126.
- 35 G. Cerri, "La terminologia sociopolitica di Teognide: 1. l'opposizione semantica tra ἀγαθός — ἐσθλός e κακός — δειλός," *Quaderni urbinati di cultura classica* 6 (1968) 7-32. Cf. further M. T. W. Arnheim, *Aristocracy in Greek Society* (1977); I. Muñoz

"bad" men; it strongly resembles that between the "righteous" and "wicked" of Proverbs chapter 10 and following. Thus: "When it goes well with the righteous, the city rejoices; and when the wicked perish there are shouts of gladness" (Prov 11,10). A recent volume of essays on Theognis³⁶ with much subtlety still clearly affirms that "the poet who speaks in the Theognidea... is a true and authoritative spokesman for the Megarian aristocracy"; and that its program is "the restoration of a properly functioning aristocratic state."

But we should not confine our examination of either text to its notions of goodness and badness; we should ask what realms of practice and technology are most familiar to the authors. Crenshaw,³⁷ anticipating the results of Lichtheim, speaks of the "internationalization of wisdom" and the "high level of continuity" among Egyptian, Mesopotamian and Israelite wisdom texts, to which we are now adding Greek. What class of carriers can explain those international contacts?

Both proverbial collections presuppose that *wealth and wisdom naturally go together*: "Early to bed and early to rise / Makes a man healthy and wealthy and wise."³⁸ Of course this follows inevitably to the extent that wisdom is restricted to maxims about those things which bring wealth. Thus Theognis 1157 "Wealth and wisdom is always irresistible to mortals":

πλοῦτος καὶ σοφίη θνητοῖς ἀμαχώτατον αἰεὶ.

At Prov 8,18 (cf. 3,16) Wisdom (LXX σοφία) says "Riches and honor are with me, enduring wealth and justice":

עֵשֶׂר יִכְבוֹד אֲתִי הוּן עֲתָק וְצַדִּיקָה

LXX πλοῦτος καὶ δόξα ἐμοὶ ὑπάρχει, καὶ κτήσις πολλῶν καὶ δικαιοσύνη. (The text goes on "My fruit is *better* than gold..."; Prov 8,19, sect. 2 below). Or again, "To be under the protection of wisdom is as being under the protection of silver" (Koh 7,12):

כִּי בְצֵל הַחֲכָמָה בְּצֵל הַכֶּסֶף

Greeks logically expressed this connection by *identifying* men with their wealth. Thus Hesiod *Opera* 686 "For wealth is the life of wretched mortals":

χρήματα γὰρ ψυχῇ πέλεται δειλοῖσι βροτοῖσιν.

Here χρήματα are things of which one can "make use," in the first instance land. Alcaeus³⁹ quotes Aristodamos the Spartan and adds his own sentiment, "'Money is man,' and no poor man can be noble or held in honor":

Valle, "La Ideología de la Aristocracia Griega Antigua," Euphrosyne n.s. 8 (1977) 43-56.

36 T. J. Figueira & G. Nagy, *Theognis of Megara: Poetry and the Polis* (1985) 2, 4.

37 J. L. Crenshaw (ed.), *Studies in ancient Israelite Wisdom* (1976) 21.

38 ODEP³ 211; Benjamin Franklin in *Poor Richard's Almanac* (1757).

39 Lobel-Page, PLF no. 360.

χρήματ' ἄντηρ, πένηχος δ' οὐδ' εἷς πέλετ'
ἔσλος οὐδὲ τίμιος.

Pindar redoubles the sentiment, *Isthm.* 2.11

"χρήματα χρήματ' ἄντηρ" ὃς
φᾶ κτεάνων θ' ἅμα λειφθεῖς καὶ φίλων.

"It is money, money that is man,' he said who at once lost his possessions and his friends" (Proverb 1 above). Philosophers can see either man or money as the universal measure. Plato on the one hand citing others, "Every man is the measure of all things," πάντ' ἄνδρα πάντων χρημάτων μέτρον εἶναι (*Theaet.* 183C); he thinks himself that only the wise man is. Aristotle on the other, "[Coinage] measures all things," πάντα γὰρ [τὸ νόμισμα] μετρεῖ, *Eth. Nic.* 5.8 (= 1133a21). Aristophanes summarizes, "for all things are subject to wealth" (*Ploutos* 146):

ἅπαντα τῷ πλουτεῖν γὰρ ἐσθ' ὑπήκοα.

When coinage comes in, Aristophanes explicitly compares it to men. The old silver coinage (*Ranae* 720ff), composed of pieces "properly struck and ringing like a bell" (ὀρθῶς κοπεῖσι καὶ κεκωδωνισμένοις), has been rejected by the state; as also the citizens who were "wellborn and moderate...just and *kalokagathoi*" (727-728). In their place, Athenians are making use of plated coppers and "red-headed foreigners (ξένοις καὶ πυρρίαις), bad men from bad parents." The exquisite part of the comparison is that the silverplated coppers would wear through first on the high point of Athena's forehead and become "redheads."⁴⁰ Aristophanes' aristocratic thought is undisguised. A democratic shift is seen as an analogue to Gresham's law whereby the availability of bad men drives out good. Jesus' answer about the tribute money suggests that as the "things of Caesar" are denars, the "things of God" are men's lives, which they should earmark or dedicate to God as the denars to Caesar. For the "image of Caesar" (εἰκόν ... Καίσαρος Mark 12,16) echoes the "image of God" (εἰκόνα θεοῦ Gen 1,27 LXX). Housman says of young men dying early (*A Shropshire Lad* 23):

They carry back bright to the coiner the mintage of man.

9.2 The spread of a gold-economy

Both Israel and Hellas had well-to-do country landowners; but a class whose wealth and interests were confined to the land would not have the international

40 See W. B. Stanford, *Aristophanes: The Frogs* (1958) 134-135. The base owls are illustrated in C. Seltman, *Greek Coins*, 2nd ed. (1955) plate XXVII.10.

contacts required to mediate even the literary relations we have seen so far. What form of wealth does generate such contacts? The chorus in Aeschylus' *Agamemnon* 437-444 uses the international flow of gold, taken as well known, to describe the shipment of cremated Achaean dead back from Troy:

ὁ χρυσαμοιβὸς δ' Ἄρης σωμαίων
καὶ ταλαντοῦχος ἐν μάχῃ δορὸς
πυρῶθ' ἐξ Ἴλίου
φίλοισι πέμπει βαρὺ
ψῆγμα δυσδάκρυτον, ἀν-
τήνορος σποδοῦ γεμί-
ζων λέβητας εὐθέτου.

"And Ares, the gold-changer of bodies, he who holds the scales in the battle of the spear, sends back from Ilion to loved ones, refined in the fire, heavy dust bitterly lamented, filling urns with light ash in the place of men." The key words all refer to the money-changer's art. χρυσαμοιβός does not appear elsewhere; the *talanta* are his scales; ψῆγμα ... χρυσοῦ (Herodotus 4.195) is "gold dust"; πυρῶθ' must describe gold which has passed through the fire;⁴¹ perhaps λέβητες were used for shipping gold dust; γεμίζω is used of loading a ship, equally appropriate for the gold dust of the image and the funerary urns of the reality.

The *Oresteia* trilogy was put on in 458 BC; in the previous year Athens had sustained heavy losses, 170 men from a single tribe, "in Cyprus, Egypt, Phoenicia, Halieis, Aegina, Megara."⁴² The bodies of Athenians who fell abroad were apparently cremated on the battlefield and the ashes sent home. The passionate energy of the play, projected onto the past of the Trojan war where it would be bearable, is a comment on the Athenian empire, connecting the money-flow of imperial tribute and the inevitable deaths in war that it brings.

Heraclitus, when he needed a metaphor to explain his new idea about the underlying cosmic process of change, naturally went to the flow of money: "All things are an exchange for fire and fire for all things, just as goods are an exchange for gold and gold for goods".⁴³

πυρὸς τε ἀνταμοιβὴ τὰ πάντα καὶ πῦρ ἀπάντων ὅκωσπερ χρυσοῦ χρήματα καὶ χρημάτων χρυσός.

Here χρήματα is contrasted with gold and plainly means "goods, land." This is unimpeachable testimony that in the early fifth century BC gold was the ultimate source of value, although a greater volume (and perhaps value) of

41 E. Fraenkel, *Aeschylus, Agamemnon*; 3 vols. (1950) ii.226-231 sees no reference to refining of gold here.

42 The "Nointel Marble," now in the Louvre: Meiggs-Lewis no. 33 (p. 73) = IG i² 929.

43 Heraclitus frag. 90 Diels-Kranz FVS³ i.171.

silver circulated. We can now add that the *name* of gold moved from one society to another, and is implanted as a metaphor of human virtue in both proverb-books.

χρυσός must give the vocalization of Phoenician חרץ over against Hebrew חָרִץ *ḥarúwš*. For Phoenician (like Aramaic and unlike Hebrew) reduced the vowel in nouns before the accent (p. 204 above). It is one of the earliest loans to Greek from a specifically Phoenician source: for it surely appears in Linear B (below). A dialect inscription from Thebes⁴⁴ shows a different vowel closer to the Hebrew, "a jasper (Chapter 2.8 above) having gold through its midst," ΙΑΣΠΙΝ ΕΧΩΣΑΝ ΧΡΟΥΣΙΔΙΟΝ ΔΙΑ ΜΕΤΩ Phoenician e.g. KAI 24.12 (Kilamuwa)

ובעל כסף ובעל חרץ

"an owner of silver and owner of gold"; Ugaritic *ḥrš*; Akkadian *ḥurāšu*. Hebrew חָרִץ is marked as Phoenician when used for normal וְהָב; outside Proverbs only at Sach 9,3 as designating the gold of Tyre. The reverse process is at work in the Piraeus, where a Sidonian inscription (KAI 60) has:

עטרת חרץ בדרכנם 20

"a golden crown of twenty drachmas (darics?)⁴⁵," translating a regular Attic formula, e.g. χρυσῶν στεφανῶν ... ἀπο χιλίων δραχμῶν "a golden crown of a thousand drachmas." Möller⁴⁷ ingeniously took the Indo-European stem *arg-* "white, silver" (e.g. ἄργυρος, Latin *argentum*) as presupposing an initial laryngeal and cognate with Semitic חָרִץ.

Greek agrees with Ugaritic in four phrases for things made of gold; this clinches it that the word with its usages came in from somewhere on the Syrian coast. If alphabetic Phoenician were better attested it would show the same parallels; Hebrew texts have וְהָב. For "bricks of gold" see Chapter 2.6 above; for a "bowl (γαυλός) of gold" Chapter 4.7; for a "shekel of gold" and a "mina of gold" see below.

The golden age. Hesiod *Opera* 109 says that the Olympians made "first of all a golden race of mortal men,"

χρύσειον μὲν πρώτιστα γένος μερόπων ἀνθρώπων

44 IG 7.2420.19, 3rd century BC.

45 The inscription attests both דרִכְמָנִים and דרִכְמָנִים.

46 M. N. Tod, *A Selection of Greek Historical Inscriptions*, ii (1948) no. 167.24-26 (p. 194).

47 Hermann Möller, *Vergleichendes indogermanisch-semitisches Wörterbuch* (1911) 16; followed by A. Cuny, *Invitation à l'étude comparative des langues indo-européennes et des langues chamito-sémitiques* (1946) 140, 167; and by Allan R. Bomhard, *Toward Proto-Nostratic: A New Approach to the comparison of Proto-indo-european and Proto-Afroasiatic*, *Amsterdam Studies in the theory and history of linguistic science* IV.27 (1984), no. 242 p. 262.

followed by ages of silver and bronze, a heroic age, and an age of iron—only today drawing to a close:

We shall remain for some centuries in the Age of Iron, until the combusive uses of fire itself are called into question by a future generation impelled to stop the pollution of the earth's atmosphere.⁴⁸

Plato (*Rep.* 415A) associates the four classes in the state simultaneously with the same four metals; naturally the rulers are of gold. Hesiod is drawing from the same Oriental source as the late text Dan 2,32-33,⁴⁹ where the successive kings of Babylon are represented by a statue made from top to bottom out of fine gold (Aram. *כֶּהָב טָב*), silver, bronze, iron and clay. In a Phoenician version the golden head would be of *חָרָץ*. In Vergil *Aen.* 6.792-3 it is Augustus who will "found the golden ages," *aurea condet / saecula*. The theme was popular, for it appears in an anonymous satire on Tiberius (Suetonius *Tib.* 59.1) "Caesar, you have changed the golden ages of Saturn; for while you are alive they will always be iron":

Aurea mutasti Saturni saecula, Caesar;

Incolumi nam te ferrea semper erunt.

Rovere, working out Polanyi's suggestion about a "thalassophobia" of the Ancient Near Eastern empires, regards the coastal cities of Asia Minor and Palestine as a "No Man's Coast" composed of wealthy "ports of trade" which "happened to fit into an economic context to the international organization of trade, comprising that of the continental powers themselves."⁵⁰ Hittites, Assyrians, Babylonians both strove to control the coastal cities, and granted them quasi-autonomous status to engage in the sea-commerce at which they themselves felt incompetent. Both before and after the invention of coinage, the primary medium of that trade, as Heraclitus testifies, was gold, as being the most valuable per unit weight. Then the original carriers of that medium must have been, not scribes or landowners, nor yet in the beginning money-changers at tables, but those who actually handled the

48 T. A. Wertime & J. D. Muhly, *The Coming of the Age of Iron* (1980) xviii.

49 Bibliography: J. W. Swain, "The theory of the Four Monarchies: Opposition History under the Roman Empire," *Classical Philology* 35 (1940) 1-21; S. K. Eddy, *The King is Dead: Studies in the Near Eastern Resistance to Hellenism 334-31 BC* (1961) 16; D. Winston, "The Iranian Component in the Bible, Apocrypha and Qumran: A Review of the Evidence," *History of Religions* 5 (1965/6) 183-216, pp. 189-90; G. F. Hasel, "The Four World Empires of Daniel 2 Against its Near Eastern Environment," *JSOT* 12 (1979) 17-30; West, *Works and Days* ad loc.; D. Mendels, "The Five Empires: A Note on a Propagandistic *Topos*," *AJP* 102 (1981) 330-337.

50 R. B. Rovere, "No Man's Coast"; *Ports of Trade in the Eastern Mediterranean*, pp. 38-63 of *Trade and Market in the early Empires: Economies in History and Theory*, ed. K. Polanyi et alii (1957), p. 39.

gold for fineness and weight; we might call them *goldsmith-bankers*. The goldsmiths in a neo-Babylonian city are thought to be upper-class and within the temple administration rather than forming an autonomous guild.⁵¹ The class to which our proverb-books are most closely related is betrayed by a running metaphor common to both, in which, whether by contrast or comparison, men (women fall in another realm) are treated as if they were gold, and refined gold is the type of the worldly and intellectual virtues.

For the concrete occupation and art best known to both proverbial collections, and their preferred metaphor, is that of gold-working. Prov 8,10 (cf. 3,13-14; 8,19; 16,16) "Choose my instruction rather than silver, and knowledge rather than tested gold (LXX χρυσίον δεδοκιμαμένον)":

קחו מוסרי ואל כסף ודעת מחרוץ נבחר

ἄπεφθος χρυσός likewise means "refined gold from which the impurities have been smelted." Theognis compares himself with it (449 below), and it is used in inventory-like passages of the historians: Herodotus 1.50.2 ἡμιπλίνθια ... ἀπέφθου χρυσῶ "half-bricks of refined gold" etc. (cf. Thucydides 2.13.5). Pindar, who in the very beginning of his book praises gold which "shines like a fire by night beyond all other possessions of wealth" (*Olymp.* 1.1), makes a clear parallelism (*Nem.* 4.82-85): "Gold refined in the fire shows its full splendor, and the song of great deeds gives a man equal fortune to kings":

ὁ χρυσὸς ἐψόμενος
ἀνγὰς ἔδειξεν ἀπάσας, ὕμνος δὲ τῶν ἀγαθῶν
ἐργμάτων βασιλευσιν ἰσοδαίμονα τεύχει / φῶτα ...

The proverbial literature in both languages is marked by its special use as metaphor of the passage of gold through the fire, where the initial refining is not clearly distinguished from the testing of gold already refined. Thus Theognis 499-500 (anonymous) "Craftsmen recognize gold and silver in the fire, but wine shows the mind of a man":

ἐν πυρὶ μὲν χρυσόν τε καὶ ἄργυρον ἴδριες ἄνδρες
γινώσκουσ'· ἀνδρὸς δ' οἴνος ἔδειξε νόον

Compare Prov 17,3 "The crucible is for silver, and the furnace [evidently hotter] for gold; but it is Yahweh that *tries* hearts"

מִצָּרָף לְכֶסֶף וְכוּר לְאֵהָב וּבִחֵן לְבוֹת יְהוָה

Vg sicut igne probatur argentum et aurum camino, ita corda probat Dominus.

The Greek goldsmith (and silversmith) of the early age best remembered was Theodoros (Θεόδωρος) son of Telecles of Samos; he was the maker of Polycrates' ring, an emerald set in gold (Herodotus 1.15, 3.41). It ends up in

51 Johannes Renger, "Notes on the Goldsmiths, Jewelers and Carpenters of Neobabylonian Enna," *JAOS* 91 (1971) 494-503.

a fish's belly like the shekel of Matt 17,27; what passed for it was preserved in the temple of Concord at Rome (Pliny 37.4).⁵² Names which define a man as the gift of a god are rare in earlier Hellas, and *Theodoros* has a nice parallel in common Phoenician **בעליתן**.⁵³ Another Theodoros was a Phoenician shipping banker who made Phormio a loan on bottomry of 4,500 drachmas (Demosthenes 34.6). Note this Greek name in Phoenicia before Alexander. **Θέογονις** is either from **γίγνομαι** "born by the god" or **γιγνώσκω** "made known by the god"; if the latter, compare David's son **בְּעִלְיָדָב** (I Chron 14,7) "Baal"⁵⁴ has recognized [the father in the birth of a son]," altered as **עֲלִיָּדָב** II Sam 5,16. Another such is that **יְהוֹנָדָב**, whose son Benaiah was over the "Cretans" (**הַכְּרֵתִי** II Sam 8,18 etc.) and other mercenaries; another that **יְהוֹנָדָב** who brings gold and silver from Babylon (Sach 6,10). The international character of metal-working is illustrated by Hiram (I Reg 7,14) or Hiramabi of Tyre (II Chron 2,13), whose father is Tyrian and mother Israelite, who is competent to work in "gold, silver, bronze....," and is sent back from Tyre to work in Jerusalem.

The trade of Theodoros and the others is known to Homer as that of the **χρυσσοχόον** (*Od.* 3.425) who gold-plates the horns of the sacrificial bull (Chap. 6.4 above). Ventris & Chadwick⁵⁵ read *ku-ru-so-wo-ko*, i.e. ***χρυσσοφογοί** or the like, "goldsmiths," in the unique Pylos tablet 52 of "mixed tradesmen." The noun of profession occurs elsewhere only with silversmiths at Sap Sol 15,9 **χρυσουργούς** καὶ ἀργυροχόους, cf. **χρυσουργείων** "gold mines" at Strabo 4.6.7. The presence of **χρυσός** in Mycenaean Greek seems attested in spite of many uncertainties in the long tablet 244⁵⁶ *to-no we-a₂-re-jo a-ja-me-no ku-wa-no pa-ra-ku-we-ge ku-ru-so-ge* "a chair (...?) inlaid with kyanos and (...?) and gold." For *kyanos* see p. 88 above.

The excavations in Sardis at Pactolus North uncovered a goldsmiths' area with small concentric rings of earth, ash and clay fired at a high temperature, containing much lead slag and fragments of gold, which clearly reflect refining of gold by cupellation (heating in a ceramic vessel).⁵⁷ Herodotus 1.50 contrasts the bricks of "refined gold" (**χρυσσοῦ ἀπέφθου**) dedicated by

52 Theodoros was also a bronze-caster (Plato *Ion* 533B) and architect of the temple of Hera at Samos, which Pliny (34.83) calls a "labyrinth"; see Alison Burford, *Craftsmen in Greek and Roman Society* (1972) 192.

53 See the index to KAI.

54 Or Yahweh seen as the "Master."

55 DMG² 182-3.

56 Ibid. p. 344.

57 A. Ramage, "Pactolus North," and S. M. Goldstein, "The Examination of the Gold Sample from Pactolus North," pp. 16-26 and 26-29 of G. M. A. Hanfmann & J. C. Waldbaum (eds.), "The Eleventh and Twelfth Campaigns at Sardis (1968, 1969)," *BASOR* 199 (1970) 7-58.

Croesus at Delphi with those of "white gold" (λευκοῦ χρυσοῦ), apparently the native Lydian electrum, i.e. gold-silver alloy. Halleux⁵⁸ believes that Croesus, to give his coinage a stable base, developed the purification process for his electrum to become "the first bimetalist," emitting gold and silver coinages valued for their great purity.

For the goldsmiths' trade or guild to provide an international medium of exchange, two things were needed: generally recognized measures of *fineness* and of *weight*. The Greek test for fineness, the βάσανος or touchstone, first appears in Theognis; and while there it is used for uncoined bulk gold, it continued in use to test the composition of pieces of doubtful authenticity. One view is that the original purpose of Greek coinage was less to serve new economic interests than to act as a "civic emblem"⁵⁹ and claim a share in an existing commerce; another⁶⁰ that it was to pay off mercenaries. But at all times a test for the fineness of gold was critical. The touchstone was used to test the percentage of gold in an alloy by the color of a trace; Lord⁶¹ found it still in use in the goldsmiths' quarter of Athens and still called "the Lydian stone"; he gives a chemical analysis.

Theognis 449-452 (cf. 417-8 = 1105-6) defines the self-awareness of the aristocrat in terms of the touchstone, whose use is presumed familiar:

εὐρήσεις δέ με πᾶσιν ἐπ' ἔργμασιν ὥσπερ ἄπεφθον
 χρυσόν, ἐρυθρὸν ἰδεῖν τριβόμενον βασάνῳ,
 τοῦ χροῖης καθύπερθε μέλας οὐχ ἄπτεται ἰὸς
 οὐδ' εὐρώς, αἰεὶ δ' ἄνθος ἔχει καθαρὸν.

"You will find me in all my works like refined gold, red to see when rubbed with the touchstone, on whose surface black rust and mold never seize, but which forever has its pure bloom." (Contrast James 5,2-3, cited at 2.3 above, where not only silver but also gold tarnishes.) A fragment of Bacchylides actually inscribed on a jewel now lost, perhaps a touchstone, reads:⁶²

Λυδία μὲν γὰρ λίθος μανύει χρυσόν, ἀνδρῶν δ' ἀρετὰν σοφία τε
 παγκρατῆς τ' ἐλέγχει ἀλάθεια.

"The Lydian stone proclaims gold; wisdom and omnipotent truth show the virtue of a man." So Pindar, *Pyth.* 10.67-8:

πειρῶντι δὲ καὶ χρυσὸς ἐν βασάνῳ πρέπει
 καὶ νόος ὀρθός.

58 R. J. Halleux, "L'affinage de l'or, de Crésus aux premiers alchimistes," *Janus* 62 (1975) 79-102; see J. Ramin, *La technique minière et métallurgique des Anciens*, Coll. Latomus 153 (1977) 129-138.

59 M. Austin & P. Vidal-Naquet, *Economic and Social History of Greece* (1977) 57.

60 Y. Garland, *La guerre dans l'antiquité* (1972) 202.

61 L. E. Lord, "The Touchstone," *Classical Journal* 32 (1936/37) 428-431.

62 Ed. B. Snell, 8th ed. (1961), 51*, 89.

"When you test it, gold shines out on the touchstone, and also right wisdom." Theocritus 12.36-37 indicates that in his day it was used by moneychangers, *argyramoiboi* (with neglect of the etymological sense of "silver") simply to distinguish between gold and counterfeit:

Λυδίη ἴσον ἔχειν πέτρη στόμα, χρυσὸν ὀποίη
 πέϋθονται μὴ φαῦλος ἐτήτυμον ἀργυραμοιβοί.

"to make his lips like the Lydian stone by which moneychangers test the true gold lest it be false." Since coined money was invented in Lydia, it is plausible that this test of gold content should also have come to Greece from Lydia and been known by its name. Theophrastus (*de lap.* 45-47) describes the usage of the touchstones known to him. In the fourth century BC Athens had a public slave, the *dokimastes*, who examined coins for their purity: "Let the public tester sitting among the tables test..." [Ο ΔΕ] ΔΟΚΙΜΑΣΤΗΣ Ο ΔΗΜΟΣΙΟΣ ΚΑΘΗΜΕΝΟΣ ΜΕ[ΤΑΕΥ ΤΩΝ ΤΡ]ΑΠΕΖΩΝ ΔΟΚΙΜΑΖΕΤΩ.⁶³

Egyptian *bhn* is some kind of dark hard stone compared with βασανίτης λίθος.⁶⁴ Kretschmer⁶⁵ thinks it the origin of βάσανος. In one Hebrew passage there is an apparent noun made from the root נָחַב, Isa 28,16 נָחַבְתָּ נְחָבָה, *ʿēben bohan*, Vg *lapidem probatum*; it could mean "stone approved by testing" or "stone used for testing." Lambdin⁶⁶ thinks the connection of the Egyptian with the Hebrew "more than a likelihood". And in both Greek and Hebrew the nouns correspond to well-attested denominative verbs, with the sense "not merely test but actually refine by passing through fire." βασανίζω further means "torture." duBois⁶⁷ draws far-reaching conclusions: the Greeks saw truth as something hidden in bodies that must be extracted by "torture" as confessions from a slave; slaves differed from free persons most fundamentally in their being subject to torture.

The metaphor of the touchstone, βάσανος, applied to free men meant more mildly their testing by the trials of life. Plato (*Gorgias* 486D): "Callicles, if I happened to have a soul made of gold, don't you think that I would be glad to find one of those stones by which they test (βασανίζουσιν) gold, the best kind; and that when I rubbed my soul on it, if it should assert that my soul had been well taken care of, I would be assured that I was in good shape, and would need no other touchstone (βασάνου)?" The transferred

63 Ronald S. Stroud, "An Athenian Law on Silver Coinage," *Hesperia* 43 (1974) 157-188; lines 5-6. The same office appears in Menander frag. 581.8, ed. A. Koerte (1959) 2nd ed., ii.188. There was early an ἀργυραμοιβήιον at Thasos: H. Duchêne, *La Stèle du Port...*; *Etudes Thasiennes* 14 (1992) line 42.

64 Erman-Grapow i.471.

65 P. Kretschmer, *Glotta* 24 (1936) 90.

66 T. O. Lambdin, "Egyptian Loan Words in the Old Testament," *JAOS* 73 (1953) 145-155, p. 148.

67 Page duBois, *Torture and Truth* (1991).

meaning is plain in Plato *Republic* 3.413E βασανίζοντας πολὺ μᾶλλον ἢ χρυσὸν ἐν πυρί "testing [the young men] much more than gold in the fire." Compare then Prov 17,3 quoted above; also Sach 13,9 "And I will put this third in the fire, and refine them like the refining of silver, *and test* (Luther *prüfen*) *them like the testing of gold*":

וַיִּצְרְפוּתִים כְּצֶרֶף אֶת־הַכֶּסֶף וּבְחַנְתִּים כְּבַחַן אֶת־הַזָּהָב

LXX καὶ δοκιμῶ αὐτοὺς ὡς δοκιμάζεται τὸ χρυσοῖον. Job 23,10 "He has tried me, I shall come forth as gold".⁶⁸

בְּחַנְיָ כְּזָהָב אֲצֵא

In Phoenician this would have come out with the alternative name of gold, צָרַח, an exact parallel to Plato's usage. The root בַּחַח makes a unique noun of agent at Jer 6,27-30 "I have made you an assayer (or refiner, LXX δοκιμαστήν), among my people"

בְּחַחֵן נִתְתִּיךָ בְּעַמִּי

with an elaborate metallurgical metaphor.

The incorporation of Greece into Near-Eastern gold-banking is further illustrated by its adherence to the Babylonian system of weights. The Akkadians divided weight (as we still do the hour and the angle of an equilateral triangle) into sixty parts of sixty parts each. (Levin notes that French *soixante-dix* for "70" suggests remote Babylonian influence.) The largest weight was what a man could carry: Akkadian *bilu*, Hebrew כֶּכֶר, Greek τάλαντον. The Greek is from the verb appearing in τλῆ (*Iliad* 8.78 etc.) "he suffered, endured" but with the physical sense illustrated in Latin *tulit* "he carried"; it is tempting to compare Targumic תְּלֵא "he hung" and Hebrew תְּלֵא (spelled exactly the same as the Greek!). In each language it had a different name because that much gold did not usually move.⁶⁹ The smallest unit, which became the standard for a silver or gold coin, was international in the Middle East: Akkadian *siqlu*, Hebrew שֶׁקֶל, Aramaic קֶלֶת (for its usage at Dan 5,25 see p. 50 above). But Greek developed its own names for coins and only in a couple of places is "shekel" taken over. At Xenophon *Anab.* 1.5.6 the Hellenes buy grain in the Lydian market for four σίγλων per καπίθην. The LXX transliterated σίκλος; hence Eupolemus⁷⁰ "ten shekels of gold," χρυσοῦ σίκλους ... δέκα representing unattested Hebrew-Phoenician *צִיָּקְלִי הָרִיבִּי.

Thus the intermediate weight of from one to two pounds was the trade unit of gold: Akkadian *manû*, Hebrew מִנָּה, Biblical Aramaic מְנָא (Dan 5,25),

68 R. C. van Leeuwen, "A Technical Metallurgical Usage of צֵא," ZAW 98 (1986) 112-113, shows that it refers to casting; see Ex 32,24 "and out came (צֵא) this calf."

69 The "half talent of gold" of *Iliad* 23.751, only a third prize, must be a small weight of gold equivalent in purchasing power to a half-talent of bronze.

70 Jacoby FGH 723 F 2.34.15 = Eusebius *Praep. Ev.* 9.34.15.

Ionic *μνῆ, Attic μνᾶ, Latin *mina* (since Plautus). The Attic pronunciation is essentially the same as the Aramaic (and Phoenician?), and in retrograde script the letters are the corresponding Semitic letters מנא. Here is one word anyway which could have facilitated the takeover of the alphabet from expressing Phoenician to Greek.

Ez 45,12 LXX prescribes 50 shekels to the mina as the sexagesimal system became unfamiliar. At Ezra 2,69, Neh 7,71-72 the mina measures silver, while the gold is in darics (or drachmas?). At I Reg 10,17 the mina measures gold, "three minas of gold,"

שְׁלֹשָׁת מִנִּים זָהָב

LXX τρεῖς μναὶ χρυσίου. Other Semitic texts have the normal word for gold. Thus in Ugaritic, Niqmad's tribute includes *šrm tq̄l kbd [...] mn hrš* "20 heavy shekels...minas of gold."⁷¹ The ideograms of Amarna 3.15 imply 30 *manā hurāša*. Beside the archaic temple of Artemis at Ephesus there was found a silver plaque of about 550 BC which lists building donations for the temple,⁷² ΔΕΚΑ ΔΕ ΑΙ ΕΝΘΕΝΔΕ ΕΣΤΑΘΗΣΑΝ ΜΝΕΑΙ ΧΡΥΣΟ "and from here there were deposited ten minas of gold." The mina thenceforward is a measure of gold as at Herodotus 1.51.2 εἶνατον ἡμιτάλαντον καὶ ἔτι δῶδεκα μνέας; the peculiar expression seems well attested as meaning "eight and a half talents and twelve minas."

The upper-class orientation of Proverbs and Theognis is not absolute nor without ambiguity. Greek "good man" and Hebrew "righteous man," although used in reference to a member of a wealthy and powerful class familiar with gold-banking and deemed wise, do not carry unqualified approval of that class. The parallelism between man and refined gold presupposes an objective standard of human worth. An integral part of that standard lies in recognizing the tendency of the oligarchic class to overreach itself through insolence (ὕβρις). Tribute is paid to a principle of justice in human dealings. Thus Prov 8,19-20 (Hebrew cited at p. 73 above) "My [Wisdom's] fruit is better than gold (זָהָב), even fine gold, and my yield than choice silver; I walk in the way of justice (LXX δικαιοσύνης), among the paths of equity." Theognis 145-148: "Choose to dwell piously with few possessions rather than to be rich having acquired possessions unjustly; for all virtue is summed up in justice, and every man who is just, Kyrnos, is good." The gnomic poetry mediated by a pre-banking class is doing more than simply serving the interests of that class; it also carries symbols and concepts which even in their internal use by that class expose or correct its interests.

71 Gordon UT 118.20 = KTU 3.1.20.

72 LSAG² plate 66 no. 53.

Excursus E: Motifs, Comparisons, Proverbs

Here I gather further proverbs attested both in Greek (or Latin) and in West-Semitic alphabetic texts.¹ I preface two bodies of material that do not quite fall into the category of proverbs, but show nice agreements: (E.1) ethical and religious motifs; (E.2) comparisons of color, quality and number.

Good later sources state that Greeks by the time of Alexander had knowledge of Oriental proverb-collections under the name of Ahiqar. Diogenes Laertius 5.50 lists a book Ἀκίχαρος among the very numerous writings of Theophrastus. Clement of Alexandria² says that "Democritus [perhaps not a genuine attribution] composed the *Babylonian Ethical Sayings*; for he is said to have had the 'tablet' of Akikaros translated and to have arranged it in his own compositions":

Δημόκριτος γὰρ τοὺς Βαβυλωνίου λόγους ἠθικοὺς πεποιήται· λέγεται γὰρ τὴν Ἀκικάρου στήλην ἐρμηνευθεῖσαν τοῖς ἰδίοις συντάξει συγγράμμασι.

Clement may not have known what a cuneiform tablet was, but his στήλην surely attests to a tradition of such. Strabo 16.2.39 in a list of prophets includes "Achaikaros among the men of the Bosphorus [better Borsippa?]," παρὰ δὲ τοῖς Βοσπορηνοῖς [Βορσιππηνοῖς?] Ἀχαϊκάρος. The tale of Ahiqar is known from the 5th century BC in Aramaic fragments from Elephantine of Egypt:³ Ahiqar (אחיקר) the "wise scribe, counsellor of all Assyria,"

פּראַ חכּימא יעט אַתּר כּלּה

lived under Esarhaddon (אַסרַחאַדן), cf. II Reg 19,37 אַסרַחַדְן. So at Tobit 1,21-22 (cf 11,18) Ἀκίχαρος (variously spelled) is Tobit's nephew and the administrator of Esarhaddon (Σαχερδονος nom. sing.).⁴ We have versions of Ahiqar's proverbs in Syriac (one cited below), Arabic and other languages. Such a book could have been the source of agreements like those cited below.

1 For references see the Bibliography at the end.

2 Clem. Alex. *Strom.* 1.69.4 = Pseudo-Democritus, Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ 68 F 299.

3 Cowley p. 212; i.1, 12.

4 In the Aramaic Tobit from Qumran (ed. J. Fitzmyer, *Biblica* 75 [1994] 220-224) the names are אַחיקר and אַסרַחאַדן.

E.1 Ethical and religious motifs

E.1.1 The "Golden Rule" in its negative form

Pittakos in the "Sayings of the Seven Sages":⁵ "What you resent in another, do not yourself do":

ὄσα νεμεσῶς τῷ πλησίον, αὐτὸς μὴ ποίει
Anksheshonqy 15.23⁶ "Do not do to a man what you hate so as to cause another to do it to you." Tobit 4,15 καὶ ὁ μισεῖς, μηδενὶ ποιήσης. A non-Jew asked Hillel to teach him the whole Law while he was standing on one leg; Hillel said (Bab. Talm. *Shabb.* 31a) "What is hateful to you do not do to your neighbor:

דעלך סני לחברך לא תעביד

All the rest is commentary; go and learn it." Act 15,29 (codex D) "And what you do not wish to happen to yourselves, do not do to another," καὶ ὄσα μὴ θέλετε ἑαυτοῖς γίνεσθαι, ἐτέρῳ μὴ ποιεῖν. The Egyptian shows how the maxim can be understood in a merely prudential sense.

E.1.2 "Befriend strangers"

Lev 19,34 "And you shall love [the stranger] as yourself, for you were strangers in the land of Egypt":

וְאַהֲבַתְּ לוֹ כְּמוֹךָ כִּי־גֵרִים הָיִיתֶם בְּאֶרֶץ מִצְרַיִם

Menander,⁷ "Befriend strangers, lest you become a stranger":

ξένους ξένιζε, μήποτε ξένος γένη

E.1.3 "The sin of the fathers"

Ex 20,5 "Visiting the sin of the fathers upon the sons,"

פֶּקֶד עוֹן אָבֹת עַל־בְּנֵיהֶם

Euripides⁸ "The gods turn the faults of the parents upon the children"

5 Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ i.64.

6 Lichtheim 31-35.

7 Menander *Sent.* 554 ed. S. Jaekel (1964).

8 Euripides frag. 980 Nauck 676 = Plutarch *de sera num. vind.* 12 (*Mor.* 556E). There are numerous Hebrew and Greek parallels, none quite so close, in Moshe Weinfeld, "Traces of Hittite cult in Shiloh, Bethel and in Jerusalem," OBO 129, 455-472, pp. 460-461.

τὰ τῶν τεκόντων σφάλματ' εἰς τοὺς ἐκγόνους
οἱ θεοὶ τρέπουσιν.

E.1.4 "Born but to die"

Manilius 4.16 "In our birth we die, and our end depends on our beginning":
nascentes morimur, finisque ab origine pendet.

Avoth IV.22 (R. Eleazar) "Those that are born are such in order to die, and those who die are in order to live [in the resurrection]":

הילודים למות והמתים לחיות

Pope (*Essay on Man* II.10) "Born but to die, and reas'ning but to err."

E.1.5 "Earth to earth"

This is a central theme of all three languages, and I here just note some examples. Gen 3,19 "For you are dust, and to dust you will return," LXX
ὅτι γῆ εἶ καὶ εἰς γῆν ἀπελεύσει

כִּי־צֶפֶר אֶתָּה וְאֶל־צֶפֶר תָּשׁוּב

Koh 3,20 "Everything was from dust, and everything returns to dust":

הַכֹּל הָיָה מִן־הָעֶפֶר וְהַכֹּל שׁוֹב אֶל־הָעֶפֶר

Xenophanes⁹ "For all things are from earth, and in earth all things end":

ἐκ γαίης γὰρ πάντα καὶ εἰς γῆν πάντα τελεῖται.

Lucretius 2.999-1000 "For what before was from earth returns to earth":

cedit enim retro, de terra quod fuit ante, / in terras...

I treat these more fully elsewhere.¹⁰

E.1.6 "Better not to have been born"¹¹

Besides the classical statement at Job 3 "Let the day perish wherein I was born," see Theognis 425-6 (echoed by Sophocles *Oed. Col.* 1225-6):

πάντων μὲν μὴ φῦναι ἐπιχθονίοισιν ἄριστον,
μηδ' εἶσιδεῖν ἀγῶας ὄξεος ἡελίου.

9 Xenophanes frag. 27, Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ i.135.

10 "Yahweh, Zeus, Jupiter: The High God and the Elements," ZAW 106 (1994) 175-197, pp. 194-195. Grotius 2.19.2.1-2 discusses some of the passages in the context of the practice of burying bodies in the earth.

11 See David Daube, "Black Hole," *Rechtshistorisches Journal* 2 (1983) 177-193; cf. further Lichtheim 131.

"Best of all for mortals is not to have been born nor to see the rays of the bright sun." Cf. Koh 4,3 "Better than both [dead and living] is he who has never been, and has not seen the evil deeds that are done under the sun":

וְטוֹב מִשְׁנֵיהֶם אֶת אֲשֶׁר-עָרַן לֹא הָיָה אֲשֶׁר לֹא-רָאָה אֶת-הַמַּעֲשֵׂה הַרַע אֲשֶׁר נַעֲשָׂה
תַּחַת הַשֶּׁמֶשׁ

Mark 14,21 (= Matt 26,24) picks up the phrase but restricts it to a specific evil-doer, "it would have been good for that man not to have been born," καλὸν αὐτῷ εἰ οὐκ ἐγεννήθη ὁ ἄνθρωπος ἐκεῖνος. *Odyssey* 8.312 Hephaestus speaks of his two parents, "Would that they had not begotten me," τὼ μὴ γείνασθαι ὄφελλον, cf. Jer 20,14 "Cursed be the day on which I was born, the day when my mother bore me...cursed be the man who brought the news to my father."

E.2 Comparisons

E.2.1 Of color

Greek vases employ the colors white, black and red-brown; and neither Greek nor Hebrew color-vocabulary goes much beyond those three.¹² Thr 4,7-8 "Her princes were purer than snow, whiter than milk":

וְכֹה נִזְרִיָּהּ מִשֶּׁלֶג צָחוּ מִחֶלֶב

LXX ... ὑπὲρ χιόνα ... ὑπὲρ γάλα; Vg *candidiores Nazirei eius niue, nitidiores lacte*. The text goes on "their bodies were redder than coral(?)... now their faces are blacker than soot(?)." Isa 1,18 "Though your sins are like scarlet (LXX ὡς φοινικοῦν, Vg *ut coccinum*, Luther *blutrot*) they shall be white as snow (LXX ὡς χιόνα λευκανῶ, Vg *quasi nix dealbabuntur*):

אִם-יְהִי חֲטָאֵיכֶם כַּשָּׁנִים כַּשֶּׁלֶג יִלְבִּינִי

and the text goes on in parallelism "though they are red like crimson they shall be as wool."¹³

Greek and Latin commonly have "whiter than snow." *Iliad* 10.437

λευκότεροι χιόνος, θείειν δ' ἀνέμοισιν ὁμοῖοι

horses "whiter than snow, and like the winds for running"; imitated by Vergil at *Aen.* 12.84:

qui candore niues anteirent, cursibus auras.

12 Athalya Brenner, *Colour Terms in the Old Testament*; JSOT Sup. Series 21 (1982).

13 For "white as snow" Biblically see further Ps 51,9; Dan 7,9; and (in a variant reading) Mark 9,3.

Plato *Phaedo* 110C γύψου ἢ χιόνος [γῆν] λευκοτέραν "a land whiter than chalk or snow"; Catullus 80.2 *hiberna...candidiora niue* "whiter than winter snow." Ovid agrees with Thr 4,7 in a double comparison with snow and milk. *Ex Ponto* 2.5.37-38

... sed sunt tua pectora lacte

et non calcata candidiora niue

"Your heart is whiter than milk and untrodden snow"; *Heroides* 16.251-2 *pectora uel puris niuibus uel lacte...candidiora*.

So for "black." Cant 5,11 "His locks are wavy(?), black as a raven":

קוצותיו תלתלים שחורות כעורב

LXX μέλανες ὡς κόραξ, Vg *nigrae quasi coruus*. Petronius 43.7 *aetatem bene ferebat, niger tamquam coruus*; "He bore his age well, [his hair was] black as a raven."¹⁴ "Raven" is a plausible item of common vocabulary: see the plurals ערבי 'orābey Prov 30,17 with *corūi*. Thr 4,8 (cited above) might mean "as black as pitch," a frequent comparison in Greek and Latin.¹⁵ Greek and Latin avoid "red as blood" in contrast with II Reg 3,22 דם הַמַּיִם אֲדָמִים "the water was red as blood", suggesting an etymological connection; LXX τὰ ὕδατα πυρρὰ (avoiding ἐρυθρά) ὡσεὶ αἷμα, Vg *aquas rubras quasi sanguinem*. Greek hardly ever even calls blood red; at Horace *Carm.* 3.13.7 the Bandusian waters are stained *rubro sanguine* in a sacrifice. But Greek can say "redder than scarlet," ἐρυθρότερον κόκκου.¹⁶

E.2.2 Comparisons of quality

Words may be "sweeter than honey," Ps 19,11 (cf. 119.103) "[The judgements of Yahweh] are sweeter than honey," שְׂמֵחִים מְדַבְּרִים, LXX γλυκύτερα ὑπὲρ μέλι, Vg *dulciora super mel*. Thus *Iliad* 1.249 of Nestor:

τοῦ καὶ ἀπὸ γλώσσης μέλιτος γλυκίων ῥέειν αὐδὴ

"The speech flowed from his mouth sweeter than honey," in Latin translation¹⁷ *cuius ore sermo melle dulcior profluebat*. So Cicero *Orator* 32 *sermo...melle dulcior* "speech sweeter than honey." Jud 14,18 may originally not have been the answer to a riddle but another riddle (p. 229), whose answer was "Love"; "What is sweeter than honey, stronger than a lion?":

מַה־מְתוֹק־מְדַבֵּשׁ וְיָמָה צוֹ מְאַרְי

14 Greek does not say "black as a raven" but treats white ravens as a rarity, *Anth. Pal.* 11.417 (cf. Juvenal 7.202); so in English ODEP³ 885. For "black as a raven" see ODEP³ 63 since Chaucer.

15 *Iliad* 4.275-277; Ovid *Met.* 12.402 etc.; cf. ODEP³ 63 since 1410.

16 Dromo frag. 1.4 Kock ii.419 = Athenaeus 6.240D.

17 *Rhet. ad Her.* 4.44.

Plautus is in the same realm; *Asin.* 614 *oh melle dulci dulcior tu es* "Oh you are sweeter than sweet honey"; *Per.* 3 *cum leone...deluctari mauelim / quam cum amore* "I prefer to fight with a lion than with love."

Gall and wormwood. Prov 5,3-4 "Her mouth is smoother than olive oil, but afterwards she is as as bitter as wormwood":

וְחֶלֶק מִשְׁמֵן חֲכָה וְאַחֲרֵיהָ מֶרֶה כְּלַעֲנָה

Vg *nitidius oleo guttur eius; nouissima autem illius amara quasi absinthium.* Ovid describes the land of his exile, *ex Ponto* 3.8.15-16 "The hideous fields bear gloomy wormwood (*tristia...absinthia*), the land by this fruit teaches how bitter (*amara*) it is." Alexis¹⁸ "Are not these more bitter than gall itself?"

ταὐτ' οὐχὶ μικρότερον ἔστιν αὐτῆς τῆς χολῆς;
Jerome *Epist.* 128.2.3 *amarius felle* "more bitter than gall." Hebrew for "gall, bile" is just "bitterness": Job 16,13 מֶרְרָתִי "my gall." It is tempting to compare מֶר with Latin *amarus*.

"Hard as a stone." Job 41,16 of Leviathan, "his heart is hard as a stone,"

לְבוֹ יִצְוֶק כְּמוֹ אֲבָן

LXX ἡ καρδία αὐτοῦ πέπηγεν ὡς λίθος, Vg *cor eius indurabitur quasi lapis.* *Od.* 23.103, Telemachus to Penelope, "But your heart is always harder than a stone":

σοὶ δ' αἰεὶ κραδίη στερεωτέρη ἔστι λίθοιο
Ovid *Ars Amat.* 1.475-6 "What is harder than a stone, softer than water? But hard stones are still hollowed out by soft water" (see Proverb 14 below):

quid magis est saxo durum, quid mollius unda?

dura tamen molli saxa cauantur aqua.

Hearts are frequently described as of stone.

E.2.3 Comparisons of number

A repeated formula makes Abraham's seed as the stars of heaven: Gen 15,5 "Number the stars if you can number them...so shall your seed be":¹⁹

סֶפֶר הַנוֹכְבִּים אִם-תּוּכַל לְסַפֵּר אֹתָם ... כֹּה יִהְיֶה יִרְעָךָ

So Ovid *Ars Amat.* 1.59-60 "As many stars as the sky holds, so many girls does your Rome; [Venus] the mother of Aeneas has settled in the city of her son":

Quot caelum stellas, tot habet tua Roma puellas;
Mater in Aeneae constitit urbe sui.

18 Alexis frag. 16.12 Kock ii.303 = Athenaeus 6.224F.

19 Further Gen 32,13 (as the sand of the sea), 26,4; Exod 32,13; Deut 1,10; 10,22; 28,62.

This is half of a common formula of uncountability. Gen 22,17 "And I will multiply your seed as the stars of heaven and as the sand on the 'lip' (LXX χεῖλος)²⁰ of the sea":

וְהִרְבָּה אֲרֵבָה אֶת יְרֵעָה כְּכּוֹכְבֵי הַשָּׁמַיִם וְכַחֹל אֲשֶׁר עַל שֹׁפֶת הַיָּם

Cf. Jer 33,22 "As the host of heaven cannot be numbered or the sand of the sea be counted," so will the seed of David be:

אֲשֶׁר לֹא יִסְפָּר צְבָא הַשָּׁמַיִם וְלֹא יִמַּד חוֹל הַיָּם

Dionysodorus and his brother claim to know everything (Plato, *Euthyd.* 294b). Socrates: "And do you two know these things: how many the stars are? and the sand?" τοὺς ἀστέρας ὅπόσοι εἰσὶ, καὶ τὴν ἄμμον; Lesbia (Catullus 7) asks how many kisses will be enough; the poet answers "As many as the Libyan sand...or as many as the stars, when the night is silent":

Quam magnus numerus Libyssae harenae...

aut quam sidera multa cum tacet nox

So Ovid *Tristia* 1.5.47-48 "I have suffered as many ills as there are stars shining in the sky, or as many tiny bodies as are contained in the dry dust":

tot mala sum passus, quot in aethere sidera lucent

paruaque quot siccus corpora pulvis habet.²¹

Only a divine or mantic mind could number such. Ps 139,17-18 "How precious to me are thy thoughts, O El! ...If I count them they are more than the sand":

אֲסַפְּרֶם מִחֹל יַרְבּוֹן

Compare Pindar *Olymp.* 13.46 (cf. 2.98), victories are too long a tale, "I could not count the number of the sea's pebbles," οὐκ ἂν εἰδείην λέγειν ποντιᾶν ψάφων ἀριθμόν. Ps 147,4 (cf Isa 40,26) "He counts the number of the stars,

מוֹנֵה מִסְפָּר לְכוֹכְבֵימ

all of them he calls by name." God gave Solomon wisdom "like the sand on the lip of the sea" (I Reg 5,9). At Herodotus 1.47.3 the Delphic prophetess tells visitors "And I know the count of the sand and the measure of the sea":²²

οἶδα δ' ἐγὼ ψάμμου τ' ἀριθμόν καὶ μέτρα θαλάσσης

20 Compare Mimnermus frag 11a.3, West IEG ii.86, "on the lip of Ocean," Ὠκεανοῦ παρά χεῖλος

21 Ovid at *Tristia* 4.1.55-59 compares the number of his sufferings to grains of sand, fish in the sea; eggs in the fish (for he has been sampling Pontic caviar); and the products of the four seasons—flowers, ears of wheat, apples, snowflakes. See further the texts cited by Otto on *sidus* (p. 321) and *harena* (p. 159).

22 Compare Isa 48,18-19 where righteousness is as the waves of the sea and offspring like the sand; Aeschylus *PV* 89-90 "and the innumerable laughter of the sea-waves," ποντίων τε κυμάτων / ἀνήριθμον γέλασμα.

Archimedes wrote a book Ψαμμίτης "The Sand-Measurer"; it is echoed by Horace (*Carm.* 1.28.1-2) on Archytas, "the measurer of sea and land and the innumerable sand," *te maris et terrae numeroque carentis harenae / mensorem*. The Sibyl asked for as many years "as the sand has grains," *quot haberet corpora pulvis* (Ovid *Met.* 14.137). Sirach 1,2 "Who shall count the sand of the seas and the drops of rain and the days of eternity?"²³ The Phoenician text from Pyrgi (KAI 277, Nachtrag), though of uncertain meaning, suggests how the phrase could have travelled:

ושנת למאש אלם בבתי שנת כם הככבם אל

"And may the years of the image of the divinity in his house be as the years of these(?) stars."²⁴

E.3 International Proverbs²⁵

Proverbs 1-5 are in the text of 9.1 above.

Proverb 6: "The wine is the master's, the goodness is the butler's." I.e., the butler is the real master of the house. Here uniquely I find a Sumerio-Akkadian parallel, "Giving pertains to a king, showing favor to a steward."²⁶ Aristophanes *Equites* 1205 with the second half implies the whole, "but the favor is his who served it":

οὐ γὰρ ἀλλὰ τοῦ παραθέντος ἡ χάρις

An exact agreement between Latin and Rabbinic: Petronius 31.2 *Vinum dominicum, ministratoris gratia est*; Bab. Talm. *Baba Qamma* 92b, noted as a saying²⁷

חמרא דמריה טיבותא לשקיייה

The English form is attested since 1639.²⁸

This and other proverbs attested by Petronius (nos. 10-12 below) have special features. Their appearance in Rabbinic writers (who can hardly have known Petronius' novel) shows that the Latin author is not inventing but genuinely (as he purports to do) transmitting the phrases of parvenus. How

23 Matt 10,30 // Luk 12,6 "But even the hairs of your head have all been numbered."

24 Elsewhere an army is compared to the sand: see Jos 11,4; Jud 7,12; I Sam 13,5; II Sam 17,11; Rev 20,8; and (in effect) *Iliad* 9.381-385.

25 I do not claim much originality in this collection; most of the Rabbinic parallels are from Lewy and Lieberman (see Bibliography at end). I have tried to include in the present work an anthology of what is already known. Much harvest remains out there to be gathered in.

26 W. G. Lambert, *Babylonian Wisdom Literature* (1960) 259; the first half exists only in the Sumerian.

27 Lieberman p. 152.

28 ODEP³ 896.

did they appear in the Romance languages and English before 1650? For the unique MS (Parisinus 7989, "H") of the *Cena Trimalchionis* (in which they all appear) was not rediscovered until that year, and not published until 1664. Thus they were transmitted orally, and not by scholars extracting them from the *Satyricon*. If Petronius had not used Proverbs 10-12, we would have had no evidence that they ever existed in Latin, nor any explanation of the agreement between Rabbinic and European traditions! Undoubtedly other such agreements exist, pointing to Latin proverbs which never got written down at all.

Proverb 7: "If I be hanged I'll choose my gallows." Aristophanes *Ranae* 736 "And if you fail, at least it will be 'from a good tree':"

... κἄν τι σφαλῆτ', ἐξ ἀξίου γοῦν τοῦ ξύλου

The Scholiast²⁹ says that it is "From the proverb, 'At least be hanged from a good tree'," κατὰ τὴν παροιμίαν, ἀπὸ καλοῦ ξύλου κἄν ἀπάγξασθαι. Rabbi 'Aqiba (Bab. Talm. *Pesahim* 112a) "If you wish to be strangled, hang yourself from a big tree";

אם בקשת ליחנק היתלה באילן גדול

In English well-attested since 1631;³⁰ men seek distinction even in death. Various sources³¹ cite "Publilius Syrus 911" *uel strangulari pulcro de ligno iuuat*, which I have not found in any edition easily available. Publilius "the Syrian" was a slave from Antioch (Pliny 35.199) and a promising candidate to have brought Semitic proverbs to the West.

Proverb 8: "As you sow, so shall you reap." Prov 22,8 (cf. Job 4,8; Hos 8,7; 10,13) "He who sows injustice will reap calamity":

זֶרַע צָדִיק יִקְצֹר אֵין

LXX ὁ σπεύρων φαῦλα θερίσεται κακά, Vg *qui seminat iniquitatem metet mala*; Luther elegantly *Wer Unrecht sät, der wird Unglück ernten*.³² A fragment of Hesiod, "If one should sow evils, he would reap evil gains":³³

εἰ κακά τις σπεύρει, κακά κέρδεα κ' ἀμήσειεν

Gorgias the sophist,³⁴ "you have sown these things shamefully and harvested ill," σὺ δὲ ταῦτα αἰσχροῶς μὲν ἔσπειρας, κακῶς δὲ ἐθέρισας, Cicero *de orat.* 2.262 *ut sementem feceris ita metes*.³⁵ Gal 6,7 ὁ γὰρ ἐὰν σπεύρη ἄνθρωπος, τοῦτο καὶ θερίσει, Vg *quae enim seminauerit homo, haec et metet*. In English from the beginning; thus in the Proverbs of Alfred (ab.

29 Ed. F. Dübner (1877/1969) 296b.

30 ODEP³ 350.

31 CPG ii.295 no. 34; Lieberman 158.

32 Wander iii.1827 no. 42 cites "Was du säest, das wirst du ernten."

33 Hesiod frag. 286 ed. Merkelbach-West.

34 Diels-Kranz FVS⁸ 82 B 16 (ii.304) from Aristotle *Rhet.* iii.1406b4.

35 See further Otto 221.

1275)³⁶ *Hwych so pe mon sowep, al swuch he schal mowe*. Proverbs and Hesiod draw only the negative conclusion; Cicero and Paul restore what looks like a Neolithic proverb of the proportional connection between sowing and reaping.

Proverb 9: "Better the foot slip than the tongue." Egyptian,³⁷ "You may trip over your foot in the house of a great man, you should not trip over your tongue." Zeno in Diog. Laert. 7.26 κρείττον εἶναι τοῖς ποσὶν ὀλισθεῖν ἢ τῇ γλώσσῃ. We know that Zeno was born in Citium of Cyprus, and Cicero (*de fin.* 4.56) calls him *Poenulus*, "a little Phoenician," so that he also might have transmitted Semitic wisdom to the West. Sirach 20,18 "A slip from the pavement. . .," ὀλίσθημα ἀπὸ ἐδάφους μᾶλλον ἢ ἀπὸ γλώσσης. Syriac Ahiqar no. 54.³⁸

מטל דטב גברא דמתתקל ברגלה ... מן דמתתקל בלשנה

In English since 1573.³⁹ German: "Besser mit den Füßen stolpern als mit der Zunge."⁴⁰

Proverb 10: "Like master, like man." Ez 16,44 (cited as a proverb) "As a mother, so her daughter," מִתַּיִם כַּאֲמֵת; Hos 4,9 "And it shall be, like people, like priest," כְּהֵן כְּעַם כְּהֵן.⁴¹ Scholiast⁴² on Plato *Rep.* 8.563C⁴³ "As the mistress, so is her dog,"

οἷα περ ἢ δέσποινα, τοῖα χῆ κύων.

Petronius 58.4 *Plane qualis dominus talis et seruus*. It is transformed at Matt 10,25 "It is sufficient for the disciple to become as his tacher, and for the slave to become as his master": ... καὶ ὁ δοῦλος ὡς ὁ κύριος αὐτοῦ, Vg *et seruus sicut dominus eius*. In English since 1530.⁴⁴ "Wie der Herr, so das Gescherr."⁴⁵

36 A 82, ODEP³ 757 with many more citations; also in Erasmus *Adag.* 1.8.78.

37 Ankhsheshonqy 10.7, cited Lichtheim 19.

38 F. Nau, "Histoire et sagesse d'Ahiqar d'après le manuscrit de Berlin 'Sachau 162,' fol. 86 sq." *Revue de l'Orient chrétien* 21 (1918-1919) 148-160; p. 154 line 9.

39 ODEP³ 55, including George Herbert's *Outlandish Proverbs* (1640) no. 53.

40 Wander i.1295 no. 8, who also cites Latin (not from the Vg of Sirach) *melius est pede quam labi lingua, praestat pedibus labi quam lingua offendere*.

41 The same construction is frequent in the Hebrew Bible for a different sense, where opposites meet a common fate: Gen 18,25 "the righteous as the wicked"; Ps 139,12, light and darkness; Deut 1,17, small and great; Lev 24,16, sojourner and native. So especially in the six phrases of Isa 24,2 "As with the people, so with the priest; as with the slave, so with the master (Vg *sicut seruus sic dominus eius*); as with the maid, so with her mistress..." Here Hos 4,9 is (wrongly?) interpreted as if people and priest were contrasted opposites.

42 Ed. W. C. Greene (1938) 264.

43 Cited in part in Greek by Cicero *Att.* 5.11; and thence to Erasmus *Adag.* 4.5.63.

44 ODEP³ 517; for the Latin cf. further Otto 300.

45 Wander ii.576 no. 93.

Proverb 11: "The pot of a company cooks ill." Petronius 38.13 *Sociorum olla male feruet*. Bab. Talmud *Baba Bathra* 24b etc.

קידרא דבי שותפי לא חימא ולא קירא

"The pot of a company is neither hot nor cold."⁴⁶ For the sentiment see Aristotle *Pol.* 2.1.10 (1261b33) "For property shared by the greatest number of owners gets the least attention," i.e. "Everybody's business is nobody's business" (English since 1611).⁴⁷ Also attested in English (1706, 1732) is "A pot that belongs to many is ill stirred and worse boiled"—from recently discovered Petronius?⁴⁸ Native English is "Too many cooks spoil the broth" since 1575;⁴⁹ "Viele Köche verderben den Brei."⁵⁰ A nice illustration of the rule that every proverb has a counter-proverb: thus "Many hands make light work" in English since 1350.⁵¹ Erasmus 2.3.95 cites *multae manus onus leuius reddunt*, and compares Hesiod *Opera* 380 (cf. *Iliad* 12.412) *πλείων μὲν πλεόνων μελέτη* "the work of more hands is greater."

Proverb 12: "He that cannot beat the ass beats the saddle." Petronius 45.8 *Sed qui asinum non potest stratum caedit*. So the Midrash⁵²

מי שאינו יכול להכות לחמור מכה את האיכה

a perfect translation of the Latin. Known in English as a Spanish or Italian proverb since 1573.⁵³ So German "Den Sack schlagen und den Esel meinen" is cited by Luther and Schiller.⁵⁴

Proverb 13: "The place doesn't honor the man, but the man the place." Plutarch:⁵⁵ οὐχ οἱ τόποι τοὺς ἄνδρας ἐντίμους, ἀλλ' οἱ ἄνδρες τοὺς τόπους ἐπιδεικνύουσιν. Likewise Rabbinic⁵⁶ in an exact translation (in the singular):

לא מקומו של אדם מכבדו אלא אדם מכבד את מקומו

Otto 196 cites from comedy *homo locum ornat, non hominem locus*.⁵⁷ A similar proverb with a different point entered English from Aristotle *Nic.*

46 Lieberman 153.

47 ODEP³ 231.

48 ODEP³ 641.

49 ODEP³ 831.

50 Wander ii.1447 no. 73.

51 ODEP³ 517; Otto 254 otherwise.

52 Midrash Tanhuma *Pqwdy* sect. 4; cf. Lieberman 153.

53 ODEP³ 36, citing Herbert (1640) "The fault of the horse is put on the saddle."

54 Wander iii.1808 no. 10.

55 Plutarch, *Apophth. Lac.* 6 = *Mor.* 208E; partially cited by him in several other places. In the singular at Apostolius 13.62 = CPG ii.592.

56 Bab. Talmud *Taanith* 21b = *Mechilta* ii.214 Lauterbach; discussed Lewy 86, Lieberman 157.

57 O. Ribbeck, *Comicorum Romanorum...Fragmenta*, 3rd ed., 1888, 150.

Eth. 5.1.16 (= 1130a1) quoting Bias ἀρχὴ ἄνδρα δείξει. Bacon *Essays* 11 (*Of Great Place*) as "anciently spoken," "A place sheweth the man."⁵⁸

Proverb 14: "Constant dropping wears the stone." Job 14:19 "Water wears away stones," Vg *lapides excavaunt aquae*:

אַבְנֵי מַיִם שֶׁהֵקִיחוּ

Anksheshonqy 17.13 "Water grinds the stone."⁵⁹ Common in Latin since Lucretius;⁶⁰ most pointed in Ovid *ex Ponto* 4.10.5

Gutta cauat lapidem, consumitur anulus usu

"A drop hollows the stone, a ring is worn out with use." Likewise Plutarch⁶¹ σταγόνες μὲν γὰρ ὕδατος πέτρας κοιλαίνουσι. A favorite of Shakespeare's, e.g. *Troil. & Cres.* III.ii.182 *When waterdrops haue worne the Stones of Troy.* Common in English since 1200.⁶² "Steter Tropfen höhlt das Stein."⁶³

Proverb 15: "To wash an Ethiop white." Jer 13,23 "Can the Ethiopian change his skin?" LXX εἰ ἀλλάσσεται Αἰθίοψ τὸ δέρμα αὐτοῦ; Vg *si mutare potest Aethiops pellem suam*:

הֲיִהְיֶה כְּשֵׁי עֹרֹוֹ

Lucian *Adv. Ind.* 28 (LCL iii.208) citing a proverb κατὰ τὴν παροιμίαν Αἰθίοπα σμήχειν ἐπιχειρῶ "According to the proverb, I am trying to whiten an Ethiopian." Lucian's saying is taken up into the proverbial collections and the Aesopic prose fables,⁶⁴ where the new owner of an Ethiopian slave tries to wash him clean. There is a general tendency for proverbs to get themselves attached as a moral to fables. Here both Jeremiah and the proverb are quoted and mostly reversed in the early Church, to prove that the blackness of sin can be washed out and Ethiopians baptized.⁶⁵ Erasmus *Adag.* 1.4.50 *Aethiopem lauas.* Bunyan in the original sense at *Pilgrim's Progress* ii.7: "They saw one *Fool* and one *Want-wit* washing of an Ethiopian with intention to make him white, but the more they washed him the blacker he was"; Bunyan must have found it in an English Aesop book. Frequent in English since 1543.⁶⁶ It becomes a verse in German:⁶⁷

Er lässt sich nicht waschen der Mohr
sondern bleibt allzeit wie zuvor.

58 ODEP³ 382, with variants since 1500.

59 Lichtheim 36.

60 Otto 156 s.v. *gutta* (2).

61 Plutarch *de lib. educ.* = *Mor.* 2D.

62 ODEP³ 141.

63 Wander iv.1335-6 nos. 8, 15.

64 Aesop no. 11 ed. E. Chambray (1927).

65 Frank M. Snowden, Jr., *Blacks in Antiquity: Ethiopians in the Greco-Roman Experience* (1970) 5, 197-198.

66 ODEP³ 868; cf. Otto 7.

67 Wander iv.1797 no. 2.

Proverb 16: "A lamp at midday." Phaedrus 3.19.8 in a fable *Aesope, medio sole quid tu lumine?* "Aesop, what are you doing with a lamp at midday?" He had been to the market to get fire for dinner (no matches in antiquity) and says to his garrulous questioner *hominem...quaero*. The origin must be Diogenes (Diogenes Laertius 6.41 *λύχνον μεθ' ἡμέραν ἄσας*) who "lit a lamp at midday" searching for an honest man—not even the sun was bright enough to see inside a man. So in the Greek collections⁶⁸ *λύχνον ἐν μεσημβρίᾳ ἄπτειν*. Bab. Talm. *Hullin* 60b "What is the use of a lamp (Persian word) at midday?"⁶⁹

מאי רבותיה דשרגא כטיהרא

"Beim hellen Mittag ein Licht anzünden."⁷⁰

Proverb 17: "In the kingdom of the blind the one-eyed is king." Scholiast on *Iliad* 24.192⁷¹ (a hexameter-ending):

... ἐν τυφλῶν πόλει γλαυρὸς βασιλεύει

"In the city of the blind the bleary-eyed is king." *Genesis Rabba* XXX.9⁷²

בשוק סמיא צוחין לעירא

"In the market of the blind they praise the one-eyed": Erasmus *Adag.* 3.4.96 *inter caecos regnat strabus*. In English since 1522;⁷³ familiar in the fugitive French form *dans le royaume des aveugles le borgne est roi*. "Unter den Blinden ist der Einäugige König."⁷⁴ There is a vast folklore on the one-eyed man (cf. Mark 9,47).

Proverb 18: "Cast your bread on the waters." Koh 11,1 "...for you will find it after many days":

שְׁלַח לַחֲמֶךָ עַל-פְּנֵי הַמַּיִם כִּי-בָרַכְתָּ הַיָּמִים תִּמְצְאוּנִי

Anksheshonqy 19.10⁷⁵ "Do a good deed and cast it in the flood; when it dries you will find it." The image is unclear: sowing seed on fields flooded by the Nile? In the late Greek proverbialist Maximus Planudes no. 255⁷⁶ *ποίησον ἀγαθὸν καὶ ῥίψον αὐτὸ εἰς τὴν θάλασσαν* "Do good and throw it into the sea." Goethe (from *Koheleth*):

Thust du was Gutes, wirf es ins Meer,

Sieht es der Fisch nicht, sieht's doch der Herr.

68 Diogenianus 6.27 etc. = CPG i.274.

69 Lewy 82.

70 Wander iii.682 no. 23.

71 Ed. H. Erbse vol. 5 (1977) 551.

72 See Lieberman 157.

73 ODEP³ 428. Many further citations in Burton Stevenson, *The Home Book of Proverbs, Maxims and Familiar Phrases* (1948) 197.

74 Wander i.403 nos. 72-73.

75 Lichtheim 31.

76 Kurtz p. 45, cf. Lewy p. 80.

Proverb 19: "Who spits against heaven, it falls in his face." Ankhsheshonqy 11.10⁷⁷ "He who sends spittle to the sky, upon his face it falls." Exact translation in *Qohelet Rabbah* on 7.9.1:

כל דרפק לעיל על אפוי נפל

Medieval Greek proverb,⁷⁸ ὁ πτύων εἰς τὸν οὐρανὸν τὰ γένειά του πτύει "He who spits against the sky, spits on his own cheeks." English proverb since 1557;⁷⁹ Webster *White Devil* III.i "As if a man should spit against the wind; / The filth returns in's face." German: "Wer nach dem Himmel speit, dem fällt der Speichel in den eigenen Bart." See the more vulgar Italian proverb Anglicized in the 17th century:⁸⁰ "Chi contra il vento piscia / si bagna la commiscia"—a phenomenon I have observed myself in the windy California hills.

Normal Italian *camicia*, French *chemise* etc. "shirt" are from late Latin *camisia*: Jerome *Epist.* 64.11 *solent militantes habere lineas quas camisias uocant, ... aptas membris et adstrictas corporibus* "soldiers have linen garments they call *camisiae*, fitting their limbs and closely covering their bodies." It went into Arabic قَمِيصُهُ *qamīṣuhu* "his shirt" Quran 12.28.⁸¹

Proverb 20: "He that has been bitten by a serpent is afraid of a rope." Ankhsheshonqy 14.14⁸² "He who was bitten of the bite of a snake is afraid of a coil of rope." So in the Midrash:⁸³

דנכית ליה הייא חבלא מדחיל ליה

Medieval Greek proverb:⁸⁴ ὁ δηχθεὶς ὑπὸ ὄφεως καὶ τὸ σχοίνιον φοβεῖται. Cited in English (1678) as a Hebrew proverb.⁸⁵ "Wer von einer Schlange ist gestochen, der fürcht jeder Wurmb."⁸⁶

Proverb 21: "The ox fell, men sharpen their knives." *Lam. Rabbah* 1.7 sect. 34,⁸⁷ "The Rabbis from there [Babylon] say, 'The ox fell, many are its slaughterers.' The Rabbis from here [Palestine] say, 'The ox fell, men sharpen their knives'":

רבנן דהתם אמרין נפיל תורא סגין טבחין

77 Lichtheim 29.

78 Krumbacher (1893) no. 29 p. 84; earlier at Apostolius 6.57.

79 ODEP³ 766.

80 ODEP³ 627 (which cites the Italian in non-rhyming form, *Chi piscia contra il vento...*); the verse-form restored by Levin.

81 Levin asks if rather the Latin is derived from Semitic; but the attestation in Romance languages suggests that the *chemise* was a western, not an eastern garment.

82 Lichtheim 28.

83 *Qoheleth Rabbah* on 7.4; *Shir ha-Shirim Rabbah* on 1.14.

84 Moscow MS no. 119, Krumbacher (1900) p. 414.

85 ODEP³ 62.

86 Wander iv.225 no. 73 (cf. iv.224 no. 68).

87 Lieberman 154.

רבנן דהכה אמרין נפיל תורא תהדדן סכינאיה

Medieval Greek proverb,⁸⁸ "The ox fell, all take out their knives":

ἔπεσε βούς καὶ πάντες τὰ ξίφη αὐτῶν ἤραν

A Life of Aesop⁸⁹ says that at Delphi bystanders stand around the sacrifice with their knives, and each cuts off what he can; the story (true or false) must be the source of the proverb.

Proverb 22: "Steal from a thief and get no sin." Maximus Planudes 90.⁹⁰ ἀπὸ κλέπτου κλέψον καὶ ἀμαρτίαν οὐχ ἔξεις. Mishna *Baba Qamma* VII.1 "Who steals from a thief does not incur double penalty [Ex 22,3]"—here a ruling rather than a proverb:

אין הגונב אחר הגנב משלם תשלומי כפל

Proverb 23: "Of ill debtors men take oats." Maximus Planudes 80⁹¹

ἀπὸ κακοῦ δανειστοῦ κἄν σακκίον ἀχύρου

Bab. Talmud *Baba Qamma* 46b:

ממרי רשותך פארי אפרע

"From your debtor (lit. 'the owner of your loan') accept payment (root פרע) even in bran." English proverb since 1579.⁹²

Proverb 24: "To have a wolf by the ears." Prov 26,17 "He who meddles with strife that does not belong to him is as one who takes a dog by the ears":

מחזיק בפְּאוֹנֵי כָּלֵב ... מתעַבֵּר עַל־דֵּיב לֹא־לוֹ

Greek proverb, first at Polybius 30.20.8⁹³ "According to the proverb they had a wolf by the ears," κατὰ τὴν παροιμίαν τὸν λύκον τῶν ὠτων παρέλαβον. Terence *Phormio* 506-7 "But as they say I have a wolf by the ears; for I don't know either how to get rid of it or keep it":

...immo id quod aiunt auribus teneo lupum

nam neque quo pacto a me amittam neque uti retineam scio.

Suetonius *Tib.* 25.1 *ut saepe se lupum auribus tenere diceret.*⁹⁴ Chaucer *Melibee* B² 2732 (citing Proverbs) "For...he that taketh a straunge hound by the eres is outhewhyle biten with the hound." Frequent in English, always after Chaucer with "wolf."⁹⁵ "Einem Wulf bei den Ohren zu fassen."⁹⁶

88 Moscow MS no. 31; Krumbacher (1900) p. 403.

89 *P. Oxy.* 15.1800.34-46.

90 Kurtz p. 25, cf. Lewy p. 78.

91 Kurtz p. 24, cf. Lieberman 156.

92 ODEP³ 174.

93 Cf. Plutarch *Reip. ger. praec.* 5 = *Mor.* 802D; Apollodorus Carystius frag. 18 Kock iii.286; CPG ii.220.

94 Further Latin and Greek quotations in Otto 199.

95 ODEP³ 906.

96 Wander v.361 no. 248.

Proverb 25: "Eat, drink and be merry." Aristobulus the historian of Alexander⁹⁷ says that there stood in Cilicia a monument of "Sardanapallus" (Σαρδανάπαλλος, probably a deformation of Assurbanipal) snapping his fingers with an inscription in "Assyrian letters": ἔσθιε πῖνε παῖζε. Arrian says that the Assyrians interpreted παῖζε in a more vulgar sense. If the locals could actually read the inscription, the script was Aramaic and not cuneiform (nowhere described by Greeks).⁹⁸ It is in fact an Oriental phrase, Koh 8,15 הִיָּשְׁתִּי לֶחְמִי לִישְׁתִּי לִישְׁתִּי לִישְׁתִּי where the LXX τοῦ φαγεῖν καὶ τοῦ πίνειν καὶ τοῦ εὐφρανθῆναι (cf Tobit 7,10). The rich man says to his soul (Luk 12,19) φάγε πίε εὐφραίνου, Vg *comede bibe epulare*.⁹⁹

Proverb 26: "You can't take it with you." Several Egyptian sources.¹⁰⁰ Aeschylus *Persae* 842 "Wealth does not benefit the dead":

ὡς τοῖς θανούσι πλοῦτος οὐδὲν ὠφελεῖ

Menander,¹⁰¹ "No mortal departs carrying his wealth":

ἀπῆλθεν οὐδεὶς τῶν βροτῶν πλοῦτον φέρων.

Koh 2,21 "A man who has toiled...must leave all to be enjoyed by a man who did not toil for it"; 5,14 "As he came from his mother's womb he shall go again, naked as he came, and shall take nothing for his toil, which he may carry away in his hand":

יְהִי כְּמֵת הַיּוֹמָהּ יֵצֵא מִבֶּטֶן אִמּוֹתָיו

Vg *et nihil auferet secum de labore suo*.¹⁰²

97 Athenaeus 12.530AB = Jacoby FGH 139 F9; paraphrased by Strabo 14.5.9 and Arrian *Anab.* 2.5.2-4.

98 In 425/4 BC the Athenians intercepted dispatches from Persia to Sparta and "translated the letters from the 'Assyrian characters' and read them" (Thucydides 4.50.2), τὰς μὲν ἐπιστολάς μεταγραφάμενοι ἐκ τῶν Ἀσσυρίων γραμμάτων ἀνέγνωσαν. (Thucydides peculiarly writes as if translation were a mere mechanical process of "transcribing" from one script to another.) All our evidence—like that of the Arsames dossier of Aramaic documents from Egypt—shows that the Persians used Aramaic for correspondence. For possible Greek knowledge of cuneiform see p. 27 above. Curiously, Jews also called their square script (derived from Aramaic) "Assyrian": Mishna *Megillah* 1.8 "Tefillin and Mezuzoth must only be written in Assyrian (אשורית)."

99 Not so close is Isa 22,13 "Let us eat and drink, for tomorrow we die," cited in the LXX at I Kor 15,32.

100 Lichtheim 156-158. Not old in English (ODEP³ 799).

101 Menander *Sent.* 87, Jaekel 37.

102 Athenaeus (12.529F-530A) gives also an alternate version of "Sardanapallus" monument, which he took from one Amyntas and says was versified by Choerilus. Here he calls the script "*Chaldaean letters*" (Χαλδαϊκοὶς γράμμασιν, cf. p. 97 above), which reinforces the interpretation of "Assyrian letters" as Aramaic. This version of the text combines *three* themes we have studied separately:

"I became King, and while I saw the sun's light (ἐώραν τοῦ ἡλίου φῶς; cf. p. 56 above) I drank, I ate, I loved (ἔπιον, ἔφαγον, ἠφοροδίσιασα; cf. Proverb 25), for I knew that the time men live is short, and has many changes and misfortunes, and

Proverb 27: "A liar is not believed when he speaks the truth." Diogenes Laertius 5.1.17: Aristotle was asked "What benefit comes to liars?" τί γίνεται κέρδος τοῖς ψευδομένοις; he answered "Not to be believed when they tell the truth,"¹⁰³ ὅταν... λέγωσιν ἀληθῆ, μὴ πιστεῦεσθαι. The proverb in variant form is attached to Aesop's prose fable of the shepherd boy who cried "Wolf Wolf."¹⁰⁴ Cicero *de div.* 2.146 *cum mendaci homini ne uerum quidem dicenti credere soleamus.* Bab. Talm. *Sanh.* 89b "It is the penalty of a liar, that should he even tell the truth, he is not listened to":

כך עונשו של בדאי שאפילו אמר אמת אין שומעין לו

In English since 1477.¹⁰⁵ It becomes a nice verse in German:¹⁰⁶

Wer einmal lügt, dem glaubt man nicht
und wenn er gleich die Wahrheit spricht.

Analysis of our 27 proverbs. Already a selective process has been at work, in that I have omitted from this list proverbs with ethical or edifying themes; comparisons of color, quality, or number; literary reminiscences. Also the degree of literal rendition varies a lot. Still here is a body of material that has passed in one direction or the other between the Semitic and Greco-Roman worlds (often intersecting the Egyptian as well), and mostly continuing in English, German and other European languages. What conclusions does it suggest? The proverbs could be classified as follows:

(a) *Recognition of contingency in human affairs.* (3) "Man proposes, God disposes"; (4) "Sufficient unto the day is the evil thereof"—both shared by "Solomon" and Theognis. Death is the end, (26) "You can't take it with you"; and so you might as well (25) "Eat, drink and be merry."

(b) *Recognition of a law of retribution in human affairs.* (19) "Who spits against heaven, it falls in his face"; (2) "Pride goeth before a fall"; (8) "As you sow, so shall you reap" (originally literal). But persistence and necessary risk are rewarded: (14) "Constant dropping wears the stone"; (18) "Cast your bread on the waters."

(c) *Formulas of incongruity.* Failure in recognition of either contingency or law results in incongruous action. (7) "If I be hanged I'll choose my gallows" as if it made any difference; (15) "To wash an Ethiop white" as a

others will have the enjoyment of the goods I leave behind (Proverb 26). So I have let no day pass by as I follow this course."

An international literature of pessimism existed in the Hellenistic period, best attested in Koheleth, but also in Greek and (surely) Aramaic, and drawing from earlier Greek themes as in Mimnermus.

103 Similarly Maximus Planudes no. 133.

104 Ed. E. Chambray (1927) no. 318.

105 ODEP³ 457; cf. Lewy 79.

106 Wander iii.268 no. 109.

formula of futility; (16) "A lamp at midday" as a formula of the unnecessary. Men make illogical connections: (12) "He that cannot beat the ass, beats the saddle"; (20) "He that is bitten by a serpent is afraid of a rope."

(d) *Maxims of prudence*. Between contingency and retribution we walk a fine line, where prudence is top priority. We want above all to avoid (24) "having a wolf by the ears." The dangers are less in the world outside than in the jungle of human society, (9) "Better the foot slip than the tongue." Best to stay at home (sexually and otherwise), (5) "Drink from your own well." Take indeed what you can safely, (22) "Steal from a thief and get no sin"; accept what's available, (23) "Of ill debtors men take oats." But we have need of others, and best to maintain credibility with them, (27) "A liar is not believed when he tells the truth."

(e) *Realism about the motives of others*. Each takes care of his own business, (11) "The pot of a company cooks ill"; all seize opportunities, (21) "The ox fell, men sharpen their knives." Character is fixed in low place or high: (12) "The place does not honor the man, but the man the place" (this once expressed moralistically). Competence is not widespread, minimum ability may shine by comparison, (17) "In the kingdom of the blind the one-eyed is king." Power is where we find it, (6) "The goodness is the butler's," and subordinates take up what they find, (10) "Like master, like man." And as bees come to the honeypot, (1) "Rich folk have plenty of friends."

What about these themes accounts for their exceptional transmissibility? They all deal with men's affairs (women's proverbs have a more hidden history). They urge us to recognize both the contingency and retribution built into human existence; they warn us against inappropriate responses; they put prudence as a top priority. Above all they give us clues to the actions and motives of others—based in the end on our own self-knowledge. They are the first level of social thought, always with a practical goal, divorced from any dogma other than the bare existence of the non-contingent divine. That level is the best adapted to travel from person to person, from society to society. Most human beings, as they get older, slough off abstract and ill-fitting doctrines that schooling gave them, and are left with the maxims which as young people they heard from their elders and for a time rejected. Principles of classification and generalization are really needed; but in our widespread lack of reflection, the most rudimentary religious or philosophical apparatus goes over our heads. The transmitter of proverbs does not make the mistake of overestimating his audience.¹⁰⁷

107 "Proverbs are older far than principles and, like rules of grammar, they do not lose their validity because of their numerous exceptions"; Bernard Lonergan, *Insight: A study of human understanding*, 5 ed. (1982) 199 = *Collected Works*, vol. 3.

Bibliography to Chapter 9 and Excursus E

Erasmus: Desiderii Erasmi Roterodami Opera Omnia...tomus secundus, Adagia, 1703; reprint 1961.

Krumbacher 1893: F. Krumbacher, "Mittelgriechische Sprichwörter," Sitzungsberichte der k. bayer. Akad. der Wiss. zu München, philos.-philolog. Classe (1893) ii.1-272.

Krumbacher 1900: —, "Die Moskauer Sammlung mittelgriechischer Sprichwörter," *ibid.* 1900, pp. 339-464.

Kurtz: E. Kurtz, Die Sprichwörtersammlung des Maximus Planudes, 1886.

Lewy: Heinrich Lewy, "Parallelen zu antiken Sprichwörtern und Aphthegmen," *Philologus* 58 (1899) 77-87.

Lichtheim: Miriam Lichtheim, Late Egyptian Wisdom Literature in the International Context: A Study of Demotic Instructions; *Orbis Biblicus et Orientalis* 52, 1983.

Lieberman 1942: Saul Lieberman, "Greek and Latin Proverbs in Rabbinic Literature," pp. 144-160 of *Greek in Jewish Palestine: Studies in the Life and Manners of Jewish Palestine in the II-IV Centuries C.E. (570/1942)*.

Wander: K. F. W. Wander, *Deutsches Sprichwörter-Lexikon...*; 5 vols; 1867-1880.

Appendix

Here I treat in summary manner some further items of common vocabulary, proper names, and literary parallels suggested by the text.

(P. 15) "*Sky and Mrs Sky.*" At *Iliad* 5.370 Aphrodite complains about Diomedes to her mother Διώνη, the feminine of Zeus, who also appears at 5.419. At *Gilgamesh* 6.80-81 Ishtar (nearly the same goddess!) complains about Gilgamesh to Anu her father and Antu her mother. Both the relationships among the three gods and the scene run closely parallel.

(P. 16) *Ereschigal*. The Paris magical papyrus¹ has a divinity Ἐρεσχιγαλ, identified as underworldly, for equated with "the maiden Persephone." It is Akkadian, *Gilgamesh* VII.iv.50 *šar-rat irši-tum(tum)*^{11u} *Ereš-ki-gal* "the queen of the [nether] world Ereshkigal." The tradition of magic arts (*magicas...artes* Vergil *Aen.* 4.493) preserved with complete fidelity the name of an Akkadian goddess along with her realm.

(P. 16) *Kybebe*. Herodotus 5.102.1 knows Κυβήβη as goddess of Sardes. Later poets like Catullus 63 identify *Cybēbē* and *Cybēlē*, and they may in fact have a common origin. Kybebe is attested in Aramaic as כַּבְּבָה (KAI 278 Nachtrag) from Hierapolis of Cilicia, 5th-4th century BC, and well known from Anatolia.² A male devotee is Κύβηβος,³ and perhaps Κόμβαβος at Byblos (Lucian *de dea Syria* 19). Probably all go back to Gilgamesh's adversary *Hum-ba-ba* in the cedar-forest.⁴ Moses' father-in-law Ḫobab (חֻבָּב) Jud 4,11 could have the same name.

(P. 17) *The common geographical world*. Here I note briefly a few more of the place-names (perhaps 150 in all) known to both Greek and Hebrew.

-
- 1 K. Preisendanz et alii, *Papyri Magicae Graecae*, 2 vols. (1928-31) i.82; 5 verso line 337 etc.
 - 2 RLA "Kubaba" vi.257-261: Akkadian *Ku-ba-ba*; Hittite *Ku-pa-pa*; Hurrian from Ugarit *kbb(-d)*.
 - 3 Semonides frag. 36, West IEG ii.110.
 - 4 *Gilgamesh* V.4 Akkadian; in the Old Babylonian (ANET³ 504) *Huwawa* is specifically located on Lebanon. See my discussion in "The Mediterranean Seer and Shamanism," ZAW 93 (1981) 374-400, p. 393 fn 95.

Egyptian. Αἴγυπτος since *Odyssey* 14.257, probably Linear B ethnic a_3 -*ku-pi-ti-jo*;⁵ Amarna 84.37 *hi-ku-up-ta-ah*, Ugaritic *hkpt*;⁶ Egyptian original uncertain.⁷ —Memphis: Μέμφις Herodotus 2.99.4; Hos 9,6 הַמְּ (LXX Μέμφις), elsewhere הַמְּ (Isa 19,13, KAI 49.36); Egyptian *mn-nfr*.⁸ —Amun the god of Thebes: Ἀμοῦν Herodotus 2.42.5; Egyptian *ʿimn*;⁹ a place-name in Hebrew, Jer 46,25 אֲמוֹן הַמְּ "Amon of Thebes," reversed Nah 3,8 אֲמוֹן הַמְּ. (Ammon the god of Libya, "Αμμων Herodotus 1.46.3; אֲמוֹן KAI 118.1 has no known connection.) —Patoumos of Arabia (Πάτουμος Herodotus 2.158.2) is אֲמוֹן Ex 1,11; Ptolemaic *Pr-jtm-ṭkw*.¹⁰

Phoenician. Tyre is Τύρος since Herodotus 1.2.1, but Hebrew תַּיִר, Phoen. תַּיִר. Later the Semitic sibilant was heard: Appian *Punica* 8.1.1 Ζῶρος as eponym, Ennius¹¹ *Poenos Sarra oriundos* "Phoenicians coming from Tyre," Vergil *Geor.* 2.506 *Sarrano ostro* "Tyrian purple." The Greek *t* is explained if the name meant "rock," and came to Greeks via Aramaic תַּיִר. —Sidon: Levin¹² draws close correlations between the variant pronunciations in Greek and Hebrew of the city and its ethnic. —Byblos is Βύβλος Strabo 16.2.18 but Hebrew-Phoenician בַּבְּלָא Ez 27,9, Amarna 73.4 etc. *gub-la*. The simplest explanation for the divergence is that βύβλος "papyrus" had a separate (unknown) origin and that the city's Greek name is folk-etymology.

Syrian. Nineveh (Νίνος Herodotus 1.193.2, נִינְוֵה Nahum 3,7) was already known to Phocylides (6th century BC):¹³

καὶ τὸδε Φωκυλίδου· πόλις ἐν σκοπέλω κατὰ κόσμον
οἰκεῦσα συμκρῆ κρέσσων Νίνου ἀφραινούσης.

"Also this is of Phocylides: a small city on a rock living by order is better than frantic Nineveh." Plato *Laws* 684C supposes that the peoples around Ilion at the time of the Trojan war trusted "the power of the Assyrians at Ninos," τῇ τῶν Ἀσσυρίων δυνάμει τῇ περὶ Νίνον γενομένη. —Thapsacus on the Euphrates is Θάψακος (Xenophon *Anab.* 1.4.11) with folk-etymology to θάπτω as "cemetery"; I Reg 5,4 פֶּרְסִי is probably "Ford."

(P. 19) *Ship timber.* The wood of the Ark was עֵצֵי קֶדְרִים Gen 6,14; the Targum logically considers it resinous, "cedar" (קֶדְרִים). Behind κυπάρισσος and Latin *cupressus*, both "cypress," must lie a Mediterranean tree-name which

5 DMG² p. 537.

6 Gordon UT 2 Aqht V:21 = KTU 1.17.V.21.

7 See Helck-Otto iv.25.

8 Erman-Grapow ii.63, and so in the Demotic of the Rosetta stone (OGIS 90.7).

9 Erman-Grapow i.84.

10 Helck-Otto iv.1055.

11 Ennius 472 ed. Skutsch.

12 S. Levin, IESL 90.

13 Phocylides frag. 3 Diehl, *Anthologia Lyrica Graeca* 3rd ed. (1954), i.58.

could also appear in Hebrew *gōṣer*. Vegetius 3.34 specifies cypress and other such for shipbuilding, *ex cupresso igitur et pinu domestica siue siluestri et abiete praecipue liburna contextitur*, "a galley is mostly built of cypress, cultivated or wild pine, and fir." Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 5.7.1 for shipbuilding records several resinous woods, omitting cypress but including cedar.

(P. 20 above). *The "elements" of the High God*. In Art. B I discuss the very old agreements between Indo-European and Semitic in names of the "elements" that fall from the sky. —*Snow*: *νίφα* (Hesiod *Opera* 535) points to Russian *снѣг*; since *n* and *l* interchange, compare *לְשֵׁלַג*, and for the vowels the anomalous verb Ps 68,15 *תִּשְׁלַג*. —*Lightning*: *φλόξ*, Latin *fulgur* both probably go back to Sanskrit **bhrāt* (root *bhrāj*) "it lightened"; cf. *בְּרָק*, Aramaic **בְּרָק bəraq* "it lightened." (And Jos 19,45 *בְּרָק בְּנֵי בְרָק* should be Aramaic "sons of lightning" as a place-name). —*Rain*: since *m* and *w* interchange, compare *ῥῶψ* (Eng. *water*, Hittite *uatar*) with *מָטָר*.

(P. 35) *Phoenician names known in Greece*. Eumaeus (*Odyssey* 15.426) knows one Arybas (genit. Ἀρύβαντος) a wealthy Sidonian. Since Greek for Latin *Hannibal* is Ἀννίβας, Arybas ends in -ba'al. Perhaps it is *עֹזְבַעַל* (already in Byblos in the 10th century BC, KAI 3), *Hasdrubal*, Ἀσδροῦβας Polybius 1.40.1. Herodotus 7.98 among Phoenician admirals (treated as kings in DCP) has clearly identifiable Phoenician names: besides Σιρώμου (on 334 below), *Ματτήν* = *מתן*¹⁴ and *Μέρβαλος* = *מהרבעל* (KAI index); but the Sidonian names already show Hellenization, *Τετράμνηστος Ἀνύσου*.

(P. 35) *Atabyris as toponym*. The mountain of Rhodes is Ἀτάβυρις Strabo 14.2.12; compare Mt Tabor of Galilee, *תַּבּוֹר* Hos 5,1 where LXX Ἰταβύριον. The Galilean mountain is Ἀταβύριον Polybius 5.70.6, Ἰταβύριον Josephus *BJ* 4.54. If non-Hebrew, *תַּבּוֹר* could be a variant of *טַבּוֹר* Jud 9,37 (LXX ὀμφαλοῦ "navel" used as a geographical term.)

(P. 54) *School-vocabulary*. All four words *παιδαγωγός*, *χάρτης*, *μέλαν* and *κάλαμος* went into both Latin and Rabbinic as part of the lingua franca of the early Empire. With Paul's description of the Law as our "pedagogue" (Gal 3,24) cf. Plutarch *Mor.* 645B where the Law is a pedagogue; Seneca *Epist.* 110.1 *unicuique nostrum paedagogum dari deum...inferioris notae* "to each of us is given as pedagogue a god of lower rank"; *Gen. Rabbah* 28.6 "parable of a king who entrusted his son to a pedagogue":

משל למלך שמסר את בנו לפידגוג

With *χάρτης* cf. *charta* Catullus 36.1; Rabbinic קרטיס (mostly corrupt); Quran 6.7 *كِتَابًا فِي قِرْطَاسٍ kitāban fiy qirtāsin* "writing on parchment." With "pen and ink" cf. Plato *Phaedr.* 276C, who deprecates vain writing

14 At II Reg 11,18 Mattan the priest of Baal, evidently a Phoenician, has the same name.

"with ink by a pen," μέλανι ... δια καλάμου; a fragment of Cato *Antiochus epistulis bellum gerit, calamo et atramento militat* "Antiochus wages war with letters, fights with pen and ink;"¹⁵ a Rabbinic parable of an "astrologer" king has him cry out "take ink and pen" (*Gen. Rabbah* 1.4) מילנין וקלמין (Gen. Rabbah 1.4). An early Sabaeen incense altar defines one of the spices used on it as קלם¹⁶ corresponding to the Greek fragrant calamus, and Quran 96.4 has بِالْقَلَمِ, *bi'lqalami* "with a pen"; these usages create the illusion that קלם is an original Semitic root, but it must be just an early loan from Greek at one or more removes. Sanskrit has *kalama* "reed" and *melā* "ink" as Greek loan-words, but no text containing them is easily found.¹⁷

(P. Ex. 9/72) *Still more spices.* "Almond-oil" is νέτωπον, frequent in Hippocrates, which surely corresponds to חֲמָזִים Ex 30,34 in the ingredients of incense; the tree must have grown at חֲמָזִים Ezra 2,22. —"Lily-ointment" is σουσίνον Theophrastus *de odor.* 27, corresponding to "lily" σοῦσον Athenaeus 12.513F, שושן I Reg 7,19; the woman's name Σούσαννα (LXX) corresponds to the fem. שושנה Cant 2,2. The Persian capital Σούσα (Herodotus 1.188.1) was understood by Greeks and Hebrews as "The Lilies," Old Persian *Čūšāyā*,¹⁸ שושן Neh 1,1. Another word for "lily," a favorite flower at Minoan Crete, is Mediterranean, λείριον (*Hom. Hymn Dem.* 2.427), Latin *lilium*; see Egyptian *hrr.t.*¹⁹ It continued in Coptic, and the Bohairic of Matt 6,28 "lilies of the field," κρίνα τοῦ ἀγροῦ, uses *hrēri* just as the Vulgate *lilia agri*.

Cannabis. Pausanias 6.26.6 knows κάνναβις as grown in Elis for fiber; and so Mishna *Kil.* V.8 קנבוס. But Herodotus 4.74-75 knows that Scythians throw it on the hot stones in their sauna baths as an intoxicant; and censers full of charred hemp-seeds from about 400 BC were found in frozen tombs of Siberia.²⁰ An Akkadian letter to the mother of Esarhaddon discusses the use of *qu-nu-bu* in cult.²¹

Castor-oil: With κίκι (Herodotus 2.94.1) cf. Mishna *Shabb.* II.1 שמן קיקי, and probably Jonah's gourd, קיקיון Jon 4,6.²² The Lebanese sanctuary ΒΑΙΤΟΚΑΙΚΗ (IGLS 7.4028.18) may be *בית קיקי "house of castor." —*Ladanum:* Herodotus 3.112 cites λήδανον and Arabic λάδανον; cf. Sabaeen *ldn* on an

15 OLD 255c.

16 RES vi.3853.

17 See W. W. Tarn, *The Greeks in Bactria and India*, 3 ed. (1987) 376.

18 Darius, *Susa* F 22; Kent 142.

19 Erman-Grapow iii.149.

20 See S. I. Rudenko, *Frozen Tombs of Siberia*, 1970.

21 See R. F. Harper, *Assyrian and Babylonian Letters* (1892-1914) no. 368; also E. Salonen, "Über einige Lehnwörter aus dem nahen Osten in griechischen und lateinischen," *Arktos* 8 (1974) 139-144.

22 Egyptian *k3k3* is uncertain, Erman-Grapow v.109.2.

incense-altar (CIS 4.3.685). Tiglath-Pileser received *la-da-nu* in tribute from Damascus.²³ —*Lotus*: *λωτός* is both fodder for horses (*Od.* 4.603) and (9.97) the food of the Lotus-eaters; compare the aromatic טל Gen 37,25.

(P. 84) *Kothar and Kythera*. The Aegean island Κύθηρα (*Odyssey* 9.81) was said (Stephanus 391) to have its name "from Kytheros the Phoenician," ἀπὸ Κυθήρου τοῦ Φοίνικος. He is surely the Ugaritic divinity *Ktr* mostly joined with a double:

bym arš wttn ktr whss yd

"On the sea of dragon(?) and *tannin*, Ktr-and-Hss journeys(?)." ²⁴ The vowels are given by Philo Byblius Χουσσώρ.²⁵ The Syriac text printed above (Chap. 7) speaks of "Tammuz the son of *Kwir*," כוטר בר כותר.²⁶ Arabic كَوْتَرُ Kawthar the river of Paradise is described by the commentators on *Quran* 108.²⁷ The Phoenician form appears in the proper name עברכשר.²⁸ His feminine counterpart is Χούσαρθις;²⁹ in the plural Ugaritic *ktrt*,³⁰ and apparently Ps 68:7 כוֹשְׁרוֹת; and in Κυθήρεια *Odyssey* 18.193 as title of Aphrodite.³¹

(P. 87) *Further jewels*. The "sapphire" (often thought lapis lazuli) is known since Theophrastus *Lap.* 23 σάφειρος; the פפיר of Ex 28,18 reappears at 24,10 לְבִנַת הַפַּפִּיר, LXX with two loanwords πλίνθου σαφείρου, perhaps "pavement of lapis lazuli" (see p. 84 above). The word is presumably from further east, but no original is known. The *Periplus Maris Rubri* 39 has it exported from the mouth of the Indus; Casson³² is sure that it is lapis lazuli from the description in Pliny 37.120.

The σμάραγδος of Plato *Phaedo* 110D and of Herodotus 2.44.2 at Tyre (p. 122 above) is some green stone (perhaps in Herodotus just green glass) not usually identifiable as our "emerald." But there was an actual emerald mine in Egypt; an inscription of AD 11³³ speaks of a "chief minechief(!) of the Emerald and... all the mines of Egypt," ἀρχιμεταλλάρχου τῆς Ζμαράγδου ... καὶ πάντων τῶν μετάλλων τῆς Αἰγύπτου. The shorter form μάραγδος Athenaeus 3.94B fits very well the Hebrew בְּרִקֵּת Ex 28,17 and בְּרִקֵּת Ez 28,13.

23 P. Rost, *Die Keilschrifttexte Tiglat-Pileasers III* (1893) 15.

24 Gordon UT 62.50-51 = KTU 1.6.VI.51-52.

25 Philo Byblius, Jacoby FGH 790 F. 2.11; cf. the form Χουσσώρος in Laitos, FGH 784 F4 = Damascius *de princ.* 125c.

26 W. Cureton, *Spicilegium Syriacum* (1855) 44.

27 *Encyclopaedia of Islam*, rev. ed., iv (1978) 805-806.

28 CIS i.4835 etc.

29 Philo Byblius, Jacoby FGH 790 F 2.10.

30 Gordon 2 Aqht II.26 = KTU 1.17.II.26.

31 See my "Kothar, Kinyras, and Kythereia," *JSS* 10 (1965) 197-219.

32 L. Casson, *The Periplus Maris Erythraei* (1989) 194.

33 Ehrenberg-Jones 232.

The source must be Sanskrit *marakata*,³⁴ in Hebrew with a folk-etymology to קֶרֶק "lightning"; and so in Akkadian, neo-Babylonian *barraqtu* (CAD).

Beryl is βήρυλλος Strabo 16.4.20, called Indian at *Anth. Pal.* 9.544.1; Propertius 4.7.9 dreams of dead Cynthia after her cremation,

et solitum digito beryllon adederat ignis

"And the fire had eaten the accustomed beryl on her finger." For שָׁחַם, the 11th jewel of Ex 28,20, the LXX βηρύλλιον agrees with Targum בורלא where perhaps it is the LXX that is original.³⁵ Pali *veluriya*. Among the jewels in the heavenly robe of the Syriac *Hymn of the Pearl*³⁶ is ברולא.

(P. 100) *Tahpanhes (Daphnae)* of Egypt. Herodotus 2.30.2 calls an Egyptian city Δάφνησι "the Laurels," a folk-etymology of תְּהַפְנִיחַס Jer 43,7, and see KAI 50 of the text. It is Egyptian *T3-h(t)-(n.t)-p3-nḥsy* "the Fortress of Penhase."³⁷ It appears in Greek form in a Nabataean inscription of 36 BC "...to Dushares the god who is in 'Daphne' in the Egyptian language; year 14 of queen Cleopatra [the well-known one]...":³⁸

לדושרא אלהא בדפנא מצרים שנת 14 למלכת קלפתרו

The cult of Δουσαρης is well-attested, e.g. OGIS 770.1; Tertullian *ad nat.* 2.8.5 *Obodan et Dusarem Arabum* "Obodas and Dusares, [gods] of the Arabs."

(P. 102) *Egyptian gods*. Their names and attributes are shared by Greeks and West-Semites: one more common feature in the east Mediterranean.

Osiris is identified by Herodotus 2.144.2 "Ὀσίρις as Dionysus; in Phoenician names of the Ptolemaic period, e.g. KAI 47 אסרשמר "Osiris keeps" (p. 120), in Greek Σαραπιωνος after Serapis; Egyptian *wš-ir*.³⁹

Isis Ἴσις likewise at Herodotus 2.59.2; KAI 48 is a late Ptolemaic dedication to "my lady, the great god Isis," לרבתי לאלם אדרת אס and so in the Aramaic of Elephantine, "for a purification before Isis the goddess,"⁴⁰

לנקה קדם אסי אלהתא

Egyptian *ś.t.*⁴¹

Horus Ὡρος the falcon Herodotus 2.156.5, later authors Ὡροϋς; Jos 13,3 שִׁיחֹר is probably "the lake of Horus"; in KAI 35.1 (Kition) חר seems a

34 Monier-Williams 789.

35 See my "The Septuagint as a Source of the Greek Loan-Words in the Targums," *Biblica* 70 (1989) 194-216, p. 209.

36 Ed. A. Bevan. *The Hymn of the Soul, Texts and Studies* V.3 (1897), line 83.

37 ABD vi.308; for Penhase see text above p. 181. But Helck-Otto i.990 gives the much simpler form ḫn.

38 R. N. Jones et alii, "A Second Nabataean Inscription from Tell esh-Shuqafiya, Egypt," *BASOR* 269 (1988) 47-57.

39 Erman-Grapow i.359.

40 Cowley 72.16.

41 Erman-Grapow iv.8.

man's name; Egyptian *hr*.⁴² All three names together on the Rosetta stone (OGIS 90.10) "Horus the son of Isis and Osiris," Ὁρως ὁ τῆς Ἴσιος καὶ Ὀσίριος υἱός, where the Demotic⁴³ *Hr s3 's.t s3 Wsjr*.

Phthas Φθᾶς the smith known to Porphyry (Eusebius *Praep. Ev.* 3.11.46) as Hephaestus, also in a proverb ὁ Φθᾶς σοι λελάληκεν "Phthas told you";⁴⁴ at Rosetta (OGIS 90.2) "Great Hephaestus," ὁ Ἡφαιστος ὁ μέγας is in Demotic *pth tni*; Aramaic "by weights [lit. stones] of Ptah," פתח גי[באב].⁴⁵

Apis Ἄπις the bull Herodotus 2.154; prob. at Jer 46,15 הָקִדְוֹן שָׁדֵד where the LXX διὰ τί ἔφυγεν ὁ Ἄπις "why did Apis flee?" suggesting *הק סך. Aramaic, KAI 268 חפי לסרי ל"to Osiris-Apis"; Egyptian *Hp*.⁴⁶

Theuth Θεύθ Plato *Phaedr.* 274E who invented writing; Aramaic תותת Cowley 69.10; Egyptian *Dhw.tj*.⁴⁷

Knouphis the ram: see below. *Amun*: see above.

(P. 119) *Carthage*. Punic "New City" תתחדשת KAI 68.2 (another such on Cyprus, KAI 31.1). Καρχηδών Herodotus 3.19 shows that the *heth* was heard; from it with metathesis Latin *Carthago*. Same Greek suffix as in Βαβυλών for בבל; perhaps it is modelled on the city Καλχηδών. The LXX of Is 23,1 interprets Tarshish as Carthage. But Solinus 27.10 has it direct from Punic, *Carthadam dixit quod Phoenicum ore exprimit ciuitatem nouam* "[Elissa] called it *Carthada* which in Punic means 'New City'; so perhaps Vergil *Aen.* 1.366 *nouam Karthaginis arcem*. The seemingly redundant Καρχηδών ἢ Νέα Strabo 3.4.6 and *Nouae Carthaginis* Livy 26.47.1 mean what is now Cartagena in Spain.

(P. 121) *Hiram of Tyre*. At Herodotus 7.98.1 the father of the Tyrian admiral is Σιρώμου (genit.), with variants Σειρώμου and Σιρώνου; it is hardly a MS error in uncials for *Εἰρώμου, for it appears also at 5.104. In any case the same name as Solomon's contemporary, known to Menander of Ephesus⁴⁸ as Εἰρωμος. At II Sam 5,11 הַיִּתִּי, with varied vowels elsewhere, evidently representing an unfamiliar Phoenician pronunciation. All these show a shortened form of Num 26,38 הַיִּתִּי the Benjamite, "My brother is high"; and so the king of Byblos אחרם KAI 1.

(P. 136) *Gamphane of Cyprus*. A place-name Γαμφάνη, apparently on Cyprus, is attested in a saint's life (otherwise unreliable), Neophytus *Laudatio*

42 Erman-Grapow iii.122.

43 Ed. W. Spiegelberg, *Der demotische Text der Priesterdekrete von Kanopus und Memphis (Rosettana)...* (1922) line 6 & Glossar p. 215 no. 449.

44 Suda no. 447, iv.740 Adler.

45 Cowley 11.2.

46 Erman-Grapow iii.70.

47 Erman-Grapow v.606.

48 Menander Eph., Jacoby FGH 783 frag. 1.117 = Josephus *con. Ap.* 117.

S. Polychronii chap. 1, ed. H. Delehay, "Saints de Chypre," *Analecta Bollandiana* 26 (1907) 161-297, p. 175.14; and cf. E. Lipiński, "Carthage de Chypre," *Studia Phoenicia I-II; Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta* 15 (1983) 209-234, p. 231. Neophytus wrote ab. AD 1200, Polychronius was supposedly of Constantinian date. Since the saint worked in an ἄμπελος and was accompanied by vineyarders, ἀμπελοουργοί (chap. 2, p. 176.1,6), it seems likely that Γαμφάνη meant "Vineyard," and shows a pronunciation of ἡμφᾶ with the *-p-* strengthened to *-mp-*.

(P. 146) *Zodiac*. The ancient monuments are catalogued, and many illustrated, in a sumptuous work by Gundel.⁴⁹ See especially how they circle novel divinities: the Modena Aion ("Time") wrapped in a serpent,⁵⁰ the Heddernheim Mithras slaying a bull (no. 175). Well-known is the "Atlas Farnese" (Gundel no. 8) now in Naples: kneeling Atlas upholds a celestial globe with the Zodiac and much else; Hadrianic copy of an original of 25 BC. The Greek and Latin names were so familiar that they are hardly ever written on the monuments, unlike the Beth Alpha mosaic. There is a medieval mnemonic in hexameters:

Sunt Aries, Taurus, Gemini, Cancer, Leo, Virgo,
Libraque, Scorpius, Arcitenens, Capet, Amphora, Pisces.⁵¹

(P. 151) *Aromatic Seeds*. Several are listed with their international names in the Linear B "seed-tablets,"⁵² but not necessarily as Greek.

Kardamon in Aramaic of the text is prob. a Greek loanword from κάρδαμον Xenophon *Cyr.* 1.2.8; doubtful whether in Linear B⁵³ *ka-da-mi-ja*; perhaps from a Sanskrit *kardama*.

Pepper in Aramaic of the text corresponds to Mishnaic Heb. *Shabb.* VI.5 פלפל; πέπερι since Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 9.20.1; both from Sanskrit *pippali*.⁵⁴

Cummin. Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 1.11.2 κύμινον; Linear B *ku-mi-no*;⁵⁵ Is 28,25 חֲמִיץ where LXX κύμινον, Vg *cuminum*. International word of uncertain origin (Masson 51). Proverbially insignificant: Theocritus 10.55 καταπρίων τὸ κύμινον "sawing a cummin-seed in half"; Matt 23,23 implies an Aramaic equivalent "you tithe cummin," ἀποδεκατοῦτε τὸ κύμινον.

49 Hans Georg Gundel, *Zodiakos: Tierkreisbilder im Altertum... Kulturgeschichte der antiken Welt* Bd 54 (1992); enlarging his catalogue in *PW X A* 462-709.

50 Gundel no. 71, Abb. 73.

51 The medieval lines rework a longer anonymous text: A. Baehrens, *Poetae Latini Minores* 5 (1883) 352.

52 DMG² nos. 105-107.

53 DMG² no. 107.

54 Monier-Williams 628. For its trade-route see Miller *Spice-Trade* (1969) 80-83.

55 DMG² no. 105.

Sesame in Greek since Herodotus 3.117.4 σήσαμον as crop; otherwise spelled in the Doric inscription IG 5(1) 364.9 ΣΑΑΜΩΝ. In the seed-tablet of Linear B DMG² 105.3 as *sa-sa-ma*. Ugaritic *ššmn*;⁵⁶ in a Phoenician papyrus (KAI 51.7) with much else unclear *מְשִׁמְן ... וְכַמְן* "cummin and...sesame." These all seem to be simplified versions of a form with full reduplication, cf. Mishna *Shevi*. II.7 *מְשִׁמְן*. Further then Akkadian *šamaššammu*;⁵⁷ Egyptian *šmšm.t*;⁵⁸ Arabic *simsim(un)* as "Open Sesame" in the famous tale of "Ali Baba and the Forty Thieves" attached to the *Thousand and One Nights*.

(P. 158) *Scorpion and frog*. Hebrew characteristically names small pests with roots of four or even five consonants: thus the "frog" is *צְרִיפָצָה* (Ps 78,45 collective) and must bear some relation to Greek βάρραχος with its numerous dialectal forms; e.g. σπορδακάς in the modern dialect of Zacynthos with a nearly perfect phonetic fit.⁵⁹ I discuss a rain of frogs elsewhere.⁶⁰ Then with σκορπίος compare Heb. *צְקָרָב* Deut 8,15, also collective. It makes proverbs in Greek, Sophocles.⁶¹

ἐν παντὶ γάρ σοι σκορπίος φρουρεῖ λίθῳ
"a scorpion keeps watch for you under every stone"; see further Sirach 26,7; Luk 11,1.

(P. 159) *Dido*. Latin *Dido*, in Vergil always in the nominative. Timaeus⁶² calls her Δειδώ. Her name is surely Semitic and a feminine of דָּוִד "David, i.e. "beloved" or "uncle"; it is then comparable to דָּוִדָּה Lev 20,20 "his father's sister." Her sister *Anna* (Vergil *Aen.* 4.31) is surely Hebrew Hannah, חַנָּה I Sam 1,2.

(P. 176) *Sardeis of Lydia*. Aeschylus *Pers.* 45 πολύχρυσοι Σάρδεις "golden Sardeis": Herodotus 1.84.1 Σάρδιες. In Lydian it began with a consonant cluster;⁶³ *šfardak artimuλ* must be "Artemis of Sardeis." A Lydian-Aramaic bilingual (KAI 260) in the Aramaic part (Lydian not comparable) has "in the fortress Sardeis," *בִּסְפָרַד בִּירְתָא*; likewise Old Persian *Sparda* in Darius *Beh.* I.15.⁶⁴ Thus when Obad 20 says that the exiles of Jerusalem are *בְּסַפְרַד* it must be in Sardeis. But Targum Jonathan here wrongly has *דְּבַסְפַּמְיָא* i.e. "in Spain," whence the Spanish Jews called themselves "Sephardic."

56 Gordon UT 12.4 etc. = KTU 4.14.4 with numerous other commodities.

57 CAD 17.306 thinks it originally "flax," later transferred to sesame.

58 Erman-Grapow iv.488.

59 G. P. Shipp, *Modern Greek Evidence for the Ancient Greek Vocabulary* (1979) 138-141.

60 "Yahweh, Zeus, Jupiter....," ZAW 106 (1994) 175-197.

61 Sophocles frag. 37, TrGF iv.130.

62 Timaeus, Jacoby FGH 566 F 82. See my "From Divine Kingship....," ZAW 105 (1993) 62-86, p. 80 fn 72.

63 J. Friedrich, KASD 113 no. 11.9.

64 Kent 117.

(P. 187) *Maza*. Hesiod *Opera* 590 μᾶζα τ' ἀμολγαίη is "bread (or emmer) kneaded with milk"; often with forms of μάσσω "knead." Thus Archilochus⁶⁵ ἐν δορὶ μὲν μου μᾶζα μεμαγμένη either "with the end of my spear my bread is kneaded" or "by my spear is won the bread I knead."⁶⁶ Latin *massa* is usually "lump of metal" but at Ovid *Met.* 8.666 closer to the Greek, *lactis massa coacti* "lump of clotted milk." It is attractive to compare Heb. מֶצֶה "unleavened bread"; there is no obvious semantic connection to the root מָצַח "drain, press out." But μᾶζα does have a Greek root; then מֶצֶה would be a Greek loanword in Semitic.

(P. 194) *The stone of Bethel*. At בֵּית אֵל (Gen 28,19) it seems that Jacob's stone itself was the "house of God." The phrase becomes in turn a divinity in men's names: Aramaic ביתאלידע KAI 227.2, at Elephantine ביתאלנלנ,⁶⁷ perhaps as one name Sach 7,2 שֶׁר־אֵל בֵּית־אֵל; by itself in Esarhaddon's treaty at Tyre *Ba-a-ti-ili*.⁶⁸ In a Greek proverb⁶⁹ βαίτυλος is the stone swallowed by Kronos in place of Zeus (Hesiod *Theog.* 498); and so *baetylos* Pliny 37.135, βαίτυλον and βατύλια Philo Byb.⁷⁰ Jacob poured oil on his pillow-stone at Bethel, and Pausanias 10.24.6 says that the stone of Kronos was preserved at Delphi where "they pour oil on it daily," ἔλαιον ὁσημέραι καταχέουσι. The cults are identical, and it seems likely that the Semitic name came to Greece early, though attested late.

(P. 197) *Ivory and ebony*. We saw in the text that they appear together both in Greek and Hebrew: exotic imported materials in the two primary colors (besides red-brown) white and black. *Ivory* in most languages is also a name of the "elephant." Greek ἑλέφας bears no clear relationship to the name in any other language. But Latin *ebur* ("elephant" at Juvenal 12.112) is a loanword from Egyptian *3bw*,⁷¹ with various determinatives both "ivory" and "elephant." It seems to be fossilized as the second element of שֵׁן־הַבַּיִת I Reg 10,22 "tooth of elephant?" Either the beast or its tusks gave its name to the Nile island Elephantine at Assuan (Herodotus 2.28.2 Συήνη, Ez 29,10 הַסְּוֹנִיָּה); Herodotus 2.9.2 Ἐλεφαντίνη; a mercenary graffito⁷² has Doric εἰ

65 Archilochus frag. 2, West IEG i.3.

66 Also an object to forms of μάσσω at Herodotus 1.200; Plato *Rep.* 372B; Aristophanes *Equites* 55.

67 Cowley 18.5.

68 R. Borger, *Die Inschriften Asarhaddons Königs von Assyrien*; *Archiv für Orientforschung* 9 (1956) 109.

69 CPG ii.468, "you would have swallowed a *baetylos*." A god Zeus Betylos, Διὸς Βετύλου from Dura (SEG 7 [1934] 341), see Fergus Millar, *The Roman Near East: 31 BC—AD 337* (1993) 1,14.

70 Philo Byblius, FGH 790 frag. 2.16, 23.

71 Erman-Grapow i.7.

72 Meiggs-Lewis no. 7a.

ΕΛΕΦΑΝΤΙΝΑΝ. (As with *Buffalo* [New York], it is hard to tell whether the place was named as a watering-place of the beast or entrepôt of its product.) The Egyptian place name is likewise *3bw*,⁷³ and so in the Aramaic of Elephantine (e.g. Cowley 30.7) it is **בֵּיב בִּירְתָא** "in Yeb the fortress." It appears disguised in Greek (OGIS 168.32 etc.) ΧΝΟΥΒΩ ΝΕΒΙΗΒ "Chnoum the great master of Yeb"; Knouphis is the god of Syene (Strabo 17.1.48 Κνουφίς), Aramaic variously spelled **כְּנוֹפִּי** (Cowley 27.3 etc.). Ultimately connected may be Sanskrit *ibha*⁷⁴ "elephant" (with many other meanings).

Ebony may appear in Ugaritic as *hbn*;⁷⁵ the Greek and Hebrew forms are certainly from Egyptian *hbnj*, perhaps itself a loan from some African language.⁷⁶

(P. 211) *The camel (and the needle's eye)*. Greek κάμηλος is obviously borrowed from the East, Hebrew **גַּמֶּל**. Varro *de ling. lat.* 5.100 correctly notes *camelus suo nomine syriaco in Latium uenit* "the camel came to Latium along with its Syrian name." In Jesus' saying (Matt 19,24) about the needle's eye, a few Greek MSS have κάμιλον for κάμηλον; there is some Greek evidence for another word κάμιλος meaning "cable, thick rope," and Levin⁷⁷ strongly argues that this was Jesus' original meaning. Muḥammad says of unbelievers (Quran 7.40[38]) in the usual translation "they shall not enter paradise until the camel passes through the needle's eye"; here again Levin notes some evidence that **الْجَمَلُ** *al-jamalu* was interpreted to mean "the rope."

(P. 211) *Sheba*. The Greek & Hebrew texts cited refer to the people of the South Arabian inscriptions, e.g. *mlk sb'* "king of Saba."⁷⁸ Augustus (*Res Gestae* V.26) boasts *in Arabiam usque in fines Sabaeorum pro[cess]it exerc[it]us ad oppidum Mariba* "My army advanced into Arabia as far as the territory of the Sabaeans, to the city Mariba." The name appears as a doublet in Hebrew, Ps 72,10 (cf. Gen 10,7) **מְלֻכֵי שָׁבָא וְסָבָא** "the kings of Sheba and Saba." In inherited words Arabic *s* corresponds to Hebrew *š* as in Arabic *sab'un* "seven" but Hebrew **שֶׁבַע**; thus Hebrew **שָׁבָא** is the inherited word and **סָבָא** shows contemporary hearing of it. Then I Reg 10,4 **מְלֻכַת שָׁבָא** "the Queen of Sheba" is an inherited phrase.

(P. 212) *The rose; the island Rhodes*. The flower already in Homer, "rosy-fingered Dawn" (*Iliad* 1.477 etc.) **ῥοδοδάκτυλος Ἥως**. Latin *rosa* is

73 Helck-Otto i.1217.

74 Monier-Williams 167.

75 KTU 4.402.6.

76 Erman-Grapow ii.487.

77 S. Levin, "A Camel or a Cable through a Needle's Eye?," LACUS Forum 14 (1987) 406-415.

78 CIS IV.2.540.4.

an independent borrowing from the same source. Sappho's Aeolic βρόδοισι implies *Fródon. The Targum on Cant 2,1 כורדא shows Aramaic *warda*; Esther 1,6 LXX ῥόδα for Hebrew רר shows that the translator read *רר. Behind *Fródon then lies Aramaic **warad*; and Armenian *vard* "rose" implies Iranian **urda*-. Many Persians were named for it, thus *Vardanes* Tacitus *Ann.* 11.10, same man as Οὐαρδάνην (accus.) Josephus *AJ* 20.71; Palmyrene רר ספטמיוס = ΣΕΠΤΙΜΙΟΝ ΟΥΟΡΩΔΗΝ "Septimius Worod."⁷⁹ Greeks certainly felt that the island Rhodes (Ῥόδος *Iliad* 2.655) was named after the flower and perhaps it really was. I Chron 1,7 רררר surely intends the island, and the LXX correctly Ῥόδιοι. The author of Chronicles was working over Gen 10,4 רררר "Dodanim" (unknown) where the LXX wrongly Ῥόδιοι. At Ez 27,15 רררר "sons of [Arabian] Dedan" again the LXX wrongly has υιοὶ Ῥοδίων.

(P. 213) *Astarte and Ishtar*. Ugaritic *ʿgrt* shows a typical consonantal shift from Heb. רררר. Both represent Sumero-Akkadian *Ištar*; it is possible though hardly demonstrable that the Sumerian is a very old loan from Indo-European for "star," cf. Sanskrit *str̥bhis* Rigveda 1.68.10.

(P. 236) *The ideal square city*. The Babylon of Herodotus (1.178), τετραγώνου and the ideal temple of Ezekiel (45,2) are designated as square. From the Etruscans the Romans derived an idea that a military camp should be a perfect square and "arranged like a city" (Polybius 6.31.10). The nucleus of Rome where augury took place was on the Palatine in front of the temple of Apollo and called *Quadrata Roma*,⁸⁰ in Greek τετραγώνος Dion. Hal. 2.65.3. We saw (p. 141 above) that both Calypso's island and Eden are watered, no doubt symmetrically, by four rivers. Hellenistic Nicaea was square with four gates, and had a stone in the center of the gymnasium from which all four could be seen (Strabo 12.4.7). These themes are summed up in John's vision of the New Jerusalem as "foursquare," τετραγώνος Rev 21,16; also Talmudic טטררון (Bab. Talm. *BB* 164b).

(P. 241) *Linen or cotton sails*. κάρπασος Dion Hal. 2.68.5 and its cognates must mean either "linen" or "cotton," but it is seldom clear which. Latin *carbasus* is mostly a ship's "sail," Vergil *Aen.* 3.357. Esther 1,6 כרפס (LXX καρπασίνους, Vg *carpasini*) may be either linen or cotton. Nor is it clear which stuff Sanskrit *karpasa* represents. But at the *Periplus Maris Rubri* 41 κάρπασος is an Indian crop, and here must be cotton as Casson interprets.

(P. 282) *Names of the lion*. Hebrew has five names; and Greek two, both with plausible international contacts. An archaic name is λξ *Iliad* 15.275, similar to rarer Heb. לִשׁ Job 4,11. Arabic لَيْت *layt(un)* is a single syllable

79 J. Cantineau, *Inventaire des Inscriptions de Palmyre*, 1 (1930) no. 9.

80 Festus p. 310 ed. Lindsay (1913).

like the Greek; in retrograde Greek script the word would be spelled identically with Hebrew, ΣΙΑ as with "mina" ANM (p. 308 above). Aquila, in line with his regular Homerizing, made the good hit of translating שִׁלְיָ Job 4,11 by λῖς.⁸¹ At Isa 30,6 the שִׁלְיָ appears with אֶרְפָּא "serpent" (occasionally translated ὄφις by the LXX, e.g. Job 20,16); so Hesiod *Scutum* 161,172 in adjacent panels describes ὀφίων κεφαλαί "heads of serpents" and μέγας λῖς "a great lion." In Hebrew under this name the lion is "great among the beasts," Prov 30,30 בְּבַהֲמָה גָבוֹר בְּבַהֲמָה שִׁלְיָ, Vg *leo fortissimus bestiarum*; Babrius 67.3 (LCL) in the proverb of the "lion's share"; Phaedrus 4.14.1 *cum se ferarum regem fecisset leo* "when the lion had made himself king of the beasts."

Normal Greek for "lion" is λέων (Latin *leo*). It seems to name ornaments in Linear B: *re-wo-pi-qe* dat. pl.⁸² as if **lewomphique*; again *ka-ra-a-pi re-wo-te-jo* "with lion heads".⁸³ These suggest an original *λέφων. The Oriental forms—Hebrew לָבִיא, poetical Akkadian *labbu*, Egyptian *rw*⁸⁴—suggest an international word of fluctuating form.

A name of the lion may underly a notable agreement between Homer and Gilgamesh (p. 15 above). Achilles grieves over Patroclus as a "bearded lion" (λῖς ἠϋγένειος) over its cubs (σκόμνους, *Iliad* 18.318-320). Gilgamesh grieves over Enkidu (*Gilgamesh* VIII.2.18-19) "like a lion..., like a lioness deprived of her cubs," *kīma a-ri-e...kīma neš-ti [š]a šuddât me-ra-[ni-ša]* (cf. CAD x.2.106). The Akkadian feminine *neštu* seems more appropriate than the Greek masculine. Hebrew three times has דָּב שָׁכוּל "a bear deprived of its cubs": II Sam 17,8 of dispossessed David, where the LXX ἄρκος ἠτεκνωμένη, Vg *ursa raptis catulis*; Hos 13,8, parallel to a lion (לָבִיא); Prov 17,12. Since *n* and *l* often interchange, *neštu* may be a feminine corresponding to שִׁלְיָ. Then the Iliadic λῖς would be an actual vocabulary agreement with Akkadian *nešti*.

(P. 309) *A king in the field pours out water brought to him alone.* A thematic parallel. II Sam 23,16 "[David] poured out the water as a libation to Yahweh." Arrian *Anab.* 6.26.3 Alexander in the desert takes the helmet of water brought to him and "poured it out in the sight of all"; this is not specifically described as a libation, but the action strongly suggests it.

(P. 309) *"Flies o'er th'unbending corn."* A literary allusion. *Iliad* 20.227; the horses of Erichthonius "would run across the tops of the grain and not break them,"

ἄκρον ἐπ' ἀνθερίκων καρπὸν θεὸν οὐδὲ κατέκλων

81 F. Field, *Origenis Hexaplorum quae supersunt* (1875/1964) i p. xxiii, ii.10.

82 DMG² no. 243.

83 DMG² no. 246.

84 Erman-Grapow ii.403.

and likewise over the waves of the sea.⁸⁵ So Camilla (*Aeneid* 7.808-9)

Illa uel intactae segetis per summa uolaret
gramina nec teneras cursu laesisset aristas.

"She would fly over the tops of the ears of an untouched field, nor break the tender ears in her course." Likewise Atalanta and Hippomenes (Ovid *Met.* 10.654-5). Jesus walked on the sea (Mark 6,48 etc.) but not over grain. The Midrash (*Qoh. Rabbah* on 9,11) says that Asahel "used to run on ears of grain and they were not broken,"

רץ על סאסי שיבלייא ואין משתברין

This seems to show knowledge of the Greco-Roman literary commonplace like Pope's (*Essay on Criticism* 372-3):

Not so, when swift Camilla scours the plain,
Flies o'er th'unbending corn, and skims along the main.

(P. 309) *Sennacherib*. He appears in Tobit 1,15 as Σενναχηρίμ father of Esarhaddon;⁸⁶ in Aramaic Ahiqar as [מלך אחר] "S. king of Assyria";⁸⁷ in the ostracon KAI 233.16 [סנ]הריב; at II Reg 18,13 = Isa 36,1 [סנ]הריב; as Σενναχειρίμου in Berossus.⁸⁸ Herodotus 2.141.2 calls him "king of the Arabs and Assyrians," Σαναχάριβον βασιλέα Ἀραβίων τε καὶ Ἀσσυρίων and tells the story how the mice gnawed the bowstrings of his army in Egypt.

(Additional) *The bird-trap*. I end with a Semitic loanword in the Greek of Palestine. Antipater of Sidon (*Anth. Pal.* 6.109.3) has a bird-hunter dedicate, among other things, κλωβούς τ' ἀμφίρωγας "woven bird-traps"; so Babrius 124.3 (LCL) either "trap" or "cage." Antipater has the noun from a long Canaanite tradition. Jer 5,27 "like a trap full of birds," כְּכַלּוּב מְלֵא עוֹף. Hence Sirach 11,28 (ed. Lévi) [כְּכַלּוּב] "like a bird caught in a trap." The LXX (at 11,30) has πέρδιξ θηρευτῆς ἐν καρτάλλω "like a decoy partridge in a basket," using a phrase of Aristotle *Hist. Anim.* 614a10 θηρευτὴν πέρδικα (and cf. Babrius *loc. cit.*). Jeremiah in turn has the phrase from common usage, for Rib-Addi of Byblös uses it frequently; thus at Amarna 74.45-48⁸⁹:

ki-ma iššurāti ša i-na libbi^{bi} ḥu-ḥa-ri ki-lu-bi ša-ak-na-at ki-šu-ma
a-na-ku i-na^{al} gu[b-l]a

"Like birds that lie in a cage, so am I in Gubla." With different language Sennacherib boasts that he has shut up Hezekiah in Jerusalem "like a caged bird," *kīma iššur ku-up-pi*.⁹⁰ In this light Amos 8,1 קִיץ כְּלּוּב should be given a similar meaning, for the context is sinister, and RSV "a basket of

85 See Hesiod frag. 62.1 Merkelbach-West.

86 Corrupted to אסרחריב in the Aramaic Tobit, ed. J. Fitzmyer, *Biblica* 75 (1994) 220-224.

87 Ahiqar i.3, Cowley p. 212.

88 Berossus, FGH 680 frag. 7a = Josephus *AJ* 10.20.

89 Also at Amarna 79.36; 81.35; 105.9; 116.18.

90 D. D. Luckenbill, *The Annals of Sennacherib* (1924) 33.

summer fruit" does not fit the theme of judgement. LXX ἄγγοϛ ἰξευτοῦ "vessel of the fowler" though no translation conveys the right feeling. Amos 3,5 has "Does a bird fall in a trap on the earth where there is no snare for it?" So I suggest for Amos 8,1 "a bird-trap baited with fruit."

When I began to compile Index 1 of words discussed, I realized that this book in one way or another touched on nearly all the vocabulary of common nouns (excluding proper names, transliterations, and names of the alphabet-letters) shared by Greek and Hebrew before the time of Alexander. The following paragraphs in briefest possible compass make the listing complete, to the extent of my present knowledge. Thus the lists of Index 1.1.1 and 1.2.1 *include* that common vocabulary, which forms their bulk. The lists also include other words from both languages whose etymology is discussed. I was unable to find a simple way of marking the type of etymological connection in each case, or my degree of certainty about it; for those details, the reader will refer back to the text.

Geographical. In Article B, I compare the words for "mountain" (ὄρος, ֶהָר); and note (p. 189) that ִתְּנַחַח I Reg 4.11 "some geographical term" is close to ִנָּחַח "valley."

Greek loan-words in Hebrew? Homeric μάχαιρα "sword" has a possible reflex at Gen 49,5 ִמְכַרְתֵּיהֶם "their swords." — φακός "lentil" appears as "lentil-shaped flasks" at Hippocrates *Nat. Mul.* 34 τοῖς φακοῖς τοῖς ὀστρακινοῖς. Then compare I Sam 10,1 (& II Reg 9,1) ִמְשֹׁךְ הַשֵּׁן "flask of oil" for anointing, LXX φακὸν τοῦ ἐλαίου, Vg *lenticulum olei*. The LXX may have been guided by sound but still hit on a Greek original.

Trees. συκάμινος Theophrastus *Hist. Plant.* 1.9.7 "mulberry"; surely the same as ִמְשֹׁךְ Amos 7,14, LXX συκάμιννα. In neither case is the exact species intended clear. Strabo calls its fruit συκόμορον; both words at Luk 17,6; 19.4. —Greek ἐλάτη "fir" (*Od.* 5.239) is used to make oars (12.172). With its adjective εἰλάτινος (*Iliad* 24.454) cf. ִלְאָל Ez 6,13 etc. "terebinth?"; at Ez 27,6 ִלְאָלִים (LXX ἐλατίνοισ) are used for oars.

Persian words. In Article H (fn. 119) I propose that ἄγγαρος "Persian courier" (Theopompus, FGH 115 F 109) is a later borrowing from the same source as ἄγγελος "messenger"; with both cf. Aramaic ִלְתָּר Ezra 4,8 "letter." —At Article H p. 113 I note various forms of Persian "satrap" (σατράπης Xenophon *Oec.* 4.11), and see p. 29 above. —Actual "Magians" (μάγοι Herodotus 1.101) witness a document at Elephantine, each designated ִמְגִישָׁא (E. G. Kraeling, *The Brooklyn Museum Aramaic Papyri* [1953] 4.24). A book could be written on the history of the words for "Magi, magic."

Miscellany. μαγγανεία "magic spell" (Plato *Leg.* 933A) sounds very much like Thr 3,63 ִמְגִישָׁא "their incantation," Vg *ego sum psalmus eorum*. The

relation of Greek μάγγανον "machine" is unclear. —λεκάνη Aristophanes *Nubes* 907 "pot or pan" is perhaps from Akkadian *lahannu* "bottle." It appears for לִפְּחָ at Jud 6,38 LXX where the Targum has לִקְנָה, seemingly as a loanword from Greek, and following the LXX. — πίννη is both "oyster" (Aristotle, *Hist. Anim.* 547b15) and "pearl" (*P.Oxy.* 1273.10) ἐνωτίων ζεῦγος ἔχον πείνας δέκα "a pair of earrings with ten pearls [each?]." פְּנִינִים is some precious substance; פִּנָּה is "corner," but at Isa 28,16 יְקִרְתָּ פִּנֶת יְקִרְתָּ "precious cornerstone" is treated by Rev 21,12 "twelve μαργαρίται" as if "pearls" were intended. — σεμίδαλις "wheat flour" (Aristophanes frag. 412 OCT), cf. Latin *simula* (Martial 13.10.1) is probably from Akkadian *samīdu* "groats"; Bab. Talm. *Gitt.* 56a סמִידָא must be direct from the Akkadian.

Index 1: Words Discussed

Words whose phonetic equivalents in other languages are discussed. Minor variations in spelling are omitted.

1.1 West-Semitic

Biblical Hebrew except as marked: Aram(aic), epigraphic and on papyrus; Bib(lical) A(ramaic); Nab(ataean); Palm(yrene); Phil(istine); Phoen(ician & Punic); Qum(ran); Rab(binic); Syr(iac); Targ(umic).

1.1.1 West-Semitic common nouns (and verbs)

אבני	"stones" 19	קרק	"lightning" 18,330
אברה	"letter" (BibA) 342	קרקח	"emerald" 18,87,122,332
אדון	"lord" 41,154	בשם	"balsam" 96
אהבה	"love" 21	גדר	"wall" 119
אהלים	"aloes?" 71,96	גיא	"valley" 58
אזנים	"two ears" 196	גלה	"bowl" 19,40,109,146-8
אחשדרפנים	"satraps" 342	גמל	"camel" 210, 338
אשן	"linen" 41	גמוסירכס	"gymnasiarch" (Palm) 121
אשנס	"tuna" (Rab) 133	עזא	"treasure" (Aram) 40
אלה	"terebinth" 342	גפן	"vine" 136-7
אלה	"curse" 258	גפר	"wood of Ark" 329
אלף	"Aleph" (Rab) 42	גשר	"bridge" (Rab) 35
אלפבטרין	"alphabet-song" (Rab) 46	דה	"aunt" 336
אניה	"mourning" 21	דלי	"bucket" 145
אפעה	"serpent" 340	דלת	"door" 18,40,52-3
אקאס	"kyanos" (Phoen) 88	דקל	"date(-palm)" (Rab) 19
ארץ	"earth" 20	דרכמנים	"drachmas" 301
ארר	"to curse" 258	הבנים	"ebony" 42,197
אתון	"ass" 19	הר	"mountain" 342
בוץ	"byssus" 209	ורד	"rose" (Targ) 339
בורלא	"beryl" (Rab Syr) 333	.	"to sacrifice" 188-90,199-201
בחון	"tower" 131	זנה	"harlot" 226
בחן	"to test, refine" 19,305-7	חלבנה	"galbanum" 150
ביתא	"house" (BibA) 42	חצי	"arrows" 20
ביתאל	"house of God" 337	חרב	"sword" 21,78-83
במה	"altar" 188-190,201-4		
בקר	"unripe grapes" 155-6		
בקר	"oxen" 194		
בקר	"pool" 24		
ברכה	"blessing" 24		

חרוץ	"gold" 19,41,73,84,197, 300-8	מסך	"to mix" 142-3
חָהָם	"signet" 75	מַעְרָה	"cave" 244
טבח	"to slaughter" 199-201	מַצָּה	"unleavened bread" 337
טַטְרָנון	"square" (Rab) 339	מֵר	"myrrh" 40,70-2,95-6,150, 210-3
טַרְנִי	"rulers" (Targ) 65	קָר	"bitter" 314
טַרְפְּסִיטִים	"banker" (Rab) 75	מֵרָא	"hoe" (Rab) 145
		מְשִׁיחַ	"anointed" 60
יָן	"wine" 41,137-141	נָבֵל	"harp" 155
יַשְׁפָּה	"jasper" 40,42,87-90	נְטָף	"some gum" 331
		נְעָמָן	? 246
כָּבִיר	"great" 36-7	נַפְתָּח	"naphtha" (Rab) 279
כַּד	"amphora" 19,40,143-5	נָפֶחַ	part of a mountain 342
כּוּבֵעַ	"helmet" (Phil) 20,65,165-6	נִקְמָר	"spiced" (Rab) 91
כְּלוּב	"bird-trap" 341	נָרַד	"nard" 148-151
כְּלוֹנוֹסָת	"columns" (Rab) 158	נִשְׁקָה	"hall" 141-2
כַּפְּזָן	"cummin" 335	נִחָר	"nitre" 241
כַּפְּרָה	"henna" 92-3,149	סָדִין	"linen" 209
כְּרוּב	"cherub" 18,85-7	סַמִּידָא	"wheat flour" (Rab) 343
כְּרֹכְסִים	"crocus?" 93	סֵס	"moth" 73-4
כְּרֹפֶס	"cotton" 339	סַפִּיר	"sapphire" 40,84,87,332
כַּחְנִיחַ	"tunic" 59,188-90,204-9	סַרְנִי	"rulers" (Phil) 65
לְבִיא	"lion" 340	עֲבָרָה	"arrogance" 107,294
לְבָנָה	"brick" 16,76,83-5	עוֹף	"birds" 281
לְבוֹנָה	"frankincense" 40,70-2,95, 188-90,210-3	עֵינַיִם	"two eyes" 196
לוֹלְרֵי	"harness-makers" (Syr) 179	עֵלְיוֹן	"most high" 35
לוֹט	"some aromatic" 332	עַקְרָב	"scorpions" 146,336
לִישׁ	"lion" 42,340	עָרֵב	"evening" 57
לַמֵּד	"Lamedh" (Rab) 44	עֲרֻבוֹן	"pledge" 18-19,74-8
לַפִּיד	"torch" 21	עֲרָבִי	"ravens" 313
לַקְנָא	"dish" (Targ) 343	עֲתִיק	"old" (BibA) 119
לַקֵּק	"to lick" 282	פּוֹךְ	"mascara" 241-2
לַשְׁקָה	"hall" 18,43,141-2	פּוֹל	"beans" 19
מַגִּישָׁא	"magus" (Aram) 343	פִּידְוֹנ	"pedagogue" (Rab) 330
מַרְבְּחָא	"altar" (BibA) 202	פִּילְגָשׁ	"concupine" 19,65-70
מוֹם	"flaw" 232	פֶּךְ	"oil-flask" 342
מוֹנֵג	"to mix" 142-3	פַּלְפַל	"pepper" (Rab, Qum) 151, 335
מַטְרָן	"rain" 22,330	פִּנְהָ	"corner; pearl?" 343
מִלְנִין	"ink" (Rab) 330	פִּנְקָס	"tablet" (Rab) 75
מִכְרָה	"sword?" 342	פַּרְדִּים	"paradise" 21,95-6,140
מִלְטָה	"mortar?" 41	פַּרוּבוּל	"exemption" (Rab) 250
מִלְךְ	"king" 200	פֶּרָה	"bear!" 43
מִלְמָד	"ox-goad" 44	צַפְעוֹנִי	"serpent" 103
מָן	"manna" 210	צַפְרָדַע	"frogs" 336
מַגִּידָה	"incantation" 343		
מִנָּה	"mina" 43,50,76,307-8		

קבעת	"bowl" 109,167	ששן	"lily" 331
קדם	"ancient, eastern" 37	שכינה	"presence" (Rab) 20,179-180
קדרוס	"cedar" (Rab) 329	שכר	"strong drink" 154
קובע	"helmet" (Phil) 20,65,165-6	שלב	"snow" 330
קולמוס	"pen" (Rab) 330	שנהבים	"ivory" 197,337
קוף	"monkey" 44	שק	"sack" 19,41
קושט	"costus" (Rab) 149-150	שקל	"shekel" 307
קיק	"castor" (Rab) 331	שקמה	"sycamore" 342
קיקון	"castor tree?" 331	ששמן	"sesame" (Phoen) 335
קנבוס	"cannabis" (Rab) 331	האומים	"twins" 146
קנה	"reed" 94	חבה	"ark" 35
קנמן	"cinnamon" 71,94	חור	"bull" (BibA) 18,190-5
קציעה	"cassia" 18,42,70-72,150	חירוש	"new wine" 154-8
קרדמן	"cardamum" (Qum) 151	חככים	"peacocks?" 44
קרטיס	"paper" (Rab) 330	הלה	"to hang" 307
קרן	"horn" 195-9	המנת	"precinct" 21
רמחי	"lances" 18,20,173-7	תצין	"great fish" 19,128-133
שר	"bull" 146,188-195	תף	"tambourine" 152-5
		תקל	"shekel" (BibA) 50

1.1.2 West-Semitic proper nouns

אג	"Agag" 37	בעל צפן	"Baal Saphon" (Aram) 98-105
אגדר	"Gadeira" (Phoen) 119	בה כפס	"House of Mopsus" (Phoen) 33
אחיקר	"Ahiqar" (Aram) 309	גבל	"Byblos" 329
אחרם	"Ahiram" (Phoen) 334	גוג	"Gyges" 175
אכיש	"Achish" of Gath (Phil) 164	גלגמיס	"Gilgamesh" (Qum) 16
אמן	"Amon" of Thebes 329	גליית	"Goliath" (Phil) 164
אמן	"Ammon" of Libya (Phoen) 329	גירגשי	"Girgashite" 31
אסי	"Isis" (Aram) 333	גשורי	"Geshurite" 35
אסר-חדן	"Esarhaddon" 309	דאר, דור	"Dor" 33
אסרשמר	"Osir-Shammar" (Phoen) 333	דינים	some people 7,339
אפקה	"Aphaca" 245	דוסרא	"Dusares" (Nab) 333
ארנד	"Aradus" 41	דוד	"David" 336
ארוס	"Ares" (Syr) 245	דני	"Danite" 227
ארמי	"Aramaean" 18	דנם	"some people" (Phoen) 227
אררט	"Ararat" 139	דפנא	"Daphne" of Eg. (Nab) 333
אשדוד	"Ashdod" 40	הגי	"Hegai" 34
אשור	"Assyria" 42-3,324	הדר	"Hadad" 273
אשמן	"Eshmun" (Phoen) 35	הופסטס	"Hephaestus" (Syr) 245
בבל	"Babylon" 334	ורוד	"Worodes" (Palm) 339
בל	"Bel" 195	חבב	"Hobab" 328
בלתי	"Balthi" (Syr) 245	חובבס	"Humbaba?" (Qum) 16
בעל זבוב	"Baalzebub" 219-221		
בעליחן	"Baalyathon" (Phoen) 304		
בעלמרפא	"Baal heals" (Phoen) 49		

חי	"Hivite" 32,201,227	עבדאסר	"Abd-osir" (Phoen) 120
חילך	"Cilicia" 29	עברכשר	"Abd-Koshar" (Phoen) 332
חירם	"Hiram" 334	עבדה	"Obodas" (Nab) 43
חנא	"Hanno" (Phoen) 41	עזה	"Gaza" 40
חננה	"Hannah" 336	עזרבבל	"Hasdrubal" (Phoen) 330
חנוב	"Chnubis" (Aram) 338	עשתרת	"Ashtoreth" 213,339
חפי	"Apis" (Aram) 334	פניקיא	"Phoenicia" (Syr) 245
חצ'רמא	"Hadhramaut" 210	פיניחס	"Phinehas" 181-2
חתי	"Hittite" 31	פלשתי	"Philistine" 170-1
טוביה	"Tobias" 40	פרס	"Persia" 40,165
טרפליא	"men of Tripolis?" 34	פתח	"Ptah" (Aram) 334
		פתם	"Pithom" 329
יב	"Elephantine" (Aram) 338	צידון	"Sidon" 18,42,69,329
יון	"Ionia" 42,82	צפון	"Mt Saphon" 98-105
יפו	"Joppa" 182	צר	"Tyre" 329
יפת	"Japheth" 42,82-3	קדמוני	"Qadmonite" 37
ירדן	"Jordan" 34,42	קפרוס	"Cyprus" (Syr) 245
כבבה	"Kybebe" (Aram) 328	קלפתרו	"Cleopatra" (Nab) 333
כוחר	"Kothar" (Syr) 245,332	קרתחדשת	"Carthage" (Phoen) 119,334
קרי	"Carian" 29	רודינים	"Rhodians" 339
כרך	"Caria" (Aram) 29	רמה	"Ramah" 24
קרתי	"Cretan" 32,69	שבא	"Sheba" 210,338
כשדים	"Chaldaeans" 97	ששן	"Susa" 331
		ששנה	"Susanna" 331
לבנון	"Lebanon" 95,210	שיחור	"Shihor" 334
לד	"Lydda" 30	שרדן	"Sardinia?" (Phoen) 176
לובים	"Libyans" 29,165	שרון	"Sharon" 35
לוד	"Lydia" 29,42,165	תבור	"Tabor" 330
לוי	"Levi" 38	תבל	"Tubal" 174-5
מארבלוס	"Merbalos" (Phoen) 42,330	תדמר	"Tadmor" 19
מלקרת	"Melqarth" (Phoen) 120	תחות	"Thoth" (Aram) 334
מף	"Memphis" 329	תחפנחס	"Daphne" of Egypt 100,333
משך	"Meshech" 174-5	תמוז	"Tammuz" 244-5
מתן	"Matten" (Phoen) 330	תפסח	"Thapsacus" 329
ניעה	"Nineveh" 329	תרמילא	"Lycia" (Aram) 29
סבא	"Saba" 210,238	תרשיש	"Tarshish" 7
סנה	"Syene" 41,337	תשבתי	"Tishbite?" 35
סנחריב	"Sennacherib" 341		
ספרד	"Sardes" 336		

1.2 Greek

1.2.1 Common nouns (and verbs)

ἀγάλοχον

"fragrant wood" 96

ἀγάπη

"love" 21

- ἄγγαρος "(Persian) courier" 342
 ἄγγελος "messenger" 342
 ἀδελφεός "brother" 225
 ἄλση "aloes" 71,96
 ἄλφα "Alpha" 42-3
 ἀλφαβητάριον "alphabet song" 46
 ἄμπελος "grapevine" 136-7
 ἀμύμων "faultless" 232
 ἄμωμος "faultless" 232
 (F)ἄναξ "lord, king" 200
 ἀνεμώνη "anemone" 246
 ἀνίη "grief" 21
 ἀρά "curse" 258
 ἄργυρος "silver" 301
 ἄρπη "sickle" 21,78-83
 ἄρραβών "pledge" 18-19,74-8

 βαίτυλος "betyl" 337
 βάλαμον "balsam" 96
 βάσανος "touchstone" 19,305-7
 βάτραχος "frog" 336
 βήρυλλος "beryl" 333
 βῆτα "Beta" 42
 βότρυς "unripe grapes" 155-6
 βροχή "downpour" 24
 βύβλος "papyrus" 329
 βύσσος "byssus" 209
 βαμός "altar" 188-90,201-4

 γάζα "treasure" (Persian) 40
 γαυλός "wine-vessel" 19,40,
 109,146-8
 γαῦλος "(Phoen.) freighter" 19,
 146-8
 γέφυρα "bridge" 35
 γῆ etc. "earth" 58
 γρύψ "griffin" 18,85-7
 γυμνασίαρχος "gymnasiarch" 121
 γυνή "woman" 226
 γύψ "vulture" 281

 δάκτυλος "date(-palm)" 19
 δέλτα "Delta" 44
 δέλτος "tablet" 18,40,46,52-3
 διάβολος "devil" 13
 δράκων "dragon" 13
 δραχμή "drachma" 301

 ἔβνος "ebony" 42,197
 ἐλάτη "fir" 342
 ἐπικάρ "headlong" 195
 ἔραζε "to earth" 20
 ἔρεβος "darkness" 57
 εὐναί "anchor-stones" 19

 ζυῖρνη "myrrh" 95-6

 θῆβις "ark" 35
 θύννος "tuna" 19,128-133
 θύρσος "thyrsus" 154-8

 ἱάσπις "jasper" 40,42,87-90,
 301

 κάδος "amphora" 19,40,143-5
 κάλαμος "pen" 54,330
 κάμηλος "camel" 210,338
 κάμιλος "cable" 338
 κάννα "reed" 94
 κάνναβις "cannabis" 331
 κάρδαμον "cardamum" 335
 κάρπασος "cotton" 339
 κασία "cassia" 18,70-72
 κέρας "horn" 195-9
 κῆβος "monkey" 44
 κιθών "tunic" 204
 κίκι "castor plant" (Eg.) 331
 κιννάμωμον "cinnamon" 71,94
 κλέ(φ)ος ἄφθιτον "undying fame" 11
 κλωβός "bird-trap" 341
 κόστος "costus" 149-150
 κρόκος "crocus" 93
 κύανος "enamel?" 88,304
 κύκλος ἡλίου "wheel of the sun"
 271-2
 κύμβαχος "helmet" 20,65,165-6
 κύμβη "skiff" 167
 κυμβίον "patera" 109,167
 κύμινον "cummin" 335
 κυπάρισσος "cypress" 329
 κύπρος "henna" 92-3,149

 λάβδα "Lambda" 43
 λαμπάς "torch, lightning" 21
 λα(φ)ός "people" 38
 λείριον "lily" 331
 λείχω "to lick" 282
 λεκάνη "dish" 343
 λέσχη "wine-hall" 18,43,141-2
 λέων "lion" 340
 λήδανον "ladanum" 331
 λίβανος "frankincense" 40,70-2,
 95,188-90,210-3
 λίς "lion" 42,340
 λίτρον "nitre" 241
 λίψ "southwest wind" 30
 λόγχη "lance" 18,20,173-4
 λωτός "lotus" 332

μαγανεία	"enchantment" 343	σάκκος	"sack(-cloth)" 19,41
μάγος	"mage" 343	σάπφειρος	"sapphire" 40,84,87, 332
μάδβαχος	"altar" (Aramaic) 202	σατράπης	"satrap" 342
μάζα	"barley-cake" 337	σεμίδαλις	"wheat flour" 343
μάλθα	"mortar" 41	σής	"moth" 73-4
μάννα	"manna, granule" 210	σήςαμον	"sesame" 336
μάραγδος	"emerald" 332	σίγλος	"shekel" 307
μάρρον	"hoe" (Hesychius) 145	σίκερα	"strong drink" (LXX) 154
μάχαιρα	"sword" 342	σίκλος	"shekel" 307
μέγαρα	"cave" 244	σινδών	"linen band" 209
μέθυσήδύ	"sweet mead" 139	σκηνή	"tent" 20,179-80
μέλαν	"ink" 54,330	σκορπίος	"scorpion" 146,336
μίσγω	"to mix" 142-3	σμάραγδος	"emerald" 87,122,332
μνᾶ	"mina" 43,307-8	σμύρνη	"myrrh" 95-6
μύρον	"ointment" 96	σοῦσον	"lily" 331
μύρρα	"myrrh" 40,70-2, 95-6, 210-3	σπορδακάς	"frog" (modern Gk) 336
μῶμος	"blame" 194,232	στίμμι	"mascara" (Egypt.) 241-2
νάβλας	"harp" 155	συκάμινος	"sycamore" 342
νάπη	"glade" 342	συκόμορος	"sycamore" 342
νάρδος	"nard" 148-151	σφάζω	"to slaughter" 188-190, 199-201
νάφθα	"naphtha" 279	ταῦρος	"bull" 18,146,188-195
νέκταρ	"nectar" 91	ταῶς	"peacock" 44
νέτωπον	"almond-oil" 331	τέμενος	"precinct" 21
νίτρον	"nitre" 241	τετράγωνος	"square" 339
νίφα	"snow" 330	τλή	"he endured" 307
ὀθόνη	"fine linen" 41	τραπεζίτης	"banker" 75
(Φ)οῖνος	"wine" 41,137-41	τύμπανον	"tambourine" 152-5
οἷστοι	"arrows" 20	τύραννος	"tyrant" 65
ὄρος	"mountain" 342	ὔβρις	"arrogance" 107,294
οὐάτοι	"two ears" 196	ὔδωρ	"water" 22,330
οὔρος	"aurochs" 192-3	φακός	"bean(-shaped dish)" 342
ὄφις	"serpent" 340	φέρε	"bear!" 43
παιδαγωγός	"pedagogue" 54,330	φλόξ	"lightning" 330
παλλακίς	"concubine" 19,65-70	φύκος	"rouge" 241-2
παράδεισος	"paradise" 21,95-6,140	χαλβάνη	"galbanum" 150
πέπερι	"pepper" 335	χάρτης	"paper" 54,330
πηλαμίς	"young tuna" 133	χιτών	"tunic" 59,188-90, 204-9
πίναξ	"tablet" 75	χρυσός	"gold" 19,41,73,84, 197,300-8
πίννη	"oyster, pearl" 343		
πλίνθος	"brick" 16,76,83-5		
πολτός	"(bean-)porridge" 19		
ράβδος	"staff" 44		
ρόδον	"rose" 339		
ρόμφαία	"broadsword" 174		

1.2.2 Greek proper nouns

Ἀγχίσις	"Anchises" 164	Δάφναι	"Daphne" of Egypt 333
Ἄδαδος	"Hadad" 273	Δαχής	"Daches?," Bab. god 17
Ἀδράμυτα	"Hadhramaut" 210	Δειδῶ	"Dido" 336
Ἄδων(ις)	"Adonis" 41,54,208, 245	Δούρα	"Doura" of Palestine 33
Ἄζωτος	"Ashdod" 40	Δουσάρης	"Dusares," Arabian god 333
Αἴγυπτος	"Egypt" 329	Δωδώνη	"Dodona" 7
Ἀκίχαρος	"Ahiqar" 309	Εἰρωμος	"Hiram" 334
Ἀλαρόδιοι	"Urartians" 139	Ἐλιεύς	"Elieus," title of Zeus 35
Ἀλυάττης	"Alyattes" of Lydia 164	Ἐρεμβοί	"Aramaeans?" 18
Ἄμμων	"Ammon" of Libya 329	Ἐρεσχιγαλ	"Ereschigal," Bab. goddess 328
Ἄμουν	"Amoun" of Thebes 329	Ἐσμουνος	"Eshmun," Phoen. god 35
Ἄννω	"Hanno" 41	Ζμάρραγδος	"Emerald Mine," Egypt 332
Ἄνός	"Anos," Bab. god 17	Ζῶρος	"Tyrian" 329
Ἄός	"Aos" " 17	Ἡγίας	"Hegias" of Ephesus 34
Ἀπασών	"Apason" " 17	Θαμούς	"Thamous," Eg. name 244
Ἄπις	"Apis" of Egypt 334	Θάψακος	"Thapsacus" 329
Ἀράδιος	"man of Aradus" 41	Θεόδωρος	"Theodoros," Phoen. 303
Ἀρύβας	"Arybas," Phoen. king 330	Θεῦθ	"Theuth," Eg. god 334
Ἀσδρούβας	"Hasdrubal" 330	Θήβαι	"Thebes" (two sites) 35
Ἀσσύριοι	"Assyrians" 42-3	Θίσβη	"Thisbe" of Boeotia 35
Ἀσσωρός	"Assoros," Bab. god 17	Θωμάς	"Thomas" 146
Ἀστάρτη	"Astarte" 213	Ἰαπετός	"Iapetus" 42,82-3
Ἀτάβυρις	"Atabyris," mt of Rhodes 330	Ἰάρδανος	"Iardanos," river name 34,42
Ἄφακα	"Aphaca" of Lebanon 245	Ἰάων	"Ionian" 18,42,82
Ἄφροδίτη	"Aphrodite" 213	Ἰηβ	"Elephantine" 338
Ἀχαιοί	"Achaeans" 32	Ἰλλινος	"Illinos," Bab. god 17
Βαβυλών	"Babylon" 334	Ἰόππη	"Joppa" 182
Βαιτοκαΐκη	"Baetocaece" 331	Ἰσις	"Isis" 333
Βεελζεβούλ	"Beelzebul" 219-221	Ἰσμηνός	"Ismenos," river 35
Βελλεροφῶν	"Bellerophon" 49	Ἰταβύριον	"Mt Tabor" of Palestine 330
Βῆλος	"Bel" 195	Ἰτύκη	"Utica" 119
Βότρυς	"Botrys" of Phoenicia 156	Ἰω	"Io" 247
Βύβλος	"Byblos" 93,329	Κάβειροι	"Kabeiroi" 36-7
Γάδαιρα	"Gades" 119	Κάδμος	"Cadmus" 37
Γάζα	"Gaza" 40	Κάρ	"Carian" 30
Γαμφάνη	"Gamphane" of Cyprus 335	Καρχηδών	"Carthage" 119,334
Γεργίθεις	"Gergithians" 31	Κάσιον	"Mt Kasion" 98-105
Γεφυραῖοι	"Gephyraeans" 35		
Γίλγαμος	"Gilgamesh" 16		
Γύγης	"Gyges" 175		
Δανάη	"Danaë" 227		
Δαναοί	"Danaans" 227		

Κήτειοι	"Hittites?" 31	Παλαιστίνη	"Palestine" 170-1
Κίλιξ	"Cilician" 29	Πάλμυρα	"Palmyra" 19
Κισσαρής	"Kissares," Bab. god 17	Πάνδαρος	"Pandaros" 33
Κιτιβαίνα	"Qataban" of Arabia 210	Πάτουμος	"Paturamos" 329
Κλεοπάτρα	"Cleopatra" 333	Πάχυνος	"Pachynos" of Sicily 131
Κνουφίς	"Knouphis," Eg. god 338	Πελασγοί	"Pelasgians" 170-1
Κόμβαβος	"Kombabos" of Byblos 328	Πελαστικέ	title of Zeus 170-1
Κρήτες	"Cretans" 32,69	Πέρσης	"Persian" 40,165
Κυβέλη	"Cybele" 328	Ῥόδος	"Rhodes" 7,92,339
Κυβήβη	"Cybebe" 16,328	Σαβά	"Saba" 210
Κύβηβος	devotee of Cybebe 328	Σαναχάριβος	"Sennacherib" 341
Κυθήρεια	"Cythereian, Aphrodite" 331	Σαρδανάπαλλος	"Assurbanipal?" 324
Κύθηρα	"Cythera" 332	Σάρδεις	"Sardeis" 336
Κύθηρος	"Kytheros," Phoen. 332	Σαρδονικόν	from the Black Sea 176
Κύπρος	"Cyprus" 92	Σαρδώ	"Sardinia" 176
Λάβδα	"Labda," mother of Cypselus 43	Σάρων	"Saron," plain 35
Λάιος	"Laius" 38	Σαχερδόνος	"Esarhaddon" 309
*Λαχής	Bab. god 17	Σιδών	"Sidon" 18,42,69,329
Λιβανός	"Lebanon" 95,210	Σίρωμος	"Hiram" 334
Λιβύη	"Libya" 29,165	Σίσουθρος	Sumerian Gilgamesh 16
Λύδδα	"Lydda" 30	Σμύρνη	"Smyrna" 95-6
Λυδοί	"Lydians" 29,42,165	Σούσα	"Susa" 331
Ματτήν	"Matten," Phoen. 330	Σούσαννα	"Susanna" 331
Μέλκαρθος	"Melqarth" 120	Συήνη	"Syene" of Egypt 41, 337
Μέμφις	"Memphis" 329	Ταρσός	"Tarsus" 7
Μέρβαλος	"Merbalos" (Phoen.) 42,330	Ταρτησσός	"Tartessus" 7
Μεσσίας	"Messiah" 60	Ταυθέ	"Tiamat?" 17
Μέσχοι	"Moschoi" 174-5	Τερμίλαι	"Lycians" 31
Μίδης	"Midas" 175	Τήλεφος	"Telephus" 31
Μίναια	"Minaia" of Arabia 210	Τιβαρηνοί	"Tibareni" 174-5
Μόξος	"Mopsus" 33	Τουβίας	"Tobias" 40
Μόσχοι	"Moschoi" 174-5	Τρίπολις	"Tripolis" of Phoenicia 34
Μόψος	"Mopsus" 34	Τύρος	"Tyre" 329
Μόψου Έστία	"Hearth of Mopsus" 33	Τυφάων etc.	"Typhon" 98-105, 124-5
Μωϋμίν	"?" (Bab. god?) 17	Φθαῦς	"Pthah," Eg. god 334
Νίνος	"Nineveh" 329	Φινεύς	"Phineus" 181-2
Ξίσουθρος	Sumerian Gilgamesh 16	Χαλδαίοι	"Chaldaeans" (two peoples) 97,324
Όβόδας	"Obodas," Nab. king 43	Χούσαρθις	"Chusarthis" (Phoen. goddess) 332
Οινεύς	"Oineus" 137	Χούσωρ	"Chusor" (Phoen. god) 332
Οινωτήρη	"Oenotria" 138	Όγγυος	"Ogygos" 37
Όσιρις	"Osiris" 333	Όρος	"Horus" of Egypt 334
Όυαρδάνης	"Vardanes" 339		
Όυορώδης	"Vorodes" 339		

1.3 Latin words and proper names

(Some obvious borrowings from Greek omitted)

aloe	"aloes" 71,96	murra	"myrrh" 95-6
amarus	"bitter" 314	nablia	"harps" 155
antiquus	"old" 119	náphtha	"crude petroleum" 279
argentum	"silver" 301	nardus	"nard" 148-151
arra(bo)	"pledge" 74-8	paedagogus	"pedagogue" 330-1
asinus	"ass" 19	pælex	"concubine" 19,65-70
baetylus	"betyl" 337	pampinus	"grapevine" 136-7
beryllus	"beryl" 333	pauo	"peacock" 44
cadus	"amphora" 19,143-5	pecus	"flock, herd" 194
calamus	"pen" 330-1	puls	"beans" 19
camelus	"camel" 338	rosa	"rose" 339
camisia	"shirt" 332	rumpia	"broadsword" 174
canna	"reed" 94	saccus	"sack" 19
carpasus	"cotton, sail" 339	sagitta	"arrow" 20
casia	"cassia" 70-2,89	sapphirus	"sapphire" 87
cerebrum	"brain" 195	simula	"wheat flour" 343
ceruus	"stag" 195	smaragdus	"emerald" 89
charta	"paper" 330	smyrna	"myrrh" 95-6
cinnamomum	"cinnamon" 71,94	tarpezita	"banker" 75
columnas	"columns" (acc. pl.) 158	taurus	"bull" 146,190-5
cornu	"horn" 195-9	templum	"space for augury" 21
corui	"crows" 57,313	thynnus	"tuna" 131
costus	"costus" 149-150	thyrsus	"ritual staff" 156
crocus	"crocus" 93	tulit	"he bore" 307
cumba	"skiff" 167	tunica	"tunic" 204-9
cupressus	"cypress" 329	tympanum	"tambourine" 152-5
cymbium	"patern" 167	uinum	"wine" 137-141
diabolus	"devil" 13	urus	"wild ox" 192-3
dolium	"bucket" 145	Achiui	"Achaean" 32
draco	"dragon" 13	Adad	"Hadad" 273
ebur	"ivory" 337	Anna	Dido's sister 336
fucus	"cosmetic; mascara" 241-2	Beelzebub	god of Ekron 219-221
fulgur	"lightning" 330	Carthada	"Carthage" 334
galbanum	"spice" 150	Carthago	" 334
gymnasiarchus	"gynasiarch" 121	Dido	queen of Carthage 336
harpa	"harp" 78	Dusares	Arabian god 333
harpe	"sickle" 78	Gades	"Cádiz" 119
haruspex	"diviner" 185	Hasdrubal	brother of Hannibal 330
iaspis	"jasper" 87-90	Oenotri	"Oenotrians" 138
lancea	"lance" 20,173-7	Roma	"Rome" 24
lilium	"lily" 331	Sabaei	"Sabaeans" 338
lorarius	"harness-maker" 179	Sarra	"Tyre" 329
marra	"hoe" 145	Thamuz	Syrian Adonis 244
massa	"lump" 337	Utica	city of Africa 119
mina	"mina" 307-8	Vardanes	Persian 339
miscceo	"I mix" 142-3	Winlanda	"Vineland" 138

1.4 Other Languages

	<i>Akkadian</i>	<i>Ereškigal</i>	328
	(Unglossed entries are divine names)		
ašpû	"jasper" 88	Gi-il-ga-mèš Gub-la Gu-ug-gu	16 "Byblos" 329 "Gyges" 175
bamātu	"open country?" 201	Ḫaldu	"Haldians" of Armenia 97
barraqtu	"emerald" 333	Ḫazzi Ḫikuptah	"Mt Kasion" 100 "Egypt?" (Amarna) 329
bûšu	"byssus" 209	Ḫilakku Ḫumbaba	"Cilicia" 29 16,328
gullatu	"bowl" 146-8	la-su-mu-nu Ištar	"Eshmun" 36 339
ḫurāšu	"gold" 197,301	Kaldu Kishar	"Chaldaeans" 97 17
kilubi	"bird trap" 341	Labnanu	"Lebanon" 210
kitû	"linen, tunic" 205	Laḫ(a)mu	17
kuribu	"cherub?" 85	Lu-ud-di	"Lydia" 175
kurkanu	some aromatic 93	Mita	"Midas" 175
labbu	"lion" 340	Mi-il-qar-tu	"Melqarth" 120
ladanu	"ledanon" 331	Muski	"Moschi" 174-5
laḫannu	"dish" 343	Ṣapuna	"Saphon" 100
libnat	"brick" 84	Tabal	"Tibareni" 174-5
manû	"mina" 307-8	Tiamat/Tiawat	17
murru	"myrrh" 96	Artimuḷ	"Artemis" (Lydian) 336
muummu	? 17	MIDAIAI...FANAKTEI	"king Midas" (Phrygian) 175
napṭu	"naphtha" 279	Οἰνόανδα	city-name 138
neštu	"lioness" 340	Šardak	"Sardes" (Lydian) 336
qanû	"reed" 94	Tṛm̄mile	"Lycia" (Lycian) 31
qarnu	"horn" 195	Valveš	"Alyattes" (Lydian) 164
qunubu	"cannabis" 331		
saddin	"linen band" 209		
sanūdu	"goats" 343		
sāsu	"moth" 73		
šamaššammu	"sesame" 336		
šiqu	"shekel" 307		
šūru	"bull" 190-5		
uqnû	"lapis lazuli" 88		
Anshar	17	ʾarḏa	"earth" 20
Anu	17	ḏabaḫa	"slaughter" 199
Apsu	17	gharḅun	"sunset" 58
Baal-ša-pu-nu	"Baal-Saphon" 100	jamalun	"camel" 338
Danuna	some people 227	layṭun	"lion" 42,340
Dumuzi	"Tammuz" 245	al-qāḏi	"judge" 97
		qalamun	"pen" 330
		qamīšun	"shirt" 322
		qamun	"horn" 195-6
		qirtāsun	"paper" 230

qut (u)n	"cotton" 205	Imn	"Amoun" of Thebes 329
simsimun	"sesame" 336	Mn-nfr	"Memphis" 329
tabaḥa	"slaughter" 199	P3-nḥsj	"Penhase" 181-2
ṭawrun	"bull" 190-5	Pr-jtm-ṭkw	"Pithom" 329
waynun	"black grapes" 41,138	Pth	"Ptah" 334
Ghazzatun	"Gaza" 40	Š.t	"Isis" 333
Kawṭar	river of Paradise 332	Ṭbn etc.	"Daphnae" 333
Lubnān	"Lebanon" 210	Wš-ir	"Osiris" 333
	<i>Old South Arabian</i>		<i>English</i>
ḍbh	"to slaughter" 200	dēofol	"devil" (O[ld] E[nglish]) 13
kmkm	"crocus?" 93	draca	"dragon" (OE) 13
ldn	"ledanon" 331	egan	"eye" (OE) 196
qlm	"calamus" 331	flint	83
ṭwr	"bull" 191	heorot	"hart" (OE) 195
wynyhmw	"their vineyards" 138	lēod	"people" (OE) 38
Sbʾ	"Saba" 338	queen, quean	226
	<i>Armenian</i>	sunnan hweozul	"sun's wheel" (OE) 272
erek	"darkness" 58	swetter...med	"sweeter...mead" (OE) 139
vard	"rose" 339	ūr	"wild ox" (OE) 192-3
	<i>Baltic</i>		<i>Etruscan</i>
sirpe	"sickle" (Lithuanian) 78	Atunis	"Adonis" 65
taūras	"bull" (Lithuanian) 190-5	δρωῖνα	"rule" 65
tauris	"bull" (Old Prussian) 190-5	Θεβρῦμινες	"Minotaur" 190-5
	<i>Coptic</i>	Turan Ati	"Mother Turan" 65
hreri	"lily" 331	vinum	"wine" 137-41
ioh	"moon" 247		<i>Finnish/Estonian</i>
	<i>Dutch</i>	tarvas	"bull" 190-5
horen	"horn" 196		<i>French</i>
	<i>Egyptian</i>	chemise	"shirt" 322
3bw	"ivory" 337	soixante-dix	"seventy" 307
bḥn	"some stone" 305-7	Erde	<i>German</i>
db3.t	"ark" 35	hiri	"earth" 20
gjf	"monkey" 44	krump	"brain" (Old High Ger.) 195
hbnj	"ebony" 338	Leute	"crooked" (OHG) 85
ḥrr.t	"lily" 331	smero	"people" 38
ḥtm	"signet" 75	ūr-ohso	"smear" (OHG) 96
k3k3	"castor-oil?" 331	Wein	"aurochs" (OHG) 192-3
mšdm.t	"mascara" 241		"wine" 143
nṯr	"nitre" 241		<i>Gothic</i>
rw	"lion" 340	ausona	"ears" 196
šmšm.t	"sesame" 336	haurn	"horn" 195
Dḥw.tj	"Theuth" 334	riqiz	"darkness" 58
Ḥp	"Apis" 334	stiur	"steer" 191
Ḥr	"Horus" 334		

	<i>Hittite</i>		
kupahi	"turban" 65,165-6	ki-to	"tunic" 204
kuṣanna(n)	"enamel?" 88	ku-mi-no	"cummin" 335
qatar	"water" 330	ku-ru-so	"gold" 304
[qi?-] ja-na-aš	"wine" 138	ku-wa-no	"kyanos" 304
Ahhiyawa	"Achaean?" 32	re-wo-pi-qe	"lions?" 340
Lablana	"Lebanon" 210	sa-sa-ma	"sesame" 336
Luṣili	"in Luvian" 38	A ₃ -ku-pi-ti-jo	"Egyptian?" 329
Mu-uk-šú-uš	"Mopsus" 34	Mo-qo-so	"Mopsus?" 34
Niblani	"Lebanon" 210		
qinijant	"wine" (Luvian) 138		<i>Russian</i>
		кесар	"Caesar" 263
		снег	"snow" 330
		цар	"tsar" 263
		тоуръ	"bull" (Old Church Slavonic) 190-5
	<i>Icelandic (old)</i>		
hreinn	"reindeer" 195		
sunnu-hvélf	"sun's wheel" 272		
piorr	"steer" 192-3		
			<i>Sanskrit</i>
	<i>Indic</i>	bhraj	"to flash" 330
aghil	"aromatic wood" (Prakrit) 96	çṛṅgam	"horn" 195
veluriya	"beryl" (Pali) 333	çiraḥ	"head" 195
		ibha	"elephant" 338
		kalam	"pen" 331
	<i>Iranian</i>	kardamu	some spice 335
staora	"steer" (Avestan) 191	karpasa	"cotton" 339
*urda	"rose" 339	kurkuma	"turmeric" 93
Çušāyā	"Susa" (Old Persian) 331	kušta	"costus" 149-150
Karka	"Caria" (OP) 31	marakata	"emerald" 332
Sparta	"Sardes" (OP) 336	mela	"ink" 331
		naladas	"nard" 148-151
		pippali	"pepper" 335
	<i>Italian</i>	rajas	"darkness" 58
camicia	"shirt" 322	sāgarbhya	"maternal brother" 225
		str̥bhis	"stars" 339
	<i>Italic</i>	súraṣ cakrām	"wheel of the sun" 272
TAYPOM	"bull" (Oscan) 190-5	svādór...mádhvaḥ	"sweet mead" 139
toru, turup	"bull" (Iguvine) 152, 190-5	śrávo...ākṣitam	"undying fame" 11
uinu	"wine" (Iguvine) 137-141,152		<i>"Scythian"</i>
		οἰόπαρα	"rulers over men" 224
			<i>Spanish</i>
carw	"stag" (Gallic) 195	alcalde	"judge" 97
tarb	"bull" (Irish) 190-5		
Tarvos	"bull-god" (Gallo-Latin) 190-5		<i>Sumerian</i>
		GADA	"linen" 205
	<i>Luvian (hieroglyphic)</i>	ḪAR	"liver" 185
tar-wa-na-s	"ruler" 65	SUDIN	"garment" 209
tuwarsa	"vine?" 156-8	Ziusudra	name of Gilgamesh 16
wa-ā-na-a-s	"wine" 138		
Mu-ka-so-so-n	"Mopsus?" 34		<i>Ugaritic</i>
		ʿrbnm	"pledges" 26
	<i>Mycenaean</i>	bmt	"back" 201
ka-da-mi-ja	"cardamom?" 335	dlt	"tablet" 52-3
		gl	"bowl" 196-8

gr ks	? 100	qnm	"reeds" 94
hbn	"ebony" 338	qm	"horn" 195
hrb	"sword" 78	ššmn	"sesame" 335
hrš	"gold" 301	lql	"sheqel" 307-8
iqnu	"lapis lazuli" 88	tr	"bull" 190-5
kd	" <i>cadus</i> , amphora" 143-5	yn	"wine" 137-141
ktn	"tunic" 205	ʿttrt	"Astarte" 339
lbnt	"bricks" 83	Ḥkpt	"Egypt?" 329
mn	"mina" 307-8	Krt	"Keret" 32
mr	"myrrh" 95	Ktr	"Kothar" 332
msk	"to mix" 142-3	Pndr	warrior 33
qbʿt	"cup" 166	Špn	"Mt Saphon" 100

Index 2: Texts Cited

2.1 Biblical

2.1.1 Hebrew Bible

Genesis
1,21 p. 103,132,278
1,27 p. 239
1,28 p. 55
2,8 p. 140
2,9 p. 55
2,25 p. 59
3,16 p. 233
3,19 p. 311
3,21 p. 207
3,24 p. 86
4,22 p. 84,175
6,14 p. 329
7,11 p. 108
8,4 p. 139
8,21 p. 186
8,22 p. 267
9,6 p. 5
9,24 p. 82
10,2 p. 82,175
10,4 p. 339
10,6-10 p. 83
10,13 p. 29
10,26-28 p. 210
11,3 p. 83
11,28 p. 97
13,14 p. 101
15,5 p. 314
15,9 p. 214
15,19 p. 37
21,32 p. 258
22,7 p. 216
22,17 p. 315
23,9 p. 244
25,20 p. 80
27,40 p. 283
28,19 p. 337
29,11 p. 224
31,50 p. 230
34,1-2 p. 227
35,22 p. 68
36,35 p. 273

37,3 p. 205
38,17-18 p. 75
48,11 p. 81
49,4 p. 68
49,5 p. 342

Exodus
2,22 p. 43
3,8 p. 140
4,25 p. 80
6,16-20 p. 68
14,2,9 p. 100
15,8 p. 104
15,20 p. 154
16,15 p. 210
17,14 p. 44
20,3 p. 262
20,4 p. 267
20,5 p. 310
21,37 p. 202
22,1-2 p. 4
22,26 p. 207
23,22 p. 263
24,5-8 p. 200, 260
24,10 p. 84,106,332
24,12 p. 44
25,8 p. 179
28,17-20 p. 87,332
30,23-24 p. 94
30,34-37 p. 150,213,331
32,4 p. 194
32,19 p. 259
32,24 p. 307
33,19 p. 231
34,29 p. 199
38,42-43 p. 205
39,10-13 p. 87
39,27 p. 205

Leviticus
1,9 p. 184
3,2 p. 203

3,9-16 p. 184-5
 4,10 p. 199
 7,8 p. 214
 7,15 p. 185
 8,13-15 p. 189
 9,18 p. 189
 11,37 p. 81
 16,3-4 p. 189
 19,34 p. 310
 21,11 p. 205
 22,20 p. 232
 23,40 p. 18
 25,8-17 p. 250
 26,19 p. 107
 26,29 p. 280
 26,31 p. 186

Numeri

1,3 p. 236
 5,21 p. 256
 7,3 p. 194
 9,18 p. 178
 15,10-11 p. 152
 19,2 p. 216
 22,41—23,1 p. 189,202
 23,24 p. 282
 25,7 p. 181
 26,59 p. 68
 27,8-11 p. 238
 30,3 p. 258
 33,7 p. 100
 36,3-9 p. 238

Deuteronomium

6,5 p. 265
 7,9 p. 231,260
 11,1 p. 258
 11,10-12 p. 22
 11,21 p. 268
 12,27 p. 203
 13,1 p. 261
 13,10 p. 266
 15,1-6 p. 250
 16,6 p. 58
 17,1 p. 194
 20,5-8 p. 236
 21,3 p. 216
 25,5-10 p. 238
 26,5 p. 18
 27,2 p. 26
 28,12 p. 249
 28,18 p. 278
 28,23-24 p. 107,280
 28,26 p. 280

28,27-33 p. 5,280
 28,48 p. 283
 28,51 p. 157
 28,53-57 p. 280
 29,11 p. 257
 29,13 p. 256
 30,15 p. 55
 30,19 p. 269
 31,10-11 p. 261
 31,16 p. 259
 32,14 p. 135
 32,38 p. 215
 33,17 p. 198

Josua

2,15 p. 243
 5,2-3 p. 80
 6,22-25 p. 243
 7,14 p. 235
 8,20 p. 159
 9,7 p. 201
 11,8 p. 42
 13,3 p. 334
 19,45 p. 330
 22,10 p. 201

Judices

1,8 p. 159
 1,12 p. 228
 1,19 p. 171
 4,3 p. 171
 5,8 p. 173
 6,25-26 p. 189
 6,33 p. 37
 7,16 p. 144
 7,25 p. 281
 9,4 p. 257
 9,9-13 p. 139-140
 11,34-40 p. 154,244,255
 11,40 p. 244
 13,2 p. 227
 13,14 p. 137
 14,11-18 p. 229,313
 15,1 p. 228
 16,1 p. 226
 16,3 p. 123
 16,5 p. 65
 16,30 p. 123
 19,29 p. 231,274
 20,16 p. 56
 20,27-8 p. 181
 21,5 p. 257
 21,21 p. 246

I Samuel
 1,3 p. 181
 2,1 p. 199
 2,8 p. 114
 2,13-14 p. 182,214
 2,20 p. 81
 2,23 p. 182
 9,12 p. 201
 9,22 p. 142
 10,1 p. 342
 10,3 p. 140
 10,5 p. 155
 11,7 p. 231,274
 13,19-20 p. 25-26
 14,3 p. 181
 14,50 p. 67
 15,22 p. 217
 17,5-7 p. 164
 17,21 p. 22
 17,38 p. 167
 17,44 p. 280
 18,6 p. 155
 18,25 p. 228
 19,24 p. 59
 22,20 p. 181
 25,43 p. 67
 31,10 p. 213

II Samuel
 1,19-24 p. 244
 1,26 p. 240
 3,3,7 p. 67
 3,29 p. 278
 3,35 p. 256
 5,8 p. 24
 6,5 p. 155
 6,13 p. 199
 6,15-23 p. 155
 6,20 p. 60
 7,6-9 p. 180
 8,3 p. 273
 8,18 p. 32,304
 11,15 p. 49
 12,8 p. 67
 12,11 p. 279
 13,18 p. 205,208
 14,25 p. 232
 15,16 p. 67
 15,18 p. 69
 15,32 p. 208
 16,22 p. 67-8
 17,25 p. 67
 19,36 p. 56
 20,3 p. 67

21,7 p. 257
 21,10 p. 282
 23,16 p. 340

I Reges
 1,4-5 p. 67
 1,18-19 p. 200
 1,39 p. 60
 1,50 p. 203
 1,53 p. 67
 2,22 p. 68
 2,27 p. 181
 3,4 p. 201
 5,9 p. 315
 7,14 p. 304
 7,15-21 p. 122
 7,23ff p. 123
 7,27-39 p. 87
 7,41-2 p. 147
 8,31 p. 257
 9,18 p. 19
 9,26 p. 7
 10,2 p. 96
 10,17 p. 308
 10,22 p. 44, 337
 11,1-3 p. 67-9
 12,28 p. 194
 12,31-32 p. 202
 17,1 p. 35
 18,27 p. 122
 18,28 p. 174
 21,8 p. 7,230
 21,19 p. 282
 21,24 p. 280
 22,11 p. 199
 22,38 p. 282

II Reges
 1,2 p. 219
 3,22 p. 313
 6,30-31 p. 272
 9,30 p. 241
 9,36 p. 282
 11,4 p. 30
 14,14 p. 76
 18,18 p. 52
 18,26 p. 7
 19,23 p. 101
 19,37 p. 309
 20,20 p. 24
 22,8 p. 50
 23,5 p. 213
 23,13 p. 213
 25,5 p. 97

25,10 p. 161

Isaiah

1,2 p. 270
 1,11 p. 217
 1,18 p. 312
 2,2-4 p. 172
 5,8 p. 250
 5,12 p. 255
 5,22 p. 143
 14,5 p. 276
 14,13 p. 101
 14,14 p. 203
 17,10 p. 246
 19,18 p. 7
 22,21 p. 205
 23,11 p. 123
 23,13 p. 131
 24,2 p. 318
 24,7-9 p. 154
 27,1 p. 79,103,128
 28,16 p. 306,343
 30,1 p. 258
 30,6 p. 340
 30,7 p. 103,133
 37,24 p. 101
 38,10 p. 124
 40,8 p. 10
 40,15 p. 145
 40,22 p. 88,110
 42,10 p. 271
 44,24 p. 108
 45,1 p. 60
 45,7 p. 55
 47,1-3 p. 247
 49,15 p. 231
 51,8 p. 73
 51,9-10 p. 103-4,126
 51,17,22 p. 167
 52,2 p. 247
 53,7 p. 218
 54,10 p. 247
 54,12 p. 88
 56,7 p. 162
 57,16 p. 4
 59,17 p. 168
 60,6 p. 211
 65,11 p. 143
 66,3 p. 188-9
 66,22-24 p. 271

Jeremiah

1,10 p. 162
 2,2 p. 231

2,12-13 p. 26,271

2,22 p. 241
 4,30 p. 241
 5,22 p. 128
 5,27 p. 341
 6,27-30 p. 307
 7,22 p. 217
 11,5 p. 3
 11,16 p. 60
 13,23 p. 320
 15,18 p. 279
 20,14 p. 312
 22,18 p. 41
 27 p. 283
 31,29 p. 156
 31,33 p. 53
 32,35 p. 202
 32,41 p. 265
 33,22 p. 315
 33,25-26 p. 268
 34,18 p. 215,274
 35,2 p. 142
 36,4-23 p. 47
 36,23 p. 52
 43,7 p. 333
 44,17 p. 213
 46,4 p. 164
 46,9 p. 30
 46,15 p. 334
 46,25 p. 329
 51,63-64 p. 275

Ezekiel

1,4 p. 101
 4,1 p. 84,112
 6,3-4 p. 202
 8,14 p. 244
 10,1 p. 86
 16,44 p. 318
 21,26 p. 185
 25,16 p. 32,69
 27,6 p. 342
 27,7 p. 178
 27,10-11 p. 29,165
 27,13 p. 175
 27,15 p. 197
 28,12-16 p. 86-7,122,158,332
 29,3 p. 104,133
 32,2 p. 104,133
 34,3 p. 73
 34,26 p. 24
 36,1-2 p. 201
 37,26-27 p. 180
 38,2-3 p. 175

39,9 p. 176
 40,3 p. 94
 43,9 p. 178
 45,2 p. 339
 45,12 p. 308

Hosea

2,20-21 p. 231
 4,9 p. 318
 4,11 p. 157
 8,6 p. 194
 8,14 p. 159
 10,1 p. 137
 10,8 p. 202
 12,12 p. 189,199
 14,6-7 p. 60

Joel

4,10 p. 172

Amos

3,5 p. 342
 5,25 p. 217
 7,14 p. 342
 8,1 p. 342

Obadia

20 p. 336

Jona

1.3 p. 112,182

Micha

1,3 p. 203
 2,2 p. 250
 4,3 p. 172
 6,2 p. 269

Nahum

3,9 p. 29

Zephania

2,5 p. 32,69

Sacharia

2,14 p. 180
 6,10 p. 304
 7,2 p. 337
 9,3 p. 301
 13,9 p. 307

Maleachi

1,6 p. 234
 3,10 p. 108

Psalmi

8,4 p. 108
 8,7 p. 55
 18,3 p. 160, 199
 18,11 p. 85,272
 18,15 p. 104
 19,2 p. 108
 19,5-7 p. 111
 19,11 p. 313
 22,15 p. 274
 23,4 p. 58
 23,5 p. 60
 24,2 p. 113
 33,6 p. 47
 33,18 p. 272
 35,2 p. 168
 35,19 p. 218
 44,24 p. 122
 45,9 p. 71,96
 46 p. 160
 48,11 p. 244
 50,5 p. 260
 68,3 p. 274
 69,32 p. 189
 72,10 p. 338
 74,8 p. 161
 74,13-17 p. 103,126,133
 75,4 p. 114
 75,9 p. 143
 78,65 p. 122
 80,2 p. 86
 80,9 p. 137
 80,14 p. 135
 87 p. 162
 89,9-11 p. 103,126
 89,36-38 p. 268
 89,45 p. 276
 90,5-10 p. 57
 95,3 p. 10,55
 98,8 p. 272
 104,15 p. 139
 104,26 p. 103
 106,19-20 p. 194
 107,18 p. 123
 107,23-32 p. 102
 110,3 p. 111
 121,4 p. 121
 128,3 p. 60
 139,9 p. 112
 139,17-18 p. 315
 139,21 p. 263
 147,4 p. 315
 148,7 p. 103,133

- Job
 1,21 p. 58
 3,9 p. 111
 4,11 p. 340
 9,6 p. 114,126
 9,8 p. 203
 9,13 p. 126
 14,19 p. 320
 15,33 p. 156
 21,17 p. 293
 22,14 p. 110
 23,10 p. 307
 26,7-13 p. 103,114,118, 126
 30,18 p. 208
 31,10 p. 247,280
 32,19 p. 140
 34,17 p. 37
 38,8-11 p. 115,127-8
 38,17 p. 124
 41,16 p. 314
- Proverbia
 3,10 p. 157
 5,3-4 p. 314
 5,15 p. 296
 6,1 p. 293
 7-9 p. 233
 7,3 p. 53
 7,5-10 p. 233
 7,17 p. 71,96
 7,19-20 p. 248
 7,22 p. 200
 8,10 p. 303
 8,18 p. 298
 8,19-20 p. 73,308
 8,27-29 p. 112,128
 9,1 p. 117
 9,2-5 p. 143
 9,8-9 p. 292
 10,15 p. 292
 11,10 p. 298
 11,11 p. 293
 11,17 p. 293
 14,7-8 p. 292
 14,20 p. 293
 15,6 p. 292
 16,18 p. 294
 17,3 p. 303
 19,2 p. 56
 19,4 p. 293
 19,21 p. 295
 22,7 p. 249
 22,8 p. 317
 22,17—24,22 p. 5,291
- 23,4-5 p. 291
 23,27 p. 233
 23,30 p. 143
 25,23 p. 101
 26,17 p. 323
 27,1 p. 295
 30,17 p. 313
 30,30 p. 340
 31,19 p. 237
- Ruth
 1,16 p. 264
- Canticum
 1,12-14 p. 92,149
 3,4 p. 228
 4,7 p. 232
 4,13-14 p. 91
 5,1 p. 140
 5,3 p. 59,208
 5,8 p. 244
 5,11 p. 313
 7,3 p. 143
- Koheleth
 2,5 p. 96
 3,8 p. 160
 3,20 p. 311
 4,3 p. 312
 5,14 p. 324
 7,12 p. 298
 8,15 p. 324
 9,4 p. 57
 9,15 p. 293
 11,1 p. 321
 11,7 p. 56
 12,6 p. 147
- Threni
 2,8-9 p. 160
 3,63 p. 343
 4,7-8 p. 312
 5,11-12 p. 247
- Esther
 1,6 p. 339
 2,3.8 p. 34
 2,12 p. 95
- Daniel
 2,4 p. 97
 2,26 p. 97
 2,32-33 p. 302

5,25-26 p. 50
12,3 p. 108

Ezra

2,69 p. 308
4,9 p. 34

Nehemia

2,8 p. 96
4,7 p. 173
4,16-18 p. 161
5,13 p. 272

10,30 p. 256
13,16 p. 129

I Chronica

1,7 p. 339
2,16 p. 67
21,29 p. 203

II Chronica

2,13 p. 304
15,13-15 p. 262
31,5 p. 157

2.1.2: Septuagint

Dan 3,46 p. 279
Gen 2,8 p. 140
II Esdr 14,7 p. 173
21,35 p. 30
Esther 1,6 p. 339
Job 4,11 Aquila p. 340
Jud 6,38 p. 343
Judith 15,12 p. 158
16,20 p. 154
I Makk 3,3 p. 167
5,13 p. 40
8,26-27 p. 258,266
11,34 p. 30
II Makk 1,36 p. 279
4,12 p. 246
6,7 p. 157,186
10,7 p. 157
III Makk 4,6 p. 89
5,51 p. 124

Prov 9,18c p. 296
Ps Sol 16,2 p. 124
Sap Sol 5,17-20 p. 168-9
8,7 p. 237
13,14 p. 241
15,9 p. 304
16,13 p. 124
Sirach 1,2 p. 316
10,14 p. 277
14,25 p. 179
20,18 p. 318
26,7 p. 336
51,26 p. 283
Susanna p. 331
Tobit 1,15 p. 341
1,21-22 p. 309
4,15 p. 310
7,10 p. 324

2.1.3 Targum

Gen 6,14 p. 329
11,3 p. 84
Ex 28,20 p. 333
28,40 p. 166
30,23 p. 95

Jud 6,38 p. 343
16,5 p. 65
Ez 44,18 p. 166
Obad 20 p. 337
Cant 2,1 p. 339

2.1.4 Apocrypha

Agrapha (Greek) p. 75
Baruch (Syr.) 29,4 p. 126
Enoch (Aram.) p. 16,151
Enoch (Eth.) 60,7-9.24 p. 126

IV Esdras (Latin) 6,52 p. 126
Sirach (Heb.) 11,28 p. 341
14,25 p. 179
Tobit (Aram.) 1,21-22 p. 309,341

2.1.5 New Testament

- Matt**
 2,11 p. 212
 3,9 p. 83
 4,10 p. 262
 5,14 p. 24
 5,21-48 p. 252
 5,34-5 p. 270
 5,40 p. 207
 6,12 p. 250
 6,19 p. 74
 6,34 p. 295
 8,19 p. 264
 9,17 p. 140
 10,25 p. 220
 10,30 p. 316
 11,29-30 p. 283
 12,24 p. 219
 16,18 p. 124
 17,27 p. 304
 18,6 p. 275
 19,24 p. 338
 21,31 p. 248
 23,23 p. 336
 24,28 p. 281
 25,27 p. 75
- Mark**
 3,22 p. 219-220
 6,48 p. 341
 9,3 p. 312
 9,47 p. 321
 10,44 p. 249
 11,17 p. 162
 12,16 p. 299
 12,17 p. 263
 12,30 p. 265
 14,3 p. 95,151
 14,9 p. 11
 14,21 p. 312
 14,63 p. 208
 15,46 p. 209
- Luk**
 1,38 p. 249
 1,52 p. 277
 1,69 p. 199
 2,35 p. 174,177
 6,29 p. 206
 7,37 p. 151
 7,47 p. 248
 8,2 p. 248
 11,1 p. 336
- 11,15 p. 219
 11,22 p. 169
 12,19 p. 324
 14,26 p. 265
 16,9 p. 180
 22,19 p. 218
 23,28 p. 244
- Joh**
 1,14 p. 180
 1,42 p. 60
 4,25 p. 60
 6,31 p. 210
 11,16 p. 146
 12,3 p. 95,151
 13,36 p. 264
 15,5 p. 136
 15,25 p. 218
 19,12 p. 263
 19,15 p. 263
 19,23 p. 208
 19,25 p. 249
 19,34 p. 177
 19,39 p. 95-6
- Act**
 3,15 p. 120
 5,31 p. 120
 8,30 p. 48
 9,25 p. 243
 14,13 p. 194
 15,29 (D) p. 310
 18,3 p. 179
- Rom**
 8,17 p. 272
 8,22 p. 272
 10,12 p. 235
- I Kor**
 5,1 p. 69
 5,7 p. 218
 12,13 p. 235
 15,32 p. 324
- II Kor**
 1,22 p. 77
 3,1-3 p. 54
 5,3-4 p. 58,179
 5,5 p. 77
 10,4 p. 251
 11,33 p. 243

- Gal
3,24 p. 54
3,28 p. 235
5,1 p. 283
6,7 p. 317
- Eph
1,13-14 p. 77
5,22—6,5 p. 234,252
6,13-17 p. 169
- Phil
3,20 p. 162,207
- Kol
2,14 p. 218
3,11 p. 235
- I Thess
5,8 p. 169
- II Tim
2,3 p. 251
- Titus
1,12 p. 32
- Heb
10,12 p. 218
11,9 p. 180
13,12-14 p. 162
- James
5,2-3 p. 74,305
- I Peter
2,9 p. 207
- II Peter
2,13 p. 232
- II Joh
12 p. 54
- III Joh
13 p. 54
- Rev
4,3 p. 89
5,6 p. 27
5,9 p. 218
7,9 p. 207
8,3 p. 213
9,4 p. 77
12,3 p. 126
12,9 p. 13
13,1 p. 126
13,6 p. 180
14,4 p. 264
20,8 p. 316
21,3 p. 180
21,12 p. 343
21,16 p. 339
22,18-19 p. 343

2.2 West-Semitic

2.2.1 West-Semitic Inscriptions

- Abydos, graffito (KAI 49) p. 152
Aleppo, Bar-Hadad (KAI 201) p. 120
Asshur, ostracon (KAI 233) p. 341
- Beth-Alpha, Zodiac mosaic p. 146
Byblos, Abibaal (KAI 5) p. 7
Ahiram (KAI 1) p. 276,334
Hasdrubal (KAI 3) p. 330
tax p. 88
- Carthage, Eshmun (CIS 1.4834-6) p. 160,
332
funerary (KAI 90) p. 121
sacrific. (KAI 76) p. 213
tariff (KAI 74) p. 214
- Cilicia, vineyard p. 135
- CIS 1.41, Baalmarphe p. 49
Cyprus (Bonnet 333) p. 121
- Diban, Mesha (KAI 181) p. 45,202
- Egypt, Nabataean (BASOR 269) p. 333
Eretria, Hazael p. 39
- Gades, gold ring (KAI 71) p. 119
tuna-coins (Head 3) p. 118-9
- Gezer, Calendar (KAI 182) p. 7
- Hammath Tiberias, Zodiac p. 145
Hierapolis, Kybebe (KAI 278) p. 329
- Jerusalem, Siloam (KAI 189) p. 24

- Karatepe (KAI 26) p. 157,227, 268
 Kition, Abdosir (KAI 35) p. 334
- Lachish, ostracon (KAI 193) p. 52
 Larnax, Melqarth p. 167
 Libya, Ammon (KAI 118) p. 329
 Limassol, Lebanon (KAI 31) p. 210, 334
- Malta, pillars (KAI 47) p. 7,120, 333
 Marseilles, tariff (KAI 69) p. 101, 214
 Memphis, Isis (KAI 48) p. 333
 Osiris (KAI 268) p. 334
 Nabataea, Obodas (Cooke 95) p. 43
 Nora of Sardinia (KAI 45) p. 176
 Numidia, Micipsa (KAI 161) p. 121
- Palestine, coin p. 87
 Palmyra, gymnasium p. 121
 Sept. Worod p. 339
 tessera p. 195
 Piraeus, Sidon (KAI 60) p. 77, 301
 Pyrgi, gold (KAI 277) p. 121,316
- Rhodes (KAI 44) p. 121
- Samaria, ostracon (KAI 185) p. 140
 Sardes, bilingual (KAI 260) p. 336
 Sardinia, Cagliari (KAI 64) p. 42
 Carth. (KAI 68) p. 119, 334
 trilingual (KAI 66) p. 36
 Seville, Astarte p. 119
 Sfire, ostracon (KAI 227) p. 337
 treaty (KAI 222) p. 73,191, 259,260,
 269,273, 274
 Sidon, Bodashtart (KAI 16) p. 36
 Eshmun (KAI 15) p. 7
 Eshmunazar (KAI 14) p. 42, 45,182
- Tarsus, coins (Head 730) p. 29
 Tell Fekherye, bilingual p. 39
 Tyre, Ashtoreth (KAI 17) p. 213
- Xanthos, trilingual p. 29
- Zenjirli, Aram. (KAI 216) p. 42,45
 Phoen. (KAI 24) p. 42,202,209,301

2.2.2 West-Semitic Papyrus

- Egypt, spices (KAI 51) p. 336
- Elephantine
- Cowley 10 p. 76
- 11 p. 334
- 18 p. 337
- 20 p. 205
- 27 p. 338
- 30 p. 338
- 42 p. 76
- 69 p. 334
- 72 p. 333
- Kraeling 4 p. 343
- 11 p. 76
- Saqqara, letter (KAI 50) p. 100

2.2.3 Rabbinic

- Midrash
- Mehilta i.190 p. 101
- ii.30, 35 p. 168
- ii.214 p. 319
- Tanhuma Pqwdy 4 p. 319
- Midrash Rabbah
- Gen. Rabbah I.4 p. 331
- XXVIII.6 p. 330
- XXX.9 p. 321
- Lam. Rabbah 1.7, 34 p. 322
- Num. Rabbah IV.8 p. 75
- Qoheleth Rabbah on 7,4 p. 322
- on 7,9.1 p. 322
- on 9,11 p. 341
- Ruth Rabbah on 3,13 p. 46
- Shir ha-Sh. Rabbah on 1,14 p. 322
- Mishna
- Avoth I.1 p. 161
- III.2 p. 179
- III.6 p. 283
- III.14 p. 162
- III.17 p. 49
- IV.20 p. 140
- IV.22 p. 311
- V.5 p. 219
- Baba Qamma IV.7 p. 192
- VII.1 p. 323
- Berakoth II.2 p. 283

- Bikk. III.3 p. 198
 Middoth III.4 p. 172
 III.8 p. 158
 Peah IV.1 p. 19
 Sanh. II.5 p. 205
 Shab. II.1 p. 331
 II.2 p. 279
 VI.5 p. 335
 Shev. II.7 p. 336
 X.3-4 p. 250
 Yoma III.4 p. 209
- Synagogue
 Alphabetic verse p. 46
- Talmud Babli
 Avoda Zara 39a p. 133
 Baba Bathra 24b p. 319
 164b p. 339
- Baba Mesiah 48b p. 77
 82b p. 145
 Baba Qamma 46b p. 323
 92a p. 136
 92b p. 316
 Berakoth 55a p. 47
 Gittin 56a p. 343
 Hullin 60b p. 321
 p. 133
 Kerethoth 6a p. 93,150
 Niddah 25a p. 207
 Pesahim 112a p. 317
 Sanhedrin 89b p. 325
 Shabb. 31a p. 310
 33b p. 248
 Taanith 21b p. 319
- Talmud Yerushalmi
 Kilayim 32b4 p. 209

2.2.4 West-Semitic Literary

- Ahiqar (Aram.) p. 42,208,309,341
 Ahiqar (Syriac) 54 p. 318
 Hymn of the Pearl (Syriac) p. 333
 Pseudo-Melito (Syriac) p. 245,332
- Qumran, Bellum V.6 p. 174
 VII.10 p. 207
 Qumran, Manual I.4 p. 263

2.3 Greek

2.3.1 Literary Greek

- Abydenus (FGH 685) frag. 3 p. 16
 Achilles Astron. *Eisagog.* 4 p. 108
 Achilles Tatius 1.1.2 p. 213
 2.2 p. 135
 3.6 p. 102
 Acta Cononis 4 p. 212
 Aelianus *de nat. anim.* 5.17 p. 219
 6.51 p. 16
 11.8 p. 219
 12.21 p. 16
 15.3 p. 132
 Aeschines 2.115 p. 256,265-6,278
 Aeschylus
 Agamemnon
 239 p. 93
 383 p. 201
 404 p. 174
 437-444 p. 300
 827-8 p. 282
 1291 p. 123
 1478 p. 283
 1593 p. 280
 Eumenides
 106 p. 283
 275 p. 53
 Persae
 45 p. 336
 149 p. 174
 424-426 p. 133
 504 p. 271
 842 p. 324
 1000 p. 178
 Prometheus Vincetus
 83 p. 57
 88-92 p. 271,315
 133 p. 174
 348-354 p. 80,124-5
 351-365 p. 102,125
 450-451 p. 83
 459-461 p. 51,84
 462-6 p. 84

- 495 p. 185
 547 p. 57
 560ff p. 247
 588 p. 247
 675 p. 247
 714-5 p. 174
 761-7 p. 277
 789 p. 53
 803-6 p. 86
 907-912 p. 277
 910 p. 85
 1091-3 p. 271
Septem
 43-44 p. 200
Suppl.
 317-324 p. 227
 Fragment 262 TrGF p. 79
 Aesopus (ed. Chambray)
 11 p. 320
 310 p. 244
 318 p. 325
 Alcaeus (PLF) frag. 50 p. 149
 342 p. 137
 357 p. 165
 360 p. 298
 Alexis frag. 16,12 Kock p. 314
 Anacreon (PMG) frag. 28 p. 144
 400 p. 207
 Andocides 1.20 p. 69
 1.97 p. 267
 Anthologia Palatina
 4.1.42 p. 92,151
 6.109.3 p. 341
 6.250 p. 149
 6.332 p. 99,133
 9.385 p. 46
 9.415 p. 241
 9.423 p. 84
 9.544.1 p. 333
 11.417 p. 313
 14.64 p. 228
 Antigonus Caryst. p. 133
 Antipater Sidon. p. 341
 Antiphanes (Kock) frag. 35 p. 149
 123 p. 74
 189 p. 241
 224 p. 146
 296 p. 270
 Antiphilus Byz. p. 149,241
 Apollodorus
 1.4.4 p. 112
 1.6.3 p. 80,102
 1.7.2-3 p. 22,82
 1.8.1 p. 137
 1.9.17 p. 226
 2.1.4 p. 181,227
 2.4.2 p. 79
 2.4.3 p. 181-2
 2.5.11 p. 118,125
 2.7.7 p. 66,188,209
 2.11.2 p. 227
 3.1.1 p. 195
 3.2.2 p. 226
 3.5.8 p. 227
 3.7.7 p. 33
 3.10.9 p. 230
 3.12.5 p. 226
 3.15.3 p. 182
Epit. 3.22 p. 216
 3.27 p. 279
 6.23 p. 208
 Apollonius Rhod. 1.638 p. 226
 2.184-8 p. 56,182
 1.1009-15 p. 176
 Appianus *Bell. Civ.* 2.145 p. 266
 5.9 p. 19
Iber. 2 p. 119
Ital. 9 p. 250
Punica 8.1.1 p. 329
 Aquila p. 219
 Aratus *Phaen.* 545-9 p. 143
 733 p. 197
 Archestratus p. 132
 Archilochus (IEG) frag. 4 p. 143
 19.1 p. 176
 205 p. 96
 216 p. 30
 Archimedes *Psamm.* p. 316
 Aristaeus Epicus p. 86
 Aristides 48 p. 218
 Aristophanes
Acharn. 524-8 p. 240
Aves 102 p. 44
 551-2 p. 84
 559-60 p. 84
 598-602 p. 148
 685-7 p. 57
 1133-43 p. 85
Equit. 1205 p. 316
Lys. 151 p. 44
 187 p. 258
 387-9 p. 154
 729-30 p. 73
 1185 p. 231
Nubes 907 p. 343
 998 p. 92

- Plutus* 146 p. 299
 961 p. 56
Ranae 112-6 p. 242
 720-8 p. 299
 736 p. 317
Vespae 96 p. 213
 frag. 412 OCT p. 343
 902a Kock p. 242
 Scholiast *Ranae* 736 p. 317
 Aristoteles
Ath. Pol. 4.2 p. 235
 23 p. 263,268,285
 [de mir.] 884a24-35 p. 128
 [de mundo] 399b4-7 p. 168
Eth. Nic. 1133a21 p. 299
Hist. anim. 490a34 p. 57
 502a19 p. 44
 521b21-25 p. 132
 547b15 p. 343
 557b3 p. 74
 571a8-23 p. 131
 602a25 p. 129
 607b31 p. 130
 614a10 p. 341
 630a18 p. 191
Meteor. 324a10 p. 19
Pol. 1252b5-1253a3 p. 235
 1259a12 p. 77
 1260a10 p. 234
 1261b33 p. 319
 1281a1 p. 235
 1297b16 p. 235
 1306b30 p. 246
 1321b39 p. 52
 1333a35 p. 160
 frag. 144 Rose p. 66
 Arrianus *Anab.* 1.11.6 p. 152,199
 2.5.2-4 p. 324
 6.22.5 p. 151
 6.26.3 p. 340
 7.20.2 p. 151
Epict. 2.10.3 p. 162
 3.24.34 p. 168
 4.1.86 p. 162
 6.26.3 p. 340
 Athenaeus
 1.4C p. 131
 3.94B p. 332
 3.116C p. 129
 5.195 p. 72
 5.201-2 p. 72,91,198,210
 5.208B p. 118
 6.253C p. 122
 7.297E p. 133
 7.301F p. 132
 7.302C p. 129
 7.315CD p. 130
 10.453C p. 46
 11.482E-83A p. 167
 12.529-530 p. 97,324
 13.569-573 p. 242-3
 14.651F p. 72
 15.688 p. 92,96
 Athenodorus FGH 74 frag. 1 p. 83
 Babrius 124.3 p. 341
 Bacchylides 18.52 p. 206
 frag. p. 305
 Berossus FGH 680 frag. 3.13 p. 16
 Callias Comicus p. 46
 Callimachus (Pfeiffer)
 frag. 191.26-8 p. 186
 384 p. 148
 Callisthenes p. 33
 Callixeinus Rhod. FGH 627 p. 72,
 91,198,210
 Celsus *see* Origenes
 Chronicon Paschale 385 p. 177
 Chrysostomus p. 78
 Clemens Alexandrinus
Protrept. 2.33 p. 219
 11.90 p. 169
Stromat. 1.28.177.2 p. 75
 1.69.4 p. 309
 5.20.3 p. 28
 5.46-49 p. 46
 7.31.1 p. 184
 Clemens Rom. *Ep.* 1.12 p. 243
 1.25.2-4 p. 212
 Comica adespota p. 201,228
 Comment. in Arist. Graeca p. 67
 Conon FGH 26 frag. 1.40 p. 181
 Constantinus Porph. *de cer.* 183 p. 46
 Corpus Paroem. Gr. p. 319,321,337
 Cratinus frag. 197 Kock p. 94
 Ctesias FGH 688 frag. 13.24 p. 34
 p. 27
 Cypria p. 216
 Damascius *de prim princ.* 124 p. 17
 p. 36
 Demochares FGH 75 frag. 2 p. 122
 Democritus FVS frag. 37 p. 179
 p. 309

Demosthenes

- 21.33 p. 167
 23.53 p. 69
 23.68 p. 214
 24.113 p. 4
 34.6 p. 304
 35.11 p. 249
 [59.122] p. 69,233
 Dinon FGH 690 frag. 27 p. 66
 Dio Cassius 53.27.2 p. 117
 Dio Chrysostom 33.47 p. 120
 Diodorus
 1.25.6 p. 16
 1.91.4 p. 81
 2.13.2 p. 27
 2.49.3 p. 151
 3.3.3-5 p. 28
 3.4.1 p. 28
 4.18.5 p. 127
 5.14 p. 176
 5.20.2 p. 119
 5.66.3 p. 83
 12.13.2 p. 51,260
 16.41.1 p. 34
 19.98 p. 96
 20.65.1 p. 179
 Diogenes Laertius 5.1.17 p. 325
 5.50 p. 309
 6.41 p. 321
 7.26 p. 318
 Dionysius Halic. 2.27.3 p. 53
 2.65.3 p. 339
 2.68.5 p. 339
 6.95 p. 265,268
 Dionysius Perieg. 63-8 p. 114
 Dioscurides 1.68.6 p. 210
 Dorion p. 130
 Dromo frag. 1.1 Kock p. 313
 Duris FGH 70 frag. 13 p. 122
 Empedocles FVS frag. 126 p. 207
 128 p. 188
 p. 107
 Ephorus FGH 70 frag. 119 p. 35
 129b p. 132
 Epicharmus frag. 54 Kaibel p. 148
 Epiphanius *Panar.* 15.2 p. 145
 Etymologium Magnum p. 167
 Eudemus Rhod. Wehrli fr. 150 p. 17
 Eupolemus FGH 723 frag. 2.34 p. 84,122,
 307
 Eupolis Kock frag. 77 p. 155
 359 p. 44

Euripides

- Bacchae* 59 p. 154
 100 p. 198
 118 p. 238
 141-5 p. 140
 706-11 p. 156
Cyclops 63-7 p. 153
Electra 465 p. 272
Helen 582 p. 199
 1235 p. 259
Herc. Furens 394-9 p. 125
 601-2 p. 200
Hipp. 1311-12 p. 49
Ion 1-2 p. 113
 190-2 p. 79
 806 p. 179
Iph. Aul. 98 p. 53
 676 p. 217
 1397 p. 218
 1400-1 p. 234
 1483-5 p. 218
Phoinix p. 66
Supp. 1196,1202 p. 260
 frag. 578 Nauck p. 50
 980 Nauck p. 310
 Eusebius
 See also Philo Byblius
Pr. Ev. 3.11.46 p. 334
 9.34.15-19 p. 122,307
 10.5.10 p. 44,46
 Eustathius *ad Dion. Per.* 64 p. 118
ad Iliad. 5.586 p. 166
ad Odys. 1.50 p. 114
 Euthydemus p. 129
 Gorgias p. 281,317
 Hadrianus p. 193
 Hanno, *Periplus* 1 p. 115
 Hecataeus p. 174
 Heliodorus 10.30.4 p. 166
 Heraclitus allegor. 43 p. 109
 Heraclitus Eph. FVS frag. 44 p. 160
 90 p. 300
 Herodas 2.52 p. 43
 Herodianus 8.3.7 p. 185
 Herodotus
 1.1.3 p. 71
 1.2.1 p. 69,329
 1.2-4 p. 240
 1.6 p. 164

- 1.7.3 p. 30
 1.8 p. 175,207
 1.14.2 p. 175
 1.15 p. 303
 1.46.3 p. 329
 1.47.3 p. 315
 1.48 p. 48
 1.50 p. 303-4
 1.61.1-2 p. 229
 1.62 p. 133
 1.67-8 p. 170-1
 1.74.6 p. 282
 1.84.1 p. 336
 1.84.3 p. 70
 1.93 p. 43,176
 1.101 p. 343
 1.105.1 p. 170
 1.131 p. 42,108
 1.145 p. 22
 1.163 p. 125,148,176
 1.165 p. 263,268
 1.167.3 p. 138
 1.170 p. 77,176
 1.173 p. 224
 1.178 p. 339
 1.179 p. 83
 1.181.5 p. 97
 1.183 p. 213
 1.188.1 p. 331
 1.192.2 p. 43
 1.193.2 p. 329

 2.9.2 p. 338
 2.11 p. 110
 2.13 p. 22,44
 2.25.2 p. 30
 2.28.2 p. 337
 2.38-41 p. 211,215
 2.42.5 p. 329
 2.44.2 p. 122,332
 2.49.3 p. 37
 2.51.2 p. 36
 2.59.2 p. 333
 2.86 p. 81,144,209,211,241
 2.91.2 p. 227
 2.94.1 p. 331
 2.99.4 p. 329
 2.105 p. 176
 2.141.2 p. 341
 2.144.2 p. 102,333
 2.154 p. 30,334
 2.156 p. 102-3,334
 2.157 p. 40
 2.158 p. 99,329

 3.5 p. 102
 3.19 p. 334
 3.20.1 p. 144
 3.41 p. 303
 3.91 p. 31
 3.97 p. 197
 3.107-112 p. 71-2,95,331
 3.117.4 p. 336
 3.128 p. 49

 4.8 p. 116,125
 4.13 p. 36
 4.36.2 p. 110
 4.70 p. 260
 4.74-5 p. 331
 4.110 p. 224
 4.147.4 p. 37
 4.152 p. 125
 4.162.5 p. 237
 4.184 p. 113
 4.195 p. 300
 4.201.2 p. 269

 5.12.4 p. 238
 5.30.4 p. 148
 5.49.1 p. 110
 5.57.1 p. 35
 5.58-59 p. 37,44
 5.87.3 p. 206
 5.92b3 p. 44
 5.102.1 p. 328

 6.12.4 p. 178
 6.47 p. 36
 6.76.2 p. 199
 6.119 p. 147
 6.138 p. 171,226

 7.39.3 p. 215
 7.78 p. 174
 7.79 p. 139
 7.89.1 p. 170
 7.91 p. 30
 7.94 p. 82
 7.98 p. 41-2,330,334
 7.100.2 p. 178
 7.119.3 p. 178
 7.126 p. 197
 7.129.4 p. 127

 8.40.1 p. 234
 8.55 p. 61
 8.120 p. 50
 8.135 p. 52
 8.143.2 p. 268

- 9.70.3 p. 178
9.80.1 p. 178
- Hesiodus
Opera
5-8 p. 114
109 p. 301
169 p. 312
235-244 p. 278
391-2 p. 58
493-4 p. 141
501 p. 141
535 p. 330
572 p. 137
573 p. 78
590 p. 337
686 p. 298
695-8 p. 224
702-3 p. 224
- Theogonia*
134 p. 82
161-2 p. 78
179-181 p. 78,80
215 p. 125
259 p. 232
287 p. 125
304-306 p. 80,103
427 p. 267
498 p. 397
507-510 p. 82
517-520 p. 113
540-557 p. 184
600 p. 224
749-750 p. 115,123
820-868 p. 80
859 p. 103
897 p. 85
986 p. 112-3
- Scutum*
104-5 p. 195
161,172 p. 340
Fragment M-W 138 p. 181
140 p. 195
157 p. 182
278 p. 33
286 p. 5,317
- Hesychius p. 35,117,145,166,191,226
Hippocrates *de gland.* i.494 p. 196
nat. mul. 34 p. 342
- Homerus
Ilias
1.4-5 p. 281
1.65-7 p. 186
1.233 p. 257
1.249 p. 313
1.317 p. 186
1.371 p. 206
1.436 p. 19
1.477 p. 339

2.124 p. 258
2.262 p. 206
2.402-422 p. 200
2.480-481 p. 192
2.502 p. 35
2.586 p. 226
2.783 p. 79
2.865 p. 176
2.867 p. 30

3.57 p. 208
3.73 p. 258
3.105-7 p. 257-9
3.189 p. 224
3.246-7 p. 139
3.253-7 p. 230
3.268-270 p. 143,258
3.276-280 p. 269
3.299-301 p. 273
3.330-338 p. 163
3.441 p. 230

4.48 p. 160
4.385 p. 37
4.391 p. 37

5.171-3 p. 33
5.268 p. 164
5.287 p. 56
5.370 p. 328
5.503-4 p. 106
5.585-586 p. 166
5.736 p. 206

6.146 p. 57
6.168-9 p. 49,224
6.192-3 p. 228
6.196-211 p. 225
6.291 p. 18
6.297 p. 160

7.2 p. 225
7.96 p. 279

7.135 p. 35
 7.411 p. 257
 7.467-471 p. 139

8.1 p. 71
 8.388 p. 167
 8.441 p. 201
 8.479-481 p. 82,125
 8.549 p. 186

9.219-220 p. 183
 9.381 p. 35
 9.413 p. 10
 9.452 p. 66
 9.[458-461] p. 66-8
 9.497-500 p. 186
 9.539-540 p. 135

10.292-4 p. 216
 10.437 p. 312

11.17-43 p. 163
 11.624-641 p. 142

13.356-7 p. 228

14.171 p. 96
 14.231 p. 121
 14.321 p. 69
 14.444 p. 232

15.36-38 p. 267
 15.187-193 p. 267,225
 15.275 p. 340
 15.463-4 p. 277
 15.478-482 p. 163
 15.535-538 p. 166

16.131-139 p. 164
 16.233 p. 170

17.424-5 p. 106

18.29 p. 40
 18.271 p. 281
 18.318-320 p. 340
 18.399 p. 109
 18.483 p. 267
 18.595-6 p. 206
 18.607-8 p. 109
 18.609-613 p. 164
 19.258-260 p. 269
 19.301 p. 244
 19.338 p. 244
 19.369-373 p. 164

20.227 p. 341
 20.391 p. 176

21.438 p. 106
 21.522-523 p. 159

22.41-3 p. 281
 22.66-70 p. 282
 22.429 p. 244
 22.441 p. 112
 22.448 p. 237
 22.500 p. 120

23.71 p. 123
 23.74 p. 123
 23.185-6 p. 282
 23.741 p. 109
 23.751 p. 307

24.454 p. 342
 24.527-8 p. 55
 24.722 p. 244

Scholiast on 8.479 p. 125
 24.192 p. 321

Odysseia

1.32-34 p. 56
 1.52-4 p. 113
 1.110 p. 142
 2.86 p. 232
 3.1-2 p. 111
 3.141 p. 32
 3.292 p. 32
 3.382-4 p. 216
 3.425 p. 304
 3.426 p. 197
 4.84 p. 18,32,80
 4.126 p. 35
 4.563 p. 112
 4.603 p. 332
 4.613 p. 109
 4.746 p. 139
 5.1-2 p. 111
 5.62 p. 237
 5.68-71 p. 141
 5.121 p. 112
 5.184-6 p. 267
 5.275 p. 111
 6.221 p. 59
 6.244-5 p. 224
 6.309 p. 139
 7.100 p. 201
 7.197-8 p. 238

- 8.312 p. 312
 8.390-391 p. 194
 9.81 p. 332
 9.97 p. 332
 9.110-111 p. 137
 9.208 p. 139
 9.222-223 p. 147
 9.391-3 p. 171
 11.315-6 p. 84
 11.489-491 p. 57
 11.521 p. 31
 11.571 p. 123
 12.81 p. 58
 13.181-187 p. 194,201
 14.202-3 p. 69
 14.211-2 p. 228
 14.257 p. 329
 14.288ff p. 69
 15.250 p. 112
 15.329 p. 107
 15.426 p. 330
 17.565 p. 107
 18.192 p. 96
 18.193 p. 332
 18.328-332 p. 141
 19.175-7 p. 31
 19.242 p. 206
 21.85 p. 57
 22.52-3 p. 228
 23.103 p. 314
 23.190 p. 60
 24.11-12 p. 123
 24.106 p. 28
- Hymni Homerici*
 2.207-9 p. 142
 2.217 p.283
 2.403 p. 140
 2.427 p. 331
 3.339 p. 85
 5.218-227 p. 112
 7 p. 137
 7.7-8 p. 171
 7.39-40 p. 156
 14.3 p. 154
- Iamblichus *Vit. Pyth.* 72 p. 209
 Ibycus PMG frag. 32 p. 16
 Ignatius *ad Eph.* 20.2 p. 16
 ad Polyc. 6.2 p. 169
 Isaacus 8.19 p. 243
- Josephus
 AJ 1.129 p. 97
 3.153 p. 209
 3.161 p. 208
 3.225 p. 184
 14.36-7 p. 158
 14.54 p. 81
 15.395 p. 158
 16.220 p. 43
 20.71 p. 339
 BJ 1.97 p. 247
 1.138 p. 96
 2.427 p. 250
 4.54 p. 330
 4.469 p. 92
 5.210 p. 158
 5.218 p. 150
 con. Ap. 116-8 p. 121-2
 Juba FGH 275 frag. 15 p. 155
 47 p. 197
 Julianus *Epist.* 58 p. 194
 Misopogon 361D p. 99
 Orat. 7.225B p. 156
- Laitus FGH 784 frag. 4 p. 332
 [Longinus] 3.2 p. 281
 Lucianus
 adv. indoct. 28 p. 320
 [*Amores*] 41 p. 241
 de dea Syria 6 p. 242
 19 p. 329
 50 p. 174
 de sacrif. 12-13 p. 183,203
 [*Demosth. enc.*] 40 p. 201
 Navig. 44 p. 85
 Rhet. praec. 17 p. 77
 Timon 8 p. 281
 Scholiast *Dial. Meret.* 2.1 p. 243
- Malalas 199 p. 99
 260 p. 87
 Marcus Diac. *Vita Porph.* 27 p. 1
 Maximus Planudes pp. 321-3
 Melanippides PMG 757 p. 72
 Meleager Gadar. p. 92,151
 Menander
 Dyscolus 451-3 p. 184
 842 p. 233
 Sentent. 87 p. 324
 109-110 p. 75
 554 p. 310
 frag. 538(K) p. 74

- Menander Eph. FGH 783
 frag. 1.117 p. 334
 1.118 p. 122
- Mimnermus IEG frag. 1.8 p. 56
 2 p. 57
 11a3 p. 315
 12 p. 111
- Neanthes FGH 84 frag. 9 p. 243
- Neophytus p. 335
- Nicander, *Alex.* 128 p. 167
Ther. 343-54 p. 16
- Nicolaus Dam. FGH 90 frag. 16 p. 34
- Nicolaus Rhet. Walz i.271 p. 35
- Nonnus 40.430 p. 120
- Oppianus *Hal.* 1.369 p. 132
- Origenes *ad Eph.* 1.14 p. 78
c. Cels. 5.49 p. 217
 6.42 p. 125
 7.30 p. 88
- Orphici p. 107
- Pausanias
 1.24.1 p. 191
 2.16.6 p. 24
 2.30.9 p. 35
 3.15.8 p. 142
 3.20.9 p. 215
 5.14.1 p. 219
 5.17.6 p. 11
 5.18.4 p. 118
 6.19.8 p. 125
 6.26.6 p. 331
 8.26.7 p. 219
 9.5.1 p. 37
 9.8.5 p. 35
 10.4.6 p. 121
 10.31.1 p. 191
- Periplus Mar. Rub.* 39 p. 332
 41 p. 339
 68 p. 151
- Pherecydes 78-80 p. 125
- Philemon (Kock) 44 p. 155
- Philo Alexandrinus
de agric. 130 p. 232
de mut.nom. 16 p. 97
Leg. ad Gaium 4 p. 97
Spec. Leg. 1.274-6 p. 213
 2.5 p. 270
- Philo Byblius (FHG 790)
 2.10.9 p. 100
 2.10.11 p. 84,332
- 2.10.14 p. 36
 2.10.16,23 p. 337
 2.10.27 p. 120
 2.10.38 p. 36
 2.10.43 p. 191
 4.10.50 p. 125
- Philostratus *Vit. Ap.* 2.20 p. 209
 5.5 p. 116
- Phocylides p. 329
- Pindarus
Isthmians
 1.20 p. 147
 2.11 p. 299
 8.36 p. 85
- Nemeans*
 3.20-24 p. 127
 4.69-70 p. 116,119
 4.82-85 p. 303
 6.1-4 p. 110
 11.36 p. 35
- Olympians*
 1.1 p. 22,303
 2.98 p. 315
 3.29 p. 198
 3.43-45 p. 116
 9.45-46 p. 83
 9.50-53 p. 104
 13.1 p. 212
 13.46 p. 315
 13.70 p. 88
- Pythians*
 1.15-20 p. 80,116,124
 2.93 p. 283
 3.15 p. 81
 4.167 p. 257
 4.191 p. 33
 8.95-6 p. 57
 10.27 p. 110
 10.67-8 p. 305
- Paeans*
 4.37-40 p. 123
- Fragments (Bowra³)
 107 p. 212
 114 p. 211
 209 p. 73
 240 p. 80
 271 p. 115
- Schol. *Nem.* 3.20-24 p. 128
Ol. 3.44 p. 116
- Pittacus p. 310
- Plato
 [*Alc. II*] 149D p. 186
Apol. 28E p. 162

- Crat.* 403B p. 59
 409E p. 63
Critias 119E p. 192,256
Euthyd. 285C p. 31
 294B p. 315
Euthyphro 6C p. 222
Gorgias 486C p. 306
Ion 530 B p. 48
Leges 628D p. 160
 684C p. 329
 753D p. 215
 758D p. 258
 782C p. 217
 847B p. 212
 881D p. 257
 933A p. 343
Phaedo 110CD p. 87-8,313,332
Phaedrus 274DE p. 245,334
 275A p. 53
 276BC p. 246,330
Philebus 38E p. 51
Protag. 339-346 p. 236
Respub. 359E p. 175
 413E p. 307
 415A p. 302
 427-434 p. 236-7
 452C p. 59
 616C p. 238
Symp. 179E p. 239
Theaet. 183C p. 299
Timaeus 22D p. 23
 Scholiast *Resp.* 563C p. 318
- Plutarchus**
Aem. Paull. 18 p. 174
 23.6 p. 32
Agis 13.3 p. 250
Artax. 26 p. 66
Brutus 5 p. 48
Cleomenes 10.6 p. 250
Demosth. 9.4 p. 270
Eumenes 12 p. 264,286
Galba 17 p. 76
Lycurgus 14-15 p. 59
 25 p. 142
Pelopidas 18 p. 240
Pericles 24.3 p. 240
Sulla 10.4 p. 276
 17 p. 191
Theseus 15 p. 191
 21 p. 203
 29 p. 182
- Moralia* 2D p. 320
 26F p. 66
 208E p. 319
 245E p. 208
 299B p. 195
 356C p. 102
 358A p. 102
 367D p. 102
 419B p. 245
 434D p. 33
 556E p. 310
 645B p. 330
 671D p. 158
 723F p. 60
 802D p. 323
 845B p. 270
- Polyaenus Strat.* 7.21.6 p. 179
- Polybius**
 3.22.3 p. 275
 3.24.12-13 p. 220
 3.25.6-9 p. 276
 3.26.1 p. 254,275
 5.66.1 p. 33
 5.70.6 p. 330
 6.23 p. 163
 6.31.10 p. 339
 7.9 p. 254,261,265,276,286
 10.32.11 p. 31
 12.5.6 p. 246
 30.20.8 p. 323
 30.26 p. 72
 34.7 p. 129
- Porphyrius de abst.* 2.20 p. 188,324
 2.26 p. 184
- Procopius Hist.* 8.2.24 p. 176
 8.22.23-5 p. 101
- Proverbia Byz.* p. 322-3
- Ptolemaeus Heph.* p. 144
- Quintus Smyrn.* 6.218 p. 79
- Sappho PLF frag.* 2 p. 212
 44 p. 70
 140a p. 41,208
- Scylax* 111 p. 119
 112 p. 148,178
- Scymnus* 162 p. 132
- Semonides IEG frag.* 36 p. 328
- Simonides PMG frag.* 37 p. 236
- Sophocles**
Aias
 944 p. 283
Antigone
 100-104 p. 111

- 332-375 p. 55
 966-976 p. 182
 1222 p. 209
Oedipus Col.
 425-6 p. 277
 700-1 p. 61
 952 p. 257
 1225-6 p. 311
 1767 p. 257
Oedipus Rex
 1 p. 37
 269-271 p. 278
 791,793 p. 68-9
 819-820 p. 255
 1077-8 p. 81
Philoctetes
 1324 p. 257
Trachiniai
 508 p. 198
 609-613 p. 188
 1224 p. 66
 Fragment TrGF 37 p. 336
 127 p. 167
 270 p. 171
 362 p. 16
 483 p. 197
 597 p. 53
 Sophron frag. 35 Kaibel p. 204
 Stephanus Byz. 23 p. 83
 391 p. 332
 557 p. 35
 Stesichorus PMG frag. 8 p. 111
 Strabo
 3.2.7 p. 129
 3.4.6 p. 334
 3.4.17 p. 176
 3.5.1 p. 125
 3.5.5-7 p. 117,119
 4.1.4 p. 134
 5.4.9 p. 124
 6.2.1 p. 131
 6.3.3 p. 246
 7.6.2 p. 131
 8.3.12 p. 86
 9.2.2 p. 35
 10.3.21 p. 37
 11.2.17 p. 174
 12.3.11-19 p. 131,174
 12.3.36 p. 70
 12.3.38-39 p. 24
 12.4.7 p. 339
 13.1.54 p. 74
 13.4.6 p. 80
 13.4.17 p. 138
 14.1.27 p. 33
 14.2.7 p. 79
 14.2.12 p. 330
 14.4.3 p. 33
 14.5.9 p. 324
 14.5.16-19 p. 33
 15.1.20 p. 209
 15.1.58 p. 139
 16.2.2 p. 36
 16.2.5 p. 99
 16.2.9 p. 134
 16.2.16 p. 94
 16.2.23 p. 123
 16.2.28 p. 182
 16.2.33 p. 100
 16.2.39 p. 309
 16.4.17 p. 241
 16.4.20 p. 333
 17.1.46 p. 70
 17.1.48 p. 338
 17.3.16 p. 131
 apud Joseph. p. 158
 Suda 1.509 p. 147
 3.39 p. 99
 Tatian, *Orat.* 16 p. 169
 Thallus FGH 276 frag. 2 p. 126
 Theocritus 2.28-29 p. 274
 2.73 p. 209
 5.58-59 p. 147
 12.36-37 p. 306
 15 p. 245
 15.16 p. 241
 15.149 p. 4
Epigr. 1.5 p. 203
 Theodoretus p. 78
 Theodoridas p. 129
 Theognis
 31-2 p. 292
 69-72 p. 292
 112 p. 292
 141-2 p. 295
 145-8 p. 308
 151-2 p. 294
 159-60 p. 295
 179 p. 292
 233-4 p. 293
 268 p. 292
 284 p. 293
 425-6 p. 311
 449-52 p. 305
 499-500 p. 303

- 573 p. 293
 621 p. 293
 697-8 p. 293
 743-52 p. 293
 753 p. 292
 824 p. 257
 959-62 p. 296
 1023-4 p. 283
 1157 p. 298
- Theophilus FGH 733 frag. 1 p. 122
 Theophilus *ad Autolyc.* 3.29 p. 126
- Theophrastus
Char. 6 p. 248
 21.7 p. 203
de lap. 23 p. 332
 45-47 p. 306
de odor. 27 p. 93,331
de pietate p. 184,188
Hist. Plant. 1.9.7 p. 342
 1.10.4 p. 74
 1.11.2 p. 335
 4.4.14 p. 95
 4.6.4 p. 129
 5.7.1 p. 330
 5.8.1 p. 96
 7.6.3 p. 95
 8.2.9 p. 191
 9.4.2 p. 210
 9.5.1-3 p. 72
 9.6.1 p. 96
 9.7.1 p. 210
 9.7.2-3 p. 150
 9.11.11 p. 74
 9.20.1 p. 335
- Theopompus FGH 115 frag. 38 p. 197
 109 p. 342
 314 p. 30
- Thucydides
 1.6.5-6 p. 58
 1.9.1 p. 230
 1.22.4 p. 11
- 1.100 p. 32
 2.40.4 p. 249
 2.45.2 p. 240
 3.75 p. 263,285
 3.114.3 p. 260,285
 4.50.2 p. 324
 5.14.4 p. 258
 5.18 p. 254,257,261,285
 5.23.4 p. 261
- Timaeus FGH 566 frag. 82 p. 336
 Timaeus Locr. p. 57
 Tragica adespota Nauck 485 p. 122
 Tyrtaeus IEG frag. 11.38 p. 163
- Xanthus Lyd. FGH 765 frag. 17 p. 33
 Xenophanes FVS frag. 27 p. 311
 p. 140
- Xenophon
Anab. 1.2.12 p. 225
 1.4.11 p. 329
 1.5.6 p. 307
 2.2.9 p. 199,214
 2.6.10 p. 258
 4.3--5.5 p. 174
 4.34.1 p. 97
 5.8.1 p. 148
 7.2.23 p. 197
Cyr. 1.2.8 p. 335
 6.4.2 p. 206
 8.3.11 p. 194
Econ. 4.11 p. 343
 10.1 p. 237
Hell. 2.2.20 p. 264,285
 2.2.23 p. 161
 3.4.19 p. 59
 6.3.6 p. 120
Mem. 2.1.21-8 p. 233
- Zeno Citiensis p. 318
 Zosimus 1.58 p. 245
 2.20 p. 188,334

2.3.2 Greek Inscriptions

- Acarmania, Aetolians p. 286
 Acharnae, ephebes (Tod 204) p. 285
 Arabia, Dusares (OGIS 770) p. 333
 Assos, oath (IGRR 4.251) p. 264
 Astypaleia, Rome p. 286
 Athens, Carthage (M-L 92) p. 285
 coinage p. 306
 Corcyra (Tod 127) p. 285
 crown (Tod 2.167) p. 301
 Keos (Tod 142) p. 285
 Nointel (M-L 33) p. 300
 Attica, sacred law (LSCG 18) p. 185
 Baitokaike, (IGLS 7.4028) p. 331
 Boeotia, Kabiros (IG 7.2457) p. 36

- Caria, epitaph p. 281
 Chersonesus, tax (IGRR 1.860) p. 248
 Chios, law (M-L 8) p. 285
 Commagene, Antiochus (OGIS 383) p. 212
 Corinth, Lawoptolemos vase p. 38
 Crete, Malla & Lyttos p. 286
 sacred law (LSCG 146) p. 190
 Spensithios (Kadmos 9) p. 51
 Cyprus, Tiberius p. 286
 Cyrene, Therans (M-L 5) p. 285

 Delos, Astarte p. 213
 Great Gods (OGIS 430) p. 36
 inventory (IG 11.2.45) p. 167
 Nikandre (LSAG 291) p. 45
 Tyrians (Durrbach 85) p. 120
 wells (BCH 76) p. 147
 Delphi, women (SIG³ 802) p. 59
 Didyma, Seleucus (OGIS 214) p. 72, 150
 Diocletian, Edict 34.52 p. 150
 Doric, sesame (IG 5.1.364) p. 336
 Dreros, ephebes (SIG³ 527) p. 285
 Dura, Zeus Betylos (SEG 7) p. 337

 Egypt, mercenaries (M-L 7) p. 338
 mines (E-J 232) p. 332
 Rosetta (OGIS 90) p. 28,334
 Ephesus, silver (LSAG 66.53) 43,308
 Epidaurus, Kasios (IG 4.1287) p. 101
 Eumenes, oath (OGIS 266) p. 286

 Gortyn, Code p. 52,138
 law (LSCG 146) p. 190

 Halicarnassus, law (M-L 32) p. 285

 Imbros, Titans (IG 12.8.74) p. 83
 Italy, epigram (IG 14.2241) p. 207

 Kamiros, grave? (IG 12.1.709) p. 141
 Kibyra and Rome (OGIS 762) p. 286

 Lindos, law (LSCGSup 88) p. 185

 Magnesia, gods (LSAM 33) p. 118
 law (LSAM 32) p. 194
 Malta, bilingual (KAI 47) p. 120
 Mausolus p. 285
 Mytilene (IG 12.2.96-7) p. 52

 Olbia, bond (SIG³ 495B) p. 76
 Olympia, treaty (M-L 17) p. 285

 Palmyra, Worodes (Inv. 1.9) p. 339
 Paphlagonia, oath (E-J 315) p. 286
 Pergamum, oath (OGIS 266) p. 286
 law (LSAM 12) p. 214
 Philadelphia (IGLS 21.29) p. 121
 Pompeii, alphabets (CIL 4) p. 40

 Samothrace, Great Gods p. 36
 Sardinia, trilingual (KAI 66) p. 36
 Seleucia, coins p. 99
 Smyrna (OGIS 229) p. 286
 Syene, Chnoum (OGIS 168) p. 338
 Syria, Zeus Bomos (IGLS 2.569) p. 202
 Syria, Zeus Madbachos (IGLS 2.465) p. 202

 Teos, decree (M-L 30) p. 52,259
 Thasos, port p. 306
 Thebes, jasper (IG 7.2420) p. 301
 Mantiklos p. 45
 Tralles, concubinage p. 70

 Xanthos, trilingual p. 29

2.3.3 Greek Papyri

- P. Cairo Zenon 59009 p. 92
 59069 p. 72,93,151
 59075 p. 40
 P. Fayum 91 p. 76
 P. Greci e latini 6.628 p. 72,95, 151
 P. Hibeh 1.54 p. 153
 P. magicae graecae 1.82 p. 328

 P. Oxyrhynchus 1.140 p. 76
 2.299 p. 76
 5.1275 p. 76
 10.1269 p. 204
 15.1800 p. 214,323
 17.2149 p. 204
 P. Tebtunis 1.104.19 p. 69
 Wilcken 67 p. 76

2.4 Latin

2.4.1 Literary Latin

- Adam Bremensis 4.38 p. 139
 Ammianus Marcellinus
 17.4.10 p. 28
 22.14.4 p. 99
 23.6.84 p. 59
 Antoninus Plac. p. 36
 Antonius apud Suet. p. 68
 Apuleius
 de deo Socrat. 5 p. 276
 Met. 7.16 p. 257
 Arnobius 1.36.5 p. 120
 7.1 p. 217
 Augustinus
 Conf. 6.3 p. 48
 de ciu. Dei 18.9 p. 226
 Augustus
 Epist. p. 89
 Res Gestae p. 40
 V.25 p. 262
 V.26 p. 338
 Aulus Gellius 1.21.4 p. 276
 4.3.3 p. 69
 10.15.19-25 p. 205
 15.30.7 p. 173
 17.2.21 p. 76-7
 Caesar *Bell. Gall.* 6.28 p. 193
 Capito apud Macrob. p. 215
 Carmen Zodiacum p. 335
 Cato frag. p. 331
 Catullus 7 p. 315
 63 p. 80,328
 72.4 p. 251
 80.2 p. 313
 109.6 p. 251
 Cicero
 Acad. 2.1 p. 53
 Arat. p. 145
 Attic. 13.23 p. 250
 Catil. 2.82 p. 206
 de div. 1.40 p. 106
 2.146 p. 325
 de domo sua 66 p. 250,259
 de fin. 4.56 p. 318
 de nat. deorum 2.93 p. 40
 de off. 1.35 p. 160
 1.37 p. 53
 1.77 p. 58
 de orat. 2.262 p. 317
 de leg. 1.61 p. 162
 Fam. 7.12.2 p. 276
 Orator 32 p. 313
 Philip. 1.6 p. 283
 4.13 p. 81
 11.37 p. 159
 pro Archia 4.6 p. 251
 pro Balbo 53 p. 268
 pro Flacco 65 p. 31
 Verr. 2.3.78 p. 248
 2.4.92 p. 121
 2.5.3 p. 206
 Claudianus 10.90-96 p. 89
 28.30-31 p. 86
 Clemens Rom., [Rec.] 10.24 p. 120
 Columella 3.12.5 p. 134
 Comici p. 319
 Dictys Cretensis 1.15 p. 215
Digesta 39.4.16.5-7 p. 150
 Diocletianus, *Edictum* 34.52 p. 150
 Ennius (Skutsch) 48 p. 106
 472 p. 329
 Erasmus, *Adagia* 1.4.50 p. 320
 1.8.78 p. 318
 2.3.95 p. 319
 3.4.96 p. 321
 4.5.63 p. 318
 Festus 81 p. 275
 85 p. 148
 102 p. 276
 310 p. 339
 Gaius 3.139 p. 77
 Grotius *de Iure Belli et Pacis*
 1.2.5.2 p. 5
 1.3.2.2 p. 4
 2.1.12.1 p. 4
 2.13.10-15 p. 254
 2.19.2.1-2 p. 311
 3.25.2 p. 160
 Hieronymus
 Comm. in Matt. 10.25 p. 220
 Epistulae 30.5-12 p. 46
 58.3 p. 245

- 64.11 p. 322
 128.2.3 p. 314
in Esaiam 2,4 p. 177
 59,17 p. 168
in Hieremiam 2,13 p. 26
 6,20 p. 211
 11,5 p. 3
 32,35 p. 202
in Hiezech. 8,14 p. 245
 27,7 p. 211
in Mic. 4,3 p. 177
Liber Interp. Heb. p. 220
- Horatius
Carm. 1.18.1 p. 137
 1.28.1-2 p. 316
 2.11.13-17 p. 149-151
 3.13.7 p. 313
 3.21.17-20 p. 199
 3.30.1-2 p. 11
 4.7.17-18 p. 295
 4.9.25-28 p. 11
 4.12.16-17 p. 149-151
 4.14.47-48 p. 116
Epist. 1.16.48 p. 281
Serm. 2.5.44 p. 132
- Isidorus *de diff.* 2.62 p. 18
- Iustinus, *Epitome*
 43.4.1-3 p. 60,134
 44.5.2 p. 119
- Iuuenalis 6.181 p. 96
 8.235 p. 208
 10.38 p. 206
 13.164-5 p. 106
 14.209 p. 47
- Jerome: *see* Hieronymus
- Lactantius *de opif. Dei* 17.6 p. 107
div. inst. 6.25.3 p. 217
- Liber Pontificalis* p. 150
- Lilius 1.24.4 p. 259
 1.24.8 p. 274
 1.32.10 p. 267
 1.43.2 p. 163
 1.44.2 p. 214
 2.33.4 p. 259
 8.8.19 p. 185
 21.45.8 p. 275
 22.57.6 p. 221
 23.33.9 p. 251,261
 26.33.8 p. 243
 26.47.1 p. 334
 31.39.11 p. 174
 40.6.1-2 p. 215
 42.40.3 p. 259
- Lucanus 3.217 p. 123
 3.228 p. 30
 10.434-5 p. 100
- Lucretius 1.90 p. 217
 2.618-620 p. 154
 2.999-1000 p. 311
 3.750-1 p. 196
 5.1286-94 p. 172
- Macrobius, *Sat.* 1.4.19 p. 4
 2.4.12 p. 89
 3.4.9 p. 37
 3.5.5 p. 216
 3.10.3-7 p. 215
- Maecenas *apud* Isid. p. 89
- Manilius 4.16 p. 311
- Martialis 1.43.8 p. 145
 4.19.12 p. 209
 9.37.6 p. 240
 10.51 p. 198
- Mela 3.46 p. 119
- Ovidius
Amores 3.11A.6 p. 199
Ars Amat. 1.59-60 p. 314
 1.475-6 p. 314
 3.239 p. 240
ex Ponto 2.5.37-8 p. 313
 3.8.15-16 p. 314
 4.10.5 p. 320
Fasti 1.186 p. 145
 1.699 p. 173
 2.171 p. 208
 4.898 p. 152
Heroides 16.251-2 p. 313
Metam. 1.74-7 p. 55
 1.91-2 p. 53
 1.99 p. 172
 1.111-1 p. 4,140
 1.414 p. 83
 2.80 p. 198
 3.194 p. 196
 3.258 p. 69
 8.294 p. 135
 8.666 p. 337
 10.189 p. 279
 10.347 p. 69
 10.654-5 p. 341
 10.737-9 p. 246

- 14.137 p. 316
 15.398-9 p. 72
Tristia 1.5.47-8 p. 315
 1.9.5-6 p. 294
 4.1.55-9 p. 315
- Petronius 31.2 p. 316
 38.13 p. 319
 43.7 p. 57,313
 45.8 p. 319
 58.4 p. 318
- Phaedrus 3.19.8 p. 321
 4.14.1 p. 340
- Plautus
 Amphitryon 429 p. 144
 Asin. 614 p. 314
 Cist. 37 p. 69
 542 p. 145
 Merc. 940 p. 40
 Miles Glor. 957-60 p. 75
 Per. 3 p. 314
 Poenulus 259 p. 144
 1359 p. 76
 Pseudolus 1021 p. 199
 Rudens 46 p. 76
 1319 p. 147
 Trin. 1154 p. 206
- Plinius junior
 Epist. 3.5 p. 48
 Paneg. 48.3 p. 283
- Plinius *Nat. Hist.*
 2.242 p. 120
 3.4 p. 127
 4.52 p. 101
 5.80 p. 99
 5.88 p. 19
 7.3 p. 55
 7.193 p. 27
 7.208 p. 167
 8.7 p. 197
 9.8 p. 116
 9.11 p. 182
 10.79 p. 219
 12.41-2 p. 150
 12.87-8 p. 94
 12.115 p. 81
 18.307 p. 144
 19.129 p. 156
 29.21 p. 75
 33.28 p. 76
 34.13 p. 117
 34.83 p. 304
- 34.139 p. 171
 36.38 p. 117
 37.4 p. 304
 37.14 p. 158
- Propertius 1.6.30-31 p. 251
 2.13.36 p. 251
 2.13.36 p. 333
 2.18C.31-32 p. 242
 3.20.15-16 p. 251
 4.7.9 p. 333
- Publilius Syrus "911" p. 317
- Quadrigarius 20 p. 76
- Quintilianus 1.1.24-27 p. 47
 1.4.9 p. 40
- Quintus Curtius 10.9.12 p. 215
- Sallustius *Cat.* 33 p. 250
Script. Hist. Aug. Hadr. 14.3 p. 99
- Seneca
 de prov. 3.12 p. 16
 Epistulae 14.5 p. 208
 88.37 p. 248
 96.5 p. 168
 108.28 p. 279
 110.1 p. 330
 Herc. Oet. 372-3 p. 279
 apud Lact. p. 217
- Seneca senior *Cont.* 10 p. 5
- Seruius *ad Aen.* 1.532 p. 138
 8.641 p. 275
 11.262 p. 117
- Silius 3.17-31 p. 119
 3.358 p. 176
 10.537-8 p. 123
 12.148 p. 82
- Solinus 5.6 p. 131
 27.10 p. 334
- Statius *Silu.* 3.2.140 p. 144
 Theb. 10.9.5 p. 82
- Suetonius
 Div. Aug. 77 p. 156
 86 p. 89
 88 p. 40
 Nero 22.3 p. 102
 Tib. 25.1 p. 323
 59.1 p. 302
- Tabulae XII p. 4
- Tacitus, *Ann.* 1.8 p. 261
 2.24 p. 116
 12.47 p. 283

- 12.63 p. 131
 15.44 p. 208
Germ. 17.2 p. 116
 34 p. 117
Hist. 2.81 p. 262
 5.5 p. 158
 5.6 p. 81
 Terentius, *Heaut.* 603 p. 76
Phormio 506-7 p. 323
 Tertullianus
ad nat. 2.8.5 p. 333
de praescr. haer. 7.9 p. 161
 [Thomas à Kempis]
de inuit. Chr. 1.19.2 p. 295
 Tibullus 1.1.75 p. 251
 1.3.80 p. 145
 1.7.26 p. 23
 1.10.1-2 p. 251
 Valerius Maximus 6.9.2 p. 283
 Varro *de ling. lat.* 5.100 p. 338
 apud Arnob. p. 217
 apud Augustin. p. 226
 apud Gell. p. 173
 apud Lact. p. 107
 Vegetius 3 prolog. p. 160
 3.34 p. 330
 Velleius Paterc. 1.2.3 p. 119
 2.23 p. 250
 Venantius Fort. 7.8.63 p. 78
 Vergilius
Aen. 1.7 p. 24
 1.12 p. 119
 1.195-6 p. 144
 1.366 p. 334
 1.416-7 p. 211
 1.532 p. 138
 3.669 p. 131
 4.261-2 p. 88
 4.493 p. 328
 4.6626 p. 159
 5.267 p. 167
 6.38 p. 216
 6.303 p. 167
 6.724-6 p. 4
 6.792-3 p. 302
 7.808-9 p. 341
 7.601-4 p. 47
 7.633-40 p. 172
 8.620-5 p. 165
 8.726 p. 165
 10.724-5 p. 196
 12.84 p. 312
Ecl. 1.3 p. 12
 3.89 p. 3
 8.80-81 p. 274
Georg. 1.56-7 p. 71
 1.132 p. 3
 1.216-7 p. 198
 1.278-80 p. 82
 1.299 p. 58
 1.433 p. 197
 1.447 p. 71, 111
 1.505-8 p. 173
 2.374 p. 193
 2.506 p. 329
 4.540 p. 216
 Vitruvius 1.4.9 p. 185
 6.7.6 p. 118

2.4.2 Latin inscriptions

- Ankara, Mon. Anc.: see Augustus
 Corcyra, Cas. (CIL 3.576-7) p. 101
 Dacia, wooden (CIL iii.2) p. 76
 Hedderheim, Cas. (CIL 13.7330) p. 101
 Lebanon, forest (IGLS 8.3) p. 130
 Lusitanians, oath (ILS 90) p. 286
 Paris, sailors (ILS 4613) p. 195
 Pompeii, alphabets (CIL 4) p. 40
 Rome, Arvales (AD 213) p. 194
 Rome, epitaph (CIL 6.7193a) p. 77
 Sardinia, trilingual (KAI 66) p. 36

2.5 *Treaties*

Citations (all in Chapter 8) of provisions from treaties and the like as numbered on pp. 284-286.

- | | |
|---|-------------------------------------|
| 01 (Hammurabi) p. 273,276,279 | 28 (Fetial) p. 274 |
| 02 (Yahdunlim) p. 277 | 29 (Halicarnassus) p. 259 |
| 03 (Hittite soldiers) p. 273,277 | 30 (Ionia) p. 263,268 |
| 04 (Hittite officers) p. 262 | 31 (Corcyra I) p. 263 |
| 05 (Kurtiwaza) p. 253,261,269 | 32 (Acarmanians) p. 260 |
| 06 (Tette) p. 263,265,269 | 33 (Nicias) p. 254,257,261 |
| 07 (Niqmad) p. 263 | 34 (Sparta I) p. 261 |
| 08 (Hukkanas) p. 262 | 36 (Sparta II) p. 264 |
| 09 (Mursilis) p. 269 | 37 (Corcyra II) p. 265 |
| 13 (Ahiram) p. 276 | 38 (Keos) p. 256 |
| 14 (Shamshi-Adad) p. 276 | 39 (Maussolus) p. 270 |
| 15 (Mati-il) p. 265,280 | 40 (Plataea) p. 253,277 |
| 16 (Sfire) p. 259-260,269,273-4 | 42 (Eumenes/Antigonus) p. 264 |
| 17 (Esarhaddon) p. 253,262,266,272, 277,
279,280 | 43 (Aetolians) p. 260 |
| 18 (Baal) p. 255,279 | 44 (Eumenes, soldiers) p. 266 |
| 19 (Delphi) p. 256,265,266,277 | 45 (Smyrna/Magnesia) p. 253,265 |
| 20 (Ephebes) p. 253,270 | 46 (Malla/Lyttos) p. 261 |
| 21 (Dreiros) p. 266,270 | 47 (Hannibal) p. 254,261,265,270 |
| 22 (Therans) p. 262,273 | 49 (Rome & Jews) p. 258,266 |
| 23 (Chios) p. 259 | 50 (Astypaleia) p. 256,261 |
| 25 (Rome/Carthage) p. 254,276 | 51 (Caesar's party) p. 266 |
| 26 (Elis/Heraea) p. 259 | 52 (Paphlagonians) p. 253,264-5,277 |
| 27 (Latin cities) p. 261,265,268 | 53 (Cypriotes/Tiberius) p. 262,264 |
| | 54 (Lusitanians/Caligula) p. 264-5 |

2.6 *Other Languages*

For texts in languages not listed here, see under their vocabulary in Index 1.4.

- | | |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| <i>Akkadian</i> | <i>Arabic</i> |
| Adad-text p. 195 | Ibn Manẓur 138,196 |
| Amarna 19 p. 84 | Quran 6.7 p. 330 |
| 22 p. 87 | 7.40 p. 338 |
| 25 p. 197 | 12.28 p. 322 |
| 73 p. 329 | 20.72 p. 97 |
| 74 p. 341 | 96.4 p. 331 |
| 84 p. 329 | 108 p. 332 |
| 151 p. 227 | Thousand and One Nights p. 336 |
| Assurbanipal p. 30,175,256 | |
| Enuma Elish p. 17,127 | <i>Cypriote</i> |
| Esarhaddon p. 5,107,120,209 | Syllabary p. 52,144,227 |
| Gilgamesh p. 16,186,329,340 | |
| Letters p. 331 | <i>Egyptian</i> |
| New Year's Ceremony p. 88 | Amen-Em-Opet p. 5,291-2 |
| Sargon II p. 175 | Anksheshonqy p. 310 |
| Sennacherib p. 342 | Bohairic p. 247,331 |
| Tiglath-Pileser III p. 100,332 | Rosetta (Demotic) p. 334 |
| Vassal Treaties p. 280 | Wen-Amon p. 33 |

English

- Alfred (King) p. 317
 Arnold, Matthew p. 2
 Bacon p. 320
 Beowulf 92 p. 13
 107-8 p. 13
 1368-9 p. 196
 2088 p. 13
 Bunyan p. 320
 Byron p. 226
 Carroll p. 87
 Chaucer p. 294,323
 Conan Doyle p. 281
 DeQuincey p. 228
 Dylan, Bob p. 153
 Eliot, T. S. p. 161,209
 Franklin p. 298
 Gower p. 160
 Housman p. 299
 Hymns (Surtees) p. 272
 Joyce p. 186
 Lincoln p. 51,57
 Loneragan p. 188,326
 Milton, *Comus* 998-91 p. 150
 Par. Lost 1.394-5 p. 154
 1.446-53 p. 244
 1.508 p. 82
 2.943-7 p. 86
 4.257-60 p. 158
 4.716-7 p. 82
 Mysteries p. 139
 Pope p. 49,240,341
 Purchas p. 295
 Runes p. 193
 Shakespeare
 Sonnet 55 p. 11
 Hamlet I.v p. 53
 Macbeth V.i p. 72
 V.v p. 269
 Richard III V.ii p. 136
 Troilus III.ii p. 320
 Tennyson p. 117
 Watts p. 57
 Webster p. 322

Etruscan

- TLE ix.6 p. 152
 128 p. 225
 754 p. 65
 755 p. 191

French

- Renan p. 248

German

- Goethe p. 88,321
 Niebelungenlied p. 192
 Wagner p. 260

Hittite

- Military ritual p. 284
 Myths p. 103
 Other p. 34
 Papanikri p. 166
 Treaties p. 230

Italian

- Dante p. 72,117
 Proverb p. 322

Italic

- Uguvine p. 137-141,152,192
 Oscan p. 40,194

Lemnian p. 171*Mycenaean*

- DMG² 52 p. 304
 105-7 p. 335
 222 p. 204
 243 p. 340
 244 p. 304
 246 p. 340

Sanskrit

- Atharva Veda 6.1025-6 p. 149
 Rig Veda 1.84 p. 139
 6.56.3 p. 371

Sumerian

- Proverb p. 316

Ugaritic

- KTU 1.1 p. 100
 1.3 p. 79,143
 1.4 p. 84,88,201
 1.5 p. 79,126,143
 1.6 p. 220,332
 1.12 p. 198
 1.14 p. 147
 1.17 p. 94,329,332
 1.18 p. 197
 1.19 p. 143,166
 1.39 p. 101
 1.46 p. 101
 3.1 p. 205,308
 4.14 p. 95,145,336
 4.68 p. 100

4.132 p. 204
4.269 p. 144

5.7 p. 52

Index 3: Objects Described

- Achilles' shield: reconstructions 109
Acragas, Zeus temple: Atlantes 118
Aleppo: Melqarth stele 120
Anchors: dedic. to Zeus Kasios 102
stone trapezoids 19
Arabia: Sabaeen incense-altar 331
Athens: base owls p. 299
Athens, black-figured vases:
Dionysus on ship (Exekias) 137
olive harvest & press 60
triple sacrifice 214
Athens: Erechtheum, Caryatids 113
Athens: "Nointel Marble" 300
Athens, red-figured vases:
Dawn & Tithonus 112
Maenads with sickle 79
Thetis, Achilles' shield 105
Athens: spring in citadel 24
Athens, theatre of Dionysus:
Griffin throne 87
- Babylon: clay liver 185
Behistun: relief of Darius 27
Beth-Alpha synagogue:
Zodiacal mosaic 145
Blake, William: God & compasses 112
Byblos: Ahiram sarcophagus 87
- Campania: vase of tunny-merchant 125
Carthage: stelai of sacrifice 179
Çatal Hüyük: bull fresco 192
room of horns 197
vulture & corpses 281
Cnossus: bull-leaping fresco 192
bull's-head vase 198
throne-room, griffins 87
Crete: bronze armor 51
Cumae: ivory alphabet tablet 39
Cyzicus: tuna staters 131
- Delos: Nikandre Kore 45
- Egypt: Rosetta Stone 28,334
Enkomi: griffins, bronze laver 87
Ephesus: silver plaque 308
Etruria: bronze liver model 185
Minotaur mirror 191
- Etrusco-Corinthian vase:
vultures over corpse 282
- Gades: coins with tuna 118
- Haghia Triadha: horned table on
sarcophagus 203
Hammath Tiberias:
Zodiacal mosaic 145
Heddernheim: Mithras & bull 335
- Ida cave, Crete: bronze shields 109
- Jerusalem: Siloam tunnel 24
- Kells, Book of 47
- Laconian vase: Atlas, Prometheus 125
Lascaux: bull frescos 192
- Malta: inscribed pillars 120
Megiddo: horned incense altar 203
Modena: Aion with Zodiac 335
Mycenae: spring & cistern 24
- Naples: "Atlas Farnese" 335
Nineveh: relief of vultures and slain 282
- Olympia: griffin protomai 86
Temple of Zeus; Atlas & Heracles 118
- Palestine: coin of god & wheel 87
Hebrew alphabet 39
Paris, Notre-Dame: Tarvos relief 195
Petronius: MS of *Cena* 317
Phoenician ceramic: tambourinist 153
Pompeii: alphabet graffiti 40
fresco, Achilles' shield 109
fresco, erotic 242
tympanum with rattles 153
Praeneste: silver patera 109
Pyrgi: gold lamellae 316
- Rembrandt: woman in adultery 248
Rome: Ara Pacis Augustae 203
Pantheon 117
Prima Porta, Augustus 170

- Russia, "Sauromatae"
 Graves of female warriors, 224
- Sardis: goldsmiths' area 304
- Seals with griffins 85
- Seleucia: Coins, Zeus Kasios 99
- Seville: seated Astarte 119
- Shipwrecks 144
- Siberia, frozen tombs:
 charred hemp-seeds 331
- Sidon: Eshmunazar sarcophagus 45
 Temple of Eshmun 36
- Spanish colonial 8 Reales 117
- Sumeria: vulture stele 281
- Tarquinia: frescos of banquets 225
- Tell Asmar (Iraq): cylinder seal, dragon with
 seven heads 126
- Thebes: cylinder-seals 35,62
 Mantiklos statuette 45
- Touchstone(?), inscribed 305
- Trapani, tonnara:
 photo by Salgado 131
- Troy: layer of tunny-bones 131
- Ugarit: alphabets 39
 golden bowl of hunt 109,192
- Vases, Greek: athletes 59
 tuna for sacrifice 133
- Vinland map 139
- Zagros, Shanidar cave:
 sickle of flints 81
- Zeeland: coins with motto 295

Index 4: Modern Scholars

Editors of inscriptions, texts, dictionaries and collective volumes are normally omitted.

- Achtemeier, Paul J. 48
Albright, William F. 98,101,292
Arnayor, O. Kimball 18
Arnhem, M. T. W. 297
Aspesi, F. 204
Astour, Michael C. 6,35,49,227
Atallah, W. 136
Aubet, Maria Eugenia 109
Auerbach, Erich 3
Austin, M. M. 6,305
- Bachofen, J.J. 224
Ballabriga, Alain 98
Balogh, Josef 48
Baltzer, Klaus 287
Barré, Michael L. 270,287
Baumgartner, W. 242
Beekes, R. S. P. 138
Bernal, Martin 6,24,58
Bethemont, Jacques 23
Bevan, A. 333
Bezenberger, A. 191
Bickerman, Elias 215,254,274,287
Biernacka-Lubanska, M. 24
Bisi, Anna Maria 85,87
Blomqvist, Jerker 115
Boardman, John 31,60
Bolton, J. D. P. 86,110
Boman, Thorleif 2
Bomhard, Allan R. 196,301
Bonnet, Corinne 98,119,121,221
Bowra, C. M. 110-111
Brendel, Otto J. 282
Brenner, Athalya 95,312
Breton, Jean-F. 130
Brinkman, J. A. 35
Briquel-Chatonnet, F. 7,87,121,260
Brown, John P. 9,18,166,169
Bryce, T. R. 225
Buck, C. D. 227
Bühler, Winfried 195
Burford, Alison 304
Bürkert, Walter 2,5,17-8,142,183-190,213,
267
- Carcopino, J. 240
Carey, Christopher 233
Carruba, O. 225
Casabona, Jean 187,215,259-60,287
Casson, Lionel 1,19,148,242,332
Cataudella, M. R. 117
Cerri, G. 297
Charlesworth, J. H. 126
Christensen, D. 164
Chuvin, Pierre 98
Cole, Susan Guettel 36
Crawford, Timothy G. 254,274,287
Crenshaw, J. L. 292,298
Crouch, Dora P. 24
Crowley, Janice L. 85
Cuny, A. 301
- Daube, David 311
David, T. 224
de Saignac, J. 98
de Vaux, R. 86-7, 186,238
Deissmann, Adolf 60
Delcor, Mathias 32,138,156,271,287
Delehay, H. 335
Detienne, Marcel 60,91,133,190,246
Deubner, Ludwig 244
Dothan, Moshe 145
duBois, Page 306
Dumont, Jacques 131
Dussaud, R. 94
- Eddy, S. K. 302
Edmonds, H. 168
Edwards, Ruth B. 37,52
Effe, B. 239
Eissfeldt, Otto 98,101
Engels, F. 224
- Faure, P. 20,91,151
Fauth, Wolfgang 98,158
Figueira, T. J. 298
Fittschen, K. 109
Fontenrose, Joseph 79,98,124
Forbes, Hamish A. 60
Fournet, Jean-Luc 6,241

- Fowler, D. P. 47
 Foxhall, Lin 60
 Fraenkel, E. 300
 Frazer, James George 24,80
 Frei, Peter 49
 Friedrich, J. 287
 Frost, Honor 19
- Galling, K. 34
 Gardiner, A. H. 288
 Garland, Y. 305
 Gatier, P.-L. 121
 Genovese, Sebastiano 129-130
 George, C. J. 132
 Gesenius, W. 142
 Gill, David 187
 Gilliard, Frank D. 48
 Gimbutas, Marija 159
 Girard, René 190,218
 Giroux, Robert 11
 Goldstein, J. A. 157
 Gordis, R. 296
 Gordon, Cyrus H. 6,62,100,232,287
 Görg, M. 33
 Gould, John 222
 Griffin, Jasper 277,282,287
 Griffiths, J. Gwyn 6
 Gubel, E. 87
 Gundel, Hans Georg 335
 Güterbock, Hans G. 32
- Hachlili, Rachel 145
 Hallett, Judith P. 251
 Halleux, R. J. 305
 Halpern, B. 67
 Hanson, V. D. 163
 Hardy, D. A. 104
 Harlan, J. R. 81
 Harnack, Adolf 168-9
 Harper, R. F. 331
 Harris, William V. 12,49
 Hasel, G. F. 302
 Havelock, Eric 3
 Heaton, E. W. 296
 Hemberg, Bengt 37
 Henninger, J. 215
 Herrmann, Peter 261-4,287
 Herzfeld, E. 176
 Heubner, H. 158
 Hillers, Delbert R. 277-282, 287
 Hoffner, H. A. Jr 31,103
 Hommel, H. 124
 Hopper, R. J. 60
 Howe, H. M. 117
- Hubert, Henri 189
 Hudson-Williams, T. 296
 Hunt, R. C. & Eva 23
 Huxley, G. L. 33
- Jeffery, Lilian H. 38,51
 Just, Roger 222,238-9
- Karavites, Peter 254,259-280,288
 Katzenstein, H. J. 170
 Kemble, J. M. 193
 Keuls, Eva C. 240
 Koch, Klaus 98
 Köhler, L. 1547
 Korošec, Viktor 254,287
 Kovacs, B. W. 296
 Kretschmer, P. 306
 Krings, Véronique 115,134
 Krumbacher, F. 322-327
 Kühne, C. 198
 Kurtz, E. 320-327
- Lacey, W. K. 238
 Lambdin, T. O. 306
 Lambert, W. G. 316
 Langdon, S. 288
 Lavelle, B. M. 133
 Lee, Hugh M. 59
 Lefkowitz, Mary R. 224-5
 Letters, F. J. H. 228
 Levenson, J. D. 67
 Levin, Eve 222
 Levin, Saul 35,37,41,50,65,68,91,160,191,
 204,213,229,236-8,244,322, 388
 Lewis, T. J. 220
 Lewy, Heinrich 35,49,85,246,316-327
 Lichtheim, Miriam 310-323
 Lieberman, Saul 198,216,288,316-323
 Lipiński, Edouard 6,335
 Lloyd, Alan B. 6,103
 Lloyd-Jones, H. 297
 Lord, L. E. 305
 Loretz, O. 1875
 Lorimer, H. L. 163
 Lozano y Rey, Luis 130
 Lüder, Andreas 294
- Mans, M. J. 208
 Margalith, Othniel 32
 Mariaselvam, Abraham 94
 Markoe, G. 109
 Masson, Emilia 8,18,63,70,73-4,143,146,
 148,152
 Masson, Olivier 215,227

- Mauss, Marcel 189
 McCarthy, Dennis J. 254,288
 McNutt, Paula M. 25
 Mellaart, J. 81
 Mellink, M. J. 32
 Mendels, D. 302
 Mendenhall, George E. 38,288
 Meriggi, P. 34,156
 Meyers, Carol 223
 Milik, J. T. 151
 Millar, Fergus 337
 Miller, J. Innes 20,72,91,150,210, 335
 Mitford, T. B. 288
 Möller, Hermann 301
 Momigliano, Arnaldo 6
 Morpurgo-Davies, Anna 51
 Morris, Sarah P. 6,199
 Mühlestein, Hugo 35
 Muhly, James David 25,171,302
 Müller, W. W. 210
 Muñoz Valle, I. 297
 Mynors, R. A. B. 173
- Nagy, G. 298
 Nau, F. 318
 Niemann, H. M. 227
- Opie, Iona & Peter 229
 Otto, A. 317-320
 Otto, Walter F. 2
- Page, D. L. 165
 Pallottino, Massimo 185,191,225
 Palmer, L. R. 40
 Patrick, G. 52
 Pickard-Cambridge, A. W. 87
 Pomeroy, Sarah P. 228,234,238
 Porada, Edith 35,62
 Porter, J. R. 185
 Post, George E. 94
 Postel, E. 132
 Powell, Barry B. 39,45
 Provera, Mario 138
 Puech, E. 119
- Raabe, Paul R. 100
 Rabin, Chaim 65,94,156
 Ramage, A. 304
 Ramin, J. 305
 Reinach, Salomon 245
 Renfrew, Colin 82,104
 Renfrew, Jane M. 134
 Renger, Johannes 303
 Ribichini, Sergio 246
- Rice, E. E. 91
 Ridley, R. T. 273
 Rodríguez-Roda, Julio 130-131
 Rogers, S. C. 223
 Römer, W. H. P. 195
 Römheld, Diethard 291
 Rosén, H. B. 8,143,146
 Rosswig, Curt 131
 Rost, L. 187
 Rostovtzeff, M. 234
 Rovere, R. B. 302
 Rowton, M. B. 23
 Rudenko, S. I. 331
 Rustomji, Roshni 149
- Sagan, Carl 50
 Salonen, E. 331
 Sanders, Jack T. 291
 Sapir, E. 166
 Schibli, Hermann S. 125
 Schiffmann, I. 88
 Schliemann, H. 131
 Schmid, Rudolf 187
 Schmidt, Ernst Günther 267
 Schmitt, Rüdiger 5,11,27,139,272, 288
 Schoff, W. H. 148
 Sealey, Raphael 234,239
 Seltman, C. 87
 Sereni, Emilio 138,156
 Sherk, Robert K. 288
 Shipp, G. P. 336
 Skelton, R. A. 139
 Smallwood, E. Mary 288
 Smith, Morton 157
 Snodgrass, A. M. 163
 Snowden, Frank M. Jr 320
 Sperber, Daniel 150
 Spiegelberg, W. 334
 Stanford, W. B. 299
 Starr, C. G. 297
 Steiner, Richard C. 97
 Stern, Menahem 157
 Stevens, S. T. 273
 Stevenson, Burton 321
 Strömberg, R. 132
 Svenbro, Jesper 45
 Swain, J. W. 302
 Szemerényi, Oswald 19,155,166
- Tarn, W. W. 331
 Täubler, Eugen 288
 Thomas, Rosalind 48
 Thompson, D'Arcy W. 128
 Thuillier, Jean-Paul 59

- Tov, E. 18
 Toynbee, Arnold 249
 Tribble, Phyllis 252

 van Berchem, D. 220
 Van Den Brink, F. H. 192
 Van Groningen, B. A. 292
 Van Laere, Raf 23
 van Leeuwen, R. C. 307
 Verneule, Emily 55,57,112,121,281-2
 Vernant, J.-P. 133,190
 Vian, F. 98
 Vidal-Naquet, P. 225,305
 Visonà, P. 273
 Vogt, Joseph 249
 von Rad, Gerhard 296
 von Schuler, Einar 288

 Walcot, P. 5
 Wander, K. F. W. 294,317-327
 Wansbrough, Henry 48
 Warren, Larissa Bonfante 225

 Warren, P. M. 86
 Waterman, Leroy 288
 Weidner, Ernest F. 289
 Weinfeld, Moshe 20,215,230,289,254,
 256-278,310
 Wertime, T. A. 171,302
 West, M. L. 5-6,11,15,82,272,291-2
 Whewell, William 4
 White, K. D. 134
 Whybray, R. N. 297
 Willetts, R. F. 52,138
 Wills, Gary 51
 Windisch, H. 242
 Winspear, Alban D. 236
 Winston, D. 302
 Wiseman, D. J. 289
 Wittfogel, Karl A. 23
 Wood, Ellen & Neal 236

 Yahuda, Joseph 226
 Yerkes, R. K. 20,185
 Yoyotte, Jean 98

Index 5: General

Items in quotation marks as "aloes" indicate that the word both is discussed as a topic and translates an element of the common vocabulary.

Note the collective entries "grammar," "phrases, international" and "proverbs."

- Aaron 189,194,205
abecedaria 39
Abigail 67
Abner 67
Abraham 3,314
Absalom 3,67,232
absolutism 255
Abydos 243
academy and church 161
Achaeans 32,227,279
Achilles 10,57,108,164,239
Achish 164
acrostics 46
Actium 165
adamant 78
Adonijah 67
Adonis 41,136,154,208,245-6
Aegyptus 181,227
Aeneas 88
Aeolians 22
Aesop 320
Aetna 80,124
Agag 37
Agamemnon 58,66,208
Agis 249
Agrippa 117
Ahab 230
Ahhiyawa 31
Ahinoam 67
Ahiqar 309
Ahiram of Byblos 87,276,284
aide-mémoire 11,47-48
Akkadian 5
Akko 25
al-Mina 31
Alarodloi 139
Alexander Jannaeus 247
Alexander of Macedon (early) 268
Alexander (Paris) 208,230
Alexander the Great 151-2,199,340
allegories of vice and virtue 233
allegories of weapons 162
"almond-oil" 331
"aloes" 71,96
"alpha" 42
alphabet 28,38-54
"alphabet-song" 46
"altar" 188-90,201-4
Alyattes 164
Amarna letters 6
Amaseia 24
Amazons 224
ambiguous oaths 269
Ambrose 48
America 130,138
Ammon god of Libya 329
Amnon 67
Amos 27
amphictyony 22,256,265-6
Amphilochus 33
"amphora" 40,143-5
Amun god of Thebes 329
Amyntor 66
Anath 94
Anatolia 174
Anchiale 83
Anchises 164
"anchor-stones" 19
Andromache 70
Andromeda 181
"anemone" 246
Anna 336
"anointed" 60
anointing 60,95
Antinous (Homer) 228
Antioch 87,99
Antiochus I of Commagene 212
Antiochus IV of Syria 157,186
Antony 68,266
Anu 17,276,328
anxiety 295
Aphaca 245
Aphrodite 91,188,208,212,226,242,247,
282
Apis 334
Apollo 86

- Apollodorus s. of Pasion 69,233
 'Aqiba 75,162,317
 "Aquilaria" 96
 Arabia 72,151
 Aradus 41
 Aramaeans 18,43
 Aramaic 7,39,42
 Ararat 139
 archers 33
 architecture 7
 archives 250
 Archytas 316
 Ares 300
 Arimaspians 86
 Arimoi 79
 Aristagoras 110
 Aristobulus of Judaea 158
 aristocracy 292
 Aristophanes 239
 Aristotle 10
 "ark" 35
 armor, putting on 164
 "arrogance" 107,294
 "arrow" 20
 Arsames 324
 Artaxerxes II 66
 Artemis 45, 86,135,216,335
 Arvales 194
 Arybas 330
 Asahel 341
 Ascalon 25,33,213
 Asclepius 36,159
 Ashdod 40
 Ashoka 117
 Ashtoreth 213
 Aspasia of Athens 240
 Aspasia of Persia 66
 "ass" 19
 Assurbanipal 30,324
 Assyria 42-43
 Astarte 213,339
 astrology 97
 Astyanax 120
 Astypaleia 286
 Atabyris 330
 Atargatis 33
 Athaliah 30
 Athena 54,61,65,167,206,226
 Athens 25,159
 athletics 207
 Atlantic 116
 Atlantis 256
 Atlas 113-8,335
 atonement 218
 Atreus 280
 Attis 80
 Augustine 48
 Augustus 89,170,286,302
 "aurochs" 192-3
 Aurora 71,111
 averter of flies 219-221
 Avesta 27
 Azitawad 33,268
 Baal, god 122,174,189
 Baal k. of Tyre 101,120,255
 Baal-Saphon 79,98-105
 Baalyada' 304
 Baalzebub 219
 Babylonia 16-17,27,50,83-4,206,213,242,
 275,339
 Babylonian gods 17
 Baitokaike 331
 Balak 89
 "balsam" 96-7
 Balthi 245
 "banker" 75
 banking 19
 banquet, sacrifice as 183-187
 baptism 320
 Bar-Hadad 120
 barbarism 30,234
 Barca 269
 "barley-cake" 337
 Barnabas 194
 Baruch 47
 Barzillai 56
 Basques 176
 Bathsheba 49,67
 "bean(-shaped dish)" 342
 "beans" 19
 "bear!" (vb) 43
 Behistun 27
 Bel(us) 17,181,195,227
 belief in gods 254
 Bellerophon 49,224,228
 Benaiah 231
 "beryl" 89,333
 "beta" 42
 Bethel 194,337
 Bethlehem 245
 better world 212
 "betyl" 337
 Bias 320
 Bilhah 68
 bimetalism 305
 binding, death by 208
 "bird-trap" 341

- "birds" 281
 bisexuality 239
 bison, European 191
 "bitter" 314
 "blessing" 24
 blood of the grape 135
 blue sky 84,106
 boar 135-6
 Bodashtart of Sidon 36
 bodyguards 30
 Boeotia 35
 Boghazköy 254
 Borsippa 309
 Bosphorus 131
 Bostrenus 36
 Botrys 156
 bow as broken 277
 "bowl" 19,40,109,146-8
 bowl of the sun 111
 Brahms 162
 "bread" 337
 breakdown of distinctions 243-4
 breaking treaty 259
 "brick" 16,76,83-5
 "bridge" 35
 "broadsword" 174
 bronze 25,171
 bronze sky 106-7
 "brother" 225
 Brutus 48
 "bucket" 145-6
 Buddhism 27
 "bull" 18,146,152,188-195
 bullfight 192
 burning, death by 208
 business as symbol 74-77
 Byblos 7,93,102,242,329
 "byssus" 209
 Byzantine scholars 12
 Byzantium 1,131
- cable and camel 338
 Cadmeians 37
 Cadmus 37,44-5,142
 Caesar 48,263,286,299
 Cain 13,175
 Calchas 33
 calligraphy 47
 Calydonian boar 135
 Calypso 113,141,237,339
 Cambyses 144
 "camel" 210,338
 Camilla 341
 Canaan 6-7
 Canaanite language 7
 "cannabis" 331
 Capitoline Hill 159
 Capua 242
 Carchemish 164
 "cardamum" 151,335
 Caria 30
 Carthage 119,159,184,220,334
 Caryatids 118-122
 "cassia" 18,42,70-72,150
 "castor" 331
 castration 80-82
 Cato 48
 "cave" 244
 Cecrops 226
 Cepheus 181
 Chaldaeans of Armenia 97,174
 Chaldaeans of Babylon 97
 Chalybes 174,211
 Charon 167
 "cherub" 18,85-7
 children's phrases 229,255
 Chimaera 228
 Christ 235
 Christianity 208,218
 Chusarthis 332
 Chusor 84
 Cilicia 29,80,124
 Cinna 276
 "cinnamon" 71,94-5,150
 circumcision 32,81
 cisterns 26
 citadel 22
 citizen of the world 162
 city-state 25
 classicism 14
 Claudian 89
 Cleomenes 249
 Cleopatra 68
 Cluvia 243
 Clytemnestra 208
 Cnossus 87,206
 coinage 295-9,305
 Colchis 176,240
 color-words 312-3
 "columns" 158
 compasses 110-112
 "concubine" 19,65-70
 contexts, literary 63-64
 contingency 325
 Corcyra 101,263
 Corinth 212,242
 Cornelia m. of Gracchi 249
 "corner" 343

- Corsica 176
 corslet 206
 Corycian cave 80
 cosmetics 240-241
 cosmological myth 17,21
 cosmology & technology 108
 "costus" 149-150
 "cotton" 339
 "courier" (Persian) 342
 couvade 176
 covenant of blood 200
 covenant renewal 261
 creation 108
 Crete 32,59,69
 critique of cult 188-90, 217-8
 "crocus" 71,93,150
 Croesus 48,305
 crucifixion 247
 Cumae 124
 "cummin" 335
 cuneiform 12, 27,39,309
 cupellation 304
 "curse" 258
 curses 5,254
 cutting a treaty 258-9
 Cybebe 16,328
 Cybele 154,328
 Cyclops 137,171
 Cydonians 32
 Cynthia 252,333
 "cypress" 329
 Cyprus 92,286
 Cyrene 285
 Cyzicus 131
- Dagon 123
 Damascus 28,243
 Danae 227
 Danaids 72,227
 Danaoi 6,227
 Danaos 181,227
 dancing floor 206
 Daniel 50
 Danites 6
 Daphnae of Egypt 333
 "daric" 301
 Darius, prince 66
 "date-palm" 18
 dating by tree-rings 104
 David 49,59,67,167,240
 debt 249-251
 Decalogue 262
 dedications 193
 deforestation 130
- Deianeira 66,188
 Delilah 170,226
 Delos 36,203
 Delphi 172,186,256,265-6,285,315,323
 "delta" 44
 Demeter 142
 Demetrius Poliorcetes 122
 democracy 26,255
 Democritus 309
 demons 219
 demythologizing 108
 Deucalion 22,83,99,104
 Deuteronomy 253
 "devil" 13
 Dido 88,159,336
 dimorphism, sexual 192
 Dinah 32,227
 Diocletian 150
 Diogenes 321
 Dione 328
 Dionysius of Malta 120
 Dionysodorus 315
 Dionysus 137-40,153,157,195,243
 Dioscuri 36-37
 "dish-names" 343
 dispersal of power 21
 Dispiter 276
 divine indwelling 179
 "diviner" 185
 Dodanim 7
 Dodona 7,70
 dogs and vultures 247,280-2
 Dolops 166
 domestic mode of production 237
 dominion over animals 55
 Domitian 283
 "door" 18,40,52-3
 Dorians 22,33,206
 Doura of Palestine 25,33
 down-payment 77
 "drachma" 301
 "dragon" 13
 dragon, primeval 79-86,98-105,124-8, 182
 drinking-horn 193
 drought 107
 Dumuzi 245
 Dusares 333
 dying god 244
 dynasties of gods 85
- "ears" 196
 "earth" 20
 earthquakes 114,123,195
 "eastern" 37

- "ebony" 42,197,337-8
 Ecbatana 84
 Eden 55,86,140,158,339
 effeminacy 153,296
 Egypt 329
 Egyptian 6
 Ekron 219,247
 El, god 195
 electrum alloy 305
 elegiac verse 251,290
 elements 20,267-272,330
 "elephant" 197,337-8
 Elephantine 338
 Elieus 35
 Elijah 122
 Elisha 178
 Elohim 85
 Elysian Fields 112
 embalming 211
 "emerald" 18,87,122,332
 emergence of freedom 14
 En-Dor 243
 "enamel" 88,304
 enclaves, disloyal 242
 "endure" (vb) 307
 entrails, eating of 185-6
 Enuma Elish 64,127
 Eos 112
 epebes 246,285
 ephemerality 57
 Ephialtes 84
 epikleroi 238
 Epimenides 32
 epithalamium 70
 Epyaxa 225
 Ereimboi 18,79
 Ereschigal 328
 Erichthonius 341
 erotic imagery 94
 errors in MSS 17
 Esarhaddon 5,101,107,255,284-309
 Eshmun 7,35,159
 Eshmunazar 45
 Esmounos 36
 Ethiopian 320
 Etruria 28,170,225
 eunuch 34
 Europa 37,69,195,240
 Euxantius 123
 Eve 224
 "evening" 58
 Exekias 137
 "exemption" 250
 Exodus 98-105
 exoticism 20,72
 "eyes" 196
 faultless 232
 fear of the gods 254
 feminism 222
 Fertile Crescent 8
 festival, village 154
 fetials 275
 fibula 206
 "fine linen" 41
 fire and sword 159
 firmament 106-8
 fish as sacrificed 133
 "flash" (vb) 330
 "flaw" 231-2
 flies at sacrifice 186,219-221
 flints 81,275
 flood legends 83,99,103
 forest-inscriptions 130
 formulas, oral 13
 Forum Boarium 219
 foursquare man, city 236,339
 Fox, George 117
 "frankincense" 40,72,95,150,188-90,210-3
 "freighter" (Phoen.) 19,146-8
 Freire, Paulo 46
 Freud 68
 friend to your friends 263
 "frogs" 336
 Gadara of Decapolis 119
 Gades 114-130
 "galbanum" 150
 gall and wormwood 314
 Galloi 174
 Gamphane 335
 garden with four rivers 140-1
 garments, over and under 206-7
 gates of hell 123-4
 Gathas 27
 Gaul 60,134
 Gaza 1,25,40,123,226
 geopolitical world 14,328-9
 Gephyraioi 35
 Gergithes 31
 Germans 13,106,238
 Geryon 125
 Geshurites 35
 Gibeon 201
 Gibraltar 115,128-133
 Gideon 144
 Gilgal 189
 Gilgamesh 16,328,340

- Girgashites 31
 "glade" 342
 Glaucus 225
 God arming self 168
 God as bull 194-5
 God as fortress 160
 gods and men 55
 Gog 175
 "gold" 19,41,73,84,197,301-8
 gold leaf 198
 gold-economy 19,299-308
 Golden Age 172,188
 golden vine 158
 goldsmith-bankers 299-308
 Goliath 164,280
 good and evil 55-6
 Gracchi 249
 grammar
 accents 12
 alliteration 196
 alternations l/n, m/w 136,141,200
 aspiration 204
 cases 191,196
 cognate accusative 179,257
 collective plurals 189,194,202
 consonantal equivalents 40,174
 contamination 78
 conventional plurals 208
 denominative verbs 152
 dialects 7,42
 doubled stops 153
 dual endings 191,196
 emphatics 42
 eponyms 82
 ethnics 18,38
 folk-etymology 18,43
 fricatives 40
 laterals 97
 metathesis 192
 noun-endings 18
 noun-pairs 260
 off-glides 41
 passive, Aramaic 140
 pausal forms 82,136
 puns 147,241
 quadriliteral roots 146
 quasi-proper nouns 91
 shift of voicing 85
 spirants 227
 verb and object 18,142,199-201
 vowel signs 12,38-43
 vowel harmony 12
 vulgarism 68
 "grapes, unripe" 155-6
 "great" 36-7
 "great fish" 128-133
 great oath 257
 Gresham's Law 299
 "griffin" 18,85-7
 Grotius 3,50
 guerrilla tactics 167
 Gyges 30,175,207
 "gymnasiarch" 121
 gymnasium 121,246
 Hadad 194,273
 Hades 53,123
 Hadhramaut 72,210
 Hadrian 99,117,130,193
 halves of victims 215
 Hamlet 53
 Hammurabi 284
 handwriting on wall 50
 "hang" (vb) 307
 Hannah 199,336
 Hannibal 159,254,286
 Hanno 41,115
 hardness 314
 "harlot" 226
 "harness-maker" 179
 "harp" 78
 Hasdrubal 330
 Hatti land 230
 Haustafel 234
 Hazael 39
 "headlong" 185
 Hebraism 1-9
 Hebrew Bible, Greek man in 34
 Hector 70,207
 Hecuba 225
 Hegai 34
 Hegias 34
 Helen 68,227-230
 Hellen 22
 Hellenism 1-9
 Hellespont 131
 "helmet" 20,65,165-6
 "henna" 92-3,149
 hepatoscopy 185
 Hephaestus 87,108,164
 Heracles 66,79,111,118-121,188,208,279
 Heraclitus 300
 "herd" 194
 Hesiod 27
 Hesperides 125
 hetaerae 233,240
 Hezekiah 24
 hide of victim 213-4

- hieroglyphics 12,28
 Hieron II 118
 High God 20,257
 High Priest 50,205
 Hillel 250,310
 Himera 124
 Hinduism 27
 Hippolytus 49
 Hippius 167
 Hiram, artisan 87,304
 Hiram, king 7,121,334
 historical texts 27
 historicizing of myth 28
 Hittites 6,31,230
 Hivites 32,201,227
 Hobab 328
 "hoe" 195
 Homer, historical man in 176
 homosexuality 239
 "horn" 195-9
 Horus 102
 hostages 76
 "house" 42
 "house of God" 337
 housewife and harlot 233-4
 human nature 21
 humanism 12,54-6
 Humbaba 16,328
 Hurrian 87
 Hushai 208
 hydraulic society 23
 hypogrammos 46
 Hypsipyle 226
- Iapetus 42,82-3
 Iardanos 32,34
 Iberia (W & E) 176
 Iguvium 152
 immortality, medicine of 16
 immunity, sacral 246
 imperialism 21,177
 "incantation" 343
 incense 93,150
 incest 69
 incongruity 325
 India 71,211
 Indo-European 139,271
 information, sources of 50
 inhumation 311
 "ink" 54,330
 inland literary cultures 8
 inns 242-3
 innumerability 271,314-6
 inspiration 14
- intoxication 153,331
 Io 71,240,247,277
 Ionia 18,22,42,82
 Iphigeneia 216,234
 Irish Elk 192
 iron 25,106-7,171-2
 irrigation 22
 Isaac 216
 Ischomachus 237
 Ishtar 328,339
 Isis 16,333
 islands named for flowers 92-3
 Ismenos 35
 Itabyrion 330
 Ithaca 228
 "ivory" 197,337-8
- Jabal 84
 Jacob 230
 Janus 20
 Japheth 42,82-3
 Jason of Jerusalem 246
 "jasper" 40,42,87-90
 Jebel Aqra' 98
 Jehoiakim 47
 Jephthah 154,255
 Jeremiah 47
 Jericho 92,96,243
 Jeroboam 194,202
 Jerome 3
 Jerusalem 87,158,339
 Jesus 151,209,248-50,270,295
 jewels 87-90,332-3
 Jews 6,184
 Jezebel 7,230,241
 Joab 49
 Jocasta 227
 Jochebed 68
 Jonah 102
 Jonathan 240
 Joppa 181-2
 Jordan 34
 Joseph 205
 Joseph of Arimathea 95
 Joshua 164
 Judah 75
 Judas Maccabeus 167
 Judith 154-8
 Julian 99
 Jupiter 20
 Jupiter Feretrius 275
 Jupiter Optimus Maximus 159
 Jupiter Victor 194
 Jupiter-stone 276

- Kabeiroi 36
 Karatepe 33
 karst 24
 Kasios (2 sites) 21,80,98-105
 Keret 32,147
 Kerne 179
 Keteioi 31
 Kilamuwa 209
 "king" 200
 kingship, divine 21
 Klothes 238
 Knouphis 338
 Kombabos 328
 Kore 45
 Koronis 81
 Kothar 84
 Kronos 78,85,125
 Kumarbi 103
 kyrios 239
 Kyrnos 290-299
 Kythera 332
- Laban 230
 Labda 43
 Lacedaemonians 44,59,161
 "ladanum" 331
 Laerkes 197
 Laios 38
 "lambda" 43
 "lance" 18,20,170-177
 land tenure 240
 land-trade 19,25
 Laodicea of Syria 134
 "lapis lazuli" 88,304
 Latin 39
 law and wall 160
 Lear, Edward 46
 Lebanon 95,130,210
 Lemnos 171,226
 Lesbia 251
 Levantine Crescent 8
 Levi 38,68
 Leviathan 79,102-3, 126
 levirate 238
 libanos *see* frankincense
 libations 215
 Liberty Bell 54
 Libya 29
 Lichas 171
 "lick" (vb) 282
 licking blood 282-3
 life as campaign 168
 "lift" (vb) 307
 "lightning" 18,330
- "lily" 331
 lime 25
 "linen" 209
 lingua franca, Roman 75,121
 "lion" 42,340
 literacy 46-50
 "liver" 185
 Locri 246
 Lord's Prayer 249-251
 "lotus" 332
 "love" 21
 love-charm 149
 loyalty-oath 253
 Lusitanians 286
 Luther 295
 Luvian 38,49,65
 Lycians 28,224
 Lydda 30
 Lydia 28,29,42-3,164,282
 Lydian stone 305
 "lyre" 155
- Macedon 215
 Madagascar 94
 Maecenas 89
 Maenads 79
 Magi 95,212
 magic 20,328
 Magnesia 118
 Mago 134
 "magus" 343
 male dominance 224
 Mallus 33
 "manna" 210
 Mantiklos 45
 maps 110
 Marathus 93
 Mardonius 178
 Marduk 127
 marriage contracts 229-231
 Mars 47
 Marxism 222
 Mary Magdalen 248
 "mascara" 241-2
 mask 199
 Masorettes 12,179,203,290
 mass marriages 227
 Massilia 134
 materiel of war 20
 matriarchy 225-6
 matrilineality 176,224
 matrilocal succession 227-9
 Matten 330
 Medea 240

- Medusa 79
 Megara 240
 Meges 166
 Melqarth 7,86,119,167,220
 melting wax 273
 memorization 11,51-2
 Memphis 329
 Menelaus 32,66,227,280
 Menno Simons 177
 Mephisto 88
 Merbalos 42,330
 mercenaries 29
 Mesha 45,202
 Meshech 175
 "messenger" 342
 Messiah 60
 metallurgy 171
 metaphors 53,169
 Michal 67,228
 Midas 175
 Midian 74
 Miletus 74,240
 military colony 33
 military innovations 162
 military numen 20
 militia, civic 26,235-6
 milk and honey 3,140
 "mina" 43,50,76,307-8
 Minaia 151,210
 mining societies 177
 Minoan society 56
 Minotaur 191,199
 Miriam 154
 missing the mark 56
 mistresses 251-2
 "mix" (vb) 142-3
 mixed drinks 142-3
 Moabite 7,45
 models of society 222
 Moloch 154
 money-changers 306
 "monkey" 44
 monsoon winds 94
 "moon" 247
 Mopsuestia 33
 Mopsus 33
 "mortar" 41
 Moschoi 174
 Moses 54,68,80
 "most high" 35
 "moth" 73-4
 "mountain" 342
 mountain, divine 103
 mourning 208,244
 "mourning" 21
 movement of peoples 29-38
 Muses 27
 Muski 175
 Myagros 219
 Mycenae 24
 Mycenaean 186
 "myrrh" 40,72,95,150,210
 myths, Platonic 87-8
 Naboth 282
 nakedness 58-60
 "naphtah" 279
 "nard" 72,92,148-151
 narrative 15
 Nathan 67
 Nausicaa 139,224
 ne plus ultra 117
 Neaera 233
 Nebuchadrezzar 161
 "nectar" 91
 Nehemiah 161
 Neolithic 81,318
 Nereids 152
 Nessus 188
 Nestor 35
 new moon 213
 "new wine" 153-8
 Nicaea 339
 Nicias 257
 Nikandre 45
 Nile 23
 Nimrod 83
 Nineveh 329
 Niqmad 205,284,308
 "nitre" 241
 no other lord 262
 Noah 82,267
 nomadism 177
 non-violence 252
 oath 256
 Obodas 43
 obsidian 81
 Ocean 109,125
 Ochus 66
 Odysseus 59-60, 69,101,206
 Oedipus 68,227,255
 Oenotria 138
 Oeta, Mount 120
 Ogygos 37
 oil on stone 337
 "oil-flask" 342
 Oineus 135-7

- Oinoanda 138
 old age 56-7
 "old" 119
 oligarchy 308
 olive 60-61
 Olympians 54
 Olympus 84,106
 Onan 81
 Ophion 125
 Ophioussa 125
 oral repertory 48
 orchestras, cultic 155
 ordeal, prenuptial 228
 Oreb 281
 originality 13
 Orpheus 79
 Orphics 107
 Orsippus 59
 Osiris 16,99,102,333
 Otos 84
 Ouranos 78,85
 Ovid 4,55
 "oxen" 194
 "oyster" 343
- Pachynos 131
 paciñism 251
 Pactolus 304
 Paeonia 191,197,238
 pageants 72,91,198,210
 Palamedes 49
 Paleolithic 190
 Palestine 170
 pallium 206
 Palmyra 19
 Pamphyloi 32-3
 Pamplona 192
 Pandarus 33,56
 panoply 163-170
 Pantheon 117
 "paper" 54,330
 Paphlagonians 286
 papyrus 329
 parables 75
 "paradise" 21,95-6,140
 Parisian 195
 parody 71
 "patara" 109,166
 Patoumos 329
 patricide 69
 Patroclus 184,239,339
 Paul of Tarsus 54,60,77,102,243
 "peacock" 44
 "pearl" 343
 "pedagogue" 54,330
 Pelasgians 65,176,226
 Pelusium 102
 "pen" 54,330
 Penelope 228
 Penhase 181,333
 "people" 38
 "pepper" 151,335
 Pericles 240
 Persephone 140,328
 Perseus 79,181
 Persia 165
 Petronius 316-7
 Phaeacians 194
 Phaethon 198
 phalanx 163
 phallus 240
 Phasis 88,111
 Pheretima of Cyrene 237,247
 Philistines 65,165,170-1,219,226
 Philoctetes 279
 Phinehas 181
 Phineus 56,181
 Phocaea 134,148
 Phoenicia 1,8,44
 Phoenician vowels 204,301
 Phoenix (bird) 72
 Phoenix (Homeric) 66,135,181,186
 phonetic script 11
 phrases, international
 amphora of wine 144
 bucket of wine 145
 gold brick 84
 gold mina 308
 golden bowl 147
 golden horn 197
 horned altar 203
 horned bull 195-9
 jewel-lists 87-90,332-3
 lion and serpent 340
 mix wine 18,142
 pavement of sapphire 84,332
 sack on ass 19
 silver bowl 167
 slaughter bull 18,199-201
 spice-lists 70-72,91-7,150-1
 strip of byssus 209
 test gold 18,306
 Phrygia 175
 Phthas 334
 Picasso 192
 Pilate 263
 pillars of heaven 113-123
 Pillars of Heracles 88,115-130

- piracy 171
 Piraeus 25,161,301
 Pithom 329
 Pixodarus 29
 Plataea 286
 Plato 236
 Platonism 88
 "pledge" 18-19,74-8
 Pliny the Elder 48
 poetry of commerce 71,210-11
 poison and witchcraft 171
 political animal 235
 Polybius 163
 Polycrates 303
 Polyphemus 147
 polytheism 55
 Pompeii 40
 Pompey 100,158
 "pool" 24
 "porridge" 19
 Porsenna 25,171
 ports of trade 302
 Poseidon 123,148,194-5
 Posideion 31
 Posidonius 168
 Praxinoa 241-245
 "precinct" 21
 "presence" 177-180
 preservation of texts 10
 Priam 226,282
 Prodicus 233
 Proetus 49
 prohibition of metallurgy 25,171
 Prometheus 51,82-3,125,184-5,247,271
 prophetism 27
 prose and verse 63-4
 prostitution 212,242-3,248
 prostitution, sacred 242
 prostitution-tax 248
 prototype, Sem. of Greek script 38
 proverb and fable 156,320,325
 proverb-book 290-299
 proverbs
 a wolf by the ears 323
 as you sow, so reap 81,317
 better foot slip 318
 bitten by a serpent 322
 bread on the waters 321
 constant dropping 320
 Cretan liar 32
 drink from your own well 296
 early to bed 298
 earth to earth 311
 eat, drink and be merry 324
 he who desires peace 160
 he that cannot beat the ass 319
 if I be hanged 317
 kingdom of the blind 321
 lamp at midday 321
 liar not believed 325
 like master, like man 318
 man proposes 295
 many hands, light work 319
 money is man 299
 of ill debtors men take oats 323
 ox to slaughter 201,218
 place doesn't honor man 319
 place sheweth the man 319
 pride goeth before a fall 294
 rich folk have plenty of friends 293
 sour grapes 156
 steal from a thief 323
 sticks and stones 255
 sufficient unto the day 295
 the ox fell, men sharpen 322
 to wash an Ethiop white 320
 too many cooks 319
 who spits against heaven 322
 wine is the master's 316
 you can't take it with you 324
 prudence 326
 Psammetichus 30
 Ptah 334
 Ptolemy II Philadelphus 72,91,198,
 210,245
 publicans 248-9
 Publius Syrus 317
 pyramids 11
 Pythius 215

 Qadmonites 37
 Qataban 210
 Quadrata Roma 339
 Queen of Sheba 96

 Rabbi 209
 Rachel 224
 Rahab of Jericho 243
 Rahab, dragon 102-3,126
 "rain" 24
 rainfall 22
 Ramah 24
 Ramses III 170
 "raven" 313
 realism about motives 326
 Rechabites 142
 recitation, oral 48
 "reed" 94

- Reformation 177
 Rehoboam 67
 resurrection 140
 retribution 5,325
 Reuben 68
 revelation 14
 Rhadaunanthys 5
 Rhea 225
 rhinoceros 198
 Rhodes 7,92,339
 Rib-Addi 341
 Richard III 136
 riddles 227-9
 Rizpah 67,247,282
 Rome 24
 Romulus 246
 "rose" 339
 Rosetta Stone 28
 "rouge" 241-2
 "rulers" 65
 "rulers over men" 224
 runes, Old English 193
- Saba 71,210-1,331,338
 Sabbatical Year 250
 Sabines 246
 "sack" 19,41
 sacred space & time 21
 Sacred Band of Thebes 240
 "sacrifice" (vb) 188-90,199-201
 sacrifice, Greek 183
 sacrifice, human 260
 sacrifice, language of 187
 sacrifice of fish 133
 sacrifice, theories of 189-190
 sacrificial cult 20
 saffron 93
 sailing-times 1
 Samnites 76
 Samothrace 36
 Samson 123,228-9
 sand and stars 314-6
 sand-measurer 316
 Saphon 98-105
 "sapphire" 40,87,332
 Sappho 71,248
 Sardanapallus 97,324
 Sardes 176,304,336
 Sardinia 176
 Sardonikon 176
 Saron 35
 Sassanids 59
 "satrap" 342
 Saturnalia 243
- Saul 59,67,167,274
 Sauromatae 224
 Scaurus, M. 182
 scepter 276-7
 school-vocabulary 330-1
 "scorpion" 146,336
 Scottish proverbs 294
 scribalism 27
 scrolls 47
 Scythia 86,224,260,331
 sea-purple 88
 sea-trade 19,146-8
 seafaring 1,7,102
 seed, plant and human 81
 seeds, aromatic 335-6
 seers 21,33-4
 Seleucus I 72,99,150
 self-interest, enlightened 293
 Sennacherib 247,341
 Septuagint 55
 "serpent" 340
 Servilia 48
 Servilius Tullius 163
 "sesame" 336
 Seth, Eg. demon 99
 seven-headed dragon 126
 sexagesimal system 307
 sexuality 207,239
 Shakespeare 53,135
 shamanism 21
 Shaphan 50
 Shardana 176
 Sharon 35
 Sheba 72,96,205,338
 Shechem 32
 Shechinah 180
 "shekel" 50,307
 Shema^c 283
 shepherds 24
 Sherlock Holmes 281
 Shihor 334
 Shiloh 181
 ship-timber 329
 shipwreck, causes of 101,144
 "shirt" 322
 shroud 209
 Sibyls 243,316
 "sickle" 21,78-83
 Sidon 18,32,42,329
 siege warfare 25
 Siegfried 192,260
 signet 75
 silent reading 48
 "silver" 301

- Sinope 131
 sins of fathers 310
 "skiff" 167
 skin, making of 207
 "slaughter" (vb) 199-201
 slaves 234-5,246
 sleep and death 121-2
 smell of sacrifice 186
 Smyrna 95
 "snow" 330
 social realities 222
 Socrates 162,237
 Solomon 60,67,69,237
 Solon 250
 "southwest wind" 30
 sowing with salt 273
 "space for augury" 21
 Spanish kings 117
 Sparta 59,142
 speaking texts 45
 Spensithios 51
 Sphinx 47,227
 spice-trade 94
 "spiced" 91
 spices 70-72,91-97,148-151,211,331-2
 spinning 237-8,278-9
 spirit of divinity 4,27
 "square" 339
 "staff" 44
 "stag" 195
 "star" 339
 stars and sand 314-6
 "steer" 191
 stereotypes, ethnic 30-32
 stoning 208
 storm at sea 101
 "strong drink" 154
 Styx 267
 substitution 217
 suitors 230
 Sulla 276
 "sunset" 58
 Suppiluliuma 284
 Susa 331
 Susanna 331
 "sweet mead" 139
 sweetness 314
 "sword" 342
 swords into plowshares 172-3
 "sycamore" 342
 Syene 41,337
 symposia 140
 synagogue 161
 syncretism 157
 Syria 184
 Tabal 175
 Tabernacle 180
 "tablet" (*deltos*) 18,40,52-3
 "tablet" (*pinax*) 75
 Tabor 330
 Tadmor 19
 Tahpanhes 100,333
 Tamar 67,205,208
 "tambourine" 152-5
 Tamil poetry 94
 Tammuz 154,244-6
 Tannin 79,102,126-133
 Taprobane 72
 Tarentum 246
 tariff 214
 Tarshish 7
 Tartessus 7,125
 Tarvos 190
 Tatuhepa of Mitanni 197
 Taurus mount 191
 tax-lists 150
 tearing tunic 208,245
 telamones 118
 Telchines 79
 Telemachus 228
 Telephos 31
 Telipinus 31
 tempering of steel 171
 "tent" 20,177-180
 tent-makers 179
 Termila 29-31
 Tessub 103
 "test, refine" (vb) 19,305-7
 thalassophobia 302
 Thales 77
 Thapsacus 329
 Thasos 36
 Thebes of Egypt 35
 Thebes of Greece 8,35,62
 theft at night 4
 theism 12, 54-61
 Theodoros of Samos 303
 Theognis 290-299
 Thera 104,285
 Theron 116
 Thesmophoria 243
 Thetis 85,109
 Theuth 334
 Thisbe 35
 Thomas 146
 Thrace 174,197
 throne and scepter 276-7

- throwing stone 275
 "thyrsus" 153-8
 Tiamat 17,127
 Tibarenoi 174
 Tiberius 261,286,302
 Timnah 226
 tin 25
 Tishbite 35
 Titans 83,113
 Tithonus 71,111
 Titus 99
 Tjeker 33
 Tobias 40
 toga 207
 tonnara 130-1
 tools, iron 25,171
 toponyms 35
 "torch" 21
 torture 306
 "touchstone" 305-7
 Trajan 99,193
 transhumance 24,178
 transience 12
 translation 14
 transmigration 217
 transmissibility 326
 "treasure" 40
 treaty 20
 treaty structure 253
 "tree-names" 342
 triple division of cosmos 267
 triple sacrifice 214
 Tripolis of Phoenicia 34
 Triptolemus 99
 triumphator 206
 Troy 159
 tsunami 104
 Tubal 84,175
 Tubal-Qain 84
 "tuna" 128-133
 "tunic" 59,188-90,204-9
 tunic as badge of office 205
 tunica molesta 208
 "turban" 166
 "turmeric" 43
 twelve peoples 22,194
 Twelve Tables 53
 Tyndareus 230
 Typhon 79,98-105,124
 "tyrant" 65
 Tyre 119-122,165,329
 Tyrsenians 171
 Ugarit 6,13,39
 underworld 57-8,124
 "undying fame" 11
 unguents, perfumed 149
 unicorn 198
 unyoked heifer 216
 Urartu 139
 Uriaah 449
 Ursa Major 111
 Utica 119
 Valerius Flaccus 250
 "valley" 58
 Vardanes 339
 Varuna 272
 Vascones 176
 vassal treaties 253
 Venus 65
 Verres 248
 Vespasian 87
 Vesuvius 124
 Viet Nam 72
 "vine" 136-7
 Vinlanda 138-9
 violation of sepulture 255
 viticulture 20,134-158
 vocabulary, common 18,63-64
 vocabulary, popular 192
 volcano 124
 "vulture" 247,280-2
 "wall" 119
 warrior arms self 167
 "watchtower" 131
 "water" 22
 water supply 24
 wealth and wisdom 298
 weaving 238
 wheat, wild 81
 "wheat-flour" 343
 "wheel of the sun" 272
 whole burnt offering 184
 whole-heartedness 265-6
 wild ox 192
 "wine" 41,137-141
 "winehall" 18,43,141-2
 wings of the dawn 112
 Wisdom 179
 "woman" 226
 women, movements of 19
 women, restrictions on 222
 women, roles of 21
 women, slaves, children 262
 women's cults 243-4
 women's freedom 224
 Worodes 339

- wound, incurable 279
writing and memory 50-54
- Xenophon of Corinth 212,242
Xerxes 34
Xisouthros 16
- Yahdunlim 284
Yahweh 20,44,79,86
Yawan 7,82,175
Yeb 338
yoke 283
- Zagros 81
Zedekiah 199
Zeeb 281
- Zeeland 295
Zeno of Citium 162,318
Zeno of Egypt 93
Zenobios tambourinist 153
Zeus 20,23,56,122
Zeus Apomyios 219
Zeus Belos 97
Zeus Betylos 337
Zeus Bomos 202
Zeus Kasios 98-105,193
Zeus Larasius 70
Zeus Madbachos 202
Zipporah 80
Ziusudra 16
Zodiac 145-6, 198, 335

BEIHEFTE ZUR ZEITSCHRIFT FÜR DIE ALTTESTAMENTLICHE WISSENSCHAFT

Large-octavo · Cloth

ISAAC KALIMI

Zur Geschichtsschreibung des Chronisten

Literarisch-historiographische Abweichungen der Chronik von ihren Paralleltexten in den Samuel- und Königsbüchern

1995. IX, 400 pages. ISBN 3-11-014237-6 (Volume 226)

ERNST WÜRTHWEIN

Studien zum Deuteronomistischen Geschichtswerk

1995. VIII, 221 pages. ISBN 3-11-014269-4 (Volume 227)

JONATHAN G. CAMPBELL

The Use of Scripture in the Damascus Document 1–8, 19–20

1995. XII, 218 pages. ISBN 3-11-014240-6 (Volume 228)

KLAUS KOENEN

Heil den Gerechten – Unheil den Sündern!

Ein Beitrag zur Theologie der Prophetenbücher

1995. XI, 293 pages. ISBN 3-11-014376-3 (Volume 229)

MARKUS WITTE

Vom Leiden zur Lehre

Der dritte Redegang (Hiob 21–27) und die Redaktionsgeschichte des Hiobbuches

1995. XII, 333 pages. ISBN 3-11-014375-5 (Volume 230)

JOHN PAIRMAN BROWN

Israel and Hellas

1995. XXII, 407 pages. ISBN 3-11-014233-3 (Volume 231)

RUTH SCORALICK

Einzelpruch und Sammlung

Komposition im Buch der Sprichwörter Kapitel 10–15

1995. IX, 285 pages. ISBN 3-11-014440-9 (Volume 232)

Walter de Gruyter



Berlin · New York

BEIHEFTE ZUR ZEITSCHRIFT FÜR DIE ALTTESTAMENTLICHE WISSENSCHAFT

Large-octavo · Cloth

ANDREAS LÜDER
Historie und Dogmatik

Ein Beitrag zur Genese und Entfaltung von Johann Salomo Semlers Verständnis des Alten Testaments
1995. X, 259 pages. ISBN 3-11-014627-7 (Volume 233)

MARKUS WITTE
Philologische Notizen zu Hiob 21–27

1995. X, 202 pages. ISBN 3-11-014568-8 (Volume 234)

PIERRE AUFFRET
Merveilles à nos yeux

Etude structurelle de vingt psaumes dont celui de 1 Ch 16,8–36
1995. XII, 315 pages. ISBN 3-11-014666-5 (Volume 235)

CLAIRE R. MATHEWS
Defending Zion

Edom's Desolation and Jacob's Restoration (Isaiah 34–35) in Context
1995. XII, 190 pages. ISBN 3-11-014665-7 (Volume 236)

ARMIN SCHMITT
Wende des Lebens

Untersuchungen zu einem Situations-Motiv der Bibel
1996. Approx. 320 pages. ISBN 3-11-014757-2 (Volume 237)

HEINZ-DIETER NEEF
Ephraim

Studien zur Geschichte des Stammes Ephraim von der Landnahme bis zur frühen Königszeit
1996. Approx. 370 pages. ISBN 3-11-014756-4 (Volume 238)

JOEL WEINBERG
Der Chronist in seiner Mitwelt

1996. Approx. 370 pages. ISBN 3-11-014675-4 (Volume 239)

Walter de Gruyter



Berlin · New York

